

## ***Book Reviews***

***Modern Tribal Development: Paths to Self-Sufficiency and Cultural Integrity in Indian Country.*** Dean Howard Smith. (Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2000. xii, 167 pp.; 23 cm, ISBN 0742504107, \$23.95 paperback.)

Statistics show that American Indians are still the poorest population group in the United States. Yet there is hope, as Dean Howard Smith notes in this rather slim volume. Smith, an associate professor of economics at Northern Arizona University, argues that development is the way out of tribal poverty and consequent dependency on the federal government. His thesis, that development will help sustain tribal identity and tribal sovereignty, as long as it happens within the cultural context of a particular tribe, has been well articulated in this publication.

Smith notes that American Indians have not always been poor. Hopewell Culture as exemplified in the Cahokia mound complex, provides many primary examples of well-developed ancient cultures in North America. European borne illnesses decimated many Indian Nations throughout the country. With this loss of population came the fragmentation of traditional life. As a result, Indians were driven into poverty by European invaders and, subsequently, through 200 years of failed federal policies, have continued a downward decline due to these acts of cultural, political, and social genocide. Still, many tribes, such as the Mississippi Choctaw, have succeeded in a form of economic development that has promoted their cultural integrity and financial independence. Smith argues that all tribes can potentially succeed provided they have a good plan on how to proceed.

Smith introduces a paradigm for development, carefully explaining the social compatibility required in order for any economic activity in Indian country to succeed. Tribes need to control their resources, know what those resources are, and be able to provide stability within the tribal government. Smith's thesis is strong and his evidence, based on his own experiences in consultations for the Center for American Indian Economic Development with reservation leadership, sufficiently supports his thesis.

Smith uses as examples of different tribal communities, the Rosebud Sioux and the Fort Belknap Assiniboine/Gros Ventre Reservation. He argues that, despite the overwhelming poverty on the Rosebud, many opportunities to beat the odds and get ahead are present. Its best asset may prove to be the youth who provide a sufficient labor force for entry level positions in industrial development. With strong educational opportunities in tribal K-12 schools with strong culturally relevant curricula and Sinte Gleske, the Rosebud Lakota Tribal College, young Rosebud Lakota men and women are well prepared to be financially and vocationally successful within a compatible social environment. But to make any plan work, an integrated plan of action needs to be in place. Small-scale plans, which do not take all possible factors into account, are doomed to failure. Some initial success will be necessary to feed optimism and more success. In contrast, the Fort Belknap Nations are currently putting into practice a comprehensive community development plan, which takes into account educational, economic and psychological problems. Smith hopes that this type of comprehensive plan could be applied to all poor rural communities, Native or non-Native, with success.

This book provides a parallel to *What Can Tribes Do?*, 1992, edited by Stephen Cornell and Joseph Kalt. Both utilize material collected in the Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development by the John F. Kennedy School of Government. In fact the reader of this slim book should read Cornell and Kalt's book for further details. Smith does not actually provide much new information. Yet the book is useful and important because it is up-to-date and because tribal attempts to strengthen their self-determination are as timely and important as they have ever been.

University of Turku, Finland

Jaakko Puisto

***Protecting Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage: A Global Challenge.*** Marie Battiste and Sa'ke'j (James) Youngblood Henderson. (Saskatoon: Purich Publishing Ltd., 2000. viii, 324 p.; 23 cm., ISBN 189583015X, \$27.50 paper)

Marie Battiste and James Youngblood Henderson's new book *Protecting Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage*, is an essential companion reader to Linda

Tuhiwai Smith's *Decolonizing Methodologies*. While Smith writes from a Maori woman, researcher perspective within a New Zealand colonial context, Battiste and Henderson write from Mi'kmaq and Chickasaw legal scholar perspectives, within both Canadian and international contexts. Battiste and Henderson reflect Smith's goal (1999:7), to recover "ourselves, an analysis of colonialism, and a struggle for self-determination."

*Protecting Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage* is a part of the debate about the protection of Indigenous knowledge as intellectual property, with current discussion focusing on the World Trade Organization, TRIPS, WIPO, and other international organizing bodies of the United Nations. These international discussions have been equally matched by national and regional efforts, for example, a conference hosted by Treaty & Tribal Association in Fort St. John in northern British Columbia on the topic of sharing traditional knowledge. This conference was followed by a conference hosted by the Union of British Columbia Indian Chiefs (UBCIC) in Vancouver, entitled "Protecting Knowledge: Traditional Resource Rights in the New Millennium." The UBCIC conference attracted a wide and international group of Aboriginal activists and academics (students and teachers).

Since 1965 at the international level, from 1970 onward in Canada and the United States, there have been significant legal reforms, in particular United Nations covenants, which affirm and support Indigenous rights. International legal recognition of Indigenous peoples has begun to influence domestic policy in states like Canada. Aboriginal groups see these international forums as increasingly attractive arenas in which to create a climate for domestic policy reform. This argument reinforced the recognition of plurality, the intra-relatedness of Aboriginal issues and land, and the many challenges that require further consideration.

*Protecting Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage* embodies a rich and textured weave of ideas. The complexity of the telling is not restricted to simply the legalistic, cultural, environmental, spiritual, geographic, human rights, education, history, orality, and so on. *Protecting Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage* affords an insightful and extremely well researched narrative on what Henderson and others might suggest is one of the scariest things in the world to do, capture Indigenous ideas into English. The seventeen chapters of the book are set in five parts. Part I, *The Lodge of Indigenous Knowledge in Modern Thought* contains two important chapters.

Chapter one, similar in many ways to McConaghy's (2000) critique of "culturalism", examines Eurocentrism and the European ethnographic tradition. Battiste and Henderson argue, "one of the tasks of this book is to attempt to replace the anthropologists' canon with a more realistic assessment of Indigenous knowledge" (33). Chapter two examines Indigenous knowledge as a manifestation of particular ecological order, decolonizing the death grip of anthropology, and the authors stress the connection between knowledge and

---

intelligible essences. "Indigenous knowledge is based on awareness, familiarity, conceptualization, and beliefs acquired about an ecosystem" (48). While this statement might sound like an endorsement of the biological science of ecology, nothing could be further from the truth. Battiste and Henderson are using the term ecology, beyond the crude scientific meaning, embracing the holism of ecology with spirituality and language as integral component parts of ecosystems thinking. These chapters offer radical reevaluation of the fragmented concepts offered by western epistemology, asserting Indigenous ways of knowing.

The next seven chapters collectively make up part II, "Towards an Understanding of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples to Their Knowledge and Heritage." In this part of the book, Battiste and Henderson map the progress of previously colonized societies "seeking to end the reign of Eurocentric singularity by building postcolonial diversity and equality" (59). The authors interrogate the definition of Indigenous, the concepts of Indigenous knowledge and heritage, ecology, intellectual property rights, and Indigenous legal systems, to assert each community's "collective right to manage its knowledge... critical to the identity, survival, and development of each Indigenous society" (72). An essential point made by the authors is that Indigenous languages are integral to the maintenance and propagation of knowledge, and in this they remind us that the power to name also reflects the power to make decisions. Quite convincingly, the authors endorse a segregationist approach to decolonize "cognitive imperialism" in education beyond the malevolent treatment of universities and public state educational institutions. The authors support their position with discussions of the impacts on Indigenous religions, paradigmatic thought in Eurocentric science, and ethical research. Battiste and Henderson end part two by stating, "Indigenous peoples are victimized by an intellectual and cultural property law system that not only depends on appropriation and control through individual ownership—a concept foreign to Indigenous systems of regulating creativity—but also relies on an ideological structure that relegates Indigenous peoples to a category beneath human ingenuity and creativity, raising serious doubts about the applicability of any Eurocentric law to traditional arts and knowledge" (168).

Part III, "Existing Legal Regimes and Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage," made up of three chapters, examines the intellectual and cultural property law regimes at both the international and Canadian (constitutional and legislative) contexts. The four chapters in Part IV, "The Need for Legal and Policy Reforms to Protect Indigenous Knowledge and Heritage," advance and recommend future directions for the protection of Indigenous knowledge and heritage. In Parts III and IV the material is the most challenging of the book with the bulk of the chapters examining the legal regimes and policy in Canada and at the international level. The arguments in these chapters represent a need for the empowerment of Indigenous peoples and the need to create documents of definition and description for an international agenda.

One criticism involves the citations on page 164. Pask (1993, 59-60) is cited for a series of articles including an article by Joane Cardinal-Schubert, Lee Maracle, and Loretta Todd's "Notes on Appropriation." The legalistic tone sprinkled throughout the book is a bit hard to read at times, however, efforts are made by the authors to refrain from overly jargonistic language. Perhaps more about the dynamic players involved with different nation states, beyond Dr Daes, would be useful. Battiste's and Henderson's critique of universities ignored the plurality of research generated. Just how legal policy reforms will impact other aspects of community life remains an unexplored area.

This book may well be considered a narrative blueprint for postcolonialism. It forms a direct challenge to structural and institutionalized racism and discrimination of Aboriginal people. Ultimately, the book will be most valuable to researchers and community members. It is of relevance to courses in archival studies, museum studies, Native studies, natural resource management, environmental studies, education, law, international studies, and graduate courses that examine Aboriginal rights.

University of Northern British Columbia

Chris Hannibal Paci

*Nunavut: Inuit Regain Control of the Lands and Their Lives.* Dahl, Jens, Jack Hicks and Peter Jull (eds.). (Denmark: International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs, 2000. 223 p.: ill.; 24 cm, ISBN 8790730348 \$16.00 paperback)

On April 1, 1999 the territory of Nunavut came into existence and currently encompasses one-fifth of Canada's total land mass. The diverse and captivating history of this territory and the Inuit who call it home is in need of recognition, something the editors of *Nunavut: Inuit Regain Control of the Lands and Their Lives* attempt with this collection of 11 essays. What struck me immediately about this compilation was the title, which is problematic as it implies that the Inuit have achieved a form of self-government and direct the territory's everyday activities. The editors would be well advised to further examine the situation. Nunavut is a territory, much the same as the Yukon or Northwest Territories, and as such, the government is recognized as a territorial government whose governing procedures are regulated by Ottawa, Canada's capital. The territorial population is approximately 85 percent Inuit, which results in a high proportion of the Nunavut legislature's members being Inuit; this is not self-government. Rather, it is a governing structure based on the Yukon and Northwest Territories legislative design, whose governing bodies consist of primarily Inuit members who have a vested interest in the territory's political and social well-being.

This is an important point as many of the collection's essays are predicated on the fact that Nunavut is a self-governing entity; consequently, many miss

---

their mark. Also affecting the final product is the fact that this publication was slated for release shortly after Nunavut was realized and much has occurred since that time, events of which are not covered in the enclosed articles that are vital to understanding Nunavut in 2001 and beyond. Despite the disjointed nature of this collection, there are nevertheless a number of interesting personal reflection pieces written by people who were directly involved in the creation of Nunavut during the last 25 years. Also, there are two impressive articles that provide important insight into the character of the Inuit and their ties to the territory. The first outlines the importance of place names to the survival of Inuit cultural identity, whereas the second deals with the re-emergence of the Beluga whale hunt in 1995 and its importance to Inuit epistemology. As well, chapter three is an extended overview of the creation of the social contract entered into by the Inuit and Canadian government and provides the foundation for this compilation.

Overall, this collection is varied and expresses a variety of viewpoints and concerns. However, the editors' attempted to establish a theme upon which they were unable to follow through – Nunavut as Aboriginal self-government. This is due mainly to a misunderstanding of Canadian policy regarding territorial governments, a dilemma that could have been easily avoided. Had this book been presented as a history text, it would make for interesting reading as the chosen articles provide a general explanation of events that led to the creation of Nunavut. Unfortunately, the editors' goal is to present us with a contemporary reader that presents the Inuit as modern day folk heroes who fought gallantly to persevere and reclaim territory that was in the first places theirs. This makes for an intriguing story, albeit an inaccurate one.

Trent University

Yale Belanger

*Traders' Tales: Narratives of Cultural Encounters in the Columbia Plateau, 1807-1846.* Elizabeth Vibert. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000. xviii, 366 p.: ill., maps; 23 cm, ISBN 0806131942, \$16.95 paperback)

Elizabeth Vibert uses post records, reports, journals, draft manuscripts, and published accounts to outline early nineteenth-century British views of Indian lives. Out of reciprocal misunderstandings and half-correct impressions arose a new "understanding" not wholly of either culture. To her credit, the author does not use traders' insensitivities to form another simple indictment of colonizers, nor does she charge shortcomings within native cultures. Instead, *Traders' Tales* depicts attempts of all parties to use contact to their advantage.

The misjudgments of European observers will not be "new" to readers versed in Indian history. For example, British men reportedly described Native

peoples as “starving” or “miserable.” This work’s prime contribution is in the persuasive refutation of such claims based on the words of the traders themselves. The author details striking contrasts between British expectations and Native realities such as the rather incongruous notion that Indians should yearn for eastern woodlands and aspire to the same “familiar” foods and culture as Britons. The artificial distinction between “noble hunting tribes” and “indolent fishing tribes” not only reflected British class hierarchies, but determined trading preferences as well.

This work joins in a growing call for more nuanced and thoughtful ethnohistory. The author’s announced intention is to contemplate “the nature of historical realities” rather than to redefine “historical fact” (xiii). Vibert’s investigation is well-grounded and the written materials of British traders, prudently analyzed, divulge information far beyond their face value. Traders’ “truths” reveal themselves as conjectures constructed through their own cultural lenses. Vibert points out selected cases in which traders were quite astute, and others in which they were miserably wrong. Anthropology, archaeology, and linguistics assist in assessment, but the ultimate difficulty lays in the selection of materials upon which to rely. However, the propensity of the aggregated evidence employed makes for a convincing and informed reading of trader chronicles.

The final chapter of *Traders’ Tales* illustrates the importance of exploring early nineteenth-century European concepts of poverty, industriousness, and propriety by comparison with the 1990 “*Delgamuukw v. British Columbia*” decision. In the “Reasons for Judgment issued by the court,” European narratives represented “reliable” information while First Nations accounts were considered “not literally true” (281-283). Clearly, Vibert criticizes the privileging of simulacra created by outside observers over peoples whose history transcends the brief events of the fur trade. The refutation of the arrival of Europeans as the watershed event in Native history is a continuous subtext and those interested in the construction of culture in any borderland region would do well to consider this work.

University of California, Davis

Steven M. Founta

***Beyond Rights Talk and Culture Talk: Comparative Essays on the Politic Rights and Culture.*** Mahmood Mamdani, ed. (New York: St. Martin’s 2000. v, 170 p.; 24 cm, ISBN 0312234988, \$19.95 paper)

In the post-colonial world, where is the intersection of justice between Western precepts of legal rights and justice based on local cultural institutions? This is the pivotal question that outlines Mahmood Mamdani’s collection

---

essays, drawn from the 1997 Conference on Cultural Transformations at the Centre for African Studies at the University of Cape Town in South Africa.

Mamdani, Director of Columbia University's Institute of African Studies, has selected the conference papers that comprise this tome, and accordingly frame the terms of debate. He uses the opening and closing essays (by Martin Chanock and Thandabantu Nhlapo respectively) to concentrate the book's focus. Updating some of the older tensions surrounding issues of cultural relativism and post-colonial development, Chanock argues that, in a post-colonial world, culture-based institutions are often misappropriated by local elites. He identifies these elites as embracing cultural issues as a way to bolster their authority, which is otherwise flagging in the face of political and economic reforms. Nhlapo counters that there is an element of cultural chauvinism, i.e., Western chauvinism, by insisting that a system of justice based on Western legal frameworks be applied around the world as the appropriate and exclusive models. In other words, while conceding that culture-based systems are sometimes a defense of privilege, he also asks, is not an exclusive application of Western-based system of legal rights also a defense of privilege: the privilege of Westerners to apply their legal culture?

Within the parameters of this debate, five other essays concerning issues in Africa and the United States are explored within *Beyond Rights Talk*. Issa G. Shivji broaches the issue within the context of modern political developments surrounding land reform in Tanzania; Kimberle Krenshaw examines the changing face of civil rights in the post-World War II United States; Nivedita Menon investigates the interaction between the rising women's rights movement and religious communities in India; Hussaina Abdullah follows a similar tack by tracing the relationship between Nigeria's growing women's rights movement and that nation's army; and Ebrahim Moosa looks at the problems of state protection of and interaction with religious institution in post-apartheid South Africa.

Menon's discussion of India is the most refreshing, as it captures the complexity of the issues at hand: Western legal frameworks and local cultural practices are not simply at odds. They also interact substantially. She does a splendid job relaying the intricacies and ironies of this interaction as she examines the balancing act of legal and religious cultures perched on the fulcrum of the movement for women's rights.

In general, these essays are saddled with the kind of unnecessary jargon that was silly fifteen years ago and is now yawn-inducing: discourses are mobilized and contested, and narrative paradigms shift. However, despite its literary shortcomings, *Beyond Rights Talk* features essays that effectively grapple with various aspects of larger issues in the post-colonial legal culture war.

***To Show What An Indian Can Do: Sports at Native American Boarding Schools.***  
John Bloom. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2000. xxi, 151 pl, [16] p of plates. ill.; 24 cm, ISBN 0816636516, \$24.95)

For some time, historians of Native American boarding schools have recognized the importance of sports at these institutions of higher learning, yet, until now, no comprehensive study has been attempted. John Bloom argues that Indians and the majority culture contested “the meaning of Indian education” through sports. (xiii) Reformers used sports to demonstrate the efficacy of the assimilation program at off-reservation boarding schools. Indian athletes undermined the reformers’ goals and controlled their own sporting lives by developing a pan-Indian consciousness and an alternative resistance.

Between 1890 and 1929, school administrators made athletics integral to boarding school curriculum. Reformers believed that outside exercise was salubrious, inculcated proper gender roles among students and Indian participation in sports confirmed progress in assimilating to the majority culture. Too often, this did not occur. Administrators countered their goal by recruiting players and emphasizing competitive and profitable teams. This ambivalence undermined football at Carlisle. The corruption endemic of big-time football in the early twentieth century facilitated the closing of the Carlisle Indian Industrial School. In addition, journalists often read regressive trends in sports and Indian events associated with football games.

While reformers and journalists treated sports ambivalently, Native American students used sports for their own purposes. In the 1930s, male students created a pan-Indian identity through boxing. Indian pugilists traveled across the country, felt pride in their Indian identity and understood the cultural diversity of Indians in America. Female students formed a folk culture that emphasized fun, pranks and tricks during recess that defied the reformers’ attempts to instill Victorian sexual norms and control their social lives. Finally, Bloom finds a “hidden transcript” in oral histories. Native American athletes recall their athletic days fondly but these interviews also criticized racism in the United States.

Bloom successfully integrates considerable work on Native American sports at boarding schools. His first chapter about Carlisle integrates literature that lacked a synthetic structure and will aid future students of Native American sports at the boarding schools. However, this perceptive and much needed study is too short. Bloom provides insightful commentary on Indian participation in sports but many ideas are undeveloped in the space provided. The fault does not lie primarily with Bloom. The study of Native American sports is an immature but growing field of study. His volume facilitates future work and serves as a beacon for forthcoming studies of Indian athletics.

---

***Creek Indian History: A Historical Narrative of the Genealogy, Traditions and Downfall of the Ispacoga or Creek Indian Tribe of Indians by One of the Tribe.*** George Stiggins. Edited by Virginia Pounds Brown. (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2000. 176 p.: ill.; 23 cm, ISBN 0942301153, \$24.95 paper)

This volume by Virginia Pounds Brown reprints a source familiar to most scholars of eighteenth and early nineteenth century southeastern Indians. George Stiggins, a child of an Euro-American trader and Natchez Creek mother, wrote the volume in the years preceding and immediately following Indian removal in 1836. Born into Creek society, Stiggins witnessed Native customs and the rise of the Creek civil war (1812-1814). After the war, he played upon his white paternity and remained in Alabama.

Stiggins's manuscript provides a unique look at various aspects of Creek society. Scholars have long relied on it in their descriptions of rituals, politics, the ethnic diversity within Creek society, the structure of government, and the location of towns. The volume also explores many aspects of the Creek civil war (1812-1814), including Burnt Creek, Fort Mims, and the motivations of nativist prophets and other Creek leaders.

One of the most interesting themes within the volume deals with Stiggins's relationship to other Creek Indians. At times, he describes himself as "one of the tribe" and refers to "my woe-worn and pitiable country" (p. 23). In almost the same breath, though, his position as an outsider appears in his descriptions of "their debates in council." Stiggins, in fact, includes a cautionary tale in his preface concerning the "fabricated tale[s]" told to travelers among the Creeks and his attempt to "take the most probable side of what I have heard them relate" (p. 24). As much as he claims to be "one of the tribe," his alienation from Creek society permeates the text.

Unfortunately, Brown chose not to publish the entire or an intact manuscript. Brown explains that "basic editing has been done to the frequently obscure and wordy manuscript in the interest of clarity and readability" (p. 12). Parts of the original have been removed, sentence structures have been altered, and meanings have been slightly changed. For example, Brown added the words "claimed to have" to Stiggins's description of "Josiah Francis, a half-blooded Frenchman, who was of the prophets, [who] claimed to have received an order from the master of Breath" (p. 91). By adding those words, Brown needlessly augments Stiggins's skeptical views of Francis's religious faith.

In short, this is not the first nor the best reprint of the manuscript. Apart from a few insightful comments by William Stokes Wyman, a turn of the twentieth-century scholar who originally edited the volume for publication, scholars who cannot consult the original manuscript at the State Historical Society of Wisconsin should use the more accurate reprint that Theron A. Nunez, Jr. published in *Ethnohistory* in 1958.

***Contrary Neighbors: Southern Plains and Removed Indians in Indian Territory.*** David La Vere. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000. xii, 292 p.: ill., maps, ports.; 23 cm, ISBN 0806132515 hardcover \$29.95)

La Vere's work confirms, in historical documentation and analysis, what many in Native American studies have known for 50 years: the containment of the Plains Indians and removal of the Southeastern Indians to Indian Territory created a politico-geographic and cultural space ripe for conflict. La Vere substantially supports his argument that the cultural differences between the Southern Plains (hunter-gatherers) and the Southeastern (agriculturalists) peoples precipitated suspicion between the two groups preventing a "middle ground of cooperation and unity." In the beginning chapters, the book examines early contact and disputes between the Plains tribes and Northeast, Woodlands and Northeastern, and clashes among the closely related Southeastern groups over progressive and traditionalist ways. Although, it is made clear that white encroachment and Indian incorporation into the European political economy are largely responsible for these troubles, what makes La Vere's assessment distinct is his focus on the relations between the variety of Indian peoples instead of Indian relations with the government. The book emphasizes early on that the US government was ignorant of the differences between Plains and Southeastern peoples when establishing Indian Territory, however this fact comes more into focus under La Vere's examination of Southeastern Indian removal. The Five Tribes, upon their arrival in Indian Territory, continued a program of "civilization" with the establishment of republican governments and large scale agriculture. In contrast the Kiowa, Comanche, Osage, and Apache continued their historic practice of land and resource competition by raiding the newly settled Southeastern homesteads. Efforts to "civilize" the perceived "savagery" of the Plains groups by the Southeastern peoples through political councils, attempted alliances and government involvement sets the tone for the remainder of the book. As we see, the chasm between is intensified. Ironically, as La Vere points out, both groups saw themselves as "real Indians".

University of Oklahoma

Brian Gilley

***Inigo of Rancho Posolmi: The Life and Times of a Mission Indian.*** Laurence H. Shoup and Randall T. Milliken. (Menlo Park: Ballena Press, 1999. ISBN 0879191422, \$19.95)

Provocative and timely, *Inigo of Rancho Posolmi: The Life and Times of a Mission Indian*, by anthropologists Laurence H. Shoup and Randall T. Milliken, chronicles the California Indian past as seen through the eyes of Lope Inigo

---

(1781-1864), an Ohlone Indian from the Santa Clara Valley embroiled in the turbulent era of the Spanish mission system, Mexican secularization, and American invasion. The authors utilize a biographical or life cycle approach common to the writing of family history, an increasingly popular method to uncover the historical experiences of Indigenous people.

Given the lack of violence in neophyte recruitment, and the high rate of disease within the missions, why did California Indians voluntarily enter the missions and remain for long periods of time as their populations plummeted? Shoup and Milliken argue that California Indians near the missions were “forced to choose from an array of undesirable choices.” [xi] Symbolized by the behavior of Inigo and his family, California Indians voluntarily relinquished control over their Indigenous culture after recognizing the benefits provided by the Franciscan priests. Abundant food and clothing, impressive buildings, and a lack of violence lured Indians into the missions. Persuasion and coercion within the mission helped to convince them to embrace a Spanish Christian lifestyle as mission neophytes.

The life of Inigo embodies the main focus of the book and the lens through which the authors interpret the California Indian mission experience. Born in 1781 four years after the founding of the Santa Clara Mission, Inigo outlived nearly all of his family, including both of his wives and most of his grandchildren. The authors admit that as a former alcalde, Christian Indian soldier, and elderly Indian land grant holder who survived into the 1860s, Inigo does not represent the typical experiences of most California Indians drawn into the mission system.

The most persuasive part of the book deals with Inigo’s difficulties in receiving legal possession of his land grant rancho, Posolmi. Inigo applied to Mexican secularization authorities for his share of Santa Clara Mission property in 1839, only to face opposition and delays from corrupt governors and land-hungry Californio ranchers. After receiving legal title, Inigo then confronted greedy American squatters. Following several court battles in the 1850s, Inigo occupied only a small portion of his original land grant when he died in 1864.

While the book masterfully details the lives of specific Indian individuals, the authors exaggerate the extent of Spanish hegemony over Indian people. They write, “The conquest and domination of Native American lives, labor, and land was underway.” [25] This interpretation obscures the cultural syncretism and passive resistance utilized by oppressed peoples when their culture experiences attack by foreigners. Some of the sources employed by the authors also merit closer scrutiny to more fully discern the biases of American explorers and Spanish mission priests.

Quite readable and relatively brief, *Inigo of Rancho Posolmi* includes seven maps, twelve tables based on mission and census records, and a family history chart. These sources help provide historical continuity to the portrayal of Inigo’s life, linking his exploits in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries with the fate

of his land grant, which became part of Moffet Air Field in the mid-twentieth century.

University of California, Davis

Jason Newman

***The Language Encounter in the Americas, 1492-1800: A Collection of Essays.***

Edward G. Gray and Norman Fiering, eds. (New York: Berghahn Books, 2000. x, 342 p.: ill.; 23 cm. ISBN 1571812105, \$49.95)

This collection is a very welcome addition to scholarship on Native-European encounters in the New World. Any researcher who has met the intractable silence of European records concerning Indigenous peoples of the Americas knows the value to ethnohistorical work of linguistic evidence. Often, it forms the only link in the chain by which scholars might follow the movements, reorganizations, or ethnic amalgamations of Indigenous peoples attempting to deal with the effects of European invasion over the three centuries covered in the present volume. Both the broad coverage and the interdisciplinary approaches of the authors in Gray and Fiering's collection will offer future scholars of colonial situations conceptual tools with which to address what Fiering refers to as "the curse of the Tower of Babel... the impenetrability of the thousands of different forms of human speech" (p. ix) across the Americas in their works.

The essays originated as papers given at a conference at the John Carter Brown Library of Brown University in 1996, entitled "Communicating with the Indians." They are organized into five thematic headings: Terms of Contact, Signs and Symbols, The Literate and the Nonliterate, Intermediaries, and Theory. In the first section, Terms of Contact, James Axtell and Ives Goddard frame the historical problem at hand. Axtell argues that the power relations of the European colonial enterprise, which necessitated both the acquisition of European languages by Indigenous peoples and Indigenous languages by Europeans, resulted in colonial officials who clearly heard, but chose not to listen to, Indigenous peoples they could not deny were "articulate human beings like themselves" (p.53). Goddard deals with the use of pidgins and jargons in the new world encounter, a long-neglected topic that points to not only the Indigenous impetus in creating modes of language with which to confront Europeans, but also to pan-Indigenous tongues which fostered greater cooperation and understanding between diverse groups.

Notable contributions in the succeeding sections include Pauline Moffitt Watts on what she calls the "mute eloquence" of communicating with gestures, pictures and hieroglyphs in early colonial Mexico. Frances Kartunen offers a sharp essay on the trials of those Indigenous individuals unlucky enough to be "chosen" to learn European languages, usually across the seas in a very differ-

---

ent new world for them. Isaias Lerner, Lieve Jooken, and Rudiger Schreyer close the volume with three edifying investigations into the place of Indigenous languages in contemporary theories of linguistic origin and change. Overall, Gray and Fiering have put together a strong and accessible collection that will lead scholars of diverse subfields in very profitable common directions.

Miami University

Bradley Scott Schragar

***Keepers of the Central Fire: Issues in Ecology for Indigenous People.*** Lorelei Anne Lambert Colomeda. (Sudbury, Massachusetts: Jones and Bartlett Publishers, 1999. xxii, 250 p.: ill.; ISBN 0763709239, \$36.95 paper)

Americans have romanticized the relationship between Indigenous peoples and their environment for more than a century. *Keepers of the Central Fire* explores the implications that human-altered environments have had on Indigenous populations. Colomeda, a registered nurse and medical ecology Ph.D., aims her work to serve as a call to action for health care workers and public policy formulators to more broadly consider the links between environmental contamination and public health.

Colomeda covers much ground in this six-chapter study. Her first two chapters focus on the need to rethink environmental agenda and comparisons between policies of capitalistic and tribal societies. The succeeding three chapters provide the work's main contributions by exploring specific ecological developments within Indigenous societies around the world. Each chapter presents brief case studies of Indigenous communities that include historical overviews, particular environmental problems, impacts on public health, and oral testimony of tribal members. Chapter 3 focuses on Colomeda's home state of Montana and its seven reservations. She reveals, among many developments within her state, the impact of the Kerr Dam on the Flathead Reservation, cyanide and lead poisoning from mining on the Fort Belknap Reservation, and dioxin contamination from pesticides and paper mills on the Rocky Boy Reservation. Chapter 4 expands the study to other Indigenous environmental experiences within North America, including those of the Kiowa, Dine (Navajo), Cree, and Iroquois societies. Chapter 5 examines similar ecological issues within tribal communities in the Amazon Rain Forest, Africa, the former Soviet Union, and New Zealand.

Colomeda's litany of environmental abuses inflicting Indigenous communities will raise the ire of many readers who know of past injuries committed against Indigenous peoples, but may not be aware of the continuation of environmental injustices. Readers need to recognize, however, that the breadth of Colomeda's coverage required sacrifices in the discussion of the thorny com-

plexities within community histories. Her concentration on the impact of American corporate villains on tribal victims, for instance, seemingly glosses over divergent intertribal and intratribal attitudes toward environmental issues. Still, few readers will put down this book without embracing her scientifically-supported and indisputable thesis that ecological degradation has had a great impact on Indigenous communities.

Overall, the work's strength stems from Colomeda's ability to integrate a wide range of secondary sources on ecological issues into a single volume. General audiences and teachers will appreciate the broad scope of this study and its capacity to link national and international developments. Incorporating ethnohistorical analysis and scientific research, the interdisciplinary work will appeal to readers in the social and natural sciences. Scholars of Indigenous history and environmental studies will value Colomeda's collection of first-person accounts and numerous interviews with Indigenous community members. Indigenous and environmental activists will also appreciate the appendices, including the listings and addresses of Indigenous grass roots environmental organizations in the United States. All readers, within and outside of tribal communities, will gain from a work that reminds us of the critical links between our environment and our health.

The Newberry Library

Robert Galler

***Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision.*** Edited by Marie Battiste. (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2000. xxx, 314 p.; ill.; 24 cm, ISBN 0774807458, \$75.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper)

Indigenous criticism of mainstream education has roots deep in the rock and soil of the land and, therefore, in the memory of The People. Even though deliberate efforts to destroy Indigenous cultures continue, the many human beings who constitute the Indigenous Nations sometimes translate a critique of that shared oppression, commentary enabled by earlier resistances. In his third of four books published in a foreign language, for instance, Luther Standing Bear commented on the colonizer's schools in the United States at the height of calculated assimilation campaigns aimed at Indigenous children. "We went to school to copy, to imitate; not to exchange languages and ideas, and not to develop the best traits that had come out of uncountable experiences of hundreds of thousands of years living upon this continent," he wrote reflecting on the experiences of a 12-year-old boy separated from his Lakota family. "So, while the white people had much to teach us, we had much to teach them, and what a school could have been established upon that idea!" (*Land of the Spotted Eagle*, 236.)

---

The same could be said in response to the essays collected by Marie Battiste from a gathering of Indigenous leaders and educators for ten days at the University of Saskatchewan in Saskatoon, Canada, in 1996: what a school could be established on these ideas! Many of the contributors to this volume are well known among Indigenous teachers and scholars; others are less so. Together, 67 years after Standing Bear translated his Lakota vision, the various voices and visions assembled by Battiste come together to form a beautifully diverse and marvelously complex narrative that follows the time of the annual cycle when the book opens and gracefully moves along toward its closing pages. The book begins appropriately with the autumn of life; with what Battiste calls “diagnosing colonialism.” It ends with what contributors articulate as those decolonizing processes that accept difference as normative. Throughout its pages contributors model self-reflective practices of self-discovery along the rim of what might be a postcolonial world order, an Indigenous renaissance that values alliances among formerly oppressed peoples and that holds mainstream populations accountable for their selfish, inward-looking, and resource-hoarding behavior.

At the heart of this collection is the argument too often and too easily dismissed by mainstream scholars and educators: Indigenous knowledge exists and is a legitimate interdisciplinary and discipline-specific research issue that demands moral dialogue with and the participation of Indigenous communities. For far too long, this book’s contributors rightfully maintain, liberal solutions to the problems of colonization have ignored crises perpetrated by colonizing mainstems among Indigenous Peoples; these solutions have disregarded the many emergencies that ensue from the ongoing destruction of Indigenous ways of knowing and being. Departing from arguments for inclusion that universalize experience from liberal eurocentric theories and, importantly, from postcolonial theory in literature, this work acknowledges multiple responses to the many faces of oppression encountered and resisted by Indigenous scholars. And it does so from countless reservoirs of Indigenous knowledge.

While this volume certainly does not exhaust the conversations it both interprets and is interpreted by, *Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision* should and certainly could be a welcome contribution to teacher preparation programs in schools of education and in those centers for teaching excellence that populate so many universities, colleges, and community colleges today. Its contributors have much to offer educators whose investments in ongoing colonization are reflected not only in Luther Standing Bear’s memory of resistance but also are contemplated in the presence, not the absence, of Indigenous scholars who demand that we define ourselves, name ourselves, create for ourselves, and speak for ourselves. While the settler populations have had much to teach us, too much perhaps, we have much to teach ourselves and our allies among them as well.

*Homage to Chiapas: The New Indigenous Struggles in Mexico.* Bill Weinberg. (New York: Verso Publishing, 2000. x, 445 p.; illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 1859847196, \$30.00 paper)

One of the major difficulties in researching and exploring a topic so contemporary as the Indigenous struggle in Chiapas is creating a credible authorial voice while maintaining a perspective for the subject that usually takes many years to establish. However, in this latest work on the subject of the Zapatista rebellion and Indian uprisings in southern Mexico, Bill Weinberg presents a researched and well-documented assessment of the situation in Chiapas, drawn primarily from other studies of the topic and based upon his own first-hand, journalistic accounts in the region.

Weinberg begins his work by surveying the 500-year span between early Spanish colonialism and present-day Mexico, focusing on how the Indigenous people of Mexico have suffered and endured at the hands of both foreign and domestic governments. Highlighting major figures of Mexican history, Weinberg documents how Mayan resistance was created, transformed, and molded by such people as Cortez, Bartolome de Las Casas, Hidalgo and Morelos, Iturbide, Vicente Guerrero, Juarez, Diaz, Zapata, Salinas, and many others. Within this framework, Weinberg showcases the development of Mexico as an independent Nation. He traces the political revolutions and subsequent geographical metamorphoses that occurred in the nineteenth century, including national and international conflicts that influenced the formation of the modern government.

Weinberg's greatest contribution to the subject is his use of personal interviews and accounts of the time he spent in Mexico with members of the government and the Zapatistas, particularly, Subcommander Marcos. In chapter two, Weinberg describes his stay with the Indigenous rebels and his private meetings with Marcos. His interview with Marcos sheds light on the mysterious, masked guerrilla rebel who has become the physical symbol and voice for the entire movement. Marcos' political agenda, philosophy, reaction to NAFTA, and the plights and concerns of the EZLN are all presented in this interview. Marcos argues "When Salinas shook hands on the NAFTA agreement, he was playing with the lives of Indian peoples. You cannot shake hands on an agreement like that without staining your hands with blood" (p. 128). Subsequent chapters also rely on first-hand narratives and accounts to depict the deplorable situation in Chiapas and illustrate the justification for the rebellion. These unprecedented and valuable accounts offer readers an excellent portrait of the struggle throughout Mexico unavailable in other works on the subject.

However, much of Weinberg's work is merely a synthesis of secondary accounts and texts on Mexican history, leaving his overall contribution somewhat lacking. While he does rely heavily on Mexican newspapers, EZLN publications, his first-hand accounts, and some reports from human rights organizations, he relies too much on other historians' works, largely summarizing and

---

restating many of their previously stated ideas. Through this synthesis, Weinberg's work becomes an historiographic essay of the major publications on Mexico and the conflict in Chiapas, yet without the benefit of a central thesis to guide the work. Additionally, Weinberg's journalistic voice and organization creates some transition problems between the sections and may distress some readers. The general audience, who may expect an introduction to Chiapas and the Zapatista rebellion's significance in Mexican history will find Weinberg's work a thorough and insightful guide that surveys Mexico's diverse past and depicts indigenous rebels as the saviors of their people. Others seeking new conclusions and new interpretations regarding the complexity of the situation should refer to the works cited in the bibliography.

Oklahoma State University

Nathan Wilson

***Coosa: The Rise and Fall of a Southeastern Mississippian Chiefdom.*** Marvin T. Smith. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2000. xix, 146 p.: ill; 24 cm, ISBN 0813018110, \$49.95)

Intended as a supplemental reader for history and archaeology courses on Native Americans in the Southeast, Marvin Smith's monograph provides a clear and concise historical account of the Coosa people. They inhabited the Southeast before the arrival of Europeans to the early nineteenth century. Specifically, this book addresses the political fortunes of the Coosa chiefdom as it rose to regional prominence prior to 1540. With the arrival of Spanish *entradas* in the sixteenth century, the chiefdom fell into relative obscurity.

The importance of this book lies in its ability to merge archaeological, ethnographic, and historical evidence to construct a narrative that connects the unrecorded events of Pre-Columbian history in the Southeast with the more familiar story of native activities during the Colonial era.

Organized into seven chapters, each chapter in this book uses specific types of evidence to reconstruct Coosa history during a specific time period. This methodological approach allows the author to assess the value of the evidence used at the same time a narrative is constructed.

The first two chapters use various types of archeological evidence to describe the environment and socio-political development of the region occupied by the Coosa chiefdom and its neighbors prior to European contact. The third chapter examines the historical accounts of the Spanish *entradas* that entered this territory and encountered the Coosa chiefdom. It expands upon the scenario developed in the first two chapters and identifies the human geography of the sixteenth century Coosa world. The fourth chapter assesses historical information concerning the Upper Creeks who descended from the Coosa people and their closest neighbor. The Coosas eventually became one of the ethnicities

collectively known as the Upper Creeks. Smith uses eighteenth-century Upper Creek cultural and political development as the endpoint of the Coosas' rise and fall as a dominant, Indigenous group in the region. In the fifth chapter, Smith reconstructs the sixteenth century using historical and archaeological evidence, and he clearly demonstrates that the Coosa chiefdom was at the height of its power during this time period. Smith then goes on to examine the Coosas and their neighbors in the years between the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries in the sixth chapter. Here he traces their movement down the Coosa River from northwest Georgia to north-central Alabama using primarily archaeological sources. Finally in the concluding chapter, Smith completes his account by illustrating three changes: how the Coosas managed to retain their relationship to a specific environment, how one of the Coosa neighbors, the Apica/Abihka, inherited the Coosa mantle of leadership under a more egalitarian form of government, and how all of the groups previously associated with the Coosa chiefdom became dependent upon European trade goods by 1775.

In this book, Smith is at his best piecing together the various types of evidence in a plausible fashion that clarifies the Coosas' trek through time from a sixteenth century, autocratic chiefdom to their association with other Muscogee towns in the eighteenth century. Additionally, his insight into the Coosa and Abihka desire to remain within the Ridge and Valley ecological zone points the way for an organizing theme for future work that focuses less on Indigenous acculturation of European culture and more on the persistence of Indigenous culture and society. Although Smith does tend to periodically overstate the devolution of indigenous culture and socio-political institutions, this work provides a blueprint for other scholars to fill in the gaps of southeastern indigenous history during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and it gives the general public a readable and entertaining account of one group of southeastern Native Americans.

University of Kansas  
Haskell Indian Nations University

Dixie Ray Haggard

***Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850.***

Martin Daunton and Rick Halpern, eds. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999. xii, 400 p.: 25 cm., ISBN 0812216997, \$24.95)

In February 1997 this reviewer had the pleasure of attending the joint Neale and Commonwealth Fund Conference in London. The conference produced three days of excellent papers by leading scholars, including, but not limited to, luminaries such as Philip Morgan, Kathleen Brown, Hilary Beckles and Christopher Bayley. A number of these papers appear in this excellent anthology looking at various aspects of the British colonial encounter. Although the pri-

---

mary focus of this book is Colonial North America, it also offers excellent work covering such diverse geographic regions as Africa, Australia and New Zealand. Thematically, the book raises new questions concerning such concepts as racial construction, the shifting and contested legal position within colonial encounters, and the role of gender and sexuality in contact situations. A short review such as this is unable to offer full details of the multiple and varied chapters. Three chapters are exemplified in an attempt to show the breadth of academic content with the volume.

Kathleen Brown's work on the construction of race during the early modern period is just one outstanding contribution. With great respect she deftly returns to Winthrop Jordan's *White over Black* to offer new and interesting interpretations "based on the insights of recent scholarship." (p. 81) Brown suggests, and shows, that a review of the literature used by Jordan reveals the "interesting history of early modern racial formations yet to be written about the Englishman and the Indian." (p. 98)

Nathaniel Shieldy's work on the Cherokee land transfers of the 1770s details the place of gender within colonial encounters. Shieldy's work looks beneath the surface of the traditional interpretation of these events to show that beyond the roles played by fraud and generational conflict in these contested land transfers it was in fact "concerns about masculinity [that lay] at the very heart of [the] narrative." During the 1770s the intense conflict and interaction between red, white and black in the southeast led to new meanings of masculinity for all parties which were acted out in the negotiations.

Finally, Heather Goodall's piece on Richard Bligh, the Commissioner for Crown Lands in the Macintyre River region of nineteenth century Australia, details the manner in which a similar pressure-pot of changing social and cultural ideas was reflected in the confusion and shifting position of Bligh. The rapidly changing concept, and application, of British colonial law was played out through land dispossession and deadly confrontations between the white "squatter" settlers and the aboriginal people of the region, the Murrumbidgee.

Overall this is an exciting and rewarding book to which justice cannot be done in these few words.

University of California, Riverside

Ian Chambers

***Indian Gaming: Tribal Sovereignty and American Politics.*** W. Dale Mason. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000. xxi, 330 p.: ill.; 23 cm., ISBN 0806132604, \$19.95 paper)

Indian gaming is a dynamic trend that has spread rapidly across the United States with both social and political implications for Indian and non-Indian communities. It is only recently, since the passage of the Indian Gaming Regu-

latory Act of 1988, that Indian tribes have had the financial wherewithal to take on new levels of organizing and exercising political and economic power within mainstream systems. There are few studies examining the Indian gaming phenomenon that will indeed continue to be a salient issue across Indian country. W. Dale Mason's *Indian Gaming* does a credible job by providing a rich analysis into the intricate understandings of Indian sovereignty through gaming. Mason examines the status of Indian tribes in the American political system, and introduces a new understanding of federalism and how tribes wield their political power in politics to protect their status as sovereign nations.

Mason's research draws upon Indian gaming to gauge a central question: what is the status of Indian tribes in the American political system? This is an ambitious research question since federal policies have historically been tumultuous for Indians by declaring tribes both "wards of a guardian" and "domestic dependent nations."

The first portion of the book is devoted to an overview of federal Indian policies that contextualize contemporary Indian gaming conflicts. Mason attempts to assess the quandary that "tribes act as sovereign entities, similar to states; for others, they act as interest groups; and for still others, they act as both simultaneously" (p. 3). In Mason's analysis, tribes do not fit into traditional models since they act in ways that states and interest groups cannot. Moreover, in his policy analysis Mason outlines the Indian Gaming Regulatory Act (IGRA) that sets the framework by which tribes and states must negotiate gaming compacts. Mason's interpretation of the Act could have been further developed since the IGRA plays a major role in framing the language in which Indian gaming operates. What Mason's analysis does not show is that the IGRA is contradictory in nature: on the one hand it encourages "self sufficiency and strong tribal governments" through gaming, *but* "only if legal in the state and if agreed to in a compact negotiated between the state and tribe" (p. 64-65). This is a minute point in the IGRA policy analysis, but nonetheless demonstrates the nature in which tribes must negotiate their role in such a system.

Mason draws upon tribes in New Mexico and Oklahoma for a comparative analysis of Indian gaming politics. New Mexico's tribal responses offer readers an opportunity to view, in all its complexity, the many ways that Indians have used their "anomalous political status" to protect tribal gaming, such as filing suit in federal court under the IGRA, lobbying the state legislature for a change in the state's gaming laws, and signing a state compact. In addition, New Mexico tribes vehemently endorsed favorable candidates and made significant campaign contributions to candidates in the 1994 gubernatorial election based solely on the candidates' positions on Indian gaming. In this argument, Mason implicitly suggests that prior to the introduction of Indian gaming in New Mexico, tribes were not politically active. Mason could have devoted more discussion to the historical significance of Pueblo Indians organizing, for example, the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 and the defeat of the Bursum Bill in the 1920s that in turn shaped their contemporary political lens. Another point worth

mentioning, not included in Mason's description of Indian politics in New Mexico, is that not all tribes, especially the Pueblos, chose to participate in the pursuit of Indian gaming compacts for various ideological reasons. In fact, not all tribes in New Mexico have successfully signed gaming compacts due to strict tribal ideological agendas.

In contrast, Mason's discussion of Oklahoma provides an interesting counterpoint to the gaming activities of New Mexico tribes. According to Mason, Oklahoma Indian tribes have not had the same opportunities under federal and state laws to expand gaming, as there appears to be much more political opposition by non-Indians than in New Mexico. Another difference Mason describes is the lack of tribal cohesiveness based on historical and cultural differences that have prevented tribes in Oklahoma from engaging in the kinds of tribal interest group activity utilized by New Mexico tribes. For example, Oklahoma Indians have a patchwork of histories in which tribes such as the Five Civilized Tribes (the Choctaw, Chickasaw, Creek, Cherokee, and Seminole) were involuntarily "resettled" under the nineteenth-century federal Indian removal policy. The outcome of such policies has produced less cultural and political unity among Oklahoma tribe in comparison with Pueblo Indians of New Mexico.

Mason's methodology is also worthy of comment for it represents one of the major strengths of the book. *Indian Gaming* utilizes several forms of methodology to obtain information and data: interviews with tribal and state leaders; analyses of congressional documents; analyses of Supreme Court cases; and analyses of newspaper reports. This multiperspective approach, which includes interview excerpts as well as federal and state policy analysis, serves as a model for those conducting research in the area of federal Indian policy. Meeting and conversing with tribal leaders adds a unique and insightful dimension to the discussion of politics.

*Indian Gaming* deserves to be read widely for Mason's contribution in providing a solid investigation of Indian gaming and in further clarifying the nature of tribes as legitimate governments. Mason's work conveys belief that tribes are indeed diligently involved in policy making since "tribal governments possess the commonly understood attributes of both sovereign and interest groups" (p. 231).