

Student Post-Survey Summary

Q1: Did you prefer Google or Academic Search Premier (ASP)?

Counts for Google: 9

Counts for ASP: 5

Q2: How would you compare the interfaces of these two search tools?

Anything you especially liked about Google?

As far as searching, Google is cleaner, easier to see what you get
Liked that it was only one link (or click) to each result

Not really sure how the advanced search in Google Scholar works, but he likes the options.
Likes to search keywords in title.

It would depend on what the professor asked her to use, but if no guidelines, she would use Google first
knows to look for .gov and .edu web sites
Liked that the words she searched were highlighted in the list of results
It was easier to see good sites and results seemed more factual

More familiar with Google. Picks ASP over Google, but Google Scholar over ASP. Would start with Google Scholar and move to ASP.
Liked streamlined search on first page, more user friendly.

Google is easier for getting the information
Can get what you want right away

Depends on type of paper, which one to use
More general works
Would use both Google Scholar and ASP
Likes Google Scholar because you can view books if uploaded to server
Gives you introduction, sometimes bibliography
User friendly and people are used to using it
Easy to use

Prefers Google - personal choice
Knows what she's doing in Google
Likes the advanced search, ability to use quotes to narrow
Assuming it inserts AND

Likes the "randomness" sometimes
Gives you some other tangent you hadn't thought of before - more ideas
Pulls in larger list of results

Easy to type in the words and get a bunch of hits

Would use Google to start
Interfaces are similar

Neither really had what she was looking for

Anything you especially disliked about Google?

Is less trustworthy
You have to click into link to verify that is useful

You can't use AND in Google
Can't narrow down to Full text
Don't get option to choose Full Text only or use dates

Sometimes results were random or off-topic
Had a larger list of results to go through
Many articles were irrelevant and information could be unreliable

Left with more questions about using Google

Harder to find citations

Cannot narrow results by time period

Randomness can be bad
Have to verify information to make sure it is valid
Doesn't trust Google

Looked like was pulling up only news stories
Wouldn't base paper on only new stories - need more scientific evidence
Would want to compare these to scholarly sources

Not so easy to narrow topic in Google

Google can lead you in circles - too random

Uses Google to get ideas first
 Also used Wikipedia
 Would use a combination of all sources
 Likes that you can use quotes in search
 But does not know how to use advanced search

Not knowing if sources were good

Preferred Google because it is familiar - easier to find things

Sources not as reliable or relevant

More results came up
 Highlights word you searched

Anything you especially liked about ASP?

Anything you especially disliked about ASP?

Leads to reliable sources

Too much stuff came up that wasn't relevant
 Had to start broadly with indirect searches, then narrowed
 & got more on topic that was more relevant

Can use advanced search more effectively
 Uses keywords on side with basic search
 Can choose FT articles. OR select scholarly

Lot to choose from on pull down menu on selecting a field

Fewer results but more reliable sources
 Liked there were different ways to get to articles
 Looked nice and organized

Interface more complicated, results seemed to be about
 actual cases, not general information about vaccines and autism

Needs more time to explore ASP. Did not notice if it had
 fancy stuff

Didn't see availability of limiting by specific disciplines
 Wishes ASP could limit by discipline

ASP has better, more legitimate articles instead of just web
 sites
 Takes you to interesting places

But too many questions to get there
 Too hard to narrow searches

Information in ASP helped to find solutions

Has fewer sources than Google

Seemed more scholarly with more academic books
 Has more peer-reviewed articles
 Easy to use
 More powerful for zoning in on subject headings

Hard to think of good search terms
 Not sure how to use advanced search - a bit confusing

Would probably use database for writing a paper - more
 relevant
 Liked that you could narrow the results to full-text,
 scholarly and by time period
 Can do a range of dates

Search page had too many options - confusing
 Couldn't see where to put in another search word

Likes the suggested topics on the side
 Results are more reliable - peer-reviewed

Modeled after library catalog where you have to type in
 specific terms

Could narrow searches right away
 Can search a particular topic (suggestions provided on side)

Would use for scholarly articles
 Likes the option of narrowing results to peer reviewed -
 can expand or contract
 Searching easier in ASP
 Easier to learn

Frustrated with both because wasn't finding information

ASP good for academic information
 Easier to use because could read the abstracts
 Likes the full text option

Found good information in ASP

Database can be intimidating
 If she hadn't had library instruction, it would have been
 worse searching

ASP is supposed to be good (sounded doubtful)

Did not know what she was doing in ASP
 Not clear what she was getting

Q3: Please comment on the results you received. Did you find the results to be more relevant to the research question in Google or in ASP?

Results in ASP were more relevant
Relevance depends on what you're searching
Google had more relevant terms like searching for theory and music
APS results were more relevant and more reliable for specific stuff
ASP results seemed more relevant to topic
ASP results were more relevant
Google can take you in a whole new direction
Results more relevant in ASP
More relevant in ASP - more narrowly focused
Wasn't impressed that Oprah show on autism appeared on first page of results in Google
Results in ASP were more geared to writing a paper
Google results were not professional - what people had done on their own
ASP results more relevant
Google comes up with a lot of extra stuff, but liked the newspaper results
Google brings up word she is looking for in the results - highlighted
ASP - you can't tell if it's a good result based on the title
More relevant in ASP. Had more recent articles.
Liked results in Google better
More facts in Google, and ASP had more specific cases
More relevant articles in Google
Wasn't sure if had selected to search full text in ASP
Results were more relevant in ASP
Web sites seemed helpful in Google. You can type in anything and something comes up
It helps you with spelling if you make a typo. Library database was more restrictive

Q4: Which of these sources would you go to first in the future when doing research?

Counts for Google: 10

Counts for ASP: 4

Google - because it is quicker than databases
Both are easy to use
Students are not usually allowed to use Google for research
Would go to Google for a quick search - a good place to go to get ideas for topics for searching
For research, would pick ASP
Get random bits with Google, e.g. TV causes autism
Would still go to Google first to see what comes up, then go to ASP
Would go to Google/wikipedia as a good place to start and jump into references
But would also look in other databases and catalog
Would probably use the academic database
It would depend on the paper

Google first, then Wikipedia, then go to library database

Would use Google first - then ASP

Would switch to academic database to find good sources to confirm what was found in Google

Google first to see generally what you can find. Web sites get you thinking on a different track. As far as sources, go for what has been published.

Goes to Google first to see what in general he can find - preliminary research. Prefers ASP to find articles that are not a web site.

Natural tendency to go to Google first

Didn't know about Academic Search Premier, had used Lexis Nexis before for newspaper sources.

Google Scholar since familiar with it

Probably Google first. If having difficulty finding anything, would go to library databases for research

Q5: Let's say that your paper is due tomorrow. Now that you have searched both Google and ASP, which would you be more inclined to use in order to find information for your paper?

Counts for Google: 6

Counts for ASP: 8

Both have links to full text, if paper due tomorrow

Google links to previews of books and then you can go to find books in catalog

For efficiency, ASP would be useful - better links to full text, has PDFs & KU Link

You can find trustworthy material in ASP mostly. Google can give you more results but not always trustworthy

For this paper, ASP. Found several promising articles and would use it to find more

Would choose academic source, but would look in some other sources like IMDb and Netflix (interested in movies related to this topic)

Results appeared more factual in Google, providing information about autism, not just individual experiences

Google or a combo of it along with ASP

Would pick Google for this topic

Really liked one of the web pages she found (in Google) that had sub-categories under Vietnam War

Q6: Do you have any other comments about this observation experience?

Good to learn about a new database

Exciting to be able to find more articles

Felt comfortable and thought we were nice. Liked that she got two choices to search and could pick.

Wondered what we were doing with the information we were gathering

Doesn't like headphones

Usually uses Firefox for the "open in tab" feature

Felt nervous

If she had not had library instruction, she would have been intimidated, especially brainstorming terminology

Had fun. Liked that we watched the screen and not over her shoulder. Made her less nervous.

No comments other than she felt she wasn't very good at searching.

Found it enjoyable