Schumann and the Development of the Collaborative Relationship between Voice and Piano in Opus 48 *Dichterliebe*

BY

Scott Wichael

Submitted to the graduate degree program in Music and the Graduate Faculty of the University of Kansas in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts.

______________________________
Chairperson Dr. Genaro Mendez

______________________________
Dr. Roberta Schwartz

______________________________
Dr. John Stephens

______________________________
Mark Ferrell

______________________________
John Staniunas

Date Defended: April 4, 2014
The Dissertation Committee for Scott Wichael
certifies that this is the approved version of the following dissertation:

Schumann and the Development of the Collaborative Relationship between Piano and Voice in
Opus 48 Dichterliebe

________________________________
Chairperson Dr. Genaro Mendez

Date approved April 4, 2014
Abstract

After Franz Schubert, Robert Schumann is the most recognized name as a composer of Lieder. The son of a book dealer Schumann was perhaps one of the most well read composers of his day, which resulted in informed decisions as to his choice of poetry and treatment of each poem within his songs and cycles. Schumann’s first foray into lieder in 1827-28 was followed by an over ten year hiatus from lieder composition. During this time he seemed to have a disdain for vocal writing thinking it to be an “inferior” form of music and led to him solidifying his instrumental compositional technique.

The year of 1840 to 1841, brought an abrupt change in his attitude about song composition and he went on with what has been described as his *Liederjahr*, in which he composed over 150 songs and several cycles including *Dichterliebe*, which combined Schumann’s mature piano technique to his choice of poetry. What resulted was a combination of voice and piano that was more of a symbiotic relationship then that of simple voice and accompaniment. Before Schumann, the piano and voice could exist independently of each other. The vocal line was one aspect of the song, often the melody, and the piano was accompaniment providing harmony and text painting. In the mature songs of Schumann, including *Dichterliebe*, the piano and voice were dependent, more collaborative with each other as not previously seen.
## Examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Work</th>
<th>mm/Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Gretchen am Spinnrade</td>
<td>1-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Die Forelle</td>
<td>1-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Ständchen</td>
<td>1-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Winterreise “Auf dem Flusse”</td>
<td>1-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Winterreise “Auf dem Flusse”</td>
<td>41-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Aus meinen Tränen spriessen”</td>
<td>1-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Ich will meine Seele tauchen”</td>
<td>14-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Und wüssten’s die Blumen”</td>
<td>30-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Hör’ ich das Liedchen klingen”</td>
<td>4-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Hör’ ich das Liedchen klingen”</td>
<td>19-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Ich hab’ im Traum geweinet”</td>
<td>24-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Dichterliebe “Die alten bösen Lieder”</td>
<td>48-67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Schumann and the Development of the Collaborative Relationship between Piano and Voice in Opus 48 *Dichterliebe*

In songs artistic souls first make each other’s acquaintance, the poet with the composer, and vice versa; they must be so constituted that the poet, were he a musician, would express himself in tones just as he has in words, and that the musician, were he a poet, would express himself in words as he has in his notes.

Robert Schumann

After Franz Schubert, Robert Schumann may be the most recognized name as a composer of Lieder. The son of a book dealer, Schumann was perhaps one of the most well-read composers of his day, which resulted in informed decisions as to his choice of poetry and treatment of each poem within his songs and cycles. Schumann’s first foray into Lieder in 1827-28 was followed by a hiatus from song composition. During this hiatus, he questioned the worth of vocal writing, describing it as an inferior form of music, which led to him solidifying his instrumental compositional technique. The year of 1840 to 1841 brought an abrupt change, and he entered what has been described as his *Liederjahr*; he composed over one-hundred-fifty songs and several cycles, including *Dichterliebe*, which connected Schumann’s mature piano compositional technique to his choice of poetry. What resulted was symbiotic combination of voice and piano. Before Schumann, the piano and voice could almost exist independently of each other. The vocal line conveyed the poetic aspect of the song, often with the melody, and the piano provided accompaniment, harmony, mood setting and text painting. In Schumann’s mature songs, including *Dichterliebe*, the piano and voice were dependent upon and more

---

collaborative with each other. In the words of Julia Perrey, “With Schumann after Schubert, the Lied was given a genuine voice. Here, the voice of the poet no longer dominates the musical setting, but rather the poetic text fully becomes part of Schumann’s own voice. Neither musical imitation of poetic content nor emotional or stylistic assimilation, the Schumann Lied is the utterance of someone able to make the words he set to music his own. In this regard, the distinction between the role of the voice and the role of the piano should be made very clear. Although romantically ‘intertwined’, the relation between the two is complimentary as well as contrasting.”

In addition, Robert Schumann may have been among the best-read composers of the Romantic era. Growing up in Zwickau with his book-dealer father, literature was a significant part of his development. At fifteen Schumann founded a literary club, where he and his friends read poetry, novels, and plays. He wrote, “The most significant writers of just about every country were familiar to me.” Following his father’s death in 1826, Schumann found guidance and support from a local music-loving couple. Agnes Carus introduced him to the Lieder of Franz Schubert and encouraged him to compose songs. His first attempts set texts by several poets that he would return to again in later years, including Goethe, Byron, and Kerner. Many of the songs were skilled imitations of Schubert. They tended to be strophic, but some were in ABA form and a few were through-composed. All of the early songs, though, are texturally homophonic: voice and accompaniment. Although immature, the works show glimpses of what

---


3 Hallmark, *German Lieder in the Nineteenth Century*, 92.
is to come in his later works, with mature piano technique, including some very brief preludes and postludes, and vocal phrases anticipated or echoed in the piano.\footnote{Jürgen Thym, “Schumann: Reconfiguring the Lied,” in \textit{The Cambridge Companion to the Lied}, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 120-22.}

The social life of the German middle class in the eighteenth century held singing and the playing of songs in great importance. The accompaniment of these early Lieder was usually not overly difficult to play and often doubled the voice.\footnote{Lorraine Gorrell, \textit{The Nineteenth-Century German Lied} (Portland: Amadeus Press, 1993), 57.} In 1842 Schumann stated, “The composer names his songs ‘Lieder with Piano,’ and this is important. For the singing voice certainly is not sufficient in itself; it cannot carry out the task of interpretation unaided.”\footnote{Gorell, \textit{The Nineteenth-Century German Lied}, 58-61.}

The development of piano literature in the nineteenth century was an essential factor in the growth of the Lied and the combination of voice, poetry and piano. As it was more flexible and expressive, and capable of more dynamic contrast, composers became more aware of the piano’s ability to express new musical effects and sounds.

The publication of song and solo piano music developed into more important genres of music in the nineteenth century; both Schubert and Schumann found their distinct compositional voices writing for the solo piano and each incorporated that skill into their approach to the Lied.\footnote{Gorell, \textit{The Nineteenth-Century German Lied}, 62.}

During his eleven-year break from composing Lieder, Schumann became well-known as a music critic after founding and writing for the \textit{Neue Zeitschrift für Musik} (New Journal for Music). His prevailing attitude regarding Lieder was that it was an inferior genre. In 1839, remarking to fellow critic, Herrmann Hirschbach, he said, “All my life I have rated song compositions less important than instrumental music, and have never taken them for a great art form…..But don’t tell anyone that!”\footnote{John Worthen, \textit{Robert Schumann: Life and Death of a Musician} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007), 186.} His attitude may seem perplexing, especially considering
his literary background and inclination for writing. The combination of music and literature in his life appears ideal for writing vocal works. According to Alan Walker, Schumann believed that music was a form of language, that the composer had a duty to translate verse into music, and the music should not be lowered to the level of words. As a piano composer he had developed his own language, and poetry could be an irrelevance or a rival.  

It is also important to understand that Schumann’s first and most influential attachment to music was with the piano. Piano was the instrument of his early experience, and he moved to Heidelberg in 1831 to become a piano virtuoso. Schumann thought in terms of the piano, and thus his connection to literature often took the form of programmatic keyboard music. Gorell states, “Since the majority of Schumann’s piano pieces were written before his Lieder, he had already developed a highly individual pianistic language and knew this instrument’s potential for colors and expressive range. In his songs, the piano often takes the lead in its partnership with the voice.” In his Lieder he combined a mature compositional technique, personal sentiment, and complete literary knowledge into a fully formed unity of voice and piano.

During his break from Lieder, Schumann was influenced by an aesthetic that may be described as the Romantic Fragment or “Fragmente” as described by Fredrich Schlegel, a theorist of the Romantic era. Schlegel suggested that the essence of Romantic art lays in the fragmentary; for instance, a sketch or short work, although incomplete, may imply a larger whole. Despite not using the exact term “fragment” in an 1839 review of Chopin’s Preludes, Schumann wrote, “I would describe the Preludes as strange…[T]hey are sketches, the beginnings of etudes, or if you will, ruins”. Many of his piano pieces and several of his later songs,

---

11 Gorrell, The Nineteenth-Century German Lied, 71.
including “Im wunderschönen monat Mai” from *Dichterliebe*, incorporate the “fragment” aesthetic.\(^{13}\)

By 1840, Schumann had developed and mastered his technique of composing for the piano. At this time he suddenly returned to composing Lieder. The shift may be attributed to several factors. It was in 1840 that Schumann fought Friedrich Wieck in court for the right to marry Wieck’s daughter, Clara. Despite his confidence that he would win, Schumann felt he must address the primary objection that Wieck had with him, his lack of income. Lieder was the most marketable genre in Germany at the time, and successful songs could provide financial stability for the couple. From May 1840 to September 1841, his *Liederjahr*, Schumann composed over 150 songs in several sets. Another factor was the prospect of marrying Clara, his muse. “Much of you is embedded in my Eichendorff *Liederkreis*,” he wrote to Clara in May of 1840.\(^{14}\)

“I feel like singing myself to death, like the nightingale. There are twelve Eichendorff songs, but I have already forgotten them and started something new,” Schumann wrote to Clara in May of 1840. The “something new” was *Dichterliebe*, a cycle of sixteen songs setting poems by Heinrich Heine.\(^{15}\) The poems in *Dichterliebe* (A Poet’s Love) are from Heine’s *Lyrisches Intermezzo*, a set of sixty-six poems written in 1822-23. The overall theme of *Dichterliebe* is one of unrequited love, and it may have been Schumann’s difficulty in marrying Clara that inspired this cycle. Originally, the cycle was comprised of twenty songs and titled *Gedichte*

\(^{13}\) Hallmark, *German Lieder in the Nineteenth Century*, 100-01.
von Heinrich Heine, 20 Lieder und Gesänge aus dem lyrischen Intermezzo. Four of the songs were removed and the title *Dichterliebe* was added at the time of publication in 1844.\(^{16}\)

In order to understand Schumann’s new development of the singer and accompanist relationship, one must take into account previous Lieder, particularly those of Franz Schubert.

Over the course of his career, Schubert composed over 600 Lieder and many can be assigned to a few basic types. The strophic Lied contains an unchanging vocal line and accompaniment from stanza to stanza. The modified strophic Lied uses a slightly altered melody in the reprise. The scenic Lied contains contrasting sections that vary keys and tempi. Some of the scenic Lieder are in a modified ABA form. Finally, there is the *durchkomponiert*, through-composed song.\(^{17}\)

Schubert was the first important composer to concentrate a significant portion of his time to the composition of Lieder. He added a level of artistry to and showed that Lieder could be a challenging and sophisticated genre.\(^{18}\) Schubert dedicated his time to devising memorable melodies and emphasizing the meaning of the images in poetry with an expressive vocal line, musical texture, and harmony.\(^{19}\)

The Schubert Lieder may be viewed as a construction on three different levels: the voice and the two hands of the piano. The voice usually contains the melody. One hand of the piano will incorporate an accompaniment figure, such as repeated chords, while the other hand contains a melodic or rhythmic motive associated with the vocal line. The motive can vary as the Lied progresses. Several of Schubert’s most well known Lied including; *Gretchen am


Spinnrade, Erlkönig and Die Forelle, contain these three distinct features. It is a mistake to describe the accompaniment as simple support of the vocal line. It is better to think of the vocal line and the accompaniment as two voices on different planes.

One of the most characteristically Schubertian strategies from the earliest songs to some of the latest is the representation of an inner experience through an analogy with some outward physical motion or sound. There are countless familiar examples: Gretchen’s increasing distraction from her activity as she remembers Faust is given a measurable presence through the astonishingly realistic representation of the action of the spinning wheel, ceasing to spin at her climactic memory of his kiss. In Gute Nacht, as elsewhere in Winterseisse, the plodding steps of the poet-wanderer, called up by the insistently plodding rhythm, force the events of the cycle into the present, heightening the emotional force of his departure…

As Muxfeldt describes, Schubert incorporated highly stylized onomatopoeia, music that is descriptive, but not simple text painting, and never a means unto itself. Schubert uses an individual ability to create patterns with harmony, melody and rhythm that work as symbols for poetic ideas. Essentially he creates an accompaniment that embodies the mood or illustrates a background idea to support the poem. Grey states, “That is, he invents musical ideas, usually accompaniment motives and figures, which perfectly conform to one’s idea of the object with little or no attempt at musical description.”

Written in October of 1814, Gretchen am Spinnrade is one of the earliest and best known examples of how Schubert used the piano to provide onomatopoeia to accompany the narrative of the vocal line. The right hand of the piano contains the sixteenth-note groupings that symbolize the incessant movement of Gretchen’s spinning wheel. The piano, while on a

---

23 Hallmark, *German Lieder in the Nineteeth Century*, 40.
separate plane, does not double the voice; instead, it provides a depth of texture to the throbbing vocal line.\textsuperscript{25}

Example 1: Schubert, \textit{Gretchen am Spinnrade}, mm. 1-7

\begin{quote}
From Goethe's \textit{“Faust”}

\textit{Nicht zu geschwind (Allegro ma non troppo) (\textit{\textit{D}}=72.)}
\end{quote}

One of Schubert’s most popular Lieder is \textit{Die Forelle}. It was first published as a supplement in a magazine in 1820 and then again in 1825 as his Opus. 32. \textit{Die Forelle} is essentially strophic and has a modest, folksong-like vocal line. The piano is assigned a sextuplet figure that illustrates a trout and its swimming in a stream.\textsuperscript{27}

\textsuperscript{25} Kenneth Whitton, \textit{The Development of the German Lied} (London: Julia MacRae, 1984), 35.
\textsuperscript{27} Capel, \textit{Schubert’s Songs}, 136
Example 2: Schubert, *Die Forelle*, mm. 1-8

In *Ständchen*, the accompaniment provides a feeling of palpitation with a repeating eighth-note figure representing the strumming of a guitar. The piano echo, which represents the continuing thought of the vocal line, plays a significant role in *Ständchen*. (See Example 3)

Written in 1827, *Winterreise* is Schubert’s most profound and lengthy work for voice. Comprised of 24 *Lieder*, *Winterreise*, is a cycle that represents lost or unrequited love, yet each song can be performed individually. It was with this cycle that Schubert continued to expand the role of the piano. As Susan Youens states, “*Winterreise* is chamber music in which the pianist’s part far surpasses the subordinate function implied in the word ‘accompaniment.’

---

Ultimately, what is most impressive about the writing for the piano in this cycle is the pianist’s role both in the enactment of the poetry and in music’s inevitable antagonism to words. The seventh Lied of the cycle, *Auf dem Flusse*, is about a frozen river and how the poet will carve the date he met his beloved and her name into the ice. The frozen river is a metaphor for his cold heart that still beats, but only under the frozen surface. The piano line is punctuated by weak-beat accents that exemplify emotional turmoil and unrest. In the final stanza, Schubert incorporates the original vocal melody in a new fashion. He brings back the vocal line but places it in the left hand of the piano, as if attempting to bring the singer back to the previous melody, but he refuses to return to his previous state.

Example 4. Schubert, *Auf dem Flusse*, mm. 1-14

Langsam (Lento)

Der du so lustig

(rauschtest, du heller, wilder Fluss, wie still bist du geworden, gibst

keinen Scheidegruß.

Mit harter, starrer

pp
While each of these Lieder are excellent examples of the developing collaboration of voice and piano, the two elements are not on an equal plane and are not completely dependent on each other. The vocal line takes precedence, while the piano incorporates the use of onomatopoeia to comment on and support the poetic idea.

Following Schubert’s Winterreise, Schumann’s Dichterliebe is counted as a pinnacle in the development of the lied. Schumann did not entirely depart from Schubert’s approach to the
Lied. Instead, he built on Schubert’s method of combining a beautiful vocal line with a virtuoso piano accompaniment. Schumann compared his Lieder to Schubert’s:

Paralleling the development of poetry, the Franz Schubert epoch has already been followed by a new one which has utilized the improvements of the simultaneously developed instrument of accompaniment, the piano…. The voice alone cannot reproduce everything or produce every effect; together with the expression of the whole the finer details of the poem should also be emphasized... 31

During his Liederjahr, Schumann composed many of his songs in such a way that the vocal line could be considered redundant as far as overall musical completeness. 32 Ronald Taylor states, “The watershed in Schumann’s creative life becomes the more prominent with the realization that what at first appears as a substantial change of interest from piano music to song represents in fact, as Schumann conceived the two genres, merely an organic extension of a single lyrical continuum. The lyricism of his piano pieces is the lyricism of the Lied…And as poetry and music are but two designations of a single creative activity…so the sphere of instrumental music merges in the sphere of vocal music.” 33

In the first song of the cycle, “Im wunderschönen monat Mai,” the idea of the Romantic fragment is displayed. In many of his cycles, as well as in Carnival, Op. 9, individual songs or pieces seem to begin in the middle of things and to seem unfinished. By itself, “Im wunderschönen monat Mai” does not actually resolve, as it ends on an incomplete cadence. The resolution only arrives by continuing on to the next song in the cycle, “Aus meinen Tränen spriessen.”

In essence, the piano part in these songs is not an “accompaniment” but a part of the song itself, with the piano pointing, underlining, and conceptualizing the poetry. The result is a fuller relationship between voice and piano, each with a role that complements the other. This allows Schumann to release the piano from having to accompany or provide text painting for the singer and permits it to comment with interior or ulterior emotional suggestion on the poem articulated by the singer. For example, in “Aus meinen Tränen spriessen,” three of the cadences in the vocal line end on a dominant seventh chord and are answered and resolved in the piano. (See Example 6)

Postludes play a vital part in Schumann’s songs and the relationship between voice and piano. In Lieder prior to Schubert and early Schumann, the postlude’s function was normally to summarize or punctuate the Lied. Yet several postludes in Dichterliebe introduce new material and the postlude of the final Lied, “Die alten bösen Lieder,” is of such length and quality that it summarizes both the final Lied and the complete cycle.

Example 6. Schumann, Aus meinen Tränen spriessen, mm 1-16

---

34 Taylor, Robert Schumann: His Life and Work, 192.
Nicht schnell.

Aus meinen Tränen sprühen viel blühende Blumen her.

vor, und meine Seufzer werden ein Nachtigallenchor. Und

wenn du mich lieb hast, Kindchen, schenk ich dir die Blumen all, und vor

dinem Fenster soll klingen das Lied der Nachtigall.
The fifth song in *Dichterliebe*, "Ich will meinen Seele tauchen," contains a patterned accompaniment that only alludes to the melody. When the voice concludes, the melody seems incomplete; the piano then continues, completing and finalizing the poetic idea.37

**Example 7. Schumann, Ich will meine Seele tauchen, mm. 14-22**

Number eight in the cycle, "Und wüssten's die Blumen," is a strophic song. The poet laments that only she may know his pain, as it was she who tore his heart in two. After a bitter

---

36 Examples 6-12 from, Schumann: 85 Songs, ed. Sergius Kamen (New York: International Music Company), 52.  
vocal cadence, the piano then introduces new material which accents the indignant theme of the song.\textsuperscript{38}

Example 8. Schumann, *Und wüssten’s die Blumen*, mm. 30-37

In “Hör’ ich das Liedchen klingen,” the tenth song of the cycle, the piano introduction is a descending arpeggio with an offbeat dotted rhythm that tearfully presents what the voice will

\textsuperscript{38} Walsh, *The Lieder of Schumann*, 45-6.
In the postlude, Schumann subtly interweaves the voice and piano using the melody of the line “das einst die Liebste sang” (was sung by the beloved) repeating it several times as a reminder of the poets former bliss now painfully gone.

Example 9. Schumann, *Hör’ ich das Liedchen klingen*, mm. 4-9

---

In number thirteen, “Ich hab’ im Traum geweinet,” an interesting relationship between voice and piano develops. During the first two stanzas of the poem, the voice and piano remain completely separate. One is silent while the other sounds. The voice comments first and is mournful and legato with a recitative quality. The piano punctuates the voice part with a staccato shudder. It is in the third and final stanza where the two come together. This time the piano enters first, then the monotone vocal line joins the piano, which contains chords that do not
resolve until the end of the piece. In the postlude the pianist has the responsibility to sustain suspense by maintaining two long silences, one of eight beats and the other ten.

Example 11. Schumann, “Ich hab im Traum geweinet,” mm. 24-39

Perhaps the most famous postlude in all Lieder is that of the final song of the cycle, “Die alten bösen Lieder.” The final stanza of the poem is the poet proclaiming his intention to bury

---

40 Thym, “Schumann: Reconfiguring the Lied,” 130.
all his love and anguish within a coffin so large that the only grave wide and deep enough for it is the ocean. Schumann makes the final statement of the cycle textless. The piano completes the musical and poetic idea of the cycle by burying the poet’s grief with the descending motive that represents the sinking of the coffin into the sea. “The expression of the ‘inexpressible’ has become the responsibility of music.”

Robert Schumann incorporated his love for both literature and the piano into his Lieder. After his prolonged break from writing Lieder, in which he developed his piano technique and was exposed to the aesthetics of the Romantic era, he then composed some of the most finely-crafted songs of the Romantic era. Before Schumann, the piano and voice functioned together, but on different planes, and while the piano supported the voice, it was not its equal. In Schumann’s works, the piano became a textless voice which shared and in many instances punctuated the vocal line. What resulted was a more collaborative relationship between voice and piano.

Example 12. Schumann, “Die alten bösen Lieder,” mm. 48-67

---

Adagio.

senkt' auch meine Liebe und meinen Schmerz hin ein.

Andante espressivo.

* * *

ritard.
Bibliography


