

CARLYLE'S TRANSLATIONS OF THE GERMAN NARRATIVES
INCLUDED IN GERMAN ROMANCE

by

John Edward Linscheid

of Bethel College, Bethel College, Kansas

A. B., Bethel College, Newton, Kansas, 1914

A. M., State University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, 1929

Submitted to the Department of
English and the Faculty of the
Graduate School of the Univer-
sity of Kansas in partial ful-
fillment of the requirements
for the degree

of

Doctor of Philosophy

May 1
1935

To Anna,
my wife, who has given her time and help
patiently, and

to Willard,
Katherine Anne and Marjorie,

the children, who have forgone much of the
paternal attention which was rightfully
theirs, this work is gratefully
and affectionately
dedicated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
PREFACE	vi
TEXTS USED IN THIS STUDY	viii
I. INTRODUCTION: THE KNOWLEDGE OF GERMAN LITERATURE IN ENGLAND AND AMERICA BEFORE APPROXIMATELY 1825	1
II. THE TASK OF THE TRANSLATOR AND CARLYLE'S QUALIFICATIONS FOR THE TASK	28
III. CARLYLE'S EXPERIENCES AS A TRANSLATOR BEFORE BEGINNING WORK ON THE ROMANCES	52
IV. THE TRANSLATION OF THE GERMAN ROMANCES	69
1. A Summary Account of the Translation of the German Romances	69
2. Carlyle's Difficulties in Selecting Desirable Material	77
3. Carlyle's Personal Estimate of the Material Selected	81
4. Carlyle's Method of Procedure and Certain Difficulties Which He Encountered in the Course of the Work	86
V. UNDENIABLE AND HARDLY EXCUSABLE FAULTS FOUND IN THE TRANSLATION OF THE GERMAN ROMANCES	115
1. Definite Errors	121
2. Inaccuracies	129
3. Literalness Resulting in Awkward Construc- tions and Germanisms	134
4. Inexcusable Free Translations	138
5. Conscious Alterations: Additions, Conden- sations, Omissions	140
6. Whimsical and Capricious Translations	144
7. Occasional Faults in Rendering Metre and Meaning in Translating Verse	148
VI. FAULTS WHICH MAY BE MORE OR LESS JUSTIFIED	156
1. Additions: Appositives; Explanatory Terms in Compounds and Antecedents; Minor Additions	160

CHAPTER	PAGE
2. Alterations: Condensations and Softenings	165
3. Omissions	169
4. Failure to Render Certain Words and Phrases Accurately	173
5. Occasional Literalness for the Purpose of Showing German Idiom	178
 VII. STRONG FEATURES OF CARLYLE'S TRANSLATIONS	 182
1. General Fidelity to Idiom and Faithful Attention to Linguistic Details	184
2. Accurate Rendering of Idiomatic German Expressions into Corresponding Idiomatic English	186
3. Free but Effective Translation of Occasional Odd Passages	188
4. Accurate Rendering of Unusually Difficult and Somewhat Ambiguous Passages	190
5. Treatment of Long Sentences; Breaking up of Long Sentences; Leaving Long Sentences Intact; Rendering Long Sentences Excep- tionally Well	192
 VIII. EVIDENCE OF THE PROBABLE DEVELOPMENT OF CARLYLE AS A TRANSLATOR	 197
 IX. CONCLUSION	 206
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 219
 APPENDIX	 228

PREFACE

In this dissertation are presented the results of a critical comparison of Carlyle's translations of twelve stories by Musaeus, Fouqué, Tieck, Hoffmann, and Richter with their originals. An attempt has been made to determine how well Carlyle knew the German language and hence to what extent he was successful as a translator. As a preliminary to the study proper it has seemed desirable to include an account of the introduction of German literature into England and America at the close of the eighteenth and at the beginning of the nineteenth century.

Acknowledgement for the completion of this work is sincerely and gratefully made to the following members of the faculty of the University of Kansas:

Dr. J. H. Nelson, who first suggested the subject for the dissertation and who directed the general organization of the material.

Professor R. D. O'Leary, under whose immediate supervision the work was done, and by whose careful and critical reading of the entire manuscript the study was made possible. To him the author is most deeply and most directly indebted.

Dr. H. C. Thurnau, who read very carefully and critically the German part of the dissertation and evaluated

carefully each entry made there.

Dr. W. S. Johnson, Dr. C. K. Hyder, and Dr. A. M. Sturtevant, who also read the manuscript with utmost care, offered many helpful suggestions, and made numerous valuable corrections.

The various members of the library staff of the University of Kansas who most courteously and most obligingly supplied the many books needed, and who cheerfully granted special privileges for access to the stacks. Special acknowledgement should be given here, too, to Miss Hope Murray who secured many loan copies of books from other libraries, and to Miss Odessa Haugh who generously made special concessions to use books for long periods of time.

J. E. L.

TEXTS USED IN THIS STUDY

Obviously in an investigation such as is attempted for this dissertation the determination of the exact texts which Carlyle had in hand when making the translations becomes exceedingly important: great care has been taken in the attempt to ascertain what these were. Unfortunately, excepting in one case, Carlyle left no hint anywhere as to the particular edition he used when translating, in the case of the several authors. Wherever such information was not given by Carlyle and was not available elsewhere, efforts were made to secure those editions of the romances in question which are known to have been extant at the time when Carlyle was translating: it was assumed that he used one of those editions.¹ Wherever such early editions could themselves not be secured, effort was made to find later editions, declared by the editors to be accurate reprints of the earlier. As a result of such proceeding, the writer believes that the German texts used as a basis in this study are either those which Carlyle had himself used as his originals, or were exact reprints of them. In some cases, where the writer

¹Information regarding the editions was obtained from such sources as the British Museum Catalogue, Kayser's Neues Bucher-Lexicon, and the Encyclopedia Britannica; also, several editions of certain stories which had been made a subject of special study.

used a recent edition, because of more distinct print, it was necessary to make a careful comparison with the earlier texts to make sure that the reprint was accurate. The romances translated by Carlyle and dealt with in this dissertation were by Musaeus, Fouqué, Tieck, Hoffmann, and Richter. Following is a list of the texts used in this study:

- A. J. K. A. Musaeus Volksmärchen der Deutschen, herausgegeben von Paul Zaunert, Jena, 1927.
- B. Fouqué, Friedrich Heinrich Karl Baron de la Motte. Die Jahreszeiten, Berlin, 1814.
- C. Ludwig Tieck's Schriften, Vierter Band, Berlin, 1828.
- D. E. T. A. Hoffmann's Gesammelte Schriften, Siebenter Band, Berlin, 1873.
- E. Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke, Dritte vermehrte Auflage, Sechszwanzigster Band, Berlin, 1862.
- F. Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke, Historisch-kritische Ausgabe, Weimar, 1930.

For a detailed statement, in the case of each of these, of the reasons for thinking that it is either the edition on which Carlyle based his translation, or fairly representative of it, see the appendix. The corresponding symbols-- A, B, C, and so on, will be used there.

CHAPTER I

Introduction

The Knowledge of German Literature in England and America before Approximately 1825.

Carlyle's accomplishments as a translator of German literature cannot be properly evaluated without an understanding of the literary relations of England and Germany before 1825, the approximate date of the beginning of Carlyle's activities in translating German. In this introductory chapter, therefore, an attempt will be made to set forth the main facts regarding that relationship, particularly those facts which bear on works translated into English from the German. Since Carlyle's audience was an American as well as an English one, some incidental attention will be given to the knowledge of German in America and thus to the preparedness of the American public for understanding Bartor Resartus and Carlyle's version of the romances.

The introduction of German literature, by means of translations, to the English-speaking world has been investigated by several students of English and American literature. Perhaps the most thorough among these studies for English literature are those of Violet A. A. Stockley¹ and

¹ Stockley, Violet A. A. German Literature as Known in England 1750-1830, London, 1929.

and Frank W. Stokoe¹; and for American literature, that by F. H. Wilkens². All who have treated the subject have pointed out that the period from about 1780 to 1825 saw the first widespread attempt in England to understand Germany and German literature. Earlier, however, there had been numerous individual publications of German books in England as well as many translations and other indications of interest in things German.

The earliest period of German influence in England came in the sixteenth century, when the spirit of the Reformation was still active. Near the beginning of that century appeared the first translation from the German into English: the 1509 edition of Sebastian Brandt's Narrenschiff. For the most part, however, the translations made at this time were of no consequence, and the true German spirit made itself felt only to a very negligible degree.³ On the whole, the impression of the Germans held by the English in this age was that of a people crude and uncultivated, and not endowed with decided literary talents.⁴

Although there was practically no literary contact

¹ Stokoe, Frank Woodyer. German Influence in the English Romantic Period, 1788-1818, Cambridge, 1926.

² Wilkens, F. H. "Early Influences of German Literature in America, 1762-1825," American Germanica, 1905, III, No. 2, 155 pages.

³ "Im 16. Jahrhundert macht er der deutsche Geist sich nur auf einzelnen Stellen fühlbar."--Herzfeld, Georg. "William Taylor von Norwich," in Studien zur Englischen Philologie, Halle, Heft II, 1897, p. 1.

⁴ "If the extraordinarily gifted, yet relatively

between Germany and England during the seventeenth century, we find in 1635 the first traces of any effort in England to master the German language¹. There is also a record of the first German-English grammar, published in 1687, which bore the title A Double Grammar for Germans to Learn English: and for English-Men to Learn the German Tongue, compiled by Henricum Offelen in 1687². Of translations from the German into the English, however, Morgan, in his very comprehensive

barbarous, Germany of the sixteenth century was, in pure literature, of any moment for its neighbors, it was chiefly in so far as it made literary capital of its barbarism. Its moods of ideal aspiration, its laborious efforts to honour virtue and nobility, its pictures of pure women and heroic patriots, counted for little. . . .

"Clowns and fools, rogues and necromancers, were, so far as most Englishmen knew, the staple literary product of the German people. They heard only the harsher and fiercer notes of its voice: in Grobianus, its ironical scoff at brutal manners: in the Ship of Fools, its harsh rebuke of presumption and of brutality in the name of sober self-concern and civil decorum: in Ulenspiegel, its robust effort to capitalise the humour of every conceivable offence against decency: in Faustus, its cry of blended horror and exultation at the boundless aspirations of emancipated intellect." --Herford, C. H. Studies in the Literary Relations of England and Germany in the Sixteenth Century, London, 1886, p. xxviii.

¹ "German, it seems, is first mentioned as an object of study in the curriculum of the Musaeum Minervae, founded in 1635, and the first German grammar for the use of Englishmen is Martin Aedler's (published in 1680) which Professor Schaible was so fortunate as to discover amongst a heap of penny books on a London bookstall."--Hager, Herman. Review of "K. H. Schaible's 'Geschichte der Deutschen in England'." in Englische Studien, X, Heilbronn, 1887, p. 440.

² Vieter, W. "Die älteste Deutsch-Englische und Englisch-Deutsche Grammatik (1686-7)," in Englische Studien, X, Heilbronn, 1887, p. 362.

study of German translations¹, lists less than one hundred items for the whole century.

In America in these earlier centuries German literature hardly appeared at all. "German literature," says Goodnight, "seems to have been almost entirely unknown to Americans until the last decade of the eighteenth century²." "Aside from a few scattered productions," he continues, "there are few references of purely literary character before the year 1790³."

In the first part of the eighteenth century interest in German literature in England becomes more noticeable. Numerous medical, theological and scientific works were translated into English; but these, on the whole, were of scant literary value. It was not until the middle of the eighteenth century that any marked attention to what may be regarded strictly as literary German becomes apparent. "The first note of the newer epoch was sounded in the translation of Gellert's *Das Leben der Schwedischen Gräfin G--*, 1752⁴."

¹ Morgan, Bayard Q. "A Bibliography of German Literature in English Translation 1750-1830," in University of Wisconsin Studies, Madison, XVI, 1922.

² Goodnight, S. H. "German Literature in American Magazines Prior to 1846," in Bulletin of the University of Wisconsin, Philology and Literature Series, IV, 1908, p. 15.

³ Ibid., p. 28.

⁴ Haney, J. L. "German Literature in England before 1790," in Americana Germanica, IV, 1899, p. 130.

In 1754 appeared a translation of Schoenaich's Arminius, and in 1767 Bodmer's Noah: both of these received adverse criticism¹. Interest, however, was still extremely slight, the only translations appearing within the next thirty years being almost entirely from Gessner², Wieland³, and Klopstock. Lessing's Nathan der Weise was translated in 1781, but did not receive very favorable comment.⁴ None of these

¹ (a) Noah is condemned as "nauseous affectation of expressing everything pompously and poetically."--Critical Review, XXIII, p. 280.

(b) Of Noah the commentator writes: "Had the author of these volumes been with Noah in the ark, the good old antediluvian would certainly have tossed him overboard, or left him to shift for himself on the Mountains of Ararat."--Monthly Review, XXXVI, p. 235.

² "Gessner was so popular that a translation of his Death of Abel had reached the eleventh edition by 1776, the eighteenth by 1682, and by 1689 had been translated into Latin, French, Italian, Danish, Dutch, and two versions of English. Wieland was more extensively translated into English than any other author and his Agathon is today considered the best of all these earlier translations."--Haney, J. L., op. cit., IV, p. 133.

³ "Previous to 1790 Wieland was more extensively translated into English than any other German author. Dr. Herzfeld regards Agathon (1773) the best of these early translations from the German and quotes from the translator's preface, to prove the latter's familiarity with German authors."--Ibid., p. 139.

⁴ "A heap of unintelligible jargon, very badly translated from the German original The translator informs us that the author of this drama stands very high in the opinion of his countrymen, because he stands foremost among the late reformers, to whom Germany is indebted for its present golden age of literature. The reader will here please observe, that this German author stands beneath all criticism; and can only say that if this is the golden age of German literature, it appears, at least by this specimen, to put on a very leaden appearance."--Critical Review, LII, p. 236.

translations were of any great consequence; and all were, as Haney says, "for the most part wretchedly done and attracted little attention; they were executed by translators who have been long since forgotten, and who were of small importance in their own day."¹ Either the translators had no mastery of the German language or they were markedly careless. "Entweder verstanden die Uebersetzer die deutsche Sprache überhaupt nicht und bedienten sich einer französischen Vorlage; oder aber, falls sie wirklich des Deutschen mächtig waren, liessen ihre Leistungen formell sehr viel zu wünschen übrig. Auf keinen Fall konnte also ein befriedigendes Resultat herauskommen."² Translated prose works which were popular in England at the time were for the most part by writers who are today almost entirely forgotten: Gellert, Rabener, Zimmermann, Lavater, von Haller--none of whom produced literature for posterity.

In general, until shortly before the close of the eighteenth century there was gross ignorance in England concerning German literature. Such ignorance may have resulted from several factors, but certainly was to be attributed in part to the lack of interest which such theological and scientific material as was translated from the German, from the sixteenth to the middle eighteenth century, had

¹ Haney, J. L., op. cit., IV, p. 130.

² Herzfeld, Georg, op. cit., Heft II, p. 2.

for the English.¹ The following facts must also be taken into account, each suggesting a very definite cause for Englishmen's ignorance of German literature and Germans: (1) Before 1750 Germany had no literature worth international notice. German was despised in Germany itself by her scholars who wrote in Latin. There was general prejudice against things German. (2) French literary influences were dominant in England, and French opinion in literature was generally accepted without question. (3) Ignorance of the German language was general in England; and, indeed, in England it was thought this language presented almost insurmountable difficulties to a foreigner. Most translations up to the early nineteenth century were very bad,² the translators being very inadequately equipped with a knowledge of the German language. (4) German books were scarce in England. The great expense of printing in England hindered reprints

¹ Because of the strange metaphysical style developed in Germany "it partly arose that while physical and political Germany was so familiar to foreigners intellectual and literary Germany continued almost unknown. Thirty years ago, there were probably in London as many Persian as German scholars. Neither Goethe nor Schiller conquered the repugnance." --Edinburgh Review, 1813, XXII, p. 201.

² "Whoever has seen the German Grammars hitherto published, must know how vague and uncertain this subject was: the learner could, by them, never ascertain to which declension the substantive he might meet with ought to be referred. For this reason, we find the number of declensions different in almost every Grammar; and it varies, if we are not mistaken, from one to ten."--The British Critic, 1800, S. 1, XVI, p. 690.

and the exorbitant duty on foreign books hindered importation. (5) The natural pride of the English and their dislike of foreigners also accounted to some extent for their general ignorance of everything German.¹

In America, in the latter half of the eighteenth century, interest in German literature was also extremely slight, and the language, says Goodnight, "beyond the confines of the numerous German element, especially in New York and Pennsylvania, seems to have been almost entirely unknown."² The translation definitely most popular at the time was Gessner's Death of Abel which reached America in 1762.³ There was also some interest shown in Lavater, Luther, and Werter⁴ [sic], but on the whole, the place accorded to literary products from Germany in America was comparatively insignificant.

¹ Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., Introduction, pp. 2 ff.

² Goodnight, Scott Holland, op. cit., IV, p. 10.

³ "The first work of German literature that reached America proved also the most popular of all, not only during the time when it was comparatively new, but almost during the whole period of sixty years and more, of which we are treating. In the year 1762 the first American reprints of Gessner's Death of Abel appeared, and from that period till 1820 scarcely a decade passes without furnishing us with a number of reprints of this work, which enjoyed the greatest popularity both in England and America. I have enumerated in all seventeen reprints of the same, without claiming to have stated the full number actually printed."--Wilkins, F. F., op. cit., III, p. 108.

⁴ "The rapidity of this change is startling. In the magazines prior to 1795 . . . there occur, aside from the references to Frederick the Great, eleven to Lavater, eight to Luther, seven to Goethe's Werter [sic], six to Gessner, two to Lessing and one each to Haller, Wieland, Klopstock, and Gellert. Not a single reference was found to Gottsched, Harder, Buerger, Schiller."--Goodnight, Scott Holland, op. cit., IV, p. 17.

Near the close of the eighteenth century a change for the better appeared in both England and America. The beginning of this period of more intelligent interest is fixed variously from 1780¹ to 1790;² in any case, there is marked evidence of rapidly rising interest in the last two decades of the century. Many reasons are given for this. Morgan suggests several probable causes: the close connection between English romanticism and the German; the recognition in England of the greatness of men like Goethe and Schiller; the great enthusiasm for Kotzebue, from whose works more than a hundred different literary productions were translated; and finally, Germany's break with Napoleon, after which she became aligned with England.³ To these Stockley adds: the influence which may be traced to a number of German officers who served in the English army during the American Revolution; the encouragement of German works by the English court; the growing interest among the French in German literature; and, finally, the activity of Germans resident in England.⁴

¹ "The beginning of its time of importance may be set at 1780, with the prominence of Kant and Goethe, who brought new life into literature and philosophy."--Perry, Thomas Sergeant. "German Influence in English Literature," in Atlantic Monthly, XL, August 1877, p. 129.

² "1790 is the turning-point in the English attitude toward German literature. That year marked the beginning of William Taylor's literary career and approximately represents the date of Walter Scott's first interest in German, as a result of Henry Mackenzie's memorable lecture before the Royal Society of Edinburgh on April 21, 1788."--Haney, John L. op. cit., p. 152.

³ Morgan, Bayard Q., op. cit., p. 16.

⁴ Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 4.

Furthermore, there is some truth in the contention that "it was the attraction of the new, the exotic, the revolutionary, which first roused English readers from their profound indifference to the German point of view."¹ The sudden wave of enthusiasm was marked first by the demand for a type of German literature which was characteristic of the age: that which was at once emotional, sentimental, and revolutionary. Of this type Schiller's Robbers was probably the best; but to it also belonged such material as Goethe's Werther² and the so-called "Schauerroman." Werther stands out before all others, and "may be said to have opened the mine of German fiction."³ To be noted also is the fact that Buerger's Lenore and Wieland's Oberon,⁴ both of which exerted a tremendous influence on

¹ Stockoe, F. W., op. cit., p. vi.

² "No German work--except perhaps Gessner's Death of Abel at an earlier date--was as popular in England as Werther. The first translation was made from a French version in 1779 and frequently reprinted. Other translations from the original German followed in 1786, 1799, 1801, 1802, and another from the French in 1789. But none were as popular nor became as widely known as the first translation."--Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 138.

³ Ibid., p. 215.

⁴ "Der Oberon war 1789 von Sotheby übersetzt worden und allmählich so verbreitet, dass ein Kritiker 1827 sagen konnte, er sei durch diese Uebersetzung mit der englischen Litteratur identifiziert worden und in England so gut bekannt wie in Deutschland Wieland war schon 1804 'in every sense the greatest writer of the Germans' bezeichnet worden." --Critical Review, Sr. 3, I, 543; quoted by Zeiger, Theodor. "Die deutsche Litteratur in England am Schlusse des 18ten und Anfang des 19ten Jahrhunderts," in Studien zur vergleichenden Litteraturgeschichte, Erster Band, Berlin, 1901, p. 244.

English writers,¹ were of this class. Of the dramatic material suitable for theatrical purposes there was none so much in demand as that by Kotzebue.² In 1798 to 1800 his dramas took the reading and play-going public by storm. Translating of his works, as well as of other German material, became a fad,³ and during the first two decades of the nineteenth century satisfying the popular demand with translations was a lucrative employment. Works were taken wholesale, and, in the words of Alois Brandl, were "diluted," "altered," "spoiled," and thereafter meted out to the public as eagerly as they were demanded.⁴

¹ Zeiger writes of the "gefährliche Einfluss" of the "Werke der 'German School' welche nur Grausen erregten," and says of Buerger, "so begegnen wir seinem Einflusse bei fast allen Dichtern von Scott, Coleridge und Wordsworth bis auf Byron und Shelley."--Ibid., p. 245.

² "Three out of six volumes of plays from the German plays collected in 1806 are occupied by Kotzebue's works, others of which had been turned to account by Holcroft."--Stephen, Leslie. "The Importation of German" in Studies of a Biographer, London, 1898, II, p. 62.

³ "The translator had long been one of the proverbial denizens of a bookseller's garret. Johnson and Goldsmith had both toiled in that lamentable prison-house The German literature at its start was profoundly influenced by English models How deeply many famous Germans drank from English sources is a matter of familiar history. The compliment was now to be returned."--Ibid., p. 44.

⁴ "The translation of German works was at that time a regular industry in London. Monk Lewis, Benjamin Thompson, Mrs. Inchbald, and Mrs. Plumptre, all now well-nigh forgotten, were the chief purveyors. They took up works, good or bad, just as the circulating libraries ordered; they diluted them, altered them, and spoiled them. Outside this clique, it is true, there was some earnest work, but seldom the needful ability."--Brandl, Alois. Samuel Taylor Coleridge and the English Romantic School, London, 1887, p. 258.

On the whole, the literature so singled out was of a type which the Germans, themselves, looked upon as definitely inferior.¹

During the last two decades of the eighteenth century there was seen also in America a relatively sudden enthusiasm for German literature and for types not unlike those liked in England. Among the religious works Gessner's Death of Abel and Klopstock's Messias² continued to be popular. Most in demand among the romantic writings were Goethe's Werther³ and Wieland's Oberon, the latter of these eventually inspiring Charles Brockden Brown sufficiently to lead him to create a work bearing the German author's name⁴.

¹ Unfortunately it was not the best of contemporary German literature which became most popular in England. H. C. Robinson wrote from Weimar to the Monthly Register in 1801: "I have for the present but one observation. You know nothing of German literature. Kotzebue's and Iffland's plays are not German literature. Though popular German works, they are not considered classical here."--Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 7.

² "The existence of three early American editions of Messias (1788, 1795, 1811) proves that there was a constant demand for the work."--Wilkins, F. H., op. cit., III, p. 109.

³ "German Fiction was represented by one of the most brilliant meteors among the literary constellations of the last century, long before German drama became the admiration of the public. We refer to Goethe's Sorrows of Werther which was reprinted in America at least six times in four different translations during our period." 1784; 1789; 1795; 1798; 1807.--Ibid., p. 136.

⁴ "His Wieland (1798) is a powerful tale of terror, a species of literature in which the Germans easily carried off the palm, and for which they were supposed to furnish the best models."--Ibid., p. 137.

Of drama, anything extravagant like Schiller's Robbers⁴ was welcome. But as in England, so in America, Kotzebue was regularly the most popular dramatist.² William Dunlap, the prominent theatrical manager of the period, saw what the public wanted, mastered German, translated Kotzebue,³ and presented him on the stage. Generally, the American people were not enthusiastic about German, and ignorance of the language was widespread. Even "in Boston, the acknowledged seat of New English culture," says Goodnight, "nothing was known of German in the eighteenth century, and, in all probability, very little prior to the third decade of the nineteenth."⁴

To return to England: before the century closed, reviewers had already begun an emphatic protest against the imported German horrors and sentimentalities. Of this the magazines of the period, both at the end of the eighteenth and

¹ "Robbers enjoyed a general vogue on the American stage." [In the Monthly Anthology and Boston Review, VI (1807), p. 371, appears a lengthy article of praise of the Robbers as known here in America.]--Ibid., III, p. 131.

² "No development in the realm of German literature was so tangible to the American public, and so forced upon its notice, during our period, as the 'German Drama'. . . .

"Not Schiller, Goethe, and Lessing, but Kotzebue Kotzebue was regarded in America at the time as the 'German Shakespeare'."--Ibid., p. 110.

³ "Dunlap sums up the significance of the German Drama for his theatre in these words: 'The necessity for producing these attractive novelties [Kotzebue's plays] rendered Hamlet and Macbeth, and all the glories of the drama for the time a dead letter.' Dunlap, II, p. 124."--Ibid., p. 110.

⁴ Goodnight, S. H., op. cit., IV, p. 105.

the beginning of the nineteenth century, offer striking evidence.¹ Public taste, however, was still stronger than critical

¹ "Whatever degree of credit may be given to the assertion of a modern author, that the Germans, have, for the last thirty years, in literature, and in genius also, surpassed every other country in Europe; yet the want of morality in their works of fancy, will, we hope, always prove an obstacle both to our imitation and approbation of them. Whatever exclusive merit they may claim in the fertility of invention, yet the use they make of that superiority (particularly in their plays) is so exceptionable, and their conclusions approach so near the confines of vice, that it seems to be the general rule of their drama, to invert the order of nature, and render virtue subservient to vice. We ought, therefore, to be doubly armed against impressions that the fascination of their imagery and singular simplicity of language may produce in us, as the beauties in general appeal so closely to the passions, that our feelings are worked up to the highest pitch before we are sensible that our compassion has been excited for an object worthy only of horror and detestation."--The British Critic, 1798, S. 1, XII, p. 424.

"The modern productions of the German stage, which silly men and women are daily translating, have one general tendency to Jacobinism. Improbable plots, and dull scenes, bombastic and languid prose, alternately are their least defects. They are too often the licensed vehicles of immorality and licentiousness, particularly in respect to marriage; and it should be remarked, in the strongest manner, that all good characters are chiefly and studiously drawn from the lower orders; while the vicious and profligate are seldom, if ever, represented but among the higher ranks of society. This is not done without design. It is, indeed, time to consider a little to what and to whom we give our applause in an hour of such general danger as the present."--Gentleman's Magazine, 1799, LXIX, p. 383.

" in Theodore Mundt's (Geschichte der Litteratur der Gegenwart. 1842, p. 86) account of Frederick Holderlin's 'Hyperion' we were not a little struck with the following Jeremiad of the despair of Germany, whose tone is still so familiar that we were somewhat mortified to find that it was written in 1797. [The account follows in part.] 'I cannot conceive of a people more disjointed than the Germans . . . there are mechanics, priests, thinkers--but no men Is it not like some battle field, where hands and arms and all members lie scattered about, whilst the life-blood runs away into the sand? There is nothing holy

which is not desecrated, which is not degraded to a mean end among this people Full of love, talent and hope spring up the darlings of the muse among the Germans; come seven years later, and they flit about like ghosts, cold and silent.

"It is a place where the divine nature and the artist is crushed, the sweetness of life gone, and every other planet is better than the earth. Men deteriorate, folly increases, and a gross mind with it; drunkenness comes with disaster; with the wantonness of the tongue and with the anxiety for a livelihood the blessing of every year becomes a curse, and all the gods depart."--The Dial, A letter (not signed). IV, 1844, p. 265.

" But, in the puny shewy literature of the day, I think I perceived the seeds of our present degradation. In departing from the energetic models of our noble fathers, we have substituted sound for sense; and the smoothness of a line, or the roundness of a period, is reckoned an adequate compensation for vacancy of sense and meaning

"To our own debility it is then owing that we have recourse to foreign aid; and our former resources in French frippery, foppery, and infidelity, having been exhausted, we are driven to the inhospitable regions of the North, for supplies of elegant amusement and polite recreation."

The editor or reviewer adds that he has no "compunction in pointing out the immeasurable distance between a Klopstock and a Milton, a Wieland and a Swift, a Goethe and a Mackenzie In this list can I be accused of partiality? Can any be so blind, so tasteless, or so ignorant, as not to see, feel, and understand, the proud superiority of the English name? And it is the fervent hope of my heart that, posterity will endeavor to wipe away our shame, and equal, though they cannot excel, their exalted ancestors."--Gentleman's Magazine, 1799, LXIX, pp. 923-924.

"Conceiving it the duty of every inhabitant of this favoured Isle to exert himself to the utmost of his power in maintaining the pre-eminence of his country in arts as well as arms; I undertake her defence in an humbler sphere; it is against the mania of German literature that I would exert every nerve, and endeavour to excite in my countrymen spirit and resolution to oppose the demons raised by Teutonic witchcraft and incantation.

"It is, perhaps, an event unparalleled in the annals of the Literary World, that a nation just emerging from barbaric darkness, not having yet shaken off her baby amusements of legendary tales and demoniac superstitions, should impose

judgment, and the voice of the press had little effect. Carre'

the ton upon the mother of a Shakespeare, a Newton, and a Pope. To what cause can so strange a contradiction be ascribed? a contradiction so strange, that it requires me to summon all my infidelity to my aid, lest the evidence of fact should prevail over the influence of reason, and prompt a belief that we are under the malign influence of German sorcery!"--Ibid., p. 923.

One commentator, writing in 1800, points out, referring to German drama particularly, that "moral virtue is banished from the scene, and purity of taste is destroyed by affected language and pantomimical decorations." He then quotes from one Dr. Moore who gives a "just description of these German compositions, which, he says, were congenial to the revolutionary spirits of those patriots who cleared the prisons of France in 1793." The quotation follows:

"They are a kind of tragi-comedies, in which men in desperate situations, and of daring and wicked characters, are introduced speaking appropriate language. The hero declaims vertuously, and acts criminally: their drift is to show that murder, robbery, and other crimes, which in the vulgar opinion are committed by consummate villains only, may be committed by the most benevolent, generous, and heroic people on earth."

". . . . French principles are to be met with in almost every sentence; those principles, I mean, which have turned the world upside down. Kings are reviled for no other reason but because they are kings; the ministers are upon all occasions made the objects of calumny and reproach; chastity is despised if it opposes sentiment; the prostitute becomes a faithful wife; religion, under every description, bends before Philosophy. And, if there be any other perversion of human reason, the plays of Kotzebue will afford a thousand instances."--Ibid., p. 406.

A reviewer, writing in the Gentleman's Magazine, 1802, speaks about the "prevailing rage for the immoral and extravagant productions of the German school." Commenting on a memoir by William Preston, he writes as follows: "In the second memoir the English are particularly censured for adopting, and cautioned against their passion for, German productions; 'on a perusal of which it will appear that their language is either bombastic and tumid, often unintelligible, or else grossly familiar and vulgar; the sentiments forced, unnatural, and, too frequently, not only immoral but impious; the characters are extravagant caricatures, unlike anything

points out that "Werter," for example, "passed through eighteen editions of various translations between 1790 and 1830."¹

If the popular response to adverse criticism from the press was not immediate, such criticism, nevertheless, appears to have produced its effect a few years later; for early in the first decade of the nineteenth century there came a decline of interest in German literature and hence in the business of translation. A number of other reasons may be indicated for this decline. One probably was "the economic depression that followed the Napoleonic wars, coupled with some suspicion of German literature as 'revolutionary'."² Another, no doubt, was the influence of the Anti-Jacobin Review,³ which combated all things liberal in literature

in Nature, or, if the resemblances ever did or do exist, that the prototypes are to be found only in Bedlam. The incidents are as improbable as the characters are monstrous. . . .

Furthermore, 'by the courtesy of England, horror must rank as pathos, wildness of character and improbability of incident as originality of genius, bombast and rant as sublimity If all this be originality, then it must be confessed that the writers of the German Romance and Drama are most truly original.'--Gentleman's Magazine, A review of a memoir by William Preston, entitled, 'Reflections on the Peculiarities of Style and Manner in the late German Writers whose Works have appeared in English, and on the Tendency of their Productions,' 1802, LXXII, p. 1041.

¹ Carre'. Bibliographie de Goethe en Angleterre, Paris, 1920, p. 29.

² Morgan, Bayard Q., op. cit., XVI, p. 17.

³ "The Anti-Jacobin Review set its face very sternly against what is called 'a glaring depravity of taste, as displayed in the extreme eagerness for foreign productions, and

and politics. Moreover, it was a period of uncertainty and unrest, and England was suspicious of almost anything.¹

Olga Marx, in her dissertation on Carlyle's Translation of Wilhelm Meister, attributes the reaction to a repugnance to the German people themselves rather than to their literature.² Finally, a chief cause must have been that much of the English public had been more than glutted on "Goetzism" and "Wertherism"³ and had begun to experience a definite reaction against the "Sturm und Drang" sentimentalism which had brought on a wide and much dreaded suicide mania. Despite this pernicious and dangerous sentimentalism, the German drama still retained

a systematic design to extend such depravity by a regular importation of exotic poison from the envenomed crucibles of the literary and political alchemists of the new German School."
--Perry, Thomas Sergeant, op. cit., XL, p. 137.

¹ "The period in which German literature was first introduced into general notice in England was, it will be remembered, the moment of those tremendous convulsions in the political and moral world, under whose effect human nature at this hour is smarting; and when the abyss of error was pouring forth all her brow of serpents to corrupt or annoy the champion of religion and order."--In Quarterly Review X, 355 ff. Quoted by Zeiger, Theodor, "Die Deutsche Litteratur in England am Schlusse des 18. und Anfang des 19. Jahrhunderts," in Studien zur vergleichenden Litteraturgeschichte, Erster Band, Berlin, 1901, p. 243.

² "On the whole, however, English criticism of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century was hostilely disposed toward it This attitude was due less to its actual content than to certain unvarnished frankness in the discussion of love, and to the introduction of realistic details pertaining to food and clothing that to the English mind seemed unpardonably crude and even gross."--Marx, Olga. Carlyle's Translation of Wilhelm Meister, Baltimore, 1925, p. 29.

³ (a) "Goethe was first brought to the attention of

a meager popularity,¹ but now for a decade or more there was among readers of English literature comparative apathy towards German literature as a whole.

This hostility to German literature in the early years of the nineteenth century--it amounted to that--was transferred to America. "The interest in German literature, which began about 1795, suffered a period of serious depression before and during the second war with England. Practically the only works accessible were translations made in England, which were frequently reprinted here, and criticism was for the most part, reproduced directly from

the English public in 1779 through a translation of Werther. From that year until the end of the century, it is no exaggeration to say that his fame in England rested exclusively upon that work. "--Long, Orie W. "English Translations of Goethe's Werther," in Journal of English and German Philology, XIV, 1915, p. 169.

(b) Translations of Werther:

1776, 1777. First there were three French versions: 1776, 1776, 1777.
 fr. French. The Sorrows of Werther--London, 1779--Malthus, Werter and Charlotte--London, 1786 Anonymously.
 The Sorrows of Werther--London, 1789--Aubry--Gifford.
 The Letters of Werther--Ludlow, 1799--Anon.
 The first from the German.
 The Sorrows of Werther--London, 1801--Render.
 The Sorrows of Werther--London, 1802--Satzberg.
 The Sorrows of Werther--London, 1809--Pratt.
 The Sorrow of Young Werther--London, 1854--Boylan.

The 1854 version is the first that is complete; all the others omitted certain letters on suicide, and the passage from Ossian.--Ibid., p. 171.

¹ "Die nächsten zehn Jahre bezeichnen trotz des anhaltenden starken Einflusses, besonders auf dramatischem Gebiete

English periodicals, or, at best, molded entirely by English opinion.¹ Obviously, then, the American public was influenced by the same critics who had molded opinion in the mother country. However, because in America interest in German literature had been less intense previously than in England, and because recollections of the American Revolution were still vivid, English opinion was partially discounted, and the opposition to the condemned literature was less marked than in the mother country.

The British dislike of things German was, indeed, intense for only a few years and in time gave way to the reaction expected in such circumstances. By the beginning of the second decade of the nineteenth century, the public mind had begun noticeably to alter, and as the decade progressed, there developed a new wave of enthusiasm for German literature and German culture. Some attribute to William Taylor of Norwich the initial impulse for this restored interest.²

doch wieder einen Rückschritt, der Eifer liess nach, die englischen Dichter wurden selbständiger, während Deutschland selbst schwer durch die napoleonischen Kriege zu leiden hatte."--Zeiger, Theodor. "Die deutsche Litteratur in England am Schlusse des 18. und im ersten Viertel des 19. Jahrhunderts," in Studien der vergleichenden Litteraturgeschichte, Erster Band, Berlin, 1901, p. 248.

¹ Goodnight, S. H., op. cit., IV, p. 33.

² "Der Erste nun, der durch seine ganze Vorbildung, durch seine gründliche Kenntnis des Deutschen, durch sein kritisches Urteil wie durch sein Formgefühl der eigentliche Herold und Bahnbrecher der deutschen Litteratur in England wurde, ist . . . William Taylor von Norwich."--Herzfeld, Georg, op. cit., Heft II, p. 12.

It is generally agreed, however, that the revival was brought about largely by Madame de Stael's De l'Allemagne, translated into English in 1813.¹ The two periods of interest in Germany were, therefore, separated by only a short interval. There was, however, an appreciative difference between the two periods. The first period was that of "Goetzism" and "Wertherism," the second that of thought. This second, says Hugh Walker, "differed in certain very important respects from the first, and . . . in reality produced a far greater effect."²

One cause contributing to this second growth of interest in German literature, aside from Madame de Stael's book already referred to, may be found in the service of Coleridge, who had been introduced to German literature in Wieland's Oberon,³ and who has been regarded as the connecting link between the two periods.⁴

¹ Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 10.

² Walker, Hugh. "The German Influence: Thomas Carlyle," in Literature of the Victorian Era, Cambridge Univ. Press, 1910, p. 27.

³ "Die erste bekanntschaft Carlyles mit der deutschen litteratur wurde durch Wieland's Oberon vermittelt, den der neunzehnjährige junge Schotte aus Sotheby's Übersetzung 1814 las."--Kraeger, Dr. Heinrich, "Carlyles deutsche Studien und der 'Wotton Reinfred'." In Anglia, Beiblatt, Band IX, Nov. 1898, p. 193. [Kraeger does not capitalize his nouns.]

⁴ "The connecting link between the two periods, both chronologically and by reason of the nature of his interests, was Coleridge. He was as decidedly romantic as the most romantic of the Germans, but what he imported into England was not the spirit of The Robbers, Goetz, or the balladists it was the spirit of German philosophy."--Walker, Hugh, op. cit., p. 27.

It was he who suggested that there was something far more profound in German literature than had been sought out in the first period of influx. Another factor contributing to the renewal of literary intercourse with Germany was a certain prejudice against French literature after the 1815 peace treaty and the alliance in arms between the Germans and the English.¹ There were other causes also, the chief of these being the recognition, at least by the saner few, of the greatness of men like Goethe and Schiller.² The growing interest in the study of German as a language³ must also have counted in the development.

The type of material demanded in this second period of contact with German literature was, as already indicated, definitely superior to that of the first. Coleridge's Biographia Literaria (1817) gives striking evidence of this in its allusions to German philosophy.⁴ The interest felt now was not in Gessner, Wieland, Iffland, Goetz, Werther,

¹ Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 10.

² Morgan, Bayard Q., op. cit., XVI, p. 16.

³ "The study of the German language has of late become much more general and extensive, its merits have been more minutely investigated, and its value more fully ascertained." --The British Critic, 1805, §. 1, XXV, p. 305.

⁴ "Als Einleitung dieses Abschnitts kann man die 'Biographia Literaria' (1817) bezeichnen, in der Coleridge deutsche Philosophie und Aesthetik darstellte und eine wichtige Grundlage schuf für alle, die erst aus zweiter Hand diese Schätze kennen lernen konnten." --Zeiger, Theodor, op. cit., Erster Band, p. 249.

and Kotzebue, but in philosophy and in the less impassioned extracts from Goethe's Faust, in Klopstock's Messias, and A. W. Schlegel's lectures on dramatic art; in Schiller's Don Carlos, Song of the Bell, Maria Stuart, William Tell and Wallenstein; and finally, in translations of Mueller, Fouque, Tieck, Hoffmann, and Richter.¹ The demand for this last type of literature appears to have been almost insatiable. In the decade from 1820 to 1830 twenty-one of Fouque's works were translated, and eighteen of Musaeus's.²

According to Professor Morgan, there were in the seventeenth century fewer than one hundred English translations

¹ The following list of collections of romances published in England 1791-1827 suggests some idea of their popularity:

- Popular Tales of the Germans. 1791.
- Varieties of Literature. Tooke. 1795.
- The German Miscellany. A. Thompson. 1796.
- The German Museum. 1800-1801.
- The German Theatre. B. Thompson. 1891-2.
- The Juvenile Dramatist. 1801.
- The Theatrical Recorder. T. Holcroft. 1805-6.
(Including plays from the German)
- Tales of Terror. M. G. Lewis. 1800. (Adaptations from German)
- Tales of Yore. W. Taylor. 1810. (Translation from German)
- Romantic Tales. M. G. Lewis. 1808. (Adaptations from German)
- Popular Tales of the Northern Nations. 1823.
- German Popular Stories. (Grimm) 1823-4.
- Tales from the German. R. Holcroft. 1826.
- The German Novelists. T. Roscoe, 1826.
- Specimens of German Romance. G. Soane. 1826.
- German Stories. R. P. Gillies. 1826.
- German Romance. T. Carlyle. 1827.
- Taken from Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 323.

² Morgan, Bayard Q., op. cit., XVI, p. 13.

from the German.¹ This situation remained until after the middle of the eighteenth century when there was a marked increase in such translations, their number becoming surprisingly large near the close of the century. After a rapid decline in production of that kind of material in the early nineteenth century, there occurred a renewed interest in it which rose gradually until in number the English translations of German literature far surpassed those of the latter decades of the eighteenth century.

Although German literature had been flooding England in the early 1810's and the 1820's, and a superior class of German works had been introduced, the attitude of the English mind toward the imported material even by the end of the first quarter of the nineteenth century was still one of surprising ignorance and prejudice.² Englishmen, on the whole, sneered at and looked down upon what they regarded as the barbarity of the German writers. Those who recognized the better elements in the new literature made efforts to enlighten the public. In 1817, the year of the

¹ Professor Morgan has prepared an exceedingly interesting graph indicating the approximate rapidity with which translations from German literature came into prominence at this time.--See Morgan, op. cit., p. 16.

² "Turn in what direction we will for light upon German literature in England during the first quarter of the century, we find that the intellectual horizon is heavily clouded with ignorance and prejudice, only an ineffectual ray breaking through here and there."--Roe, Frederick William. Thomas Carlyle as a Critic of Literature, New York, 1910, p. 97.

founding of Blackwood's Magazine, Lockhart had made a trip to Germany, had met Goethe, and had returned "with something like reverence for the best German literature."¹

Thomas De Quincey had, by this time, too, read widely in German literature, and believed that unusual originality and strength resided in the German spirit and was manifested in the work of German authors. He recommended the study of German and undertook the task of translation himself.²

Besides Blackwood's, the Literary Gazette (begun in 1819) and later the Foreign Quarterly Review (begun in 1817) also brought German literature prominently to the notice of readers. The Edinburgh Review had at the beginning of the period held aloof. In 1816, it still wrote of the "morbid vivacity" of the German writers, with the exception of Schiller;³ it regarded the Germans as "day-dreamers,"

¹ Ibid., p. 96.

² "Wenn er auch Goethe's Grösse nicht erkannte, so konnte er sich doch einer ausgezeichneten Kenntniss der deutschen Litteratur rühmen, deren Studium er eindringlich empfahl. Als er 1819 an der Herausgabe der 'Gazette' beteiligt war, glaubte er allein durch Uebersetzungen aus dem Deutschen der Zeitschrift einen Zug der Originalität verleihen zu können, der die Aufmerksamkeit von ganz Grossbritannien auf sie lenken würde."--Zeiger, Theodor, op. cit., p. 249.

In connection with this discussion Zeiger quotes the following from Page in a footnote: "The German literature is at this time beyond all question, for science and for philosophy so called, the wealthiest in the world. It is an absolute Potosi a mine of which the riches are scarcely known by rumour to this country." (Page, De Quincey, I, 212) --Ibid., p. 249

³ "The era of good taste and sound judgment has not yet arrived With the single exception of Schiller,

"visionaries," "mystics," charged them with "mingling rant and sickliness" in their literature, and concluded one paragraph with "A German sentimentalist is a great fat butcher whimpering over a murdered calf."¹ As late as 1825, the Review still contains references to the Germans as "comfortable Burghers, occupied with stuffing, and providing for their coarse personal accommodations Their works smell of groceries--of brown papers filled with greasy cakes and slices of bacon--and fryings of frowzy back parlours."² Indeed, it was not until the close of the 'twenties and early 'thirties that this prominent periodical changed its attitude.

From the brief survey of the literary relations of England and Germany just concluded it should be obvious that Carlyle's appearance on the scene was made at a most favorable time. Interest in Germany had been quickened; a small public for German books was already in existence; such pioneers as Taylor, Coleridge, and De Quincey had already begun the intelligent interpretation of German culture to the British public. Carlyle, therefore, was able to build on a foundation already laid for him. He came to be perhaps more

they have no writer of chaste and elegant prose. Good poetry is common to every age but prose alone is the test by which mental refinement can be unequivocally ascertained

"The same imperfect perceptions of fitness and propriety, which would have made their works pedantic in the last age, have disfigured them in ours with ostentatious quackery and puling affectation."--Edinburgh Review, XXVI, p. 306.

¹ Ibid., p. 308.

² Edinburgh Review, XLII, 1825, p. 417.

important than any of his predecessors as a pioneer critic and student of Germany, but he could hardly have done his work so successfully if it had not been for the labors of these predecessors.

CHAPTER II

The Task of the Translator, and Carlyle's Qualifications for the Task

Any good translation of literary material presupposes certain high requirements on the part of the translator, for unquestionably it is a grave project to attempt to render accurately in one language the words, the idioms, and the spirit of another language. According to Tytler,¹ a translation should give not only a complete transcript of the ideas of the original work but also reproduce the style, the manner of writing, and the ease of that work. The difficulties which confront the translator were, of course, as well known in Carlyle's age, as they are in our own time. An anonymous writer in the British Critic, for example, wrote on this subject early in the nineteenth century as follows:

It has been often observed, that, as far as relates to mere phraseology, translation is one of the most difficult and hazardous of literary enterprises. The constraint and coldness with which the translator must always labour; the danger of being infected with foreign phraseology, and the impossibility of always representing the idioms of a foreign language by corresponding idioms in his own; the difficulty of adapting words to the conceptions of another, and the temptation to introduce his own ideas with his own words, into the place

¹ Tytler, Alexander. Essay on the Principles of Translation, London, 1813, pp. 10, 63, 112.

of the ideas of his author; above all, the absence of the warmth which the mind feels in pouring forth its own ideas, and which so much facilitates composition to the original writer; the necessity of never giving the reins to that enthusiasm of invention which often easily and rapidly dictates language more happy than can be attained by the painful efforts of study; all these obstacles occur in making a good translation one of the most difficult exertions of skill, in the art of giving general and permanent pleasure by the choice and arrangement of words. Correctness, which is the first duty of a translator, often seems at variance with ease, elegance and animation, which are his highest praise. He is often embarrassed by the apparently jarring claims of fidelity to the sense and spirit of his author, and fidelity to the laws of his own language.¹

Many others have written on the subject of the ideal translation, and there has been pretty general agreement concerning the qualities that the ideal translation should show.

It is necessary first of all that the translator show an absolute mastery of the language from which he would translate. No mere ability to read the foreign tongue of that work will do; reading it is one thing, translating it satisfactorily quite another. There are "very delicate shades of distinction in the signification of words, which nothing but the most intimate acquaintance with a language can teach."² The translator must have what has been called, by the Germans, a "Sprachgefühl." For this he must possess "a genius akin to

¹ The British Critic, 1800, S. 1, XVI, p. 655.

² Tytler, Alexander F., op. cit., p. 14.

the original author,"¹ must aim "to transfer the thoughts expressed in the language of one social group into that of another,"² or, must seek to establish what Phillimore terms a "mutual action" between the two languages concerned.³ The translator must "change his position and look at the unfolding of the thought from the standpoing of the original. It is then, and not until then, that he really reaches the heart of his Latin or Greek, his French or German."⁴

If it is imperative that the translator have an absolute mastery of the language from which he translates, it is even more so that he have an easy command of the language into which the work is translated; for what gain would there be in comprehending the original if one's command of the

1 " he only is perfectly accomplished for the duty of a translator who possesses a genius akin to that of the original author he must have a mind capable of discerning the full merits of the original, of attending with an acute perception to the whole of his reasoning, and of entering with warmth and energy of feeling into all the beauties of his composition."--Ibid., p. 204.

2 Posnett, Hutcheson Macaulay. Comparative Literature, London, 1886, p. 44.

3 "Just as it takes two to speak the truth, one to hear straight as well as one to speak straight, a frank correspondence between question and answer--so, I take it, perfect translation requires a sort of mutual action set up in both languages, both that from which and that into which it is to be performed. Exchange on the level must be possible if there is to be quite honest dealing."--Phillimore, J. S. "Some Remarks on Translation and Translators," in English Association Pamphlet, No. 42, Jan. 1919, p. 4.

4 Tolman, H. C. The Art of Translating, Boston, 1901, p. v.

language into which one is attempting to translate that original, is inadequate to express the thought comprehended? Ludwig Fulda, in his essay "Die Kunst des Uebersetzens," is very emphatic on this point:

Nach alledem kann füglich kein Zweifel mehr obwalten, worauf es beim Uebersetzen hauptsächlich ankommt. Nicht auf die Beherrschung der fremden, sondern auf die Beherrschung der eignen Sprache. Bei der fremden kann dem Uebersetzer das Wissen anderer zur Hilfe kommen; bei der eigenen ist er ausschliesslich auf sein persönliches Können angewiesen. Nur als einen weiteren Beleg für diese Behauptung führe ich die Tatsache an, dass ein und dieselbe Person zwar aus mehreren Sprachen, aber keineswegs in mehrere Sprachen künstlerisch übersetzen kann.¹

Again, a good translation should reflect a sympathetic familiarity with the subject matter of the original work and with the author's method and purpose. The translator must understand and reflect the spirit of the original; until he is imbued with its spirit the original will remain in what will be largely for him a dead language.² Matthew Arnold speaks of a "union of the translator with his original, which alone can produce a good translation." This union, he says, "takes place when the mist which stands between them--the mist of alien modes of thinking, speaking, and feeling on the translator's part--'defecates to a pure transparency,' and disappears."³

¹ Quoted by Juliana Haskell in Bayard Taylor's Translation of Goethe's "Faust," New York, 1908, p. 18.

² Tolman, H. C., op. cit., p. 14.

³ Matthew Arnold. "On Translating Homer," in Essays in Criticism, New York, 1880, p. 291.

He must approach sympathetically the work to be translated, must absorb its spirit and must catch the pulse of its creator. This done, he may even do as one commentator has suggested, "not translate either words or sentences, but take up and reproduce thoughts and feelings."¹ The body of it will be changed, but the soul will remain.

Ordinarily, however, a good translation will show patience and conscientiousness in adhering to the original. Fidelity had been regarded "as the ultimate test of merit in translation."² He who is not faithful and conscientious in his translation Postgate calls "a traitor."³

Here one must heed carefully the warning of Arnold that the term "translation" is applicable to manner and movement, and, therefore, does not concern itself with mere words;⁴ it is this added and even essential aspect of translating which makes the task especially difficult. This is

¹ Postgate, J. P. Translation and Translations, London, 1922, p. 7. The quotation is from "Was ist Uebersetzen," by Professor Wilamowitz.

² Ibid., p. 30.

³ Ibid., p. 6.

⁴ "To suppose that it is fidelity to an original to give its matter, unless you at the same time give its manner; or, rather, to suppose that you can really give its matter at all, unless you can give its manner, is just the mistake of our pre-Raphaelite school of painters, who do not understand that the peculiar effect of nature resides in the whole and not in the parts. So the peculiar effect of a poet resides in his manner and movement, not in his words taken separately."--Arnold, Matthew, op. cit., p. 294.

particularly true in dealing with doubtful and ambiguous passages. The temptation to resort to free translation, which may allow addition, alteration, or retrenchment of the original, is always present. To take liberties with an original, however, is ordinarily a blameworthy practise. "A translation," says one translator, "ought as faithfully as possible to reflect the original and . . . any wilful or unacknowledged deviation from it is tantamount to a breach of trust."¹ This statement suggests that the "first duty" for all translators is--"to be faithful."²

A good translation of literary material, then, will be more than merely literal. Faithfulness in translating is first and foremost; but this cannot ordinarily be attained by a verbatim version. Mere literalness will give the nearest rendering of individual words but may easily result in awkward, ungraceful, and inelegant constructions. Any such awkwardness or inelegance should be sanctioned only to the extent that the original may demand it. The sense of the individual words must be clearly grasped, must be rendered into their nearest equivalent, and the new words must be so arranged and welded together, without any violation of the diction, idiom or spirit of the original, that

¹ Swanwick, Anna. Preface to the translation of Aeschylus. Quoted by Postgate, Translation and Translations, p. 3.

² Arnold, Matthew, op. cit., p. 285.

the whole becomes a counterpart in the language of the translation.

This discussion of the qualifications which the ideal translation must have will serve as a guide in the attempt to estimate Carlyle's fitness to render the German romances. What qualifications did he have for the task he set himself? What specifically were his limitations, and what his peculiar virtues?

An examination of his academic training reveals that he received much instruction which would tend to fit him for the work of translation. Although he early showed leanings towards the sciences and mathematics, he appears to have received a thorough training in languages.¹ The Annan Academy at which he received his most satisfactory early training offered intensive work in Latin;² and Carlyle appears to have studied Greek there also, though this latter

¹ "He seems to have had a 'gift for languages,' and at different times is found reading and mastering German, French, Italian, and Spanish."--Craig, R. S. The Making of Carlyle, London, 1908, p. 126.

² "This day school at Annan, a thriving port and market town of 2000 inhabitants, was in advance of the contemporary English Public School in stressing algebra and geometry and making French compulsory, though otherwise it repeated much less competently the routine of Latin stimulated by the rod, and offered no Greek beyond the alphabet A desire to deserve his father's confidence by learning docilely whatever his teachers bade, even to meaningless Latin exercises against which he inwardly rebelled, did not endear him to his schoolmates."--Neff, Emery. Carlyle, New York, 1932, p. 17 ff.

language, he says he knew very little.¹ His study of language did not cease after he entered the University of Edinburgh. His work at the university necessitated the continued use of Latin,² and it called attention also to the need of knowing other languages. While still at the Annan Academy he had begun the study of French.³ He mastered the language and continued its use after discovering the library at the university, as he so graphically points out in Sartor Resartus. In short, during his days as a student Carlyle became language-conscious, and acquired a working knowledge of at least two, possibly three, languages other than his own.

This proficiency in the handling of language was to serve him well after he left the university, for it enabled

¹ "Indeed I know very little Greek at any rate. I have several times begun to read Xenophon's Anabasis completely; but always gave it up in favour of something else." --Quoted by Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 7.

² "Twice he went to Edinburgh to deliver discourses; once in 1814, when he gave a sermon in English, and once, about Christmastime, 1815, when he read a Latin discourse on the question, 'Num detur religio naturalis?'" -- Shepherd, Richard Hearne. Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Thomas Carlyle, I, London, 1881, p. 19.

³ "In my tenth year I was sent to the grammar school at Annan 'Sartor' is not to be trusted in details. Greek consisted of the alphabet mainly. Hebrew is a German entity. (Alluding to a German biography in which he was said to have learnt Hebrew) I did get to read Latin and French with fluency--Latin quantity was left a frightful chaos, and I had to learn it afterwards." --Quoted by Froude, James A. Thomas Carlyle--A History of His Life in London, 1895, New York, I, p. 13.

him to secure a start in the world of letters by translating for publishers and editors. Carlyle's activities as a translator prior to his undertaking to render the German romances was naturally of considerable importance in training him for the latter undertaking. In 1819 he had already translated satisfactorily from the French a twenty-two page article by Berzelius treating some aspect of chemistry,¹ this appearing in the Edinburgh Philosophical Journal.² Two other even longer works were given him to translate in 1820;³ just what these were cannot be established. At the same time he had a "kind of review" to write on a book upon "Magnetism"; it

¹ Carlyle writes to Alexander Carlyle from Edinburgh, February 23, 1819: "On Tuesday last, . . . we met Dr. Brewster, in company with two men of note. The Doctor stopped to tell me that he had got a paper on Chemistry written (in French) by Berzelius, professor of that science at Stockholm --which was to be published in April: would I translate it? I answered in the affirmative . . . I have it more than half done. The labour of writing it down is the principal one. In other respects there is no difficulty."--Norton, Charles E. Early Letters of Thomas Carlyle, I, 1814-1821, London, 1886, p. 220.

² The Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, 1819, I, pp. 63-75, 243-253.

³ To Alexander Carlyle. April 19, 1820: "I have also two pretty long articles to translate which is the easiest job; and lastly (which ought to have been first) I have to write a kind of review of that clear-backed large book which you will see in the box--upon Magnetism and other points. I ought to have done it here you know; but . . . it seemed an easier plan . . . to take the concern home with me and prepare it at my ease-- . . . before the middle of May, when it will be needed."--Norton, Charles E., op. cit., p. 289.

was probably a German book by Hansteen.¹ There has also been attributed to him the translation of "Outlines" (75 pages) of a book by a certain Professor Moh,² but of this there appears no convincing evidence.³ In 1821 he was invited to translate from the French a large five or six volume work for the bookseller, Tait, a task to which he felt himself quite equal and which, indeed, he regarded as being very easy.⁴ Aside from the French, Carlyle also

1 "Remarks upon Professor Hansteen's Inquiries Concerning the Magnetism of the Earth," in Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, 1820, III, No. 5, pp. 124-238; Jan. 1821, IV, No. 7, pp. 114-124.

2 (a) "Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy," Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, 1820, III, No. 5, pp. 154-176; Oct., 1820, No. 6, pp. 317-346; Jan. 1821, IV, No. 7, pp. 56-67--Dyer, Isaac Walton. Carlyle Bibliography, Portland, Maine, 1928, p. 267.

(b) "Translation of Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, Oct., 1820; Jan., 1821."--Ibid., p. 3

(c) "Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. (Translated by Thomas Carlyle.)"--Ibid., p. 194.

3 John Muir credits Carlyle with the translation of Moh's "Outlines" and with the writing of "Remarks on Professor Hansteen's Inquiries":

"The Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, 1820, III, pp. 124-138. Remarks on Professor Hansteen's Inquiries Concerning the Magnetism of the Earth. (By Thomas Carlyle.) pp. 154-176, 317-342. Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. (Translated by Thomas Carlyle.)"--Muir, John. Notes and Queries, 8th S., IV, Sept. 23, 1893, p. 246.

A very careful examination of both of these articles in volumes III and IV of the Edinburgh Philosophical Journal disclose no evidence whatever that the work was done by Carlyle.

⁴ Writing to his father from Edinburgh, February 21,

undertook the study of Italian and, later, Spanish. Although he is said to have read a great deal of the former,¹ it is probable that he never mastered the language.

Carlyle's study of German, to which, of course, particular attention should be given here, he had undertaken with a tutor, Robert Jardine, at Mainhill.² He was first led to the study of this language by Madame de Stael's de l'Allemagne³ and by his desire to read a scientific

1821, of a number of letters he had received, he says: "There was one, which I read with considerable interest, proffering to me on the part of Bookseller Tait to become a candidate for the translating of a French Book, Maltebrun's Geography, which one Adam Black, Tait's brother-in-law, is engaged with at present, and designs to put into fresh hands. Two persons (unknown to me) are to submit specimens of their work, I am to do likewise; and Tait assures me that, if Black had known sooner, there would have been no competition in the case. So that I am not without hope of getting this job, and if the judge be a correct one, of deserving it. You may think the latter promise is like dropping featherbeds out of a window from which one is soon to be precipitated in person; but within my own mind, I feel a kind of assurance that I can surpass my fellow-translators, unless they are far superior to the usual run of such creatures. And if I divine right, it will be very advantageous for me: A steady employment, (the book extends to five or six large volumes of which only one and a part are finished) that I can address myself to in any humour--for it requires no study; and by means of which it would not be difficult to clear the matter of £200 per annum for a considerable time."--Norton, Charles E., op. cit., p. 326.

¹ "It was mainly for a 'point of union' with Irving that Carlyle had taken up Italian, which served him little otherwise, though he read a good deal of it."--Wilson, David A. Carlyle Till Marriage, New York, 1923, I, p. 201.

² To Mr. R. Mitchell, July 14, 1819: "Jardine gives me a solitary lesson each week in German, which I repay by one in French. Of Italian nothing should be said."--Norton, Chas. E., op. cit., p. 239.

³ "It was the reading of Mme. de Stael's Germany in September, 1817, that led Carlyle to the study of German literature. Six months later we find him taking lessons in German,

article by Werner.¹ He made rapid progress, and within six weeks after the first reference to his study of the language² was able to read books with a dictionary.³ In speaking of the difficulties of German he said, in 1827, they were "little more than a bugbear Three months of moderate diligence will carry any man, almost without assistance of a master, over its prime obstacles; and the rest is play rather than labour."⁴ Returning in subsequent summers, after 1819, to Mainhill for the study of German, Carlyle, so Craig says, "plunged with avidity, like a returning fish to friendly waters, into the Teutonic sea."⁵ In the Reminiscences, referring to the year 1821,

and by 1821 he is deep in Schiller and Kant, Schelling and Fichte."--Johnson, W. S. Thomas Carlyle--A Study of His Literary Apprenticeship, 1814-1831, New Haven, 1911, p. 6.

¹ Craigenputtock, November 3, 1829: "I still remember that it was the desire to read Werner's Mineralogical Doctrines in the original, that first set me on studying German: Where truly I found a mine, far different from any of the Freyberg ones!"--Norton, Charles Eliot, Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, London, 1887, p. 156.

² "A letter written to Mitchell from Edinburgh, February 15, 1819, contains the earliest reference to the study of German to be found in the published writings of Carlyle"--Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 9.

³ "I am still at the German, as I hinted above. My teacher is not a man (any more than he was a boy) of brilliant parts; but we go on in a loving way together--and he gives me the pronunciation correctly, I suppose; I am able to read books, now, with a dictionary."--Early Letters, I, p. 227.

⁴ Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, New York, 1899, I, Preface, p. 5.

⁵ Craig, R. S., op. cit., p. 128.

he writes of having been "kept daily studious"¹ in mastering German, and in the next year, 1822, he writes to Jane, blessing the "old music master"² who first suggested to him the idea of learning it.³ The pleasure he experienced in this study is reflected in practically every letter he writes touching on this period. Although there is no reference to German literary men in his letters before 1819, German quotations, German expressions--even German oaths--are sprinkled generously throughout his correspondence thereafter. This is particularly true of his letters to Jane Welsh--no doubt, much to the chagrin of that lady, who attempted similar feats, not always with success.⁴

Aside from his study of foreign languages, Carlyle further qualified himself for the task of translating by cultivating his interest in foreign literatures. Of French

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. Reminiscences, Edited by James A. Froude, New York, 1881, I, p. 181.

² Who the "old music master" was I have thus far not been able to decide.

³ Haddington, December 24, 1822: "This German is a glorious language: While I live I shall bless my old music master whose starvation first suggested to me the idea of learning it I would have delayed writing had I not been in want of more German."--Carlyle, Alexander, Love Letters, of Thomas Carlyle and Jane Welsh, London, 1909, I, p. 130.

⁴ In a letter from Haddington, April 10, 1826, Jane writes to Carlyle: "Ach, wie kalt, wie dumm ist dieser Brief! Meine Mutter seht ihn, und Ich scheue mich ihr meiner ganze Seelen zu zeigen."--Probably she intended to say, "Meine Mutter sah ihn und ich fürchte mich, mit ganzer Seele, ihr denselben zu zeigen."--Ibid., II, p. 267.

books he read whatever came to his hands; of those which Carlyle read between 1813 and 1819, Roe lists among others the works of Voltaire, Molière, and Fénelon.¹ French, English, anything readable, he readily "devoured,"² and he was eager for any translations that came his way. His letters after 1819 have scores of allusions to both French and German books.³

After Carlyle had once familiarized himself with German he appears to have preferred the literature written in it to that written in French. This, very probably, was because of the anti-French atmosphere in which he had been reared.⁴ He was soon "turning to account the German he had so

¹ Roe, F. W., op. cit., pp. 6 ff.

² "Everything, in fact, English and French was greedily devoured by the maturing young schoolmaster. Not books of literature only, but of mathematics, theology, philosophy, and travel filled the spare hours; and the correspondence of these years alludes to considerable reading not specifically mentioned The range of his reading is indeed significant. The books that he mentions do not belong to a single class, nor to one literature. He read poetry and mathematics, travel, fiction, and philosophy. He was curious to know French books as English, and he eagerly went through such translations from languages as came his way. His curiosity was as insatiable as it was far-reaching." --Ibid., p. 8.

³ "Carlyle made rapid progress, and was soon able to read German books. These were procured for him from Germany by his kind friend, Mr. Swan, a merchant of Kirkcaldy, who had dealings with Hamburg. 'I well remember,' writes Carlyle in 1866, 'the arrival of the Schiller Werke sheets at Mainhill (and my impatience till the Annan Bookbinder had done with them): they had come from Lubeck I perceived This Schiller and Archenholtz' Seven-Years' War were my first really German Books.'"--Norton, Charles Eliot, Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, Introduction, p. ix.

⁴ "Carlyle had been reared in an anti-French atmosphere;

painstakingly mastered among the corn-rigs of Mainhill and by the kitchen hearth of his father's home, through sheer force of industry, a good dictionary, and a big brain,"¹ and by January, 1821, was doing his first translating from the German--a portion of Schiller's History of the Thirty Years' War.² Next he translated about fifty pages of Schiller

his youth had been passed during the years of war with France. The French had been defeated in the Seven Years' War, and again at the end of the Napoleonic War. English and German Protestants had been successful against French Catholics. France had a reputation for immorality which horrified the Annandale peasants, for frivolity which disgusted them, and for polite manners which they regarded as the mark of feebleness and insincerity. Brought up with these ideas, it was natural that Carlyle should prefer the Germans.

"Thus, when he came to the study of the German language, in January 1819, he was predisposed in its favour; and he was encouraged by the thought that, as the language was little known in England or Scotland at the time, familiarity with it would be a distinction, and a useful acquirement; he would have few rivals as a translator of German works. Then, as he made progress with the language, he found that it had the features which he admired; it was hard and rugged, qualities which in the rude circles in which Carlyle had been reared were considered to indicate sterling worth and character. The German writers did not, like the French, aim at lucidity and wit; they were absorbed in deep problems; they reflected upon the mysteries of life. Carlyle was attracted by their mysticism, and impressed by their obscurity."--Young, Norwood. Carlyle, His Rise and Fall, London, 1917, p. 62.

¹ Craig, R. S., op. cit., p. 151.

² A letter to Alexander Carlyle, Edinburgh, January 2, 1821: "I have translated a portion of Schiller's History of the Thirty Years' War . . . and sent it off, with a letter introduced by Tait the Review-bookseller, to Longmans and Co., London. Tait was to send it away very soon, in a package of newly published books, and to accompany it with a letter, setting forth that I was one of the most hopeful youths of the part, and that hence it were well for the men of the Pater-noster Row to secure my cooperation forthwith. The answer will come in (perhaps) three weeks. To say truth my Brother, I am not sanguine in this matter."--Early Letters, I, p. 311.

material in his Life of Schiller,¹ published in 1824. By 1824, in fact, he had translated the whole of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship. At the close of that year he writes to Brewster offering to translate all of Schiller's works.² This project, however, did not materialize. The fidelity with which he did all this translating, and the general approval of the work by those who could appraise it,³ indicated

¹ The following translations, made by Carlyle--not counting many scattered shorter passages--appear in his Life of Schiller: [Edited by H. D. Traill, London, 1899.]
 Extract from Schiller's letter to Huber, pp. 54-59.
Don Carlos, pp. 68-76; Act III, Sc. 10.
 Goethe's letter telling of his meeting with Schiller, pp. 91-94.
Wallenstein, pp. 137-149; Act. I, Sc. 4, 10, 11, 12.
Maid of Orleans, pp. 160-169; Act. III, Sc. 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10.
William Tell, pp. 177-186; Act. IV, Sc. 3.

² Kraeger, Heinrich. "Carlyle's Deutsche Studien und der 'Wotton Reinfred'", Anglia, Halle. Beiblatt IX, Band Nr. VII-VIII., Nov.-Dec., 1898, p. 196. Also Early Letters, II, p. 298.

³ Comments on the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship:

(a) "The book is now for the first time before us in an English shape, and we must begin with saying, that Goethe has, for once, no reason to complain of his translator. The version is executed, so far as we have examined it, with perfect fidelity; and, on the whole, in an easy, and even graceful, style, very far superior, we must say, to what we have been accustomed to in English translations from the German. The translator is, we understand, a young Gentleman of this city, who now for the first time appears before the public. We congratulate him on his very promising debut; and would fain hope to receive a series of really good translations from his hand. He has evidently a perfect knowledge of German; he already writes English much better than is at all common even at this time; and we know no exercise more likely to produce effects of permanent advantage upon a young mind of intellectual ambition--to say nothing of the very favourable reception which we are sure translations of such

strongly his qualification to undertake the translation of the German romances late in 1825.

There was a still stronger reason why Carlyle was fitted for this undertaking, namely his innate sympathy with the German spirit. In him there were many of the qualities that one associates with Teutonic people. He was drawn strongly to the mode of thought and the philosophy of life which in the large permeated German literature. Perhaps no other of his qualifications served him better than this one. He wrote always as a sympathetic student of the German works he translated.

So much for Carlyle's knowledge of German and his appreciation of the German way of life. He was further fitted to translate the romances because of the skill and power

books so executed cannot fail to receive in the present state of public feeling."--Blackwood's Magazine, XV, No. 89, June, 1824, p. 623.

(b) "If the text as it now appears in English, does not always seem intelligible, this is by no means the fault of the translator, who renders skillfully both the prose and the verses interspersed The whole novel turns on the history of actors and on the stage of Germany Great praise is due to the translator for fidelity and eloquence and we exhort him to continue his task"--William Taylor in the Monthly Review, 1825, VI, p. 528. Quoted by Susanna Howe, Wilhelm Meister and His English Kinsmen, New York, 1930, p. 100.

(c) "We cannot conclude without bearing testimony to the merits of Mr. Carlyle's admirable version of the Lehrjahre, which is so faithful and vigorous, and altogether so satisfactory, that had Mr. Bohn been at liberty to introduce it into his Standard Library, there would have been no occasion for any other labourer in the same field."--Boylan, R. Dillon. William Meister's Apprenticeship, London, 1881, Preface, p. v.

which he showed in the use of his own tongue. In the first letters by him which have been preserved--there are none before 1814--we find evidence that before he was twenty he knew how to use English effectively. He was a close observer, had caught the colorful, quaint style of his father,--quite the "remarkablest" man Carlyle ever knew¹--had absorbed the feeling for style from his readings, and applied both his intelligence and his imagination in all he wrote. Any of his early letters will make this statement clear. The following, selected at random, illustrates the ease and skill with which he expressed himself:

Annan, Jan. 11, 1815

To Mr. R. Mitchell,

On Sunday morning I left Edinburgh on the outside of the coach, like you, in the gayest humour in the world, but before riding half a dozen miles the "biting breezes" of the East began to disturb me, and notwithstanding the consolation I derived from a shaggy greatcoat, and from comparing the dread-nought appearance of our guard (who to a natural obesity of body altogether hyperbolical, had

¹ "Speaking to Mr. Milburn, a blind American preacher, Carlyle once said: 'I think of all the men I have ever known, my father was quite the remarkablest. Quite a farmer sort of person, using vigilant thrift and careful industry; abiding by veracity and faith, and with an extraordinary insight into the very heart of things and men. I can remember that from my childhood I was surprised at his using many words of which I knew not the meaning; and even as I grew to manhood I was not a little puzzled by them; and supposed they must be of his own coinage. But later, in my black-letter reading, I discovered that everyone of them I could recall was of the sound Saxon stock which had lain buried, yet fruitful, in the quick memory of the humbler sort of folk.'--Shepherd, Richard Hearn. Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Thomas Carlyle, I, 1795-1846, London, 1881, p. 6.

added the adventitious aids of 2738.5 cubic inches of solid cloth and leather in the form of a tremendous impenetrable roquelaure, and surmounted the whole of this terror-striking apparatus with an awful broad-brimmed hat:--displacing as he stood not less than twelve solid feet of air) with the pitiful woe-worn visages of two fellow-travellers, whose livid noses and rattling teeth proclaimed (one would have thought) that the hour of their dissolution was at hand,--notwithstanding all this, by the time we reached Hairstanes, I was right thankful to get inside of the 'leathern-conveniency',--where I continued all the way to Moffat."¹

That his early writings impressed others as having distinction of style may be inferred from a letter addressed by one of his friends:

July 27, 1814

To T. Carlyle from Thomas Murray,

I have had the pleasure of receiving, my dear Carlyle, your very humorous and friendly letter, a letter remarkable for vivacity, Shandean turn of expression, and an affectionate pathos, which indicate a peculiar turn of mind, make sincerity doubly striking and wit doubly poignant. You flatter me with saying my letter was good; but allow me to observe that among all my elegant and respectable correspondents there is none whose manner of letter-writing I so much envy as yours. A happy flow of language either for pathos, description, or humour, and an easy, graceful current of ideas appropriate to every subject, characterise your style. This is not adulation; I speak what I think. Your letters will always be a feast to me, a varied and exquisite repast; and the time, I hope, will come, but I trust is far distant, when these our juvenile epistles will be read and probably applauded by a generation unborn, and that the name of Carlyle, at least, will be inseparably connected with the literary history of the nineteenth century."²

¹ Early Letters, I, p. 27.

² Quoted by Froude, James A. Thomas Carlyle: A History of the First Forty Years of His Life, I, New York, 1882, p. 29.

Aside from invaluable drill afforded by extensive letter-writing before 1825, Carlyle further developed skill in the use of his native tongue by doing a large quantity of other writing, both hack-work and original. Of hack-work, not counting translations, before 1825, the year in which he began the romances, the most important was the articles contributed to the Edinburgh Encyclopedia during 1819 and the several years following, and the Life of Schiller, published during 1823-1824. Wotton Reinfred, what there was of it, was an original effort. The excellence of all this work has been frequently pointed out.¹ It is not such as one produces who has no other purpose than a material one and who will take no more than just enough pains to get the work accepted; Carlyle possessed the "requisites of a critic"² and would be satisfied with no work except the best. In consequence, his own became the work of an artist. "Nothing," says Nichol, "more impresses the student of Carlyle's works than his thoroughness. He never took a task in hand without

¹ Comments on the Life of Schiller: (a) "But the original matter of the Life of Schiller is as strong as the translations are weak. The style, as has been remarked, is not, of course, so complete an expression of the complete and many-sided genius of the writer as is afterwards found in 'Carlyle's'; but it is all the better a biographical style, at any rate in this instance, for that."--Traill, H. D. Carlyle's "Life of Schiller", Introduction, p. ix.

(b) ". . . it is an excellent piece of work, written with sympathy, simplicity and clear insight; the best Life of Schiller then extant, and, in English at any rate, there has been no better since."--Norton, Charles E. Correspondence of Goethe and Carlyle, p. xiii.

² "Of the four great requisites of a critic--insight,

the determination to perform it to the utmost of his ability."¹

Finally, Carlyle possessed one quality which was almost indispensable for the translations of such long, involved sentences as are found in the German romances: that was a good memory. To an unusual degree, he had the power to retain in his memory until he had rendered them into correct and forcible English the involved and often vague sentences in which the German romances abound. In translating he was thus "enabled to hold steadily before his imagination the large thought, . . . to make comparison, . . . and to move freely and unembarrassed through his material."² One need but try to render a page or two of material from such German writers as Musaeus, Richter,³ or even Goethe, vividly

knowledge, sympathy and detachment--he possessed the first two in a large measure, but he was often wanting in sympathy "—Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 144.

¹ Nichol, John. Thomas Carlyle, London, 1892, p. 166

² Said of Bayard Taylor by Julia Haskell: "He had a remarkable memory" which "was of great value to him in his work to translation, since it released his mind from the necessity of a fatiguing hunt after particulars, and enabled him to hold steadily before his imagination the large thought of the verse, to make comparison with instantaneous readiness, and to move freely and unembarrassed through his material."--Haskell, Julia, "Bayard Taylor's Translation of Goethe's 'Faust'," in Columbia University Germanic Studies III, 1908, New York, p. 5.

³ "A typical Richter sentence: "Andere Schläfer außerhalb der Postkutsche würd' ich mit gedachter Elle weniger auszumessen rathen, immer in einiger Besorgnis bleibend, dass etwa ein Kerl, der sich nur schlafend stellte, sogleich, als ich nahe genug stände, wie im Traume aufspränge, und den physiognomischen Messkünstler in die eigne Gesichtsbildung einen so hinterlistigen Fauststreich versetzte, dass sie

to appreciate the gain derived from the power to retain long, complicated, and often minutely detailed sentences in their entirety until they have been put into the new language in a manner in every way acceptable.¹

Summarizing, then, it should be reiterated that there are certain very definite requirements for a good translation of literary material: (a) it should show an absolute mastery of the language in which the original work is written; (b) it should show an easy command of the language into which the work is translated; (c) it should reflect a sympathetic familiarity with the subject matter of the original; (d) it should ordinarily show patient and conscientious adherence to the original; and (e) it should not be merely literal nor have any awkward, ungraceful, or inelegant constructions, except in so far as a faithful rendering of the original may demand them. To a more or less notable degree, Carlyle possessed qualifications which fitted him specifically for his task of translating the German romances: (a) in general, he

in keinem physiognomischen Fragmente, weil sie selber eines geworden, mehr florieren könnte, weder in punktierter Manier, noch in geschabter."--"Des Feldpredigers Schmelzle Reise nach Flaetz," in Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke, Berlin, 1862, 3d ed., XXVI, p. 233.

¹"Anyone who has tried to translate German into English knows the extreme difficulty of breaking up the long, double-barreled sentences into shorter English ones that can be wielded comfortably, and of keeping them, at the same time, close to the German. One may manage the technical difficulties of this pretty fairly, and produce a smooth-reading version that is faithful enough, in all essentials, to the original. And yet nine times out of ten it will be utterly faithless by creating a false impression of simplicity; a kind of ingenuous, childlike quality that is leagues removed from

had a fairly wide ranging knowledge of language and its problems; (b) in particular, he knew well the German language and a good deal about German literature; (c) he showed a spiritual kinship with the German people; (d) he was even in 1825 a master of his own tongue, as we see in his letters and in his early original work; (e) finally, to an unusual degree he had the strong memory necessary for retaining involved and often vague sentences until they were rendered into correct English.

It should be remembered, however, that with all these qualifications Carlyle was already about twenty-five years of age when he first came in contact with the German language and that the translation of the romances was undertaken but five years thereafter. To what extent even an enthusiast for German may at that age develop a "Sprachgefühl" is an open question. As Olga Marx says, there remained those subtle elements in the mastery of the German language which Carlyle found it impossible completely to master. Occasionally one is aware that he has missed the subtle force of an idiom, the fine shade of meaning in the case of a phrase, or that he has lacked the proper feeling for some term. In rendering the meaning in the large he was efficient enough; but he appears not always to have been aware of that linguistic

the German."--Howe, Susanna. Wilhelm Meister and His English Kinsmen, New York, 1930, p. 102.

"residue, irreducible to any erudite formula which has been called variously the spirit of a language, the Sprach-genius and such other vague terms that only serve to emphasize a certain elusive quality that cannot be transmitted in translation."¹

¹ Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 71.

CHAPTER III

Carlyle's Experiences as a Translator before Beginning Work on the Romances

The period during which Carlyle did his translating from both French and German extends approximately from 1819 to 1826. These were for him years of poverty and economic struggle, years during which he gladly accepted such hack-work as was offered him. Most of his work as translator must be rightly regarded as belonging to this type.

As has already been indicated in Chapter II, Carlyle began his career as a translator by rendering works from the French. The French work on Chemistry by Berzelius¹ has already been alluded to;² this Carlyle translated in

¹ This work was originally written by Berzelius in German and was later translated into French, as the "Vorrede" in his 4th edition indicates: Lehrbuch der Chemie. Vierte verbesserte Original-Auflage. Dresden, 1835:

"Seit dem Erscheinen der vorletzten Ausgabe dieses Lehrbuchs und deren Uebersetzung in's Französische, ist die Wissenschaft in dem Grade fortgeschritten, . . . dass die Ausgabe, welche ich hiermit dem Publikum übergebe, als eine gänzliche Umarbeitung jener zu betrachten ist.

Stockholm, im Septbr. 1835.

J. J. Berzelius."

² Isaac W. Dyer, in one entry in his Carlyle Bibliography, regards this work as a translation but assigns only the notes to Thomas Carlyle. "Translation, Examination of Some Compounds which Depend on Very Weak affinities, by Jacob Berzelius, (Notes by T. C.) Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, June-Oct. 1819."--Dyer, I. W., op. cit., p. 3.

In another note he states that the footnotes are signed by the translator Carlyle. "Examination of Some Compounds

1819¹. He is given credit, also, for having translated one work by Moh and written a review of a Norwegian article by Hansteen,² both in 1820. If the former of these two productions

which Depend upon Very Weak Affinities, by Jacob Berzelius, M. D., F. R. S. Explanatory footnotes to the article signed by the translator, Thomas Carlyle. Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, June-Oct., 1819, I, Nos. 1 and 2, pp. 63-75, 243-253."--Ibid., p. 30.

Examination of the article nowhere indicates any footnotes signed by Carlyle. In a third note Dyer gives Carlyle credit for translating the entire article. "Edinburgh Philosophical Journal (Edinburgh). Examination of Some Compounds which Depend Upon Very Weak Affinities, By Jacob Berzelius. (Tr. by T. C.) 1819, V. I, pp. 63-75, 243-253. Berzelius."--Ibid., p. 266.

John Muir in Notes and Queries states, "This is the first of Carlyle's literary work that reached the public."--Notes and Queries, London, Series 8, IV, 1893, p. 246.

¹ Edinburgh, (29th March), 1819, To his brother: "Berzelius' paper is printed. I was this day correcting the proof-sheet."--Early Letters, I, p. 227.

² Dyer, in the Carlyle Bibliography, gives Carlyle credit for the translation of Moh's work. "Translation of Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, Oct., 1820; Jan., 1821."--Dyer, I. W., op. cit., p. 3.

"Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. (Translated by Thomas Carlyle.)

"Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, 1820, Vol. III, No. 5, pp. 154-176; Oct., 1820, No. 6, pp. 317-342; Jan., 1821, Vol. IV, No. 7, pp. 54-67."--Ibid., p. 194.

Edinburgh Philosophical Journal (Edinburgh) "Outlines of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy. (Tr. By T. C.) 1820, V. 3, 154-176, 317-342; 1821, V. 4, 56-67. Mohs."--Ibid., p. 267.

In a footnote, referring to Outline of Professor Moh's New System of Crystallography and Mineralogy, the editor states that the article was a communication by one of Professor Moh's pupils. "Communicated by a Pupil of Professor Moh's.--Ed."--Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, III, p. 154.

Upon careful examination of the fifty-eight pages which the article covers in volumes III and IV of the Edinburgh Philosophical Journal nothing is found anywhere to indicate that the work is a translation, and that it was done

was, as has been supposed, a translation, Carlyle must have rendered into English not from any German or Scandinavian original, but from a French. At this time his knowledge was

by Carlyle. Likewise, there is no hint anywhere to suggest who Professor Moh was or in what language he wrote. The only, very slight, evidence suggesting that the work was a translation is the appearance of the following three appositives:

1. "Foliated gypsum, or Fraueneis," III, p. 317.
2. "The content (inhalt) of the system," IV, p. 56.
3. "Natural historical similarity, (naturhistorische Ähnlichkeit)," IV, p. 63.

These terms may suggest that the article was originally written in German but do not indicate that Carlyle translated it.

Dyer lists the treatise on Hansteen's work in the Carlyle Bibliography but does not state in what language Carlyle found the original. "Remarks upon Professor Hansteen's Inquiries concerning the Magnetism of the Earth. Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, 1820; Jan., 1821."--Dyer, I. W., op. cit., p. 3.

"Remarks upon Hansteen's Inquiries Concerning the Magnetism of the Earth."--Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, July, No. 7, pp. 114-124."--Ibid., p. 104.

"Edinburgh Philosophical Journal (Edinburgh). Remarks Upon Professor Hansteen's Inquiries Concerning the Magnetism of the Earth. 1820, v. 3, 124-138; 1821, v. 4, 114-124. Hansteen."--Ibid., p. 266.

See also Muir, John. Notes and Queries, London, Series 8, IV, 1893, p. 246.

From a footnote to the Hansteen article it is obvious that it is a translation from Norwegian into German. "Untersuchungen über den Magnetismus der Erde, von Christopher Hansteen, Professor der Angewandten Mathematik an der Norwegischen Universität, übersetzt von P. Freschow Hanson, Königl. Norw. Department-vollmachtigen und Landcadetten-Lehrer. Erster Theil: die mechanischen Erscheinungen des Magneten. 4 to, pp. 502. Christiania, 1817."--Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, III, Edinburgh, 1820, p. 124.

There is nothing in the Journal to indicate that the "remarks" were actually written by Carlyle. They may have been made in English by any reviewer who read the treatise in the German translation. Since Carlyle was greatly interested in mathematics, and since he contributed regularly to the Edinburgh Philosophical Journal, it is reasonable to assume that he is the author of the remarks; he must have known enough German at this time (1820) to read a scientific article in German intelligently.

still too meagre to allow him to work in the German language with success. In 1821 he began the now "very rare,"¹ translation of Legendre's Geometry, a book in French. It was a task he did not greatly relish² and for that reason may have sought to pass a large portion of it off to his brother John;³ he suggested that his own part in this undertaking should consist chiefly in correcting the results of his brother's efforts. The part which John actually did appears to have been so well done that it was "fitted for going directly to the Press."⁴ The whole work was completed in the latter part

¹ McMahon, in a personal letter to the editor of the Nation, writes that in the copy of the translation of Legendre's Geometry which he has before him he finds this pencil note by a second-hand bookseller: "Very rare; translated by Thomas Carlyle; Brewster only 'superintended' the translation."--McMahon, James. The Nation, XCIX, August 20, 1914, p. 222.

² To John A. Carlyle, April 7, 1822, Carlyle writes: "The translation of Legendre puzzles me a little. I had finished about four or five sheets of it long ago; but the people are getting clamorous for it now, and I not only find no kind of pleasure in the task, but cannot even perform it at all without sacrificing considerable prospects of a far more alluring kind."--Early Letters, II, p. 54.

³ To John A. Carlyle, he writes, April 7, 1822: "Could you do it, Jack? Have you time and spirit for it, I mean? If you think so--I wish you would try a portion of it, and let me see; the beginning of the fifth book, for example: write it out in a legible hand (no matter how ugly) and send it up by the first opportunity. . . . I am confident, I could make you do it well if I had you here."--Early Letters, II, p. 54.

⁴ To John A. Carlyle, May 19, 1822: "Your paper came duly to hand /The translation of a part of Legendre./ I thank you for the anxious punctuality you have shown; and I am happy, on looking over the article, to find that you have acquitted yourself manfully; happy for your sake, to see you possessed

of July, 1822.

All these articles--Berzelius, Moh, Hansteen, and Legendre--treated of science. It was only natural that it should be so: from boyhood Carlyle had been interested in science, had taken unusual interest in scientific studies at the university, had become a teacher of mathematics, and had even conveyed the impression that he would become a man of physical science rather than of literature and philosophy. Science, however, was entirely too limited and too confining for such a mind as his. While translating Legendre's Geometry he speaks almost sarcastically of "the 'most scientific' treatise on Geometry which I unhappily engaged to translate long ago,"¹ and of the thrice wearisome Legendre.²

This work with the French, however, must have been exceedingly valuable to Carlyle in preparing him for the work of translating from German. The account of how he discovered Germany is enlightening. To make the matter clearer it is necessary to go back some ten or twelve years in point of time. Early in life, Carlyle had shown himself to be a philosopher. Traditional religion with its fixed tenets was

and going on to acquire, so steady a knowledge of the English tongue and the art of composition,--and for my own sake, to find the manuscript so well fitted for going directly to the Press."--Early Letters, II, p. 68.

¹ Early Letters, I, May, 27, 1822, p. 79.

² Early Letters, I, July 25, 1822, p. 103.

entirely satisfactory for those who could accept it on faith wholesale--but it could not content the soul of the thinking Carlyle. About 1814, we find him reading Dugald Stewart, Hume, Gibbon, and the Stoic philosophers,¹ and the grave doubts he entertains later at the university, stimulated in part by such reading, are forcefully reflected in the letters which his mother writes to him. Of these years Susanna Howe writes that Carlyle "was suffering the tortures of the damned, partly from dyspepsia . . . and chiefly, we cannot doubt, because of his faith and his soul--those two preoccupations that haunted the nineteenth century forever after."² "For ten years," writes Charles Elliot Norton, "he had been engaged in constant and severe spiritual wrestlings; his soul, begirt by doubts, was painfully struggling to be free. The predominant tendencies of contemporary English thought were hateful to him; Philosophy in its true sense was all but extinct in England; the standard of ideal aims was hardly held high by any one of the popular writers. Carlyle had laid aside the creed of his fathers, and, dependent for guidance only upon the strength of his own moral principles, was adrift without other chart or compass."³

During the period of doubt and despondency following his studies in moral philosophy, he fell under the influence

¹ Johnson, W. S. Thomas Carlyle--A Study of His Literary Apprenticeship, 1814-1831, p. 6.

² Howe, Susanna, op. cit., p. 85.

³ Norton, Charles Elliot. Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, London, 1887, Introduction, p. vii.

of Madame de Stael's famous book on Germany. "His interest was aroused by it. For her animated, if somewhat shallow and imperfect accounts of the speculations of the living German Poets and Philosophers, he learned to look toward Germany for the spiritual light that he had not found in the modern French and English writers."¹ He continued eagerly to study German that he might investigate for himself.

In 1821, his mind still agonized with doubts, he had occasion to read Wilhelm Meister. The effect which this book had upon him is best seen in his Reminiscences, written many years later. There he says: "I had at length, after some repulsions, got into the heart of Wilhelm Meister, and eagerly read it through. My sally out, after finishing, along the vacant streets of Edinburgh, a windless, Scotch-misty Saturday night, is still vivid to me. 'Grand, surely, harmoniously built together, far seeing, wise and true. When, for many years, or almost in my whole life before, have I read such a book?'"² In 1838, in one of his lectures, Carlyle declared that he had first regarded Wilhelm Meister as a "recipe for happiness." Later, he discovered that it had nothing to do with happiness at all; man was to attend to his duties and thereby attain spiritual perfection.³ In

¹ Ibid., p. vii.

² Reminiscences. Edited by James A. Froude, New York, p. 105.

³ He first thought Wilhelm Meister a "recipe for

1875 he tells a friend, referring to his experiences with Wilhelm Meister, "I remember taking a long walk one evening from my lodgings near the College to Coates Crescent--there were no houses there then--when the full meaning burst upon me."¹

What Goethe came to mean to him Carlyle told Crabb Robinson in 1832. "Carlyle," says Robinson, "breakfasted with me, and I had an interesting morning with him. His voice and manner, and even the style of his conversation, are those of a religious zealot, and he keeps up that character in his declamations against the anti-religious. And yet, if not the god of his idolatry, at least he has a priest and prophet of his church in Goethe, of whose profound wisdom he speaks like an enthusiast. But for him, Carlyle says, he should not now be alive. He owes everything to him."² "It was Goethe," as Vaughan puts it, "who had taught him that the first step in the initiation of a man is self-renunciation." From Goethe "he had learned the sacredness of the

happiness" but "at last he began to perceive that happiness was not the right thing to seek; that man has nothing to do with happiness, but with the discharge of the work given him to do. The spiritual perfection of his nature, . . . -- this Mr. Carlyle began to apprehend, was the true object of search, and the proper end and aim of life."--Comment in Examiner on Carlyle's 12th lecture, June 17, 1838. Quoted by Shepherd, Richard Herne, op. cit., I, p. 195.

¹ Reminiscences, op. cit., p. 87.

² Entry in Crabb Robinson's Diary on February 12, 1832. Quoted by Shepherd, I, p. 99.

'worship of sorrow,' as the road which all who would read the facts of life or attain to spiritual manhood are ordained to tread."¹ Although he had held aloof from Goethe for a time,² he eventually came to realize that it was Goethe who more than any other man had taught and studied the conditions of modern life and modern knowledge, and who, therefore, could interpret them most fully and most clearly, could offer the surest guidance to those who were confronted with the same difficulties, the same riddle, and enable men to understand the world and to understand life.³ For him Goethe was "der Befreier von dem blos Niederreisenden und Negativen";⁴ he was for Carlyle "the first of the moderns."⁵

¹ Vaughan, C. E. "Carlyle and his German Masters," in Essays and Studies, Oxford, 1910, p. 179.

² "Carlyle hatte sich anfangs manchmal gegen den grossen deutschen gestraubt, der ihn zu erdrücken und zu vernichten drohte; er behauptete eine zeitlang seinen eignen trotzi- gen standpunkt und schüttelte durch kritische bemerkungen einen menschen ab, dem gegenüber doch nur das einzige ver- hältnis liebender unterordnung möglich war." [l.c. sic]-- Kraeger, Heinrich. "Carlyle's Deutsche Studien und der 'Wot- ton Reinfred,'" in Anglia, Zeitschrift für Englische Philolo- gie, Halle, 1819, Beiblatt IX, Band VII-VIII, p. 197.

³ Vaughan, C. E., op. cit., p. 170.

⁴ "Was Carlyle in Goethe sah, war der Befreier von dem blos Niederreisenden und Negativen, zu dem er sich ge- drängt fühlte. Er bedurfte eines grossen Vorbildes, das nach inneren Kämpfen Ruhe gewonnen hatte, und er fand es in Goethe. Viele Jahre danach sagte er zu Emerson: 'Er ist die einzige gesunde Seele von Tragweite, die ich durch mehrere Generationen in Europe entdeckt habe.'"--Brandes, Georg. Goethe, 1922, 593.

⁵ In his Reminiscences, Carlyle writes long afterwards; "This year I found that I had conquered all my scepticisms, agonizing doubtings, fearful wrestlings with the foul and vile

Carlyle was too unselfish and too greatly concerned about his countrymen to keep the treasure, the touchstone of his soul's transformation, to himself; he felt it his high mission to pass it on to others that they, too, might profit by his consoling experience. He deplores grievously that, either because of the great bulk of English and French work in England, or because of a certain disdain felt by the ancient autocracy of intellect among the English for the Germans, there has been highly limited literary intercourse between England and Germany.¹ He finds the translators poor in both their selections and their executions and the public "tasteless and absurd" in its demands.² It becomes his purpose to present

and soul-murdering Mud-gods of my Epoch; had escaped, as from a worse than Tartarus, with all its Phlegethons and Stygian quagmires; and was emerging, free in spirit, into the eternal blue of ether,--where, blessed be Heaven, I have, for the spiritual part, ever since lived What my pious joy and gratitude then was, let the pious soul figure. In a fine and veritable sense, I, poor, obscure, without outlook, almost without worldly hope, had become independent of the world;--what was death itself, from the world, to what I had come through? I understood well what the old Christian people meant by their 'Conversion,' by God's Infinite Mercy to them:--I had, in effect, gained an immense victory; and, for a number of years, had, in spite of nerves and chagrins, a constant inward happiness that was quite royal and supreme; in which all temporal evil was transient and insignificant; and which essentially remains with me still, though far oftener eclipses, and lying deeper down, than then. Once more, thank Heaven for its highest gift. I then felt, and still feel, endlessly indebted to Goethe in the business; he, in his fashion, I perceived, had travelled the steep rocky road before me,--the first of the moderns.--Norton, Charles E. Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, London, 1887, Introduction, p. xi.

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. Preface to first edition of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, Edinburgh, 1824, p. 3.

² "Our translators are unfortunate in their selection

and to interpret German literature to the English people because in it he had found something "medicative and restorative, a needed antidote to the materialism and skepticism of English literature and Philosophy,"¹ He resolves to translate Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, the first part of Goethe's Meister book, into English so that his countrymen might read; and impelled by this same sense of obligation he was "for a long time to come," says Wilson, "as lavish in prescribing German for spirits in distress as the doctors were with calomel for his stomach."²

It appears that through the intensive study of German, beginning (as we have seen) in 1819, his deep interest in German literature, and his extensive training in translating French material, Carlyle had become adequately qualified to undertake translation from the German, as he proposed. That he had confidence in himself for such work there appears to be no doubt. In 1822 he had undertaken to write the Life of Schiller, the first literary use to which he put his knowledge of the German language; for this work he translated

or execution, or the public is tasteless and absurd in its demands; for, with scarcely one or two exceptions, the best works of Germany have lain neglected, or worse than neglected, and the Germans are yet utterly unknown to us."--Ibid., p. 3.

¹ "The letters, the prefaces and the essays themselves show us that the German literature which Carlyle was devoting himself to making known in England, was looked upon as medicative and restorative, a needed antidote to the materialism and skepticism of English literature and philosophy."--Johnson, W. S. Thomas Carlyle--A Study, p. 82.

² Wilson, David A., op. cit., I, p. 222.

approximately fifty pages from Schiller's dramas. The work appeared in installments in the London Magazine during the years 1824-1825, and was printed as a separate volume, without Carlyle's name, in the spring of 1825.¹

Before he had half finished the Life of Schiller, he had already begun the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship. The reasons for his selection of this work for translation have already been indicated. Writing of this undertaking in 1868, he says, "I was now, really in part as a kind of duty conscientiously translating for my countrymen, if they would read."² H. D. Traill raises the question of Carlyle's motive in selecting Meister,³ but the translator's own reasons set forth in his introduction to the work, make the matter unmistakably clear. "Minds like Goethe's," he says there, "are the common property of all nations; and, for many reasons, all should have a correct impression of him." He says, too, that the work was intended to supply an adequate idea of Germany; for "the prevailing

¹ Norton, Charles E. Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, London, 1817, Introduction, p. xiii.

² In his Reminiscences of Edward Irving, done in 1866. Quoted by Charles E. Norton, Correspondence between Goethe, Introduction, p. xv.

³ "What determined Carlyle's choice of this particular work of Goethe's is still, and after the explanations of various Biographers, not quite apparent."--Traill, H. D. Introduction to Carlyle's translation of Wilhelm Meister, I, p. iv.

taste of Germany is likewise indicated by it."¹

In addition to the spiritual significance which Carlyle felt Meister to have, he saw in it a great work of art, illustrating effectively Goethe's memorable use of language. In his essay on Goethe he makes this appreciative statement: "Goethe's language, even to a foreigner, is full of character and secondary meanings; polished, yet vernacular and cordial, it sounds like the dialect of wise, ancient, and true-hearted men; in poetry brief, sharp, simple, and expressive; in prose, perhaps still more pleasing; for it is at once concise and full, rich, clear, unpretending and melodious; and the sense, not presented in alternating flashes, piece after piece revealed and withdrawn, rises before us in a continuous dawning, and stands at last simultaneously complete, and bathed in the mellowest and ruddiest sunshine."²

¹ "Minds like Goethe's are the common property of all nations; and, for many reasons, all should have correct impressions of them."

After he has made sufficient allowance for its "flatness," "staleness," the "milk-sop hero," "puppets and mountebanks," Carlyle hopes that to the "smaller group" who have seriously concerned themselves with some philosophy of life, "who have penetrated to the limits of their own conceptions, and wrestled with thoughts and feelings too high for them, it will be pleasing and profitable to see the horizon of their certainties widened, or at least separated with a firmer life from the impalpable obscure which surrounds it on every side."--Carlyle, Thomas. Preface to the first edition of his Wilhelm Meister, 1824, pp. 5 ff.

² Carlyle, Thomas. "Essay on Goethe," in Wilhelm Meister, New York, I, p. 26.

Unfortunately, the reception of the Apprenticeship in England was generally, in so far as it pertained to the content of the book, rather unfavorable. The translation itself, however, except in De Quincey's severe and unfair criticism in the London Magazine,¹ was on the whole commended.² That Carlyle was himself fully aware of certain objectionable features in Wilhelm Meister is repeatedly evidenced in the

¹ London Magazine, X, August, 1824. Quoted by Dr. Otto Schmeding in Studien zur Englischen Philologie, Hefte V-VII, Einleitung, p. 2. In this article De Quincey charges Carlyle with having "overrun" the translation with "provincialisms, vulgarisms, and barbarisms," and undertakes to single out a number of illustrations.

² "Whatever ordinary novel-readers may think, it is no trifle that we now possess in the English language a faithful and complete version of one of these works by which Goethe has established his fame as a novelist. The English Translation of the Sorrows of Werther is abominable, and no one can have any proper notion of that work from it. We trust this young gentleman may be prevailed upon to do for Werther the same service which Meister has received at his hands. The task will be a far lighter one, and the juvenile work, whatever Goethe himself may think or say, is, after all, a superior one even to his Meister. It is, at all events, a work much more certain to find favour with English readers, if it were but presented to them in a decent English dress." --Blackwood's, XV, 1824, p. 631.

"This is allowed, by the general consent of all Germany, to be the very greatest work of their very greatest writer We must say that we cannot enter into the spirit of this German idolatry To us it certainly appears, after the most deliberate consideration, to be eminently absurd, puerile, incongruous, vulgar, and affected;--and, though redeemed by considerable powers of invention, and some traits of vivacity, to be so far from perfection, as to be, almost from beginning to end, one flagrant offence against every principle of taste, and every just rule of composition. Though indicating, in many places, a mind capable both of acute and profound reflection, it is full of mere silliness and childish affectation;--and though evidently the work of one who had seen and observed much, it

letters he wrote while engaged in making the translation. He tells Miss Welsh very frankly that the "task suits him little," that the "libidinous actresses" and "pasteboard apparatus" disgust him, and that Goethe at times is "an ass" and should be "kicked out of the room."¹ In his preface to the first edition of Wilhelm Meister he makes copious and humble apologies for his shortcomings in the translation, and finally concludes: "This version of Meister, with whatever faults it may have, I honestly present to my countrymen: if, while it makes any portion of them more familiar with the richest, most gifted of living minds, it increases their knowledge, or even affords them a transient amusement, they

is throughout altogether unnatural, and not so properly improbable, as affectedly fantastic and absurd--kept, as it were, studiously aloof from general or ordinary nature--never once bringing us into contact with real life or genuine character--and, where not occupied with professional squabbles, paltry jargon, and scenical profligacy of strolling players, tumblers, and mummers (which may be said to form its staple) is conversant only with incomprehensible mystics and vulgar men of whim, with whom, if it were at all possible to understand them, it would be a baseness to be acquainted."
 --Edinburgh Review, XLII, 1825, p. 414.

¹ "There is poetry in the book and prose, prose forever. When I read of players and libidinous actresses, and their sorry pasteboard apparatus for beautifying and enlivening the 'Moral world,' I render it into grammatical English--with a feeling mild and charitable as that of a starving hyena. The book is to be printed in Winter or Spring. No mortal will ever buy a copy of it. N'importe! Goethe is the greatest genius that has lived for a century, and the greatest ass that has lived for three. I could sometimes fall down and worship him: at other times I could kick him out of the room."--Early Letters, II, p. 223.

will excuse its errors, and I shall be far more than paid for all my labour."¹ Furthermore, he says, "All I ask in the name of this illustrious foreigner is, that the court which tries him be pure, and the jury instructed in the cause; that the work be not condemned for wanting what it was not meant to have, and by persons nowise called to pass sentence on it."²

That his version of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship was not more favorably received in Britain must have proved disappointing to the young translator.³ The work, however,

¹ Carlyle, Thomas, Preface to the first edition of Wilhelm Meister, I, 1824, p. 11.

² Ibid., p. 10.

³ Carlyle seems to have been somewhat uncertain about the reception of his Wilhelm Meister Apprenticeship in Britain. He completed his translation in May, 1824, and the book was published early in the next month. The following extracts from five letters, of different dates indicate that he was somewhat puzzled about its success:

(a) June 25, 1824: "It is making way here--but slowly: a second edition seems a dubious matter."--Early Letters, II, p. 279.

(b) July 22, 1824: "Meister is growing a kind of small, very small lion in London: the newspapers puff him, the people read him, many venerate him highly. The periodical Rhadamanthuses of Grub-street pat me on the head, saying I am a clever fellow and must translate them much more."--Love Letters, I, p. 387.

(c) Sept. 17, 1824: "Is there any decent review of Meister? I have seen only one, in the London Magazine; it did not make me angry." [The Review of Meister by De Quincey.] --Love Letters, II, p. 12.

(d) Oct. 5, 1824: "Of Meister I have seen no review worth calling by the name; tho' it has been puffed and praised in various quarters, and has met with a reception far beyond what I anticipated."--Love Letters, II, p. 19.

(e) Feb. 28, 1825: Referring to the critics, he writes: Goethe is the Moon and these are penny-dogs; their barking pro

was not unprofitable to him. Aside from the £180 he received for it, out of which he bought "a suit of fine clothes for six pounds" and "a good watch for six,"¹ it definitely increased his reputation in certain quarters. More important for us, it helped prepare him for further labors of the sort, or, to be more specific, it helped to prepare him for the task of translating the German romances and of introducing their authors to his English public.²

and con is chiefly their own concern."--Early Letters, II, p. 312.

¹ June 25, 1824: Early Letters, II, p. 279.

² The sketches of the life and works of each author, the "memoirs" with which Carlyle introduced each set of stories were considered by some as the most valuable and attractive portion of German Romance: "The Monthly never viewed favourably the importation of German stories in such numbers, and here it wishes that a translator of such ability should have turned his attention to the sounder portions of German literature rather than this 'trash of fictions.' It considers the memoirs far the most valuable and attractive portion of the work. The Literary Gazette doubts that English taste will ever become reconciled to the 'sentimentality of Richter' or the 'mysterious mysticism of Wilhelm Meister,' but welcomes the volumes as a venture on new lines."--Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 257.

CHAPTER IV

The Translation of The German Romances

The project of translating the German romances appears to have had its inception in Carlyle's mind in 1822. Late in that year Carlyle suggested to Jane Welsh that she write a novel in collaboration with him.¹ By the following May it is clear that the two had agreed that she undertake the translation of German tales instead.² During the next year, while Carlyle was busy with Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, Miss Welsh appears to have worked desperately at translating but made so little progress that eventually she abandoned the project. By 1825, before he went to Hoddam Hill, Carlyle had come to see that if the romances were to be translated he would have to do the work himself. In that year, therefore, he arranged with the publisher, Tait, to translate a number of German romances,³ and at this task

¹The plot of the novel was to be, in a general way, the same as that which was attempted five years later in Wotton Reinfred.

² May 3, 1823: "What would you think of a Book appearing next Winter with the Title 'Tales from the German, translated and selected by Jane Baillie Welsh'?"--Love Letters, I, p. 209.

May 11, 1823: "Tomorrow I shall order the Book of Volks-märchen for you-- . . . the tales seem very good, they will employ all your gracefulness and humour of style to translate them properly. I will read them first, and then send them down to you; out of five volumes of good stories, we shall certainly succeed in gathering one of excellent."--Ibid., I, p. 215.

³ "Carlyle came to Edinburgh (from Mainhill) in April

he spent his time quietly and diligently at Hoddam from October, 1825, to August, 1826.

Various motives appear to have been responsible for Carlyle's undertaking this translation. The "economic embarrassment," which certainly was a primary motive, has already been alluded to. He had given up two possible careers--that as a minister and that as a teacher--which might have provided him with a comfortable income. The publishers were not yet eager for his original endeavors, but would accept his translations: consequently, translating offered the most expedient access to ready money. Then, too, Carlyle was, of course, aware of the demand which, at the time, existed for translations from German literature.¹ Some indication of

[1825] to consult Brewster, Tait, etc., about literary work for himself. There was small talk of founding a Literary Newspaper, with Lockhart and Carlyle in charge of the Belles Lettres department and Brewster of the Scientific; but the scheme did not take effect. Carlyle finally arranged to proceed with a selection and translation of specimens of German Fiction, to be published by Tait in a series of volumes under the title of German Romance. While negotiations were going on he paid a long visit to Hoddington

"Before leaving Edinburgh for home Carlyle selected a number of German Books and took them with him to Mainhill, where he arrived about the 12th of May, and staid until Hoddam Hill was got ready for his occupation."--Note by the editor, Ibid., II, p. 116.

¹ "In England more especially there are wiflings who make the same use of German literature at present, that was made by their forefathers of the French, in the reign of Louis XIV. A horrible story or a sentimental sonnet finds its corner in every number of our numberless Magazines; and more ambitious writers try their strength upon the epics of Schiller, or the dramas of Goethe. When the author of Waverly fails to furnish us with his quarterly novel, and our pallet is not pleased with the works of the imitators, who rival

the urgency of this demand, particularly for German romances, may be seen from the supply. In 1823, for example, there was published not only a translation of Grimm's Popular Stories but also a more general work, Popular Tales of Northern Nations. In 1826, the year before Carlyle's translation was published, appeared no fewer than four collections of German narratives in translation: R. Holcraft, Tales from the German; T. Roscoe, The German Novelists; G. Soane, Specimens of German Romance; and R. P. Gillies, German Stories.¹ Carlyle, then, appears to have gaged the requirements of the reading public at the time quite accurately.

Carlyle's greater purpose in translating the romances, however, was one more worthy than mere money-making. To understand this motive fully it is necessary to remember the situation which existed in England at this time with reference to translated German tales. The great mass of such material flooding the country and being read by the English public was definitely inferior in both its content and in the quality of the translating. Generally, the public still showed a craving for tales of terror and chivalric sentiment; ill qualified translators eagerly supplied the demand. Even

rabbits in the brevity of their gestation, the adventurous spirit of British bookseller casts a longing look to Germany and a translation is served up as readily and as cheaply as a chop of Dolly's. The novel-reading is indulged and confirmed."--The British Critic, 1824, S. 2, XXII, p. 560.

¹ Supra, p. 23.

as late as 1827, a complaint appeared in the Edinburgh Review, to the effect that translators are still the "same faithless and stolid race they have ever been," bringing over to England "a particle of gold" hidden "among shiploads of yellow sand and sulphur."¹ "Werter," [sic] a novel delightful enough in the original, had reached England through the medium of the French. As a result, it was now enjoying wide popularity in a form "mutilated," "inaccurate," "shorn of its caustic strength," with "its melancholy rendered maudlin."² It was this abundant selection and abominable rendering of less wholesome German fiction into English which afforded Carlyle his most important motive for translating German romances. He had an utter dislike for the type of German fiction demanded by popular taste and was, therefore, drawn to Tait, the publisher, who had offered "to give him a free hand in the choice of materials for a collection of romances."³

¹ Edinburgh Review, XLVI, 1827, p. 311.

² "The English reader ought also to understand that our current version of Werter is mutilated and inaccurate: it comes to us through the all-subduing medium of the French; shorn of its caustic strength; with its melancholy rendered maudlin; its hero reduced from the stately gloom of a broken-hearted poet to the tearful wrangling of a dyspeptic tailor. One of the first to notice this fault was Goethe himself."--Carlyle, Thomas. "Essay on Goethe," Miscellaneous Essays, I, p. 16.

³ "Carlyle's services were also in demand for translation of German tales of terror and chivalric sentiment, which were the fad of the moment. G. B. Whitaker, who had handled the English sales of the Meister, was saying confidentially to Connop Thirlwall: 'German tales are now the rage, and I wish to take advantage of the mania while it lasts.' Carlyle,

He was determined to supply his countrymen with more wholesome selections and better translations.¹ Although he stated, too modestly one would say, in a note to the collected edition of 1857 that his German Romance was "a Book of Translations, not of my suggesting or desiring, but of my executing as honest journeywork in defect of better,"² he must have seen in the freedom to make his own selections and translate them, an opportunity to benefit his English public. It has already been pointed out how, after making acquaintances with Goethe, he had come to look to the Germans as possessing something which his own country deplorably lacked. It was his hope that by means of these romances the English public would at least have a "few loopholes" through which to peep through the "dead wall" which separates the two countries

disliking the type of fiction wanted, found some attraction in the offer of Tait of Edinburgh to give him a free hand in the choice of materials."--Neff, Emery, op. cit., p. 75.

¹ Carlyle could not bear to see good literature poorly translated; the following letter is evidence of this: "I greatly approved of your friend Empson's [Lord Leveson Gower's Poems and Translations, Article 12, Oct., 1830] acknowledgement that 'Faust' was a wonderful poem, and Lord Leveson Gower a windbag; only he led him far too gently over the coals; he should have roasted him there, and made him not Leveson, but a cinder. It is positively the nearest approach we can make to sacrilege in these days, for a vain young man, not knowing his right hand from his left, to take on inspired work, like this of Goethe's and mangle it into such an unspeakable hash. Let it either be overlooked, or punished by Auto-da-fe."--Letter to Mr. Macvey Napier, Jan. 20, 1831. Quoted by Shepherd, op. cit., I, p. 79.

² Traill, H. D. Reported in his Introduction to German Romance, I, New York, 1898, p. vii.

and profit thereby.¹ "I have sometimes hoped," he says in the preface to the original edition, "that this little enterprise might assist, in its degree, to forward an acquaintance with the Germans and their literature; a literature and a people both well worthy of our study."² It must be concluded, therefore, that in the rendering of the German romances Carlyle had a definitely cultural and ennobling purpose.

In particular, Carlyle desired that the English public give more time to a tolerant consideration of the religious mysticism, and "interpretative transcendentalism," which he had discovered in a portion of German literature, particularly the philosophic. This element he found best represented in Novalis, the "most ideal of all idealists," whose aim it was "to preach and establish the Majesty of Reason," who "loves external Nature with singular depth . . . and holds unspeakable communings with her."³ It must be borne in mind,

¹ "The dead wall, which divides us from this as from all other provinces of German Literature, I must not dream that I have anywhere overturned; at the most, I may have perforated it with a few loopholes, of narrow aperture truly, and scanty range through which, however, a studious eye may perhaps discern . . . the singular country, which, on the other side, has long flourished in such abundant variety of intellectual scenery and product . . ."--Carlyle, Thomas. Preface to German Romance, I, New York, 1827, p. 1.

² Ibid., I, p. 5.

³ "He comes before us as the most ideal of all Idealists The aim of Novalis's whole Philosophy, . . . is to preach and establish the Majesty of Reason, in that stricter sense--the pure, ultimate light of our nature,

however, that Carlyle could tolerate only a wholesome mysticism. "With a mysticism," says Roe, "that spent itself in longings for a new catholicism or dwelt apart in a misty dream-world of fairies and hobgoblins, he had nothing to do."¹ Nor was it in him "to share in the desire of the romanticists to hold a festival of the senses, to play fast and loose with the ego, or to disintegrate the spiritual life into a hundred fantastic or grotesque shapes. Carlyle held fast to the unity of the higher self. His romanticism kept to the deeper channels of thought and was not drawn into the eddies of psychology or the muddy flats of pathology."² He was interested in discovering truth; in his philosophy there was no room for sham and falsehood. If the romances could to some degree lead his readers to discover that

wherein lies the foundation of all Poetry, Virtue, Religion: to conquer for it all provinces of human thought, and everywhere reduce its vassal, Understanding, into fealty, the right and only useful relation for it

"He loves external Nature with a singular depth; nay, we might say, he reverences her, and holds unspeakable communings with her: for Nature is no longer dead, hostile Matter, but the veil and mysterious Garment of the Unseen; as it were, the Voice with which the Deity proclaims himself to man. These two qualities,--his pure religious temper, and heartfelt love for Nature,--bring him into true poetic relation both with the spiritual and the material World."--Carlyle, Thomas. "Novalis." Critical and Miscellaneous Essays, Popular Edition, Boston /Year of publication missing/ II, p. 104 ff.

¹ Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 75.

² Ibid., p. 81.

element among the Germans, could effectively invite them to study nature, to study man, to study life, sanely and interpretatively, his hope would, to a large degree at least, be realized.

To give the English public a generous portion of this curative stimulant which Carlyle had found to be so satisfying it was necessary to administer it in a form which would be inviting--perhaps much as one would give a child a dissolved pill in a glass of orange-juice. The logical form for this purpose was, obviously, that of fiction; for, as it was indicated above, the appetite for this type of literature was highly developed. Fortunately, for this purpose, Carlyle had always shown some interest in fiction. That he had read much of it is repeatedly indicated in his early letters.¹ For example, he had recommended to his brother John the reading of all of Scott's novels;² he himself had read Ossian,³ had perused the eight volumes of Smollett, and had sat up until four o'clock in the morning reading Lewis's The Monk.⁴ On the whole, however, he did not seem to be very kindly disposed

¹ Mainhill, May 22, 1825: "I should have told you in plain prose, in an earlier portion of my sheet, that I arrived here ten days ago, having hastily collected some forty tomes of German fiction, and fled from Edinburgh as from a pesthouse, where day after day my state was growing more intolerable."--Love Letters, II, p. 126.

² Early Letters, II, p. 89.

³ Ibid., I, p. 240.

⁴ Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 8.

towards the novel. He "would have been glad," says Roe, "to banish romantic novels to a place more forlorn than an Irish bog";¹ he was "opposed to a literature that he regards as proceeding from sham and falsehood, such as novels and plays,"² and "praised the literature that seemed to him truthful, veracious, faithful to fact and reality."³

To select tales suitable for the purpose which Carlyle had in mind was a task by no means easy.⁴ One of the first difficulties with which he had to contend was the great volume of the German romantic material from which he had to choose.⁵ "Novelists at present alive and active,"

¹ Ibid., p. 86.

² Ibid., p. 73.

³ Ibid., p. 140.

⁴ A writer in Blackwood's at the time Carlyle was completing his translation of the romances has this to say about the difficulty with which the translator of fiction is confronted: "A translator of German Tales stands in a situation differing, as to one capital circumstance, from all other translators whatsoever. He is loaded with a responsibility double of theirs. They are responsible as translators, and in that character only; he is a translator, and a selector besides. In every other department of literature, except that of novels, the original motive for translating one book rather than another is, that the public curiosity has been already attracted to it But with respect to novels and romances, the case is very different. Here the public is in search of pure amusement; of that and that only." --Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 845.

⁵ (a) "In Germany, accordingly, as in other countries, the Novelists are a mixed, innumerable, and most productive race. Interspersed with a few Poets, we behold whole legions and hosts of Poetasters, in all stages of worthlessness; here languishing in the transports of Sentimentality, there dancing the St. Vitus dance of hard-studied Wit and Humour;

he says, "are to be reckoned not in units, but in thousands."¹ "Lafontaine, for example," he says, "has already passed his hundredth volume." He calls the German novelists a "mixed, innumerable, . . . most productive race," and speaks of there being "whole legions" of them. "To discover the grain of truth among this mass of falsehood, especially where time had not yet exercised its separating influence, was no plain problem."² Again he says, "It would be easy to fill, not four, but four hundred volumes."³

Another difficulty with which he was confronted was his own high standard of what was worth while. Some German writers he found to be too "abstruse and didactic"; others "much too harsh, infernal, and unpoetical for English readers."

some roaring on bold pinion into the thundery regions of Atala, ou les Amours de deux Sauvages; some diving, on as bold fin, into the gory profundities of Frankenstein and The Vampyre; and very many traveling, contented in spirit, the ancient beaten highway of Commonplace.

"To discover the grain of truth among this mass of falsehood, especially where Time has not yet exercised its separating influence was no plain problem; nor can I flatter myself either that I have exhausted the search, or in no case been deceived in my selection."--Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, Preface, pp. vii-viii.

(b) "Translations from the German! Bless me, all the world now-a-days draws upon this intellectual bank, but though the run has been very great, there is yet no lack of ore and of sterling quality too, to meet the demands of all who are qualified to draw upon it."--Holcraft, Richard. Tales of Humour and Romance, London, 1826. Preface, p. iv.

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. Preface to German Romance, I, p. 2.

² Ibid., p. 2.

³ Ibid., p. 3.

The deep and "wizard beauty" of Novalis he feared could not be discovered because of its mysticism. Many tales were also too long, others too short, and several "best performances" had unfortunately been already translated, however poorly, by another. Similar to the high standards of Carlyle were those of the publishers. Blackwood's Magazine laid down rules for him who would select romances to translate: the translator was "to abstain from novels of manners," "to avoid tales of sentiment," "to confine himself to novels of incident and regular plot."¹

Furthermore, there was also an element of prejudice of which Carlyle had to take account in choosing material suitable for translation. In 1816 an article appeared in the Edinburgh Review referring to the Germans as a "slow, heavy people," who "can only be put in motion by some violent and often repeated impulse," and who do things only "by a desire of distinction."² By 1827 the tone of this

¹ "Let him abstain altogether from German novels of manners; this for two reasons: one--that German manners are in bad taste, mean and coarse; the other--that manners generally, whether coarse or not, the Germans are coarse delineators"

"There remains for the English selector as the only quarry in which he can labour with such promise and success, the novels of incident and regular plot This is the forest in which he must beat about for game. Incidentally these last were said to be greatly in need of reform. Most are so villainous in point of style that no one can read them."--Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 846.

² "In all they do, it is evident that they are much more influenced by a desire of distinction than by any impulse of the imagination, or the consciousness of

Journal had hardly changed; it contained an article, that year, which refers to the German people as being "still in a rather coarse and uncultivated state of mind," displaying "wild and headlong temper" and "delighting in coarse excitements, vulgar horrors and all sorts of showy exaggerations."¹ A commentator in Blackwood's, 1826, even questioned whether any good novel could come from Germany at all: "Such a thing as a good novel of regular proportions," he writes, "there certainly is not in the German language; nothing that can pretend to take its place by the side of Le Sage, Fielding, Smollett, or Mrs. Inchbald."² It is apparent, therefore, that in the attempt to select satisfactory tales in the face of all these prejudices Carlyle was

extraordinary qualifications. They write, not because they are full of a subject, but because they think it is a subject upon which, something striking may be written.

"The truth is, that they are naturally slow, heavy people; and can only be put in motion by some violent and often repeated impulse, under the operation of which they lose all control over themselves--and nothing can stop them short of the last absurdity Truth, in their view of it, is never what is, but what, according to their system, ought to be."--Edinburgh Review, XXVI, 1816, p. 67.

¹ "That the Germans, with much natural susceptibility, are still in a rather coarse and uncultivated state of mind; displaying with the energy and other virtues of a rude people, many of their vices also; in particular, a certain wild and headlong temper, which seizes on all things too hastily and too impetuously, weeps, storms, loves, hates, too fiercely and vociferously; delighting in coarse excitements, such as glaring contrasts, vulgar horrors, and all sorts of showy exaggerations."--Edinburgh Review, XLVI, 1826, p. 313.

² Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 854.

confronted by a real problem.

The tales which were finally selected did not afford Carlyle material which was ideal for his plans. The tales were not what he had sought, but simply the best that he was able to find in at least forty volumes which he took to Hoddam Hill. "His final selection for the four volumes of the anthology," writes Emery Neff, "was a compromise between popular taste and his desire to enlighten the public as to German life, character, and thought,"¹ They are largely of the Hausmärchen type, abounding in elements of superstition rather than in sound philosophy. Perhaps Goethe's Wanderjahre, which is a miscellaneous work crowded with theories of art, pedagogy, industry, and fragmentary stories, and Richter's Quintus Fixlein, a biographical narrative suggestive of Sartor Resartus, approached to what was wanted.² For genuine

¹ "He took to Hoddam Hill forty miscellaneous borrowed books to look over, and ordered others from Germany. His final selection for the four volumes of the anthology was a compromise between popular taste and his desire to enlighten the public as to German life, character, and thought. The first two volumes met the demand for light fiction with folk material by Musaeus and Tieck (Grimm's Fairy Tales had been published in 1823), a fantasy by Hoffman, and the chivalric medievalism of Fouqué's Aslauga's Knight. But the third volume introduced Carlyle's new discovery, Jean Paul Richter, hitherto untranslated except in fragments, with the half-sentimental, half-humorous extravaganza of Quintus Fixlein and Schmelze's Journey to Flaetz. The final volume was of still greater solidity; the heavily didactic second part of Wilhelm Meister (the Travels), prefaced by a biographical and critical sketch of Goethe that was 'the first at all adequate account of him in English.' This educative purpose greatly increased the difficulties of translation (the Germans themselves need a special glossary for Richter), and of procuring books."--Neff, Emery, op. cit., p. 82.

² Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, Preface, I, p. 4.

interest, the three stories by Musaeus will definitely rank highest, but they are not provocative of deep and serious thought. In Tieck, Carlyle admired the lofty imagination, which was not, however, "of the intellect"; the stories in the collection bear out this estimate. Hoffmann's Golden Pot was probably selected primarily for the type; hardly for any edifying qualities. All the stories, however, are wholesome and inoffensive, giving a fair impression of German interests and German traditions.

It appears, too, that in making his selections, Carlyle aimed to have represented several types of German tales extant. To be explicit, he chose six types: the popular tale, in prose form; the popular tale, in poetic form; the chivalry romance; the fantasy piece; the novel; and the art-novel. Goethe's Das Märchen, a "Phantasmagory," which Carlyle translated at this time, was not included in his collection but was sent to Miss Welsh, probably as a gift. Goethe's Novelle, an allegory, probably translated at this time also and published together with Das Märchen in 1832, was likewise omitted from the collection. Below is given a complete list of the authors from whom Carlyle translated stories for his "German Romance," together with the types and the titles of all the stories themselves:

1. Musaeus: Popular Tale (Märchen) in the prose form
 Dumb Love
 Libussa
 Melechsala
2. Tieck: Popular Tale (Märchen) in the poetic form

- The Fair-Haired Eckbert
The Trusty Eckart
The Runenberg
The Elves
The Goblet
3. Fouqué: Chivalry Romance (Ritter-roman)
Aslauga's Knight
4. Hoffmann: The Fantasy-piece
The Golden Pot
5. Richter: The Novel
Army-Chaplain Schmelzle's Journey to
Flaetz
The Life of Quintus Fixlein
6. Goethe: The Art-Novel (Kunstroman)
Wilhelm Meister's Travels

The Phantasmagory
The Tale (Das Märchen)

The Allegory
Novelle¹

All the stories listed above, excepting Goethe's The Tale and The Novelle, appeared in the first edition of four volumes. Carlyle wrote a preface to the whole work and a biographical and critical introduction dealing with each author. The table of contents of the four volumes is as follows:

- Vol. I. Preface, Musaeus, Dumb Love, Libussa, Melech-sala, Friedrich de la Motte Fouqué, Aslauga's Knight.
- Vol. II. Ludwig Tieck, The Fair-Haired Eckbert, The Trusty Eckhart, The Runenberg, The Elves, The Goblet, E. T. W. Hoffmann, The Golden Pot.

¹ The three works of Goethe here listed are not included in the present discussion because Carlyle did not after all include them in German Romance.

Vol. III. Jean Paul Friedrich Richter, Schmelzle's Journey to Flaetz, Life of Quintus Fixlein.

Vol. IV. Goethe, Wilhelm Meister's Travels, or the Renunciants.¹

Although Carlyle had the romances translated by the end of August, 1826, Tait did not publish them until the following year. The four collections by Roscoe, Holcraft, Gillies, and Soane, respectively, which appeared in 1826 made it seem advisable to postpone publication of German Romance. Even then the publisher found it necessary to resort to sensational advertising to sell the books.²

In his Preface to the first edition of German Romance Carlyle avoids general commentary on the body of material he has translated, preferring to leave to his public whatever appraisal there may be of the book as a whole. "On

¹ "In the first, People's, and Library editions of the Collected Works, the above contents, with the exception of the Preface, Biographical Introductions, Aslauga's Knight and the Golden Pot, are included in the volumes entitled 'Translations.' In the Centenary Edition the Preface and Biographical introductions are restored and the contents as above are published again under the title 'German Romance,' with the exception of Goethe and Wilhelm Meister's Travels which are in two separate additional volumes under the latter title."--Dyer, Isaac W., op. cit., p. 99.

² "Tait, finding himself anticipated by the appearance of four similar collections already that year, was postponing the issue of German Romance, printed by the ill-omened Ballantyne and Company, into 1827 in the hope of 'better times.' He was doing what he could to give an impression of sensational contents by woodcuts prefixed to each volume, such as that of a hunch-back telling a knight in armor a dreadful secret that makes him mop his brow. Even the philosophic Meister's Travels was illustrated by a peasant with a laden donkey discovering a beautiful young woman swooning or asleep in the midst of rugged and desolate mountains."--Neff, Emery, op. cit., p. 89.

the general merits and characteristics of these works," he says, "it is for the reader and not me to pass judgment."¹ Apparently anticipating an unfavorable evaluation of the material by the reader, he hastens on to plead: "One thing it will behoove him not to lose sight of: They are German novelists, not English ones; and their Germanhood I have all along regarded as a quality, not as a fault. To expect, therefore, that the style of them shall accord in all points with our English taste, were to expect that it should be a false and hollow style. Every nation has its own form of character and life; and the mind which gathers no nourishment from the everyday circumstances of its existence, will in general be but scantily nourished."² But if Carlyle hesitated to voice his opinion in the Preface, at least he did not fail to do so in the critical articles preceding the various stories. Moreover, from his letters and other sources one can learn much of his true opinion of the various authors. In a letter to Thomas Murray, June 20, 1826, he says of German Romance that "the contents are of a strange enough sort, and motley as you could expect."³ And Shepherd relates that many years later Carlyle had said of this work: "The pieces selected were the suitablest discoverable on such terms: not quite of less than no worth (I considered) any

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, Preface, p. 4

² Ibid., p. 4.

³ Early Letters, II, p. 362.

piece of them: nor, alas, of a very high worth any, except one only."¹

Here, however, a brief consideration of the comments designed for the first readers of the translations is of more importance than later comments. Below, in a discussion of each author, will be briefly indicated what Carlyle's estimate of him was at the time the translations were made.

In the order of appearance in the German Romance collection, Musaeus stands first. Carlyle attributes this writer's popularity to the skill with which he recasts the stories collected from knots of old women sitting at spinning wheels and from black-stump-piped, tobacco-smoking soldiers.² He praises him for standing "aloof from every species of cant" and adds that "he is perhaps the only satirist on record of whom it can be said that his jesting never cost him a friend.

¹ "Many years afterwards, . . . Carlyle himself described it as 'a book of translations, not of my suggesting or desire, but of my executing as honest journey-work in defect of better. The pieces selected were the suitablest discoverable on such terms: not quite of less than no worth (I considered) any piece of them; nor, alas, of a very high worth any, except one only.'"--Shepherd, op. cit., I, p. 47.

² "This preeminence is owing less to the ancient materials, than to the author's way of treating them. The primitive tradition often serves him only as a vehicle for interesting description, shrewd sarcastic speculation, and gay fanciful-pleasantry, extending its allusions over all things past and present, now rising into comic humour, now sinking into drollery, often tasteless, strained, or tawdry, but never dull. The traces of poetry and earnest imagination, here and there discernible in the original fiction, he treats with levity and kind sceptical derision: nothing is required of the reader but what all readers are prepared to give."--Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, p. 13-14.

His humour is, indeed, untinged with bitterness; sportful, ebullient and guileless as the frolics of a child."¹ He rates him as a "well-conditioned, laughter-loving man, kindly man" not high in wisdom and originality but "a sound, well-informed, common-sense thinker;"² his style is described as "sparkling with metaphors, sometimes just and beautiful, often new and inspiring; but . . . laborious, unnatural and diffuse."³ A quality which may have helped considerably in determining in favor of Musaeus was one, to a degree, in accord with Carlyle's own taste: "Whatever was austere or earnest," he writes, "still more, whatever bordered upon awe or horror, his right fancy reflected with aversion: the rigorous moral sometimes hid in these traditions, the grim lines of primeval feeling and imagination to be traced in them, had no charms for him."⁴ He concludes by stating that he has selected the specimens "in the hope, that conveying some impression of a gifted and favorite writer, they may furnish a little entertainment both to the lovers of intellectual novelty and of innocent amusement"; but he adds, that the case of Musaeus "must stand or fall by a first judgment, and without the help of

¹ Ibid., p. 15.

² Ibid., p. 16.

³ Ibid., p. 17.

⁴ Ibid., p. 18.

advocates."¹ With similar appreciation Carlyle writes to Jane Welsh, July 1, 1823: "Musaeus has a true vein of shrewd sense, no inconsiderable stock of knowledge, a fine, little, clear imagination, a perennial flow of good-nature, and abundance of wit and humour."² At this time Jane was still planning to assist with the translation.³

Fouqué excited far less enthusiasm in Carlyle than did Musaeus. Fouqué's interest in Spanish literature, he says, led him to produce material strongly colored with chivalry, presenting "knights, softhearted and strongarmed; full of Christian self-denial, patience, meekness and gay easy daring." His genius, Carlyle regards as not being of the kind to provoke much criticism"; its faults he regards

¹ Ibid., p. 18

² Love Letters, I, p. 231.

³ It may be interesting to note that Carlyle's directing of Jane's translating of Musaeus was not unlike that of a nagging, pestering schoolteacher addressing a willing but fearful and unqualified child. He is forever teasing, pegging, driving her (colloquially speaking) to "snap into it; get to work, and do something!" "Work, work, my heroine!" he writes to her. "There is nothing but toil, toil, toil" --Ibid., I, p. 274.

In the letters which he wrote to her between August 10, 1823, and August 12, 1824, there are fully a score of friendly admonitions for her Musaeus work; but on July 22, 1824, he notified poor Jane--who had been working very ambitiously with Ruebezah!--that "I found the other day in London two volumes had already been selected from Musaeus, and among them Ruebezah! Do you complete Ruebezah! nevertheless." --Ibid., I, p. 388.

More than a month later, August 31, he continues in the same spirit with the "sad news that Ruebezah!, your much and laboured Ruebezah!, has been already printed in England Finish your tale, however." --Ibid., I, p. 396.

as being "negative rather than positive."¹ What characterizes Fouqué, he says, is "not faults, but the want of merits." "In all his writings," Carlyle says, "Fouqué shows himself as a man deeply imbued with feelings of religion, honor and brotherly love; he sings of Faith and affection with a full heart; and a spirit of tenderness, and vestal purity, and meek heroism, sheds salutary influences from his presence."² His style Carlyle finds chiefly characterized by "lightness and simplicity," and his fiction he describes as being wholly pervaded by "the everlasting principles of Faith, and Integrity, and Love." Although this seems an adequate appreciation of Fouqué, Carlyle's introduction to this writer reflects, as Roe puts it, "an indifference to the work, or at most a very lukewarm interest."³ This "lukewarmness" of interest may be in part accounted for by the differing opinions about the man in England: Soane had seen fit to translate his Undine in 1818, Roscoe finds him one of the "greatest favourites" with the English public,⁴ and

¹ "Fouqué's genius is not of a kind to provoke or solicit much criticism; for its faults are negative rather than positive, and its beauties are not difficult to discern. The structure of his mind is simple; his intellect is in harmony with his feelings; and his taste seems to include few modes of excellence; which he has not in some considerable degree the power to realize."--Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, p. 212.

² Ibid., p. 213.

³ Roe, F. W., op. cit., p. 80.

⁴ "Few modern writers of Germany have become greater

Blackwood's labels him "an idiot."¹

Of Tieck and his literary work Carlyle writes with considerable commendation and appreciation. As a collector of folk-stories he says of him, "Here, by the consent of all his critics, including even the collectors of real Maerchen, he reigns without a rival."² These Maerchen of Tieck he accords praise such as any story teller would covet.³ Probably the close resemblance which Tieck's Franz Sternbald's Wanderungen bore to Wilhelm Meister--Carlyle's "Articles of Faith"--aided in winning Carlyle's favor to the former. He rates Tieck as being "no ordinary man; but a true Poet, a Poet born as well as made."⁴ For him Tieck is "no mere observer and compiler; . . . but a true Maker, to whom the actual

favourites with the English reading public, or have received more gratifying proofs of its admiration in numerous versions from their productions."--Roscoe, T. The German Novelists, 1826, Introduction. Quoted by Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 226.

1 "One of his tales has been a good deal read, but the Baron's name is wholly without power in England except among our German literati; . . . Undine is nothing but waterworks.

"There is an impression amongst those who have known anything about the Baron, that he is 'an inspired idiot.' About the inspiration the learned demur a little; that he is an 'idiot,' we suppose all of us are agreed."--Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 852.

2 Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, p. 265.

3 "The Volksmaehrchen are of the most varied nature: sombre, pathetic, fantastic, satirical; but all pervaded by a warm, genial soul, which accommodates itself with equal aptitude to the gravest or the gayest form. A soft abundance, a simple and kindly but often solemn majesty is in them: wondrous shapes, full of meaning, move over the scene, true modern denizens of the old Fairyland; low tones of plaintiveness or awe flit round us; or a starry splendour twinkles down from the immeasurable depths of Night."--Ibid., pp. 258.

4 Ibid., pp. 264. ff.

and external is but the excitement for ideal creations, representing and ennobling its effects." Among Tieck's individual characteristics he singles out the "combination of so many gifts in such full and simple harmony," and as his most distinguishing faculty, "a still imagination, in the highest sense of that word, an imagination, not of the intellect, but of the character, not so much vague and gigantic as altogether void and boundless, Immensity and Eternity seem to rest over the bounded and quickly-fading." Carlyle admits that Tieck has not succeeded entirely in the "political" and the "moral" standard which the Maerchen should possess but contends that "throughout he approaches it more nearly than any of his rivals" and recommends, rather caustically, that unadmiring readers search for the merits in the tales.¹

In his estimate of Hoffmann and of that author's literary creations, Carlyle was not so generous as he was in his treatment of the other romancers selected for the collection.

¹ "The ordinary lovers of witch and fairy matter will remark a deficiency of spectres and enchantments here, and complain that the whole is rather dull. Cultivated freethinkers again, well knowing that no ghosts or elves exist in this country, will smile at the crackbrained dreamer, with his spelling-book prose and doggerel [sic.] verse, and dismiss him good-naturedly as a German Lakepoet. Alas, alas! Ludwig Tieck could also fantasy, 'like a drunk Irishman,' with great conveniency, if it seemed good to him; he can laugh too, and disbelieve, and set springes to catch woodcocks in manifold wise: but his present business was not this: nor, I fear, is the lover of witch matter, or the cultivated freethinker, likely soon to discover what it was."--Ibid., pp. 266 ff.

He regrets that Hoffmann was "no poet," that his "mind was not cultivated," that "his abundant humour is too often false and local; his rich and gorgeous fancy continually distorted into crotchets and caprices human nature he had studied only as a caricature-painter."¹ Of his works Carlyle says "it is seldom that any piece is perfected, that its brilliant and often genuine elements are blended in harmonious union." The shorter pieces such as Der Goldene Topf, are written "too often with only transitory excellence."² Nevertheless, Carlyle is considerate and tolerant: "Yet if, in judging Hoffmann," he says, "we are forced to condemn him, let us do so with mildness and justice. Let us not forget, that for a mind like his the path of propriety was difficult to find, still more difficult to keep."³

In his esteem of Richter--true exponent of "the empire of the air"--to whom he was introduced five years earlier by De Quincey,⁴ Carlyle assigns a place but little

¹ Ibid., II, p. 20.

² "We do not read them without interest, without high amusement; but the second reading pleases worse than the first; for there is too little meaning in that bright extravagance; it is but the hurried copy of the phantasms which forever masqueraded through the author's mind; it less resembles the creation of a poet, than the dream of an opium-eater."--Ibid., II, p. 20.

³ Ibid., II, p. 18.

⁴ "The honor of having introduced Richter to the British public belongs to De Quincey. In the London Magazine for December, 1821, he published an essay entitled John Paul Fredrick Richter, together with two analects

lower, if any, to that accorded Goethe. For him "he felt genuine admiration and love"; to him the tributes Carlyle pays are excessive. In 1826, when Carlyle was at work on the translation, he looks upon Richter as "a colossal spirit, a lofty and original thinker, a genuine poet, a high minded, true and most amiable man."¹ His heart Carlyle praises as one of "the truest, deepest, and gentlest that ever lived in this world His works are hard to understand but they always have a meaning, and often a true and deep one." In intellect, humour, language, and imagination he is placed prominently above all other producers of romances.² "In Richter alone," Carlyle continues, "among the great (and even sometimes truly moral) writers of his day, do we find the Immortality of the Soul expressly insisted on, nay, so much as incidentally alluded to."³ Schmelzle's Journey, the shorter of the two romances selected from Richter, Carlyle considers "one of the most finished, as it is at least

"More important than these translations, however, is the fact that it was he, who first called Carlyle's attention to Richter who then was destined to make him more thoroughly and more effectively known among the English."--Geissendoerfer, T. "Carlyle and Jean Paul Richter," Journal of English and Germanic Philology, XXV, 1926, p. 540.

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, II, p. 121.

² "His imagination opens for us the Land of Dreams; we sail with him through the boundless abyss, and the secrets of Space, and Time, and Life, and Annihilation hover round us in dim cloudy forms, and darkness and immensity and dread encompass and overshadow us."--Ibid., II, p. 122.

³ Ibid., II, pp. 126 ff.

one of the simplest, among his smaller humorous performances"; the second, "The Life of Fixelin, he thinks faulty and wishes it known that it was selected "not without reluctance; rather from necessity than preference." He presents it to the reader not "as Richter's best novel, but simply as his shortest complete one."

All careful students of Carlyle know something of his great indebtedness to Goethe, the one author whom he most enthusiastically looked to as master. Quite naturally, he translated more from Goethe than from any other German. As stated earlier, he had already translated Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship before 1825, and had given his high appraisal of that book in the preface.¹

Now he translated Wilhelm Meister's Travels, the Tale, and, probably, the Novelle.² Of the three, only the Travels

¹ "The philosophical discussions it contains; its keen glances into life and art; the minute and skilful delineation of men; the lively genuine exhibition of the scenes they move in; the occasional touches of eloquence and tenderness, and even of poetry, the very essence of poetry; the quality of thought and knowledge embodied in a style so rich in general felicities, of which, at least, the new and sometimes exquisitely happy metaphors have been preserved,--cannot wholly escape an observing reader, even on the most cursory perusal. To those who have formed for themselves a picture of the world, who have drawn out, from the thousand variable circumstance of their being, a philosophy of life, it will be interesting and instructive to see how man and his concerns are represented in the first of European minds; to those who have penetrated to the limits of their own conceptions, and wrestled with thoughts and feelings too high for them, it will be pleasing and profitable to see the horizon of their certainties widened, or at least separated with a firmer line from the impalpable obscure which surrounds it on every side."--Carlyle, Thomas. Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels, 1899, New York, I, Preface to first edition, p. 7.

² There appears to be no record indicating when

formed a part of the first edition of German Romance. In his essay on Goethe, written in 1828, Carlyle characterizes this second part of the Meister story as "one of the most perfect pieces of composition that Goethe has ever produced."¹ He finds in it "a singular gracefulness, . . . a high melodious Wisdom . . . 'mild Wisdom wedded in living union to Harmony divine'." There is definite doubt in his mind, how-

Carlyle translated this story. It appeared, however, in Fraser's Magazine, in 1832. Dyer has the following entry in his Carlyle Bibliography: "Translated from Goethe, under the title Fragment, by Goethe. Fraser's Magazine, Nov., 1832, Vol. VI, No. 34, pp. 383-393. Included in the first (1839) and all subsequent editions of the miscellanies under title Novelle."--Dyer, Isaac W., op. cit., p. 198.

¹ "This fragment, for it still continues such, is in our view one of the most perfect pieces of composition that Goethe has ever produced. We have heard something of his being at present engaged in extending or completing it: what the whole may in his hands become, we are anxious to see; but the Wanderjahre, even in its actual state, can hardly be called unfinished, as a piece of writing; it coheres so beautifully within itself; and yet we see not whence the wonderful landscape came, or whither it is stretching; but it hangs before us as a fairy region, hiding its borders on this side in light sunny clouds, fading away on that into the infinite azure; already, we might almost say, it gives us the notion of a completed fragment, or the state in which a fragment, not meant for completion, might be left.

"But apart from its environment, and considered merely in itself, this Wanderjahre seems to us a most estimable work. There is, in truth, a singular gracefulness in it; a high, melodious Wisdom; so light is it, yet so earnest; so calm, so gay, yet so strong and deep for the purest spirit of all Art rests over it and breathes through it; mild Wisdom is wedded in living union to Harmony divine; the Thought of the Sage is melted, we might say, and incorporated in the liquid music of the Poet. 'It is called a Romance,' observes the English Translator; but it treats not of romance characters or subjects; it has less relation to Fielding's Tom Jones, than to Spenser's Faery Queen."--Carlyle, Thomas. "Goethe," The Modern British Essayists, Philadelphia, 1852, V, p. 85.

ever, about the reception of Travels in England. "Like all Goethe's works," he says, "its immediate reception is doubtful."¹ The book is called a "romance" but treats of neither romance characters nor subjects. Goethe's Maerchen, which Carlyle translated in November, 1825, may not have been selected for the collection of German Romance; at least, instead of including it in that work, he sends it as a personal token to Miss Welsh. Why he should have selected such a strangely symbolic tale for the lady is puzzling. That it needed interpretation is obvious from notes appended to it--signed by one "D. T.," pseudonym of Carlyle²--at the time of its first publication in Fraser's Magazine in 1832.³ These notes the editor "O. Y."⁴ ridicules as an effort on the part of "D. T."

¹ "Like all Goethe's works, its immediate reception is doubtful, or rather perhaps, it is not doubtful. That these Travels will surprise and disappoint the reader, is too likely; and perhaps the reader of the Apprenticeship will be more surprised than any other. The book is called a romance; but it treats not of romance characters or subjects; it has less relation to Fielding's Tom Jones than to Spenser's Faery Queen."--Carlyle, Thomas. "Goethe," Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels, 1899, New York, I, p. 32.

² Dr. William S. Johnson identifies "D. T." with "Diogenes Teufelsdröckh," i. e., Carlyle. See Johnson, William S. Carlyle's 'Sartor Resartus', Chicago, 1924, p. 219.

³ "The difficulties of interpretation are exceedingly enhanced by one circumstance not unusual in other such writings of Goethe's; namely, that this is no Allegory; which, as in the Pilgrim's Progress, you have only once for all to find the key of, and so go on unlocking: it is a Phantasmagory, rather; wherein things the most heterogeneous are, with homogeneity of figure, emblemed forth;" "D. T." note No. 1 to The Tale by Goethe.--Critical and Miscellaneous Essays, II, London, 1899, p. 449.

⁴ "Oliver Yorke, Pseudonym of William Maginn (1794-1842) editor of Fraser"--Johnson, W. S. Carlyle's 'Sartor Resartus', p. 219.

to find more meaning in the tale "than in all the literature of the century."¹ Of the other translation, Goethe's Novelle, there seems to be scarcely any record beyond its appearance in Fraser's Magazine, together with the Tale, in 1832. Shepherd refers to it as "Carlyle's literary production of that year,"² meaning 1832; but there is nothing to indicate when the work was translated.

Fidelity to his original has been pointed out as one of the chief qualities in Carlyle's translations. It was the principle which he stated clearly in his preface to the first edition of Wilhelm Meister: "Fidelity is all the merit I

¹ ". . . . a genuine English Translation of that Maerchen has been handed in to us for judgment; and now (such judgment having proved merciful) comes out from us in the way of publication. Of the Translation we cannot say much; by the colour of the paper, it may be some seven years old and have lain perhaps in smoky repositories; it is not a good Translation; yet also not wholly bad; faithful to the original (as we can vouch, after strict trial); conveys the real meaning, though with an effort: here and there our pen has striven to help it, but could not do much. The poor Translator, who signs himself 'D. T.' and effects to carry matters with a high hand, though, as we have ground to surmise, he is probably in straits for the necessaries of life,--has, at a more recent date, appended numerous Notes; wherein he will convince himself that more meaning lies in his Maerchen 'than in all the Literature of our Century'; "O. Y. Note No. 1 to The Tale by Goethe, Critical and Miscellaneous Essays, II, London, 1899, p. 448.

² "The remaining work of this year [1832] was all connected with Goethe--a review of 'Goethe's Works,' contributed to the Foreign Quarterly of August 1832, and 'The Tale, by Goethe,' and 'Novelle, translated from Goethe,' which appeared in Fraser's Magazine in October and November, 1832. Thus a large proportion of Carlyle's literary production of that year, both in the part of it which preceded and in the part of it which followed Goethe's death, had been devoted to the study, translation, and exposition of the Great German poet."--Shepherd, op. cit., I, p. 110.

aimed at: to convey the author's sentiments; to follow the original, in all the variations of its style, has been my constant endeavor to alter anything was not my commission."¹ That extreme conscientiousness in matters of "fidelity to the original" was not always the guiding light-- a fact probably to be attributed to a tormenting stomach-- is gathered from a letter in which he instructs his brother "not to be squeamish in imitating" existing translations.² Carlyle does not endeavor to make his translations more elegant than the original, observing the principle "if the

¹ "Fidelity is all the merit I aimed at: to convey the author's sentiments, as he himself expressed them; to follow the original, in all the variations of its style, has been my constant endeavor. In many points, both literary and moral, I could have wished devoutly that he had not written as he has done; but to alter anything was not my commission. The literary and moral persuasions of a man like Goethe are objects of a rational curiosity; and the duty of a translator is simple and distinct. Accordingly, except a few phrases and sentences, not all amounting to a page, which I have dropped as evidently unfit for the English taste, I have studied to present the work exactly as it stands in German."--Carlyle, Thomas, Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels, I, Preface to first edition, p. 10.

² May 9, 1823. To John A. Carlyle: "Boyd and I have talked repeatedly about the French Novels Elizabeth and Paul et Virginie: We have at length come to a bargain. I have engaged that you 'the Universal Pan,' shall translate them both in your best style (I overlooking the manuscript, and correcting the Press), and receive for so doing the sum of £20: the whole to be ready about August next. You will get the French copies and the existing translations, by Farries; and then, I read you, betake yourself to the duty with might and main. I have no doubt you will do it in a sufficient manner. You have only to consult the old copy at any dubious point, and never to be squeamish in imitating it. All that Boyd wants is a reasonable translation, which no one can prosecute him for printing."--Early Letters, II, p. 196.

original creeps, the translation should not soar."¹ He looked upon translation as a reproduction of the original, and seemed to feel obliged, as Tolman later suggests, to be as faithful to the imperfections as he was to the beauties of the author he was translating.² Whether this faithfulness to the original was always best for his English readers is a disputed point; Japp leaves it an open question. Either Carlyle was "too faithful" or he was "too little concerned for English domestic purity."³ That "fidelity" was not the first requisite with all Englishmen appears from an article

¹ Tolman, H. C., op. cit., p. 30.

² "Since translation is the reproduction of the spirit of the original, we ought to be faithful to the imperfections as well as to the beauties of the author we are translating."--Ibid., p. 30.

³ Japp lists a series of passages from Wilhelm Meister, in italics, which treat of rather suggestive sex relations. The following is an illustration: "But at that moment he felt himself suddenly locked in the embrace of two tender arms; his mouth was covered with a shower of most passionate kisses, and he felt a bosom pressed to (Mr. Carlyle has, as in all such instances, 'against') his own, from which he had not the resolution to disengage himself." After some half dozen or more illustrations he comments: "It is a most remarkable fact that the very sentences in these extracts, which we have put in italics, as the mainlinks in the chain establishing our case, do not appear in any other English translation known to us than that of Mr. Carlyle. In Bohn's library translation they are omitted or modified. Now, what was the reason of that? Were the passages deemed too strong for the sense of decency in translator or publisher? or was it that some prudent sense of preserving English domestic propriety prevailed? Anyway, it is a testimony not without its own weight, though it suggests that Mr. Carlyle was either all too faithful to the text of his author, or all too little concerned for that same English domestic purity which others had found was not likely to profit by such suggestions from German literature."--Japp, Alexander Hay, German Life and Literature, London, 1878, p. 352.

in Blackwood's in which the insistence is on "English" above everything else.¹

While at the task of translating, Carlyle appears to have worked very consistently and very tenaciously. The statement applies, incidentally, not only to his work on the romances but to all his translations. This habit of steady work is particularly commendable in view of the tediousness of much of the material in hand and his persistent physical ailment.² He appears to have budgeted his time and worked by system when engaged on a translation. While working on Legendre he writes: "It is a canny job: I could earn five guineas if I were well. I restrict myself to three,

¹ "Still, though a little German is undoubtedly useful to a translator from the German, that is not what we would here insist upon: English, English is the thing. For heaven's sake, let every translator emancipate himself so far from thralldom to the book before him and put forth so much activity of mind, as to think in English, and not passively to reproduce the phraseology of his German original. Let him scour out the vile stain of the German dye, and colour it with the racy idiom of the nation he addresses, before he presumes to introduce his book into good company."--Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 857.

² Carlyle had at the start to drive himself to his task; though as he worked at it, this task appealed to him much more. "Er ging widerwillig an sein werk, das zwar nachher genial und ursprünglich aussah, aber unter heftigen, von vielen flächen begleiteten schmerzen geboren war." Then, too, Carlyle did not find original writing easy. "Carlyle schrieb in der that mühsam. Der weg vom kopf in die feder war allemal wie ein leidensgang, weil er dabei wirklich für sich selber das unselige und schmälliche gefühl nie los wurde, dass er eigentlich doch nur den baren unsinn in die welt setzte." --Kraeger, Fr. H. "Carlyles Deutsche Studien und der 'Wotton Reinfred'," Anglia, Beiblatt IX, Band Nr. VII-VIII, Nov.-Dec. 1898, p. 196. [Kraeger does not capitalize his nouns.]

--working four hours each day. The evenings I design to devote to original composition."¹ To his mother he writes that he is "besieged by Printers' devils who want copy," and "cannot think of coming home till the thing is done."² To his friend Robert Mitchell he writes, "I sit here and read all the morning--or write, regularly burning everything I write."³ Not only does he burn material but he rewrites it: in a letter to his brother he notes that he is writing the Life of Schiller "a second time--often harder than the first."⁴ Once he had launched the task of translating Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, nothing could interfere. "Ten pages a day is my task: with riding, and teaching and other drivelling, I seldom get begun till six at night."⁵ Three months later, he is going at his determined pace: "Meanwhile I go on with Goethe's Wilhelm Meister," he writes, "a book which I love not . . . but which

¹ Early Letters, II, December 19, 1821, p. 15.

² Ibid., II, May 27, 1822, p. 79.

³ Ibid., II, December 23, 1822, p. 153.

⁴ Nov. 11, 1821. To John A. Carlyle: "I get on with it dreadfully slow: I am now almost half-done with writing it the second time--often harder than the first; some nights I am fitter for the hospital than the writing desk; all nights (and I never get it touched till then) I am sick and stupid and done, as never man was that persisted in such a task."
--Ibid., II, p. 241.

⁵ Love Letters, I, August 31, 1823, p. 273.

I am determined to print and finish I sit down to it every night at six, with the ferocity of a hyena."¹ (A few nights later he writes to James Johnstone, "I render it [Wilhelm Meister] into grammatical English--with a feeling mild and charitable as that of a starving hyena.")² When he writes to his father in March of the next year he is still going "pretty regularly" with the translation and "at the rate of ten pages daily."³ A month later, in April, in a letter to Jane, he says that he is going about the task of translating with regularity and precision: "Clockwork," he says, "is scarcely steadier. Nothing do I allow to interfere with me; my movements might be almost calculated like the moon's."⁴

As soon as Carlyle has begun on the German romances, he is "the most industrious man in Annandale."⁵ His

¹ Early Letters, II, September 18, 1823, p. 219.

² Ibid., II, September 21, 1823, p. 223.

³ Ibid., II, March 18, 1824, p. 270.

⁴ To Miss Welsh. Mainhill, Apr. 15, 1824: "It would do you good to see with what regularity I progress in translating. Clockwork is scarcely steadier. Nothing do I allow to interfere with me; my movements might be almost calculated like the Moon's. It is not unpleasant work, nor is it pleasant. Original composition is ten times as laborious. It is an agitating, fiery, consuming business: I can easily conceive a man writing the soul out of him; writing till it evaporates 'like the snuff of a farthing candle,' when the matter interests him properly. I always recoil from again engaging in it. But this present business is cool and quiet; one feels over it, as a shoemaker does when he sees the leather gathering into a shoe; as any mortal does when he sees the activity of his mind expressing itself in some external material shape."
—Love Letters, I, p. 357.

⁵ Nov. 28, 1825: "For the last three weeks I have been the most industrious man in Annandale. It would do you good

activities are many and varied. He is busy deciding on the selections desirable for his collection--among other decisions he substituted Goethe's Travels for his Werter, which had been his first choice--and at the same time is translating books already selected. "At all events," he says, "I am eager to get it off my hands." Three months later he is still driving on at the same high speed, Sunday and every day: "I am still busy as ever man was at present; the printers are chasing me like greyhounds; so from dawn till dewy eve, and often till rainy midnight, I am kept in a perpetual flurry. Writing, riding, walking or smoking, there is no moment of my waking hours unoccupied. This very day I have retouched a Sketch of La Motte Fouqué,

to see with what steadfastness I equip myself every morning with dreadnought and wooden shoes and sally forth to walk to the Kelhead Tollbar, regardless of the fury of the elements: then return to breakfast and translate; to mingle in fit proportions throughout the day the exercises of the body and the mind, till late night finds me a sheet further forward in my compilation. I am not happy but neither am I miserable, and my work advances without injury to my health. Ere long I suppose I shall be in Edinburgh arranging the printing. I have written to Tait for more books, which I expect in a day or two; and I am already done with Goethe's Maerchen, and Musaeus's Stumme Liebe and Libussa. The former was meant for you, but for want of other work, I took it up myself. I have still Melechsala before me, and then I bid him adieu with small regret. He is a man of fine talent but has no genius whatever. One volume of the publication I purpose to occupy with Wilhelm Meister's Wanderjahre, Goethe's last work, instead of Werter, which I once had thoughts of, but I cannot now abide. There is also one Maler Mueller (the Painter Mueller) of whom I hear a most flattering report, tho' he is entirely unknown in this country; from him I calculate on gathering another half volume. On the whole I begin to be better satisfied with the aspect of this business; and at all events eager to get it off my hands."--Ibid., II, p. 194.

retouched it, alas! in time stolen from Divine Service."¹
 In May, "after a week of joinering," he writes of having
 "resumed my stint of ten daily pages, steady as the town
 clock, no interruption dreaded or occurring."²

Carlyle does not appear to have grown careless in his translation of the German romances even as the work neared completion. On August 12, 1826, he writes to Miss Welsh that the task is finished; in the same letter, however, he indicates his difficulty with the word "Wetterbaum," which does not appear in his dictionary. He might easily have translated literally "weathertree," and passed on in the maze of Richter's German compounds. But he is desirous of the correct translation and implores Jane to assist by sending the English word in case her German-English dictionary contains it.³ As a result of this feverish procedure, generally under tremendous pressure, he came very near to being a physical wreck by the time the work was done.⁴

¹ Ibid., II, February 5, 1826, p. 227.

² Ibid., II, p. 227

³ "Can you find Wetterbaum (Weather-tree) in your German Dictionary? If so send it down (the English of it) without delay." [In a footnote on the same page the editor of Love Letters makes this comment: "Wetterbaum is a thick cloud that spreads upwards like the branches of a tree. Carlyle's German Dictionary at this time was Nathan Bailey's (Leipzig and Jens, 1810), given to him by Edward Irving. It does not contain the word Wetterbaum."] -- Ibid., II, August 12, 1826, p. 312.

⁴ Sept. 19, 1826: "I have been a very wicked man of late weeks, and not less so since I saw you; so splenetic, so

Carlyle nowhere makes reference to any inability to translate the romances which he selected. There are incidental hints that certain of the story-tellers are vexatious, but Carlyle does not convey the impression that their style is particularly baffling for him; any such admission would hardly be consistent with his boast that "the difficulties of German are little more than a bugbear," that "three months of moderate diligence" is all any man requires to master most of it.¹ The difficulties, if they may be termed so, which impress one as being major with Carlyle are occasioned largely by the lack of enthusiasm for the work he had contracted to do. He is continually driving himself like a taskmaster to the job he has taken on and is voicing displeasure because he cannot be doing something original. Of the selected romancers he complains most frequently about Musaeus, possibly because of that writer's excessive employment of foreign words.² In writing to Jane, October 28, 1823,

sick, so sleepless, so void of hope, faith, charity; in short so altogether bad and worthless." In referring to this particular time in Carlyle's life, the editor adds this comment: "Carlyle was now suffering a relapse after his arduous and long continued labours on the 'German Romance.' He here mistakes, as he often did elsewhere, the remonstrances of an ailing liver for the chidings of a guilty conscience. Like Teufelsdröckh, he was not guilty, but only suffering the pangs of guilt."--Ibid., II, p. 317.

I "The difficulties of German are little more than a bugbear: they can only be compared to those of Greek by persons claiming praise or pudding for having mastered them. Three months of moderate diligence will carry any man, almost without assistance of a master, over its prime obstacles; and the rest is play rather than labour."--Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, Preface, p. 5.

² Musaeus was extremely fond of using strange and

referring to the business of translating Musaeus, he says "translating is a weary business: the turning of a sentence gives no scope to the better faculties of the mind: it helps to still the conscience and that is all."¹ When he is finishing with that author he again writes to Jane, December 11, 1825, that he "got too much of him rather than too little,"² and two weeks thereafter, having just finished with a "sorry sketch of Musaeus," he refers to the whole task as "a confused piece of work, and very little to my taste, after all the trouble I can take with it."³ Fourteen days later, he sends Jane the first few sheets of the Musaeus translation, "which," he writes, "is giving me so much trouble." "I wish to Heaven," he continues, "it were off my hands; for there is much more cry than wool in the whole affair."⁴ Tieck and Fouqué appear to cause him no uncommon displeasure but it is not so with Hoffmann and Richter. In May, 1826, Carlyle writes to Jane: "I have had a bout with this Life of Hoffmann's: it is far the

foreign words. The following sentence will illustrate:
 ". . . . aber es kam damit, wie es bei weiblichen Konsultationen zu geschehen pfleget, zu keinem Konklusum, weil bei der Stimmensammlung eine solche Dissonanz der Meinungen sich ergab, dass kein harmonischer Akkord herauszufinden war."--
Melechsala, p. 292.

¹ Early Letters, I, p. 287.

² Love Letters, II, p. 200.

³ Ibid., II, p. 205.

⁴ Ibid., II, p. 212.

worst, and has been far the most troublesome of them all."¹

This may be ascribed in the first place, to Hoffmann's vague and florid style, which of all styles is the most difficult to translate;² and in the second place, to the fact that Hoffmann's material was of a nature for which Carlyle had little love.³ "Bad taste" and "mysticism,"⁴ particularly the "Schwärmerei" type, appear to have offended him; such characteristics possibly disturbed the state of mind necessary for the task in hand.⁵ In addition, Hoffmann

¹ Early Letters, II, p. 350.

² "No compositions will be found more difficult to be translated, than those descriptions, in which a series of minute distinctions are marked by characteristic terms, each peculiarly appropriated to the thing to be designed, but many of them so nearly synonymous, or so approaching to each other, as to be clearly understood only by those who possess the most critical knowledge of the language of the original, and a very competent skill in the subject treated of."--Tytler, A. F. op. cit., p. 187.

"There is no species of writing so difficult to be translated, as that where the character of the style is florid, and the expression consequently vague, and of indefinite meaning."--Ibid., p. 192.

³ "With art which rejects the actual conditions of life and creates . . . a fantastic world of its own he had no patience. Hence perhaps, . . . his undisguised contempt for Coleridge."--Vaughan, C. E. op. cit., p. 174.

⁴ In discussing the objections to much of the German literature brought into England, Carlyle writes in his essay "The State of German Literature" as follows: "In dealing with the host of objections which front us on this subject, we think it may be convenient to range them under two principal heads. The first, as respects chiefly unsoundness or imperfection of sentiment: an error which may in general be denominated Bad Taste. The second, as respects chiefly a wrong condition of intellect; an error which may be designated by the general title of Mysticism."--Edinburgh Review, XLVI, 1827, p. 312.

⁵ "The frame of mind in which we approach an author influences our correctness of appreciation of him;"--Arnold,

presented further difficulties: abominable practices in punctuation¹ and a degree of carelessness in sentence constructions make his writings trying to the readers; they must have been more so to a translator.

One is not surprised that Carlyle did not find translating Richter easy when one recalls the highly eccentric German of that novelist. The following characterization of this German style given by Carlyle in his first essay on Richter, which appeared in the Edinburgh Review in 1827, suggests the difficulties which Carlyle had to face: There are few writers with whom deliberation and careful distrust of first impressions are more necessary than with Richter. He is a phenomenon from the very surface; he presents himself with a professed and determined singularity:

. . . . his √Richter's language itself is a stone of stumbling to the critic; to critics of the grammarian species, an unpardonable, often an insuperable, rock of offence. Not that he is ignorant of grammar, or disdains the sciences of spelling and parsing; but he exercises both in a certain latitudinarian spirit; deals with astonishing liberality in parentheses, dashes, and subsidiary clauses, invents hundreds of new words, alters

Matthew, op. cit., p. 289.

¹ Examples of Hoffmann's failure to use quotation marks in punctuating: "Ich weiss, sprach der Untenstehende, ich weiss, dass Euer Fräulein so eben das Manuscript ihres Romans, Clelia geheissen, an dem sie rastlos gearbeitet, bei Seite gelegt hat."

"Wo denkt Ihr hin, erwiederte die Martiniere, mein Fräulein wollt Ihr sprechen mitten in der Nacht?"--Selected from "Das Fräulein von Scuderi" by Richard Holcraft and cited in his Tales of Humour and Romance, London, 1826, III, p. 143.

old ones, or, by hyphen, chains, pairs, and packs them together into most jarring combination; in short, produces sentences of the most heterogeneous, lumbering, interminable kind. Figures without limit; indeed the whole is one tissue of metaphors, and similes, and allusions to all the provinces of Earth, Sea, and Air; interlaced with epigrammatic breaks, vehement bursts, or sardonic turns, interjections, quips, puns, and even oaths! A perfect Indian jungle it seems; a boundless unparalleled labyrinth; nothing on all sides but darkness, dissonance, confusion worse confounded! Then the style of the whole corresponds in perplexity and extravagance, with that of the parts. Every work, be it fiction or serious treatise, is embued in some fantastic wrappage; some mad narrative accounting for its appearance, and connecting it with the author, who generally becomes a person in the drama himself, before all is over. He has a whole imaginary geography of Europe in his novels; the cities of Flachsenfingen, Harrhar, Scheerau, and so forth, with their princes and privy-councillors and serene highnesses; most of whom, odd enough fellows every-way, are Richter's private acquaintances, talk with him of state matters (in the purest Tory dialect), and often incite him to get on with his writing. No story proceeds without the most erratic digressions, and voluminous tagrags rolling after it in many a snaky twine It is, indeed, a mighty maze, and often the panting reader toils after him in vain, or, baffled and spent, indignantly stops short, and retires, perhaps forever.¹

Carlyle justly remarks that Richter is the most untranslatable of Germans.² "Probably there is not," he writes, "in any modern language, so intricate a writer; abounding, without measure, in obscure allusions, in the most twisted phraseology; perplexed into endless entanglements and dislocations, parenthesis within parenthesis; not forgetting elisions, sudden whirls, quips, conceits, and all

¹ Edinburgh Review, 1827, XLVI, p. 184.

² Stockley, Violet A. A., op. cit., p. 244.

manner of inexplicable crotchets: the whole moving on in the gayest manner, yet nowise in what seem military lines, but rather in huge parti-coloured mob-masses."¹ Though it was Carlyle's avowed purpose to remain absolutely true to the original in both thought and diction, i. e., to be faithful to the text, he soon discovered with Richter, that in spite of his enormous English vocabulary, it would become necessary to coin new words, and make new combinations.²

The following two extracts, typical of Richter in style, will indicate what Carlyle had to contend with:

Es war keine unrechte Zeit, denn absichtlich um 4½ Uhr wollt' ich mir den Bart scheeren lassen, um gegen fünf so recht mit einem vom Barbiermesser-Glätzzahn geleckten Kinn, wie glattes Velinpapier, ohne wurzelstöcke vom Kinnhaare (Barthaare ist Pleonanus) auf-und vorzutreten.--Richter, "Des Feldpredigers Schmelzle Reise nach Flaetz," p. 245.

It was no improper time; for I had previously determined to have my beard shaven about half-past four, that so, towards five I might present myself with a chin just polished by the razor smoothing-iron, and sleek as wove-paper, without the smallest root-stump of a hair left on it.--Carlyle, p. 169.

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. "Jean Paul Richter Again." The Modern British Essayists, Philadelphia, 1852, p. 197.

² "Ein solches Vorgehen [i. e., to be faithful to the text], dass all Umschreibungen möglichst zu meiden suchte, musste zur Folge haben, dass der Uebersetzer von Werken so sprachgewaltiger Meister trotz des grossen Wortreichtums seiner eignen Sprache sich doch nicht selten gezwungen sah, zu Neubildungen seine Zuflucht zu nehmen, von denen er mit der Zeit, wie man deutlich beobachten kann, auch immer häufiger Gebrauch macht.--Es ist ganz natürlich, dass die in den 'Translations' sich findenden neuen Formen sich zum grössten Teil deutlich als Germanismen charakterisieren."--Schmeding, Otto. "Ueber Wortbildung bei Carlyle." Studien

"Willst due ein blosser Staats-schooshund werden-- ein Hunds-Hund--ein pium desiderium eines impii desiderii--ein Ex-Ex--ein Nichts-Nichts?-- --O Sackerment!" Dardber stuess ich mir aber meinen Hut in den Markt-Koth. Da ich ihn aufhob und säuberte, sah ich überall, wie verschossen er war, . . . --Richter, "Des Feldpredigers Schmelzle Reise nach Flaetz," p. 248.

"Wilt thou be a mere state-lapdog? A dog's-dog, a pium desiderium of an impium desiderium, an Ex-Ex, a Nothing-Nothing?--Fire and Fury!" With this, however, I dashed down my hat into the mud of the market. On lifting and cleaning this old servant, I could not but perceive how worn and faded it was.--Carlyle, 172.

Despite such "impossible" German,¹ Carlyle neither praises nor censures Richter's style. In his essay on Jean Paul, referring to the task of translating the man, he briefly writes: "We have done our endeavor to preserve the quaint grotesque style so characteristic of Jean Paul; rendering with literal fidelity whatever stood before us, rugged and unmanageable as it often seemed."² It is probable that the high regard which he had for Richter more than outweighed any grievances which Carlyle may have encountered

zur englischen Philologie, Heft V, Halle, 1900, p. 46.

¹ Richard Holcraft in the preface to his Tales says, "I am aware that one cannot read two sentences of Richter without finding many faults." He concludes his comments as follows: "Although his writings are far too sentimental --too imaginative, and too metaphorical, and his characters too simple and unsophisticated for the present state of English readers I have made the attempt, to put this eccentric writer into an English garb, and no easy task it was I assure you."--Holcraft, Richard. Tales of Humour and Romance, 1826, p. viii.

² Carlyle, Thomas. Introduction to his translation of "Jean Paul Friedrich Richter's Review of Madame de Stael's Allemagne," Miscellaneous Essays, Popular Edition, Boston, (no date) II, p. 457.

in translating Richter's language.

Any difficulties Carlyle may have had with Goethe's language, as he met it now in Travels and the Maerchen, he had already conquered in translating the Lehrjahre. Because of the extreme precision in his choice of words,¹ any accurate translation of Goethe's German must be no easy matter, and Carlyle's excellent rendering of it merits every recognition. True, he does write, a few months after beginning that work: "Some parts of Meister are very stupid, and it is all very difficult to translate."² In his Preface to the first edition there is also the implication that Goethe's German in Meister was not easy: "In rendering the ideas of Goethe, often so subtle, so capriciously excessive, the meaning was not always easy to seize, or to convey with

¹ "Goethe's reiche, unendlich mannichfaltige Sprachgewalt kann nur ein Wörterbuch veranschaulichen, ein Wörterbuch, das seinen Wortschatz systematisch nach grammatischen und aesthetischen Gesichtspunkten verzeichnet. Ein solches Lexikon von einem feinen, philologisch geschulten und künstlerisch empfindenden Kopfe bearbeitet, scheint mir ein dringendes Bedürfnis der Goetheforschung, die an ihm einen festen Halt und Mittelpunkt fände. Der Verfasser müsste in den tiefsten Schacht der Sprachschöpfung hinabsteigen. Es gälte die ganze Bedeutungsfülle der Worte darzuthun und die zarteste Nuance des Sinnes zu verzeichnen. Selbst den Hauch aufzufangen, von dem ein bezeichnendes Wort an einer einzelnen Stelle durch den Stimmungsgehalt, durch die Prägnanz des Zusammenhanges unwittert ist, dürfte der Bearbeiter nicht unnütz dünken. So müsste seine Haupttugend die Gabe einer mit den feinsten Empfindungsnerven ausgestatteten Interpretirungskunst sein. Er müsste aber auch wie mit der Entwicklung des Goethischen Geistes so wie mit der Geschichte unserer Sprache aufs innigste vertraut sein, um abzuwägen, wie weit der Dichter in seinem Wortgebrauch individuell verfährt, wie weit er auf der Tradition fusst."--Pniower, Otto. Eingang zum Aufsatz "Zu Goethe's Wortgebrauch," Goethe-Jahrbuch, 1898, Band 19, p. 229.

² Love Letters, I, August 31, 1823, p. 273.

adequate effect. There were thin tints of style, shades of ridicule, or tenderness, or solemnity, resting over large spaces, and so slight as almost to be evanescent: some of these I have failed to see; to many of them I could do no justice."¹ Of any difficulty in translating Travels and Maerchen in 1825, however, there is no intimation anywhere in the letters of that time. Two months before the entire translation of German Romance was actually completed, Carlyle anticipated more agreeable times--"when I am free of this Egyptian bondage for a week or two and able to think of something else than Novels and Novelists with their long etceteras of stupid consequences."² In the same letter of June 18, 1826, he writes of a certain satisfaction he felt regarding the value of his efforts: "It is full of small cares, the process of manufacturing it; but I go along contentedly: for I reckon it though a poor enough affair, yet an innocent, even a laudable one; and considerably the best sample of German genius that has yet been presented to the English. And who can blame me for a little satisfaction in the thought, that even I, poor I, here in the wilds of Annandale,

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, New York, 1899, I, Preface to first edition, p. 10-11.

² Love Letters, June 18, 1826, II, p. 294. Somewhat later, however, he writes rather apologetically: "I have called my task an Egyptian bondage, but that was a splenetic word, and came not from the heart but from the sore throat, for I have not been so happy for many a year as since I began this undertaking in my own home."--Early Letters, II, p. 352.

am doing somewhat to instruct the thinkers of my own Country to do justice to those of another?"¹ By August, 1826, the work was definitely completed² and, on the whole, "was done with pleasure and satisfaction, with less agonizing perhaps than any other of his books."³

¹ Ibid., p. 352.

² "Thank Heaven! Title-page, and Preface and all are now off my hands: next week I shall get the last four sheets, and then in two days bid goodbye to the whole matter."--Love Letters, II, August 12, 1826, p. 308.

³ Johnson, William Savage. Thomas Carlyle--A Study of His Literary Apprenticeship, 1814-1831, p. 63.

CHAPTER V

Undeniable and Hardly Excusable Faults Found in the Translation of the German Romances

1. Definite Errors
2. Inaccuracies
3. Literalness Resulting in Awkward Constructions
and Germanisms
4. Inexcusable Free Translations
5. Conscious Alterations: Additions, Condensations,
Omissions
6. Whimsical and Capricious Translations
7. Occasional Faults in Rendering Metre and Meaning
in Translating Verse

CHAPTER V

Undeniable and Hardly Excusable Faults Found in the
Translation of the German Romances

Anyone venturing to speak of faults in Carlyle's translations from the German should do so with caution. He is dealing with the work of a man who, at the time the translations were made, had already absorbed virtually whole libraries--books not only in English but in French, Latin, Italian, Greek (a few), and German. The result was an abundant vocabulary which made it possible for him to express some of the finest shades of meaning either by the use of words already well established, or by the use of new ones skilfully coined out of a full knowledge of the old. Some general considerations bearing on Carlyle's translation of these German romances have already been presented; in this chapter and the two chapters which follow, a detailed analysis of this body of translated work will be made. Incidentally, this analysis will go more into detail than that of Olga Marx, in her study of the translation of Wilhelm Meister, already referred to.

It is desirable to point out at the start that the flaws in Carlyle's translation appear, on the surface, to be very numerous. Some of these flaws are serious, as will presently be seen; but a clear majority are inconsequential and not a few thoroughly excusable. The translation of

Musaeus, the earliest part of the work done, contains the largest number of all. That of Richter stands next; but for this there is ample justification in the difficulty presented by the author's style. Third in frequency of errors in the translation is that of Hoffmann. There, however, as in the case of Richter, the author's unusual style must be taken into account. In the translations of the other three storytellers--Tieck, Fouque, and Goethe--the faults are not sufficiently numerous to warrant any attempt at ranking.

The inaccuracies and other faults in Carlyle's work may be easily accounted for. A few, unquestionably, are the result of an inadequate knowledge of German; for it must be borne in mind that in 1825 Carlyle's acquaintance with the German language had extended over a comparatively brief period of time. He had been in no German atmosphere and had had no contact with German-speaking people.¹ He should naturally be expected, therefore, to misunderstand a great many words and phrases,² and translate a large number

¹ Brandl writes of Coleridge's excellent translation of Schiller's Wallenstein as follows: "Coleridge was a faithful translator . . . his work, as far as it goes, does justice not only to Schiller's mind but to his imagination. He would never have caught his spirit so profoundly had he not visited Germany."--Brandl, Alois. Samuel Taylor Coleridge and the English Romantic School, London, 1887, p. 259.

² In writing of Carlyle's limited preparation for the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, in 1824, Olga Marx says: "With such scant preparation, characterized on the one hand by ardent interest and eager industry, but on the other by total lack of contact with

inaccurately. The inconvenience occasioned by the necessity of frequently consulting the dictionary may easily have led to the recourse of ready guessing; the translations of certain words seem to indicate as much. Furthermore, the element of haste must be taken into account. The tremendously crowded program of Carlyle's day must too often have left insufficient time for the adequate completion of the self-assigned ten pages. Oversight, too, rather than ignorance, appears to have been the cause of certain other errors--particularly alterations and omissions which obscure the meaning of the original. It is also altogether probable that Carlyle's physical indisposition at this period was responsible for certain faults--at least for many small inaccuracies.

Of major and more definite causes to which certain changes made by Carlyle are attributable, there are at least

German-speaking people and German environment, it is not surprising that Carlyle misunderstood a great many words and phrases in Wilhelm Meister, and translated almost as large a number inaccurately, because he had not the background to gauge their precise meaning. For, as the significance of many words is very vague, depending largely on the context in which they are used, the dictionary per se, may be a very disconcerting source of reference."--Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 13.

In a footnote referring to this matter Olga Marx makes this statement: "Carlyle's dictionary was listed in the Anderson Auction Co. Cat. No. 1580:65. A New Dictionary of the English and German Languages, compiled from the best authorities. 2 vols. in one 8 vo., Leipsic, 1810. It was not available."--Ibid., p. 13.

six. One is the acknowledged disgust which Carlyle felt for portions of the substance he was translating--for what he thought maudlin love-scenes and suggestions of anything obscene. Closely related to this was his belief that English taste was too refined to tolerate the many coarse passages found in this German. Some strange translations, also--faults in so far as they are violations of the principle of fidelity to the original--are undoubtedly the result of Carlyle's passionate eagerness to have his fellow Englishmen comprehend clearly not only the substance but the spirit of the German romances. This seemed to Carlyle to call for numerous insertions and explanatory terms not belonging to the original writing. The translator's well-intended effort to give his reading public a fair conception of the oddity of German syntax and German mode of expression also occasionally led him astray. Furthermore, there are certain renditions which can hardly be attributed to anything except sheer whimsicality and caprice. Finally, Carlyle was not always faithful in translating verse accurately. There are occasional flaws in the translations of the verse appearing in some of the romances which hardly seem excusable. Sometimes he fails to reproduce the rhythm and the metre, at other times the verse form, and occasionally, too, he misses the substance and the spirit. This faulty rendering can probably be accounted for in part, at least, by Carlyle's decided preference for prose and for his seeming lack of experience with poetry.

An enumeration follows of the hardly deniable types of fault in the translation of the romances: 1. definite errors; 2. inaccuracies, of varying degrees of seriousness; 3. occasional literalness resulting in awkward and Germanic constructions; 4. free and hence loose rendering of short passages resulting in weakened force; 5. minor additions, condensations, and omissions not warranted; 6. whimsical and capricious translations; and 7. an occasional failure to translate verse faithfully. Each of these types of fault will be defined as it is taken up, and will be illustrated by groups of passages. These passages are merely illustrative and are by no means exhaustive. Most of the passages need no comment. Wherever comment is made, it appears in brackets.¹

¹ For convenience the following abbreviations have been used throughout in referring to the several works from which illustrations are selected:

	Abbreviation
Misaeus	Mis
Dumb Love	D L
Libussa	L
Melechsala	M
Fouqué	Fou
Aslauga's Knight	A K
Tieck	Tie
The Fair-Haired Eckbert	F E
The Trusty Eckart	T E
The Runenberg	R
The Elves	E
The Goblet	G
Hoffmann	Hof
The Golden Pot	G P

(1) Definite Errors

The definite errors found in the following passages are not all serious, but none of them appears to be excusable. They range from a slight deviation from the exact meaning to a wholly inexact rendition. To what extent these errors are the result of Carlyle's failure to comprehend the exact meaning of the German it is difficult to determine. One should think, of course, if the meaning were fully grasped, his readiness with the English would enable him to express it with no difficulty whatever. In any case, a great many of these errors are unmistakable violations of Carlyle's avowed principle of "fidelity." When Carlyle translates "einen Schritt näher" as "a hair's breadth," he is not strictly accurate; he does no essential injustice to the original even though it is not obvious that he gains anything, either. On the other hand, when he renders "Mitternacht" as "the south" and "der Tau aus der Morgenröte" as "the dew from the Twilight," he is simply guilty of plain

Richter	Ric
Army-Chaplain Schmelzle's Journey to Flaetz	A S J
Life of Quintus Fixlein	A F
Goethe	Goe
Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship	Ap
Wilhelm Meister's Travels	Tr
The Tale	T
Novelle	N
Carlyle	Car

The numbers immediately following the abbreviations

errors. In most of the illustrations which follow, the fault is obvious. A few passages, however, seemed to demand an explanatory note. The portions of the passages particularly concerned are underscored.

Mus. D L, 188: Mutter Brigitta beklagte sich gegen eine Nachbarin, der Flachs sei nicht geraten daher sei dieser Nahrungszweig vor der Hand nichts anders als ein duerrer Ast.

Car. 30: Mother Brigitta was complaining to a neighbour that flax was very dull; and that hence this branch of industry was nothing better, for the present, than a withered bough.

[One wonders whether "flax was very dull" will convey the same meaning as "flax crop was very poor."]

Mus. D L, 181: W^{ar} Meta nicht allzu klostermässig erzogen und von der strengen Mutter wie ein Schatz von den Augen eines Geizigen bewacht worden

Car. 34: Had not Meta been brought up in a style too nunlike, and guarded by her rigid mother as a treasure, from the eyes of thieves

["Augen eines Geizigen" is correctly rendered "the eyes of a miser."]

Mus. D L, 195: zu träge, um des Fremdlings willen das Feuer auf dem Herde wieder aufzufachen.

Car. 44: and too tired to relight the fire on his hearth, for the sake of a stranger.

[Here träge definitely had the force of lazy in the text.]

Mus. DL, 198: "Ich sage, dass er schlecht sei," antwortete Franz, "wenns vom besten ist, den Ihr auf dem Lager habt, und dass er gut sei, wenns Eure geringste Nummer ist."

Car. 47: "I say," answered Franz, "that it is bad, if it is the best sort in your catacombs; and good, if it is your meanest number."

["Catacombs" too readily suggests subterranean vaults instead of store rooms.]

in the illustrations refer to the pages in the German editions and in the editions of Carlyle's translation from which the illustrations were taken.

Mus. D L, 216: Gegen diesen bedeutsamen Wink galt so wenig eine Einwendung, als gegen die strengen Befehle des Grossherrn, wenn er einem exilierten Vezier den Engel des Todes, den Capichi Baschi, mit der seidnen Schnur nachschickt, seinen Kopf in Empfang zu nehmen.

Car. 62: Against so pertinent a sign, remonstrance was as bootless as it is against the rigorous commands of the Grand Turk, when he transmits an exiled vizier to the Angel of Death, the Capichi Bashi with the silken Cord, to take delivery of his head.

[Here, in the original, the Grand Turk does not "transmit the exiled Vizier to the Angel of Death" but sends the Angel of Death in pursuit of him.]

Mus. D L, 220: wenn der Wanderer mit der Glatze zum Vorschein kommen würde

Car. 66: when the traveller with his scalp was to come forth

["Glatze" is a "bald-head."]

Mus. D L, 226: er nagte lange Zeit an einem Apfelkröbse, ohne dass er dieses selbst zu wissen schien.

Car. 70: he had nibbled at an apple-rind for some time, without seeming to be conscious that he was doing so.

[Carlyle should have written "apple-core."]

Mus. L, 202: und einer Geliebten eine mündliche Erklärung abzufordern

Car. 109: and for a lover to demand an oral explanation

[Here in the context, "mündliche Erklärung" was definitely a declaration or a confession of love.]

Mus. L, 208: er [refers to "Sturmwind"] soll mit den Wolken kämpfen und sie zerstreuen, die von Mitternacht heraufziehen und das Land mit Hagel und schweren Wettern bedräuen.

Car. 114: it shall battle with the clouds, and disperse them, where they are rising from the south, and threatening the land with hail and heavy weather."

["Mitternacht" is "the North"; "Mittag" is "the South."]

Mus. M, 250: während dieses Zeitverlaufes hatte ihm seine liebebreizende Gemahlin auch zwei Kinder zur Welt gebracht, ein Herrlein und ein Fräulein, die nach Beschaffenheit dieses rüstigen Weltalters ohne Beihülfe der Kunst so leicht und rasch geboren wurden wie der Tau aus der Morgenröte.

Car. 137: in this period his lovely consort had presented him with two children, a little master and a little

miss, which, according to the custom of those stalwart ages, had been born without the aid of science, fair and softly as the dew from the Twilight.

["Morgenröte" is "the Dawn"; "Abendröte," "the Twilight."]]

Mus. M, 258: und sein ritterliches Schwert dreimal gegen die Sarazenen blitzen zu lassen.

Car. 143: and thrice dyeing his knightly sword in un-believing blood

[Musaeus writes merely of a display of the sword; Carlyle, of actual slaughter.]]

Mus. M, 271: vermittelt der Lockspeise des Baumöls

Car. M, 153: the bribery of a little vegetable-oil

["Olive oil" would have been correct.]]

Mus. M, 293: Weil nun das Fräulein in dem Kostüm der Koketterie ganz unerfahren war, und nicht wusste, den blöden Schläfer aufzumuntern, den Diebstahl ihres Herzens zu begehen, so drehete sich die ganze Intrike um die Achse des wechselseitigen Wohlwollens.

Car. 181: And as the Princess was entirely inexperienced in the science of coquetry, and knew not how to set about encouraging the timid shepherd to the stealing of her heart, the whole intrigue revolved upon the axis of mutual good-will;

[Apparently Carlyle misread "Schläfer" for "Schäfer."]]

Mus. M, 300: Der Graf bemerkte ihre Ankunft hinter einer Eheulaube; da fing an in seinem Herzen zu arbeiten wie in einer Mühle; es pochte und hämmerte als war er Berg an Berg abgelaufen

Car. 177: The count observed her entrance from behind a grove of ivy; and there began a knocking in his heart, as in a mill; a thumping and hammering as if he had just run a race.

[Musaeus writes "as though he had run up a hill and down again"; there is no hint of any race.]]

Mus. M, 332: Meinst du mein keusches Ehebett wieder zu beschreiten? Wir sind geschiedene Leute! Hab ich dich nicht öffentlich an drei Kirchthüren öffentlich zitieren lassen und bist du nicht deines ungehorsamlichen Ausbleibens halber für mausetot erklärt?

Car. 202: dost thou think that I will take thee back to my chaste bed? Off with thee! Did I not publicly cite thee at three church-doors, and wert not thou, for thy contumacious non-appearance, declared to be dead as mutton?

["Wir sind geschiedene Leute!" should be translated "We are divorced people." "Off with thee!" will hardly suggest

this even in the context.]

Tie. F. E, 159: aber die Sucht etwas Neues zu sehen, trieb mich vorwärts.

Car. 280: but the longing to see something new still hindered me.

Tie. T E, 179: auch deinen Bruder erretten, der in gefänglicher Haft bei ihm schmachtet.

Car. 292: and fain save thy brother who is pining in the dungeon beside him.

["Bei" here means merely "at that place." Carlyle would lead one to believe that both men are in the dungeon; the fact is that one has the other in prison.]

Tie. T E, 182: Wer nun diese Klänge vernimmt, der wird von ihnen mit offenbarer, doch unerklärlicher Gewalt erfasst.

Car. 295: And whoever hears these sounds is seized by him with visible yet inexplicable force.

[The meaning obviously is: whoever hears the sounds is seized by the sounds, not by the "Musician from the Powers of Hell" who produces them.]

Tie. T E, 192: doch sollst du dich künftig, zum Gedächtniss dieser grauenvollen Nacht, den Tannenhäuser nennen.

Car. 302: and in the future, in remembrance of this awful night, thou shalt call them the Tannenhäuser, or Pinehouses.

[The Duke gave the name Tannenhäuser to Eckart, not to the two castles as Carlyle believed.]

Tie. T E, 193: Am andern Morgen kamen andere Diener, die den kranken Herzog fanden

Car. 302: some other servants of the Duke arrived and found their master dying.

[Carlyle hastens the matter too much. Tieck has not yet intimated that the man is dying.]

Tie. E, 365: Es ist heiss! sagte der Bursche, und das kleine Mädchen langte begierig nach den rothen Kirschen.

Car. 343: "It is warm," said the boy; "and Mary had a longing for the red cherries.

[Apparently Carlyle confused "langte" with "verlangte."]

Tie. E, 383: und im folgenden Jahr ward sie durch eine junge Tochter erfreut.

Car. 357: in the next year she was solaced by a little daughter.

Die. P, 397: mit einem einzigen Bedienten

Car. 368: with a few servants

[In this instance the emphasis in the original was particularly on the fact that there was but one servant.]

Tie. P, 409: dies ist das Zimmer, in welchem er mir jenes holdselige Orakel erwecken wollte.

Car. 377: here is the room where he raised for me that blissful vision.

[The fact is that the "blissful vision" never was "raised," or conjured up.]

Hof. G, 204: Da erwachten die tausend Keime und streckten ihre grünen Blättlein und Halme zum Angesicht der Mutter hinauf, und wie lächelnde Kinder in grüner Wiege, ruhten in den Blüten und Knospen Blümlein, bis auch sie von der Mutter geweckt erwachten und sich schmückten mit den Lichtern die die Mutter ihnen zur Freude auf tausendfache Weise bunt gefärbt.

Car. 38: Then a thousand germs stretched out their little leaves and stalks towards the sun their father's face; and like smiling infants in green cradles, the flowrets rested in their buds and blossoms, till they too, awakened by their father, decked themselves in lights, which their father, to please them, tinted in a thousand varied hues.

[In the German, "sun" is feminine and "moon" masculine; in the English just the reverse holds true. This is probably the reason for Carlyle's writing of "father" in the place of "mother." Whether the translator may take such privilege is highly questionable.]

Hof. G, 220: Es war eben Mittwoch und Veronika beschloss, unter dem Vorwande, die Osters nach Hause zu begleiten, die Alte aufzusuchen, welches sie denn auch in der That ausführte.

Car. 57: It was Thursday even now, and Veronica determined, under pretext of accompanying the Osters home, to visit this old woman and lay the case before her.

Hof. G, 232: und gleich darauf stand auch die Alte, mit einem Korbe beladen und von ihrem Kater begleitet, vor der Thür.

Car. 70: and instantly the crone, laden with a basket, and attended by her Cat, was also standing at the door.

["Auch" here gives the statement the force of "and instantly thereupon the old woman was standing at the door." "Auch" is correct in German but should be omitted in English.]

Hof. G, 234: Der Postillon stiess schmetternd in sein Horn, die Alte kugelte um in ihren Sud hinein, und Alles

war mit einem Mal verschwunden in dickem Qualm.

Car. 73: The postillion blew a clanging blast on his horn; the witch ladled about in her brewage, and in a trice the whole had vanished in thick smoke.

[The old hag literally "tumbled over into her brewage."]]

Hof. G, 260: "Die hat der Anselmus auch auf der Seele," sagte der Conrektor voller Bosheit.

Car. 103: "She too has Anselmus in her head," said the Conrektor, full of spleen:

[The meaning is: In addition to everything else, Anselmus has that girl on his brain, too; Carlyle wrote that the girl had the boy on her brain.]]

Hof. G, 238: das Wichtigste bleibt aber noch zu tun übrig.

Car. 78: but the hardest is yet behind.

[The most important still remains to be done," would be correct.]]

Ric. A S J, 239: die Thürme der Stadt, gleichsam architektonische Berge, welche, wie die Natürlichen, die Thronen unserer Zukunft sind.

Car. 162: the steeples of the town these artificial peaks, which like natural ones, are the thrones of our Future.

[The "Architectural peaks" would have been more exact.]]

Ric. A S J, 216: den vergoldeten Klingel-Drahts-Knopf, den ja jeder abdrehen und einstecken konnte.

Car. 184: the gilt bell-handle, lying ready for anyone to pull out or push in.

[The meaning is that this gilt bellknob could have been taken off and stolen.]]

Ric. Q F, 63: Sie konnte vor Vergnügen den Plettstein nicht in die Platte schütteln, da der vornehme Schulmann sie unter dem lauten Sieden des Bratens zärtlich auf die nackte Stirn küsste und gar Mama sagte.

Car. 199: For joy she forgot to put the heater into the smoothing-iron, as her illustrious scholar, amid the loud boiling of the soup, tenderly kissed her brow, and even said Mamma;

[She was so excited she was unable to put the heater into the iron.]]

Ric. Q F, 77: "Die Juden hätten ihre Masora aufzuweisen, die ihnen sagte, wie oft jeder Buchstabe in ihrer Bibel vorkomme, z. B. das Aleph (das A) 43,277 mal.

Car. 215: "The Jews had their Masora to show which

told them how often every letter was to be found in their Bible; for example, the Aleph (the A) 42,377 times.

[This is probably a slip in reading proof; the "2" and the "3" have been interchanged.]

Ric. Q F, 80: Daraus erkläre sich der Leser Fixleins Wohlegefallen am rothen Eichhörnchen-Stockhaus, an dem aus Kartoffelnsamenkapseln und weissen Saßen zusammengesteckten Sparrwerk, an dem heitern Glashauss einer würfelförmigen Laterne.

Car. 219: From this may the reader explain to himself Fixlein's delight in the red acorn-blockhouse, in the spar-work glued together out of white chips and husks of potato-plums, in the cheerful glass-house of a cube-shaped lantern, and other the like products of his early architecture.

["Eichhörnchen" is a squirrel, not an acorn.]

Ric. Q F, 86: Es fehlte der Schlachtereier weder an einem hölzernen Beile, nach an Würsten, Pökelfleisch u.d.gl.

Car. 226: Their slaughtering wants not an axe (of wood), nor puddings, nor potted meat.

["Würsten" is the word generally used among German people for sausage; it has a very rich connotation. "Puddings" does not convey the correct conception.]

Ric. Q F, 95: Der Quartiermeister nickte mit dem Kopfe siebenzimal.

Car. 236: The Quartermaster nodded fifty-times.

[Carlyle must have thought seventy just a little high.]

Ric. Q F, 102: Denn er hat für den armen Teufel, welcher keinen Stoiker und keinen Seelensorger bezahlen kann . . . ein herrliches Wund-Wasser

Car. 243: for the poor devil who is no Stoic, and can pay no Soul-doctor . . . he has a precious wound-water.

[Should be: "for the poor devil who can pay no Stoic." It is true, Fixlein wished to be stoical as he pondered over the idea of death; he needed, however, to rely on a Stoic that had greater firmness than he himself possessed.]

Ric. Q F, 120: Der Himmel segne sein Couvert; aber ich lasse mich vom babylonischen Thurm hinunter werfen, wenn er die Pfarre kriegt.

Car. 263: Heaven bless his cover; but I let you throw me from the Tower of Babel, if he get the parsonage;

["Couvert" here refers definitely to the envelope of a letter. The young parson had just mailed his letter containing the application for the parsonage.]

Ric. Q F, 146: "der Herr segne dich and behüte dich und lasse sein Angesicht über dich leuchten und schenke dir

zur Freude deiner Schwiegermutter und deines Mannes insbesondere ein glückliches frohliches Kindbette, Amen!"

Car. 291: and may the Lord bless thee and watch over thee, and cause his countenance to shine on thee, and send thee, to the joy of our mother and thy husband especially, a happy glad recovery. Amen!"

[/The softening of the passage here is definitely a blunder. It is the first hint in the story that a child is expected; Carlyle writes of a recovery and the reader doesn't know from what.]

Ric. Q F, 152: In jedem Frühling--und in einem solchen gar--geh' ich zu Fusse den Zugvögeln entgegen

Car. 298: Every spring--and especially in such a spring--I imitate on foot our birds of passage;

[/In the spring of the year when the birds return he goes out to meet them, not to imitate them.]

Ric. Q F, 152: Es ist sonderbar, d. h., menschlich.

Car. 298: It is singular, that is to say, manlike.

[/Generically speaking "Mensch" is "man." Here, however, Carlyle has made an error; for "menschlich" is translated "human," and "männlich," "manlike."]

Ric. Q F, 152: Ich glaube aber nicht, dass ich nur den Thurmknopf von Hukelum, der in einigen Tagen abgehoben wird, geschweige, geschweige die Pharrleute gesehen hätte, war' ich nicht beim flacksenfinglichen Superintendenten und Konsistorialrath gewesen.

Car. 298: but I do not think I should have seen even the steeple-ball of Hukelum, which is to be set up one of these days, to say nothing of the Parson's family, had not I happened to be visiting the Flacksenfingen Superintendent and Consistorialrath.

[/Richter here refers to the old "steeple-ball" which is still on the tower. It is to be taken down within a few days and replaced by a new one.]

Ric. Q F, 178: weil Lavater in Kanzeln, wie eine Schäferin in Bäume, gern den Namen des Beliebten schreibt.

Car. 326: for Lavater likes to inscribe in pulpits, as a shepherd does in trees, the name of his beloved.

[/Carlyle changes the feminine to masculine. It is a shepherdess who inscribes the name of her lover upon trees.]

(2) Inaccuracies

To inaccuracies belong by far the greatest number of the faults which the study revealed. In degree of seriousness

they range from the slightest deviation from the original to the near-definite error. All of the inaccurate passages have a semblance of correctness, and the meaning which they convey in the translation is, in a general way, the same as that in the original. It is in their failure to preserve the finer shades of value that the objection lies. Usually it is a single word, less frequently an entire phrase, which is the offending element. The first passage below is a good example. "Ein herrlicher Junge" Carlyle translates "a brilliant youth." In a broad sense, "herrlich" is "brilliant"; but to give the same impression which Musaeus was giving here, Carlyle should have written "a magnificent youth," "a noble youth," or even "a glorious youth." Were "brilliant" correct, the original would have been "ein glänzender Junge." "Brilliant" in the sense of "exceptionally talented"--which was not the thought in the original--would be expressed in German as "begabter."

Mus. D L, 162: Franz Melcherson war ein herrlicher Junge.

Car. 19: Franz Melcherson was a brilliant youth.

Mus. D L, 165: der Besitzer (wurde) der sich zur Notwehr mit einigen rechtlichen Schikanen noch verbollwerkt hatte, judizialiter exmittiert.

Car. 21: And the late owner, who in this extremity had screened himself from jail by some chicanery of law, judicially ejected.

["Screened" does not suggest sufficiently heavy fortifications.]

Mus. D L, 194: im Verliess seines Raubschlusses verschmachten.

Car. 44: pining in the ward-room of his tower.

["The "Verliess" mentioned in the German story refers to a dungeon; the English word "ward-room" hardly conveys that idea.]

Mus. D L, 195: und mich wacker schütteln wird, wofern ich die nassen Kleider nicht trocken kann.

Car. 45: and shake me tightly if I cannot dry my clothes.

Mus. D L, 204: Peter Martens ist ein solider Mann

Car. 52: Peter Martens is a warm man

Mus. D L, 234: das lästige Geschmeiss der Gutschmecker und Schranzen

Car. 78: the cumbersome brood of pick-thanks and toad-eaters

[A "Gutschmacker" is one who likes to eat well; "pick-thank" one who curries favor by talebearing.]

Mus. D L, 239: Er hatte sich in einem prächtigen Feierkleide herausgeputzt.

Car. 81: He had decked himself with a gallant wooing-suit;

["Feierkleid" is a holiday-garment but not necessarily a "wooing-suit."]

Mus. L, 194: Der Wolf frisst das Lamm, der Weih die Taube, der Fuchs das Huhn.

Car. 103: The wolf eats the lamb, the kite the dove, the fox the Cock.

Mus. L, 198: das stolze Ross scheut meinen Stachel

Car. 106: the strong horse is afraid of my sting

Mus. L, 200: Der Würgengel fiel mit Zentnergewicht auf den schlafenden Ritter und würgte ihn so zusammen, dass er im Erwachen vermeinte, es sei ein Mühlstein ihm auf den Hals gewälzet.

Car. 108: The destroying angel lighted like a mountain of lead upon the slumbering knight, and so squeezed him together, that he felt on awakening as if a millstone had been hung about his neck.

[The actual translation is: when he awoke he felt crushed as though a millstone had been rolled upon him.]

Mus. M, 248: dem widerte bald der Pillen Geschmack, der in der Süssigkeit verborgen lag; auch kneipte es ihn davon weidlich in den krausen Därmen.

Car. 135: he soon smacked the taste of the physic hidden in this sweetness, and he knew too well its effects on the alimentary canal:

[More accurately, he felt griping pains in his bowels.]

Mus. M, 286: dass er ihn mit dem Ehrenge wand des Kaftans bekleidete.

Car. 165: and presenting him with a splendid caftan.

Mus. M, 296: Der flinke Kurt hatte die Abendmahlzeit schon aufgetischt

Car. 173: The mettled Kurt had supper on the table:

["flinke" appears frequently in the Musaeus material; Carlyle always translates it "mettled."]

Mus. M, 324: Das Gewissen ist ein Mantel der jede Blöße deckt.

Car. 196: Conscience is a cloak that covers every hole.

[A bare spot is not necessarily a hole.]

Mus. M, 327: das Gerücht von seiner Ankunft war auf Adlersfüttichen vor ihm her geflogen.

Car. 199: but the news of his approach had preceded him, as on the wings of the wind.

Tie. F E, 146: Ihr müsst mich nicht für zudringlich halten.

Car. 270: "You must not reckon be a babblers".

[Literally, "Do not think me too importunate, or too intrusive."]

Tie. F E, 147: weil ich doch nur ein unnütziges Geschöpf sei.

Car. 271: since I was nothing but a useless sluggard.

Tie. F E, 151: und das Rieseln der Quellen und von Zeit zu Zeit das Flüstern der Bäume tönte durch die heitere Stille wie in wehmütiger Freude.

Car. 274: and the gushing of brooks and from time to time, the rustling of the trees, resounded through the serene stillness, as in pensive joy.

["Rieseln" is hardly strong enough to suggest "gushing."]

Tie. T E, 182: nun hat sie der Klang ergriffen und angefasst, sie sind davon in die Weite.

Car. 295: But now the sound has caught and carried them off, they are gone into unseen kingdoms.

Tie. E, 373: Viele kleine Zwerge . . . schütteten die Gold-körner keuchend auf den Boden aus.

Car. 349: Many little dwarfs were busied . . . shaking the gold-dust on the ground.

["Gold-staub" would have better justified Carlyle's translation.]

Tie. G, 412: damals soll sie das schönste Mädchen in der Stadt gewesen sein.

Car. 379: "She was then, it seems, the finest woman in the city."

Hof. G P, 208: ein recht artiger junger Mann
 Car. 43: a most pretty young man

Mann

Hof. G P, 216: ein liebenswürdiger junger

Car. 52: a pretty young man

fert"

Hof. G P, 260: "der Registrar ist nun auch gelie-

Car. 103: The Registrar is now over with it too.

[The meaning in the original is that now the Registrar has also been turned over to the Devil; as Carlyle renders it the impression is given that the Registrar is now no longer in any danger of being turned over.]

Ric. A S J, 220: Ich setzte mein Bittschreiben in drei Tagen auf.

Car. 143: In less than a week, I had finished writing my Petition.

Ric. A S J, 226: ein Zwerg und ein Mädchen

Car. 149: a dwarf and a female

Ric. A S J, 236: Eigentlich sollte niemand mit dem Nachwächterhorne investieret werden, als ein vernünftiger Mann, der sich schon einen Bruch geblasen oder gehoben hatte,

Car. 160: In my opinion, nobody should be invested with the watchmanhorn but some reasonable man, who had already blown himself into an asthma

[Actually, a man who blew so hard he developed a rupture.]

Ric. A S J, 259: Gott soll mich strafen, wenn ich nicht noch in den Hundstagen alles werde, was du nur willst --Sprich, willst du Bergräthin werden, oder Bauräthin, oder Hofräthin, Kriegsräthin, Kammerräthin, Kommerzienräthin, Legazionsräthin, oder des Henkers-und Teufels-räthin: ich bin dabei und werd' es und such' an.

Car. 182: May I die, if yet in these dog-days I become not all and everything that thou wishest! Speak, wilt thou be Mining-räthin, Build-räthin, Court-räthin, War-räthin, Chamber-räthin, Commerce-räthin, Legations-räthin, or Devil and his Dam's räthin: I am here and will buy it, and be it.

[Carlyle might convey the impression that Schmelzle had to win his position by bribery. What Fixlein said was that he would be persistent in his application for the contemplated appointment until he secured it.]

Ric. A S J, 262: Es gehört auch allerdings unter die unerkannten Wohlthaten--wordüber man sonst predigte

Car. 186: On which, in ancient times, special sermons were preached

Whenever "sonst" is used as it is here Carlyle always translates "in ancient times."/

Ric. Q F, 94: seiner leiblichen achtzehn]ährigen Tochter.

Car. 235: his own grown-up daughter.

Ric. Q F, 156: Das Leben schattet sich mir zu einer eiligen Johannisnacht ein, die wir schiessende Johanniswürmchen glimmend durchschneiden.

Car. 302: Life shaded itself off to my eyes like a hasty summer night, which we little fireflies shoot across with transient gleam;

(3) Literalness Resulting in Awkward Constructions and Germanisms

De Quincey's condemnation of Carlyle's translation of Wilhelm Meister, because of its provincialisms, Scotticisms, and other lapses from genuine English, was, on the whole, too sweeping¹; nevertheless, there was some warrant

¹ De Quincey, in an article in Blackwood's, severely criticized Carlyle for his close allegiance to the law of "fidelity" in translating: "From a complete misconception, of the duties of a translator of novels,--and under the very same servile conceit of fidelity which, combined with laziness and dyspepsy, has so often led translators to degrade themselves into mere echoes of the idiom and turn a sentence in the original. Fidelity is a good thing; none better: but what is it we mean by fidelity? Fidelity, we presume, to what is good in our model; not to the accidents of his particular language, which must be transfused into ours upon a principle of compensation, not by exchanging like for like, but equivalent: still less fidelity to his errors, his dulness, or his self-counteractions: But shall I not stick to my author? Is it lawful for me to swerve from a German Professor's Novel?--Undoubtedly it is: be faithful to the Professor, where you cannot improve his plot, or inspirit his characters: wherever you can, betray the Professor--betray him into a general popularity in England, and the Professor will be the first man to send you a gold snuff-box for so doing."--Blackwood's Magazine, XX, 1826, p. 857.

for his criticism; and the translation of the German romances done a year later is not wholly free from the sort of faults De Quincey had assailed. De Quincey concludes his criticism thus:

Not to insist however invidiously on errors of this nature, we shall conclude our notice of the English Wilhelm Meister . . . that the translation too generally by the awkward and German air of its style, reminds us painfully that it is a translation; and in respect to fidelity therefore, will probably on close comparison, appear to have aimed at too servile a fidelity.¹

The "German air" is as obvious in the style used by Carlyle in translating portions of the romances as De Quincey found it to be in the earlier work. Undoubtedly, by his "continuous poring over his text"² Carlyle became so steeped in the style of the original works that he made this style in part his own. Any reader of Carlyle will recall that in his own original work--Sartor Resartus in particular--there is to be found much of this "German air." His use of German constructions and German diction in the translations, however, may in part be justified. He wished to convey to the English public an idea of the Germanic manner of expression, and a number of the Germanisms may have been deliberately used with that intent. A list of his Germanic constructions which seem to be good illustrations of German idiom, and

¹ London Magazine, X, August, 1824. Quoted by Olga Marx, op. cit., p. 7.

² Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 74.

which therefore may fairly be justified, will be given in the next chapter. In this chapter are listed a number which seem hardly excusable.

Mus. D L, 215: Draussen gings Tür auf, Tür zu, mit grasslichem Gepolter.

Car. 61: Outside it came along, door up, door to, with hideous uproar.

[When one says in German "die Tür aufmachen," he does not generally think of it being drawn upward.]

Mus. D. L, 226: demungeachtet hielt die Hoffnung noch immer seine Aufmerksamkeit gespannt.

Car. 70: yet hope still kept his attention on the stretch.

Mus. L, 198: Die Bienen hatten ihren Weisel verloren, und der ganze Stock war unlustig und traurig. Sie flogen träge und sparsam aus, hatten zur Honigbereitung wenig Lust und Mut, und ihr Gewerbe und Nahrung geriet in Verfall.

Car. 106: "The Bees had lost their Queen, and the whole hive sat sad and moping; they flew seldom and sluggishly out, had small heart or activity in honey-making and their trade and sustenance fell into decay.

[The word order has been retained exactly.]

Mus. L, 225: Denn wenn er den Lindwurm des Aberglaubens unter seine Füße getreten hat, wird er seinen Arm ausstrecken, dem wachsenden Mond entgegen.

Car. 129: For when he has trodden under his feet the Dragon of Superstition he will stretch out his arm against the waxing moon.

[Carlyle repeatedly translates "entgegen" "against" instead of "towards."]

Mus. M, 277: Sie sind insgesamt bei der Erde weggehauen, dass ihre Stätte nich mehr zu finden ist.

Car. 158: They are all hewn away by the surface, and their place is no longer to be found.

[Ordinarily we say "at the surface."]

Mus. M, 298: sie nahm die Blume mit sich und das assekurierte wenigstens vorläufig des Grafen Kopf.

Car. 175: she took the flower with her, and this at least secured the Count's head, in the first place.

[In the effort to catch also the word "vorläufig," Carlyle attaches the dangling phrase "in the first place." Translated more accurately it should read, "and this, for the time being, at least, secured the Count's head."]

Tie. T E, 177: Aber was will er von uns, fragte Conrad ungeduldig.

Car. 291: "But what wants he with us then?" said Conrad impatiently.

Tie. T E, 199: schon umgab ihn ein Kreis von fröhlichen Kindern.

Car. 308: already was a ring of merry children round him.

[The word order follows the German very closely.]

Tie. T E, 204: Von dieser Stunde an war es, als wenn die Musik, die mich bis dahin begleitet hatte, in meinem Busen unterginge.

Car. 311: From this hour, it was as if the music, which had hitherto accompanied me, went silent in my bosom.

Tie E, 412: Er schaute in das Gold hinein und in die Welle des Weines.

Car. 379: He looked in upon the gold, and the waving of the wine.

Hof. G P, 224: Die Thür ging auf.

Car. 22: The door went up:

["aufmachen" is "to open," but not necessarily "up."]]

Hof. G P, 233: indem sie unverständliche, durch die Nacht grausig gellende Töne austiess.

Car. 72: While she howled in dread yelling tones through the gloom.

Ric. A S J, 251: Unsere Trauerthänen trocknen auch Freunde ab.

Car. 175: Our tears of sorrow friends dry up.

Ric. A S J, 256: ich gaffte auf

Car. 179: I gaped up.

Ric. Q F, 97: das Aufblühen der verjüngten Erde.

Car. 238: this very up-blooming of the renovated earth.

Ric. Q F, 157: Die schwarze Stunde des Kaffees hat Gold im Munde für uns und Honig.

Car. 304: The black hour of coffee has gold in its mouth for us and honey.

Ric. Q F, 168: Alle theologische Wünsche, die ich ihm auf dem damit bedruckten Pathenzettel an seinen jungen Busen steckte, glühten in meinem noch einmal geschrieben.

Car. 317: All the theological wishes, which, on the godson-billet printed over with them, I placed in his young bosom, were glowingly written in mind.

[In adhering too closely to the German, Carlyle, produces awkward English.]

(4) Inexcusable Free Translations

Numerous short passages occur in the German romances which Carlyle apparently thought best to translate freely. These passages are usually found to contain some vague idea, some idiom difficult to render into English, or some involved construction. In making such free rendition there was an occasional weakening of the force of the original. In certain instances, a literal translation would have been more effective, even if a bit awkward, than the free one Carlyle has given. In a later chapter will be listed illustrations of Carlyle's free translations that involve little or no loss of the force of the original and seem in all ways effective. The following are passages illustrating his unsuccessful free translations.

Mus. D L, 176: junges Blut, spar dein Gut!
Car. 30: A penny saved is a penny got.

Mus. D L, 198: "Das Wams," sprach er, "ist für einen Schmerbauch."
Car. 47: "This waistcoat," said he, "would go round a tun."
["Schmerbauch" is an enormous paunch.]

Mus. L, 177: dass das Geräusch der keuchenden Säge ihm in die Ohren drang.
Car. 89: that the screeching of the busy saw did not escape his ear.

Mus. L, 225: Als er nun an dem war, dass er sein bisheries Eigentum verlassen wollte.
Car. 129: Being now about to quit his still asylum.

[The reference here is to a man who, for many years, had been living free and unmolested upon his own farm; it was by no means an "asylum" for him in the sense that we use

the word today. "Eigentum" is "property."]

Mus. M, 250: Allein die mehresten suchten einen Vorwand, diese Fahrt in fremde Lande glimpflich von sich abzulehnen.

Car. 136: But most of them sought pretexts for politely declining this honour.

Mus. M, 322: So fand sie keinen Anstand, zu williger Abtretung der Halbscheid ihrer ehelichen Gerechtsame sich zu entschliessen.

Car. 195: she no longer hesitated to resolve on the surrender.

[Here Carlyle not only translates freely, but also condenses.]

Tie. T E, 212: die eben von einem Besuch ihrer Schwester, bei der sie einige Tage verweilt, auf das Schloss zurück gekommen war.

Car. 317: who had just then returned from a visit to her sister, which had kept her for the last few days from home.

Tie. R, 242: er trank häufigen und starken Wein.

Car. 340: he fled for consolation to the bottle.

Tie. E, 369: Ei! es will nur gewagt sein! rief die kleine Marie, ich renne was ich kann, und bin schnell, schnell jenseit wieder hinaus, sie können mich doch eben nicht gleich von der Erde weg auffressen.

Car. 346: "Well, I must risk it," cried she, "I will run for life; quick, quick, I am through: certainly to Heaven, they cannot eat me up alive in half a minute!"

Hof. G P, 249: "Ja, ja, Du hast Recht, Brüderchen Anselmus, und wer es nicht glaubt, ist mein Feind!"

Car. 91: "Ay, ay, thou art in the right, brother-kin Anselmus; and whoever says no, is saying no to me!"

[An enemy is not necessarily one merely because he has said "no."]

Ric. A S J, 225: Beide Narren beziehen nämlich gemeinschaftlich die Messen als gegenseitige Messhelfer zu entgegengesetzten Grössen.

Car. 148: Both these noodles, it appeared, are in the habit of going in company to fairs, as reciprocal exaggerators of opposite magnitudes.

["Noodle" was a slang term for "fool" in Carlyle's time.]

Ric. A S J, 261: Ja, ihrem armen Herzen wurde ordentlich die Brust zu Schnürbrust.

Car. 184: Nay, her poor heart was like to fail.
 For her heart the feeling was not unlike that
 experienced when the chest is being laced tight with a
 corset.

(5) Conscious Alterations: Additions,
 Condensations, Omissions

On the whole, Carlyle very seldom allowed himself to change the text of the original. Occasionally, however, as will be seen in the next chapter, because of a certain ethical taste characteristic sometimes of himself, sometimes, as he thought, of his public, he found it necessary to do so. In this chapter are pointed out, only those minor alterations which seem to lack justification. In the main, as has just been indicated, changes of this kind are few. The objectionable additions consist generally of some word or phrase which does not seem necessary for explanatory or other purposes. Of condensations there are even fewer. The meanings lost as a result of these condensations are not always essential for the clearness of the passage; nevertheless, certain fine shades are sacrificed through them.

Additions

Mus. D L, 162: er . . . spielte den reichen Mann im Evangelium im Wortverstande und lebte alle Tage herrlich und in Freuden.

Car. 20: he . . . began to play the Rich Man in the Gospel to the very letter; went clothed in fine apparel, and fared sumptuously every day.

Mus. D L, 221: das Gespenst möchte . . . ihn erdrosselt oder in so übermässige Furcht versetzt haben, dass er vor Entsetzen gestorben sei.

Car. 66: the Goblin might have beaten him to jelly perhaps, or so frightened him that he had died of terror.

Mus. L, 189: Wo nicht, so bleibe hie, bis du mir die Augen zgedrückt hast, dann tue, was dir gut dünket.

Car. 99: If not, stay here till thou has closed my eyes and laid me in the earth; then do what shall seem good to thee.

Tie. F E, 148: Bald musste ich über Hügel klettern

Car. 272: Ere long my path began to mount, at one time I was climbing hills,

Tie. E, 386: dann kommt die Sonne, die Blüte geht so leutselig auf.

Car. 359: then the sun grows hot, and the buds come joyfully forth.

Tie. P, 415: und der Tod nur schied die beiden Wesen, um sie kurze Zeit nachher wieder zu vereinigen.

Car. 382: and Death alone parted these two beings, to reunite them in a short time, beyond the power of separation.

Hof. G P, 206: er konnte dem Archivarius Lindhorst kaum in die starren ernsten Augen sehen

Car. 42: he could scarcely look in Archivarius Lindhorst's parched countenance, and fixed earnest eyes.

Ric. Q F, 80: er rückte seine Kinderkutsche

Car. 219: he gave his childs-coach a tug and made it run.

["Gave a tug" would have been an adequate translation of "rückte"; the context does not indicate that the coach was made to run.]

Condensations

Hof. G P, 256: aber meine Frau Gevatterinn, die Ratte welche gleich über Dir auf dem Boden wohnt, die soll das Brett entzweinagen, auf dem Du stehst, dann purzelst Du hinunter und ich fange Dich auf in der Schürze.

Car. 98: but my cousin Gossip the Rat, that lives close behind thee, will eat the shelf in two; thou shalt jingle down, and I catch thee in my apron.

Ric. A S J, 224: Ob nicht die Hure meine Bekanntschaft zu einer Eidlichen Angabe benützen, ob nicht Spitzbuben unter den Passagieren mich und meine Eigenheiten und

Zufälle studieren würden, um auf der Tortur mich in ihre Bande zu flechten--dafür konnte sich niemand verpfänden.

Car. 148: That rascals among these people would not study me and my properties and accidents, to entangle me in their snares, no man could be my surety.

Ric. Q F, 97: Der alte Lehrer des Konrektors, Astmann, begegnete im April, der weniger veränderlich als todlich ist, dem Tode, der ihm das am Magen siechende Gehirn eindrückte.

Car. 238: In April, which is no less deadly than it is fickle, old Senior Astmann, our Conrector's teacher, was overtaken by death.

[By both condensing and omitting, Carlyle here fails to give the force of the original.]

Omissions

Mus. L, 210: Stunden wir nicht gerüstet, um die betrügliche Gabe des stolzen Frauleins zu kämpfen, die uns hasset?

Car. 116: Were we not standing harnessed to fight, for the deceitful gift of this proud Princess?

[The omission of the phrase "die uns hasset" is inexcusable; this is the only place in the story where it is reported that the queen actually hates the two men.]

Mus. L, 230: Wenn indessen ja ein Teil von beiden der Betrogne gewesen war, so war es wenigstens nicht die kluge Libussa, sondern das Volk, wie das ohnehin der gewöhnliche Fall ist.

Car. 133: And if either of the parties had been overreached in any measure, it at least was not the fair Libussa.

[The part omitted here is very necessary to the context; although it may have been inferred that the other party was the public, there is nothing to suggest that its betrayal was usual.]

Mus. M, 269: Sie beweinte ihren Herrn auch wirklich als einen Toten. Und als ihre verwaisten Kindlein in der Unbefangenheit ihres Herzens, sich der schwarzen Käpplein freuten, die ihnen Mama hatte machen lassen, den guten Vater, dessen Verlust sie noch nicht fühlten, darin zu betrauern: so jammerte es ihr in die Seele, und ihre Augen zerflossen in Tränen vor wehmutsvoller Betrübniß.

Car. 151: (Passage is entirely omitted.)

[This is merely the narration of a naturally expected reaction; nevertheless, "fidelity" can not condone its omission.]

Mus. M, 292: Das Fräulein stund im ersten Noviziat

der Liebe und hatte so wenig Kenntniss davon als eine Klo-
sternovize von den Ordensgeheimnissen.

Car. 170: The Princess was still in the first novitiate of love, and had not the slightest knowledge of its mysteries.

[By the omission of the simile some of the force of the original is lost.]

Fou. A K, 77: Während dass Frode geheilt ward, ging Edwald bisweilen, wenn der Abend recht tief und still hernieder dämmerte, auf der blühenden Terrasse unter Hildegardens Fenstern lustwandeln, und sang anmutige, kleine Lieder. Unter andern folgendes:

"Heilt, Ihr Heldenwunden!
Ritter, wollst gesunden!
Lieber Ehrenstreit,
Sei nicht allzuweit!"

Das aber, welches ihm die Jungfrauen im Schloss am liebsten und öftersten nachsungen, hiess also:

"Ich wollt' ich läg' am Boden,
Gestorben von Heldenschlag.
Ich wollt,' ein Liebesodem
Hauchte mich wieder wach,

Ich wollt,' ich wär' ein Kaiser
An Reichtum und Gewalt,
Ich wollt,' ich suchte Reiser
Im wilden Wald.

Ich wollt,' ich wär' ein Einsiedler,
Ich wollt,' ich ritt in Königs Heer
Ich wollt' in Ehren Jedwedes sein,
Wozu Feinsliebchen nicht sagt: Nein."

Es war auch zugleich das längste Lied, welches Edwald vielleicht in seinem Leben gesungen hatte.

Car. 247: While Froda's cure was proceeding, Edwald, impatient till it were completed, went out now and then, while the evening was darkening down deep and silent over him, and walked on the flowery terrace under Hildegard's window, singing graceful little dainty songs, which the maidens of the Princess learned from him, and often repeated.

[This song should have been translated. It reveals Edwald's subjective mood as it is revealed nowhere else in the story; he is ordinarily silent.]

Tie. F E, 162: welch einen unbeschreiblichen Reiz ihr ihre einsame Erziehung gegeben hatte. Sie kam mir vor wie ein Wunder, und ich liebte sie ganz über alles Maass. Ich hatte kein Vermögen.

Car. 282: What a charm her lonely way of life had given her. I had no fortune.

Hof. G P, 239: und bei dem Anblick der vielen Pünktchen, Striche und Züge und Schnörkel, die bald Pflanzen, bald Moose, bald Thiergestalten darzustellen schienen, wollte ihm beinahe der Muth sinken, Alles so genau nachmalen zu können.

Car. 78: and as he looked over the many points, strokes, dashes, and twirls in the manuscript, he almost lost hope of ever copying it.

Ric. Q F, 85: Nun nahm er den Schnee der Zeit von dem Wintergrün der Erinnerung hinweg und sah die schönen Jahre seiner Kindheit aufgedeckt, frisch, grün, und duftend vor sich darunter stehen. O es ist schön, dass der Rauch der über unserem verouffenden Leben aufsteigt, sich bei dem vergehenden Spiessglas in neuen, obwohl poetischen Freuden-Blumen anlegt!

Car. 225: And now he shook away the snow of Time from the winter green of Memory; and beheld the fair years of his childhood, uncovered, fresh, green and balmy, standing afar off before him.

Ric. Q F, 166: Endlich ging der Sonntag auf, der heutige, und es wurde an diesem heiligen Tage, bloss weil mein Patchen zum Christenthum, obwohl ohne eine grössere nürnbergische Konvertitenbibliothek als die Taufagende, übertreten wollte, ein grosser Lärm gemacht.

Car. 314: At last rose the Sunday, the present; and on this holy day, simply because my little godson was for going over to Christianity there was a vast racket made.

Ric. Q F, 166: Er gab . . . alles her, Fischhamen, Zinnschrankschüsseln und Gewürzbüchsen, und machte mich auf die Fruchtkorbchen voll Freuden aufmerksam, die der Kantatesonntag allemal für ihn pflückte und füllte.

Car. 314: he set before me all that he had; and pointed out to me the fruit-baskets of pleasure which Cantata-Sunday always plucked and filled for him.

(6) Whimsical and Capricious Translations

When translating, Carlyle, for the most part, restrained himself from giving expression to his originality in the use of language. He did, however, occasionally allow his fancy or his imagination to dictate his choice of terms. Occasionally, too, perhaps because of the intolerable strain of the work, or the resentment felt toward some of the material

he was translating, or the persistent disturbances from a dyspeptic stomach, or various other irritations, he translated even carelessly and in a contrary manner. The whimsicalities, careless spurts, and capricious renditions, however, are few in German Romance. Usually they are amusing. Instead of calling a "Stelzfuss" a "wooden-leg," he calls it a "timber-toe." For what should be a "breath of fresh air" he prefers a "mouthful of fresh air." "Suppe" he calls a "bad dinner," and the servant of one referred to as "cock" he calls a "cocker." There follows a list of the most striking of the capricious translations in the romances.

Mus. D L, 225: Der Physiognomist mit dem Stelzfusse
 Car. 70: The Physiognomist with the timber-toe
 ["With stilts" would have been more nearly correct.]

Mus. L, 193: denn sie waren rasch und gurrig, wie der Stier im Kalender abgebildet wird, der im Zeichen des Aprilmonats aus den Wolken herab springt, und nicht so lässig und träge wie der Ochs, der im Evangelienbuch sich so pflegmatisch neben seinen heiligen Gefährten hinfliegelt wie ein Schäferhund.

Car. 102: For they were fiery and impetuous, as the Bull is painted in the Almanac, where he rushes from the clouds in the sign of April; not sluggish and heavy like the Ox, who plods on with his holy consorts, in our Gospel-Book, phlegmatically, as a Dutch skipper in a calm.

[Is a "Dutchskipper in a calm" more suggestive of phlegmatic position than a "shepherd dog"? Carlyle may have thought so.]

Mus. L, 221: und weil der Magen sie an das Mittagsmahl erinnerte, gedachten sie wieder an den wunderbaren Tisch, woran ihr neuer Fürst nach dem Auspruche des Fräuleins tafeln sollte.

Car. 126: and as the gastric juices made them think of dinner, they recalled to mind the strange table, at which, according to the Fräulein's oracle, their new Prince was to be feeding.

Mus. M, 254: er kam . . . auf die Zugbrücke, gleichsam um freie Luft zu schöpfen.

Car. 139: he stepped out upon the drawbridge, as if to take a mouthful of fresh air.

[/The expression "a mouthful of fresh air" easily produces a smile./]

Mus. M, 255: den ersten Ohrenbläser, der seine tugendsame Gemahlin wieder bei ihm verunglimpfen würde, als bald in das Verlies werfen und darinnen peinlich verschmachten zu lassen.

Car. 140: that the first eaves-dropping pickthank who again accused his virtuous wife to him, he would cast into the dungeon, and there let him lie and rot.

[/"Verschmachten" suggests "to pine away" or "to famish"; "to rot" is more than the text implies./]

Mus. M, 324: Lasset einen Scheidebrief, wer kann Euch dann wehren, das Fräulein zu heuraten?

Car. 196: Get a divorce; and who the deuce can hinder you from wedding the Princess then?

[/Carlyle probably intended to indicate emphasis./]

Tie. R, 219: War ich . . . wieder auf der Reise

Car. 323: I was . . . again in motion

[/Why not say, "I was again on my journey"?./]

Tie. R, 233: Er verschloss es sorgfältig.

Car. 333: He locked it carefully up.

[/Had the German been "Er schloss es sorgfältig zu," or "Er hob es sorgfältig auf," one might have thought that Carlyle meant to translate literally. As it is, there seems to be no justification for the awkward "locked it carefully up."/]

Tie. E, 387: Lieb! sagte die kleine Elfe

Car. 360: "Give it me here," said the little Elf.

Tie. P, 411: so dick und breit sie ist, so behende kann sie sich doch noch bewegen, obgleich sie schon sechzig zählt.

Car. 379: "See how nimbly she can move, with all her breadth and weight, and reckoning sixty by this time of the day."

[/Ordinarily one does not speak of what a person's age is at a certain time of the day./]

Hof. G P, 208: Morgen ist er gewiss sanftmütig.

Car. 44: Tomorrow, you shall see, he is as mild as a lamb again.

[/The idea of meekness can be grasped, as in the German, without suggesting that it is the quality of the lamb./]

Hof. G P, 238: Herr Studiosus, Herr Studiosus, eilen Sie nicht so--kucken Sie nicht so in die Wolken--Sie könnten auf die Nase fallen.

Car. 78: "Herr Studiosus, Herr Studiosus, don't be in such a hurry! Don't peep into the clouds so! They may fall about your ears.

[The instructor of Studiosus was warning him not to look up while running so that he might not fall. One can think of no good reason for Carlyle's writing of clouds falling about the ears.]

Hof. S P, 248: Sie nehmen vorlieb bei mir mit einer Suppe, und nachher bereitet uns Veronika einen köstlichen Kaffee.

Car. 89: You will put up with a bad dinner; then Veronica will make us delightful coffee.

Ric. A S J, 229: "Man sollte das so arme Schaf mit keinem Geister-Spuk foppen, der Hase kann ja auf der Stelle auf dem Platze bleiben."

Car. 152: "One should not bamboozle the poor sheep, man, with any ghost-tricks; the hen-heart may die on the spot."

Ric. Q F, 67: Gleichwohl trat er mit Ehrfurcht in das Haus seines alten, mehr grau-als kahlköpfigen Lehrers, der nicht nur die Tugend selber war, sondern auch der Hunger; denn er ass mehr als der Höchstseelige König.

Car. 204: Yet it was not without reverence that he entered the dwelling of his old, rather grey than bald-headed teacher, who was not only Virtue itself, but also Hunger, eating frequently and with the appetite of Pharaoh's lean kine.

Ric. Q F, 129: der amthierende Schuldiener

Car. 274: the scholastic cocker

[Just because earlier in the story the students had on one occasion been called "cockerels," Carlyle appears to take the liberty to call the teacher in charge a "cock," or a "cocker," as he puts it.]

Ric. Q F, 159: dem Religions und Tilgungsfond des Gotteskastens beispringen wollen zum Kauf des neuen Thurmglobus.

Car. 306: the sinking or rather rising fund of the church-box for the purchase of the new steeple-globe.

[Since a fund is to be gathered for the purchase of a new globe which is to be raised to the top of the steeple after the old ball is taken down, Carlyle pleases to call it a "rising fund."]]

Ric. Q F, 164: eine Baureda

Car. 312: a Topstone-speech

[A speech of this nature is usually given on the occasion of laying a corner-stone. Since the speech here is to be made on the occasion of raising a ball to the top of the steeple Carlyle takes the opportunity to name it more appropriately.]

Ric. Q F, 175: Ich meines Orts ging blos hinauf zu ihm und befragte ihn: "ob er toll wäre--"

Car. 323: I for my own part simply went up to the bedside, and asked him: "If he was cracked--"

(7) Occasional Faults in Rendering Metre and Meaning

It has often been pointed out that Carlyle was not altogether successful in his translation of poetry.¹ Referring to his rendering of the lyrics in Wilhelm Meister (1824) Olga Marx writes, "While he caught the swing, the spirit often eluded him." She continues: "His translations, where they are most accurate, are uninspired. Occasionally there are good lines, at times a good stanza, but for the most part his verse-translations strike one as dull and

¹ H. D. Traill makes the following comment on Carlyle's weakness in verse-making and gives a translated line from Carlyle's Schiller to illustrate his point: "It is, of course, pretty well known to every one acquainted with Carlyle's few attempts at original verse-making that his ear for metre was singularly bad; but how bad it was, can, I think, have been realized by no one who has not made a special study of these translations from Wallenstein and of which no fewer than nine refuse to scan after any amount of negotiation: and such amazing attempts at a decasyllable as

That I never had been born. No more.

and

Of light dust. Thus man comes to an end abound.

"More distracted prosody was never heard by the ear or tested on the fingers."--Traill, H. D. Introduction to Carlyle's Life of Schiller, p. viii.

artificial."¹ With some exceptions, one may make a similar statement about his translation of the verse appearing in the German romances. One has a feeling that he may have translated it merely because it stood in his way rather than because of any particular relish he had for it. This feeling grows when one finds that occasionally he dealt somewhat playfully with the poems, changing the metre from four to five feet in one, for example, and changing the stanza from four to five lines in another.

That Carlyle could translate poetry accurately when he chose to do so is evident from the following passage, in which the German is rendered exceptionally well, and in which the catchy, rhythmic swing, the rhyme, and the metre of the original are reproduced with surprising faithfulness:

Fou. A K, 6:

Sie reiten und suchen durch Thal und Höhn
 Nach einem Feinsliebchen wunderschön;
 Durch Stadt und Burg sie halten die Fahrt,
 Zu suchen ein Liebchen wunderzart;
 Sie forschen, wo nie ein Steig hin trug,
 Zu suchen ein Liebchen wunderklug:--
 Ach reitet, Ihr Ritter, ihr findet's nicht,
 Ich hab' es gefunden im Sangeslicht,
 Ich hab es gefunden, zart, klug und schön
 Ich will es durch mutige That erhöh'n.
 Und sah ich's im Leben auch nimmerdar,
 So wird mir im Tode sein Antlitz klar,
 Und wohnt es nicht mehr auf dem Erdenrund,
 So schliessen wir drunten den süssen Bund.
 Gute Nacht, liebe Welt! Süsse Lieb, guten Tag.
 Wir finden, wer treulich nur suchen mag.

¹ Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 47.

Car. 216:

They ride and they seek with toil and care,
 To find a heart's mistress passing fair;
 Through tower and through town they ride and seek
 To find a heart's mistress passing meek;
 Where rivers are rolling and mountains rise,
 To find a heart's mistress passing wise;
 Ah, Knights! ye may seek, and seek full long,
 'Tis I have found her in Realms of Song!
 I've found her, this mistress, wise, fair, and meek;
 How hearts can adore, my sword shall speak;
 And should I not see her while toiling here,
 O, yonder her form is light and clear;
 And dwells she not down in Earth, this love,
 Our spirits are one in lands Above.
 Good-night, thou old world!—Sweet love, 'tis past!
 Who seeketh in faith, will find at last.

In the following passages Carlyle has combined the first two lines into one, and has changed the rhyme scheme from ab ab cc to ab abb. The iambic measure, however, is retained. On the whole, the substance is correctly, although somewhat freely, given. "So fromm und mild" in the second stanza has been somewhat too freely rendered in "Come out so frank and free."

Fou. A K, 28:

Ach wär ich nur
 Ein Vögelein!
 Das darf die Flur
 Durchklingen fein
 Gar mannigfalt
 Mit Allem, mit Allem, was in ihm schallt!

Ach möcht ich blühh
 Als Blume rein
 Die darf das Grün
 Durchhauchen fein
 So fromm und mild
 Mit Allem, mit Allem, was in dir quillt!

So bin ich nur
 Ein Rittersmann,
 Auf hoher Spur

In Act und Bann,
Und nehm hinab
Mein Alles, mein Alles versummt ins Grab.--

Car. 225:

Ah were I but a little bird,
To sing from tree to tree;
And telling no one e'er a word,
Come out so frank and free
With all, O with all that dwelt in me!

Ah were I but a little flower,
To bloom on grassy lea:
With my sweet perfumes every hour,
Come out so frank and free
With all, O with all that dwelt in me!

Ah I am but an armed Knight
Bound over land and sea;
Must shut my heart in rest and fight;
And laid in grave shall be
My all, O my all that dwells in me!

The selections given below, taken from a long poem, indicate that Roscoe, who also translated some of Tieck's works early in the nineteenth century, did the task to a degree better than did Carlyle. As regards the metrical aspect of the translation Carlyle did well, but he did not always render the substance as accurately as did Roscoe.¹

(1)

Tie. T E, 172 ff: Er sprach: mich schlägt der Feind
Mein Mut ist mir entwichen,
Die Freunde sind erblichen,
Die Knecht' geflohen seind!

Ros. 53 ff: He spoke: "I'm struck! I bleed!
Where is my valor fled?
Friends fail me at my need.
My knights are flown and dead.

Car. 288 ff: He said: the foe prevailleth,

¹ Roscoe, Thomas. The German Novelists, London, 1826.

My friends and followers fly,
My striving naught availeth,
My spirits sink and die.

(2)

Tie. T E, 172 ff: So klagt der von Burgund,
Will sein Schwert in sich stecken:
Da kommt zur selben Stund
Eckart, den Feind zu brechen.

Ros. 53 ff: With that he raised his sword,
And would have smote his breast;
When, truer than his word,
Good Eckart forward prest----

Car. 288 ff: Thus Burgundy so bitter,
Has at his breast his sword;
When, see, breaks-in the Ritter
Eckhart, to save his Lord!

(3)

Tie. T E, 172 ff: Geharnischt reit't der Degen
Keck in den Feind hinein,
Ihm folgt die Schar verwegen
Und auch der Sohne sein.

Ros. 53 ff: Back spurn'd the vaunting foe,
And dashed into the throng;
Nor was his bold son slow,
To bring his knights along.

Car. 288 ff: With cap and armour glancing
Bold on the foe he rides,
His troops behind him prancing,
And his two sons besides.

(4)

Tie. T E, 172 ff: Als nun der Feind bezwungen,
Da sprach der Herzog laut:
Es ist dir wohl gelungen,
Doch so, dass es mir graut.

Ros. 53 ff: When now the foe was fled,
Out spoke the Duke aloud;
"Well hath it with me sped,
Yet Eckart's head is bowed.

Car. 288 ff: And when the fight was ended,
Then Burgundy he speaks:

The following are excerpts showing a definite failure to reproduce the thought of the original:

- Tie. T E, 196: Ein wüſtes Heer von Zwergen
Sie nahen grauerlich.
Car. 305: Of dwarfs a boundless tissue
Come simmering round in swarms.
- Tie. T E, 198: Die Zwerge niedersinken
Zu Haufen dort im Thal
Car. 306: The Dwarfs, with wailing bitter,
And howls depart away.

In translating another poem of Tieck's, Carlyle has tried his hand at rendering the five line stanza of the original in a four line stanza. The comparative failure of the attempt is obvious, resulting as it has done in the omission of some among the more delicate and significant shades of meaning. This is particularly noticeable in the last of the three stanzas.

- Tie. R, 214: Froh und lustig zwischen Steinen
Geht der Jüngling auf die Jagd,
Seine Beute muss erscheinen
In den grünlebensgen Hainen,
Sucht er auch bis in die Nacht.
- Car. 319: Blithe and cheery through the mountains
Goes the huntsman to the chase,
By the lonesome shady fountains,
Till he finds the red-deer's trace.
- Tie. R, 214: Seine Heimat sind die Klüfte
Alle Bäume grüssen ihn,
Rauschen strenge Herbsteslüfte
Find't er Hirsch und Reh, die Schlüfte¹
Muss er jauchzend dann durchziehn.
- Car. 319: In some dell, when luck hath blessed him
And his shot hath stretched the deer,

¹ Schluff (mhd sluft, zu schliefen.)--Schlucht.--
Muret-Sanders Wörterbuch, Teil II, p. 1763.

lies he down, content, to rest him,
While the brooks are murmuring clear

Tie. R, 240: Liebe kommt zum Menschenherzen,
Regt die goldnen Saitenspiele,
Und die Seele spricht: ich fühle
Was das Schönste sei, wonach ich ziele,
Wehmuth, Sehnsucht, und der Liebe Schmerzen.

Car. 339: Love comes to us here below,
Discord harsh away removing;
And the heart cries: Now I know
Sadness, Fondness, Pain and Loving.

CHAPTER VI

Faults Which May be More or Less Justified

1. Additions: Appositives, Explanatory Terms in Compounds, Antecedents, and Minor Additions.
2. Alterations: Condensations and Softenings.
3. Omissions.
4. Failure to Render Certain Words and Phrases Accurately.
5. Occasional Literalness for the Purpose of Showing German Idiom.

CHAPTER VI

Faults Which May be More or Less Justified

In addition to the numerous flaws, often inexcusable, in Carlyle's translation of German Romance, there are others which deserve to be excused or even approved. Tested by the standards of correct translation, many passages reveal distinct flaws, but when considered from Carlyle's point of view they should be called apparent rather than real faults. Carlyle said that to alter was not his commission. Critic that he was, however, and well-wisher of the public for which he wrote, he felt that the rigid rule of the translator should not stand in the way of his performing a little literary surgery in the interests of art and morality. Whether, therefore, one approves of renditions which were from Carlyle's point of view fully warranted, even though not strictly "faithful," he can at least understand why they were allowed to appear in German Romance.

These excusable faults are of several types. First to be noted are various additions which Carlyle found it necessary to make. The purpose of these was generally to aid in the interpretation of certain terms difficult to render into English, or to give necessary emphasis to words and phrases which, translated literally, are weaker

in English than in German. Many of these additions are in reality not in the form of new material; they are merely renditions of the German, French, or Latin of the original into English. Second, there are occasional skilful softenings of the meaning of the original, designed to spare the feelings of the English public. Carlyle well knew that his readers would not tolerate much of the coarse material in the German romances if translated literally. Third, for this same reason he made a number of omissions. Occasionally the entire substance of a passage in the original was so indelicate that any attempt at softening would have been futile; in such instances Carlyle wisely omitted the passage entirely. Omissions of this kind, as well as the softenings referred to earlier, became necessary most frequently in the translations of the stories of Musaeus, Hoffmann, and particularly Richter; Fouqué, Tieck, and Goethe ("Travels")--excepting a few lyrics and ballads omitted for no obvious reason--required little, if any, change of this kind. Fourth, however, there are flaws which concern themselves primarily with idiom. In the original matter, appear occasional idiomatic words and phrases fraught with subtle force and peculiar shades of meaning. Carlyle did not render some of these into English with the same force and implication which they had in the original for the simple reason that no corresponding word or phrase with equal force existed

in English. "Such words," says Postgate, "whatever their grammatical category, are strictly untranslatable."¹

Fifth, Carlyle in his eagerness to give the English public an acquaintance not only with German literature but also with the German language, seems deliberately to have executed a number of literal translations to illustrate the German mode of expression. No other plausible explanation can be offered for certain awkward translations appearing in German Romance. Facility with a rich English vocabulary, as is evidenced by his elegant style, is sufficient proof that Carlyle was not constrained to resort to any ungraceful employment of his native tongue. Passages illustrating each of the enumerated types follow. Some groups of these are preceded by a brief explanatory introduction. Wherever comments are made in connection with any single passage, they will, as in Chapter V, appear in brackets.

Olga Marx, in referring to Carlyle's additions in the translation of Wilhelm Meister, says that these additions were made chiefly for two well intended purposes: "to elucidate the meaning, which may be quite clear in the original but obscure in a precise translation," and "to emphasize a given expression, which would otherwise ring flat in the rendering."² She goes on to say, however:

¹ Postgate, J. P., op. cit., p. 42.

² "In prose translations legitimate additions are generally made for two reasons: to elucidate the meaning,

"An addition is valuable only insofar as it actually adds something to the clearness and beauty of the text. Carlyle's additions add little or nothing, detract occasionally and are, on the whole, superfluous." This may hold true for the translation of Wilhelm Meister; it does not hold for German Romance. In this later body of translation additions are, on the whole, definitely helpful. To be sure, the majority of them are, strictly speaking, not additions at all. They amount merely to an attempt on Carlyle's part to secure verisimilitude by keeping the actual German in the case of proper nouns, or nouns it pleases him to treat as such, and clearness for his readers, by rendering the originals into English. The following examples of additions in German Romance may, therefore, be considered excusable:

Mus. M, 269: Darin kamen alle überein, dass er pro mortuo zu achten sei.

Car. 151: In this one point all agreed: That he was to be held pro mortuo, dead in law.

[In this case the addition is merely an attempt to render the Latin.]

Mus. M, 332: "Da kommt der Störenfried, und will mein Haus verwirren! Wo du dich nicht stehenden Fusses fortpackst, soll dich der Magistrat stöcken und pflöcken

which may be quite clear in the original but obscure in a precise translation, or to emphasize a given expression, which would otherwise ring flat in the rendering. Almost all of Carlyle's additions fall under these headings, but there are times, when his imagination extends an image and introduces an adjective, or when he perverts the meaning of Goethe's text perhaps unconsciously, in accordance with his characteristic ideas."--Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 43.

und an den Pranger stellen lassen, zum Exempel aller solcher Irrläufer, die ihre Weiber bösllich verlassen."

Car. 203: And now comes the Marpeace to perplex my house! Off with thee! Pack, I say, this instant, or the Amtmann shall crop thy ears, and put thee in the pillory, to teach such vagabonds, that run and leave their poor tender wives.

Here Carlyle, oddly enough, substitutes the German word for the very suitable English "Magistrate." "To teach such vagabonds" is a loose translation; "poor tender" is an addition.

Hof. G P, 190: Am Himmelfahrtstage, Nachmittags um drei Uhr, rannte ein junger Mensch in Dresden durchs schwarze Thor.

Car. 23: On Ascension-day, about three o'clock in the afternoon, there came a young man running through the Schwarzthor, or Black Gate, out of Dresden.

Here, and in most of the passages following, Carlyle retains the German word, then adds the English rendering of it.

Hof. G P, 191: da setzte er sich hin und stopfte eine Pfeife von dem Sanitätsknaster.

Car. 25: Here he sat down, and filled a pipe from the Sanitätsknaster, or Health-tobacco-box.

Hof. G P, 201: Er bezahlt ausser dem freien Tisch während der Arbeit jeden Tag einen Speciethaler.

Car. 36: he pays his man a speciethaler, or specie-dollar, daily,

Hof. G P, 203: auf den letzten die Luft mit mächtigem Klange durchbebenden Schlag der Thurm-Uhr an der Kreuzkirche.

Car. 37: the last stroke tingled through the air with loud clang from the steeple-clock of the Kreuzkirche, or Cross-church.

Hof. G P, 216: Sie war Frau Hofrätin.

Car. 53: She was Mrs. Hofrath, Frau Hofrätin.

Ric. Q F, 62: Verschnitt sie nicht einmal ihren Kirmesskuchen an zwei Bettelstudenten . . . ?

Car. 199: Nay, did she not once divide her solitary Kirmes (or Church-dale) cake between two mendicant students?

Ric. Q F, 90: So könnte mit einer Kammerrathsstelle die Tugend der Unterthanenliebe schön als Titel verknüpft werden.

Car. 230: Thus with the appointment of a Kammerrath,

or Councillor of Revenue, the virtue of Patriotism might fitly be conjoined.

Ric. Q F, 128: Der Gerichtshalter hingegen verfocht, es ist zweierlei, und liess es seinen Parteien unverholen, dass der Tagefahrt Termin bedeute und Appellieren Berufen.

Car. 272: The Lawyer, on the other hand, contended that it was different; and accordingly he hid not from any of his clients that Tagefarth (Day-turn) meant Term, and that Appealing was Berufen (Bealling).

One of the chief difficulties which confronted Carlyle in translating the German romances was the rendering of compounds. This fact has already become obvious in the passages just given. The German habit of creating new words out of its own resources as necessity arises is largely absent in the English. Most of the compounds appearing in the German romances Carlyle translated as nearly as he could into corresponding English; many of them, however, he left in the original German and transferred them bodily into the English. Frequently he added an English word or phrase rendering approximately or explaining the German. In following this procedure Carlyle was attempting, no doubt, to make the meaning clear and at the same time be as faithful to his original as possible. Following are illustrations of renditions in which the additions occur chiefly in connection with compounds:

Mus. D L, 194: Denn der Landfriede, den Kaiser Maximilian hatte ausrufen lassen.

Car. 44: for the Land-fried (or Act for suppressing Private Wars), which the Emperor Maximilian had proclaimed.

Mus. M, 262: davon der Mäusethurm im Rhein, laut Hübner, kundig Zeugnis gibt.

Car. 146: as the Mäusethurm, or Mouse-tower, on the Rhine, by Hübner's account gives open testimony.

Mus. M, 327: in einer lustigen Aue, welche . . . das Freudenthal heisst.

Car. 199: a pleasant green which . . . is called the Freudenthal, or Valley of Joy.

Ric. A S J, 218: Der Schwanzschleuderer.

Car. 142: The Schwanzschleuderer, or Train-dasher.

Mus. M, 264: denn er wusste das ihm zugeteilte Wildpret nicht so niedlich zuzurichten, als vordem sein Mundkoch.

Car. 148: for in reading the game handed in to him, he by no means recalled his Brunswick cook.

Tie. E, 374: unser Metallfürst.

Car. 350: Our Metal-Prince.

Ric. A S J, 210: Bayreuth, im Heu-und-Friedens-Monat, 1807.

Car. 133: Bayreuth, in the Hay and Peace Month, 1807.

Ric. A S J, 234: Diess liess mich hoffen, dass mich dort ein kleines Sarg-Kunstwerk, ein Ehren-Pfahl, irgend ein Treff-Zier- und Spiess-Dank für einen Todten erwarte.

Car. 158: This gave me hopes that perhaps some little monumental piece, some pillar of honour, some little memento, might here be awaiting me.

[Here Carlyle attempted free rendering and omission rather than any faithful translating of each compound.]

Ric. A S J, 252: Als ich an den Bettpfosten gut angebunden, und endlich unter die Bettdecke gekommen war: wurde ich wegen meines Pontaks Feuertaufe aufs Neue bedenklich und furchtsam vor meinen zu erwartenden Kraft- und Sturm-Träumen welche leider nachher auch nichts bessers wurden, als Helden- und Potentaten-Thaten, Festungs-Stürme, Felsen-Würfe:--

Car. 176: Having properly tied myself to the bed-posts, and at length got under the coverlid, I now began to be dubious about my Pontac Fire-bath, and apprehensive of the valorous and tumultuous dreams too likely to ensue; which, alas, did actually prove to be nothing better than heroic and monarchic feats, castle-stormings, rock-throwings, and the like.

[An instance in which Carlyle took care of each of the compounds in the series and added a phrase, in this instance "and the like," to suggest inclusiveness.]

Ric. A S J, 259: Gott soll mich strafen, wenn ich nicht noch in den Hundstagen alles werde, was du nur willst --Sprich, willst du Bergräthin werden, oder Bauräthin, oder

Hofrätin, Kriegerätin, Kammerrätin, Kommerzienrätin, Legationsrätin, oder des Henkers- und Teufels-Rätin:
ich bin dabei und werd' es und such' an.

Car. 182: May I die, if yet in these dog-days I become not all and everything that thou wishest! Speak, wilt thou be Mining-rätin, Build-rätin, Court-rätin, War-rätin, Chamber-rätin, Commerce-rätin, Legations-rätin, or Devil and his Dam's rätin: I am here and will buy it, and be it.

Ric. Q F, 88: Ich sorge im Ganzen, die Akademien-Produkten-Verschleiss-Kommission des Staats betreibe den Aemterhandel Schlaff.

Car. 228: My chief anxiety is lest the Academy-product-sale-Commission of the State carry on its office-trade too slackly.

Ric. Q F, 146: die Kunst-Gärtnerin.

Car. 292: The gardeneress.

It is characteristic of German writing, particularly in sentences into which many subordinate elements are woven, that the pronoun is frequently far removed from the substantive to which it refers. Unless one knows German well, he will experience difficulty in following the meaning in a sentence so constructed. Carlyle's occasional repetition of the antecedent in a subsequent sentence is appreciably beneficial in making the meaning clear. In the first of the following passages a pronoun refers back to a noun; in the second, a verb refers back to an act:

Mus. M, 296: Man muss es dieser Erfindung lassen, dass es keine kompendiosere Liebeserklärung gibt als diese, die wohl wert wäre, von den Abendländern nach geahmet zu werden

Car. 174: To this invention it must be conceded, that there cannot be a more compendious method of proceeding in the business than this of the Mushirumi, which might well deserve the imitation of our Western lovers.

Ric. A S J, 219: Er that die lustige Frage: warum ich nicht voltigiert hätte, ob er gleich recht gut

weiss, dass dazu ein hölzerner Gaul gehört, der steht--

Car. 143: He put the pleasant question: Why I had not vaulted, and come off by ground-and-lofty tumbling, though he knew full well that for this a wooden-horse which stands still, is requisite.

[The "voltigiert" here refers to the springing from the back of a runaway horse. Carlyle must have felt that "vaulted" alone would not convey sufficient clearness in meaning.]

Occasionally Carlyle employed substitution rather than make an addition or insert any explanatory elements.

Examples:

Mus. M, 258: wo der Held Achill mit seiner Bundesbrüderschaft so lange um ein Freudenmädchen maulte.

Car. 143: where the godlike Achilles, with his confederates, moped so long about his fair Briseis.

Tie. F E, 166: der Fremde erzeugte Eckbert alle möglichen Gefälligkeiten.

Car. 284: Hugo showed his friend all possible attentions.

Ric A S J, 211: Gute Fürsten bekommen leicht gute Unterthanen (nicht so leicht diese jene)

Car. 135: Good princes easily obtain good subjects; not so easily good subjects good princes.

Aside from additions which can, to a degree, be classified, there occur frequent other and minor additions which hardly belong to any class and whose function is chiefly explanatory. Following are a few illustrations:

Mus. M, 302: In dieser Situation machte er für einen erhörten Liebhaber nun eben nicht die imposanteste Figur.

Car. 178: In this predicament, he certainly, for an accepted wooer, did not make the most imposing figure in the world;

Mus. M, 315: Er schwur beim Barte des Propheten dem ganzen Serail den Untergang.

Car. 189: He swore by the Prophet's beard that he would utterly destroy every living Soul in the Seraglio.

[The added element is strictly for force. It is a

a free paraphrase rather than explanation.]

Tie. F E, 150: nur eines Menschen ansichtig zuwerden.

Car. 273: to see one human creature, any living mortal.

Tie. G, 409: Vierzig Jahre sind seitdem verschwunden, seufzte er.

Car. 377: "Forty years have vanished," sighed he, "since that afternoon."

Hof. 234: Sie vernahm wohl, wie es um sie her heulte und brauste, wie allerlei widrige Stimmen durch einander blöckten und schnatterten.

Car. 74: She heard, indeed, what howling and raging there was around her; how all sorts of hateful voices bellowed and bleated, and yelled and hummed.

Hof. 235: Aber sage mir nur Schwester, was Dir ist.

Car. 75: "But tell me then, sister, what in all the world ails thee?"

Ric. A S J, 218: Jetzt kam den Faulpelzen ein hartmäuliges schrittlings ausziehendes Pferd lächerlich vor.

Car. 142: But now, to these noodles the sight of a hard-mouthed horse going off with its rider step by step, seemed ridiculous rather than otherwise.

Ric. Q F, 148: Da er noch ein wenig Zeit bis zur Dämmerung hatte, so setzte er das Arbeitszeug an sein neues belehrtes Opus an.

Car. 294: As there still remained a little space till dusk, he clapped his tackle to his new learned Opus, of which I must now afford a little glimpse.

[Carlyle adds a phrase for the purpose of connecting the material logically with what follows.]

(2) Alterations: Condensations and Softenings

Occasionally, there are sentences in the original unnecessarily repetitious and elaborately involved. Carlyle wisely condenses these with practically no loss of the thought. There are sentences, too, treating frankly of sex relations or matters of religion which Carlyle knew would be unwelcome in England; that he softened these is quite under-

standable, and hardly to be counted as a fault. Passages illustrating both of these types of alterations follow:

Mus. L, 181: Und der über die Fruchtbarkeit seiner anderen Hälfte entzückte Vater nannte bei der ersten Umarmung die, welche früher als die beiden Zwillingsschwestern seine vier Wände beschrie, Bela, die nachgeborene Therba und die jüngstgeborene Libussa.

Car. 92: and the father, rejoicing in the bounty of his better half, named, at the first embrace, the eldest infant, Bela; the next born, Therbe; and the youngest, Libussa.

Mus. I, 229: Ob nun wohl der gemeinste Rechenmeister, der seiner Kunst nur um ein Haar breit kundiger gewesen wär als die unbelehrte K--lenberger Rechengilde, die Aufgabe ohne Mühe würde entziffert haben: so ist für einen schlechten Rechner die Gabe der Divination doch unumgänglich erforderlich.

Car. 132: Though, in our days, any man endowed with the arithmetical faculty of a tapster, might have solved this problem without difficulty, yet for an untaught computant, the gift of divination was essential.

[Here material is translated freely, is condensed, and, in part, also omitted; the local hit at the Kellenberger will hardly interest English readers.]

Mus. M, 291: "Wo anders," antwortete er nach seiner handfesten Art, "als in den Klauen des jüdischen Quacksalters, der ihm ohne Verzug die Seele wird ausschwitzen lassen?" Darüber erschrack die reizvolle Tochter des Soldans also, dass ihr angst und wehe ums Herz ward.

Car. 169: "Where else," said he, in his sturdy way, "but in the hands of the Jewish quack-salver, who will sweat the soul from his body in a trice?" These tidings cut the lovely Princess to the heart.

Ric. A S J, 208: zumal da wir jetzt wie Türken bloss mit Beuteln rechnen und zahlen (der Inhalt ist heraus) und und mit Herz-Beuteln (der Inhalt ist darin)

Car. 131: when, like the Turks, we count and pay merely with sealed purses, and the coin within them has vanished?

Ric. Q F, 64: Stand nicht neben ihm der Orgelstuhl als der Thron, auf den ihn allemal an Aposteltagen der Schulmeister durch drei Winke gesetzt hatte, damit er durch ein plätscherndes Murki den Kirchensprengel tanzend die Treppen nieder führte?

Car. 200: Stood there not close by him the organ-stool, the throne to which, every Apostle-day, the

Schoolmaster had by three nods elevated him, thence to fetch, down the sacred hyssop, the sprinkler of the Church?

Mus. L, 185: wie junge Gesellen pflegen, die sich bei den Vätern so gern ein Gewerbe machen, wenn sie die Töchter beschleichen wollen.

Car. 95: as is the mode with young men, who delight to have some business with the master of the household, when his daughters are beautiful.

Mus. L, 218: Es gibt keinen artigern Zeitvertreib für ein engbeschuhtes Mädchen, wenn sie sich eben die Leichdorn beschneidet, als an eine stattliche und bequeme Equipage zu denken.

Car. 122: There is no more pleasing pastime for a strait-shod-maiden, when hergalled corns are resting from the toils of the pavement, than to think of a stately and commodious equipage.

Mus. M. 324: dass er die Unmöglichkeit vor Augen sahe, der Prinzessin Wort zu halten und mit ihr das Ehebett zu beschreiten.

Car. 196: now that he saw the visible impossibility of ever keeping his word to the Princess, and taking her in wedlock.

Mus. M. 307: so hat die Zeit ihren Gram überwältiget; sie hat Eurer vergessen und erwarmet in dem Bette eines andern.

Car. 183: Time has overpowered her sorrow, and she is happy by the side of another.

Tie T E, 210: und die holdseligsten Gestalten gaukelten dann in der Luft, ein Gewimmel von nackten Mädchen umgab mich einladend.

Car. 316: and beauteous forms sported in the air and soft eyes invited me.

Tie. R, 244: Sie wusste nicht, was sie im Erschrecken und tiefsten Mitleiden sagen sollte, Er fiel ihr um den Hals, und küsste sie. Elizabeth rief aus: O Gott! mein Mann kommt!

Car. 342: She knew not, in her horror and deepest compassion, what to say. He fell upon her neck and kissed her. Elizabeth exclaimed: "O Heaven! My husband is coming!"

Hof. G P, 200: das ist aber körperliche Krankheit, und es helfen Blutigel, die man, salva venia, dem Hintern appliziert, wie ein berühmter bereits verstorbner Gelehrter bewiesen.

Car. 342: but this is a bodily disease and leeches are good for it, if applied to the right part, as a certain learned physician, now deceased, has directed."

Hof. G P, 223: und ich will Dir mit allen Kräften beistehen, dass Du recht glücklich werden und fein ins Ehebett kommen sollst, wie Du es wünschest.

Car. 60: I will help thee with all my strength, that so thou mayest be happy, and wed him like a pretty bride, as thou wishest.

Hof. G P, 225: Wollen Sie eins mit uns flappern, wie die Grossmutter das Ei mit dem Steiss zerdrückte?

Car. 63: Will you chat with us for a minute, how grand-mammy eat squelching down upon the egg.

Hof. G P, 256: "Höhne und spotte nur, Du verdammtes Hexenweib."

Car. 98: "Mock and jeer me, do, thou cursed witch!"

Ric. A S J, 213: Habe ich nicht mich beschneiden und doch als Jude mit zahlen lassen, und mit Schinken bewirthen.

Car. 137: Did I not once submit to be made a Jew of, and then be regaled with hams.

Ric. A S J, 235: Uebrigens hatt' ich fast auf der ganzen Stazion leichte Händel mit dem Postillon, weil er nicht von Viertelstunde zu Viertelstunde halten wollte, wenn ich ausstieg um zu pissen. Leider sind freilich von Postknechten keine Urinpropheten zu erwarten, da so selten Gelehrte aus Hallers grosser Physiologie es wissen, dass Aufschieben der gedachten Sache teuflisches Steingut niederschlägt

Car. 159: For the rest, throughout the whole stage, I had a constant source of altercation with the coachman, because he grudged stopping perhaps once in the quarter of an hour, when I chose to come out for a natural purpose. Unhappily, in truth, one has little reason to expect water-doctors among the postillion class, since Physicians themselves have so seldom learned from Haller's large Physiology, that a postponement of the above operation, will precipitate devilish stoneware.

Ric. A S J, 247: Schwangere mögen bei Schrecken an den Hintern greifen, um das Muttermal des Versehens dorthin zu verstecken; ich griff bei dem Muthe ans Herz, und sagte: "schlage dich nur tapfer durch! wer auch dabei geschlagen werde!"

Car. 171: Let henhearts cackle and pip; I flapped my pinions and said: "Dash boldly through it, come what may!"

[In this case Carlyle not only softened but also condensed and altered.]

Ric. Q F, 85: Der freudige Narr hatte unter dem Schreiben den Kopf geschaukelt, die Hände gerieben, mit dem

Steisse gehüpft, das Gesicht gebohnt, und am Zopfe gesogen.

Car. 224: The happy fool, while writing, had shaken his head, rubbed his hands, hitched about on his chair, puckered his face, and sucked the end of his cue.

Ric. Q F, 100: es sei erlogen und erstunken.

Car. 241: it was falsehood and cozenage.

Very rarely Carlyle appeared to be off his guard.

The following passages, though not, of course, strictly in point in this chapter, it may nevertheless be in order to note here:

Tie. R, 223: Er wagte kaum zu athmen, als sie nach und nach alle Hüllen löste; nackt schritt sie endlich im Saale auf und nieder und ihre schweren schwebenden Locken bildeten um sie her ein dunkel wogendes Meer, aus dem wie Marmor die glänzenden Formen des Reinen Leibes abwechselnd hervor strahlten.

Car. 326: He scarcely dared to breathe, as by degrees she laid aside her other garments; at last she walked about the chamber naked; and her heavy waving locks formed around her, as it were, a dark billowy sea, out of which like marble, the glancing limbs of her form beamed forth, in alternating splendour.

Ric. A S J, 224: Neben mir sass eine höchst wahrscheinliche Hure--auf ihrem Schosse ein Zwerg, der sich auf dem Jahrmarkte wollte sehen lassen.

Car. 148: Beside me sat a person who, in all human probability, was a Harlot; on her breast, a dwarf intending to exhibit himself at the Fair.

[Carlyle may have been sleepy, or, at least was off his guard when he translated this passage. Ordinarily he evaded the word "Harlot."]

(3) Omissions

Attention has already been called to the fact that in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century the English mind was rather hostile toward German literature.

Among other reasons, this was due to a certain frankness with

which the Germans wrote of love,¹ to their unrestrained insertion of vulgarities and their offending allusions to religious matters--all of which were objectionable to British moral refinement. Because he was aware of "the storm-cloud of literary disapproval that burst upon every infringement of an unwritten code of accepted morals and manners,"² Carlyle thought it advisable, in his translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, to drop several pages "evidently unfit for English taste";³ in rendering the romances he pursued the same policy. In doing so he was following a well-established precedent: other translators, before him, had made expurgations even to a much greater degree than he.⁴ With the exception of some of

¹ "In what nation, for example, but the German, does a daughter address her father as her 'dear little fatherling'? . . . this single instance might suffice to convince us that there is a radical effeminacy in the German mind But the same sort of paralytic weakness runs through the whole of German life. Nowhere is the contemptible puerility so common of forming marriage connections upon the first random impulse of casual desire or momentary fancy. Does a young German dine at a table where there are two or three pretty young women--straightway the coxcomb is 'in love'; he spends the whole night in endeavoring to ascertain which of the three he loves best; and the next morning he waits on papa, flings himself at his feet, draws out a pistol, and swears he will shoot himself unless he consents to bestow upon him in marriage the charming Miss--; and there he pauses to determine with which name he shall fill up the blank."--Blackwood's, XX, 1826, p. 847.

² Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 30.

³ Carlyle, Thomas, Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, Preface to the first edition, p. xvii.

⁴ "Coleridge did not bind himself slavishly to the original text at the cost of his own national and individual feeling. He wished not only to render 'Wallenstein'

the lyrics in Tieck, a form of literature not altogether to Carlyle's liking, the omissions in German Romance are chiefly from Musaeus and Richter. A number of minor ones from Goethe's Travels are insignificant.¹

For most of these omissions no comment is necessary; the reason for the omission is obvious. In the passages from the originals cited below the parts omitted by Carlyle are underlined.

Mus. D L, 203: so erwischen sie aus Reverenz ein Knöchlein von der Schüssel, das ich meinem Hund nicht bät; sprech ich: "Tut Bescheid!" so netzen sie kaum die Lippen aus dem vollen Becher, als wenn sie Gottes Gabe verschmäheten; lassen sich zu jedem Dinge lange nötigen, tät schier Not auch zum Stuhlgang.

Car. 51: out of reverence, they pick you a fraction from the plate which I would not offer my dog: if I say, Your health! they scarcely wet their lips from the full cup, as if they set God's gifts at naught.

Mus. D L, 217: und durch eine schnelle Kombination der Ideen riet er darauf, dass er vielleicht den nählichen Dienst von ihm erwarte, den es ihm vorher geleistet habe, und er trafs damit glücklicher, als weiland Geisterseher Oeder, der das renommierte Braunschweiger Gespenst inquirierte, wie ein Amtmann den Delinquenten, ohne dass er es zum Geständnis brachte, was es eigentlich mit seiner frivolen Erscheinung wolle.

Car. 63: and a rapid combination of ideas suggested, that he was expecting the very service he himself had just

conscientiously into English words, but to suit also the drama itself to its English form. He kept carefully in mind the manners of his own country, left out formal compliments, turned kisses into embraces, and embraces into shakes of the hand."--Brandl, Alois. Samuel Taylor Coleridge and the English Romantic School, London, 1887, p. 261.

¹ "The numerous brief omissions in the Travels are of a different character from those in the Apprenticeship. For the most part they are so trivial as to appear unintentional."--Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 37.

performed.

[The allusion here is to an incident, either fact or fiction, obviously not known to English readers; the omission, therefore, is for Carlyle's purpose, well-advised.]

Mus. M, 329: Wer für fünfzig Guineen die teure Wol-lust erkaufte hat, eine Nacht in Doktor Grahams himmlischem Bette in London zu rasten, nur der kann sich das Entzücken träumen, welches Graf Ernst von Gleichen empfand, als die dreischläfrige Bettspende ihren elastischen Rumpf eröffnete, den Verlobten zweier Geliebten nebst seinem Komitat aufzunehmen. Nach so vielen kummervollen Nächten drückte ein bescheidner Schlummer der Gräfin Ottilia an der Seite ihres wiedergefundenen Eheherrn bald die Augen zu und verstattete ihm die unbeschränkte Freiheit, mit der zärtlichen Angelika nach aller Bequemlichkeit den Endreim auf Muschirumi zu suchen.

Car. If any of my readers ever purchased for himself, for fifty guineas, the costly pleasure of resting a night in Doctor Graham's Celestial Bed at London, he may form some slender conception of the Count's delight, when the triple bed at Gleichen opened its elastic bosom to receive the twice-betrothed with both his spouses.

Ric. A S J, 252: Medizinräthe und ihre Kunde strecken sich alle ruhig in ihren Betten aus, ohne dass nur einer von ihnen befürchtet oder untersucht, ob ihm ein wüthiger Zorn (zumal wenn er schnell darauf kalt säuft im Traum), oder ein herzerreissender Harm, was er alles in den Träumen erleben kann, am Leben schade oder nicht. Wäre ich, ich bekenn' es, eine Frau, und mithin weiblich furchtsam, zumal in guter Hoffnung, ich würd' in letzter Zeit über die Frucht meines Schosses in Verzweiflung sein, wenn ich schlief und folglich im Traum alle die von medizinischen Polizeien verbotenen Ungeheuer, wilden Bestien, Missgeburten und dergleichen zu Gesicht bekäme, wovon eine ausreicht (sobald die bestätigte Lehre des Versehens wahr bleibt), dass ich Kreisende mit einem elenden Kinde niederkäme, das ganz aussehe, wie ein Hase, und voll Hasenscharten dazu, oder das eine Löwenmähne hinten hätte, oder Teufelsklauen an den Händen, oder was sonst noch Missgeburten an sich haben. Vielleicht wurden manche Missgeburten von solchen Versehen in Träumen gezeugt.

Car. 177: Medical gentlemen, as well as their customers, all stretch themselves quietly in their beds, without one among them considering whether a furious rage (supposing him also directly after to drink cold water in his dream), or a heart-devouring grief, all which he may undergo in vision, does harm to life or not.

Ric. Q F, 62: Und überhaupt trägt der dritte Stand (sie war eine Kunstgärtnerin) allema! wie ein Rebhuhn die

Schalen des Werkeltags-Eies, aus dem er sich hackt, noch unter der Vormittagskirche am Steisse herum.

Car. 198: for indeed she belongs to the Tiers Etat, being neither more nor less than a gardener's widow.

[Aside from the fact that Carlyle omitted a passage here, one wonders why he translated "Kunstgärtnerin" to "gardener's widow." There is nothing in the story which suggests that Fixelin's mother had once been the wife of a gardener.]

Ric. Q F, 128: "Von," diesen Ehrenbogen, durft' er nicht vor Fuchsleins neuen Namen stellen, weils Aufhammer untersagte, der dessen ahnenreine Abkunft anfiel und nicht bedachte, was überhaupt ein Edelmann sich zu getrösten habe, da schon Christus in seinem von Matthaues gefertigten Stammbaum vier bekannte--Huren zählt, die Thamar, Rahab, Bathseba und Ruth.

Car. 272: Von, this triumphal arch he durst not set up before Fuchslein's new name, because Aufhammer forbade it, considering Hanz Fuchslein as a mushroom who had no right to vons and titles of nobility, for all his patents.

[Aside from the omission in this passage, Carlyle also translates a part of it very freely.]

(4) Failure to Render Certain Words and Phrases Accurately

No matter how faithful to his original a translator may set out to be, he will meet certain words, phrases, or epigrammatic expressions peculiar to the language in which they are written--expressions which are generally of a familiar nature, and which occur most commonly in conversation. Such expressions, of course, present a definite problem, having as they do a connotation that it is practically impossible to render. On this point translators and critics, such as Croce, Tolman, Posnett, Tytler, and others are agreed.¹ If the translator finds in his own language an

¹ "Single expressive facts are so many individuals, of which the one cannot be compared with the other, save gen-

erically, in so far as each is expression Impressions, that is to say contents, vary; every content differs from every other content, because nothing in life repeats itself

"A corollary of this is the impossibility of translations, in so far as they pretend to effect the transference of one expression into another, like a liquid poured from a vase of a certain shape into a vase of another shape. We can elaborate logically what we have already elaborated in aesthetic form only; but we cannot reduce that which has already possessed its aesthetic form to another form also aesthetic. In truth, every translation either diminishes and spoils; or it creates a new expression, by putting the former back into the crucible and mixing it with other impressions belonging to the pretended translator

"There are resemblances of expressions such as observed among individuals It is in these resemblances that lies the relative possibility of translations. This does not consist of the reproduction of the same original expressions (which it would be vain to attempt), but, in the measure that expressions are given, more or less nearly resembling those. The translation that passes for good is an approximation which has original value as a work of art and can stand by itself."--Croce, Benedetto. Aesthetic. Translation from the Italian by Douglas Ainslie. London, 1909, p. 111.

"The more one enters into the spirit of the language he is reading, the more he appreciates the responsibility of the translator, and realizes that many times it is impossible to bring over into English the heart of the original construction."--Tolman, H. C., op. cit., p. 20.

"The Aramaic expression for translating (targem, from which our 'dragomen' is descended) conveys the figure of 'throwing a bundle over a river'; and the truth is that in a translation process the bundle never arrives at the other side exactly as it was before starting."--Posnett, Hutcheson M., op. cit., p. 148.

"But this resource, of translating the idiomatic phrase into easy language, must fail, where the merit of the passage to be translated actually lies in that expression which is idiomatic. This will often occur in epigrams, many of which are therefore incapable of translation."--Tytler, A. F., op. cit., p. 148.

De Quincey speaks of the bibliolaters: "They fancy that every idea and word which exists, or has existed, for any nation, ancient or modern, must have a direct interchangeable equivalent in all other languages, and that, if the dictionaries do not show it, that must be because the dictionaries are bad The fact is that all languages

idiomatic phrase corresponding to that of the original, his translation may be "perfect."¹ What course to pursue when such corresponding element does not exist is a matter of dispute: one critic advises the translator "to express the sense in a plain and easy language,"² another says that the translator "must either take over the foreign word or provide a representative by some coinage of his own,"³ a third thinks that a "middle ground" is "absolutely impossible,"⁴ Because of his principle of "fidelity," Carlyle

offer ideas absolutely separate and exclusive to themselves. In the highly cultural languages of England, France, and Germany, are words, by thousands, which are strictly untranslatable."--De Quincey, Thomas. Collected Writings, edited by David Masson. London, 1897, VIII, p. 285.

¹ "The translation is perfect, when the translator finds in his own language an idiomatic phrase corresponding to that of the original."--Tytler, A. F., op. cit., p. 137.

² "A translator will often meet with idiomatic phrases in the original author, to which no corresponding idiom can be found in the language of the translation. As a literal translation of such phrases cannot be tolerated, the only resource is, to express the sense in plain and easy language."--Ibid., p. 147

³ "Many times there will be no correspondence Translators must either take over the foreign word or provide a representative by some coinage of their own. Languages have used both these methods in their borrowings, most preferring to adopt, but German to re-coin. So tricycle French and English from the Greek, Dreirad in German."--Postgate, J. P., op. cit., p. 42.

⁴ "All translation," writes Wilhelm von Humboldt to Wilhelm von Schlegel, the German translator of Shakespeare, "seems to me but an attempt to accomplish what is impossible. Every translator must run shipwreck on one of two rocks: either at the cost of the style and the idiom of his own nation, he will hold too closely to the original, or at the cost of the original, he will hold too close to the peculiarity of his nation. The middle ground between these is not only

often took over the foreign word directly and, as we have noted earlier in this chapter, also added to it an explanatory one, often of his own coinage. In any case, Carlyle's failure to render accurately certain highly connotative words and phrases because of the absence of a corresponding idiom can hardly be regarded as a fault. Below are examples of Carlyle's failure to render certain words and phrases accurately.

Mus. D L, 163: Die gefrässige Schar der Tischfreunde

Car. 20: The voracious host of table-friends

["There is something connotative about the word "fressen" which can not be duplicated in English.]

Mus. D L, 165: Nun war nicht zu leugnen, dass ein Pflaster von buntfarbigem Marmor, a la Mosaïque, sich in einem Speisesaal ungleich besser ausnahm als die verblichenen alten Taler.

Car. 21: Now, it could not be denied, that a marble-floor, worked into nice mosaic, looked much better in a parlour, than a sheet of dirty, tarnished dollars.

["Buntfarbig" might have been translated "vari-colored"; but the word would not convey the richness which the German word suggests.]

Mus. D L, 182: Darum zitterte ein Tränlein von ihren schönen Augen.

Car. 34: for this that the little tear had trickled from her beautiful eyes;

["Es zitterte ein Tränlein" is very effective in German; it would never do to say "a tear trembled" in the English.]

Mus. D L, 183: Nach dem Hinscheiden der selgen Frau

Car. 35: After the departure of his whilom wife.

["Selgen" suggests that the wife has departed this life happily. Carlyle might have attempted "blessed" or "beatific."]

hard, but absolutely impossible."--Quoted by Tolman in Art of Translating, op. cit., p. 24.

Mus. D L, 218: er schor das Gespenst so kahl als er selbst war.

Car. 64: he scraped the Ghost as bald as he himself was.

["Schor" suggests a very close shearing. Carlyle tried to convey the meaning in the word "scraped"; for this word, however, the German is "schaben."]

Mus. L, 187: Sie geizte nicht nach Reichtümern.

Car. 97: she cared not for riches.

["Carlyle could have used "covetous" but the English seems to have no verb corresponding to the German "geizen."]

Mus. M, 265: "Herzog Heinrich, was jammerst du?"

Car. 148: "Duke Henry, what ails thee?"

["Carlyle probably did well here by merely suggesting. "Why do you lament?" would not have given the force of "jammern" in German.]

Mus. M, 275: und zwischen durch schlängelten sich wunderbar gewundene Blumenbeete in mancherlei grotesken Figuren.

Car. 156: and through these strangely-twisted flower-bed serpentised along.

["There is no verb in English with the connotation of the German "schlängeln."]

Hof. G P, 232: Da schlängelten und kreuzten sich blaue Blitze vor ihnen her, und Veronike wurde inne, dass der Kater knisternde Funken sprühend und leuchtend vor ihnen herumsprang, und dessen ängstliches grausiges Zetergeschrei sie vernahm, wenn der Sturm nur einen Augenblick schwieg.

Car. 71: The blue forky gleams went quivering and sputtering before them; and Veronica perceived that it was the Cat emitting sparks, and bounding forward to light the way; while his doleful ghastly screams were heard in the momentary pauses of the storm.

Hof. G P, 258: und hundert Blitze schlängelten sich in feurigen Kreisen um die kreischende Alte.

Car. 101: and a hundred bolts whirled forth in fiery circles round the shrieking crone.

Ric. A S J, 235: und die beiden Schwäger soffen selig.

Car. 158: and my Brother-in-law and the Postillion were both carousing with full can.

["Soffen selig" in the German will invariably elicit a smile; it suggests a state of most ecstatic drinking. There is no expression quite comperable to it in English.]

Ric. Q F, 113: "Ei, Herr Konrektor, (sagte der Regimentsquartiermeister und wurstete ungestört fort).

Car. 256: "Ey, Herr Conrektor," said the Quartermaster, and continued calmly stuffing puddings as before.

["Wurstete . . . fort" may be correctly translated "stuffing puddings"; but to the German the former will suggest much more than the latter will to the Englishman.]

Ric. A F, 137: dass der Regimentsquartiermeister ungerufen kam und das Schwein abstach und gratis Würste machte.

Car. 282: that the Regiments-Quartermaster came un-called, and killed the pig, and made puddings gratis.

(5) Occasional Literalness for the Purpose of Showing German Idiom

In the previous chapter were listed a number of literal translations from Carlyle's German Romance which appeared inexcusable. Either they were the result of too great an absorption in the study of German idiom, or they were the logical consequence of too severe an application of the principle of fidelity. They did not appear to have been formulated with any ulterior motive and did not seem to possess sufficient justification for being. Here are listed a number of literal renditions which may be regarded as excusable. To a limited degree, these seeming faults, like those listed in the previous chapter, may have been the result of a specific influence growing out of Carlyle's prolonged contact with the German text. Likewise, these literal translations again show a confirmation in practice of Carlyle's conception of a good translation. However, in the light of Carlyle's work as a whole in these translations, one feels that the literalisms listed in this chapter, the awkwardnesses and oddities in the English expressions, were

too obvious to have escaped the translator, and we must, therefore, judge that he used them deliberately in an effort to acquaint the English people with the character of the German language. What Carlyle wrote in his preface to the first edition of German Romance should be recalled here: "They are German Novelists, not English ones; and their Germanhood I have all along regarded as a quality, not as a fault."¹ It was this quality of "Germanhood" that he wished to have his countrymen know better and learn to esteem.

Here are examples of occasional literalness, the purpose of which seems to be the showing of German idiom. It is reasonable to assume that Carlyle's familiarity with English usage may have readily suggested to him words and phrases more appropriate than those which he employed here.

Mus. D L, 186: Dass ihr das Heuratsgewerbe [sic] nicht zu sinne sei.

Car. 37: that the marriage-trade was not to her taste.

["Matrimony" would have been a satisfactory translation and less surprising.]

Mus. L, 230: Daher kommt die Gewohnheit, dass man von einem zurückgewiesenen Freier sagt, er habe von seinem Liebchen einen Korb bekommen, bis auf den heutigen Tag.

Car. 133: Hence comes it, that when a wooer is rejected, people say, his love has given him a basket, even to the present day.

[The literal translation here is particularly happy because expression of a rejected lover being given a basket is in universal usage among the Germans.]

Mus. M, 265: Schwarzbart

Car. 148: Blackbeard

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, Preface, p. 4.

Mus. M, 234: Eine Menge neuer Gegenstände drängten sich ihm auf, von allen Seiten her.

Car. 164: Crowds of new objects pressed on him from every side.

["Menge" in the German is suitable for either objects or persons; in the English "crowds" is applicable to persons, but less so to objects.]

Mus. M, 295: Der Graf . . . blieb in der Stellung eines Büssenden noch lange Zeit auf den Knien liegen, nachdem ihn die Prinzessin verlassen hatte.

Car. 173: The Count . . . continued sitting on his knees, in the position of a man doing penance, for sometime after his princess had left the place.

[Here the literalness is not quite complete. Carlyle may have preferred the "sitting on his knees" to the more absurd "lying on his knees."]

Tie. F E, 152: Meine Neugier war ausserordentlich gespannt.

Car. 275: My curiosity was wonderfully on the stretch.

Tie. R, 216: Er sprang auf und wollte entfliehen.

Car. 321: He started up to fly.

[This is somewhat perplexing. One wonders why Carlyle did not write "flee" instead of "fly."]

Tie. R, 242: So sass sie einst mit ihrer Arbeit auf dem Anger, Leonore zu ihrer Seite und ein säugendes Kind an der Brust.

Car. 341: She was sitting one day with her work in the field, Leonora at her side, and a sucking child on her breast.

Tie. P. 394: er konnte nicht verhindern, dass sie nicht kurze Zeit in der reizendsten Stellung knieend vor seinen Füssen lag.

Car. 366: he could not prevent her having, for a moment, in the most charming posture, lain kneeling at his feet.

[In the English one is not accustomed to say that a person has "lain kneeling"; Carlyle, however, has so written it here because of the German "knieend . . . lag."]

Hof. G P, 192: mit Mühe befestigt der Friseur einen kleinen Zopf an meinem Hinterhaupt.

Car. 26: with an immensity of trouble, the barber fastens me a little cue to my hindhead.

Hof. G P, 194: Schwesterlein--Schwesterlein, schwinde dich im Schimmer.

Car. 27: Sisterkin, sisterkin! up to the shine.

Hof. G P, 221: "Töchterchen, höre!"

Car. 59: "Daughterkin, hear me!"

Hof. G P, 252: ich musste mich schnell in des Conrektors Pfeifenkopf retiriren.

Car. 94: and I had to make a quick retreat into the conrector's pipe-head.

Ric. Q F, 66: es wird ihr aber--sagt sie--nicht passen, da die Rittmeisterin (denn sie hing an Thiennetten ihre abgeworfenen Kleider, wie Katholiken an Schutzheilige abgelegte Krücken und Schäden) dicker sei.

Car. 202: but, adds she, it will not sit her; as the Rittmeisterinn (for this lady used to hang her cast clothes on Thiennette, as Catholics do their cast crutches and sores on their patron Saints) was much thicker.

[In English one prefers to say that a woman is heavy, stout, or corpulent; rarely does he speak of her as being "thick."]

Ric. Q F, 80: Er stieg unter das Dach zu den leeren Vogelhäusern seines Vaters, der im Winter ein Vogler war.

Car. 218: He mounted to the garret, to the empty bird-coops of his father, who in winter had been a birder.

Ric. Q F, 94: der Grossvaterstuhl, ein silbernes Besteck und eine Weinsuppe gereicht; lauter Aufwand, der sich, wie der Vormund sagte, nur für einen Gelehrten schickte aber nicht für einen Fleischer.

Car. 235: the arm-chair; silver implements, and a wine-stoup were handed him; mere waste, which as the Guardian used to say, suited well enough for a Scholar; but for a flesher not at all.

[According to Webster's Collegiate Dictionary "flesher" is "chiefly Scotch."]

Ric. Q F, 134: Und wenn dann Fixlein die Treppe unter dem Gebetläuten langsam hinuntergeht zur kochenden Mutter.

Car. 279: And then when Fixlein, smid the tolling of the evening prayer-bell, slowly descends the stair to his cooking mother.

[To speak of "einer kochenden Mutter," in the German is no less jarring than to speak of a "cooking mother" in the English. One would prefer to read that the mother was cooking the noon-day meal for Fixlein.]

Ric. Q F, 176: Wegweiser

Car. 325: Road-pointer

CHAPTER VII

The Strong Features of Carlyle's Translation

1. General Fidelity to Idiom and Faithful Attention to Linguistic Details.
2. Accurate Rendering of Idiomatic German Expressions into Corresponding Idiomatic English
3. Free but Effective Translation of Occasional Odd Passages
4. Accurate Rendering of Difficult and Somewhat Ambiguous Passages
5. Treatment of Long Sentences: Breaking up of Long Sentences; Leaving Long Sentences Intact; Rendering Long Sentences Exceptionally Well.

CHAPTER VII

The Strong Features in Carlyle's Translations

Any analysis of the accomplishment represented in German Romance which did not set forth the strong features in the translation would do Carlyle an essential injustice. Considered as a whole, Carlyle's work is highly commendable, especially in view of the many difficulties presented in the language of Musaeus, Hoffmann, and Richter. The translator wrestled manfully with many obscure and difficult passages, and, for the most part, emerged successful. His work is evidence of a high degree of accuracy in rendering into English the substance as well as the style and the spirit of the original.¹ The strong features for which one must praise him as a translator are chiefly these: (1) General fidelity to idiom, and surprisingly even if not invariably faithful attention to linguistic details, (2) Accurate rendering into English of idiomatic German expressions, (3) Free but effective translation of certain odd passages in

¹ "The importance of German Romance lies not so much in the spirit in which it is done, though that is significant, as it does in the popularity and prestige which it was to enjoy for some years to come, and in the excellence of its translation."--Zeydel, Edwin H. Ludwig Tieck and England: A Study in the Literary Relations of Germany and England During the Early Nineteenth Century, Cincinnati, 1931, p. 152.

the original with little or no loss of meaning, (4) Accurate rendering of particularly difficult and often ambiguous passages, (5) Skilful turning of long involved sentences, occasionally improving clearness without injury to the original. The passages below will serve to illustrate the several features just indicated.

(1) General Fidelity to Idiom and Faithful Attention to Linguistic Details

One of the first requisites of a translation is that it be idiomatic; and, of course, one of the first requisites of an English translation is that it be English. To achieve this purpose a knowledge of the original is essential, but a knowledge of English is imperative; for "no task is more delicate than the choice of an English word to convey the idea of the original."¹ Carlyle's vocabulary fitted him admirably for this task.

Mus. D L, 164: Er gab sich auch weiter keine Mühe, die Ursache davon zu ergründen, sondern nachdem er zu der gewöhnlichen Litanei des Unsinnns eine Zuflucht genommen und einige Dutzend Flüche abgedonnert hatte, liess er an den achselzuckenden Haushalter den lakonischen Befehl ergehen: schaff Rat.

Car. 21: Nor did he give himself the trouble to investigate the real condition of the business but after flying to the common Fool's-litany, and thundering out some scores of curses, he transmitted to his shoulder-shrugging steward the laconic order: Find means.

Each of the three phrases--"zu der gewöhnlichen Litanei des Unsinnns eine Zuflucht genommen hatte," "einige Dutzend Flüche abgedonnert hatte," and "schaff Rat"--is peculiarly effective in the German. Adhering closely to the original yet without becoming awkward, Carlyle has rendered

¹ Tolman, H. C., op. cit., p. 44.

each in diction that is equally effective in the English.]

Mus. M, 300: In einer Stunde ebnete die Phantasie die unübersteiglichsten Berge, in der andern sah sie nichts als Klüfte und Abgründe, vor welchen sie zurückschauderte, und über die die kühnste Einbildungskraft keinen Steg zu bauen wagte.

Car. 176: One hour fancy smoothed away the most impassable mountains; and the next, she saw nothing but clefts and abysses, from the brink of which she shuddered back, and over which the boldest imagination could not build a bridge.

Mus. M, 310: zwei schön gewölbte Bogen, auf welchen Amor scherzte, wie die buntfarbige Iris auf dem Regenbogen, beschatteten die seelevollen Augen, und zwei goldne Locken küssten sich auf ihrer Liljenbrust.

Car. 185: two beautifully-curved arches on which love was sporting like the many coloured Iris on the rainbow, shaded her spirit-speaking eyes; and two golden tresses kissed each other on her lily breast.

[With the single exception of "seelevollen Augen," this entire passage is rendered into correspondingly effective English. "Soul-ful eyes" would have been nearer the original than "spirit-speaking eyes," and would have been fully as forceful; the implication, however, would remain the same.]

Tie. F H, 225: und erblickte weit hinter sich und kaum noch kennbar am äussersten Horizont.

Car. 327: and saw far behind him, and scarce discernible at the extreme horizon.

[Aside from the somewhat faulty grammar in the translation, Carlyle has turned this German phrase into equally adequate English.]

Hof. G P, 203: Die Klingelschür senkte sich hinab und wurde zur weissen durchsichtigen Riesenschlange, die umwand und drückte ihn, fester und fester ihr Gewinde schnürend, zusammen, dass die mirben zermalnten Glieder knackend zerbröckelten und sein Blut aus den Adern spritzte, eindringend in den durchsichtigen Leib der Schlange und ihn roth färbend.

Car. 37: The bell-rope lengthened downwards, and became a white transparent gigantic serpent, which encircled and crushed him, and girded him straiter and straiter in its coils, till his brittle paralysed limbs went crashing in pieces, and blood spouted from his veins, penetrating into the transparent body of the serpent, and dyeing it red.

[Here the entire passage is rendered into gracefully turned, idiomatic English.]

Hof. S P, 218: hinter jeder Tasse sprang jene Gestalt wie ein Alräunchen hervor und lachte höhnisch und schlug mit den kleinen Spinnen-fingern Schnippchen und schrie.

Car. 55: behind every cup that shape peeped forth, like a little mandrake, and laughed in spiteful mockery, and snapped its little spider fingers, and cried.

(2) Accurate Rendering of Idiomatic German Expressions into Corresponding Idiomatic English

Occasionally the German romances contain epigrammatic phrases, proverbial sayings, and other idiomatic expressions for which there exist no corresponding expressions, of equal force, in the English. For most of them, however, there do exist such corresponding English terms of equal force; the difficulty lies in being familiar with them. Carlyle appears to have been fairly successful in translating such expressions; the following passages will illustrate this fact.

Mus. D L, 210: denn ich fühle grosse Ermüdung und werde auf beiden Ohren schlafen.

Car. 57: for I am tired completely, and shall sleep with both eyes.

Mus. D L, 222: "Fremdling," sprach er, "trau keinem Wirte, der den Schalk im Schilde führt."

Car. 67: "Stranger," said he, "trust no inn-keeper who is a Turk in grain."

Mus. L, 211: Die zweideutige Spende der Herzogin wurmt sie sehr.

Car. 117: The ambiguous present of the Duchess cut them to the heart.

[The English expression has the same force and is as common and effective as the German.]

Mus. L, 219: Die Versammlung der Ritter und Vasallen um sie her war ganz Ohr.

Car. 124: The assemblage of knights and vassals around her stood in breathless attention.

Mus. M, 256: Er starb auf dieser Heeresfahrt, in der besten Blüte des Lebens an einem bösen Fieber, zu Hdrunt,

ehe er noch das ritterliche Verdienst hatte, einen Sarazenen bis auf den Sattelknopf zu spalten.

Car. 142: He died on this march, in the bloom of life, of a malignant fever, at Otranto, before he had acquired the knightly merit of chining a single Saracen.

[Carlyle might have added "to the pommel," but the thought is probably implied.]

Mus. M, 291: "Wo anders," antwortete er nach seiner handfesten Art, "als in den Klauen des jüdischen Quacksalbers, der ihm ohne Verzug die Seele wird ausschwitzen lassen?"

Car. 169: "Where else," said he, in his sturdy way, "but in the hands of the Jewish quack-salver, who will sweat the soul from his body in a trice?"

Mus. M, 314: weil alles einen natürlichen Gang nahm, und sich keine dienstfertige Fay ins Spiel mischte.

Car. 188: everything proceeded merely by the course of nature, and no serviceable Fairy put a finger in the pie.

[Although Carlyle translated effectively the idiomatic expression "ins Spiel mischte," his rendering of "dienstfertige" may be questioned. "Dienstfertig" suggests a constant readiness to serve; "serviceable" in German is "dienstbar" or "nützlich."]]

Tie. F E, 156: Du bist brav, mein Kind!

Car. 278: Thou art a good girl, child.

Tie. F E, 158: Ich solle . . . mir die Zeit nicht lang werden lassen.

Car. 279: I must . . . not let time hang heavy on my hands.

Hof. G P, 193: Ich wollte ordentlich was darauf gehen lassen.

Car. 26: I would stretch a point for once.

[The thought here is, of course, "I was prepared, this one time, to risk it (meaning the breaking of a resolution not to drink beer)."]]

Hof. G P, 196: geh' Er fein ordentlich zu Hause und leg' Er sich aufs Ohr.

Car. 30: go home like a pretty man, and take a nap of sleep on it.

[Here "take a nap on it" would have been translation sufficient; "of sleep" qualifying "nap" suggests wordiness. Furthermore, "take a nap on it" is an effective English idiom generally known.]]

Hof. G P, 197: Herr Anselmus! Herr Anselmus! wo

rennen Sie denn um tausend Himmelswillen hin in solcher Hast!

Car. 31: "Herr Anselmus! Herr Anselmus! for the love of Heaven, whither are you running in such haste?"

Ric. A S J, 228: Fällt mich irgend ein unbesonnener Hund bedeutend an, so tret' ich ihn freilich im ersten Zorn entzwei.

Car. 151: If any thoughtless dog chance to anger me, in the first heat of rage I kick my foot through him.

[Richter seems to have exaggerated for humorous effect. Carlyle succeeded in achieving the same end in the translation.]

Ric. Q F, 114: ein Mensch ist ein Narr von Haus aus.

Car. 257: man is a fool from the very foundation of him.

(3) Free but Effective Translation of Occasional Odd Passages with Little or no Loss of Meaning

It was pointed out earlier in this study that Carlyle often translated somewhat odd passages in the romances somewhat freely, a procedure which was not always a happy one, as is seen in the resulting awkwardnesses, Germanisms, and frequent renderings with losses in meaning. He did, however, also make free translations of occasional odd passages with very good effect and with little or no loss of meaning. Below are selected passages illustrating this fact.

Mus. D L, 189: "Kind, um Mädchen ohne Heuratsgut [sic] ist kein Drang, müssen kaufen, wer mit ihnen kaufen will."

Car. 39: Child, for girls without dowry there is no press of woovers; they are heavy ware to trade with.

[Carlyle shifts from the active to the passive in this construction, but the meaning remains the same.]

Mus. D L, 203: fasse den Tropf beim Fell, balge ihn weidlich und werf ihn zur Tür hinaus.

Car. 51: catch the noodle by the spall, thrash him sufficiently, and pack him out of doors.

[The force of the original is well reproduced in the

English; one questions, however, the translation of "Fell" by the term "spall."⁷

Mus. L, 173: Tief im Böhmer Walde, wovon jetzt nur ein Schatten übrig ist

Car. 86: Deep in the Bohemian forest, which has now dwindled to a few scattered woodlands.

Mus. L, 217: die das Pfand der Liebe unbedacht-
sam verschleudert hatten, welches doch das Mittel war, die Braut zu dingen und den Finger zu beringen.

Car. 122: and thoughtlessly cast away the pledge of love, which, as it appeared, had been the casket of their fairest hopes.

[Here the translation is obviously very free. The meaning remains, of course, that the purpose was to win the bride.]

Mus. M, 333: Dass dir doch die lügenhafte Zunge verschwarzte, du Galgenas!

Car. 203: Devil broil thy tongue, thou gallows carrion!

Hof. G P, 254: Da sagte Jemand dicht neben ihm: "Ich weiss gar nicht was Sie wollen, Herr Studiosus."

Car. 96: Then spoke a voice close by him: "What the devil ails you, Herr Studiosus?"

[Studiosus was weeping pitifully because of being shut up in a bottle. Another clerk, one of his "fellows in misery," also shut up in a bottle, is irritated by the ceaseless whining of Studiosus and wishes to give emphasis to his address.]

Hof. G P, 254: Sie sitzen ja doch eben so gut eingesperrt in gläsernen Flaschen als ich, und können sich nicht regen und bewegen.

Car. 97: You are sitting here corked up in glass bottles, as well as I, and cannot move a finger.

["Sich nicht regen und bewegen" is a term commonly and effectively applied in the German when referring to one's inability to move. "Cannot move a finger" is equally effective for the same thought in the English.]

Hof. G P, 255: Spüren Sie es denn nicht, dass Sie alle saamt und sonders in gläsernen Flaschen sitzen und sich nicht regen und bewegen, viel weniger unerspazieren können?

Car. 97: Do you not observe, then that you are all and sundry corked up in glass bottles, and cannot for your hearts walk a hairsbreadth?

Ric. A S J, 225: Könn' er einmal oben in der ewigen

Seligkeit keine Seele zuweilen wamsen und koram nehmen, so fahr' er lieber in die Hölle, wo gewiss des Guten und der Händel eher zu viel sein werden.

Car. 149: That if in the Upper world he could not get a soul to curry and towzle by a time, he would rather go the Under, where most probably there would be plenty of cuffing and to spare.

Where Richter writes that there will be too much of cuffing, Carlyle renders there will be cuffing to spare; in either case the meaning and the force are the same.

(4) Accurate Rendering of Particularly Difficult and Ambiguous Passages

Carlyle's skill as a translator becomes strikingly evident when one examines carefully his rendering of occasional particularly difficult and often definitely ambiguous passages in the German romances. In addition to their being long and involved, some of the German sentences are frequently burdened also with thought that is vaguely and strangely expressed. Carlyle renders these sentences--not always, however--with an accuracy in both substance and form that is commendable. Following are selected illustrations of this excellence.

Mus. D L, 173: Lange vor ihm hatten die empfindsamen Seladons in Welschland und Spanien schmelzende Harmonien bei ihren Serenaden die Sprache des Herzens unter dem Balkon ihrer Donna reden lassen, und dieses melodische Pathos soll in Liebesdakarationen des Zwecks nicht leicht verfehlen und nach dem Geständnis der Damen heranfassen-der und hinreissender sein, als weiland die Wohlredenheit des ehrwürdigen Vaters Chryostomus oder die Beredsamkeit schulgerechten Cicero und Demosthenes.

Car. 28: Many years ago, the sentimental Celadons of Italy and Spain had taught melting harmonies, in serenades beneath the balconies of their dames, to speak the language of the heart; and it is said that this melodious pathos had especial virtue in love-matters; and, by the confession of the ladies, was more heart-affecting and subduing, than of yore the oratory of the reverend Chrystom, or the pleadings of Demosthenes and Tully.

[Musaeus makes this passage increasingly difficult by weaving allusions into it. Carlyle takes care of it with nice precision.]

Fou. A K, 67: da sei es ihm bei'm Anlanden leichtes Spiel gewesen, die Räuber, die sich aus ihrer eignen Schaar heraus von ihm angegriffen gesehen, und für verhext gehalten, vollends zu verwirren.

Car. 242: on landing, he found no difficulty in entirely confounding the robbers, who, seeing themselves attacked from the middle of their own troop, had imagined that they were bewitched.

[In this passage Carlyle shifts the emphasis. In the German the thought that the robbers could easily be confused is emphasized. Carlyle emphasized the thought that they imagined themselves bewitched. There is no omission, however, of the content.]

Tie. F E, 145: In diesen Augenblicken geben sich die zarten Seelen einander zu erkennen, und zuweilen geschieht es wohl auch, dass einer vor der Bekanntschaft des andern zurück schreckt.

Car. 270: It is in such moments that tender souls unveil themselves, and stand face to face; and at times it will happen that the one recoils affrighted from the countenance of the other.

[Eckbert chooses to reveal a strange secret to Walther, one which the latter had never suspected. He reveals to him his own character, at which disclosure Walther is startled.]

Hof. G P, 265: ein glänzend polirtes Metall in dem ich mein Ich erblickte, blass, übernächtig und melancholisch

Car. 109: I beheld my own mean Self, pale, over-
watched, and melancholic.

[The story-teller had been up too late the evening before; there, "übernächtig."]
fore

Ric. A S J, 214: und der Kriegsfuss, worauf die Zeit gesetzt wird, ist ihnen der wahre teuflische Pferdefuss der Menschheit.

Car. 138: and the Warlike Foot, which the age is placed on, is to them the true Devil's cloven-foot of human nature.

[If Richter here referred to the mythical Satan's foot, Carlyle's correction is in place; the horse's foot is not cloven.]¹

¹ "To imitate the obscurity or ambiguity of the original, is a fault."--Tytler, A. F., op. cit., p. 18.

Ric. Q F, 109: Thiennette, unbekannt mit unserm Geschlecht, musste dieses irrig für einen Antrag der Ehe nehmen und drückte dem einzigen lebendigen Menschen, durch dessen Arme sich noch die Freude, die Liebe und die Erde mit ihrer Brust verband, heute zum ersten mal mit den Fingern des wunden Armes bebend seinen, worin sie lagen.

Car. 251: Thiennette, unacquainted with our sex, naturally mistook this speech for a proposal of marriage; and the fingers of her wounded arm, tonight for the first time, pressed suddenly against the arm in which they lay; the only living mortal's arm, by which Joy, Love and the Earth, were still united with her bosom.

[This passage is not simply stated in the German. Literally, Thiennette's fingers, on the hand of her wounded arm, pressed the man's arm which was holding her fingers. Carlyle put the thought into more elegant and more intelligible English.]

Ric. Q F, 154: Ich blätterte die Leichensteine durch.

Car. 301: I perused the grave-stones.

[Carlyle has expressed an idea more sensibly here than the German has it. Fixlein was walking about on the graveyard reading the inscriptions on the tombs. Richter has him say that he was turning the leaves of the grave-stones as though the stones formed a book.]

(5) Treatment of Long Sentences: Breaking up of Long Sentences; Leaving Long Sentences Intact; Rendering Long Sentences Exceptionally Well

Carlyle could have rendered his English readers an even greater service than he did in his translation had he chosen to break up some of the long involved sentences which not infrequently characterize the German romances. He did so rarely, and when he did, he added materially to a quicker understanding of the context, and, at the same time, took nothing away from the thought. The short sentence below is an illustration of such work.

Tie. R, 216: Indem es finster wurde, und der Bach lauter rauschte, und das Geflügel der Nacht seine irre Wanderung mit umschweifendem Fluge begann, sass er noch immer

missvergnügt und in sich versunken.

Car. 320: Meanwhile it grew darker; and the brook rushed louder; and the birds of night began to shoot, with fitful wing, along their mazy courses. Christian still sat disconsolate, and immersed in sad reflection.

[Just what Carlyle hoped to gain by the additional infinitive "to shoot" in describing the flight of the birds it is difficult to say.]

More common than the breaking up of long sentences just referred to, was Carlyle's tendency to leave long and rather involved German sentences intact. His various marks of punctuation do not always coincide with those of the German author; but the thought is equally suspended until the period is reached in the German, regardless of the many ramifications which the subordinate elements indicate. A few examples of such long sentences left intact by Carlyle follow:

Mus. L, 201: Das Volk huldigte ihr mit grossem Frohlocken, und obgleich die beiden Schwestern sie neideten und ihre geheimen Künste anwendeten, sich an ihr und dem Vaterlande der vermeinten Verschmähung halber zu rächen, durch den Sauerteig der Verunglimpfung und des Tadels aller Handlungen und Taten ihrer Schwester unter der Nation eine schädliche Gärung zu bewirken und die Ruhe und Glückseligkeit der sanften jungfräulichen Regierung zu untergraben: so wusste Libussa doch diesem unschwesterlichen Beginnen weislich zu begegnen und alle feindseligen Anschläge und Zaubereien dieser Unholdinnen zu vernichten, bis sie müde wurden, ihre unwirksamen Kräfte weiter an ihr zu versuchen.

Car. 109: The nation celebrated the event with vast rejoicings: and although her two sisters envied her, and employed their secret arts to obtain revenge on her and their country for the slight which had been put upon them, and endeavoured by the leaven of criticism, by censuring all the measures and transactions of their sister, to produce a hurtful fermentation in the state, yet Libussa was enabled wisely to encounter this unsisterly procedure, and to ruin all the hostile projects, magical or other, of these ungentle persons, till at last, weary of assailing her in vain, they ceased to employ their ineffectual arts against her.

[In this long sentence Carlyle appears to have over-

looked the phrase, "und die Ruhe und Glückseligkeit der sanften jungfräulichen Regierung zu untergraben." At any rate, no equivalent of it appears in his translation.]

Hof. G P, 209: Versuche es, geneigter Leser! in dem feenhaften Reiche voll herrlicher Wunder, die die höchste Wonne, so wie das tiefste Entsetzen in gewaltigen Schlägen hervorrufen, ja, wo die ernste Göttin ihren Schleier lüftet, dass wir ihr Antlitz zu schauen wännen--aber ein Lächeln schimmert oft aus dem ernsten Blick, und das ist der neckhafte Scherz, der in allerlei verwirrendem Zauber mit uns spielt, so wie die Mutter oft mit ihren liebsten Kindern tändelt--ja! in diesem Reiche, das uns der Geist so oft, wenigstens im Traume aufschliesst, versuche es, geneigter Leser, die bekannten Gestalten, wie sie täglich, wie man zu sagen pflegt im gemeinsamen Leben, um Dich herwandeln, wiederzuerkennen.

Car. 45: Make an effort, favourable reader--while in the Fairy region full of glorious Wonders, which with subduing thrills calls forth the highest rapture and the deepest horror; nay, where the Earnest Goddess herself will waft aside her veil, so that we seem to look upon her countenance (but a smile often glimmers through her earnest glance; and this is the jestful teasing, which sports with us in all manner of perplexing enchantments, as mothers in nursing and dandling their dearest children)--in this region, which the spirit so often, at least in dreams, lays open to us, do thou make an effort, favourable reader, again to recognize the well-known shapes, which, even in common life, are daily, in fitful brightness, hovering round thee.

Hof. G P, 242: Sein Feuer ist für jetzt erloschen, sprach der Geisterfürst, in der unglücklichen Zeit, wenn die Sprache der Natur dem entarteten Geschlecht der Menschen nicht mehr verständlich seyn, wenn die Elementargeister in ihre Regionen gebannt nur aus weiter Ferne in dumpfen Anklängen zu den Menschen sprechen werden, wenn dem harmonischen Kreise entrückt, nur ein unendliches Sehnen ihm die dunkle Kunde von dem wundervollen Reiche geben wird, das er sonst bewohnen durfte, als noch Glaube und Liebe in seinem Gemüthe wohnten,--in dieser unglücklichen Zeit entzündet sich der Feuerstoff des Salamanders aufs Neue, doch nur zum Menschen keimt er empor und muss, ganz eingehend in das dürftige Leben, dessen Bedrängnisse ertragen.

Car. 83: 'His fire is for the present extinguished,' said the Prince of the Spirits: 'but in the hapless time, when the Speech of Nature shall no longer be intelligible to degenerate man; when the Spirits of the Elements, banished into their own regions, shall speak to him only from afar, in faint, spent echoes; when, displaced from the harmonious circle an infinite longing alone shall give him tidings of the Land of Marvels, which he once might inhabit while Belief and Love

still dwelt in his soul: in this hapless time, the fire of the Salamander shall again kindle; but only to manhood shall he be permitted to rise, and entering, wholly into Man's necessitous existence, he shall learn to endure its wants and oppressions.'

Some of the long sentences which Carlyle left intact he rendered exceptionally well. Below are two, one from Tieck and the other from Richter, which will serve as examples. The first is preceded by a short sentence, given here to make the meaning clearer.

Tie. P, 213: Sie wollten sich umarmen und fuhren schnell zurück. Beide betrachteten sich mit prüfenden Blicken, beide suchten aus dem Ruin der Zeit jene Lineamente wieder zu entwickeln, die sie ehemals an einander gekannt und geliebt hatten, und wie in dunkeln Gewitternächten unter dem Fluge schwarzer Wolken einzeln in flüchtigen Momenten die Sterne räthzelhaft schimmern, um schnell wieder zu erlöschen, so schien ihnen aus den Augen, von Stirn und Mund jezuweilen der wohlbekannte Zug vorüberblitzend, und es war, als wenn ihre Jugend in der Ferne lächelnd weinte.

Car. 381: They sprang forward to embrace, then started suddenly back. Each viewed the other with investigating looks: both strove again to evolve from the ruins of Time those lineaments which of old they had known and loved in one another; and as, in dark tempestuous nights, amid the flight of black clouds, there are moments when solitary stars ambiguously twinkle forth, to disappear the next instant, so to these two was there shown now and then from the eyes, from the brow and lips, the transitory gleam of some well-known feature; and it seemed as if their Youth stood in the distance, weeping smiles.

Ric. Q F, 153: Wahrlich ein Mann muss nie über die mit einer Ewigkeit bedeckte Schöpfungsminute der Welt nachgesonnen haben, der nicht eine Frau, deren Lebensfaden eine verhüllte unendliche Hand zu einem Zweiten spinnt, und die Zeit verhüllt, mit philosophischer Verehrung anblickt; aber noch weniger muss ein Mann je empfunden haben, dessen Seele vor einer Frau in einem Zustande, wo sie einem unbekanntem ungesehenen Wesen noch mehr aufopfert als wir den bekannten, nämlich Nächten, Freuden und oft das Leben, sich nicht tiefer und mit grösserer Rührung bückt als vor einem ganzen singenden Nonnen-Orchester auf ihrer Sarawüste; und schlimmer als beide in einer, dem nicht seine Mutter alle andere Mütter verehrungswürdig macht.

Car. 299: In truth, a man must never have reflected on the Creation-moment, when the Universe first rose from the bosom of an Eternity, if he does not view with philosophic reverence a woman, whose thread of life a secret all-wondrous Hand is spinning to a second thread, and who veils within her the transition from Nothingness to Existence, from Eternity to Time;--but still less can a man have any heart of flesh, if his soul, in presence of a woman, who, to an unknown unseen being, is sacrificing more than we will sacrifice when it is seen and known, namely, her nights, her joys, often her life, does not bow lower, and with deeper emotion, than in presence of a whole-nun-orchestra on their Sahara desert;--and worse than either is the man for whom his own mother has not made all other mothers venerable.

CHAPTER VIII

On the Probable Development of Carlyle as a Translator

Whether Carlyle improved steadily as a translator of German is difficult to decide. Presumably he did, although convincing evidence on which to base such a conclusion is lacking.

Olga Marx, however, in her comparative study of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Wilhelm Meister's Travels,¹ is certain that there was considerable gain in power on Carlyle's part.² Of the inaccuracies which she has selected from both works to show faults of Carlyle's translation she lists approximately three from the Apprenticeship to one from the Travels, selected from an equal number of pages. Of the incorrect translations her selections from the two works bear about the same ratio. This ratio does not obtain with reference to awkwardnesses; of

¹ Carlyle's translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship appeared in 1824 while the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Travels was not made until 1826, and published in 1827.

² "The two are, however, very unequal, as the former, in spite of numerous infidelities, unapparent, of course, to an English public, reads well, while the latter, disclosing a far more intimate knowledge of German, suffers from literal translations of compound adjectives and from an adherence to the movement of the German sentence that destroys the rhythm of the English prose."--Marx, Olga, op. cit., p. 8.

those, she has chosen, proportionally, more from the Travels than from the Apprenticeship. A probable explanation for this latter fact, however, is that Carlyle deliberately permitted many of the awkward constructions to stand so that the English people might become more familiar with German idiom. The number of inaccuracies, incorrect translations, and awkwardnesses listed by Olga Marx in her study of the translation of Wilhelm Meister is shown in the following table:

Type of Fault	<u>Apprenticeship</u> (1824) 1001 pages	<u>Travels</u> (1827) 550 pages
Inaccurate translations	34	11
Incorrect translations	67	24
Awkward translations	16	14

The figures just given should not be made to bear too much meaning. They are indicative of a probable gain rather than absolute proof. "That Carlyle recognized a difference between his translation of the Lehrjahre and that of the Wanderjahre," says Olga Marx, "is attested first by his statement in a letter to Goethe: 'This Wanderjahre which I reckon somewhat better translated than its forerunner,' and secondly by the fact that while he made numerous changes in his second (1839) versions of the Lehrjahre, he altered little or nothing in that of the Wanderjahre."¹ Olga Marx

¹ Ibid., p. 70.

points out further that in the Apprenticeship excellent free translations and "circumlocutions" predominate, whereas in the Travels literal translations abound. "From this alone," she says, "it would be logical to deduce that Carlyle considered a translation good, when it closely followed the style of the original."¹ Other students of Carlyle's translations have arrived at similar conclusions. "The Wanderjahre is better done by Carlyle than the Lehrjahre," Edward Dowden wrote to one of his friends.² In 1839, when the publisher had undertaken to bring out a new edition of Carlyle's Wilhelm Meister, Carlyle himself wrote to Emerson as follows: "He has begun reprinting Goethe's Wilhelm Meister, the Apprenticeship and Travels One of these I call my best Translation, the other my worst."³ All this evidence is, however, largely in the form of statements either by Carlyle himself or by students of his work, and can, of course, not be regarded as conclusive proof of Carlyle's actual development as a translator.

Whether there was any marked growth in Carlyle's skill

¹ Ibid., p. 70. [By "this" Olga Marx means Carlyle's expressed preference, quoted above, for his translation of the Wanderjahre.]

² Dowden, Edward. In a letter to Clement K. Shorter: Letters of Edward Dowden and his Correspondents, London, 1914, p. 245.

³ Norton, Charles E. Correspondence between Thomas and Ralph Waldo Emerson, 1834-1872, New York, I, 1894, p. 272.

as a translator shown in his German Romance, as he passed from story to story, is even more difficult to determine than it was in the case of the two parts of Wilhelm Meister. The authors represented in German Romance are so diverse in manner and style that a comparison of Carlyle's translation of them is difficult. All that is possible to do is speculate. It is known, of course, in what order he undertook the several authors; he began with Tieck and ended with Richter.¹ This much is certain: the stories by Hoffmann

¹ From various hints found in Carlyle's letters it is possible to discover the order in which he translated the different authors. The following table will indicate this:

- Oct. 19, 1825: First reference to work on Tieck.--Love Letters, II, p. 173.
- Nov. 4, 1825: Finished Tieck ten days ago.--Ibid., II, p. 188.
- Nov. 4, 1825: Goethe's Märchen more than half done.--Ibid., II, p. 188.
- Nov. 28, 1825: Märchen, Stumme Liebe, Libussa completed.--Ibid., II, p. 194.
- Dec. 11, 1825: Musaeus completed. Out of German books from which selections for translations are to be made.--Ibid., II, p. 200.
- Jan. 7, 1826: All translated material printed. Carlyle out of material. More books ordered from Germany.--Ibid., II, p. 210.
- Feb. 5, 1826: Fouqué completed. Decides on a fourth volume.--Ibid., II, p. 217.
- May 6, 1826: Invoice of books from Germany arrives.--Ibid., II, p. 268.
- May 12, 1826: The books from Germany arrive.--Ibid., II, p. 280.
- May 26, 1826: Work on Hoffmann completed.--Early Letters, II, p. 350.
- July 19, 1826: At work on Richter during last four weeks; to be completed within four days.--Love Letters, II, p. 305.
- Aug. 12, 1826: German Romance completed.--Ibid., II, p. 308.

The following fact may also be noted regarding the

And Richter which Carlyle translated last are more difficult to be read, to understand, and to render, than the early ones by Tieck, Musaeus, and Fouqué. In these later translations Carlyle appeared, if anything, more at ease with the German. A comparison of two representative passages, one from Tieck's The Fair-Haired Eckbert (October, 1825), the other from Richter's Quintus Fixlein (July, 1826) should make this point clear.

Tieck F E, 152

Wir stiegen nun einen Hügel hinan, der mit Birken bepflanzt war, von oben sah man in ein grünes Thal voller Birken hinein, und unten mitten in den Bäumen lag eine kleine Hütte. Ein munteres Bellen kam uns entgegen, und bald sprang ein kleiner behender Hund die Alte an, und wedelte, dann kam er zu mir, besah mich von allen Seiten, und kehrte mit freundlichen Geberden zur Alten zurück.

Als wir vom Hügel hinunter gingen, hörte ich einen wunderbaren Gesang, der aus der Hütte zu kommen schien, wie von einem Vogel, es sang also:

Carlyle, 275:

We now mounted an eminence planted with birch-trees; from the top we looked into a green valley, likewise full of birches; and down below, in the middle of them, was a little hut. A glad barking reached us, and immediately a little nimble dog came springing round the old woman, fawned on her, and wagged its tail; it next came to me, viewed me on all sides, and then turned back with a friendly look to its old mistress.

On reaching the bottom of the hill, I heard the strangest song, as if coming from the hut, and sung by some bird. It ran thus:

place of the Wanderjahre in German Romance: "Carlyle translated Goethe's Wilhelm Meister's Wanderjahre oder die Entsagenden under the title of Wilhelm Meister's Travels or the Renunciants, and it constituted the fourth volume of the original edition of German Romance. Later Goethe made large additions to the book, but Carlyle did not translate the work in its new form, but added his original translation to the Apprenticeship, in the edition of 1839."--Dyer, Isaac W., op. cit., p. 262.

Waldeinsamkeit,
Die mich erfreut,
So morgen wie heut
In ewger Zeit,
O wie mich freut
Waldeinsamkeit.

Alone in wood so gay
'Tis good to stay,
Morrowlike today,
Forever and aye:
O, I do love to stay
Alone in wood so gay.

Diese wenigen Worte wurden beständig wiederholt: wenn ich es beschreiben soll, so war es fast, als wenn Waldhorn und Schallmeie ganz in der Ferne durch einander spielen.

Meine Neugier war ausserordentlich gespannt; ohne dass ich auf den Befehl der Alten wartete, trat ich mit in die Hütte. Die Dämmerung war schon eingebrochen, alles war ordentlich aufgeräumt, einige Becher standen auf einem Wandschranke, Fremdartige Gefässe auf einem Tische, in einem glänzenden Käfig hing ein Vogel an Fenster, und er war es wirklich, der die Worte sang. Die Alte keichte und hustete, sie schien sich gar nicht wieder erholen zu können, bald streichelte sie den kleinen Hund, bald sprach sie mit dem Vogel, der ihr nur mit seinem gewöhnlichen Liede Antwort gab; übrigens that sie gar nicht, als wenn ich zugegen wäre. Indem ich sie so betrachtete, überlief mich mancher Schauer: denn ihr Gesicht war in einer ewigen Bewegung, indem sie dazu wie vor Alter mit dem Kopfe schüttelte, so dass ich durchaus nicht wissen konnte, wie ihr eigentliches Aussehen beschaffen war.

Als sie sich erholt hatte, zündete sie Licht an, deckte einen ganz kleinen Tisch und trug das Abendessen auf. Jetzt sah sie sich nach mir um, und hiess mir einen von den geflochtenen Rohr-

These few words were continually repeated, and to describe the sound, it was as if you heard forest-horns and shalms sounded together from a far distance.

My curiosity was wonderfully on the stretch; without waiting for the old woman's orders, I stept into the hut. It was already dusk; here all was neatly swept and trimmed; some bowls were standing in a cupboard, some strange-looking casks or pots on a table; in a glittering cage, hanging by the window, was a bird, and this in fact proved to be the singer. The old woman coughed and panted: it seemed as if she never would get over her fatigue: she patted the little dog, she talked with the bird, which only answered her with its accustomed song; and for me, she did not seem to recollect that I was there at all. Looking at her so, many qualms and fears came over me; for her face was in perpetual motion; and, besides, her head shook from old age, so that, for my life, I could not understand what sort of countenance she had.

Having gathered strength again, she lit a candle, covered a very small table, and brought out supper. She now looked round for me, and bade me take a little cane-chair. I was thus sitting close fronting her, with the light between us. She folded her

stühlen nehmen. So sass ich ihr nun dict gegenüber und das Licht stand zwischen uns. Sie faltete ihre knöchernen Hände und betete laut, indem sie ihre Gesichtsverzerrungen machte, so dass es mich beinahe wieder zu Lachen gebracht hätte; aber ich nahm mich sehr in Acht, um sie nicht zu erbösen.¹

Richter, Q F, 122:

An sich war die Predigt gut und herrlich und der Tag ein rechter Wonnetag; aber ich musste überhaupt mehr Stunden übrig haben, als ich dem Maie abstehe, worin ich jetzt lebe und schreibe, und mehr Kräfte, als mir die Lustfahrten durch schöne Tage zu den Landschaftsgemälden derselben frei lassen, wenn ich mit einiger Hoffnung es versuchen wollte, von der Länge und Dicke der Saiten und ihren Vibrationen und den konsonen Verhältnissen derselben unter einander, die an jenem Posttrinitatis seinen Herzohren eine Sphärenmusik machten, einen mathematischen Bericht abzustatten, der mir so sehr gefiele wie anders Man verlang' es nicht! Ick denke, wenn ein Mann an einem Sonntage vor allen Fröhnern, die ihn sonst als den Kunstgärtners-Buben auf dem Arm hatten, ferner

bony hands, and prayed aloud, still twisting her countenance, so that I was once more on the point of laughing; but I took strict care that I might not make her angry.¹

Carlyle, 265:

In itself the sermon was good and glorious; and the day a rich day of pleasure; but I should really need to have more hours at my disposal than I can steal from May, in which I am at present living and writing; and more strength than wandering through this fine weather has left me for landscape pictures of the same, before I could attempt, with any wellfounded hope, to draw out a mathematical estimate of the length and thickness, and the vibrations and accordant relations to each other, of the various strings, which combined together to form for his heart a Music of the Spheres, on this day of Trinity-term, though such a thing would please myself as much as another Do not ask me! In my opinion, when a man preaches on Sunday before all the peasants, who had carried him in their arms when a gardener's

¹ From "Der blonde Eckbert," Ludwig Tieck's Schriften, Vierter Band, Phantasia, Berlin, 1828, Seite 152.

¹ From "The Fair-Haired Eckbert," German Romance, I, New York, 1899, p. 275.

vor seiner Mutter, die ihre seelige Zerfließung in die Gasse des Sammt-Muffs ableitet, ferner vor seinem gnädigen Herrn, dem er geradezu befehlen kann, seeling zu werden, und endlich vor seiner mousselinenen Braut, die schon seelig ist, weil sie fast zu Stein darüber wird, dass dieselben Lippen küssen und predigen können, ich denke, sagt' ich, wenn ein Mann das leistet: so hat er wohl einiges Recht, vom Biographen, der seinen Zustand schildern will, zu begehren, dass er das--Maul halte, und vom Leser, der solchen nachempfinden will, dass er seines aufmache und selber predige.--

Aber was ich ex officio malen muss, ist der Tag, wozu der Sonntag nur der Vorschabbes, die Vigilie und das Voressen war--nämlich der Vorschabbes, die Vigilie und das Voressen vor dem Martini-Aktus. Am Sonntag hielt er die Predigt, am Mittwoch den Aktus, und am Dienstag die Probe.¹

boy; farther, before his mother, who is leading off her tears through the conduit of her satin muff; farther, before his Lordship, whom he can positively command to be blessed; and finally, before his muslim bride, who is already blessed, and changing almost into stone, to find that the same lips can both kiss and preach: in my opinion, I say, when a man effects all this, he has some right to require of any Biographer who would paint his situation, that he--hold his jaw; and of the reader who would sympathise with it, that he open his, and preach himself.--

But what I must ex officio depict, is the day to which this Sunday was but the prelude, the vigil and the whet; I mean the prelude, the vigil and the whet to the Martini Actus, or Martinmas Exhibition, of his school. On Sunday was the Sermon, on Wednesday the Actus, on Tuesday the Rehearsal. This Tuesday shall now be delineated to the universe.¹

It is obvious that the passage from Richter, which is later than the one from Tieck, is the more difficult of the two passages and that Carlyle renders it with equal if not greater ease. Furthermore, it is not without significance that he chose the earlier German to begin on and progressed toward the more difficult. Common sense suggests that he

¹ From "Leben des Quintus Fixlein" in Jean Pauls Sämtliche Werke, Fünfter Bd., von Eduard Berend, Weimar, 1930, p. 122.

¹ Carlyle, Thomas. From "Life of Quintus Fixlein" in German Romance, II, New York, 1899, p. 266

must have gained steadily as a translator. One feels that he did, yet any conclusive evidence of the extent to which he gained is, as already suggested, difficult to get.

CHAPTER IX

Conclusion

A brief survey of this study will not be amiss. It has been indicated that the introduction of German literature into England had its true beginning about 1750. A slow movement at first, it quickened surprisingly near the close of the century, and reached the point of its greatest activity in the twenties of the century following. It was in this third decade of the new century that Carlyle became interested in German thought and, subsequently, became the foremost figure¹ among those who had a share in making the English public better acquainted with German literature, German thought, and German life.²

¹ "Zunächst hat Carlyle das grosse verdienst, die deutsche literatur in England bekannt gemacht zu haben. Er ist nicht der erste interpret deutscher dichtung und philosophie in England--William Taylor, 'Monk' Lewis, Walter Scott, Henry Crabb Robinson, Coleridge und De Quincey gingen ihm voraus--aber er ist der tiefste und wirksamste unter den entdeckern des geistigen Deutschlands in England, er ist namentlich der erste der Goethes grösse erkannt hat."--Aronstein, Phil. Discussion, "F. W. Roe's Thomas Carlyle as a Critic of Literature," Anglia: Beiblatt, Band XXII, Jan. 1911, p. 16.

[Aronstein does not capitalize German nouns.]

² "The issue of all was a religion profound and true, a religion of things 'known for certain,' yet absolutely divorced from all creeds, independent of all churches; certain, just because it was personal

"This was the religion essential to Carlyle, here lay the secret of his spiritual salvation, this was the German he introduced into English literature

Carlyle's natural abilities, augmented by an ardent enthusiasm for language and literature and by an affluent versatility in his own tongue, fitted him almost uniquely for work of translation. His first efforts of this nature consisted of the rendering of scientific articles from the French. From this work he turned to translations from German. Aside from innumerable shorter passages scattered throughout his original work, his greatest achievements in rendering German were Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, completed in 1824, and German Romance, in 1826. The latter, being the last of his major translations, has been made the subject of the present study.

The first four chapters of the study are, to a degree, merely introductory. It is the later chapters which concern themselves specifically with German Romance. In these chapters are set forth, in some illustrative detail, the actual accomplishment of Carlyle in his translation of the German romances. In Chapter V, for example, are pointed out numerous inaccuracies appearing in German Romance, through the medium of selected passages, from the originals, and from

"It was this enlarged idea of religion, a religion not of the first century, or of the sixteenth, but of the nineteenth, that Carlyle absorbed into himself. To transmit this from Germany to England, to convince the English mind that there is an alternative to the garb of Hebrew old-clothes on the one hand, and the nakedness of atheism on the other, was the main part of his function in literature. It was thus that he interpreted the mind of Germany."--Walker, Hugh, op. cit., p. 48.

Carlyle's translations of these passages. These inaccuracies vary considerably in degrees of seriousness, but are all of a type which can hardly be regarded as excusable. Some of these are definite errors, such as the rendering of "Mittwoch" by "Thursday"; others are merely inexactnesses, such as the translation of "das schönste Mädchen" as "the finest woman." Furthermore, passages are cited showing many awkwardnesses, unnecessarily periphrastic renditions, unwarranted additions, alterations, and omissions--even whimsical translations--none of which can be justified. Some attention is also given to occasional liberties which Carlyle took with both the metre and the meaning in translating much of the verse appearing in the romances. It should be said, however, in justice to Carlyle, that in proportion to the mass of the whole of German Romance the sum total of the inexcusable errors is appreciably small.

While Chapter V concerns itself with the number of flaws in the translation which are not excusable, Chapter VI presents a considerable number of passages which to some may seem objectionable in one way or another, but which, to the author of this study, seem at the very worst excusable. Because there appears to be an approximate justification for the latter, they are regarded as "apparent" rather than "actual" faults. Many of these are in the form of slight additions not found in the originals--such as antecedents, parenthetical elements, and the insertion of the original

German with the English translation, all employed largely for the purpose of explaining and emphasizing words and ideas. For example, "der Landfriede" Carlyle renders "the Landfried (or Act for Suppressing Private Wars)"; and where Richter wrote "Gute Fürsten bekommen leicht gute Unterthanen (nicht so leicht diese jene)," Carlyle wrote "Good princes easily obtain good subjects; not so easily good subjects good princes." Furthermore, there are numerous softenings, and even entire omissions, of passages the original substance of which Carlyle thought, perhaps warrantably, too coarse for English taste. A few illustrations are also given of approximate translations rather than exact ones, apparently the nearest approach possible for Carlyle because just the right words for the meaning are not found in the English language. Finally, a small number of Germanisms are cited from the translation, which appear to have been deliberately set down by Carlyle, the writer believes, merely to show English people the strangeness of German idiom. Passages from the translation are given illustrating each of the several types of excusable faults referred to.

In Chapter VII a number of passages are cited illustrating various strong features of Carlyle's translation. Some of these passages show his general fidelity to idiom and faithful attention to linguistic details. Qualifying adjectives and adverbs rarely escaped him.

Others of the selections illustrate his effective rendering into English of German idiomatic or epigrammatic expressions. For example, in Musaeus's Dumb Love appears the proverbial admonition "Fremdling, trau keinem Wirte, der den Schalk im Schilde führt"; this Carlyle happily renders "Stranger, trust no inn-keeper who is a Turk in the grain." Illustrations are also given of rather cumbersome passages, appearing in the German, translated by Carlyle into free but effective English with practically no loss of the original meaning. Finally, there are quoted some examples of Carlyle's successful handling of the very long sentences characteristic of some of the writers of the romances. Occasionally, he broke these sentences into several parts; more often, however, he left them intact, but resolved them into English possessing strength and elegance equal to that which originally distinguished them in the German.

Chapter VIII contains a brief discussion of the question whether, in the course of his translating, Carlyle gained noticeably in power as a translator. Common sense, of course, will suggest such growth as being natural and inevitable. Actual evidence, however, sufficient to formulate any definite conclusion, cannot be gathered. The styles of the six story tellers represented are so dissimilar that any effort to trace a growth in the skill of one translating their works is almost impossible. Furthermore, no two stories from any one author excepting Goethe were

translated by Carlyle at periods sufficiently far removed one from the other to make a comparison of renditions of similar materials possible. Attention is called to the fact that Olga Marx, in her study of the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and of Wilhelm Meister's Travels, found that, in the excellence of the translations, the latter of 1826 surpassed the former which was done two years earlier. It was noted, too, that Carlyle appears to have translated the more difficult stories by Hoffmann and Richter, the last of the authors undertaken, with even greater ease than the simple, straightforward narrative by Tieck which he did first.

Upon considering somewhat critically the translation of German Romance as a whole, one arrives at certain fairly definite conclusions regarding the faults and merits of Carlyle as a translator. First, it is discovered that many of the innumerable minor flaws, as well as a few errors of greater magnitude, may, in the main, be attributable to certain definite causes. Among these should be mentioned (1) Carlyle's inadequate familiarity with the German language and the German spirit, because of his limited study of German and because of his lack of contact with German environment; (2) the intolerable strain of literary work, performed with clock-like precision, regardless of health and an enduring inclination to do something better; and (3) a certain Puritan attitude inherent both with

him and his English public, which made portions of the original text unpleasant to render. Second, many of the "apparent" faults--so-called because of an obvious violation of the law of fidelity, as well as of other laws--are often not only excusable but even commendable. Many of the brief additions, condensations, and other alterations made in the process of rendering, are sufficiently advantageous to permit their being designated as merits rather than demerits. Particularly is this true of the softening of occasional passages concerned with the terminology of passion. The same comment will hold with reference to the complete omission of such passages. For the most part, these are vulgar and offensive. Third, many of the Germanisms scattered throughout the pages of German Romance may be looked upon, in part, as showing a specific influence which Carlyle's constant nearness to his original had upon him; to a higher degree, however, as already intimated, they should be regarded as an indication of Carlyle's eagerness to give to his English readers an adequate impression of German idiom and of the synthetic character of the German language in general. Fourth, certain translated passages which show a failure to give the exact substance and spirit of the original will, upon careful study, be found to represent as accurate a rendition as is possible in the light of language limitations.

Finally, on balance, the occasional errors and the

more frequent inaccuracies in this translation are found to be vastly outweighed, in importance, by certain undeniable merits. Of these at least two are significant.

(1) Carlyle showed a constant fidelity to idiom and an attention to minute linguistic details which is surprising. At the same time, although stilted and artificial literalness ordinarily results from such servile procedure, the translator has generally reproduced the original to an English characterized by ease, charm, and force. When one considers the torments brought on by moods of profound depression, arising from a wretched state of chronic dyspepsia, the crushed ambition for higher ideals, and a certain spiritual restlessness, the accuracy and elegance of Carlyle's translation becomes even more laudable. (2) As a medium for introducing English readers to some better specimens of German literature and the German spirit, the translation was distinctly beneficial. But a few years before, many of the commentators writing in the Journals were still hostile, or, at least lukewarm, in their attitude towards German literature. In 1829, just two years after the publication of German Romance, a writer in the Gentleman's Magazine has this to say: "Germany has but lately been regarded as a literary country, but it has already attained a high station, and bids fair vigorously to maintain it. Its authors are distinguished for a spirit of originality which renders them peculiarly worthy of

translation."¹ He then goes on to express regret that but "very few German authors are in English dress," and concludes the paragraph by saying: "We are accustomed to hear German literature spoken of as something worthy of study and admiration, although but of such recent growth."² Unquestionably, Carlyle's part in bringing about this changed attitude in England was considerable.

It is deplorable, of course, that the nature of the material with which Carlyle had to work was not always such as would excite his enthusiasm; for, certainly, some of the unanimated passages in the translation would have been better done had there not been an occasional lack of sympathy with certain of the authors. It is also to be regretted that Carlyle did not take the time to make certain very necessary revisions in his work before he submitted it to the press. Had he gone over it once more critically, after he had been away from the original material for some time, many passages would unquestionably have been better finished.³

¹ Gentleman's Magazine, 1829, Pt. I, CXLV, p. 308.

² Ibid., p. 308.

³ "The final revision of a translation for the press should certainly not begin until the words of the original have entirely faded from the mind of the translator, and then the revision should be finished without once recurring to that original."--The Nation, Dec. 4, 1879, XXIX, p. 387.

Unfortunately for the reception of German Romance in England, four similar collections of German stories in translation--those by Roscoe, Soane, Holcraft, and Gillies--came out in the same year, 1826, in which Carlyle completed his. "Tait, finding himself anticipated by the appearance of four similar collections already that year," writes Emery Neff, "was postponing the issue of German Romance, printed by the ill-omened Ballantyne and Company, into 1827 in the hope of 'better times.' He was doing what he could to give an impression of sensational contents by woodcuts prefixed to each volume, such as that of a hunchback telling a knight in armor a dreadful secret that makes him mop his brow. Even the philosophic Meister's Travels was illustrated by a peasant with a laden donkey discovering a beautiful young woman swooning or asleep in the midst of rugged and desolate mountains."¹ The work did not have the circulation which it merited, and additional efforts to increase its sales did not meet with success.² The eagerness for German material seems to have begun to wane, and when Carlyle offers, in 1833, to write a history of German literature, he is given definitely to understand

¹ Neff, Emery, op. cit., p. 89.

² "Despite Tait's efforts, it was selling badly and would probably yield no more. London publishers were as unresponsive to overtures as those in Edinburgh."--Ibid., p. 90.

that such work is not wanted.¹

On the whole, according to accepted standards, the translation German Romance possesses many of the distinct qualities requisite for good literature. An excellent appraisal of all of Carlyle's translations from the German appeared in Fraser's Magazine in 1833. In it the writer, Dr. Maginn, says that "Carlyle hath bestowed upon us the Wilhelm Meister, and other works, so Teutonical in raiment, in the structure of sentence, the modulation of style that it is with difficulty we can recognize them to be translations at all."² To one familiar with the

¹ "Tait, whose fingers had been burnt by German Romance, gave a firm refusal: 'Every one of the books on German literature has been a failure; most of them ruinously losing concerns. The feeling in the public mind is that anything German is most especially to be avoided As to a collection of your pieces in the Reviews, etc., I am quite clear that such a thing should not be attempted'." --Ibid., p. 113.

² "Over-set Goethe hath Carlyle, not in the ordinary manner of language-turners, who content themselves with giving, according to the capacity of knowingness or honesty within them, the meaning or the idea (if any there be) of the original bookfashioner, on whom their second-hand-pennomgery is employed; but with reverential thought, work-worshipping even the articulable clothing wherein the clear and ethereal harmony of Goethe is invested, Carlyle hath bestowed upon us the Wilhelm Meister, and other works, so Teutonical in raiment, in the structure of sentence, the modulation of phrase and the roundabout, hubble-bubble, rumpustianish (hübble-bübblen rümfüstianischen) roly-poly growlery of style, so Germanically set forth, that it is with difficulty we can recognize them to be translations at all." [This was written by the famous Dr. Maginn in June, 1833, for Fraser's Magazine in 'Gallery of Literary Character.']--Quoted by Shepherd, R. H., op. cit., p. 120.

German idiom it is apparent that frequently Carlyle did not merely render the words of German into English, but rather that his translation represents a reincarnation, so to speak, of the life, the power, and the spirit of the original in the English tongue; and the emotions and sentiments which the translation aroused in the English reader must often have been identical with those aroused in a native of Germany when reading the original.¹

What, finally, is the worth of Carlyle's accomplishment in German Romance? Considered in the large, Carlyle's translations of the twelve² German tales strike one as noteworthy. Carlyle took in hand a body of fictional material, some of it excellent, but some of it also maudlin and sentimental, and rendered it into readable English which conveys the meaning and suggests the color of the original writing. He grappled successfully with numerous obscure passages and difficult idioms and made them intelligible to the readers of his book. He took a few liberties in rendering the material but showed marked restraint in curbing his natural bent toward originality in expression. He was guilty of numerous inaccuracies and slight changes in meaning, to be sure; but most of these

¹ "I would therefore describe a good translation to be, that, in which the merit of the original work is so completely transfused into another language, as to be as distinctly apprehended, and as strongly felt, by a native of the country to which that language belongs, as it is by those who speak the language of the original work."--Tytler, A. F., op. cit., p. 8

² Since Goethe's Wilhelm Meister's Travels is omitted

were too inconsequential to count against him, and not a few of his departures from literality were distinctly happy. Perhaps most important of all, he was constantly regardful of the spirit of the German language and took care that something of the genius of that language might show through his English. Indeed, it may be said unreservedly that, on the whole, Carlyle showed a high degree of accuracy in rendering into English not only the substance of the original but also the style and the spirit. Readers of Carlyle's translation will be given a very fair and honest presentation of the literary merits variously characterizing the German originals. The body of translations, in short, represents one of the most solid and commendable achievements of Carlyle's young manhood.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Works on Translating

- Arnold, Matthew. "On Translating Homer," in Essays in Criticism, New York, 1880.
- Conley, C. H. The First English Translators of the Classics, New Haven, Yale Press, 1927.
- Croce, Benedetto. Aesthetic. Translated from Italian by Douglas Ainslie. London, 1909.
- Cauer, Paul. Die Kunst des Uebersetzens, Berlin, 1894.
- Phillimore, J. S. Some Remarks on Translation and Translators, English Association, Pamphlet, No. 42, Jan. 1919.
- Posnett, Hutcheson Macaulay. Comparative Literature, London, 1886.
- Postgate, J. P. Translation and Translations--Theory and Practice, London, 1922.
- Tolman, H. C. The Art of Translating with Special Reference to Cauer's "Die Kunst des Uebersetzens", Boston, 1901.
- Tytler, Alexander Fraser, Lord Woodhouselee. Essay on the Principles of Translation, London, 1813.

Works on the Introduction of German Literature into England and America

- Beers, Henry A. "The German Tributary," in A History of English Romanticism in the Eighteenth Century, New York, 1899, pp. 374-424.
- Brandl, Alois. "Die Aufnahme von Goethes Jugendwerken in England," in Goethe-Jahrbuch, Band III, 1882, Seite 27-76.
- Faust, Albert Bernhardt. The German Element in the United States, Boston, 1909, Vol. II, pp. 338-360.

- Geissendörfer, T. "Carlyle and Jean Paul Richter," in Journal of English and Germanic Philology, Vol. XXV, 1926, pp. 540-553.
- Goodnight, Scott Holland. "German Literature in American Magazines Prior to 1846," in University of Wisconsin, Philology and Literature Series, Vol. IV, 1908, pp. 3-108.
- Hager, Hermann. Review of "K. H. Schaible's 'Geschichte der Deutschen in England,'" in Englische Studien, Vol. X, Heilbronn, 1887, pp. 440-455.
- Haney, John Louis. "German Literature in England before 1790," in Americana Germanica, Vol. IV, 1902, pp. 130-154.
- Herford, C. H. Studies in the Literary Relations of England and Germany in the sixteenth century, London, 1886.
- Herzfeld, Georg. "William Taylor von Norwich," in Studien zur Englischen Philologie, Heft, II, Halle, 1897, pp. 1-69.
- Morgan, Bayard Quincy. "A Bibliography of German Literature in English Translation," in University of Wisconsin Studies in Language and Literature, Number 16, Madison, 1922, pp. 8-154.
- Perry, Thomas Sergeant. "German Influence in English Literature," in Atlantic Monthly, Vol. XL, Aug. 1877, pp. 129-147.
- Stephen, Leslie. "The Importation of German," in Studies of a Biographer, London, 1898, Vol. II, pp. 38-75.
- Stockley, Violet A. A. German Literature as Known in England, 1750-1830, London, 1929.
- Stokoe, Frank Woodyer, German Influence in the English Romantic Period, London, 1926.
- Zeydel, Edwin H. Ludwig Tieck and England: A Study in the Literary Relations of Germany and England During the Early Nineteenth Century, Cincinnati, 1931.

Primary Sources

- Boylan, R. Dillon. Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship, London, 1910.

- Carlyle, Alexander. The Love Letters of Thomas Carlyle and Jane Welsh, two volumes, London, 1909.
- Carlyle, Thomas. Critical and Miscellaneous Essays, in five volumes, London, 1899.
-, "Essays," in The Modern British Essayists, Philadelphia, 1852.
-, Montaigne and Other Essays, with Foreword by S. R. Crockett, London, 1897.
-, Reminiscences, edited by James Anthony Froude, New York, 1881.
-, Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels, Vol. II, London, 1897.
-, German Romance, two volumes, New York, 1899.
-, German Romance, Specimens of its Chief Authors with Biographical and Critical Notices. By the translator of Wilhelm Meister and Author of the Life of Schiller. In four volumes, Edinburgh, 1827.
- Fouqué, Friedrich Heinrich Karl de la Motte, Baron, Die Jahreszeiten, Berlin, 1814.
- Glencross, Thomas Orr. The Best of Carlyle, London, 1923.
- Goethe, Johann W. "Das Märchen" and "Novelle," in Goethe's Sämtliche Werke, Jubiläums-Ausgabe, Stuttgart und Berlin, 1902, Vol. 16.
-, "Meisters Wanderjahre," in Goethes Sämtliche Werke, Jubiläums-Ausgabe, Stuttgart und Berlin, 1902, Vol. 19 and 20.
- Hoffmann, Ernst Theodor Wilhelm. "Phantasiestücke in Callot's Manier," in E. T. A. Hoffmann's gesammelte Schriften, siebenter Band, Berlin, 1873.
- Musaeus, Johann Karl August. Volksmärchen der Deutschen, herausgegeben von Paul Zaunert, Zwei Bände, Jena, 1927.
- Norton, Charles Eliot. Correspondence between Goethe and Carlyle, London, 1887.
-, Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and Ralph Waldo Emerson, 1834-1872, two volumes, New York, 1894.

-, Early Letters of Thomas Carlyle, two volumes, London, 1886.
- Pröhle, Dr. H. "Ahringer, Musaeus, Müller von Itzehoe. In einer Auswahl aus ihren Werken im Anschluss an Wielands Werke," in Deutsche National-Litteratur, 57. Band, Berlin und Stuttgart, 1888.
- Richter, Johann Paul Friedrich. Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke, Historisch-kritische Ausgabe, herausgegeben von Edward Berend, Weimar, 1930.
-, Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke, Dritte vermehrte Auflage, Sechszwanzigster Band, Berlin, 1862.
- Tieck, Johann Ludwig. Ludwig Tieck's Schriften, Vierter Band, Berlin, 1828.
- Traill, H. D. Introduction to Thomas Carlyle's translation from Goethe, entitled Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship and Travels, two volumes, New York, 1899.
-, Introduction to Thomas Carlyle's The Life of Friederich Schiller, London, 1899.
- Wieland, Christoph Martin. Johann Karl August Musaeus, 'Die deutsche Volksmärchen,' Gotha, 1804-1805.

Works about Carlyle

Books:

- Cazamian, Louis. Carlyle, New York, 1932.
- Craig, R. S. The Making of Carlyle, London, 1908.
- Dunn, Waldo H. Froude and Carlyle, London, 1930.
- Dyer, Isaac Watson. A Bibliography of Thomas Carlyle, Portland, Maine, 1928.
- Froude, James Anthony. Thomas Carlyle, A History of the First Forty Years of his Life, two volumes in one, New York, 1882.
-, Thomas Carlyle, A History of His Life in London, two volumes in one, New York, 1895.
- Johnson, William Savage. Thomas Carlyle--A Study of His Literary Apprenticeship, 1814-1831, New Haven, 1911.

- Nichol, John. Thomas Carlyle, London, 1892.
- Neff, Emery. Carlyle, New York, 1932.
- Ralli, Augustus. Guide to Carlyle, Boston, 1922.
- Roe, Frederick William. Thomas Carlyle as a Critic of Literature, New York, 1910.
- Shepherd, Richard Herne. Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Thomas Carlyle, Vol. I, 1795-1846. London, 1881.
- Young, Norwood. Carlyle, His Rise and Fall, London, 1927.
- Warner, Percy. Thomas Carlyle, the Man and His Influence, London, 1904.
- Weddigen, Dr. F. H. Otto. Geschichte der Einwirkung der deutschen Litteratur, Leipzig, 1882.
- Wilson, David A. The Life of Thomas Carlyle, Vols. I and II, New York, 1923.
- Wylie, William Howie. Thomas Carlyle: The Man and his Books, London, 1909.

Works about Carlyle

Articles

- Burnett, Percy B. "The Language of Carlyle as Affected by the German," in Publications of the Modern Language Association, Vol. XI, 1896.
- Durand, Walter Y. "De Quincey and Carlyle in Their Relation to the Germans," in Publications of the Modern Language Association, Vol. XXII, 1907.
- Hohlfeld, A. R. "The Poems in Carlyle's Translation of Wilhelm Meister," in Modern Language Notes, Vol. XXXVI, April, 1921.
- Kräger, Heinrich. "Carlyles Deutsche Studien und der 'Wotton Reinfred,'" in Anglia, Beiblatt, Band IX, Nov.-Dec., 1898.
-, "Carlyles Stellung zur Deutschen Sprache und Litteratur," in Anglia, Neue Folge, Band X, 1899.
- Krummacher, M. "Notizen über den Sprachgebrauch Carlyles," in Englische Studien, Band VI, 1883.

-, "Englische Sprache und Stil in Carlyles 'Frederick II,'" in Englische Studien, Band XII, 1888.
- McMahon, James. "Carlyle's Translation of Legendre's Geometry," in The Nation, Vol. 99, August 20, 1914.
- Mott, Frank Luther. "Carlyle's American Public," in Philological Quarterly, Vol. IV, 1925.
- Paget, Violet. (Pseu., Vernon Lee) "Carlyle and the Present Tense," in The Handling of Words, London, 1923.
- Thompson, Frank T. "Emerson and Carlyle," in Studies in Philology, University of North Carolina, Vol. 24, 1927.
- Trevelyan, G. M. "Carlyle's Lapse into Germanism," in Current Opinion, Vol. 65, October, 1918.
- Vaughan, C. E. "Carlyle and His German Masters," in Essays and Studies, collected by A. C. Bradley, Oxford, 1910.
- Walker, Hugh. "The German Influence: Thomas Carlyle," in Literature of the Victorian Era, London, 1910.
- Wilkins, F. H. "Early Influences of German Literature in America," in Americana-Germanica, Vol. III, Philadelphia, 1899.
- Zeiger, Theodor. "Die Deutsche Litteratur in England am Schlusse des 18. und Anfang des 19. Jahrhunderts," in Studien zur vergleichenden Litteraturgeschichte, Erster Band, Berlin, 1901.

Other Works Consulted

Books:

- Ahlwardt, Christian Wilhelm. Die Gedichte Ossians aus dem Gälischen, Leipzig, 1861.
- Berzelius, J. J. Lehrbuch der Chemie, Vierte verbesserte Original-Auflage, Dresden, 1835.
- Brandes, Georg. Goethe, Berlin, 1922.
- Brandl, Alois. Samuel Taylor Coleridge and the English Romantic School, London, 1887.
- Breul, Karl. Heath's German and English Dictionary, Chicago, 1906.

- British Museum Catalogue of Printed Books, London, 1890.
- Darbishire, H. De Quincey's Literary Criticism, London, 1909.
- De Quincey, Thomas. The Collected Works of Thomas De Quincey, Edited by David Masson, London, 1897.
- Dowden, Edward. Studies in Literature, 1789-1877, London, 1909.
-, Letters of Edward Dowden and his Correspondents, London, 1914.
- Elton, Oliver. A Survey of English Literature, 1780-1830, Vol. I, London, 1912.
- Gillies, Robert Pearse. German Stories, three volumes, London, 1826.
- Haskell, Juliana. Bayard Taylor's Translation of Goethe's Faust, New York, 1908.
- Hedge, Frederich H. Prose Writers of Germany, Philadelphia, 1849.
- Hogg, James. De Quincey and His Friends, London, 1895.
- Holcraft, Richard. Tales of Humour and Romance, London, 1829.
- Howe, Susenna. Wilhelm Meister and His English Kinsmen, New York, 1930.
- Japp, Alexander Hay. German Life and Literature, London, 1878.
- Johnson, William Savage. Carlyle's 'Sartor Resartus', Chicago, 1924.
- Kayser, Christian Gottlob. Neues Bücher-Lexicon, Leipzig, 1841.
- Köhler, Dr. Friedrich. Handwörterbuch der englischen und deutschen Sprache, Leipzig, 1907.
- Marx, Olga. Carlyle's Translation of Wilhelm Meister, Baltimore, 1926.
- Muret-Sanders. Enzyklopädisches Wörterbuch der Englischen und Deutschen Sprache (Grosse Ausgabe), Berlin, 1905.

- New English Dictionary. Edited by James A. H. Murray, Oxford, 1888.
- Prehn, August. A Practical Guide to a Scientific Study of the German Vocabulary, New York, 1913.
- Price, Lawrence Marsden. The Reception of English Literature in Germany, Berkeley, 1932.
- Roscoe, Thomas. The German Novelists, London, 1826.
- Soane, G. Specimens of German Romance, London, 1826.
- Webster's New International Dictionary, Springfield, Mass., 1932.
- Witkowski, Dr. Georg. German Drama of the Nineteenth Century, New York, 1909.

Other Works Consulted

Articles:

- Aronstein, Phil. "F. W. Roe's Thomas Carlyle as a Critic of Literature," in Anglia, Beiblatt, Band XXII, Jan., 1911.
- Dunstan, A. C. "The German Influence on Coleridge," in Modern Language Review, Vol. XVII, July, 1922, and Vol. XVIII, April, 1923.
- Long, O. W. "English Translations of Goethe's Werther," in Journal of English-Germanic Philology, Vol. XIV, 1915.
- Muir, John. "Addition to Carlyle Bibliography," in Notes and Queries, Eighth s., Vol. IV, July-Dec., 1893.
- Pniower, Otto. "Eingang zum Aufsatz zu Goethes Wortgebrauch," in Goethe-Jahrbuch, Band 19, 1898.
- Schmeding, Dr. Otto. "Ueber Wortbildung bei Carlyle," in Studien der Englischen Philologie, Hefte V-VII, 1900.
- Viotor, W. "Die älteste Deutsch-Englische und Englisch-Deutsche Grammatik (1686-7)," in Englische Studien, Band X, Heilbronn, 1887.

English Periodicals between
1750-1830

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1815-

British Critic, 1793-1826.

Edinburgh Review, 1802-

Gentleman's Magazine, 1750-

APPENDIX

APPENDIX

The statements given in connection with the texts listed below are intended as evidence that such texts are either those on which Carlyle based his translation, or are fairly representative of them.

A. J. K. A. Musaeus Volksmärchen der Deutschen, herausgegeben von Paul Zaunert, Jena, 1927.

The Volksmärchen by Musaeus were first published in five volumes during the years from 1782 to 1787. These first issues had, of course, no editor, in the ordinary sense of the term. In these five volumes "Libussa" formed the first story of the third volume, published in 1784; "Stumme Liebe," the first story of the fourth volume, published in 1786; and "Melechsala" the first story of the fifth volume, published in 1787. Repeated efforts were made to secure copies of this edition for the present study, but without success.

In 1804-5 Christoph Martin Wieland prepared a new edition of these volumes of the Volksmärchen.¹ In it he declares himself to have made certain slight changes in the text as originally written by Musaeus. These changes,

¹ "Wieland gab diese Märchen denn auch 1804 und 1805 vom neuem heraus."--Poritsky, J. E. Musaeus Volksmärchen der Deutschen, Berlin, 1920, I, p. 18.

for the most part, he tells us, were made in the mechanical and the grammatical elements of the style. For example, he says he made some minor changes in connections with inaccurate syntax and in the abundance of dispensable foreign words.¹ He also admits having softened certain expressions which he feared might offend people of a refined taste. Finally, he says that he undertook some improvements in the

¹ "Was die für nötig erachtete Revision betreffe, so würde mir leid sein, wenn sich jemand anmassen wollte, an einem so genialischen Werke vieles ändern und meistern zu wollen . . . kurz, ausser gewissen ziemlich häufigen Nachlässigkeiten in der Schreibart wusste ich wenig oder nichts, was ich an diesen Volksmärchen verändert sehen möchte . . . Das grösste Verdienst (wenn es anders diese Benennung verdient), so ich mir um dieses unterhaltende Lesebuch gemacht habe, betrifft meistens bloss das Mechanische und Grammatische der Schreibart, z. B., unrichtige Wortfügungen, allezu häufige entbehrliche fremde Wörter, mitunter auch wohl niedrig-possierliche Ausdrücke, die einem geläutertem Geschmack hätten anstössig sein können, und was dergleichen mehr ist, besonders die richtige Setzung der Unterscheidungszeichen und eine unendliche Menge von Kommas und Semikolons, welche, wo sie nicht hingehörten, weggestrichen, oder wo sie unentbehrlich schienen, beigefügt werden mussten--wiewohl mir bei aller angewandten Sorgfalt manches noch entgangen sein mag. Unter die Eigenheiten der Manier des Verfassers rechne ich vornehmlich die vielen und beinahe zu häufigen Anspielungen und Stiche auf längst vergessene litterarische Produkte und Schriftsteller jener Zeit oder auf kleine Begebenheiten und Anekdoten, die damals Jedermann bekannt waren, jetzt aber ohne einen Kommentar manchem Leser rätselhaft sein müssen. Unglücklicherweise bin ich in der Geschichte der elenden Skribenten meiner Zeit schlecht bewandert . . . Zu meinem Bedauern musste ich also manche Stelle, die einer Erläuterung bedurft hätte, unberührt vorübergehen; überall aber, wo mir mein Gedächtnis zu Hilfe kam, habe ich die zu bessern Verständnis dienlichen Anmerkungen beizufügen nicht ermangelt."--Wieland, Christoph Martin. Johann Karl August Musaeus, 'Die deutsche Volksmärchen,' Gotha, 1804-1805, Einleitung, s. 4. Also given in Deutsche National Litteratur, LVII, p. 159.

punctuation, particularly as it applied to the use of commas and semicolons.

The possibility is obvious that, in making his translation, Carlyle may have used either the edition of 1782-1787, or that of 1804-1805; which of the two it was, or whether it was neither, Carlyle nowhere specified. This uncertainty became a problem in the present study. It was hoped that a comparison of Carlyle's translation with the two editions just referred to might show the one to run more parallel with the translation than the other, and so lead to a proof as to which of the two Carlyle used as his original. A difference in the two editions, (1782-1787 and 1804-1805), was anticipated especially since Wieland declared himself to have made numerous changes in his work, that of 1804-1805.

The desired comparison could not be easily made since only the Wieland edition, that of 1804-1805, was available; that of 1782-1787, as already stated, could not be found.

Fortunately, however, there appeared recently an exact reprint of it.¹ This is in the form of a two volume work edited by Paul Zaubert, entitled J. K. A. Musaeus Volksmärchen der Deutschen, and published at Jena, 1927. The

¹ "Der Text der 'Volksmärchen,' wie er in folgendem sich bietet, geht wieder auf die erste Ausgabe (1782-87) zurück, die einzige, die ganz von Musaeus hand ist."--Zaubert, Paul. Editor of Musaeus Volksmärchen der Deutschen, Einleitung des Herausgebers, I, p. xii.

two texts, that of 1804-1805 and this by Zaunert of 1927, were then compared, first with Carlyle's translation, and afterwards each with the other. The comparison revealed that Wieland's and Zaunert's editions were almost identical and that Wieland's purported changes were of but very little consequence. Omissions and alterations in the interest of refinement and good taste, such as Wieland declared himself to have made, were but slightly in evidence. No fact could be established as to which of the two editions Carlyle used as his original, and the possibility remained that he may have used either. The greater likelihood, however, is that he used the earlier (1782-1787), that with no other editor than Musaeus himself. It was thought advisable, therefore, to use Zaunert's edition, which, as already stated, is an accurate reprint of that of 1782-1787.

B. Fouque, Friedrich Heinrich Karl Baron de la Motte. Die Jahreszeiten, Berlin, 1814.

"Aslauga's Ritter," the story by Fouque which Carlyle translated, appeared in the "Herbst-Heft" of the quarterly, Die Jahreszeiten, published in 1814. There is no record of either any reprint or new edition of this publication before its appearance in the collected works in 1841.¹ This was, of course, after the time of Carlyle's translation

¹ "Fouque's Ausgewählte Werke, edited by himself, appeared in 12 volumes (1841). -- Encyclopedia Britannica, 14th edition, 1929, IX, p. 562.

of the work. It may be safely accepted, therefore, that he used the edition of 1814 as his original text.

C. Ludwig Tieck's Schriften, Vierter Band, Berlin, 1828.

Tieck's first contributions in the form of short stories were to a series entitled Straussfedern, published from 1795 to 1798 by a bookseller named C. F. Nicolai. In 1797 appeared a collection of stories in three volumes, Volksmärchen von Peter Lebrecht, which contained at least one of Tieck's stories, "Der blonde Eckbert."¹ Neither Straussfedern nor Volksmärchen von Peter Lebrecht was available for the present study. Tieck's stories next appeared in a collection of three volumes entitled Phantasia (1811-1817). In his introduction of the Tieck stories, in German Romance, Carlyle makes this statement: "In 1812 appeared the early Volksmärchen retouched and improved and combined into a whole, by conversations, critical, disquisitionary and descriptive, in two volumes entitled Phantasia; from which our present specimens of him are taken."²

Tieck's collected works appeared in twenty volumes (1826-1846), entitled Ludwig Tieck's Schriften. Volume IV of this collection, on which this study is based, contains

¹ Encyclopedia Britannica, 14th edition, XXII, p. 204

² Carlyle, Thomas. German Romance, I, New York, 1899, p. 263.

a reprint of Phantasmus, Parts I and II, as is indicated by the title pages. Part I contains "Der blonde Eckbert," "Der getreue Eckart," "Der Runenberg," "Die Elfen," und "Der Pokal." These are the five stories which Carlyle translated; and we have his own statement that he used Phantasmus as his text.¹

D. E. T. A. Hoffmann's gesammelte Schriften, Siebenter Band, Berlin, 1873.

Early in the nineteenth century, Hoffmann began to contribute essays and stories to the Musicalische Zeitung at Leipzig. These were "afterwards collected, enlarged, and given to the world under the title of Fantasiestücke in Callot's Manier (Fantasy-pieces in the Style of Callot),² with a preface by Jean Paul Friedrich Richter,³ and "appeared in four volumes in 1814."⁴ For this collection Jean Paul Richter wrote the "Vorrede," in 1813,⁵ which appears

¹ Ibid., I, p. 263.

² "Some of my readers may require to be informed that Jacques Callot was a Lorraine painter of the seventeenth Century; a wild genius, whose Temptation of St. Antony is said to exceed in chaotic incoherence that of Teniers himself."--Ibid., II /footnote/p. 12.

³ Ibid., II, p. 12.

⁴ Encyclopedia Britannica, 11th Edition, 1910, XIII, p. 561.

⁵ "Baireuth, den 24. Nov. 1813. Jean Paul Friedr. Richter. E. T. A. Hoffmann's gesammelte Schriften, Siebenter Band, Berlin, 1873, p. 12.

apparently without change in the 1873 edition, the text used in the present study. The "Vorrede" makes no suggestion of any revision of the original text, and there is no record that any such revision was made at any time between the writing of the "Vorrede" and the translation by Carlyle. It may be safely assumed, therefore, that Carlyle used the 1814 edition.

E. Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke. Dritte vermehrte Auflage. Sechszwanzigster Band. Berlin, 1862.

"Des Feldpredigers Schmelzle Reise nach Flätz" appears in Volume XXVI of the edition of Richter's collected works published in Berlin in 1852. This story was written in 1807 and first published in 1809.¹ According to Berend's bibliography of Jean Paul, it does not appear to have had any revision or reprint at any time before 1826, the year in which Carlyle translated it for German Romance, and was published in its original form in the first edition of the collected works in 1826-28.² According to the editor's introduction, the second edition of the collected works, published in 1840, is, excepting some minor alterations,

¹ Berend, Eduard, Jean-Paul-Bibliographie, Berlin, 1925, p. 12.

² "Jean Pauls sämtliche Werke (Edited by E. Förster) 13 L. Berlin, 1826-28, 36, 38."--British Museum Catalogue. See also: Berend, Edward, Jean-Paul-Bibliographie, Berlin, 1925, p. 12.

an exact reprint of the first;¹ and the third, that of 1860-62, which is the one used in the present study, is an exact reprint of the second.² It follows, therefore, that "Des Feldpredigers Schmelzle Reise nach Flätz," as it appears in the third edition of the collected works, was practically an exact reproduction of the text as Carlyle had it at the time he made his translation into English.

F. Jean Pauls ^sämmtliche Werke, Historisch-kritische Ausgabe, Weimar, 1930.

"Quintus Fixlein" appears in Volume V of the edition of Richter, published at Weimar in 1930. This story was first published in 1796.³ A second edition with fourteen additional pages, but with no change of text,⁴ appeared in

¹ "Die Freunde Jean Pauls erhalten hiermit die zweite Auflage seiner sämmtlichen Werke. In Wesentlichem kann sie sich von der ersten nicht unterscheiden. Kleine Aenderungen möge man als Verbesserungen aufnehmen. Der Text wurde mit Hilfe früherer Ausgaben oder vorkommenden Falls der ursprünglichen Manuscripts revidiert und von Druckfehlern gereinigt."--Förster, Dr. Ernst. Vorwort des Herausgebers zur zweiten Auflage, Jean Pauls ^sämmtliche Werke, 1840, I, p. iv.

² "Die Dritte Auflage von Jean Pauls sämmtlichen Werken ist, ausser dass sie um einen, Jean Pauls Leben enthaltenden, Band vermehrt erscheint, ein unveränderter Abdruck der zweiten, welche auf Grund einer genauen Revision vorgenommen worden."--Förster, Dr. Ernst. Vorwort zur dritten Auflage zu Jean Pauls ^sämmtlichen Werken, 1860, I, p. iii.

³ Berend, Eduard, Jean-Paul-Bibliographie, Berlin, 1925, p. 5.

⁴ The fourteen pages of additional material are occasioned by a new preface, "eine mehrere Bogenlange neue Vorrede," and are not the result of any alteration of the material in its first form. "Den meisten Exemplaren,"

1801.¹ There seems to be no evidence of any further revision of the story at any time before the year of Carlyle's translations. The story as found in the first edition of Richter's collected works, 1826, must have been in its 1801 form. The text of the 1930 edition by Berend, excepting for a mass of critical material, is an exact reprint of the text as it appears in the first, second, and third editions of the story; that is to say, those of 1796, 1801, and 1826. From this it follows that the text of the Weimar reprint of 1930 represents faithfully the text Carlyle used.

Richter writes in his "Einleitung," "ist die 'Geschichte meiner Vorrede zur zweiten Auflage des Quintus Fixlein' entweder vor- oder nachgebunden."

¹ "Die neue Ausgabe, die die Jahreszahl 1801 trägt, hat dieselbe Ausstattung und dasselbe Titelkupfer wie die erste und nur 14 Seiten mehr; grossenteils ist sie 'Männchen auf Männchen' gedruckt, d. h., unter Beibehaltung der Seiten- und Zeileneinteilung. Den meisten Exemplaren ist die 'Geschichte meiner Vorrede' entweder vor- oder nachgebunden Eine dritte Auflage hat das Buch nicht mehr erlebt."--Berend, Eduard. Einleitung, V, 1930, p. 8.

This thesis was typed

by

BERNHARD BARGEN
Buhler, Kansas

April 1, 1935