

Book Reviews

Captured in the Middle: Tradition and Experience in Contemporary Native American Writing. Sidner Larson. (Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2000. 183 pp. ISBN: 0-295-97904-6 cloth).

This brief, but wide-ranging, book by Sidner Larson is a meditation of sorts on three notions: a “Keatsian negative capability, the unification of past/present/future, and principles of self-efficacy” (p.19). These elements form the basis of what Larson calls “post-apocalypse theory,” a theory arising from the experiences of American Indians, who through conquest and colonization have lived through an apocalypse. In characteristic fashion, Larson seeks the positive from this potentially overwhelmingly negative experience: “The ways in which American Indian people have suffered, survived, and managed to go on, communicated through storytelling, have tremendous potential to affect the future of all mankind” (p. 18).

“Negative capability” is the skill “of not having to make up one’s mind about everything,” of doing “without the armor of systematic certainties” (p. 23). Such a skill leads one to accept differing conceptions of the world and of society. But more than mere tolerance, Larson advocates finding the generative potential of these differences; how can the differences between two old ways of thinking lead us to a third, new way of thinking? With this in mind, he discusses a wide range of debates—legal definitions of Indian identity that are at odds with lived experiences and community-based standards, debates between American Indian literary critics, tensions between urban and reservation Indian communities—constantly seeking new ways of approaching and answering old problems. Larson wants “us to see

how contention can produce valuable new ideas rather than just destructive behavior” (p. 29). His notion of past/present/future is relevant here, as Larson keeps in mind the facts of history (conquest and genocide, for instance), the realities of today (survival of American Indians that ranges from poverty to prosperity), and the needs of imagining a bright future and not becoming trapped in defeat or tragedy. For self-efficacy, Larson keeps a steady eye on how his discussions can have practical application to the lives of his readers and the lives of the students he teaches, leading them to greater self-actualization and more meaningful participation in their families and communities.

Three chapters focus on individual writers: Vine Deloria Jr., James Welch (primarily his novel, *Indian Lawyer*), and Louise Erdrich (primarily her novels, *Love Medicine* and *Tracks*). He locates each writer within a specifically tribal context but also within a larger national or global debate, seeking to show how each can help to resolve conflicts that exist within their communities and how they can provide answers useful for the nation or the world. The chapters on Welch and Erdrich could be useful in a college course to inform literary discussions of their texts, but these chapters also could help focus student discussion on the personal relevancies of the texts or the practical application of the ideas contained in them to current issues—environmental law, tribal sovereignty, feminism.

In his discussion on Deloria and elsewhere in the book, Larson notes interesting similarities between American Indian philosophies and Pragmatism. Other chapters focus on his personal experiences as a college professor, as a young man in the Gros Ventres community being raised mostly by women, on the benefits and limitations of the ongoing debate of authenticity concerning American Indian identity, and on other topics. Throughout the book, Larson’s discussion is wide-ranging but always focused on seeking productive answers to long-standing debates rather than finely parsing the differences between the debaters. Throughout, Larson is dedicated to “imagining a better future” (p. 51) for all people, not just American Indians.

California State University

Scott Andrews

Blackfoot Lodge Tales The Story of a Prairie People. George Bird Grinnell. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2003. xxxi 310 pp.: ill., index, ISBN: 0-8032-7109-3 paper).

George Bird Grinnell was a well-known naturalist and ethnologist of the late nineteenth century, who has written books such as *By Cheyenne Campfires*, *The Cheyenne Indians* and *Two Great Scouts and The Pawnee Battalion*, which at the time were some of the first books written pertaining to the Plains Indians. In this book, *Blackfoot Lodge Tales*, Grinnell, with the help of interpreter William Russell, has collected stories that reveal the complexity of Blackfoot culture and oral history.

He provides an intimate look at the Blackfoot way of life during the turn of the century by transcribing stories told to him by Double Runner and other Blackfoot storytellers.

The main themes of this book are Blackfoot oral history and stories that show their way of life and preserve past knowledge. Double Runner and other Blackfoot storytellers felt that there would come a time when Blackfoot culture and traditions would vanish due to assimilation into White society and that their knowledge would be forgotten. Double Runner wanted to preserve his knowledge so that his "children's children" would know the "past of their grandfathers." Double Runner understood the importance of recording Blackfoot knowledge onto paper, so he enlisted the help of George Bird Grinnell to assist him in this project.

This book is divided into four sections: Stories of Adventure, Stories of Ancient Times, Stories of Old Man, and Stories of the Three Tribes. Each section focuses on different subjects such as oral tradition, history and understanding the Blackfoot way of life. In the first section, Stories of Adventure, Double Runner and other Blackfoot storytellers give a narrative of historical adventures. These chapters give the reader glimpses of how the land looked during the nineteenth century. This section also ties Blackfoot culture to specific geographic locations to prove that a sophisticated Blackfoot society existed before colonization. The second and third sections, Stories of Ancient Times and Stories of Old Man, are the most important parts of the book. In these sections, Double Runner and the other storytellers explain how the Blackfoot developed their religion through their ceremonies, dances, songs and their traditional medicines. In these sections the Blackfoot creation story is told as well as stories explaining the cosmos that define their borders and territory. The last section, Stories of Three Tribes, is different than the other three sections in that Grinnell interprets the stories and tries to help the reader understand the Blackfoot's historical past and their present.

The strong point of this book is that it gives a good description of oral tradition told by storytellers who live in the late nineteenth century. It also gives a good description of how the land looked and how other people perceived the tribe during this time period. What is perceived as being bad in this book is the strong paternalistic attitude that Grinnell brings to the analysis of the stories. Grinnell's White views and white superiority is evident in the last chapters of the book. This leaves readers with a biased view of Blackfoot culture.

Blackfoot Lodge Tales contains 30 oral stories told by the experts of the time, Blackfoot storytellers. It describes important geographic locations and significant cultural values of Blackfoot culture. This book would be an excellent resource for people doing research on Blackfoot culture. Those readers who are true to the workings of Native Americans will find biases in the book awkward to deal with and need to have caution in interpreting the material to filter out the true oral traditions. Overall, this is a great book and a wonderful resource for any researcher's library.

Voices of a Thousand People, The Makah Cultural and Research Center. Patricia Pierce Erikson, with Helma Ward and Kirk Wachendorf. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002. xviii, 264 pp.: 17 photographs, maps, index, and references. ISBN0-8032-1824-9 cloth).

Voices of a Thousand People explains how the Makah nation, living on the northwestern tip of the Olympic Peninsula in Washington State in native soil, is rich in tradition, art and ceremony and has been nationally known for their whale hunting ceremony. A people whose name in their language translates to the "People Who Live by the Rocks and Seagulls" or q^widièè? a tx, or a coarse pronunciation is kwi-deech-cha-ahtkh. Patricia Pierce Erikson joined with Makah community members to articulate and portray this living community. The Makah have stressed the issue to recoup their heritage past and present and are a devoted people to teach the unique language and traditions to the young people.

Starting with the Ozette excavation in 1970 to the opening of the Cultural and Research Center in 1979, the Makahs have been able to pursue and resume their cultural identity. With the opening of the Cultural and Research Center, the Makah exhibit historical, archaeological and ethnographic collections and sponsor linguistic and educational programs. With the help of the Cultural and Research Center, Makah children are again learning the language because of the implementation of the language classes into the school system. The Cultural Center offers participant interaction, archival research and oral histories of a sovereign nation and the identity that was assigned to them by non-native cultures. Erikson shows how the past was imagined and how the Cultural Center promotes the traditional and new existing culture in the museum, which are done with interviews and archival research. She examines the foundation of a life that was revived from excavations to the halls of the museum with the truth being told.

On November 16, 1990, George Bush signed into law the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA). This law provided tribes with the support from the United States Government for the recovery of materials and artifacts that were harmlessly but wrongfully taken by collectors, the government and curiosity seekers. Recovery questions were on the rise when the law was enacted with the concern that the tribes would not know how to preserve the artifacts that are often fragile. The Makah Cultural and Research Center has solved this problem by having staff and elders of the community nearby to help with these items. Problems arise with the law providing recovery of religious, funerary and general tribal objects, whereas the Makah society follows private property concepts of individuals. Ownership of objects determined the social status of the Makah. Property value was kept secret, and it was forbidden to display power and wealth.

Patricia Pierce Erikson generates warmth for tribal museums, cultural centers, and urban community centers through the standpoint of disrupting stereotypes that have adorned a nation for decades and that native people have control on

how the story is to be told and empowering Indigenous people to represent themselves other than the typical colonial type. This should make the reader rethink the association with colonialism and museums and to consider the value in these entities not just for native peoples but for the non-native perspectives as well.

The Makah have an identity unique as a people and share their honored culture with other cultures. The Makah consider the native soil as the beginning of the world. For those that cannot know this soil in which Erikson describes, this book provides an enlightening and challenging entrance for readers to experience for themselves and to explore the history and Cultural Center.

Erikson contends that tribal museums evolve from non-native repositories and that tribal colleges now initiate the way museums and cultural centers are defined and actively take a role in research and education to excite and maintain social change. Erikson guides us on a tour of the Makah Cultural and Research Center, which shows how it occurs. Erikson expresses the difficulties in identifying an authentic Indian voice. At times Erikson's own voice shows through as ill at ease, and she is good at using acronyms in an archaeological demand that hurled the Makah history. Erikson also overloads the readers with professional terminology in museum subjectivity—subjugated knowledge and transnationalization of Indigenous family networks, all of these influence the ethnographic expression...

All in all the Makah are an expressive, open and generous people who have a lot to give to Native and non-Native alike. These people are at any time ready to educate through the Cultural and Research Center and tribal elders.

Patricia Pierce Erikson is the Dean of Academic Affairs at the Salt Institute in Portland, Maine. Her articles have been published in the *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*, *Cultural Anthropology* and *Museum Anthropology*. Helma Ward is a tribal elder and one of the last fluent speakers of the language. She works for the Cultural Center along with Kirk Wachendorf, another tribal member and interpretive specialist who conducts archaeological surveys and public programming.

Voices of a Thousand People, The Makah Cultural and Research Center by Patricia Pierce Erikson provides knowledge of a people who have revived ceremonies that had been a part of controversy both nationally and internationally. This book is recommended for historians, archeologists, anthropologists, ethnographic specialists, students and museum studies professionals. It is useful in gaining more knowledge in Native traditions and culture. This book is for the professionals stated above or anyone just interested in reading factual information about Indian people. *Voices of a Thousand People* cannot be compared with other works of the same genre because there are none.

Native Peoples of the Olympic Peninsula, Who We Are. Olympic Peninsula Intertribal Cultural Advisory Committee. Jacilee Wray, Ed. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2002. xvii, 185 pp.: 59 photographs, 9 maps, index, ISBN: 0-8061-3552-2 paper).

As a collaborative endeavor by members of the Olympic Peninsula Intertribal Cultural Advisory Committee, *Native Peoples of the Olympic Peninsula: Who We Are* conveys a succinct yet comprehensive history of the nine Indigenous groups inhabiting Washington's peninsular region. Replete with oral history and further enhanced by photographs, illustrations, maps and an Indigenous language pronunciation key, an unmistakable Native voice lends clarity to the region's complex history rife with turmoil stemming from cross-cultural interchange following European contact. Assertive, candid and certainly informative, the nine essays which detail each of the Indigenous groups explain their complicated past, their present state of affairs, and an optimistic future in a way that directly benefits themselves by promoting their unique identities and rich cultural heritage.

While the authors draw heavily upon the oral testimony provided by tribal interviews, they also integrate source material gleaned from ethnographic and other anthropological texts, government records, and secondary historical and geological sources. Under specific subheadings each essay explicitly discusses cultural history, visitor opportunities, and several suggested readings. Similarly, though with slight variation, each also discusses its past, transitional, and contemporary reservation communities, heritage programs, and cultural life including traditional religious and spiritual lifeways. A description of traditional territories as well as the cultural implications of post-contact changes in territorial boundaries are also provided. In turn, this leads to discussion of current issues, often regarding tribal status with the federal government as well as fishing and hunting rights. To a lesser extent, some overt discussion of European contact explains the subsequent political history following white settlement. However, the emphasis generally remains less on dispossession and social marginalization following contact, but rather on the continuity of cultural identity through adaptation, inventiveness and persistence.

By including oral histories and language references, the authors not only provide a distinct Native voice and enhance their work on a descriptive level, but they also contribute a very solid position in the ongoing debate surrounding the inclusion of oral testimony in the historical record. The Hoh essay, for example, includes a section entitled "Spoken History." The authors describe their use of oral tradition and advocate its explanatory purpose by placing historical events in context. They refute the common conception of oral tradition as mythical stories, and explain the evidentiary potential in such stories as that of Thunderbird, or T'ist'ilal, the being responsible for causing a great flood in the "Time of the Beginnings" (p. 127). According to Hoh tradition, the story of Thunderbird explains

the location of their territory and subsequent language development in relation to other groups. Similar flood stories have been recorded in the ethnographies of other Indigenous groups in the area as well.

Native Peoples speaks less to a scholarly or academic audience than to the public at large. The authors impart an informative, illustrative and assertive portrayal of these nine distinct though often misunderstood cultures, while avoiding contentious debate regarding a long history of treaty violations, discrimination and violence. Clearly, this very personalized Native voice attempts to be heard in terms which may help non-natives understand who they are today. For its unmitigated Native perspective and unique format, *Native Peoples* is recommended as a history written by Natives, about Natives, and for the express benefit of Natives.

University of Wyoming

Catherine Lucignani

The Invention of Native American Literature. Robert Dale Parker. (Cornell University Press, 2003. 244 pp.: ill., index, ISBN 0-8014-4067-X paper).

Author Robert Dale Parker's *The Invention of Native American Literature* proposes an interpretive history of the ways that Indian writers drew on Indian and literary traditions to invent Native American literature. Professor Parker, who teaches American and Native American literature at the University of Illinois at Urbana, has included in this book a preface, seven chapters, an appendix, 17 pages of well written notes, and a 22- page works cited section that includes more than 100 years of literary criticism well-organized into 244 pages, making it a compact reference.

Parker's book provides a great overview of Native American literature. Its chapters flow nicely as written; chapter four could be included by itself into a poetry syllabus. The final chapter discusses including Native American literature into the canon and suggests curricular reform to allow for its addition. To add to the narrative, Parker has included six illustrations between the covers: three photographs, two cartoons, and a copy of the front page of the *Daily Missoulian* relating to McNickle's novel. The paperback cover photo, recognizable from McNickle's later edition, draws attention to itself from the shelf.

Parker provides a starting point for scholars and other readers to enter meaningful discussions about Native literature, perhaps inspiring further study. In the chapter about poetry, he discusses inclusion of oral tradition into the canon, but with a caution, "If their elite status can be claimed for traditional Indian oral narrative, then the status of traditional narrative (and those who study it) can be raised, but at the cost of complicity with a discourse of colonizing appropriation" (p. 85). Although he obviously recognizes that each tribe is unique in much the same way that Italy, France, and Germany are different from each other, he

confusingly makes inferences about a Native aesthetic. He even leaves his readers wondering why these Native writers have not yet defined that quality for everyone's acumen.

Parker includes analyses by Native as well as non-Native scholars from various interdisciplinary fields. His book provides an overview of recent theoretical responses to literature written by Native Americans. He also compares Native American literature with African American literature, as if only one cultural arena may be discussed at a time in contrast to Euro-American literature. His style is one of easy familiarity. His writing is sometimes as laid back as he supposes the "restless young men" he writes about. He assumes his readers are versed in Native literature, at least what has been published in this century. Uncomfortable with Native literature residing outside the canon, he wishes "to recover the extraordinary sense of ordinariness in Indian writing..." (p. 9).

Parker offers yet another guidebook in the growing pedagogy regarding Native American literature, this one dating back not much further than the twentieth century. It feels like Parker dances around some issues, stepping well and lively through some sensitive territory, while acknowledging the fact that Native writers and scholars have made this new genre their own, complete with separate and distinct methods for analysis. Parker has included many well-known Native scholars in the field such as Gunn-Allen, Owens, Silko, Erdrich, and Warrior to name a few. He pulled in non-Native interdisciplinary theorists (Tedlock, Levi-Strauss) as a means to connect the recent upsurge in the study of Native American literature with the established canon. He adds credence, at long last, to what Indian people have known for a long time: Native Americans were not illiterate, and did often write their own languages in their own syllabies, even prior to Sequoyah (Cherokee).

While Parker addresses the concept of Native American literature, he stops just short of defining it. Instead, he implies that Native writers and readers will define the genre. He compares Native literature to Black literature "even as the civil rights and black power movements helped inspire political change and assertiveness in Native America" (p. 13).

Parker provides a thorough textural and in-depth theoretical analysis of John Joseph Mathews' (Osage) *Sundown* in chapter two, D'Arcy McNickle's (Chippewa-Cree) *The Surrounded* in the following chapter, Ray A. Young Bear's (Meskwaki) poetry in chapter five, Leslie Marmon Silko's (Laguna Pueblo) *Ceremony* and Thomas King's (Blackfoot) *Medicine River* in chapter six. He deliberately chose the authors due to their connections with their respective tribes.

The Invention of Native American Literature is a useful textbook for teaching any purposeful Native American literature course. Students studying Native American literature for the first time, as well as seasoned literary scholars who wish to add a reliable reference text to their collections, will discover these pages to be at most a reference worthy of further study or at the very least inoffensive and worth more than a second look,

Transcending Conquest—Nahua Views of Spanish Colonial Mexico. Stephanie Wood. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 2003. 224 pp.: ill. and drawings, map, ISBN: 0-8061-3486-0 paper).

Stephanie Wood's *Transcending Conquest, Nahua Views of Spanish Colonial Mexico* incorporates an interpretation of images as alternative literature; a methodology long used by anthropologists and art historians, in conjunction with a philological analysis of colonial Nahuatl alphabetic texts. Her topic for analysis in this study is to assess the social and cultural impact of the Spanish "Conquest" on Nahua collective mentality and identity. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo's edited compilation of essays, *Writing Without Words, Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica & the Andes*, looks at Indigenous visual and symbolic systems in pre-Hispanic and colonial times and strongly influences Wood's methodology. Her theoretical influences include Foucauldian conceptions of power and a dash of James C. Scott's "everyday forms of resistance" and "hidden transcripts" that emerge between the lines or within the actual discourse of colonial Indigenous texts. Wood examines both hegemonic discourse and its counter discourse. Although her work relies heavily on the methodologies of James Lockhart and the "UCLA School," it emphasizes an important combination of methodologies that could have been pushed further to reveal both continuity and change in Nahua conceptions of conquest.

Each chapter was initially created as a separate essay and then put together with some modification to fit within the overall concept of this book. Unfortunately, there is not enough methodological continuity, which would have greatly enhanced the cohesion of her presentation. For example, chapters three and four examine individual texts, "The Ajusco Narrative" and the *Mapa de Cuauhtlantzinco*, in which she drops the image analysis of chapter two that makes her study methodologically innovative and focuses solely on the Nahuatl language glosses and their significance. Wood inadvertently subjugates the symbolic imagery to the written word instead of taking the entire presentation as a representation of Mesoamerican concepts.

Her discussion of textual glosses alongside images evokes and alludes to earlier pre-Hispanic Mesoamerican traditions that include a description of conquest. The carved stone stelae of the Classic Period (100 CE – 900 CE) Maya lowlands include both image and glyphic text and are explained by epigraphers Simon Martin and Nikolai Grube in *Chronicle of the Maya Kings and Queens, Deciphering the Dynasties of the Ancient Maya*, as glossed pictorials that were used to inform both the literate elite and illiterate lower classes of significant expansions and conquests. Maya stelae represented both mnemonic devices for performance and ritual and were used as monuments that gave glory to the hegemonic rule of kings and queens. They were to be read and interpreted by scribes and priests for the benefit of both literate and illiterate alike. Could the Nahua images with alphabetic glosses and descriptions have been the same sort of evolutionary innovation that was

used by the Classic Period Maya—an oral tradition that existed side by side with textual explanations of past events? Wood’s study, although it alludes to pre-Hispanic traditions and makes many comparative analyses of other Mesoamerican cultures, does not delve into what those traditions might have been and what types of comparisons might be made between Mesoamerican cultures in this context. A brief description of continuity within Mesoamerican thought may have been helpful to her overarching argument. Although Wood strongly implies an ongoing oral tradition that existed alongside the development of alphabetic text, she does not fully develop a conception of how this worked in practice.

A philological interpretation of any language requires great attention to detail, which unfortunately, is not reflected in Wood’s other methods of analysis. Anthropologists and art historians both agree that if one includes images as primary source material, the facsimiles should be images of the originals or detailed copies thereof. The images included as evidence that are the basis of her analysis in Wood’s chapter two are substandard “tracings” of original drawings from several different sources.

Although there are many problems with methodological consistency and presentation in this book, the concept of continuing oral tradition and the use of images with alphabetic glosses that Wood presents is provocative and will be useful for other ethnohistorians. Her utilization of difficult ethnographic sources to convey Indigenous perceptions of Spaniards and her argument against institutionalized notions of the conquistadors’ god-like status are important contributions to an Indigenous understanding of the Spanish conquest of central Mexico. Her study asks more questions than it answers, yet her arguments on the points just mentioned are persuasive. Nevertheless, they could have been much more poignant had her presentation and methodology throughout the book been more consistent.

University of California, Riverside

Owen H. Jones

They Sang For Horses: The Impact of the Horse on Navajo and Apache Folklore. LaVerne Harrell Clark. (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2001. xxv, 338pp.: 38 photographs, maps, charts, index, p. cm. ISBN: 0-87081-496-6 paper).

In this redesigned and expanded version of *They Sang For Horses: The Impact of the Horse on Navajo and Apache Folklore*, LaVerne Harrell Clark examines first the Navajo’s and Apache’s acquisition of horses. Clark then switches to the adoption of horses into the respective songs, stories, ceremonies, prayers, art, customs, and belief systems of the Navajo and Apache peoples. The author’s focus here is broad, as the vast body of knowledge Clark defines as *folklore* proves to be embedded in all aspects of Navajo and Apache cultures.

The original version of *They Sang For Horses*, the author's first book, was published in 1966 and is now considered a literary classic. The current edition offers a fresh collection of photographs, most of which are the author's own work. In addition, a linguistic chart assists the reader in placing the Navajo and Apache groups germane to the book within the Southern Athapascan language family. Two maps indicate the present and the pre-reservation locations of all Navajo and Apache groups, and provide place names of sacred sites. Each worth a thousand words, these cartographic visuals extend aid to the existing text and breathe new life into the book.

They Sang For Horses offers seven chapters. The author, with her background in poetry and fervent interest in the topic, makes each chapter a grand entry filled with dancing colors and details. Within each chapter are several sub-categories which strengthen the over-all presentation and organization of the book by creating a cadence of skillful segues between topics.

In chapter one, "The Acquisition of the Horse," the author relies upon what Western history has recorded of when, where, and how horses came to the specified groups of Navajo and Apache. Clark discusses the "revolutionizing effects" horses employed upon Navajo and Apache modes of living. Chapter two, "The Horse of the Gods," opens with the author discrediting Navajo and Apache perceptions of Creation by declaring the Horse of the Gods springs from the "*fertile imaginations*" of Navajo and Apache people, very clearly a Eurocentric view. Reminiscent of John Neihardt's *Black Elk Speaks*, this chapter explores in detail stories, visions, song lyrics, and medicines that hold the wealth of knowledge about majestic horses as they once appeared while still in sole possession by the Spiritual Grandfathers.

In the third chapter, "The Gift of the Gods," the author turns to the songs, stories, and visions involving the culture heroes as *they* acquire horses from the Spiritual Grandfathers and deliver horses, "the thing[s] by which people live," to the Navajo and Apache peoples. This chapter ends an era: never again would horses live exclusively in the world of the Spiritual Grandfathers.

In "The Magic and Ritual of the Raid for Horses" (chapter 4), the author describes the horse raids as "sacred missions to bring home, 'the thing by which men lived'" (p. 116). On these sacred missions, leaders were expected to engage supernatural powers to locate, control, and attract horses. One of the sub-categories of this chapter distinguishes between "horse raids" and "war expeditions."

Chapter five, "The People's Ways of Keeping Horses Holy," describes how, following the teachings of their Spiritual Grandfathers, the Navajo and Apache learn songs, ceremonies and other rites for the propagation and protection of horses. While chapter five explains how the Grandfathers taught people to care for horses and keep them holy, chapter six, "The Horse's Powers Over the People's Health," addresses the reciprocal: how horses might care for people. After acquiring horses, the Navajo and Apache found they could also depend upon the "medicine" power of horses, just as they depend upon the "medicine" of other

animals. Chapter seven, "The Horse's Role in Folk Customs and Other Ceremonies," examines the horse's role in numerous ceremonies and activities surrounding Navajo and Apache cultures from birth to death. Clark goes beyond the horse's role in healing to demonstrate the thundering extent to which horses have permeated Navaho and Apache societies.

Moreover, this revised edition of *They Sang for Horses* provides a new epilogue, presenting a fresh look at how Navajo and Apache have redefined and incorporated "the thing by which men live" into their lives on the reservation today. The author notes that the Navajo and Apache have experienced a myriad of changes and adaptations to their culture and life on the reservation; although the pickup truck has become the favorite means of transportation, horses maintain their presence in Navajo and Apache lands. For example, rodeo is currently the most popular sport among the Navajo and Apache, and horses are the leading performers in the rodeo arena. Clark concludes horses continue to thrive in noticeable numbers on the Navajo and Apache ranges.

Additional features of the book include a "user friendly" index and an extensive bibliography of related texts for those interested in further exploring the equine-Indian relationship. Although Clark's examination of the topic is impressive, given her considerable amount of research, her comprehensive view remains that of an outsider. Clark's brilliant scholarship is weakened by a lack of acknowledgment to the particular Navajo and Apache individuals who provided the cultural substance for this book and to the Navajo and Apache peoples as a whole for the sharing of their traditional knowledge. Only one tribal member is acknowledged in the prologue: Adee Dodge, whose painting, "The Emergence," is portrayed on the book's cover. It is unfortunate that the contributions of the original native "informants" lie buried beneath the bibliographic lines of citations extolling previous Western research. One must assume, rather than know, that Apache and Navajo peoples were involved in the initial transmittal of the traditional knowledge discussed in *They Sang for Horses*; otherwise, what we have here is a synthesis of many academics' romantic illusions.

For the Indigenous scholar, concerns pertaining to the "outsider perspective" have largely to do with the credibility of the research. A contemporary search for identity has led a number of young Indigenous scholars to sift through works, such as Clark's, in quest of culturally relevant materials on respected groups. When an author relies heavily on "outsider" information, usually in the form of previous "studies," the information continues to be recycled, eventually taking on a life of its own. Oftentimes this created information is seen as truth to younger scholars who unwittingly embrace the distorted perceptions. Ultimately, such perceptions may be used to erroneously define the identity of a researched group. *They Sang for Horses* is recommended for western historians, musicologists, social and other anthropologists, and folklorists. It is not recommended as a model for relaying culturally relevant material.

Navajo Blessingway Singer: The Autobiography of Frank Mitchell, 1881-1967. Charlotte J. Frisbee and David P. McAllister, Eds., (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2003. xxvi, 446 pp.: 15 photographs, charts, index. ISBN: 0-8263-3181-5, paper).

Navajo people believe that life is not one dimensional. Life is not defined by appearance, employment, status, or materialism, but is measured as a composite of spiritual, physical, and emotional thoughts and actions that ultimately create the whole. Navajo's believe that people are not *only*, but *every*. And it is in this vein that Frisbee and McAllister document a life, physically segmented into parts and periods but, when combined, create a life in its entirety, the life of Frank Mitchell.

Ethnomusicologist David McAllister was introduced to Big Schoolboy (Frank Mitchell) in 1957 with the hopes of recording the sacred Navajo Blessingway ceremony. Eight years later, aspiring Anthropologist Charlotte Frisbee asked Mitchell to record his entire life's history. Over the course of several years, scores of interviews would be conducted resulting in over 1,100 pages of transcripts. After careful transcription and meticulous detail paid to nuance and inference, the autobiography of Frank Mitchell was complete. Yet these interviews created more than mere words on paper; they created a lasting friendship and unwavering commitment to the preservation of a single man's extraordinary life.

The book consists of 12 chapters, each chronicling a period in the life of Frank Mitchell. From his early days as a laborer to his inheritance of the Blessingway chant from his father-in-law to his work as a tribal councilman and ultimately as a sitting judge, the life of Frank Mitchell is laid before the reader in astonishing detail and unparalleled depth of insight. And what is revealed is what McAllister and Frisbee surely understood early on—that Frank Mitchell was much more than a Blessingway singer. This book reads as part Navajo history lesson, part anthropological study of Navajo culture, and part musicological journey into Navajo spiritual ritualism. Mitchell provides a rich, descriptive, reflective and extremely unabashed recount of his life and the social, economic, political, spiritual, and historical forces that shape it. And in doing so, the reader comes to understand that life is not lived in isolation nor can it be measured by a single event or a single moment in time. It is measured as parts to a whole.

This book is not for those exclusively interested in Navajo history. It is multi-dimensional and easily appeals to a wide range of audiences and interests. This book is laden with historical, anthropological, and spiritual insights into mid-twentieth century Navajo life. Musicologists will gravitate to chapters seven and eight with their rich description of the nuances surrounding the Blessingway ceremony. And as an educator interested in the American Indian educational experience, I found Mitchell's narrative of his Fort Defiance boarding school days both riveting and powerful. The power of the book mirrors the power of the man; sweeping, multifaceted, complex, parts separate yet interrelated.

Navajo Blessingway Singer: The Autobiography of Frank Mitchell is for all those interested in Navajo life writ large. And though it is written as an autobiography of a Blessingway singer, it is much more than that. It is a masterful account of a single life that had multiple purposes. It is a life of struggle, a life of survival, a life of spiritual sacredness and most of all, it is a life given for all to share.

University of South Carolina, Aiken

Timothy Lintner

Ethical Issues in Archaeology, Larry J. Zimmerman, Karen D. Vitelli and Julie Hollowell-Zimmer, Eds. (Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press, 2003. xvi, 300 pp.: photographs, maps, appendix, index, ISBN 0-7591-0271-6 paper).

Since the 1970s, archaeologists have become increasingly aware of the ways in which their profession is carried out within a social, political, and economic context. At first prompted by debates about the international antiquities market and clandestine research in cultural anthropology, scholars soon turned to a range of issues that challenged the fundamental assumptions of the archaeological enterprise. The long-held concerns of Native peoples were added to this mix with the publication of Vine Deloria, Jr.'s *Custer Died for Your Sins* and well-publicized protests that interrupted fieldwork and museum operations. Native peoples were demanding for their voices to be heard and their concerns to be addressed. They wanted respect, and often, more control over their heritage—its disposition and interpretation. As these concerns climaxed with the 1990 passage of the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, North American archaeologists were at last coming to realize they could not disregard the values and viewpoints of Native peoples, as well as other engaged stakeholders.

By the mid 1990s, scholars had produced scores of articles on the ethics of archaeological practice, and a few edited books had also been published, such as Ernestene L. Green's *Ethics and Values in Archaeology*, Phyllis Mauch Messenger's *The Ethics of Collecting Cultural Property*, Robert Layton's *Who Needs the Past?*, and Karen D. Vitelli's *Archaeological Ethics*. The editors suggest that *Ethical Issues in Archaeology* adds to previous efforts because archaeologists are becoming increasingly sophisticated about the quandaries they face, and thus need a text to match their increasingly complex grasp of archaeological ethics. Furthermore, the editors note that some people—thanks, in part, to the codes propagated by professional organizations—have come to see ethics as having easy right and wrong answers. Hence this volume seeks to provide not only a useful resource for readers, but also a means of furthering debate without implying that ethics is simply a collection of fixed rules.

The book is organized into four main parts: Where Archaeological Ethics Come From, Responsibilities to the Archaeological Record, Responsibilities to

Diverse Publics, and Responsibilities to Colleagues, Employees, and Students. Discussion questions and further readings are given after each chapter. In addition, at the end is an appendix offering websites with professional codes of ethics and standards. Drawn largely from the Society for American Archaeology's Committee on Ethics, the contributors to the volume are some of the most prominent scholars of archaeological ethics. The volume has a slight bias towards North America, but several chapters explicitly take a more international view. The approaches of the contributors are wide ranging, from the philosophical (Wylie) to the practical (Trimble and Marino) to the personal (Fagan and Rose).

These essays are on the most fertile ground when they delve into the broader theoretical implications of archaeological practice, instead of cataloging the details of archaeological methods or merely asserting an ethical standpoint. Comparatively, few books on medical ethics simply describe how to extract stem cells, for instance, but most explore the social and ideological ramifications of such medical procedures. In the same way, archaeological ethics is at its most exciting moments when it moves beyond the technical routines of doing "good" archaeology, and probes the more tangled theoretical problems about the beliefs that define our conceptions of the past and the principles used to justify moral action. In this way Wylie's chapter wonderfully moves archaeological ethics forward by framing ethics within a rigorous philosophical framework. Barker's distinction between "passive" and "active" ethics and Watkins' historical approach are equally important, as they situate contemporary archaeological practices in a larger context.

This volume is intended primarily for practicing archaeologists, but will be particularly useful for students. The questions at the end of each chapter are especially worthwhile, and will get readers thinking about all kinds of further contingencies and predicaments. The book is well written and well organized. Each chapter fits into the overall project more effectively than most edited volumes. Although this book does not address every subject—for example war and cultural property or archaeotourism—it provides a solid starting point for some of the weightiest ethical questions archaeologists are likely to encounter. This volume is earnestly recommended because it significantly expands and deepens our understanding of archaeological ethics, even as it challenges professionals and students alike to contemplate the conduct and core values of the discipline.

Center for Desert Archaeology

Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh

Conservation and Mobile Indigenous Peoples. Displacement, Forced Settlement, and Sustainable Development. Dawn Chatty and Marcus Colchester, Eds. (New York: Berghahn Books. V. 10. 2002. 392 pp.: preface, references, tables and figures, ISBN: 1-57181-842-1 paper).

Are conservationists as Igoo notes, "proverbial wolves in sheep's clothing"

(p. 87)? *Conservation and Mobile Indigenous Peoples* is a collection of 20 diverse academic papers. Each chapter has notes as well as extensive references, many of which are in translation and even as such will not be familiar to North American audiences. The editors suggest a “need for a wide multi-disciplinary platform on which Indigenous Peoples can voice their concerns alongside natural and social scientists” to protect biodiversity (p. xiv). Readers can excuse the rather self-serving perspective of academics as architects for this platform, a perspective that has been repeated in other writings by anthropologists and others interested in bringing together natural-social sciences and Indigenous Peoples. This collection of articles serves up a useful set of international cases enveloped in a critique of forced development, whether for economic gain or conservation.

From local to international arenas, the multi-disciplinary platform already exists in some cases, but is sorely lacking in others. For example, the Arctic Council is a circumpolar institution at which six international northern Indigenous organizations work with the eight circumpolar nation states. Such regional and high level cooperation between modern nation states and Indigenous nations is in reality an anomaly, a point that is apparent as one reads *Conservation and Mobile Indigenous Peoples*. In particular places like Israel, South Africa, Latin American, Indonesia, Asia, and so on Indigenous Peoples continue to be displaced by the States who choose to violate the rights and title of Indigenous Peoples.

Editors Dawn Chatty and Marcus Colchester have brought their research interest to bear on the editing of this anthology. Chatty is Dulverton Senior Research Fellow and Deputy Director of the Refugee Studies Center, Oxford and General Editor of *Studies in Forced Migration*. She has an interest in nomadic pastoral systems of Middle East and North Africa. Colchester is Director of the Forest Peoples Programme, Oxford with an interest in Latin America and Southeast Asia. As editors they present the interface of biodiversity conservation and sustainable livelihoods of marginalized communities (hinterland/ homelands). Originally the papers were derived from a conference at Oxford in 1999 on *Studies in Forced Migration, “Displacement, Forced Settlement and Conservation.”* The contributors represent a range of (inter/multi)disciplinary perspectives, social and natural scientists, including anthropologists, historians, ecologists, and wildlife conservationists.

Conservation and Mobile Indigenous People will be of interest to students who want to understand better the impacts of conservation and conservation paradigms (pp.3-4), have on the lives and livelihoods of people who share the same ecological niches. There is an undercurrent of action ecology driving this research, a search for mechanisms to steward policy and principles into practice. Indigenous Peoples are seen as equal or more than equal partners in the search for biodiversity conservation (p.15). There is an on-line version of the book (www.berghahnbooks.com). The authors offer a critique of protected areas and parks, how these conservation tools create increased stress on adjacent areas that are not protected. As the tenth in 13 volumes of the studies in forced migration, this particular book will be the source material for future generations of researchers,

an increasing number in North America who are Aboriginal. The book offers some insights to the broader changes to economic development/destruction paradigms, with the inclusion of social justice, land tenure and security, commons and enclosures. The over 20 authors offer commentary on consumerism, corporations, global trade, government collusion or indifference, and ultimately social impacts of protected areas on Indigenous Peoples. There is a history of conservationists blaming “local, Indigenous misuse of resources” (p.4). A significant contribution of the book is the emergence of an understanding about nonequilibrium systems, that these systems are continuously adapting, and it is this capacity to adapt that is key. This shift in thinking takes the burden off “Indigenous peoples” as “backward” and in need of help to develop and modernize (p. 5). Nature is no longer pristine and Indigenous Peoples are no longer dangerous and uncivilized locals.

The many arguments in this book will challenge and hopefully bring forward vigorous debate about the aims and goals of sustainable development and conservation tools. For instance, the editors note that conservation and development are “top-down impositions which deny their (Indigenous) prior rights to land and devalue their Indigenous knowledge systems of land use” (p. 6). Chatty and Colchester also argue that conservationists need to become advisors to Indigenous land owners, in particular since 1992 under the new direction in conservation set by the *Convention on Biological Diversity* (CBD), where Indigenous Peoples now “occupy political space at national and global levels to claim recognition of their human rights” (pp. 11-12). They note a body of jurisprudence has resulted which effectively recognized Indigenous Peoples’ rights to ownership, use and management of their lands and territories, to represent themselves through their own “institutions, to exercise their customary law in conformity with other human rights standards, to their intellectual property, to a measure of self-governance, and to self-determination” (p.13).

A short display of quotes from the numerous contributions in this book will suffice in explaining why this book will serve future generations. In each chapter there are valuable lessons and it would be easy to replace those here with others. For example, Montoya observed “the importance of the market is obvious: the reserve (Ticoporo Forest Reserve, Venezuelan Andes) as we have seen it, is permeated with business transactions of different natures” (p. 32). Galvin *et al.* argue for *integrated conservation and development projects* “as an alternate type of community-based development,” whose long-term effects remain problematic (p. 37). They remain problematic for a number of reasons outlined in the various conservation case studies where, “community conservation initiatives...claim to give...direct control of natural resources, thereby creating incentives for sustainable resource management at the community level. In practice, however, the agenda of international conservation organizations, private tour companies, and state elites dominate these programs” (p. 77). In addition the problematic results from what McCabe identifies as “progress that tries to bring together conservation and human development,” which “must be based on in-depth understanding of the

human community and be flexible enough to cope with change social and economic conditions” (p.75). Most classical approaches to conservation and development have ignored, or at worse undermined, the simple and taken for granted need (for most social scientists) to know the people and in some cases their land, to keep united the relationships (ecology) in research and in action. In this regard Fisher notes, “understanding how experiences of population displacement and resettlement in the past are given expression in the present is critical” (p. 119). Turton finds that local participation in conservation is feasible and might be achieved through “interactive participation” (p. 111). Even this last remedy, however, must be taken critically as there is literature on how participation can become a burden on local populations/individuals. A revealing observation by Fabricus and de Wit, on South Africa, is that “force relocation has had few if any benefits for conservation...land restitution, on the other hand, has not had the predicted negative effect on conservation in the short term (p. 153). This book tells of some real problems with past conservation and development, yet the authors offer hope for a better future.

Dene Nation

Chris Paci

Nationalist Myths and Ethnic Identities: Indigenous Intellectuals and the Mexican State. Natividad Gutierrez. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1999. xvii, 242 p.: index, maps, tables, 4 cm. ISBN: 0803221770 cloth).

A group in power seldom constructs a nationalist history that incorporates marginalized peoples. Such is not the case in Mexico, where both living and dead Indigenous people are part of Mexico’s nationalist traditions. While dead, Indians provide a source of authenticity and originality as demonstrated in the glorification of the Mexicans; living Indians, because of their ethnic and linguistic fragmentation, provide a strong critique of the nationalist myth. Thus, the Mexican education system developed to construct a culturally and linguistically uniform nation, by integrating people into the mestizo dominated society.

Mexican nationalism is based on two concepts that place Indian people at the heart of the nation. Co-opted by the mestizo power structure the mythic founding of Tenochtitlan and *mestizaje*, form the basis of a nationalist identity and provide the nation with political heroes. “These myths assume,” Gutierrez argues, “that historical continuity is common to an ethnically heterogeneous population and that the nation shares a unity of racial and cultural descent” (p. 4). In Mexico, a nation where the vast majority of the population claims Indigenous ancestry, the dual myths of Mexico glory and *mestizaje* have marginalized the majority of Mexico’s Indigenous people.

Through a series of mailed questionnaires, Gutierrez explores the validity of Mexico's nationalist myths among her Indigenous intellectuals. Surveys mailed to numerous intellectuals who have completed post-doctoral training and graduate students preparing for careers in Mexico's universities. Gutierrez hypothesized that because the "official Mexican nationalist mythologies are interwoven with the recorded antiquity of the Indigenous past and this Indigenous past and present inject uniqueness into the culture of Mexico" (p. 22), the nation's Indigenous population should find both validity and authenticity in the myths and support the foundation of the modern Mexican nation upon these principles.

These Indigenous intellectuals argued, "the nationalist goal of the education system [i.e. to form of patria] will never be realized uniformly as it allows for the continuity and survival of ethnic identities through the relatively recent access to education and social mobility" (p. 11). Thus, by using the development of a state educational system, Indian students have been able to reassert their ethnic identity in the face of oppression is not, Gutierrez argues, a new phenomenon. The Indigenous people of Mexico have been able to maintain Indian-ness "because Indian people are able to incorporate outside cultural symbols into their culture" (p. 33). The adoption of a village patron saint best exemplifies Gutierrez's argument, these villages across Mexico adopted the Catholic idea of a patron saint. Each village adopted its own saint, with villages in the same area adopting different saints, thus allowing Mexico's Indigenous villages to maintain their identities in the face of oppression. Villages celebrate their patron saints on specific days, thus leaving the other villages out of the celebration and asserting their own uniqueness within the larger nation.

Thus, Gutierrez attempts to demonstrate quantitatively that the foundations of the Mexican nationalist mythology do not resonate among the nation's Indian intellectuals. Through surveys and textbook analysis, Gutierrez demonstrates that only the Mexican and Mayan serve as examples of Indigenous Mexico. These two Indian groups are hardly representative of the scope of Indigenous Mexico and for that reason; Indian intellectuals find little use for the glorification of the Tenachtitlan foundation. The importance of mestizaje found more acceptance among Indigenous thinkers than did the glorification of the Aztecs.

In the 1970s, this Indigenous dissatisfaction with mestizo myth-making evolved into Indigenous academic societies with the goal of "reinstating the Indian consciousness into Mexican society" (p. 114). Growing out of these distinct academic organizations was a clearly Indigenous Mexican identity. To counter the influence of the state education system, Indian intellectuals proposed their own educational programs designed with a specific pedagogy to transmit the "Indian memory" (p. 128). These two educational programs vie for government acceptance, but offer very distinct end results. The state program offers to assimilate Indigenous policy and seeks to spark a renaissance of Indian cultures and language. These alternative education programs continue to struggle as the role of Indigenous Mexico continues to become increasingly important.

It is far too easy to consider Indigenous people as an undifferentiated bloc. Gutierrez argues that the more nations view their Indian populations as “Indians” rather than members of distinct autonomous groups, it will remain impossible to “breath life” into ideas of Indigenous autonomy and self-determination.

Oklahoma State University

Todd Leahy