

CARLYLE'S INTEREST IN GOETHE

by

Mrs. Warren L. Ross

Submitted to the Department of English and the Faculty of the Graduate School of the University of Kansas in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts.

Approved by:

S. H. Whitcomb
.....
R. D. O'Leary
Department of English

May ,1922.

PREFACE

To a student of Carlyle and his relation to German literature, Carlyle's relation to Goethe appears to be one of the most important factors in his life.

So many books have been written about Carlyle and his various thoughts and literary concerns, that the lack of a work devoted to such a subject as his great interest in Goethe, is rather striking. Since we have no book of this kind, many students of Carlyle have never fully realized the real depth and significance of his interest in the German poet.

The subject has been covered in part, in Otto Baumgarten's *Carlyle and Goethe* in which the relation of the two men is discussed from a politico-social and ethical standpoint rather than from a literary one.

This thesis is an attempt to present the literary and spiritual elements of the relationship

between the two authors. For the purpose practically all of Carlyle's works have been examined. His letters also, have been used.

I wish to express my thanks to Dr. S. L. Whitcomb for his kind and generous help and to other members of the English Department faculty for their valuable criticism.

Mrs. Warren L. Ross.

CONTENTS

| | pages |
|--|-------|
| Introduction..... | 5 |
| Chapter I | |
| THE BASIS FOR CARLYLE'S INTEREST IN GOETHE..... | 10 |
| Chapter II | |
| CARLYLE'S INTEREST IN GOETHE COMPARED WITH HIS INTEREST IN OTHER GERMAN AUTHORS.... | 15 |
| Chapter III | |
| CARLYLE'S RELATION TO GOETHE | |
| A. The Friendship Between Carlyle and Goethe..... | 21 |
| B. Carlyle as a Translator of Goethe... | 31 |
| C. Carlyle as a Critic of Goethe..... | 45 |
| Conclusion..... | 78 |
| Appendix..... | 80 |
| Bibliography..... | 88 |
| Index..... | 91 |

INTRODUCTION

In viewing Carlyle's entire work in literature, the outstanding fact that impresses one, is that his greatest service was that of being interpreter and critic of German thought and literature for his country.

At the time when Carlyle was beginning to serve his literary apprenticeship, such great essayists and critics as Lamb, De Quincey, Coleridge, and Hazlitt were shining in their full brilliance in England. Considering this fact, it can only be surmised how much longer Carlyle might have struggled to win favorable public attention and how different his influence might have been had he not found new material and inspiration in the field of German letters.

In 1820, when Carlyle's literary activities had fairly begun, Germany's growing importance and superiority in literature was far from being recog-

nized in England. The idea prevailed there, that her literary spirit was still crushed from the long period of war and literary inactivity, prior to the eighteenth century.

The Niebelungenlied, Reinecke Fuchs, and such names as Luther and Brandt had long been familiar in England. Many writers of the Golden Age of German literature (from 1770 to 1820) were read and admired, principally, however, by the philosophers¹ and the historians.

Great literary figures, such as Lessing, Klopstock, Goethe, and Schiller, were but imperfectly known through faulty translations of their early works and through vague rumors; a situation which contributed towards establishing for them unjust and doubtful reputations.

Many of the lesser writers, such as Grillparzer and Klingemann, were popularly known and read in England. Kotzebue, whom Germany herself despised, was regarded by English readers as Germany's most distinguished author.² Of such minor writers there were many fair translations. Such great minds as were necessary to translate adequately the productions

.....
1. See Appendix 1

2. Wilhelm Meister, I, 3

of men like Goethe and Schiller, had no time to devote to translating. Therefore, there were only fragments or single works of the best German authors translated into English.

For the lack of a great translator or interpreter, Goethe, who was hailed by his countrymen as the greatest figure in Germany's literary history, was the most generally misunderstood and despised author known in England. He was known almost exclusively through his Werter, which had been badly translated into English from a faint and garbled French version of the novel, in which the deep philosophy of the author had been omitted.

Faust was known only to a few, through Retzsche's Outline, which consisted of illustrations of the drama accompanied by extracts from it, poorly rendered into English. From this work, the German poet gained the reputation of being a "wild mystic"

His later works were but slightly known, and any interest in them had been suppressed by a general prejudice. Although Dichtung und Wahrheit had been translated into English from the French transla-

.....
3. Wilhelm Meister, I, 4

4. Ibid.

tion of it, yet it had been so greatly condensed⁵ that it hardly resembled the original.

In addition to the imperfect translations and the false, perplexing rumors and the misleading opinions imported by travellers, further injustice was done Goethe by critics who were incompetent to judge the moral character and the writings of such a great man.

The problem of making Goethe properly understood to the English reading public was an extremely difficult one. It required not only a man of a great mind, but one who had also a great, indefatigable spirit and above all, a sustaining love for the great German author. No other critic could fill these requirements as Carlyle did.

There were several prominent English authors besides Carlyle who were recognized as authorities on German literature. Among these were Coleridge, De Quincey, and Scott, all of whom preceded Carlyle in this field of work.

Of these three, Coleridge was the most influential and the best prepared to criticise and translate

.....
5. Wilhelm Meister, I, 12

German literature. His interest was chiefly in Schiller, and to a large extent in Lessing. This interest was later transferred to the great German philosophers. One of Coleridge's greatest achievements was his translation of Schiller's Wallenstein, in 1800.⁶

As an exponent of German thought and literature in England, De Quincey could have accomplished more had he possessed a firmer mind.⁷ He is known, in this respect, chiefly for introducing Richter into England. He translated nothing from the German except some of the shorter works of Richter and Tieck.

Sir Walter Scott was the only important literary man in England who understood and admired Goethe. As a novelist, however, he found but little time to forward Goethe's welfare in Great Britain. His translation of Götz von Berlichingen in 1799 was an excellent one, but it was hardly enough to make an impression in Goethe's behalf, under the circumstances already explained.

Thus, when Carlyle discovered a new world for himself in the literature of Germany, the office of

.....
 6. Haney: German Influence on Coleridge, 23
 7. Roe: Carlyle as a Critic of Literature, 95

interpreter and critic of the Great Goethe was still open to a younger and more discerning critic than those just mentioned. This was the most important piece of work to be done in the field which had, as yet, few effective laborers. Carlyle was not long in discovering that just and competent critics and interpreters of German literature were greatly in demand in England.

Chapter I

THE BASIS FOR CARLYLE'S INTEREST IN GOETHE

The story of Carlyle's spiritual struggle cannot remain unknown to those who read his letters and his essays. It was this spiritual unrest which caused him to take an interest in Goethe. The great conflict within him gradually affected his health until, at the time when he reached manhood, it culminated in chronic dyspepsia.

This mental and physical distress aroused in him an insistent craving for something new, which finally led him to abandon mathematics and to take up the study of philosophy. Through this pursuit the conviction grew in him that literature should be his life-work.

The literary spirit of his own country was not free enough, however, to supply him with the absorbing interest which his restless soul demanded. In 1817, Mme. De Staël's *De l'Allemagne* had awakened his interest in German literature and in Goethe.

This, along with the advice of his friends who desired to help him with his spiritual problem, led him to study the German language and literature, and he found in this literature the freer spirit which his own lacked.

His study of German philosophy and literature marks the beginning of his spiritual rebirth. His enthusiasm was at first for German literature in general, but after becoming more familiar with Goethe his admiration for this poet gradually became paramount. His real acquaintance with Goethe dates from the year 1820, when he began to study German. It was the year in which he first read Faust and began to study Wilhelm Meister, the two works on which Carlyle's interest in Goethe was based.

Before Carlyle's essay entitled Faustus was published, in 1822, in The Edinburgh Review, he had failed in several literary attempts, none of which had been on German subjects. This essay on Goethe's Faust is not an important one in itself, but it is significant in many ways. It pointed out to Carlyle where his field for literary activity lay; it proved to him that Goethe was an object of interest to English readers and made him indebted to the German

poet for his first appearance in the world of letters.

His second work, *The Life of Schiller*, was important in his country as the first English biography of a German author. It demanded a close study of Goethe as well as of Schiller. This was an important factor in bringing Carlyle a profound understanding of Goethe and enabling him to recognize his superiority to Schiller and other German writers.

Perhaps the work most beneficial to Carlyle during his literary apprenticeship was his translation of *Wilhelm Meister*---in so far as Goethe had then published the novel. This work, more than any other, showed him the true Goethe in his full greatness of mind and spirit.

The first part of the novel, *Meister's Apprenticeship*, was published separately by Boyd, in 1824 and contributed much toward bringing Carlyle to the attention of the important critics of the day. He became recognized as an authority on German literature, not only in England, but also in America, where the work was read widely. The translation served further in bringing the question of Goethe into prominence and in stimulating a new interest in him.

.....
 8. *The Correspondence of Carlyle and Emerson*, 48

Meister's Travels appeared two years later with the translations of German Romance. The second part of the novel may not have brought Carlyle as much financially, as the first, but it certainly did more for him spiritually. Beyond a doubt, the spiritual philosophy in this novel was the most powerful factor in settling Carlyle's religious doubts. Goethe had given him here, an example of repose gained through conflict. His great desire to be useful in the world¹⁰ prompted him to translate the novel "as a duty" to his countrymen.

Carlyle's work concerning Goethe brought him a demand for further work regarding German literature in general. His profound knowledge of German literature and of the German people excited even the admiration of Goethe.¹¹ With the further study of German authors came a fuller realization of Goethe's greatness.

How deeply Carlyle felt his indebtedness to Goethe, his letters and essays testify. The desire to show his appreciation of his spiritual benefactor, materialized in his effort to clear Goethe's reputation in England by making him understood through a

-
9. Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, 17
 10. Johnson: Thomas Carlyle, 9
 11. Eckermann: Conversations of Goethe, III, 123

sympathetic interpretation of his thought.

Chapter II

CARLYLE'S INTEREST IN GOETHE COMPARED WITH HIS
INTEREST IN OTHER GERMAN AUTHORS

It is not a difficult matter to comprehend how Carlyle acquired his unusual understanding of the German language and thought, when one considers what a large number of German authors of all periods of German literary history he knew in the original. He has translated entire works or large fragments from many, and has quoted from the works of still more, particularly in his critical and miscellaneous essays. Throughout his entire works, we find references to many authors which show a first-hand acquaintance with them. This wide and close acquaintance with Germany's writers both greater and lesser, gave him ability to judge and to recognize the superiority of Goethe.

Carlyle was a hero-worshipper of the highest order and chose for his own hero Goethe, a "poet of

.....
12. See Appendix, 2

13

the highest rank", who had influenced his life more vitally than anyone else. The enthusiastic admiration which he had for Goethe, and which was thought exaggerated by many of his contemporaries, he felt profoundly, even toward the close of his life. No other author, of Germany, or of any other country, dwelt in Carlyle's thoughts more than Goethe.

In comparing Carlyle's translations of various German authors, several noteworthy facts strike one's attention. The first important translation which he undertook was that of Goethe's Wilhelm Meister;¹⁴ The last he ever made was Goethe's Geister-Epochen.¹⁵ In the case of the other German enthusiasts, Coleridge, De Quincey, and Scott, the largest amount of translation from any author pointed out their favorite German writers. So it was with Carlyle. From Goethe he translated the most, although only four of the translations were complete works.¹⁶ These four were all prose works. From one other important prose work, Dichtung und Wahrheit, he has translated only small fragments, in his essay on Goethe's Works.¹⁷

.....
13. Heroes and Heroworship, 157

14. Reminiscences, 105

15. Carlyle's House Catalogue

16. See Appendix, 3

17. Essays, II, 409

From the poetry he translated much less, and only fragments. The longest and most important of these are from Faust; a speech in the first act of Part One, published separately in 1832 as Faust's Curse,¹⁸ and long passages from the Helena. This is the only drama from which any translations were made by him. From the shorter poems he has translated only a few stanzas here and there.¹⁹

Schiller ranks next to Goethe as to amount of translation by Carlyle, although he has given us no complete work. He has translated many scenes, and generous fragments from five of Schiller's dramas and one from The Thirty Years War. The Song from the Alps is the only short poem he translated from this German poet.

Carlyle shows a great fondness, in all his works, but particularly in the critical essays, for quoting German authors. It is a fact, perhaps to be expected, that Goethe is found, by actual count, to be quoted most out of the twenty-eight or more authors from whom he gives quotations.²⁰ These quotations he always takes care to translate, however short they may be, to avoid misinterpretation of the German text.

.....
 18. Essays I, Goethe's Helena
 19. See Appendix, 4
 20. Ibid. 5

The quotations from Goethe are chiefly bits of philosophy, taken mainly from Meister's Travels, although many are from Faust. A few are taken from Dichtung und Wahrheit, The Venetian Epigrams, and the favorite little Xenien. Carlyle's favorite quotation from Goethe, to which he probably referred most often, was that in Meister's Travels on the Christian Religion.²¹ Another passage from the same volume he was fond of quoting because it embodied Goethe's doctrine, as well as his own, of the worship of sorrow: "Wer nie sein Brot in Tränen ass", etc.²²

Up to the year 1833, the year following Goethe's death, we find that out of thirty-four works, originally published under separate titles, twenty-five are on German subjects and ten of these deal with Goethe alone. After the year of Goethe's death, no more works devoted to him were published, although he figures noticeably in many of Carlyle's writings.

Out of the sixty-eight publications of Carlyle considered in the present study, forty-six contain references to Goethe.²³ Of these works twenty-one containing references were published after the year

.....
 21. Wilhelm Meister, II

22. Ibid.

23. See Appendix, 6

of Goethe's death. It is not only in his earliest writings that Carlyle likes to speak of Goethe. He makes many brief critical remarks and also discusses Goethe at great length, in his later books. Even in his last important work, Frederick the Great, he refers to Goethe more often than he does to any other German author of general note.

Although there were several forces at work in forming Carlyle's thoughts and views, the influence of Goethe, taken as a whole, seems to have been the most effective. Carlyle himself seemed to be more conscious of it and to value it more highly. Goethe alone could exercise the influence on Carlyle's religion capable of changing his whole view of life. Carlyle expresses his recognition of this fact when he says in a letter to Goethe: "To you I owe the all-precious knowledge and experience that Reverence is still possible; that, instead of conjecturing and denying, I can again believe and know."²⁴

Carlyle's philosophy was based to a large extent on that of Goethe and the German Transcendental philosophers.²⁵ In Goethe he saw the principles of

.....
 24. Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, 234

25. Johnson: Thomas Carlyle, 112

Kant applied. To these principles he believed
 "all that was lofty and pure in the genius of poetry";²⁶
 was due.

It is from Fichte, however, more than from Goethe that Carlyle acquired the principles of ethics which he applied in his Sartor Resartus. In this work also, however, Goethe's influence may be seen. In Sartor Resartus Goethe's sublimity is combined with Swift's satire.²⁷ It embodies not only Carlyle's but also Goethe's spiritual history. Its two central chapters correspond in a way to the two parts of Wilhelm Meister. The Apprenticeship, like the Everlasting No, deals with a mind and spirit in the process of development. The Travels and the Everlasting Yea teach that "Thought without Reverence is barren."²⁸

.....
 26. Johnson: Thomas Carlyle, 112

27. Garnett: Life of Thomas Carlyle, 70

28. Sartor Resartus, 54

Chapter III

CARLYLE'S RELATION TO GOETHE

A. The Friendship Between Carlyle and Goethe

One of Carlyle's dearest possessions in life was Goethe's friendship. He had felt drawn to him from the time when he first read Faust, in 1820. "Since then," he wrote to Goethe, four years later, "I have²⁹ always hoped to see you and pour out my heart to you." His "day-dream" of seeing Goethe was never to be realized, however.

It was Carlyle's vigorous and aggressive spirit which finally brought about the friendship between the two men. In order to satisfy his strong desire for a personal friendship with Goethe, he sent him a copy of his translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship. It was accompanied by a letter in which he expressed his appreciation and thanks to Goethe, for presenting a solution, in this work, for his spiritual difficulties.

.....
 29. Hertz: Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel,
 June 24, 1824, 1

This letter was written in June, 1824, when Carlyle, then twenty-eight years of age, was staying at Irving's house in London. Little did he dream this was the beginning of a warm and sincere friendship, which was to terminate only with Goethe's death, seven years later.

Goethe's answer, as Carlyle wrote to Jane Welsh when he had received it, "seemed like a message from fairy-land", although only the signature was in Goethe's own handwriting.

The correspondence rested here until Carlyle resumed it, two years later, after his marriage to Jane Welsh. He sent Goethe copies of his Life of Schiller and the four volumes of German Romance which contained the translation of Wilhelm Meister's Travels. The Carlyles were living in Craigenputtock, from which place nearly all the letters to Weimar were written. At this time Goethe was nearing his seventy-eighth year. In spite of the great differences in their years and in their personalities, their letters show an increasing interest and admiration for each other. Carlyle always received German

.....
 30. Love Letters of Carlyle and Jane Welsh,
 Oct. 30, 1824, II, 60

answers to his letters, written in English.

The correspondence was not at all important in itself, but it gave Carlyle a feeling of kinship with a "world genius" which was a wonderful inspiration to him. To him the letters were "something divine". "Write again, and soon," he said at the close of a letter to Goethe, "that I may always feel united with you".

The attitude of Carlyle toward the poet, may be shown by his own words from one of his earliest letters to Goethe: "It is you more than any other man that I should always thank and reverence with the feeling of a disciple to his master, nay, of a Son to his Spiritual Father". His frank admiration and his warm praises for Goethe have no semblance of flattery, but show above all, a deep reverence for Goethe as his "Teacher of Wisdom".

During the period of his correspondence with Goethe, Carlyle was writing his essays and Sartor Resartus. He kept Goethe informed regarding the work he was doing. He was reading many of Goethe's works. In his letter of December 22, 1829, he told

.....
31. Carlyle's letters are in the possession of Mrs. A. Carlyle.

32. Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, Sept. 25, 1828; 45

33. Ibid., Apr. 15, 1827; 17

him of sending "an essay on Schiller to the Foreign Review" based on the "Goethe-Schiller correspondence".

His letters are full of his hopes and ambitions. He was planning a book on Luther, one on the History of German Literature, and a translation of Faust, none of which was actually written. At one time he expressed bright hopes of becoming a writer in a far better sense "than a mere writer of essays". This was a reference to his Sartor Resartus with which he hoped to give Goethe a surprise. Two years later, when Carlyle was on his way to make arrangements regarding its publication, he learned of Goethe's death.

The answers to Carlyle's letters were always kind and gracious, without a trace of condescension. Often they were "full of kind nothings" and contained charming little verses; then again they abounded in philosophy and criticism.

Contrary to Carlyle, who often made remarks concerning his parents, his home, and Mrs. Carlyle, who "was intending to read all of Goethe's works", Goethe was very reserved. He seldom wrote anything about his work or his personal affairs. Only through his brother John, who was studying medicine in

Germany, did Carlyle learn that Goethe was revising all his works. No mention of his son's death was ever made by Goethe, even after Carlyle's message of sympathy. Goethe showed much sympathy and appreciation for Carlyle's work in regard to German literature. On July 17, 1827, he asked Zelter, in a letter, to find out something about Carlyle "who has in a remarkable manner done very worthy work in regard to German literature". Goethe was by no means unaware of his unpopularity in England and appreciated Carlyle's efforts in his behalf. He expressed heartfelt thanks for the good and kind sentiments spoken by Carlyle, in his translation of Wilhelm Meister, concerning his life and character. ³⁴

Goethe, more than Carlyle, was aware of the great difference in their personalities and their literary tastes, on account of which they could never become intimate friends. Carlyle's letters revealed to Goethe his lack of artistic sense of form and rhythm. For this reason Carlyle, who felt more free than Goethe to discuss what was nearest to his heart, often felt puzzled over the "ordinary talk" in the poet's letters which could, at times, "sound like oracles". Animated discussions on "das Wesen der

34. Hertz: Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, July 20, 1827; 22

schönen Künste", such as are found in the Goethe-Schiller correspondence, are therefore lacking in that of Goethe and Carlyle.

Such subjects as Scotch writers, Carlyle's work, and the welfare of German literature in England in the hands of various translators and critics, were those chiefly discussed. "In the last six years", Carlyle informs Goethe at one time, "English readers of German literature have increased tenfold".³⁵

Later he reports, "German is becoming more known and appreciated by the English. In Oxford and Cambridge they are even beginning to take an interest. Niebuhr has there found a clever translator and in Oxford they have two or three Germans teaching the German language."³⁶

In many ways, Goethe's friendship proved beneficial to Carlyle. He received from it much encouragement and practical help. The advice and suggestions which he often asked of the poet were always graciously given. On Carlyle's request for help in writing his History of German Literature, Goethe referred him to Eckermann, who gave him "all

.....
35. Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, Apr. 18, 1828; 87

36. Ibid., Dec. 22, 1829; 215

the information needed regarding the newest in German literature".³⁷ Many books and magazines were sent him by Goethe to be used in his work, as references. When Carlyle applied for the professorship of philosophy at The University of St. Andrews, he asked Goethe to write a testimonial,³⁸ a request with which the poet complied generously, although it could have been of no avail, had it come on time.

It was owing to their friendship, that Goethe wrote the introduction to the German translation of Carlyle's Life of Schiller, and suggested his name for membership in the Society for Foreign Literature, at Berlin, to which he was elected. At Goethe's request Carlyle gave him his judgment of Charles de Voeux's translation of Torquato Tasso, which the English author considered "trivial, nay, altogether unworthy".³⁹

No other English writer enjoyed Goethe's friendship as fully as Carlyle did, not even Sir Walter Scott, who admired the German author greatly. Although Scott wrote to him and sent him a copy of his Life of Napoleon, yet it was through Carlyle that

.....
 37. Hertz: Goethes und Carlyles Briefweshsel, June 15, 1828; 97

38. Ibid., Jan. 7, 1828; 184

39. Ibid., Apr. 18, 1828; 87

Goethe sent an answer of thankful appreciation. Besides this, Carlyle enjoyed the distinction of representing Goethe in awarding the six medals to his English friends. Two of these were to be given to Scott and the remaining four, as he judged best.

There were many books and other gifts exchanged between the two authors, and also some gifts between their wives. During the seven years of friendship Carlyle had received an entire set of Goethe's works, besides all the numbers of Kunst und Altertum and some of the Jahresheft which Goethe thought might prove useful to him. They exchanged sketches of their homes, those of Carlyle's house in Craigenputtock being put to use by the German poet and the translator of Carlyle's Life of Schiller, for prints in that work. Several medallions and portraits of Goethe were also presented to the Carlyles. How proud they were of these gifts may be surmised from some of the letters to Goethe. In this letter Carlyle describes how they have arranged the presents in the "little drawing-room" in Craigenputtock. These pictures, medallions, and portraits later

adorned the walls of the Carlyles' house in Cheyne Row, where they may still be seen with a few of the books and other gifts.⁴¹

Goethe's last letter to Carlyle is dated August 19, 1831. The answer reached Weimar a few days after the poet's death in April, 1832. Carlyle sincerely mourned the loss of Goethe. In August, 1834, he wrote to Emerson, "From Germany I get letters, messages, and even visits; but now no tidings, no influences of moment."⁴²

Although the friendship had never been an intimate one, yet it cannot be denied that his contact with the great and powerful personality of Goethe, left a lasting impression on Carlyle. It served to deepen Carlyle's interest in literature. After Goethe's death, he gradually became more interested in history and biography. It also removed the few scruples which Carlyle may have entertained concerning Goethe's character,⁴³ and broadened his view, in this respect, in regard to other literary personalities. The friendly interest which he needed in his period of apprenticeship came from Goethe, as an

.....
41. Carlyle's House Catalogue. See Appendix, 7

42. The Correspondence of Carlyle and Emerson, I, 24

43. Wilhelm Meister, I, 12

encouragement which others did not give.

The visit to Weimar which Carlyle had spoken of
in his letters to Goethe, did not take place until
44
1852.

B. Carlyle as a Translator of Goethe

Great translators for the masters in literature and in thought are rare, for there are few authors with the originality and genius of a Carlyle who are willing to sacrifice their time to express thoughts other than their own.

The qualifications essential to a translator of Goethe's prose, were never found so happily combined in any other writer as they were in Carlyle. The most important of these was his sympathetic understanding of the author. He also possessed that greatness of mind and that thorough knowledge of both the English and the German language which were necessary for the correct interpretation of Goethe's thought.

Carlyle made no pretensions to being a great translator, but his version of Wilhelm Meister, his best work of this nature, has never been surpassed by any other writer. The second edition, which is used in the present paper, shows some improvements on his first version, but it contains few of the changes that

Goethe made in his revision of the original text. These changes were concerned with sentence length and new rules in spelling which did not affect the thought. Meister's Apprenticeship does not have the polish of Meister's Travels which appeared three years later, after Carlyle had done more extensive work as a translator and a critic.

Carlyle's praise of William Taylor's translation of German poetry, indicated the rule he himself follows in translating Goethe: "Rigorous adherence to the original, he endeavors at least to copy with all possible fidelity, the turn of phrase, the tone, the very meter, whatever stands written for him. This he thought the safest rule to follow, in order to transmute the author's exact thoughts, which was the paramount issue with him."

In the following sentence it may be observed how, even in long, winding sentences, the translator retains the word order of the original, so far as the English syntax allows: "Nach einer unruhigen Nacht, die unser Freund teils wachend, teils von schweren träumen geängstigt zubrachte, in denen er Marianen

bald in aller Schönheit, bald in kümmerlichen gestalt, jetzt mit einem Kinde auf dem arm, bald desselben beraubt sah, war der Morgen kaum angebrochen, als Mignon schon mit einem Schneider hereintrat." In the translated sentence the tone as well as the thought is preserved: "After a restless night, which our friend spent, sometimes waking, sometimes oppressed with unpleasant dreams, seeing Mariana now in all her beauty, now in woeful case, at one time with a child on her arm, then soon bereaved of it, the morning had scarcely dawned, when Mignon entered with a tailor"⁴⁶.

However literal Carlyle's translations may be, he takes care never to sacrifice English idiom to the German: "Das Recht zur Krone war nicht erblich",⁴⁷ becomes "The crown was not hereditary".

Often he lessens the tedium of the long, winding, German sentence, which is so distasteful to the English, by merely replacing semicolons with periods, in this way making two, or perhaps three sentences out of one.⁴⁸ He does not recast a sentence for this purpose, but only for the sake of smoothness, as in this sentence: "Ihm, einem treuen und zärtlichen

.....
46. Wilhelm Meister, I, 147

47. Ibid., 236

48. Ibid., Book IV, Ch. 18, 306-307

Sohn, blieb, da sein Vater starb, eine Mutter noch übrig". The German order here is impossible for the English and the rendering is, "The faithful tender son had yet a mother, when his father passed away"⁴⁹

Although Carlyle, in his desire for fidelity, occasionally gives us a sentence with a decided German flavor, yet the meaning is always clear; for example: "The Baron then drew forth a purse through whose beautiful texture the bright glance of new gold coin was sparkling out."⁵⁰

On the other hand, his faithfulness to the text enabled him to preserve the fine spirit of many beautiful passages which might have become flat and lifeless in an attempt to reconstruct them. "Wenn Minerva gauz gerüstet aus dem Haupte Jupiters entsprang, so scheint diese Göttin in ihrem vollen Putze, aus irgend einer Blume mit leichtern Fusse, hervorgetreten sein". In this description, the heroine retains her full charm in the English version; "As Minerva sprang in complete armor from the head of Jove, so does this goddess seem to have stepped forth, with a light foot, in all her ornaments,

.....
49. Wilhelm Meister I, 280

50. Ibid., 238

51

from the bosom of some flower".

It is when we view the single word that we realize wherein lie the vigor and originality which give the translation its reputation for "raciness".⁵²

While Carlyle likes to translate word for word, he often substitutes a whole phrase for one word, to retain the author's spirit. Goethe's phrase descriptive of little Mignon, "ihre Stirne geheimnisvoll", Carlyle has rendered, "her brow was full of mystery".⁵³ This retains the poetic quality of the original, which is lost in the version of another well-known translator,⁵⁴ who gave the more liberal translation, "her brow was mysterious". Another example of this tendency which also shows Carlyle's originality, is given in his translation of Goethe's portrayal of Hamlet's companions as "bewegliche und falsche Höflinge". Carlyle cleverly preserved the sarcastic tone in "the false and changeful 'insects of the court'".⁵⁵

In trying to imitate Goethe's colloquial terms, he sometimes shows a fondness for coining words and

-
51. Wilhelm Meister I, 233
 52. Wylie: Life of Carlyle, 116
 53. Wilhelm Meister I, 129
 54. Boylan, Bohn Library
 55. Wilhelm Meister I, 253

expressions which sound awkward, as in the statement regarding Philina which he renders, "Men rather wished to see her 'selves-two' than on the boards",⁵⁶ or in "Wilhelm had 'used himself' to gray".⁵⁷

One of the characteristics of the Apprenticeship which is less marked in *The Travels*, is Carlyle's effort to imitate the sounds in the original. He translates "glänzen" as "glancing"; "Harnisch" as "harness"; "Geld" as "gold"; "beraubt" as "bereaved" and other words in a like manner. Here, while the translations in themselves are not incorrect, the unusual words add an archaic quality that is not implied in the original. Contrary to his later custom of translating every word, he has thought it more dignified to leave in the original such terms as "Amtmann" (magistrate), "Actuarius" (clerk), "Stadtrath" (Mayor) and "Jägerhaus" (hunting-lodge).

While Carlyle's translation has called forth the praises of many critics, including De Quincey and Jeffrey, yet he has been severely censured by others for being "too little concerned for that English domestic purity which others had found was not likely

.....
 56. *Wilhelm Meister I*, 379
Ibid., 84

58

to profit by suggestions from the German literature". This same critic has blamed him for leaving "in perfectly unmodified form, passages that do not appear in any other translations, not even in Bohn's, where they are either given partially or wholly omitted".⁵⁹

It would be digressing too far to point out the errors of this critic who has confused Carlyle's translation with that of Boylan which work he praises. But it may be proper to state that although Carlyle did not wish to improve on the style and subject-matter of the author because he did not believe that to be the privilege of a translator,⁶⁰ yet he left out a few offending phrases here and there. It is true that Boylan does omit and modify a great many passages, but not merely because they offend the English taste, but because he does not always realize the full significance. It is only when one compares Carlyle's translation with another that one really appreciates his fine interpretation of Goethe's thought and his ability in expressing it. In the following sentence, "How many things have I

.....
58. Wylie, Life of Carlyle, 116

59. Dr. A. H. Japp, German Life and Literature, 352

60. Wilhelm Meister, I, 10

proposed to do, how many have I planned; yet how we
 linger in our noblest purposes!" ⁶¹ he has kept the
 original sigh of regret which has been allowed to
 escape in the condensed version of Boylan: "How
 many things have I undertaken and intended, which I
 have never done". The beauties of Goethe's prose
 are retained chiefly through well-chosen words.
 "Ein tausendfaches Echo" has been translated "a
 thousand-voiced echo". Boylan has worded it, "a
⁶²
 thousand times reiterated echo".

Carlyle's superiority in understanding Goethe's
 ideas may be noticed in the description of Mignon,
 in which it was difficult to follow the original
 closely: "Her countenance was not regular, but
 striking...her nose extremely beautiful; her mouth,
 although it seemed too closely shut for one of her
 age, and though she often threw it a side, had yet
 an air of frankness and was very lovely". Carlyle
 here has conveyed Goethe's idea that Mignon's beauty
⁶³
 outshone her faults.

Boylan has given us another impression: "Her face
 was not regular, but impressive...her nose extremely
 beautiful, and the shape of her mouth indicated much

.....
 61. Wilhelm Meister, II, 10

62. Ibid., I, 60

63. Ibid., I, 129

good nature and was very charming, though perhaps too closely compressed for her age, and moreover, the child was accustomed to distart her lips in a very disagreeable manner". He has almost completely obscured Mignon's beauty by enlarging on a little blemish which Goethe added to enhance her loveliness, by way of contrast.

On the whole, Carlyle's expressions carry a force that lend a distinction to his work. The sentence in which Old Barbara asks Mariana to disrobe (⁶⁴ "Ziehe dich aus"), Carlyle has quaintly rendered, "Come, doff you", for which Boylan has substituted the blunt command, "Come, strip". The expression Carlyle translates "the stateliest piece of architecture", ⁶⁵ Boylan calls "the most beautiful building". Such commonplace expressions which have caused other translations to sound cold and mechanical, Carlyle has carefully and successfully avoided.

The volume of Travels shows Carlyle at his best, as a translator. It contains none of the defects which drew the attention of the reader in the Apprenticeship. He has entered more into the poetic

.....
64. Wilhelm Meister, I, 8

65. Ibid., II, 96

spirit. Although one could hardly say the thought is clearer, one is obliged to note the smooth, polished prose which so closely resembles the original in all its beauty and variations of style. How exceedingly well Carlyle followed the deep and intricate thoughts of Goethe which abound in Meister's Travels may be seen in what he considers the finest passage in the book; the one on the three religions. ⁶⁶

While Carlyle ranks among the highest as a translator of prose, he was not able to win the same distinction for himself in regard to Goethe's poetry. This was owing to his lack of an ear for poetry, the music in the verse. In all his translations of verse he has kept both the rhyme and meter of the original. It is perhaps Mignon's beautiful song of Italy that is Carlyle's very best work in the translation of verse. His enthusiasm for Mignon gave him an inspiration which was lacking for all his other metrical translations. In no other has he retained the spirit and the haunting charm as he has here. The lines are smooth, colorful, and musical. The opening lines of the last stanza:

.....
66. Wilhelm Meister, II, 265-268

"Kenⁿst du den Berg und seinen Wolkensteg?
Das Maultier sucht im Nebel seinen Weg,"

has never been as finely rendered by any other:

"Knowst thou the mountain bridge that hangs
on cloud? 69
The mules in mist grope o'er the torrent loud."

These more than compensate for the weaker lines of the second stanza.

The most important translation of Goethe's poetry was from Faust. This amounted to a little more than one-third of the Helena and appeared in his essay entitled Goethe's Helena, 68 in the Foreign Review, 1828. Lord Gower was one of the first to attempt a translation of Faust and his version was a highly imperfect one in both form and interpretation. Carlyle was the first translator who showed that both the meter and the rhythmical character of the original could be preserved in a foreign version.

As for prose, so far verse he translates literally. Wherever he finds it necessary, to preserve the thought, he sacrifices form to subject-matter, which in part accounts for the prosaic quality of his translations of the Helena. The following is a speech from Helena:

.....
67. Wilhelm Meister, I, Book 3, chap. 1

68. Essays I

"Augenstrahl ist mir verliehen,
 Wie dem Luchs auf höchstem Baum,
 Doch nun musst ich mich bemühen
 Wie aus tiefem düsterm Traum."

Carlyle's version of this sounds like prose in which the meaning is not entirely clear:

"Eyesight truly hath been lent me,
 Like the lynx on highest tree,
 Boots not; for amaze hath shent me;
 Do I dream or do I see?" 69

"Eyesight" does not contain the beauty of the word "augenstrahl". The almost inexpressible feeling of unreality which the original words convey was not suggested in Carlyle's version. "Boots" and "shent" detract from the musical quality of the lines, while the abrupt question of the last line, seems disconnected from the rest.

Carlyle greatly lacked ear for melody and meter in poetry. The flowing, graceful lines of Goethe for this reason, sound irregular and awkward; they sound labored, rather than mechanical. The translation of the following speech of Helena may serve as an example of this:

"Von oft betretner, langersehnten Schwelle mich,
 Entlass'nam Gaste gleich, entfernend scheiden
 mag."

The thought in Carlyle's translation of these lines is entirely clear, but the language is almost "impossible":

"From the oft-trod, long-wished-for threshold,
 like a guest
 That has took leave, I would withdraw my steps
 for aye." 70

In general, Carlyle has preserved Goethe's thought a little more faithfully than anyone else. Taylor's translation, which is perhaps a much freer one, has retained more of the musical rhythm of the original. His rendering of this passage is smooth and graceful:

"Even as a guest dismissed, would take myself
 away
 From this oft-trodden threshold I so longed to
 tread." 71

Taylor's felicity of expression is due to a poetic instinct and creative power which Carlyle did not possess.

Although Carlyle lacked the guidance of an inspiration in himself, which is almost necessary in translating the poetry of a great genius, yet he often reveals his poetic soul with passages that almost surpass the original in charm, as in the following:

.....
 70. Essays I

71. Taylor: Faust II, 169

"Hinangefahren der vordern Schiffe Schnäbel
kaum
Das Land begrüßten, sprach er wie vom Gott
bewegt."

"The first ships with their prows but kissed
the land,
He rose and said, as by the voice of gods
inspired." 72

C. Carlyle as a Critic of Goethe

73

In his essay on Genius, Schopenhauer has made a remark concerning those critics of Goethe, who "think themselves justified in sitting in judgment upon his personal morality and trying if they cannot discover here or there some spot in him which will soothe the pain they feel at the sight of so great a mind---a pain excited by comparison with the overwhelming feeling of their own nothingness". This condition explains in part, the cause for Goethe's unpopularity in England.

Coleridge was the greatest and most influential critic in England at the time when Carlyle began to write. He possessed a thorough knowledge of the German language and literature, regarding which he was considered the foremost English authority at that time. He had read and studied a great many of Goethe's works which influenced him decidedly.

.....
 73. Schopenhauer: *Parerga and Paralipomena*, 76

His Friend shows a marked influence of Faust.

Nevertheless, Coleridge did not fully appreciate Goethe's genius, nor entirely approve of him.

Although he conceded to him universal talent and exquisite taste, yet "he felt a want of moral life to be the defect of his poetry".⁷⁴ Coleridge's

lukewarm reception of Goethe's productions "was a great obstacle to their appreciation by his countrymen".⁷⁵ He placed Goethe far below Schiller, who

was his favorite among the German poets. His attitude is explained by his dislike for Goethe,⁷⁶ which continued to the end of his career.

Jeffrey was another prominent critic in England who was at the height of his fame in 1816. In knowledge of the German language and literature, he was much inferior to Coleridge. He had a strong dislike for everything that was German and could never understand Carlyle's enthusiasm for Goethe, of whose works he had read but few.

Jeffrey's opinion of Goethe was based chiefly on his reading of Carlyle's translation of Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship. His criticism of the

.....
74. Haney: German Influence on Coleridge, 30

75. Columbia University Germanic Studies, IV, 63

76. Ibid.

novel appeared in The Edinburgh Review, in August, 1825,⁷⁷ and shows how little he knew or understood the real Goethe. This work he termed "after the most deliberate consideration, to be eminently absurd, puerile, incongruous, vulgar, and affected".....one flagrant offense against every principle of taste and every just rule of composition".⁷⁷

Jeffrey was the originator of the historical method of criticism. He makes use of it here, to explain the vulgar taste of Goethe and other German authors, as a product of historical developments. The Germans, he said, "had neglected their native literature for two hundred years" during a period of warfare and reconstruction. Owing to the "comparative newness of original composition,"⁷⁸ they used poor models of the English, to copy from, being unable to judge which were the best.

De Quincey did Goethe a great deal of harm in the criticism of his works. He had a fair knowledge of German and had read much in German literature, yet his preparation for criticism of as great a poet as Goethe, was inadequate. The essay entitled 'Goethe's

.....
 77. Jeffrey: Contributions to The Edinburgh Review, 106

78. Ibid.

Wilhelm Meister was the only piece of criticism he ever wrote concerning this German poet. It was one of the most unjust criticisms of Goethe ever written. His feelings for the foreign poet border on hate. He stubbornly refused to see anything good in Goethe's writings, in which he saw him "always traveling on into by-paths of unnatural or unhallowed interests". De Quincey closes his essay by applying to Goethe, Cicero's remark on "the mischief done by profligate men" who are not only corrupt themselves but also corrupt others.

The first critic of German literature in England who saw Goethe in a favorable light, was William Taylor of Norwich. He was well acquainted with the German language and particularly with the earlier German literature. Although he had spent some time in Germany, like Coleridge, he had also taken too little interest in Goethe to visit him. He confessed that he knew very little of Goethe. He translated Goethe's Iphigenie and much of his Faust, besides Mignon's Song.

While Taylor does not feel a dislike for Goethe and admires him in many respects, he shows no genuine

.....
79. De Quincey: Masters of Literature, 236

80. Taylor: Historic Survey of German Poetry, III, 242

appreciation of his worth. His lack of real critical judgment may be seen in his statement lamenting Goethe's failure to fulfill the promises of his youth. Taylor admits that he does not make much of Faust, which, "though not the best work of Goethe, is the most singular, fantastic, and impressive".⁸¹ Werter he considers far superior to Wilhelm Meister,⁸² which he terms "a tedious, planless, novel."

Taylor ranked Goethe along with Katzebue, who was perhaps his favorite German writer. This alone shows how little he could estimate the real merit of Goethe. As a critic of considerable influence, he probably did not add to Goethe's repute in England.

When such authorities as those just discussed have misunderstood and misjudged Goethe so greatly, it is not to be wondered at, that his readers could not interpret his works correctly, or that they should be prejudiced against him.

Carlyle was the first really great critic and interpreter of Goethe in England. From 1828 to 1850 he was the only interpreter of German thought in his country.⁸³ Not before his translation of

.....
81. Taylor: Historic Survey of German Poetry, III
323

82. Ibid., 348

83. Roe: Carlyle as a Critic of Literature, 145

Wilhelm Meister appeared, did English readers begin
84
to recognize Goethe's greatness.

Carlyle believed it to be his supreme mission to remove the prejudice against Goethe, among his countrymen; not only because he felt indebted to him, but also on account of his belief in the great benefit, both cultural and spiritual, that they would receive from reading Goethe's works. This sense of duty added a force to his great undertaking.

Carlyle shows in his essays that he is perfectly aware of the difficult and "hazardous" nature of this undertaking. He entered upon it with his characteristic vigor of determination that carried with it conviction from the very beginning. Carlyle was "blind on certain sides, but where he saw, he saw
85
with astounding clearness". It was this power of vision that enabled him to grasp the entire situation and to understand the causes of this universally hostile attitude of his countrymen toward Goethe.

That a part of this misunderstanding of Goethe's character, was due to his unfriendly critics and careless translators, Carlyle realized from the first. From his own experience with Faust and Wilhelm

.....
84. Wilhelm Meister, I, 2

85. Johnson: Thomas Carlyle, 2

Meister which he was slow in understanding, he learned that it takes study and effort to appreciate fully, a great work of genius. "With every work of real and abiding excellence," he states in his essay on Goethe, "the first glance is the least favorable."⁸⁶ Carlyle had recognized the fact that the fragmentary condition of Faust in which the transgressor was as yet left unpunished, did a great deal to raise doubts concerning Goethe's moral principles. It brought him the realization of the fact that the English readers were in need of an interpreter of Goethe's works, and a critic who was not a mere faultfinder.

Carlyle's success in this venture of upholding Goethe's cause against great odds, was based on his profound knowledge and understanding of German, and his deep love for Goethe. His essays on the State of German Literature and Taylor's Historic Survey of German Poetry give one a fair idea of the vast amount of reading Carlyle did in the literature of Germany. Most of this was done in the original language. He had not only read all of Goethe's works but had made a careful study of his most important ones.⁸⁷

.....
86. Wilhelm Meister, I, 8

87. Essays, II, 380

Carlyle was a student of the history of the development of the German language. He had studied⁸⁸ the old German language in the Niebelungenlied. The essay on Early German Literature indicates his familiarity with the later forms and dialects which enabled him to translate passages from Trimberg and⁸⁹ Hans Sachs into English.

This knowledge of the language enabled Carlyle to perceive what difficulties it still presented to the German authors unless it were "in the hands of the gifted". He could appreciate "how supremely good" the gifted Goethe had made "this corrupt Prussian⁹⁰ dialect!"

His work as a translator contributed not a little to Carlyle's understanding of German literature. It brought him intimate acquaintance with the style and thought of many German writers, particularly Goethe, and also taught him the difference between German and English taste. "The Germanhood" of the German⁹¹ writers he regarded "as a quality, not as a fault".

Carlyle had also studied the history of the German people, as may be seen in his essay entitled

.....1.....
88. Essays II, 223-238

89. Ibid., 292

90. Frederick the Great, I, 325

91. German Romance, I, 4

Prinzenraub. No other English critic knew as much about their literature, science, and art as Carlyle. The thorough knowledge of their intellectual history enabled him to understand the qualities of the German mind of which he deemed Goethe the embodiment.

Because Carlyle was an enthusiastic admirer of Goethe, it must not be thought that he admired German literature in its entirety. In Sartor Resartus and in Frederick the Great he repeatedly expresses a hearty dislike for the pedantry of the German writers with "its long-winded and unnecessary detail" --- a fault from which he declared Goethe, however, to be entirely free. He attributes to the style of many of the "Prussian books" a "dull, tombstone quality."

Carlyle's interest regarding current criticism of Goethe was not limited to books alone. He searched through foreign newspapers and magazines for any ideas that might have been expressed concerning him. He had mastered the French language before he thought of studying German. Later he had learned both Italian and Spanish, as well.

.....
92. Essays IV

93. Sartor Resartus, 22

94. Frederick the Great, I, 18

95. Ibid., 321

96. Copeland: The Letters of Thomas Carlyle, 45

97. Craig: The Making of Carlyle, 126

He studied the best critics in Germany, particularly Schlegel, many of whose opinions regarding Goethe's character and works, he had accepted. Many German critics had been as slow to admire Goethe as Carlyle himself had been. In Novalis, who censured Goethe in secret at first and later made amends for it, he saw a promise of Goethe's final triumph in England.

Carlyle's views concerning Goethe expressed in his essays, have been generally accepted by modern critics. He was the first English critic, who did not judge the poet by a moral or a sectarian standard, a fault for which he censured Taylor.⁹⁸

The methods of criticism which Carlyle employed, are the biographical, the historical, and the comparative.

He was the first English critic who recognized the value of *Dichtung und Wahrheit* for the interpretation of the works of its author. His essays contain many quotations from this autobiography, to show how intimately Goethe's private history is interwoven with his writings, and how many difficult problems it could solve.⁹⁹

Although Jeffrey first used the historical method

 98. Essays II, 366
 99. Ibid., I, 220-224

Carlyle used it more effectively and correctly. He showed Goethe's relation to his age and understood him as a product of its conditions. To him the doubt, the discontent, and the despair of Werter and Faust were not merely the expressions of the author's own soul, but a voicing of the general unrest and discontent which was felt all over Europe.

Carlyle pointed out qualities in Goethe, by comparing him with other literary figures. He compared him most often with Shakespeare, whose world English readers had not yet seen through German eyes. He often classed him with Homer and compared him with various other authors, ¹⁰⁰ in regard to other points.

It was with Goethe the Thinker that Carlyle was principally concerned. He owes to him many of his thoughts on life and religion and some regarding literature.

The two chief characteristics of Goethe's mind which Carlyle emphasized were "his singularly emblematic intellect", ¹⁰¹ which caused him to transform "into shape, into life, the opinion, the feeling that may dwell in him," and his "universality". Goethe's mind was great enough to express the

.....
100. See Appendix, 8

101. Essays, I, 244

problems of the age; and being a true philosopher, he rose above the moral problems rather than tried to cast them off. ¹⁰² Independently he worked out and used the principles of transcendental philosophy, which Carlyle believed, introduced "a higher tone ¹⁰³ into literature of Germany".

Goethe had been called a mystic by Jeffrey and others. Carlyle did not believe that he should be so called ^{merely} because it was difficult to understand his works without thought and study. ¹⁰⁴

"Like Shakespeare," said Carlyle, "Goethe is no sectarian." He was too broad to confine himself to any sect or caste. ¹⁰⁵ On account of this breadth of mind many believed him to be an atheist or a pantheist, neither of which, Carlyle said, he was. Goethe sought God in the soul "where alone he was to be found". ¹⁰⁶

Carlyle contrasted Voltaire, as a man of understanding, with Goethe, as a man of reason. Voltaire was a "questioner and despiser" while Goethe was a "teacher and reverencer". ¹⁰⁷ Goethe's "mind of all piercing vision, of sunny strength" was not made to ray-out darker darkness but "to bring warm sunlight,

.....
102. Essays, I, 244

103. Ibid., 78

104. Ibid., 148

105. Wilhelm Meister, 27

106. See Appendix

107. Essays, I, 249

108

all-purifying, all-uniting".

The greatest thoughts that Carlyle received from Goethe, were those concerning religion. The lesson of Reverence, "the soul of the Christian religion",¹⁰⁹ was his chief gift from Goethe. On this was based the doctrine of Renunciation or "Worship of Sorrow", which reconciles the ideal with the actual. Carlyle accepted this as being the highest significance in religion. "For the son of man", he said, "there is no noble crown well worn, or even ill worn,¹¹⁰ but it is a crown of thorns."

In Meister's Travels, Carlyle found new ideas concerning education and human perfectibility which he believed should do much toward revolutionizing¹¹¹ the system of education already too long in use.

In comparing Goethe and Schiller as to their interest in the philosophy of Kant, he found Schiller much influenced by it and Goethe but little affected. Schiller had "joyfully embraced it" while Goethe had¹¹² decided "to let it have its day". Another difference which Carlyle saw in the minds of these two poets, was that while Goethe's mind was as excursive

.....
108. Essays, I, 217

109. Johnson: Thomas Carlyle, 37

110. Past and Present, 153

111. Essays, IV, 473

112. Life of Schiller, 121

as Schiller's yet it was far cooler and more skeptical".
 113

Carlyle differed too much from Goethe in his ideas and tastes regarding literary forms and principles, to say much concerning them. Yet he had a few ideas in common with the German poet. "From Meister's Apprenticeship Carlyle learned that "the purpose of poetry is to express the universal and the ideal".

Carlyle's first interest in Goethe was in his life as a man. His "culture as a writer" was to Carlyle, at that time, much "less remarkable than his culture as a man."
 114 The art of life was the "greatest of all arts" to Carlyle, and on this basis he judged the worth of a man. What opinion he had of Goethe as a man may be given in Carlyle's own words: "Goethe ranks not only as the highest man of his time, but as a man of universal time, important for all generations---one of the landmarks in the
 115 History of Men".

It was the inner man rather than the outer man that interested Carlyle most. The ambitions and

.....
 113. Life of Schiller, 121

114. Wilhelm Meister, I, 26

115. Essays, II, 434

activities which made Goethe the successful man in practical life and the eminent statesman were of much smaller concern to him. He viewed Goethe's life as a whole and not in its various stages of development or activity. In its outward phase, it appeared to him a smooth, happy existence with good fortune following all the way. On the other hand, in its inward phase, it was complex, and filled with problems and difficulties such as only a wonderful spirit like Goethe's could overcome. It was a unique life, with an inward as well as an outward wealth which enabled Goethe to bear prosperity as few could do. ¹¹⁶ The most beautiful thing to Carlyle, however, was Goethe's untiring labor, ¹¹⁷ which, "wie das Gestirn ohne Hast aber ohne Ra st," was devoted to the service of humanity for centuries to come. This was the primary cause of Goethe's greatness.

Goethe's wide culture was a constant marvel to Carlyle; more so perhaps, than his "royal endowment by nature". Already educated "in all provinces of

.....
116. Essays, II, 404-405

117. Wilhelm Meister, I, 125

intellect and activity" beyond the appreciation of his generation he was always cultivating himself still further. ¹¹⁸ Besides his success "in every type of literature", Carlyle attributes to Goethe some success as a painter. In several branches of science, also, ¹¹⁹ he credits him with some valuable research work.

Dichtung und Wahrheit, a work which was constantly increasing in interest to him, taught Carlyle to admire Goethe's "young universal spirit which takes pleasure in workshops of handicraftsmen and loves to understand their methods of laboring and doing". ¹²⁰

The fact that Goethe was a soldier made more of an impression on Carlyle than that he was a statesman. ¹²¹

In both his French Revolution and his Frederick the Great ¹²² he is reminded of Goethe's "retreating like Pharaoh through the Red Sea", -----an incident which is described in the Dichtung und Wahrheit.

Concerning Goethe's moral life, which other critics constantly censured, Carlyle said but little.

.....
118. Wilhelm Meister, I, 18

119. Essays, II, 412

120. Ibid., 411

121. French Revolution, III, 61-64

122. Frederick the Great, VII, 15, 19

That Goethe had his faults like everyone else" since the fall of Adam", he did not undertake to deny. He was seeking only for the good in him, which far exceeded any faults he might have. In his essay entitled Goethe's Works, he raises the question as to whether or not Goethe "is a bad man".¹²³ In view of the harmless outcome of his various love-affairs, such as that with Fredericke which caused the poet bitter remorse, Carlyle decides in Goethe's favor. In the same essay, he defends Goethe against the charge of "cruelty of temper",¹²⁴ quoting Jung-Stilling, to prove his kindness of heart. Carlyle believed that to some persons Goethe was not altogether easy to understand "as to goodness and badness", but that this fact did not make him bad. To this opinion, he adds, "In Goethe's writings too, we all know, the moral lesson is seldom so easily traduced as one could wish".¹²⁵

Carlyle judged Goethe's relations with Weimar and his personal relations with Schiller, to be among the most important factors in the poet's life. In his career as a statesman, Carlyle saw, princi-

.....
123. Essays, II, 419

124. Ibid., 420

125. Ibid., 422

pally, a "business need" fulfilled, as in the case
 126
 of Milton. The atmosphere of art and learning,
 with enough business "to give it solid earth", made
 Goethe's life in Weimar an ideal one, full of in-
 spiration such as he needed to produce masterpieces
 of literature.

Carlyle was deeply interested in the friendship
 of Goethe and Schiller, of the development of which
 he had made a careful study. In Goethe's generous
 attitude in his treatment of a literary rival, he
 distinguished another proof of his nobility of
 127
 character. Although he saw them working
 together harmoniously towards the same ends in the
 classical theatre at Weimar and in the new school of
 criticism, yet he noted the differences in the two
 128
 men, as to character and intellect.

Goethe's character was to Carlyle, above all,
 dignified and truthful, "breathed upon by composure
 and cheerful seriousness".

Shelley had studied Goethe the writer and in this
 way had found Goethe the thinker; but Carlyle reversed
 the process. Only after he had gleaned the thought
 from a work, did he recognize "the matchless beauties

.....
 126. Essays, II, 429

127. Life of Schiller, 93

128. Ibid., 121

129

of its diction."

The works of Goethe taken as a whole, were to Carlyle a complete record of the spiritual development of the greatest man of all literature in the last one hundred years. ¹³⁰ To regard any one work

as a record complete in itself would involve a misunderstanding of Goethe's supreme mission as a poet. ¹³¹

Carlyle divided Goethe's works chronologically in three periods, each comprising one of the three stages of his spiritual growth. The first was the period of skepticism, represented by Faust and Werter. The second period was Pagan or Ethnic in character, during which the Venetian Epigrams and Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship were written. The third was the period of Reverence, which spirit is found in Meister's Travels, in Westoestlicher Divan ¹³² and in the Xenien. Although Carlyle has discussed

a few of Goethe's chief works separately, yet he much preferred to consider them all as one, in the light of a spiritual history.

133

In his essay entitled Goethe's Works, he states his preference for Goethe's prose rather than

-
- 129. Collectanea, Thomas Carlyle, Faustus
 - 130. Heroes and Heroworship, 219-220
 - 131. Life of Sterling, 121
 - 132. Essays, II, 430
 - 133. Ibid., 349

his poetry. Carlyle's idea of poetry was not that it was an expression of thought in rhyme and meter, but that it was an expression of the highest truths. Music in poetry should consist of musical thought.¹³⁴ The meter in poetry cramped the smooth, clear expression; it presented the sense only in "alternating flashes".

In Carlyle's criticism of Wilhelm Meister, which he regarded as Goethe's masterpiece, he did not view the novel strictly as a prose work, but rather as a poetic work, because many of its beautiful and eloquent passages "were the very essence of poetry".¹³⁵

Carlyle's interest is chiefly in the interpretive side of a literary work; form was much less important to him. For the literary type of the novel, he had little sympathy and for this reason he chose to call Wilhelm Meister an "art novel" which he considered, with Schlegel, far above the ordinary, useless novel.

Carlyle had been slow in appreciating the full value of Wilhelm Meister; in September, 1823, when he began translating it, he wrote to Miss Welsh calling it "a book I love not", quoting from it as a specimen

.....
134. Heroes and Heroism, 83

135. Wilhelm Meister, I, 7

of "the worst kind" of poetry in it, "who never ate his bread in sorrow", that stanza which later became known as his favorite.¹³⁶ In March, 1824, he has found much to admire: "Bushels of dust and straw and feathers with here and there a diamond of the purest water!"¹³⁷ By the time he had finished the translation, he considered it the most remarkable bit of writing he had known to be executed "in these late centuries".

Carlyle never changed his ideas as to the merits of this novel. In 1866, when he made the inaugural address at Edinburgh University, he made this remark as a tribute to Meister: "I have often said that there are ten pages of that, which, if ambition had been my only rule, I would rather have written, been able to write, than have written all the books that have appeared since I came into the world.....Those pages turn on the Christian religion".

It was from Meister's Travels that Carlyle received most of his ideas from Goethe. He considered it a work of art. In his opinion, Art was the creation of a poet's whole mind in its moments of clearest

.....
136. Norton, Early Letters of Carlyle, 219

137. Ibid., 269

138

vision. Wilhelm Meister is then an artistic creation because it is an interpretation of Goethe's whole life, with its passions and purposes and finally his clear understanding that "the universe is full of goodness". "The purest spirit of art" rests over this work.

139

Carlyle considered Goethe a master of style. His style is free from all mannerisms, simple and common, expressing the author's "calm, gay, strong spirit". In Wilhelm Meister the chief characteristic is its "liquid music expressing melodious Wisdom". The plot and method used by Goethe in the novel, did not interest Carlyle. Neither its subject nor its characteristics did he think suitable for a romance. He regarded it as a new type of allegory, picturing what men ought to strive for and serving Goethe as a basis for expressing his ideas regarding art, religion, and life.

Carlyle greatly admired Goethe's clever use of epigrams and his device of employing the character of Mignon to connect "with the heart much that was addressed to the head."¹⁴⁰ Of all the characters

.....
 138. Roe, Carlyle as a Critic, 32
 139. Essays, I, 233
 140. Wilhelm Meister, I, 10

found in Wilhelm Meister, Carlyle considered Mignon the most charming and poetic. Goethe's creation of her, he believes, has equalled Shakespeare's creation of Hamlet.

Carlyle made no study as to the origin or the peculiarities of Goethe's characters. He regards them, not so much as individuals, as representations of the different phases of human nature in all its varieties. ¹⁴¹ The hero, Wilhelm, he deems the least attractive and terms him a "milk-sop". In the "fair saint" Carlyle recognized Frau von Klettenberg who had been a friend to Goethe's mother, as the poet related in his *Dichtung und Wahrheit*.

Carlyle did not consider *Werter* important as a novel, but as "a loud and clear expression of the spirit of the age". Its dangerous philosophy was only a disguised blessing to point out to the world, its needs. It served also as a means by which Goethe shook off the spirit of doubt. In *Werter* Carlyle saw many faults, chiefly however its skepticism and materialism. It lacked the spiritual element and contained too many descriptions of

.....
 141. Wilhelm Meister, I, 6

142

beautiful scenes in nature. Although he attributed to it a poetic quality, yet it lacked the music of Goethe's later work. In the character of the hero, he sees in part, Goethe, although he learns from *Dichtung und Wahrheit* the origin of both character and plot, the latter of which he does not consider.

143

Dichtung und Wahrheit is regarded by Carlyle as being most valuable to aid the reader in understanding Goethe's works, to which the poet has written no preface. Carlyle defended this autobiography against the charge that it was "too garrulous" and "not noble enough". He stated that Goethe had always been considered too reserved, in his native country. He was not writing for the gentility of England but for the intellectual people of Europe. Carlyle also had explained that what the English condemned in *Meister* as vulgarity was in reality only a matter of diversity in national taste. From *Werter* he quoted and interpreted the passage regarding suicide, to show that Goethe was not recommending suicide but was really showing the folly of it.

.....
 142. *Essays*, III, 29

143. *Ibid.*, I, 220

Three other prose works of Goethe are only mentioned by Carlyle. The two novels, *The Mitschuldigen* and *Wahlverwandtschaften* had no interest for him.¹⁴⁴ Goethe's translations of the Autobiography of Benvenuto Cellini, and of two plays of Voltaire, called forth Carlyle's admiration because the great poet had not disdained "the humble task" of translator. In the Tale which he translated, Carlyle confined himself to the interpretation of the thought.

Although Carlyle cared little for Goethe's poetry in general, yet it was Faust that first attracted him to the poet. The mutilated translations of several fragments of Faust and the performance of the drama at London in a form hardly resembling the original, provoked Carlyle to write his essay *Faustus*, which appeared in the New Edinburgh Review in 1822.¹⁴⁵

This essay was devoted principally to the interpretation of the drama, which Carlyle judged the deepest of Goethe's works and the most difficult to understand. He admits that he was obliged to study it over and over before he began to appreciate its greatness.

.....
144. Wilhelm Meister, I, 20

145. Columbia University Germanic Studies, IV, 56

Carlyle showed keen insight into the nature of the problems involved in Faust, although it was impossible for him to comprehend Goethe in all particulars since the second part of the poem had not yet been published. "It is not without reluctance, he states, "that in the play before us, we behold the inferior principle triumphant in the end."¹⁴⁶

He found other faults in it. The drama lacked a "unity of interest"; there was "no sublimity" in its treatment of sorcery" and, compared to Schiller's Wallenstein, it was "but a careless effusion".¹⁴⁷

What a deep interest Carlyle had in Faust may be seen in his second essay on the drama, entitled, Goethe's Helena, which appeared in the Foreign Review, in 1828, shortly after Goethe had published his Helena. In this essay Carlyle declares Faust to be "emphatically a work of art; a work matured in the depths of a vast and wonderful mind".¹⁴⁸ Carlyle knew now, how the drama would end: "Our scared and blighted yet still noble Faust will not end in madness,¹⁴⁹ but in peace grounded on better knowledge".

He considered Goethe's Faust not only superior to

.....
146. Collectanea: Thomas Carlyle, Faustus

147. Life of Schiller, 150

148. Essays, I, 152

149. Ibid., 160

the Faustus of Marlowe but also more poetical than the Faust of Klinger and of Müller, although Maler Müller has given us a more genial interpretation than Goethe's. Klingemann also has given us a rather "hollow" Faust. Goethe's play has a "firmer moral" ¹⁵⁰ than all other plays founded on the nursery tale". Goethe's masterly delineation of his chief characters Faust, Mephistopheles, Margaret, and Helena, deeply impressed Carlyle, who has carefully interpreted them in their various stages of development. "Faust," he said, "is not wicked, only wilful and misguided", while "Mephistopheles is the best and only genuine devil of modern times"---refined and intellectual.

Of the many different verse forms used in Faust, Carlyle made no mention. They had no significance to him. The drama did not ring any changes in traditional poetic forms, he thought, although it ¹⁵¹ appeared to do so.

Carlyle saw "all that was finest in the philosophy of art and life", beautifully and gracefully expressed in Faust. The style of Helena he described as new, quiet, simple, joyful; passing by a short

.....
150. Essays, I, 162

151. Wilhelm Meister, 28

152

gradation from Classic dignity to Romantic pomp.
 In the Helena he also felt the influence of Sophocles
 and Æschylus, rather than that of Euripides, because
 it became more "rugged, copious, energetic, and in-
 artificial".¹⁵³ In the musical indistinctness,
 where Faust's adventures in the spirit world begin,
 Carlyle is reminded of Calderon's Life is a Dream.¹⁵⁴

Although Faust lacked the wholesome quality of
 geniality in the opinion of Carlyle, who heard in it
 above all else the "death song of departing worlds",
 yet he continued to study it and to find in it new
 beauties. In 1873 he wrote to his brother, John,
 "I feel not yet to have done with Faust part two,
 nor probably shall have done for some little time."¹⁵⁵
 As he placed Meister's Travels above Meister's Appren-
 ticeship, he placed Part Two of Faust above Part One,
 because it had "more meaning".

Carlyle's theory of art, as well as his literary
 taste, left little room for the purely imaginative.
 In Faust, however, he was forced to express his admir-
 ation for Goethe's wonderful power and use of imagi-
 nation. The ethereal music or the mere witchery of
 poetry, left him unmoved. Some of the smaller poems

.....
 153. Essays, I, 173.

154. Ibid., 189

155. Alexander Carlyle: New Letters of Thomas
 Carlyle, 299

of Goethe held a real charm for Carlyle, because
 they were rich in thought.¹⁵⁶ Their simplicity made
 them easy to understand, as in the case of the Xenien
 and the Westoestliche~~r~~ Divan. In this respect they
 compare with the Bible. The Venetian Epigrams were
 also favorites with Carlyle, but their blunt realism,
 due to their pagan tone, was at times offensive to
 him.

Since Carlyle showed so little appreciation of
 the technical poetry, his bare statements regarding
 Hermann und Dorothea---a poem which long remained a
 favorite of Goethe himself---are not surprising. He
 briefly states that it is written in hexameters and
 "with cheerful earnestness; adding that among the
 Germans it is popular as a gift book. Reinecke
 Fuchs, which was also "written in hexameters", was
 admired by Carlyle for its quaintness and humor but
 chiefly because the animals act out a parody on
 human life.

Goethe's most important work was in the field of
 drama, a type of literature which stands low in
 Carlyle's estimation as "a sort of carpentry".¹⁵⁷

.....
 156. Wilhelm Meister, I, 20
 157. Essays, I, 358

He does not consider the dramatic element a literary element. This lack of appreciation for the drama in Carlyle may be traced back to his earliest education and religion. Even as a student he disliked the theatre and "at no time did theatre-going figure among his expenses"¹⁵⁸. Even Goethe could not make him take an interest in the drama. "The everlasting disquisitions about plays and players" with the purpose of improving the moral world through the theatre, bored him in *Wilhelm Meister* as well as in the *Goethe-Schiller Correspondence*.¹⁵⁹

Carlyle, however, did not attempt to pass for a dramatic critic. Only in regard to *Faust* does he make any critical remarks concerning the dramatic value of any drama of Goethe. As a drama, he thought the faults of *Faust* were many. It had too little plot to have any dramatic interest and it was too vague and emblematic to be fit for theatrical presentation.¹⁶⁰

Torquato Tasso, *Iphigenie*, and *Egmont* he regarded as dramas rather than literature; *Iphigenie* and Torquato Tasso, he finally conceded, were works of art

.....
158. Craig: *Making of Carlyle*, 110

159. Norton: *Early Letters of Carlyle*, 223

160. *Collectanea: Thomas Carlyle, Faustus*

161

as to their "antique Grecian polish". For Götze von Berlichingen, Carlyle also showed little admiration, because of its ethnic character. He briefly termed it an "historical drama of the Feudal ages" and commended it for its originality.

Carlyle gives Goethe a high place as a critic of literature, not only because he forwarded the principles of the "new School" of criticism, but also because of his wide knowledge in every field of art. He praised above all the passage in Wilhelm Meister's Travels in which Goethe has given his well-known criticism of the character of Shakespeare's Hamlet. This he judged to be the highest attainment in literary criticism. It "painted to the intellect" what was already painted to "the heart and imagination".¹⁶² In the same essay Carlyle liked another example of the author's criticism. This passage shows Goethe's superior ability as a critic of plastic art. Goethe taught Carlyle how to criticize by a better standard than that used by other critics in England who judged an author by his religion.

In Carlyle's estimation, Goethe was the most

.....
 161. Essays, II, 380

162. Ibid., I, 61

influential man in the intellectual history of his country, since Luther's time. He believed that Goethe's influence was as strong as Voltaire's and, owing to the fact that Goethe taught faith while Voltaire had implanted doubt, the German thinker's influence should be the more lasting.¹⁶³

Carlyle saw that Werter had been Goethe's most influential work up to 1824.¹⁶⁴ Its popularity spread not only over all Europe but into other regions as well. It had given rise to a class of skeptic sentimentalists whom Carlyle termed "Kraftmänner", but with them it soon lost its influence. "The sin of view-hunting," said Carlyle, "first came decisively into action, through the Sorrows of Werter". It showed Goethe the nature-worshipper. This "scene-painting" in literature was very objectionable to Carlyle because of its sensuous appeal. This novel, according to Carlyle, influenced Schiller to write his play, The Robbers.¹⁶⁵

"Götz von Berlichingen," he considered almost as influential as Werter. Scott had based his Marmion and Lady of the Lake on this drama.¹⁶⁶ The effect of

.....
163. Essays, I, 201

164. Wilhelm Meister, I, 14

165. Lectures on The History of Literature, 195

166. Wilhelm Meister, I, 15

Dichtung und Wahrheit could be seen in many of the later autobiographies which had been modelled after it. Among the best of these was Richter's Wahrheit
167
aus Meinem Leben.

Wilhelm Meister also had influenced many novelists to whom Mignon was a favorite type of character. Scott's Fenella in his *Quentin Durward* bears a strong resemblance to Mignon. Of Meister's importance in regard to the technique of the novel and the theatre Carlyle said nothing. Of Goethe's influence through *Faust* he said very little except that Byron in his *Manfred* was a "generous imitator" of *Faust* but not a
168
copyist. This was said in defense of Goethe, who had been censured by the English public for showing the relationship between *Faust* and *Manfred* in his *Critique of Manfred* published in Kunst und Altertum, in 1820. Like Byron, Carlyle took Goethe's remark
169
as a tribute to the ~~one~~ English poet.

While Carlyle liked to trace Goethe's influence on later authors, he shows but little interest in Goethe's indebtedness to Homer, Shakespeare, Herder, or any of the other numerous writers who influenced both Goethe's style and thought.

.....
167. Essays, II, 102

168. Collectanea: Thomas Carlyle, *Faustus*

169. Columbia University Germanic Studies, IV, 72

CONCLUSION

Had Carlyle had a love for the music and art of poetry, he would have been one of the world's greatest critics. It was this lack which kept him, as a critic, from doing Goethe full justice in regard to his great dramatic poetry. His dislike for dramatic development shows itself not only in his disregard for Goethe's many fine dramas, but also in his lack of interest in the plots of Goethe's novels. He was interested only in such works as contained philosophical thoughts and ideas. Consequently, Carlyle neither understood nor showed any interest in Goethe's method in the use of characters, incidents, and verse forms.

Carlyle learned from *Dichtung und Wahrheit* that Goethe's works are full of his own life and the lives of those connected with him. He did not try, however, to trace the sources of his characters, or the influence of his personal experience upon his works. Many later critics have done this.

We can see that Carlyle has omitted much of value in Goethe, in his search for Goethe's thought and meaning, yet he accomplished more than any of his English contemporaries in making Goethe understood

and appreciated by his English readers. Whatever the shortcomings of Carlyle may have been, they are easily overlooked when one considers the fine spirit which caused him to champion Goethe's cause in England. His influence as an interpreter and a critic of Goethe has been not only far-reaching but most beneficial to his countrymen.

APPENDIX

1. Leibnitz, Kant, Hegel, Schelling, Fichte,
Niebuhr, Ranke.

2. German authors with whom Carlyle shows some
acquaintance:

| | | |
|------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Agricola | Dringenberg | Gottsched |
| Baumgarten | Eckermann | Görres |
| Bouterwek | Fichte | Gleim |
| Boner | Fischer | Grillparzer |
| Böhme | Fouque | Grimm |
| Bürger | Fleming | Gruber |
| Büsching | Flügel | Gryphius |
| Brandt | Frederick the Great | Guericke |
| Breitkopf | Freytag | Hagen, von der |
| Copernicus | Fülleborn | Haller |
| Cramer | Gellert | Hagedorn |
| Döring | Gessner | Heine |
| Docen | Gotha | Herder |

| | | |
|----------------|-------------|---------------------|
| Heinse | Klingemann | Neander |
| Heintze | Klopstock | Opitz |
| Hegel | Lachmann | Paul, H. |
| Hegius | Lange | Pustkucher |
| Heeren | Lavater | Rabener |
| Hevel | Lessing | Rambach |
| Heyne | Leibnitz | Rammler |
| Hinsberg | Lichtenberg | Raumer |
| Hitzig | Liben | Razmann |
| Holbach | Logau | Retzsch |
| Hölty | Lohenstein | Richter |
| Hoffmann | Luther | Roen |
| Hoffmanswaldau | Meister | Sachs, Hans |
| Horn | Müller, A. | Schlegel, A. W. von |
| Hutten | Müller, J. | Schlegel, F. |
| Jacobi | Müller, M. | Schelling |
| Jacobin | Müllner | Schiller |
| Jöcher | Musäus | Schiltburger |
| Kant | Miller | Schleiermacher |
| Kepler | Mürner | Schnüpsel |
| Kotzebue | Novalis | Schubart |
| Körner | Neumann | Scherz |
| Klinger | Nevel et | Schulze |
| Kleist | Niebuhr | Schopper |

| | | |
|-------------|------------------------|------------|
| Simrock | Trimberg | Wilderspin |
| Stilling | Tieck | Wolf |
| Stolberg | Uhl and | Wi el and |
| Sulzer | Utz | Winkelmann |
| Stricker | Varnhagen von Ense | Zelter |
| Spurzheim | Voss | Zeune |
| Schröpfer | Vogelweide, W. von der | Zirkler |
| Spiegelberg | Wachler | Zimmermann |
| Schreiter | Wackenroder | |
| Thomasius | Werner | |
| Tholuck | Weber | |

3. Carlyle's translations from Goethe's prose:

Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship

Wilhelm Meister's Travels

The Tale

Novelle

4. Carlyle's translations from the shorter poems of Goethe:

Venetian Epigrams, five

Geister EPOCHEN

Xenien, a few

5. German authors quoted in Carlyle's works:

| | | |
|-----------|---------------------|-----------------------|
| Döring | Kant | Saupe |
| Fichte | Luther | Trimberg |
| Flögel | Novalis | Tieck |
| Goethe | Lichtenberg | Richter |
| Gottsched | Schlegel, A. W. von | Varnhagen von Ense |
| Gellert | Schiller | |
| Horn | Sachs, Hans | Wolf |
| Hugo | Schubart | Werner |
| Koch | Stilling | |

6. List of Carlyle's publications concerning Goethe or containing some reference to Goethe:

1822. Faustus

1824. Life of Schiller

Wilhelm Meister, translation and essay on
Goethe

1827. German Romance

Jean Paul Richter

State of German Literature

1828. Life and Writings of Werner

Goethe's Helena

Goethe

1829. German Playwrights
 Voltaire
 Novalis
1830. Richter's Review of Mme. De Staël's
 De l'Allemagne
 Jean Paul Richter Again
1831. Schiller
 German Literature of the Fourteenth and
 Fifteenth Centuries
 Characteristics
 Taylor's Historic Survey of German Poetry
1832. Goethe's Portrait
 Death of Goethe
 Goethe's Works
 The Tale
 Novelle
 Biography
 Faust's Curse
1833. Diderot
 Count Cagliostro
1834. Sartor Resartus
1837. The Diamond Necklace
 Mirabeau
 The French Revolution

1838. Sir Walter Scott
 Varnhagen von Ense's Memoirs
 Lectures on The History of Literature
1839. Chartism
1840. Heintze's German translation of Burns
1841. Heroes and Heroworship
1843. Dr. Francia
 Past and Present
1850. Latter Day Pamphlets
1851. Life of John Sterling
1855. Prinzenraub
1866. Inaugural Address at Edinburgh University
1867. Shooting Niagara and After
- 1858-1865. History of Frederick the Great
1881. Reminiscences

7. Goethe's gifts to Carlyle which are still to be seen in the Carlyle House:

A volume of the Goethe-Schiller Briefwechsel

A large photograph of Goethe

A mask of Goethe (Sculpture)

A medallion of Goethe

Portrait of Goethe with facsimile of a poem
 by Goethe's hand

A picture of Goethe's house

A portrait of Goethe as a youth

Leather pocketbook with a goldheaded pencil,
containing a card with the following
stanza:

"Augenblicklich aufzuwarten
Schicken Freunde solche Karten
Diesmal aber heisst's nicht gern
Euer Freund ist weit und fern."

Goethe.

Weimar, 20 Juli, 1827

8. Carlyle has compared Goethe with the following authors:

Aeschylus, (Essays I, 164)

Bacon, (Essays II, 439)

Browne, (Essays III, 233)

Bunyan, (Essays I, 244)

Calderon, (Essays I, 189)

Cervantes, (Wilhelm Meister, 31)

Fénelon, (Essays I, 211)

Hooker, (Essays II, 439)

Homer, (Essays II, 437)

Milton, (Essays II, 439)

Napoleon, (Essays II, 372)

Quarles, (Essays I, 244)

- Racine, (Wilhelm Meister, 31)
Shakespeare, (Essays II, 437)
Sophocles, (Essays I, 164)
Spenser, (Wilhelm Meister, I, 30)
Tasso, (Wilhelm Meister, I, 31)
Vergil, (Wilhelm Meister, I, 31)
Voltaire, (Essays I, 250)
Xenophon, (Lectures on History of Literature)

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF WORKS CONSULTED FOR THIS STUDY

Works of Carlyle

Thomas Carlyle: Centenary Edition, 30 volumes.
 Edited by H. D. Traill. Chapman and Hall.
 London. 1905

Thomas Carlyle: Collectanea, 1821-1855, Edited
 by Samuel Arthur Jones. Canton, Pa. 1903

Thomas Carlyle: Lectures on the History of Literature.
 Edited by J. R. Greene. Charles Scribner's Sons.
 New York. 1892

Thomas Carlyle: Reminiscences. Edited by James A.
 Froude. Harper and Bros. New York. 1881

Letters

The Letters of Thomas Carlyle to his Youngest Sister.
 Edited by C. J. Copeland. Houghton, Mifflin and
 Co. Boston and New York. 1899

Early Letters of Thomas Carlyle. 2 volumes.
 Edited by C. E. Norton. Macmillan and Co.
 New York. 1886

Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel. Herausgegeben
 von Wilhelm Hertz. Bessersche Buchhandlung.
 Berlin. 1887

Love Letters of Thomas Carlyle and Jane Welsh.
 2 volumes. Edited by Alexander Carlyle.
 John Lane and Co. New York. 1909

New Letters of Thomas Carlyle. 2 volumes.
 Edited by Alexander Carlyle. John Lane.
 London. 1904

The Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and Ralph Waldo
 Emerson. Library Edition. 2 volumes.
 Houghton, Mifflin and Co. Boston and New York.
 1894

Miscellaneous Works

Columbia University Germanic Studies, vol. IV.
 W. F. Hauhart: Goethe's Faust in England.
 Columbia University Press. New York. 1909

Craig, R. S.: The Making of Carlyle.
 Everleigh Nash. London. 1908

De Quincey, Thomas: Masters of Literature.
 Edited by Sidney Low. Geo. Bell and Sons
 London, 1911

Eckermann, J. P.: Conversations of Goethe.
 Boston. 1839

Garnett, Richard: Life of Thomas Carlyle.
 Walter Scott Co. London. 1887

Haney, John L.: German Influence on Samuel T.
 Coleridge. Philadelphia. 1902

Japp, A. H.: German Life and Literature.
 Marshall Japp and Co. London. n.d.

Jeffrey, Francis: Contributions to the Edinburgh
 Review. Appleton and Co. New York. 1871

Johnson, W. S.: Thomas Carlyle, 1814-1831.
 Yale University Press. New Haven. 1911

Roe, F. W.: Carlyle as a Critic of Literature.
 Columbia University Press. New York. 1910

Tucker, T. G.: Foreign Debt of English Literature.
Geo. Bell and Sons. London. 1907

Wylie, W. H.: Thomas Carlyle, the Man and his Books.
T. F. Unwin. London. 1909.

170
INDEX

Aeschylus, 72

Benvenuto Cellini's Autobiography, 69

Boylan, 35, 37, 38, 39

Brandt, 6

Byron, 77

Calderon, 72

Carlyle, Jane Welsh, 24, 28

Carlyle, John, 24, 72

Coleridge, 5, 8, 9, 16, 45, 46, 48

Collectanea: Thomas Carlyle, 63, 70, 74, 77

Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and Ralph Waldo
Emerson, 12, 29

Craig, R. S., 53, 74

.....
170. This index attempts to be complete with reference to authors and works. Beyond that only a few items of special interest are given. No general topical index has been undertaken. Periodicals are underlined.

De Quincey, 5, 8, 9, 16, 36, 47, 48

De l'Allemagne, 10

De Staël, Madame, 10

Dichtung und Wahrheit, 7, 16, 18, 54, 60, 67, 68,
77, 78

Early German Literature, 52

Early Letters of Thomas Carlyle, 65, 74

Eckermann, J. P., 13, 26

Edinburgh Review, 11, 47

Egmont, 74

Emerson, R. W., 29

Essays, Carlyle's, 15, 16, 17, 23, 32, 41, 42, 43, 44,
51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62,
63, 68, 70, 71, 72, 73, 75, 76, 77,

Euripides, 72

Faust, 7, 11, 17, 21, 24, 41-44, 46, 48, 49, 50, 51,
55, 63, 69, 70, 71, 72, 74, 77

Faustus, 11, 71

Fenella, Scott's, 77

Fichte, 20

Foreign Review, 24, 41, 70

French Revolution, 60

Fredericke, 61

Frederick the Great, 19, 52, 53, 60

Garnett, Richard, 20, 30

Geister-Epochen, 16

German history, 7, 15

German language, 11, 15, 26, 31, 45, 46, 48, 52

German literature, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 10', 11, 12, 13,
24, 25, 26, 27, 37, 45, 46, 47, 48, 51, 52, 53,
56

German people, 13, 52

Goethe's Helena, 41, 70

Goethes und Carlyles Briefwechsel, 13, 19, 21, 25,
26, 27, 28

Götz von Berlichingen, 9, 75, 76

Grillparzer, 6

Hazlitt, William, 5

Helena, 17, 41, 42, 71, 72

Heroes and Heroworship, 16, 63, 64

Herder, 77

Hermann und Dorathea, 73

Homer, 55, 77

Iphigenie, 48, 74

Jahresheft, 28

Japp, A. H., 37

Jeffrey, Francis, 36, 46, 47, 54, 56

Johnson, W. S., 13, 19, 20, 50, 57

Kant, 20, 57
Klinger, 71
Klingemann, 6, 71
Klopstock, 6
Kotzebue, 6, 49
Kunst und Altertum, 28, 77

Lady of the Lake, 76
Lamb, 5
Lectures on the History of Literature, 76
Lessing, 6, 9
Letters of Thomas Carlyle, 53
Life of Schiller, 12, 22, 27, 28, 57, 58, 62, 70
Life of Sterling, 63
Love Letters of Thomas Carlyle and Jane Welsh, 22
Luther, 6, 24, 76

Margaret, 71
Mephistopheles, 71
Mignon, 33, 35, 38, 39, 40, 48, 66, 67, 77
Milton, 62
Mitschuldigen, Die, 69
Müller, 71

- Napoleon, 27
- New Edinburgh Review, 69
- New Letters of Thomas Carlyle, 72
- Nibelungenlied, 6, 52
- Niebuhr, 26
- Novalis, 54
- Novelle,
- Oxford University, 26
- Prinzenraub, 53
- Räuber, Die, 76
- Reinecke Fuchs, 6, 75
- Reminiscences, 16
- Retzsch, 7
- Richter, 9, 77
- Roe, F. W., 9, 49, 66
- Sachs, Hans, 52
- Sartor Resartus, 20, 23, 24, 53
- Schiller, 6, 7, 9, 12, 17, 24, 26, 46, 57, 58, 62,
70, 76
- Schlegel, A. W. von, 54, 64
- Schopenhauer, 45
- Scott, Walter, 8, 9, 16, 27, 28, 76

- Shakespeare, 55, 56, 67, 75, 77
- Shelley, 62
- Sophocles, 72
- State of German Literature, 51
- Stilling, 61
- Swift, 20
- Tale, The, 69
- Taylor, Bayard, 43
- Taylor's Historic Survey of German Poetry, 51
- Taylor, William, 32, 48, 49, 54
- Tieck, 9
- Torquato Tasso, 27, 74
- Trimberg, 52
- Venetian Epigrams, 18, 63, 73
- Voltaire, 56, 69, 76
- Wahlverwandtschaften, Die, 69
- Wallenstein, 9, 70
- Welsh, Jane, 22, 64
- Werter, 7, 49, 55, 63, 67, 68, 76
- Westöstlicher Divan, 63, 73
- Wilhelm Meister, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 16, 18, 20, 21, 22, 25, 29, 31-41, 46, 48, 49, 50, 51, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77

Wylie, W. H., 35, 37

Xenien, 18, 63, 73

Zelter, 25