

What is the Value of a Check Sheet in the
Correction of Errors in
Written Composition?

by

Edyth McBratney Salvesen

A. B. University of Kansas, 1919.

Submitted to the Department
of Education and the Faculty
of the Graduate School of the
University of Kansas in partial
fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Master of Arts.

Approved by:

J.W. Givette,
Raymond A. Schwager

May 16, 1927.

Table of Contents.

I Introduction

II Procedure

1. Method of Investigation
2. Setting up the Experiment
 - a. First Themes
 - b. Devising Tests
 - c. Ranking and Finding Two Equivalent Groups
 - d. Making the Check Sheets
 - e. Instructions to Teachers
 - f. Length of the Experiment
 - g. Retesting

III Presentation of Data

IV Interpretation of Data

V Conclusions

VI Bibliography

VII Appendix

The writer wishes to take this opportunity to express her appreciation to those people who have so kindly aided in the preparation of this thesis. To Dr. J. W. Twente she is especially indebted for his sympathetic interest, his kind suggestions and constructive criticisms. To Miss Esther Holcomb, Miss Marie Gapen, and Miss Mildred Gilmore she is indeed grateful for their cooperation in conducting the check sheet experiment in their English classes. Finally to the committee in Dr. H. P. Smith's class in "Problems in Elementary Supervision", headed by Principal J. E. Stonecipher, she is indebted for the suggestion of the technique used in this study.

What is the Value of a Check Sheet in the
Correction of Errors in
Written Composition?

Chapter I.

Introduction: Statement of Problem.

English teaching is always being attacked for its ineffectiveness. Educational authorities, business men, pupils, even teachers themselves heap on the coals of criticism. "Why," says the business man, "can't an honor student in high school write a decent letter?" "Why," says the school board, "is it necessary for the University of Kansas to have a sub-freshman course in English?" "What do they teach in the junior high school?" says the teacher of English in the senior high school. Such scathing remarks might be enumerated indefinitely.

English teaching seems to be ineffective; yet everywhere conscientious English teachers are spending hours searching for effective assignments and laboriously checking errors in written composition. If all this effort is wasted, what is the solution? English teachers must meet the challenge.

At present there is a great demand for leadership in the revision of methods of English teaching; therefore an experiment that seeks to find a workable procedure even

in one small phase of the subject seems worth while. Such a method is sought in this study. In short, this study is an experiment to discover whether the use of a check sheet made up of correct forms in English usage and punctuation, aids the individual to overcome errors in written composition more readily than the usual method of correcting such errors.

Definition of Specific Terms.

This problem involves a study of only certain specific errors in English grammar and in punctuation found in compositions written by the pupils used in the experiment. It ignores all other errors. Furthermore the experiment deals with only one hundred ten pupils; therefore the results derived will be indicative rather than conclusive.

The term "check sheet" means in this study a sheet upon which certain correct forms in English usage and punctuation are classified to be checked against, with provision for listing frequencies of errors. Each pupil in the experimental group has a check sheet and is responsible for recording his errors and correcting his themes as suggested by the checking symbol.

The term "usual method" means that the teacher indicates the correct form on the pupil's theme and tells

him to look it over carefully and try to avoid making the same errors in the future, without making further check to see if he has done so.

The forms used in the check sheet are those which are missed by over ten per cent of the people in the ninth grade as shown by results of The Correct English Usage Test and The Punctuation Test, devised from themes written by the pupils on a free-choice subject, and by the results of the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test VI, and Test of Grammatical Correctness A.

Status of the Problem.

The literature on this problem is very meager. In fact, the only experiment of like nature that the writer has been able to find has not been published. This is, namely, an experiment conducted by a committee in Supt. H. P. Smith's course in "Problems in Elementary School Supervision" given in the spring semester of the year 1925-1926. The check sheet in this case was made up of forms found in the Kirby Grammar Tests and Brigg's Form Test. The pupils used were those in the three upper sections of the 8A composition classes in English at the Lawrence Junior High School.

The committee found that for the Kirby Grammar Test, in all three classes the mean score gain of the

experimental group, using the check sheet, exceeded the mean score gain of the control group by an appreciable margin, and believes that the data presented tend to show that the check sheet was a valuable aid in correcting individual errors discovered by the Kirby Grammar Test. However, the results of the Briggs Form Test failed to indicate any value of the check sheet in correcting the errors discovered by that test.

The committee concluded that for practical use a check sheet should be based upon the specific errors made by the group using the check sheet.

(Note- This conclusion led the writer of the present experiment to try to discover the specific errors made by pupils in the ninth grade by checking carefully individual themes, and essay-type quiz papers in social science and general science as described in this paper under the heading "Setting Up the Experiment".)

Chapter II.

Procedure.

Method of Investigation.

The equivalent-group method, involving a control group and an experimental group in each class, was used for the experiment. Four divisions of the ninth grade class in English composition in the Lawrence Junior High School were used. These classes had been previously sectioned by the principal of the school according to their ability to do school work based on their intelligence quotients, their scores on the Stanford Achievement Test, and their success in school work, as indicated by the teachers' marks. Thus, each section was composed of a fairly homogeneous group, and was used as a separate experiment. These classes hereafter will be called the 9B¹, the 9B^{2x}, the 9B^{2y}, and the 9B³ class. The 9B¹ class refers to the accelerated section, the 9B^{2x} and 9B^{2y} are the two middle sections and are presumably made up of the students of average ability, while the 9B³ class refers to the retarded or slowest section.

Setting up the Experiment.

In the spring of 1926, just before the close of the school year, each pupil in the 8A composition classes

wrote in class a theme on a free choice-subject. The first draft of the theme was taken; therefore the self-criticism usually given in recopying was not done. These themes were checked over and all of the errors listed under two general classifications, correct usage and punctuation. Then discussion tests written by these same pupils in social science and general science were read and the errors tabulated. From all these errors two tests were devised, a* Correct English Test and a Punctuation Test. Only those errors which were made by less than ten per cent of the pupils were omitted from the tests.

In the early fall of the 1926-1927 school year these two tests were given to the four divisions of the ninth grade class. And as a check, two standardized tests, the** Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test VI, and the Test of Grammatical Correctness A were given, the material in these tests quite markedly resembling the errors listed in the devised tests.

All these tests were scored and the people within each division were ranked on each test. Then as a further aid in equating, the pupils were ranked according to the grade made in 8A composition. Thus each pupil had five rankings. These ranks were averaged and the pupils in the

*See Tests Appendix I

**See Tests Appendix I

class listed again according to this final rank. From these lists the pupils were paired in two equivalent groups. Not every parallel rank in the two groups is the same, but the total ranking is similar.

The following tables show the two equivalent groups in each class, the rank of each pupil in each of the criteria used for comparison, and the total average ranking. Table I represents the ranking of the 9B¹ class and should be read as follows: Pupil 1 ranked 2 in 8A composition grade, 6 in correct usage, 3 in Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test A, 15 in punctuation test, 2 in Grammatical Correctness A, a total of 14.5 or an average rank of 2.9. Therefore he is ranked 1 for the purpose of equating the groups. All the others are read the same way.

Table 1a. Rank of Pupils in the 9B¹ Class
for each of the five Criteria
used in Equating the Groups.

Control Group.

Pupil	8A Comp.	Correct Usage	Wisc. Sent. Recog.	Punct. Test	Gram. Cor-rect.	Total	Average
VI.							
1	2.	6.	3.	1.5	2.	14.5	2.9
2	13.5	16.	7.5	3.5	8.5	49.	9.8
3	13.5	6.	7.5	9.5	23.5	60.	12.
4	13.5	16.	17.	15.	2.	63.5	12.7
5	33.2	16.	17.	9.5	8.5	84.2	16.8
6	13.5	6.	35.5	7.5	23.5	86.	17.2
7	33.2	16.	12.5	12.	17.	90.7	18.1
8	33.2	22.5	7.5	21.	8.5	92.7	18.5
9	13.5	6.	30.5	12.	26.5	98.5	19.7
10	32.2	6.	17.	26.	17.	99.2	19.8
11	13.5	22.5	7.5	26.	30.5	100.	20.
12	33.2	26.	3.	15.	30.5	107.7	21.5
13	13.5	26.	22.	26.	23.5	111.	22.2
14	33.2	29.5	22.	21.	8.5	114.2	22.8
15	13.5	32.5	12.5	37.	30.5	126.	25.2
16	33.2	6.	22.	30.	36.5	127.7	25.5
17	33.2	29.5	27.	26.	17.	132.7	26.5
18	13.5	30.5	26.	32.	35.5	137.5	27.5
19	33.2	36.	37.	37.	36.5	169.7	33.9

Experimental group.

Pupil	8A Comp.	Correct Usage	Wisc. Sent. Recog.	Punct Test	Gram. Cor-rect.	Total	Average
			VI.				
1	2.	6.	12.5	1.5	8.5	30.5	6.1
2	2.	8.5	16.	7.5	8.5	32.5	6.5
3	13.5	6.	22.	5.	8.5	55.	11.
4	13.5	16.	7.5	26.	8.5	71.5	14.3
5	13.5	6.	17.	26.	17.	79.5	15.9
6	13.5	22.5	12.5	18.	17.	83.5	16.7
7	13.5	32.5	3.	6.	30.5	85.5	17.1
8	13.5	6.	38.	12.	25.5	93.	18.6
9	13.5	6.	35.5	32.	8.5	95.5	19.1
10	13.5	16.	33.5	37.	2.	102.	20.4
11	13.5	29.5	27.	3.5	30.5	104.	20.8
12	13.5	35.5	7.5	21.	30.5	108.	21.6
13	13.5	35.5	27.	18.	17.	111.	22.2
14	33.2	16.	27.	32.	8.5	116.7	23.5
15	33.2	6.	27.	35.	23.5	124.7	24.9
16	33.2	29.5	22.	15.	30.5	130.2	26.
17	33.2	22.5	33.5	34.	17.	140.	28.
18	33.2	38.	17.	18.	36.5	142.7	28.5
19	38.	35.5	30.5	32.	23.5	159.5	31.9

Table 1b. Rank of the Pupils in the 9B Class for each of the five Criteria used in Equating the Groups. ^{2x}

Control Group.

Experimental Group.

Table 1c. Rank of the Pupils in the 9B Class for each of the Five Criteria used in Equating the Groups.

Control Group.

Pupil	8A Comp.	Correct Usage	Wisc. Sent.	Punct. Test.	Gram. Cor- rect.	Total	Average
			VI.				
1	1.	2.	7.	1.	3.5	14.5	2.9
2	6.5	8.	4.	2.5	16.	37.	7.4
3	19.5	11.	9.5	2.5	8.	50.5	10.1
4	6.5	17.	2.5	9.	21.	56.	11.2
5	19.5	5.5	15.5	12.	8.	60.5	12.1
6	19.5	11.	15.5	10.	16.	72.	14.4
7	6.5	11.	15.	17.	26.	73.5	14.7
8	6.5	17.	15.5	20.	21.	80.	16.
9	6.5	28.	23.	18.5	8.	84.	16.8
10	19.5	26.	25.	21.5	3.5	95.5	19.1
11	30.	5.5	27.	18.5	16.	97.	19.4
12	19.5	22.5	9.5	27.	26.	104.5	20.9
13	19.5	22.5	19.5	28.	26.	105.5	21.1
14	19.5	17.	21.5	25.	26.	109.	21.8
15	19.5	17.	28.5	30.	30.	125.	25.

Experimental Group.

Table 1d. Rank of the Pupils in the 9B Class for each of the Five Criteria used in Equating the Groups. ³

Control Group.

Experimental Group.

Perhaps an explanation of the method of ranking used in the above tables would be beneficial. As an illustration; in the 9B²Y class (see Table Ic, page 12) one pupil received a grade of E in his 8A composition course, ten people received the grade of G, sixteen people received the grade of M, two a grade of P, and one a grade of Fail. Consequently the pupil with a grade of E ranked 1; the ten people with a grade of G had the next ten places -- two to eleven, inclusive. This makes an average ranking, then, of 6.5 for each of the ten pupils. The fourteen people with a grade of M ranked 12 to 27 inclusive which gave each one a rank of 19.5. The pupils with a grade of P ranked 28 and 29 respectively which gave them an average ranking of 28.5, and, finally, the pupil with a grade of Fail ranked 30.

This same method was used to rank pupils on each of the four tests listed in the tables above, the score made on each test being used as a basis of ranking.

Making the Check Sheet.

Although only the scores of the tests in punctuation and correct English usage were used for equating the groups in each class, the content of each test was carefully considered in devising the check sheet. The problem in

every sentence in each test was listed and the error frequencies checked by classes, as shown in the sample sheet Table II. Those problems which were missed by less than ten pupils were omitted from the check sheet.

Table II. The Frequencies of Errors in the
Test of Grammatical Correctness A
Made by the Pupils in the
9B¹, 9B^{2x}, 9B^{2y}, and 9B³
Classes.

Sentence Problem	9B ¹	9B ^{2x}	9B ^{2y}	9B ³
1 <u>Their</u> for his				
2 <u>Laying</u> for lying				
3 Was for were				
4 Like for as if				
5 Had ought for ought (been)				
6 Had of been for had (kind)				
7 These kind for that				
8 Hadn't no for had no	.			
9 Leave for let				
10 Are for is				
11 Had went for had gone				
12 Set for sit				
13 You and I (object) r				
14 Ain't for haven't		.		
15 Good for well (seen)				
16 Have saw for have				
17 Was for came				
18 Done for did				
19 Were* for was				
20 It's for its				

*One of the sparkplugs was

Problems 8, 9, and 14, in the test of Grammatical Correctness A were omitted from the check sheet, because only six, eight, and five pupils, respectively made errors in their use.

The same sort of tabulation was done for each test and the same basis (that is, ten pupils or less making the error), was used for omitting problems in the check sheet.

Finally, these errors were assembled and classified under two main divisions, Correct English Usage and Punctuation and Capitalization. Then these divisions were further subdivided, in order that the checking symbols might be small numbers. A sentence using the correct form or forms for each problem selected was written and placed on the check sheet with the proper heading and classification number. At the right of the correct form were placed twenty columns for the listing of frequencies of errors on succeeding themes*.

These check sheets were printed and (together with the names of the pupils in the two equivalent groups), given to the teachers of the four classes. The following written instructions to the teachers will explain the method of checking the themes.

* See Check Sheet Page 68

Instruction to Teachers.

Your class has been divided into two parts on the basis of the four tests given recently and last year's success in composition as measured by the semester grade.

Each student in the experimental group should have the check sheet given him when he checks over his written composition after it has been graded by symbols on the check sheet. He should find the symbol on the check sheet, and put a mark in the column to the right each time an error is made. The first column is to be marked T 1, second T 2, which means theme one, theme 2, etc. If he makes the same error three times in Theme one, he will have three marks in the first column. After he has marked the errors on the check sheet, he hould examine each sentence, and then correct the error on his theme, either on the back of the page or above the sentence in the theme.

There are twenty columns. At least twelve themes should be checked in, and sixteen would be better. Any paragraph exercise in punctuation or capitalization may be used also.

I am very grateful to you for your coöperation in this experiment, and I hope that it may prove of such value to our classes that we shall not feel that we have wasted valuable time.

Instruction for Pupil.

Say to the pupils (when you return the first themes marked with the symbols on the check sheet); During this semester we are trying an experiment to see whether a check sheet is of value in the correction of errors in written composition. The class has been divided into two sections on the basis of the tests given recently. To one section I have given a check sheet, and to the other only a theme. Those who do not have a check sheet will correct their themes in the usual way, and they may begin now to note errors in their themes.

Those who have check sheets will follow this procedure; Write your name, grade, and teacher's name at the top of the check sheet, (have them write.) At the top of the first column write T 1, (Theme one).

To the left of the page you will notice a number of sentences. These are correct forms for errors that you people made in themes last year and in the tests recently given. If you make any of these errors on your themes, hereafter, they will be checked by symbols like I 5, or A 3. (Show him on sheet).

Example: Here is a paper on which appears this sentence, "You have never saw him." The teacher has marked

in the margin III, 1. Can you find that symbol on the check sheet? Where would this pupil put his first mark? (First column, opposite III, 1).

What is the matter with the sentence on this theme? What does III, 1 say? Then this pupil would write above have saw in his paper the correct form have seen.

Do you understand? Now do each error on your theme the same way. (If any questions are asked, it may be necessary to go through a number of imaginary errors).

(Teachers will need to give individual help the first few times, but soon it will be very easy for the student to check himself, I'm sure.)

All class room instruction in each class was the same for both the experimental group and the control group. The teacher was the same; all factors (except the manner of correcting themes) were constant. This method of correcting themes was entirely different. The teacher corrected the error for the control group, and for the experimental group she checked in the margin a symbol corresponding to a type form on the check sheet.

The experiment ran through the first semester of the 1926-1927 school year. Fifteen themes per pupil were checked on the check sheet.

About two weeks before the close of the first semester the retesting was started. The Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test V, and the Test of Grammatical Correctness B were given as follow-up tests of the initial standard tests. The identical tests in punctuation and correct English usage, which had been devised from errors made by the pupils, were repeated. This was done because of the difficulty of setting up a second form equal in difficulty to the first.

The comparison of the results of the initial and final tests was used to discover whether a check sheet is

valuable in the elimination of individual errors in written composition.

Chapter III

Presentation of Data.

The following tables, IIIa, IIIb, IIIc, IIId, show the scores made by individual pupils in all four classes in both the initial form and the final form of the four tests used in the experiment. Table IIIa should be read as follows: Pupil 1 in the control group of the 9¹_B class made a score of 19 on the initial Sentence Recognition Test VI, and a score of 19 on the final form, Sentence Recognition Test V. On the Grammatical Correctness Test A he made a score of 20, and on the final test he made a score of 20. On the Correct English Usage Test he made an initial score of 24 and a final score of 24. Finally on the Punctuation Test he made an initial score of 46 and a final score of 47. Table III records the scores for all pupils in the same way. A score of 20 on the Sentence Recognition and the Grammatical Correctness Test is perfect. The perfect score for Correct English Usage is 24, and for punctuation it is 48.

Hereafter, in all tables whenever reference is made to any of the four tests the following abbreviations will be used:

- S = Sentence Recognition Test.
- G = Test of Grammatical Correctness.
- E = Correct English Usage Test.
- P = Punctuation Test.

Table IIIa.

Scores made by the Pupils of the
9B¹ Class in all Four of the Tests
Used in the Experiment.

Control Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	19	19	20	20	24	24	46	47
2	18	19	19	20	23	24	45	40
3	18	18	17	17	24	24	40	39
4	16	18	20	20	23	24	38	39
5	16	20	19	20	25	24	40	52
6	10	20	17	18	23	24	41	42
7	17	20	18	16	25	24	59	80
8	18	19	19	19	22	25	56	57
9	13	20	15	18	24	24	59	40
10	16	20	18	19	24	24	35	39
11	18	17	16	16	22	21	35	34
12	19	18	16	17	21	24	38	41
13	15	20	17	19	21	18	35	38
14	15	18	19	17	20	24	36	37
15	17	18	16	17	19	21	29	34
16	15	15	15	15	24	25	34	58
17	14	17	18	17	20	25	35	32
18	12	18	16	17	18	24	35	36
19	10	16	15	19	21	19	29	34

Experimental Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	17	19	19	20	24	24	46	44
2	20	20	19	20	23	23	41	43
3	15	17	19	20	24	23	43	46
4	18	19	19	20	23	24	35	34
5	16	17	18	18	24	23	35	40
6	17	20	18	20	23	23	37	44
7	19	17	16	18	19	24	42	44
8	5	15	17	18	24	24	39	34
9	10	19	19	20	24	24	32	39
10	14	18	16	18	20	24	45	43
11	11	19	20	20	23	24	29	32
12	18	18	16	17	18	18	36	34
13	14	20	18	18	18	23	37	38
14	14	20	19	17	23	24	32	37
15	14	17	17	18	24	24	30	35
16	15	18	16	16	20	24	38	42
17	11	19	18	17	22	21	31	31
18	16	20	15	16	17	23	37	36
19	13	17	17	19	18	19	32	31

Table IIIb

Scores made by the Pupils of the
^{2x}
 9B Class in all Four of the Tests
 Used in the Experiment.

Control Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	18	19	18	20	24	24	33	34
2	16	14	19	19	24	24	33	42
3	15	20	15	18	23	24	40	47
4	18	19	16	16	20	20	36	43
5	14	16	18	20	19	21	37	35
6	15	14	15	20	20	18	32	36
7	11	17	17	20	17	18	38	40
8	16	18	14	16	19	19	31	36
9	12	19	12	17	19	22	29	36
10	14	19	12	18	17	19	36	44
11	12	12	13	19	16	21	30	33
12	15	17	13	17	18	23	24	27
13	6	10	15	17	20	23	24	31
14	4	15	13	16	19	20	29	35
15	8	15	11	14	17	21	27	40
16	9	13	12	13	15	16	22	20

Experimental Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	19	20	20	20	24	24	45	48
2	12	17	18	17	21	24	38	42
3	13	17	16	18	20	25	37	40
4	9	20	16	17	22	20	59	40
5	15	18	14	17	23	21	34	37
6	14	19	17	15	19	23	33	40
7	8	16	16	20	20	19	36	45
8	15	18	13	17	20	23	27	31
9	11	19	13	17	21	23	50	55
10	10	14	13	20	19	20	27	39
11	7	13	15	17	17	21	28	25
12	9	5	15	17	19	19	28	31
13	5	18	17	18	17	18	19	31
14	2	2	16	18	17	19	22	30
15	11	14	11	13	18	17	23	28
16	4	8	14	13	16	16	27	29

Table IIIc.

Scores made by the Pupils of the
 9B^{2y} Class in all Four of the Tests
 Used in the Experiment.

Control Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	13	17	19	18	24	23	46	48
2	17	20	15	16	22	23	45	43
3	12	11	18	16	20	23	43	47
4	18	17	14	16	19	20	31	35
5	9	15	18	19	23	23	29	27
6	10	16	12	18	20	20	27	27
7	9	14	15	16	20	23	30	30
8	9	17	14	10	19	20	25	39
9	5	6	18	20	16	21	26	28
10	4	9	19	20	17	20	24	30
11	5	15	15	18	23	21	26	25
12	12	15	12	15	18	19	21	28
13	12	4	12	14	18	25	19	16
14	1	4	9	11	19	19	14	29

Experimental Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	16	19	18	19	24	24	58	40
2	20	19	19	19	24	24	41	42
5	12	18	20	20	23	21	58	47
4	18	13	17	17	20	20	37	36
5	9	16	19	17	19	18	29	35
6	4	18	18	17	18	21	35	35
7	8	15	17	17	17	19	28	35
8	14	16	14	17	19	23	28	35
9	11	12	14	13	14	22	29	28
10	0	18	15	18	23	23	28	35
11	8	13	15	16	19	21	18	16
12	7	13	17	18	17	18	22	37
13	4	15	11	13	18	20	23	30
14	8	9	12	18	20	22	23	25

Table IIIId.

Scores made by the Pupils of the
9B³ Class in all four of the Tests
Used in the Experiment.

Control Group.

Pupil	S VI	S V	G A	G B	E Initial	E Final	P Initial	P Final
1	15	16	16	19	19	23	28	29
2	17	17	15	17	16	20	23	26
3	17	16	13	15	15	21	27	35
4	12	14	12	16	17	23	22	36
5	18	18	12	12	14	17	20	28
6	9	14	11	20	16	22	24	38

Experimental Group.

1	11	17	13	17	18	19	26	33
2	16	15	11	10	19	20	28	35
3	9	15	11	15	20	21	22	36
4	10	15	13	12	11	18	19	21
5	12	15	11	18	15	21	21	26
6	2	5	11	9	11	18	19	21

The distribution of the scores given in Table III, together with the mean, the Standard Deviation (S. D.), and the Probable Error (P. E.) of the mean may be seen clearly in Table IV.

This table shows that in the Sentence Recognition Test no person in the control group of the 9B¹ class made a score of 20 on the initial test, but six people made a score of 20 on the final test. Two people scored 19 on the initial test and three scored 19 on the final test. Read the others the same way. The mean score for the initial test is 16.08 with a Standard Deviation of 2.68 and a Probable Error of .23.

The record for all four tests and for all four classes is similarly stated in Table IV.

Table IVa

Distribution of the Scores made by the
 9B¹ pupils in the Initial and Final
 Forms of all Four tests.

Control Group.

Sentence Recognition Test			Grammatical Correctness		
	Initial	Final		Initial	Final
Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	0	6	20	2	4
19	2	3	19	4	4
18	4	6	18	3	2
17	2	2	17	3	6
16	3	1	16	4	2
15	3	1	15	3	1
14	1	0			
13	1	0	Mean	17.86	18.34
12	1	0	S. D.	1.62	1.53
11	0	0	P. E.	.26	.24
10	2	0			
Mean	16.08	18.92	Punctuation Test		
S. D.	2.68	1.42	Initial		
P. E.	.43	.23	Score	f	f
Correct English Usage			47	0	1
Initial Final			46	1	0
Score	f	f	45	1	0
24	5	12	44	0	0
23	5	5	43	0	1
22	2	0	42	0	1
21	3	2	41	1	1
20	2	0	40	2	3
19	1	1	39	2	3
18	1	1	38	2	3
Mean	22.55	23.45	37	0	2
S. D.	1.79	1.79	36	2	1
P. E.	.29	.29	35	5	0
			34	1	3
			33	0	0
			32	0	2
			31	0	0
			30	0	0
			29	2	0
			Mean	33.40	38.34
			S. D.	4.20	2.86
			P. E.	.68	.46

Experimental Group.

Sentence Recognition Test.			Grammatical Correctness		
	Initial	Final		Initial	Final
Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	1	5	20	1	7
19	1	5	19	6	1
18	2	3	18	4	6
17	2	5	17	3	5
16	2	0	16	4	2
15	2	1	15	1	0
14	4	0	Mean	18.19	18.92
13	1	0	S. D.	1.38	1.38
12	0	0	P. E.	.22	.22
11	2	0			
10	1	0			
9	0	0			
8	0	0			
7	0	0			
6	0	0			
5	1	0			
Mean	15.07	18.86	Score	f	f
S. D.	3.48	1.38	46	1	1
P. E.	.56	.22	45	1	0
			44	0	3
			43	1	2
			42	1	1
			41	1	0
			40	0	1
			39	1	1
			38	3	1
			37	1	1
			36	2	1
			35	2	1
			34	0	3
			33	0	0
			32	5	1
			31	1	2
			30	1	0
			29	1	0
Correct English Usage					
	Initial	Final			
Score	f	f			
24	6	10			
23	4	6			
22	2	0			
21	0	1			
20	2	0			
19	1	1			
18	3	1			
17	1	0			
Mean	22.08	23.45	Mean	37.18	58.76
S. D.	2.45	1.70	S. D.	4.90	4.80
P. E.	.39	.27	P. E.	.79	.77

Table IVb

Distribution of the Scores made by the
^{2X} 9B pupils in the Initial and Final
 Forms of all Four tests.

Control Group.

Sentence Recognition Test Grammatical Correctness

Initial Final

Initial Final

Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	0	1	20	0	4
19	0	4	19	1	2
18	2.	1	18	2	5
17	0	2	17	1	5
16	2	1	16	1	2
15	2	2	15	3	0
14	2	2	14	1	1
13	1	1	13	3	1
12	2	1	12	3	0
11	1	0	11	1	0
10	0	1			
9	1	0	Mean	15.06	18.12
8	1	0	S. D.	2.39	2.05
7	0	0	P. E.	.42	.36
6	1	0			
5	0	0	Punctuation Test		
4	1	0			
Mean	13.07	16.44	Initial		Final
S. D.	3.96	2.80	Score	f	f
P. E.	.70	.49	47	0	1
			46	0	0
			45	0	0
			44	0	1
			43	0	1
			42	0	1
			41	0	0

Correct English Usage Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f	Initial	Final
47	0	1		
46	0	0		
45	0	0		
44	0	1		
43	0	1		
42	0	1		
41	0	0		
40	1	0		
39	0	0		
38	1	1		
37	1	2		
36	2	0		
35	0	0		
34	0	2		
33	1	2		
32	1	1		
31	1	1		
30	1	2		
29	2	0		
28	0	1		
27	1	0		
26	0	0		
25	0	0		
24	0	0		
23	0	0		
22	1	0		
Mean	31.81	37.18		
S. D.	5.16	5.32		
P. E.	.91	.94		

Score	f	f
24	3	3
23	1	2
22	0	1
21	0	3
20	2	2
19	4	2
18	1	2
17	3	0
16	1	1
15	1	0
1	1	
Mean	19.93	21.32
S. D.	2.85	2.35
P. E.	.50	.41

Experimental Group.

 Sentence Recognition Test Grammatical Correctness
 Initial Final Initial Final

Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	0	2	20	1	3
19	1	2	19	0	0
18	0	5	18	1	5
17	0	2	17	2	7
16	0	1	16	4	0
15	2	0	15	2	1
14	1	2	14	2	0
13	1	1	13	5	2
12	1	0	12	0	0
11	2	0	11	1	0
10	1	0			
9	2	0	Mean	15.75	17.62
8	1	1	S. D.	2.16	2.02
7	1	0	P. E.	.38	.35
6	0	0			
5	0	1			
4	1	0			
3	1	0			
2	1	1			
Mean	10.62	15.37	Punctuation Test		
S. D.	4.51	5.25	Initial		
P. E.	.79	.92	Score	f	f

Correct English Usage

Initial Final

Score	f	f
34	1	2
23	1	4
22	1	0
21	2	2
20	3	2
19	3	3
18	1	2
17	2	1
16	1	0
Mean	20.06	21.25
S. D.	2.20	2.24
P. E.	.38	.39

Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f
48	0	1
47	0	0
46	0	0
45	1	1
44	0	0
43	0	0
42	0	1
41	0	0
40	0	3
39	1	0
38	1	1
37	1	1
36	1	0
35	0	2
34	1	1
33	0	0
32	0	0
31	1	1
30	0	3
29	0	1
28	2	1
27	3	0
26	0	0
25	0	0
24	0	0
23	0	1
22	0	1
21	1	0
20	0	0
19	1	0
Mean	31.31	36.81
S. D.	7.19	5.82
P. E.	1.27	1.03

Table IVc

Distribution of the Scores made by the
9B^{2y} pupils in the Initial and Final
Forms of all Four tests.

Control Group.

Score	Sentence Recognition Test		Grammatical Correctness	
	Initial	Final	Initial	Final
20	0	1	20	0
19	0	0	19	2
18	1	0	18	3
17	1	3	17	0
16	0	1	16	0
15	0	3	15	3
14	0	1	14	2
13	1	0	13	0
12	3	0	12	3
11	0	1	11	0
10	1	0	10	0
9	3	1	9	1
8	0	0		0
7	1	0	Mean	15.50
6	0	1	S. D.	2.95
5	1	0	P. E.	.55
4	1	2		.54
3	1	0		
Mean	10.50	13.56		
S. D.	4.27	4.76		
P. E.	.80	.90		

Correct English Usage

Initial Final

Score	f	f
24	1	0
23	2	6
22	1	0
21	0	2
20	3	4
19	3	2
18	2	0
17	1	0
16	1	0

Mean 20.56 21.78
 S. D. 2.27 1.57
 P. E. .42 .29

Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f
48	0	1
47	0	1
46	1	0
45	0	0
44	0	0
43	2	1
42	0	0
41	0	0
40	0	1
39	0	0
38	0	0
37	0	0
36	0	0
35	0	0
34	0	0
33	0	0
32	0	0
31	1	1
30	1	1
29	1	2
28	0	2
27	1	2
26	2	2
25	1	1
24	1	1
23	0	0
22	0	0
21	1	0
20	0	0
19	1	0
18	0	0
17	0	0
16	0	1
15	0	0
14	1	0

Mean 29.35 32.78
 S. D. 9.01 8.71
 P. E. 1.70 1.60

Experimental Group.

Sentence Recognition Test

Score	Initial	Final
-------	---------	-------

20	1	0
19	0	2
13	1	3
17	0	0
16	1	2
15	0	1
14	1	1
13	0	4
12	1	1
11	1	0
10	0	0
9	1	1
8	3	0
7	1	0
6	0	0
5	0	0
4	2	0
3	0	0
2	0	0
1	1	0
0	1	0

Mean 10.92 15.56

S. D. 2.70 2.86

P. E. .50 .52

Grammatical Correctness

Score	Initial	Final
-------	---------	-------

20	1	1
19	2	2
18	2	3
17	3	6
16	0	1
15	2	0
14	3	0
13	0	2
12	1	0
11	1	0
Mean	16.50	17.56
S. D.	2.56	1.88
P. E.	.46	.34

Correct English Usage

Initial Final

Score	f	f
24	2	2
23	2	2
22	0	2
21	0	3
20	2	2
19	5	1
18	2	2
17	2	0
16	0	1
15	1	0
14	1	0
Mean	19.70	21.30
S. D.	3.20	2.25
P. E.	.56	.41

Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f
47	0	1
46	0	0
45	0	0
44	0	0
43	0	0
42	0	1
41	1	0
40	0	0
39	0	0
38	2	0
37	1	1
36	0	1
35	1	0
34	0	0
33	0	0
32	0	0
31	0	0
30	0	0
29	2	3
28	0	0
27	0	0
26	0	0
25	0	0
24	1	1
23	1	1
22	2	0
21	0	0
20	0	0
19	0	0
18	1	0
17	0	0
16	0	0
15	0	1

Mean	29.16	35.20
S. D.	7.20	7.45
P. E.	1.30	1.30

Table IVd

Distribution of the Scores made by the
³
 9B pupils in the Initial and Final
 Forms of all Four tests.
 Control Group.

Sentence Recognition Test Grammatical Correctness

	Initial	Final	Initial	Final
Score	f	f	Score	f

20	0	0	20	0	1
19	0	0	19	0	1
18	1	1	18	0	0
17	2	1	17	0	1
16	0	2	16	1	1
15	1	0	15	1	1
15	0	2	14	0	0
13	0	0	13	0	0
12	1	0	12	2	1
11	0	0	11	2	0
10	0	0			
9	1	0	Mean	13.33	16.83
			S. D.	1.95	2.65
Mean	15.17	16.33	P. E.	.56	.76
S. D.	3.19	1.46			
P. E.	.92	.42			

Punctuation Test Initial Final

	Initial	Final	Score	f	f
--	---------	-------	-------	---	---

Correct English Usage			Score	f	f
	Initial	Final			
Score	f	f	38	0	1
24	0	0	37	0	0
23	0	2	36	0	1
22	0	1	35	0	0
21	0	1	54	0	0
20	0	1	33	0	0
19	1	0	32	0	0
18	0	0	31	0	0
17	1	1	30	0	1
16	2	0	29	0	1
15	1	0	28	1	0
14	1	0	27	1	0
			26	0	1
			25	0	0
Mean	16.67	21.50	24	1	0
S. D.	1.57	2.08	23	1	0
P. E.	.45	.60	22	1	0
			21	0	0
			20	1	0
Mean			24.17	32.50	
S. D.			3.30	4.50	
P. E.			.95	1.20	

Experimental Group.

Sentence Recognition Test Grammatical Correctness

	Initial	Final		Initial	Final
--	---------	-------	--	---------	-------

Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	0	0	18	0	1
19	0	0	17	0	1
19	0	0	16	0	0
17	0	1	15	0	0
16	1	0	14	0	0
15	0	4	13	2	1
14	0	0	12	0	1
13	0	0	11	4	0
12	1	0	10	0	1
11	1	0	9	0	1
10	0	0			
9	1	0	Mean	11.83	13.83
8	0	0	S. D.	.50	3.29
7	0	0	P. E.	.11	.95
6	0	0			
5	0	1			
4	0	0			
3	0	0			
2	1	0			

Mean 10.50 15.17
 S. D. 4.20 3.90
 P. E. 1.20 1.10

Punctuation Test

	Initial	Final
--	---------	-------

Score	f	f
36	0	1
35	0	1
34	0	0
33	0	1
32	0	0
31	0	0

Correct English Usage

	Initial	Final
--	---------	-------

Score	f	f	Score	f	f
21	0	2	28	1	0
20	1	1	27	0	0
19	1	1	26	1	1
18	1	2	25	0	0
17	0	0	24	0	0
16	0	0	23	0	0
15	1	0	22	1	0
14	0	0	21	1	2
13	0	0	20	0	0
12	0	0	19	2	0
11	2	0			

Mean 16.16 20.00 Mean 23.00 29.16
 S. D. 3.63 1.26 S. D. 3.40 7.34
 P. E. 1.05 .36 P. E. .98 2.10

Table IVe

Distribution of the Scores made by all
 the pupils in the Four 9B Classes in
 the Initial and Final Forms of all
 Four Tests.

Science

Control Group

Score	Sentence Recognition Test		Grammatical Correctness	
	Initial	Final	Initial	Final
	f	f	f	f
20	0	8	20	2
19	2	7	19	7
18	8	8	18	8
17	5	8	17	4
16	5	5	16	5
15	6	6	15	10
14	3	5	14	3
13	3	1	13	3
12	7	1	12	8
11	1	1	11	3
10	3	1	10	0
9	5	1	9	1
8	1	0		
7	0	0	Mean	15.95
6	1	1	S. D.	2.75
5	1	0	P. E.	.26
4	2	2		.20
3	1	0		
2	0	0		
1	1	0		
Mean	13.58	16.54		
S. D.	4.44	2.62		
P. E.	.42	.25		

Correct English Usage

Initial Final

Score	f	f
24	8	15
23	8	13
22	3	2
21	3	8
20	8	7
19	9	4
18	4	3
17	5	1
16	4	2
15	2	0
14	1	0

Mean 20.51 22.14

S. D. 2.81 2.26

P. E. .27 .21

Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f
48	0	1
47	0	5
46	2	0
45	1	2
44	0	2
43	1	5
42	0	1
41	1	3
40	3	2
39	2	3
38	3	1
37	4	4
36	1	2
35	2	1
34	2	2
33	1	3
32	2	2
31	1	5
30	2	0
29	2	0
28	1	3
27	2	2
26	1	4
25	1	2
24	1	1
23	1	1
22	1	0
21	1	0
20	1	0
19	1	0
18	0	0
17	0	0
16	0	0
15	0	0
14	0	1

Mean 32.39 35.93

S. D. 7.36 6.36

P. E. .70 .60

Experimental Group.

 Sentence Recognition Test Grammatical Correctness
 Initial Final Initial Final

Score	f	f	Score	f	f
20	2	7	20	3	11
19	2	9	19	8	3
18	3	9	18	7	13
17	2	8	17	8	17
16	4	3	16	5	3
15	4	6	15	5	1
14	6	3	14	5	0
13	2	5	13	5	5
12	3	1	12	1	1
11	6	0	11	5	0
10	3	0	10	0	1
9	4	1			
8	4	1	Mean	16.48	17.77
7	2	0	S. D.	2.58	2.20
6	0	0	P. E.	.24	.21
5	1	1			
4	3	0			
3	1	0			
2	1	1			
1	1	0			
0	1	0			

Mean 12.08 16.09
 S. D. 4.96 3.68
 P. E. .47 .35

Correct English Usage

Initial Final

Score	f	f
24	9	14
23	7	12
22	3	2
21	2	8
20	8	5
19	8	6
18	7	6
17	6	1
16	1	1
15	2	0
14	1	0
13	0	0
12	0	0
11	1	0

Mean 20.43 21.93

S. D. 2.99 2.30

P. E. .28 .22

Punctuation Test

Initial Final

Score	f	f
48	0	1
47	0	1
46	1	1
45	2	1
44	0	3
43	1	3
42	1	3
41	2	0
40	0	5
39	2	4
38	4	5
37	5	3
36	2	3
35	3	1
34	1	1
33	1	3
32	3	1
31	1	2
30	2	0
29	5	3
28	5	3
27	3	1
26	1	0
25	0	1
24	1	2
23	2	0
22	4	0
21	1	0
20	0	0
19	2	0
18	1	0
17	0	0
16	0	0
15	0	1

Mean 32.25 56.23

S. D. 7.22 6.47

P. E. .68 .61

Since there were so few cases in each class, it was thought advisable to compare the control group and the experimental group of all classes taken together as one group. (See Table IVe) This plan would serve as a check on individual classes and would tend to refute or confirm results obtained from the smaller groups.

Table V shows a summary of the statistical measures used as a basis for the interpretation of the data and for drawing conclusions as to the significance of the experiment. It should be read as follows: In the control group the 9B¹ class on the initial Sentence Recognition Test made a mean score of 16.08 with a Standard Deviation of 2.68 and a Probable Error of .43. On the final test this class made a mean score of 18.92 with a Standard Deviation of 1.42 and a Probable Error of .23. The mean score in the final test exceeds the mean score on the initial test by 2.84. All the other records should be read the same way.

Table V.

Summary of the Statistical Measures

Found in Table IV.

Control Group.

Initial Form Final Form

Class	Test	Mean	S. D.	P. E.	Mean	S. D.	P. E.	Mean Score Gain
9B ¹	S	16.08	2.68	.43	16.92	1.42	.23	2.84
	G	17.86	1.62	.26	18.34	1.43	.24	.48
	E	22.55	1.79	.29	23.45	1.79	.29	.90
	P	33.40	4.20	.68	38.34	2.86	.46	4.94
9B ^{2x}	S	13.07	3.96	.70	16.44	2.80	.49	3.37
	G	15.06	2.39	.42	18.12	2.05	.36	3.06
	E	19.93	2.85	.50	21.32	2.55	.41	1.39
	P	31.81	5.16	.91	37.18	5.32	.94	5.27
9B ^{2y}	S	10.50	4.27	.80	13.36	4.76	.90	3.51
	G	15.50	2.95	.55	16.71	2.90	.54	1.21
	E	20.56	2.27	.42	21.78	1.57	.29	1.42
	P	29.35	9.01	1.70	32.78	8.71	1.60	3.43
9B ³	S	15.17	3.19	.92	16.33	1.46	.42	1.16
	G	13.33	1.95	.56	16.83	2.65	.76	3.50
	E	16.67	1.57	.45	21.50	2.08	.60	4.83
	P	24.17	3.30	.95	32.50	4.50	1.20	8.33
*9B	S	13.58	4.44	.42	16.54	2.62	.25	2.96
	G	15.95	2.75	.26	17.99	2.15	.20	2.04
	E	20.51	2.81	.27	22.14	2.26	.21	1.63
	P	32.39	7.36	.70	35.93	6.36	.60	3.54

* Class 9B refers to the pupils of all four classes taken together as one group.

Experimental Group.

Class	Test	Initial Form			Final Form			Mean Score Gain
		Mean	S. D.	P. E.	Mean	S. D.	P. E.	
9B ¹	S	15.07	5.48	.56	18.86	1.38	.22	3.79
	G	18.19	1.38	.22	18.92	1.38	.22	.80
	E	22.08	2.45	.39	23.45	1.70	.27	1.37
	P	37.18	4.90	.79	38.76	4.80	.77	1.58
9B ^{2x}	S	10.62	4.51	.79	15.57	5.25	.92	4.74
	G	15.75	2.16	.38	17.62	2.02	.35	1.87
	E	20.06	2.20	.38	21.25	2.24	.39	1.19
	P	31.31	7.19	1.27	36.81	5.82	1.03	5.50
9B ^{2y}	S	10.92	2.70	.50	15.56	2.86	.52	4.64
	G	16.50	2.56	.46	17.56	1.88	.34	1.06
	E	19.70	3.20	.56	21.30	2.25	.41	1.60
	P	29.16	7.20	1.30	35.20	7.45	1.30	6.06
9B ⁵	S	10.50	4.20	1.20	13.17	3.90	1.10	2.67
	G	11.83	.50	.11	13.83	3.29	.95	2.00
	E	16.16	5.63	1.05	20.00	1.26	.36	3.84
	P	25.00	3.40	.98	29.16	7.34	2.10	6.16
*9B	S	12.08	4.96	.47	16.09	3.68	.35	4.01
	G	16.48	2.58	.24	17.77	2.20	.21	1.29
	E	20.43	2.99	.28	21.93	2.30	.22	2.50
	P	32.25	7.22	.68	36.23	6.47	.61	3.98

* See note page 48.

Table VI compares the gains made in mean scores by the control groups and the experimental groups after a semester's work in English language. The table should be read thus: In the 9B¹ class the control group made a mean score gain in the Sentence Recognition Test of 2.84. The Experimental group made a mean score gain of 3.79. This makes a mean score gain of .95 points greater for the experimental group than for the control group. Table VI shows the same kind of record for all classes in all the tests.

All gains of the experimental group over the control group are marked with a plus (+), and all losses are marked with a minus (-).

Table VI

The Mean Score Gain of the Experimental Group Compared with the Mean Score Gain of the Control Group.

Class	Test	Mean Score Gain of Control Group.	Mean Score Gain of Experimental Group.	Gain of Experim. group compared with Gain of Control group.
9B ¹	S	2.86	3.79	+ .96
	G	.48	.80	+ .32
	E	.90	1.37	+ .47
	P	4.94	1.58	-3.36
9B ^{2x}	S	3.37	4.74	+ 1.37
	G	3.06	1.87	- 1.19
	E	1.39	1.19	- .20
	P	5.27	5.50	+ .23
9B ^{2y}	S	3.31	4.64	+ 1.33
	G	1.21	1.06	- .15
	E	1.42	1.60	+ .18
	P	3.45	6.06	+ 2.63
9B ³	S	1.16	2.67	+ 1.51
	G	3.50	2.00	- 1.50
	E	4.83	3.84	- .99
	P	8.33	6.16	- 2.17
*9B	S	2.96	4.01	+ 1.05
	G	2.04	1.29	- .75
	E	1.63	2.50	+ .87
	P	3.54	3.98	+ .44

* See note page 48.

Chapter IV.

Interppetation of Data.

In measuring the progress of the two groups used in the experiment four tests were used, as explained in the introduction. Two of these, the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test and the Test of Grammatical Correctness, were standardized tests. These were used for purposes of comparison to check conclusions that might be drawn from a phenominal increase -- should there be one-- in scores on the tests constructed by the writer of this thesis. Each of the standardized tests has two forms of relatively equal difficulty. The comparison of the scores made on the initial and the final forms of these tests should provide a true measure of progress.

The same form of the tests especially devised for this study, were used as follow-up tests. One might say that such a procedure would not be valid because the element of memory would enter in and tend to make the increase in scores unduly large. There is, of course, that objection, but an examination of the results of all the tests will show that the scores on the devised tests were increased on the final form in about the same proportion as the standardized tests.

If one still insists that the result would not show actual accomplishment, then let him remember that

two groups within the same class are compared in this experiment and that the advantage is equivalent for both groups. It seems fair to conclude then, that the results gained from any of the four tests might be used as a measure of progress.

Table V summarizes all the data presented in Tables III and IV and shows the mean score gain of each class for each of the four tests. It will be noticed that both the control group and the experimental group made an appreciable gain in each of the four tests.

Table VI presents the data from which any conclusions as to the value of the check sheet may be drawn. By comparing the two groups it will be seen that the mean score gain of the experimental group exceeds the mean score gain of the control group in every class for the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test.

In the 9B¹ class the mean score gain of the experimental group is .95 more than the mean score gain of the control group. The records of the other three classes, 9B^{2x}, 9B^{2y}, and 9B³, show that the mean score gains of the experimental group exceed those of the control group by 1.33, 1.57, and 1.51, respectively. The record for all four classes taken as one group shows that the experimental

group exceeds the control group in mean score gain by 1.05.

These gains are consistent and seem to show that the check sheet was of value in the correction of the errors found in the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test.

A study of the scores on the Test of Grammatical Correctness will show a different result. While the mean score gain of the experimental group in the 9B¹ class exceeds that of the control group by .32, in all the other classes the mean score gain of the control group exceeds the mean score gain of the experimental group. It seems that the check sheet was not of value in the correction of the errors found in this test.

In the Correct English Usage Test the experimental group in two classes, the 9B¹ and the 9B^{2y}, exceeds the control group in mean score gain by .47 and .18. In the other two classes, 9B^{2x} and 9B³, the control group exceeds the experimental group in mean score gain by .20 and .99. In the class taken as a whole the experimental group exceeds the control group in mean score gain by .87.

There is nothing conclusive in these results and no claim can be made for the check sheet as a valuable agent in the correction of errors represented in this test.

In the Punctuation Test the mean score gain of the control group exceeds the mean score gain of the experimental group in two classes, the 9B¹ and the 9B³, by 3.36 and 2.17 respectively. In the other two classes, 9B^{2x} and 9B^{2y}, the mean score gain of the experimental group exceeds that of the control group by .23 and 2.63 respectively. With the class taken together as one group the experimental group has a .44 point gain in mean score over the control group.

On the whole no claim can be made for this particular check sheet as an aid in correcting errors in grammatical correctness and correct English usage. But in all classes the group using the check sheet made a larger mean score gain in sentence recognition than the group not using the check sheet.

A few suggestions might be offered as a possible reason for this situation. In looking over all the check sheets it was very noticeable that most of the frequencies of errors were listed in the punctuation division of the test. In this division most of the frequencies were listed in Section A which deals largely with end punctuation, inner punctuation of a compound sentence, and the punctuation of direct discourse.

TWO possible explanations may be made. These very points in punctuation were stressed in class instruction, and the pupils wrote narratives nearly altogether. This means that direct discourse was used a great deal, and that with the introduction of the compound sentence, new possibilities for errors were offered.

It seems probable that the pupils would make the mistakes in English usage that were discovered on their free-choice themes and essay-type quizzes. Yet, on the whole, few errors were listed in the correct English form division of the check sheet. It is possible that pupils avoid using the forms that they are doubtful about and substitute some simpler form.

Another explanation for the ineffectiveness of the check sheet might be the spirit of rivalry on the part of the pupils in the control group which impelled them to correct their returned themes more carefully than they ordinarily would. In some classes the pupils not in the experimental group displayed great curiosity about the check sheet.

After a year's work with a class check sheet with little tangible result, the writer concludes that after all, perhaps the best way to correct individual errors is to work with each child as a separate problem and have him keep his own check sheet of errors.

Chapter V.

Summary and Conclusions.

1. At the beginning of the semester four tests were given to one hundred ten pupils in four ninth-grade English classes. These tests were the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test VI, the Test of Grammatical Correctness A, and two tests devised from errors made by these same pupils on Themes with subjects of their own choosing and on essay-type quizzes in general science and social science. The scores on the four tests and the grade made in 8A composition were used as a basis for ranking and dividing the pupils within each class into two equivalent groups.
2. A check sheet was made with correct forms for the errors found on the papers examined. At the right of each form there were twenty columns provided for recording error frequencies. The experimental group used the check sheet; the control group followed the usual procedure for correcting themes.
3. At the end of the semester Form V of the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test, Form B of the Test of Grammatical Correctness, and the two devised tests were given as a measure of the progress made by the two groups during the semester.

4. The mean score gain of the experimental group exceeded the mean score gain of the control group in all classes for the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test. In the Test of Grammatical Correctness the control group exceeded the experimental group in mean score gain for all classes except the 9B¹ class. In this case the experimental group exceeded in mean score gain by .52. In the two devised tests the experimental group exceeded the control group in mean score gain in two classes only. With the four classes considered as one group the experimental group surpassed the control group in three of the tests. In the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test the mean score gain was 1.05, in Correct English Usage the mean score gain was .87, and in Punctuation Test it was .44. The control group had a mean score gain of .75 over the experimental group in Grammatical Correctness.

5. The check sheet seemed to be a valuable factor in the elimination of such errors as are found in the Wisconsin Sentence Recognition Test. In all other tests the pupil using the check sheet showed very little gain, and often showed loss when compared with the group not using the sheet.

6. Pupils using the check sheet recorded few errors in the correct English section of the check sheet. Most

of the frequencies of errors were found in the punctuation section of the check sheet and those were limited quite generally to end punctuation, direct discourse, and the connecting punctuation in the compound sentence.

7. The writer suggests that the technique used in this experiment might be used to good advantage on individuals instead of groups. Such a procedure would involve the use of the following steps:

- a. Analyze the errors of individual pupils.
- b. Construct a check sheet upon which a child may list his own difficulties and check for frequencies.
- c. Use standardized tests for a measure of progress.

Chapter VI.
Bibliography.

- Bobbitt, Franklin, How to Make a Curriculum.
Houghton Mifflin Co., 1924.
- Charters, W. W., Curriculum Construction.
New York: The Macmillan Co.,
1923.
- Committee in Supt. H. P. Smith's Class in "Problems
in Elementary Supervision"; Is
a Check Sheet Worth While?
(Not published)
- Johnson, Roy Ivan, English Expression.
Bloomington, Ill; Public
School Publishing Co., 1926.
- Peters, C. C., Foundations of Educational Sociology.
New York: The Macmillan Co.,
1924.

Chapter VII.

Appendix.

Chapter VII includes all the tests used for measurement in the study and the check sheet especially devised for the experiment.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN

SENTENCE RECOGNITION TEST VI

Series A

Date _____ School _____

Grade _____ Teacher _____

Read each group of words carefully so as to get the meaning. Then make any necessary changes in punctuation and capital letters, especially to show the reader where every sentence really ends. Be sure to make all marks very clear and plain; any doubtful ones will be counted against you.

Make no changes whatever in the wording.

1. The rice is reaped with sickles, little more than the head is cut off.
2. If a pupil leaves things outside his locker. Before long he is minus some books and a lot of paper.
3. John became horribly frightened; his knees were weak and trembling, he rubbed his eyes to see if he was dreaming.
4. One cat was totally black, even in the circle of light thrown out by the street lamp you could hardly distinguish it from the shifting shadows.
5. "We have been busy since daybreak arranging matters to get here," said Mrs. Smith, "we could not miss hearing and seeing Abraham Lincoln."
6. Everybody thought that Jack had broken the window, there was no one to take his part.
7. I hope you will read the book through, it is certainly worth at least that much effort.
8. Maggie had just one brother and no sisters, consequently she aspired to be as big a tomboy as possible.
9. Let us leave the rest of the story untold, you will agree that it is too painful to remember.
10. Kim switched out his long turban cloth, he rolled it over and over and concealed the message in it.
11. Finally the covers are put on the book, and it is ready for gilding, a piece of gold so tiny that it can't be handled by the bare hands is used.
12. The spirits of the men were raised, they forgot some of their grudges.
13. I got the prize twice. Once for the most perfect horse-shoe crab shell, and once for the smallest one.
14. In modern hospitals skin is grafted; flesh is removed and grafted, even bones are taken from one part of the body and shaped to make a new part.
15. The Bear sits up and listens to Mrs. Wren's song, when she is through he exclaims, "Grrr, do you birds know where there is anything to eat?"
16. "Someone kick Al and tell him where we are," called Herbert, "he's gone to sleep."
17. The other children coaxed me until I went into Father's store and got them candy, this kept on until they could not think of anything else they wanted to eat.
18. In a sugar solution bubbles begin to form and rise, these are carbon dioxide.
19. All of us have mothers, therefore, it seems to me, we should all understand how many types of mothers there are.
20. Jack and John got across, but I slipped off the log and fell in the boys were on the other bank laughing at me.

When you have finished, go back over your work and make sure there are no mistakes.

63

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
SENTENCE RECOGNITION TEST V

Series A

Date _____ School _____

Grade _____ Teacher _____

Read each group of words carefully so as to get the meaning. Then make any necessary changes in punctuation and capital letters, especially to show the reader where every sentence really ends. Be sure to make all marks very clear and plain; any doubtful ones will be counted against you.

Make no changes whatever in the wording.

1. Butterflies love the hottest of suns, therefore you are most likely to catch them between twelve o'clock and three in the afternoon.
2. The school board built large buildings and had excellent teachers, they paid high wages to get the best there were.
3. "I smell something burning," called Miss Brown, "someone has allowed her sauce to scorch."
4. Fifth Avenue has been a wonderful sight; it has been covered with flags, each block represents a different nation of the Allies.
5. He is the lord of dogdom upon the hill we live on, he will kill any dog which comes on the place.
6. After the boys got upstairs they heard peculiar noises, they looked down and saw an escaped convict in the hallway, fitting a key to the closet door.
7. When Brown's few possessions had been inherited by his nephew. The nephew fell into a river and was drowned.
8. Not long ago a bomb exploded on Wall Street in New York, besides doing a lot of talking Mr. Burns and his men have done nothing to bring this crime to justice.
9. The parade was led by Sousa's band, there were many different Allied soldiers in it.
10. They could not go East again to settle down, they had been forced to leave there.
11. One year when we were up in Maine there was an explosion in one of the boats, it was caused by a man lighting a match in the cabin, where gasoline had been leaking.
12. Another hour we fished that stream, then, quite discouraged, we decided to go only to a certain tree before starting home.
13. The boards are carefully measured, this is necessary to make the corners square.
14. "Come on over here and let the rabbit go," yelled George, "we must pitch the next shock."
15. "Don't touch it! It hurts like the mischief, get something and bandage it up quick!"
16. Whitley is a good swimmer, and we used to go in bathing we also enjoyed getting up early in the morning and going for the milk.
17. On this car come the ladies who have been up town shopping. Also the high school students with their books under their arms, and a few business men.
18. Two happy boys went home that night, even though ducks were difficult to get, the hike was worth while.
19. The elementary grades are having an exhibition of things they have done in the summer, you ought to be here to see the collections some pupils have made.
20. Jack began to run, but Billy didn't see the snake in time, all he could do was to get behind a fence and wait till the snake got past him.

When you have finished, go back over your work and make sure there are no mistakes.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
TEST OF GRAMMATICAL CORRECTNESS A

Name _____ Date _____

Grade _____ School _____

Read each sentence through carefully; then write on each blank line the **one word** needed to complete the meaning and make good sense.

One word is the **most** you may write in any blank, excepting in those marked *. But you will be marked wrong if you do not put a word in every blank.

Make no change where there is not a blank to fill in.

1. Every pupil must do _____ own work in this test.
2. Mary is still _____ down on the couch, sound asleep.
3. Why didn't you come to the picnic yesterday? Didn't you know you _____ invited?
4. The boys were working hard helping Tom whitewash the fence; it looked *_____ they enjoyed it. (*In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
5. John is bright, but he failed in history; he *_____ to have worked harder, oughtn't he? (*In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
6. If I *_____ been invited I might _____ gone.
*(In this first blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
7. These apples taste sour, but I like _____ kind in the other barrel very much. (**Only a word with four or more letters** will be counted right in sentence 7.)
8. John *_____ no marbles left in his pockets. *(In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
9. Don't try to hold that dog; ----- go off his collar!
10. Don't you notice that her children's hair ----- always neatly brushed?
11. Harry was pretty tired after the game; he had ----- up to his room for a rest.
12. Mother told Johnnie to ----- down in his little chair and rest awhile.
13. Let's go down to the river; Mr. James invited you and ----- to ride in his boat. (Don't use any person's name in this blank; use a pronoun.)
14. I ate my supper long ago, John. Why *_____ you had yours yet? *(In this blank write one or two words, whichever you think best.)
15. Joe doesn't pitch ----- enough to play on our team.
16. I happened to see lightning strike a tree a block from our house last night. I'm sure you have never ----- lightning so close.
17. Somebody ----- here to my room to see you yesterday.
18. I didn't do anything wrong; I ----- all the work just as you told me to.
19. The auto didn't run well because one of the spark-plugs ----- dirty.
20. When you add or subtract, you must have each figure exactly in ----- own column.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
TEST OF GRAMMATICAL CORRECTNESS B

Name _____

Date _____

Grade _____

School _____

Read each sentence through carefully; then write on each blank line the one word needed to complete the meaning.

One word is the **most** you may write in any blank, excepting in those marked *. But you will be marked wrong if you do not put a word in every blank.

Make no change where there is not a blank to fill in.

1. You surely ----- lucky that time.
2. I'm tired; I believe I'll ----- down on this couch and take a nap.
3. Harry is no better this morning. The news we are getting *----- seem very encouraging.
*(In this blank you may write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
4. Your father ----- here to the schoolroom with these books for you during recess yesterday.
5. Everyone must show ----- own ticket at the gate.
6. Harry wanted to play with us, and so he asked his mother to ----- him come over to my house.
7. I hadn't done anything, but the teacher told Charlie and ----- to stay after school. (In this blank don't use any person's name; use a pronoun)
8. Fred had not been feeling well; he had ----- to bed and was already asleep.
9. That gun is loaded! Any fool *----- to know better than to point it at me, oughtn't he? *(In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
10. John answered that he *----- no time to play just then. (*In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
11. I wish you *----- been invited; I would ----- gone if you had.
*(In this first blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
12. You are coming, ----- you?
13. John! what have you ----- to this pump? It doesn't work!
14. We went out to look at the eclipse of the sun. Have you ever ----- an eclipse?
15. He sings so ----- that the choir-master gives him all the solos.
16. My father doesn't like these cigars; he always smokes ----- kind in the other box.
(Only words with four or more letters will be counted right in sentence 16.)
17. In her neat desk each book was in ----- own place.
18. The White Sox have won four games; it looks *----- they will win the pennant.
*(In this blank write either one or two words, whichever you think best.)
19. One of my big brothers ----- going fishing with me this afternoon.
20. Please ----- down in this chair and wait a few minutes.

TEST OF CORRECT ENGLISH USAGE.

Name _____ Class _____ Date _____

Read to students as they read silently. This is a test to see how well you know correct English Usage. In each sentence there are two forms in parentheses, one correct, and the other incorrect. Mark out the word in parentheses which is incorrect.

Example: I (climb, climbed) the cherry tree. Which word is correct? Climbed, of course. Then mark out climb, because it is incorrect. (Teacher cross out on board, thus: ~~climb~~.)

Do exactly the same way in the test. Read the sentence to get the meaning, and then cross out the work that is incorrect. Are there any questions? When you have finished, sit quietly while the others work. Begin.

- 1 I have waited (to, too) long already.
- 2 He bought two pencils and (a, an) eraser.
- 3 Some people in our town always (has, have) time for pleasure.
- 4 (It's, its) too early for the oak to shed (its, it's) leaves.
- 5 Many people drove (there, their) in (their, there) own cars.
- 6 There (is, are) twenty-seven pupils in my class.
- 7 He had (ate, eaten) his dinner when I (saw, seen) him.
- 8 An excellent student does his work (good, well).
- 9 The truant was (saw, seen) (laying, lying) in the shade of the tree near the lake.
- 10 He walked (5, five) miles every day.
- 11 I (ask, asked) my mother if I might go.
- 12 He sent my sister and (I, me) some flowers.
- 13 It looks (as if, like) they will win.
- 14 (Lets, Let's) go to the movies tonight.
- 15 He (don't, doesn't) drive his car.
- 16 (Who, Whom) did you see at the party?
- 17 I have not had (no, any) grapes this season.
- 18 Each pupil must bring (his, their) own speller.
- 19 We had (our, are) first orchestra practice today.
- 20 The whistle has (blew, blown) three times.

Name _____ Class _____ Date _____

Read aloud as students read silently. This is a test to see how well you can punctuate sentences. Below you will find twenty sentences written without some necessary capital letters, commas, apostrophes, quotation marks, and end punctuation. In some cases two or more sentences are run together.

Read over carefully each group of words to get the meaning. Then insert the proper periods, question marks, capitals, quotation marks, commas, and apostrophes. Are there any questions? When you have finished, sit quietly while the others work. Begin.

- 1 We spent a month at estes park then we went to butte montana
- 2 he used to work at innes store but now he has gone to the south for his health
- 3 If you have any old magazines at your house perhaps you can find articles about the Lusitania disaster
- 4 I had two new pencils here do you know what has become of them
bill
- 5 Mr. Andrews answered I can see no reason for such a change of affairs
- 6 Johns mother will return saturday October 16 1926
- 7 The truckster sells potatoes cabbage bcets and onions
- 8 Yes I have seen Edison the inventor
- 9 Mary is an old fashioned girl
- 10 Tho "Budget" is the high school paper it is published weekly
- 11 Many people visit niagara falls they are near buffalo new york
- 12 Charles hat was a source of trouble for he always left it on the floor
- 13 If you have any other reason now is the time to speak
- 14 Here are two good games which will you choose
- 15 Who has read this book asked the teacher
- 16 My mothers birthday is wednesday october 13.
- 17 I study civics algebra and english.
- 18 No he is only Mr. Jones the landlord.
- 19 Light colored hose are the vogue now
- 20 I have two new magazines do you want one charles

CHECK SHEET FOR WRITTEN COMPOSITION
Lawrence Junior High School

Name Grade Teacher

The teacher will indicate by symbols (I, 1; A, 5) on your theme the error you are to correct. Place a mark each time you make an error in the square opposite the correct type form. Keep your check sheet in your folder along with your themes. Head the first column on your check sheet T 1, second T 2, etc.

CORRECT TYPE FORM

I Correct pronoun form

1. Every pupil must do (his, her) own work in the test.
2. Whom did you find?
3. Mary has invited you and (me, him, her, us, them) to go.
4. The bird has built its nest.

II Contractions

1. It's too late to go.
2. Let's take a swim in the pool.

III Verb forms

1. You have never seen such apples, I'm sure.
2. Mrs. Jones came to my room to see you.
3. The tramp was lying in the shade.
4. One of the pupils was absent.
5. I didn't know you were here.
6. You ought to know better.
7. If I had been invited, I should have gone.
8. Sit in this row, please.

IV Correct adverbs

1. You have too many pins.
2. He doesn't play well enough to be on our team.

V Choice of adjectives

1. I do not like (this, that) kind of apples.
2. Mary wants a peach, but I want an orange.

VI The Connective as if

1. It looks (as if, as though) it might rain.

Other Forms

PUNCTUATION AND CAPITALIZATION

Section A

1. Everybody thought that Jack did it. There was no one to take his part.
2. John told me about it, but I cannot believe it is true.
3. Mary had no brothers; therefore she was her father's right hand man.
4. If a pupil leaves things lying around, before long he is minus some books.
5. "That is a remarkable story," said Mrs. Jones. "It's hard to believe."
6. We studied about an hour. Then we went to the show.

Section B

1. This is Saturday, January 6, 1927.
2. They spent the summer at Hot Springs, Arkansas.
3. We study science, history, and Latin.
4. Yes, this is Sam, the bootblack.
5. Mother, may I have a dollar?
6. Mary is an old-fashioned girl.
7. James's hat was always on the floor.