

Book Reviews

Tribes, Treaties, & Constitutional Tribulations, Vine Deloria, Jr. and David E. Wilkins. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1999. xii, 209 p.; 23 cm.; ISBN 0292716087, \$20.00 paper)

Building on his earlier works with Clifford M. Lytle, *American Indians, American Justice* (1983) and *The Nations Within: The Past and Future of American Indian Sovereignty* (1984), Vine Deloria, Jr., this time collaborating with David E. Wilkins, has produced a volume that examines the status accorded Indian tribes in relation to the three branches of the federal government. Further, the work investigates the varying ways that the protections guaranteed in the United States Constitution have been applied to and withheld from American Indians. There can be no doubt that these subjects are extremely important to Indian peoples, historians, and legal scholars, as they have vast ramifications for ongoing litigation involving Indian tribes, ongoing efforts to ensure religious freedom for Indian people, and the ongoing struggle of tribes to expand sovereignty and self-determination.

As with most of Deloria's past work, he and Wilkins present thought-provoking statements of moral reason that are backed by solid historical research and argument. The legal status of American Indians vis-à-vis the Constitution has been an area of confusion predating John Marshall's opinions in the *Cherokee Nation* cases of the 1830s. The inconsistent application of the treaties and laws approved by Congress, the enforcement of policies by the executive branch's bureaucracy, the Bureau of Indian Affairs, and the decisions of federal courts have only added to that confusion. To Deloria and Wilkins, the actions of the government are sometimes malicious, as with Jackson's forced removal of the

Southeastern tribes; sometimes capricious, as with the 1871 rider attached to an appropriation bill that ended the treaty-making relationship with the tribes; sometimes neglectful, as with the implementation and enforcement of existing treaties; and almost never systematically thought out. After extensively exploring the ways in which Indians interact with varying branches of the federal government, Deloria and Wilkins examine all sections of the Constitution and amendments that apply in any way to the formation and execution of Indian policy, discussing their implications and ramifications throughout the nation's history. As with their relationship with the government in general, the relationship between Indian peoples and the Constitutional amendments has always been ambiguous and often contradictory. Deloria and Wilkins convincingly argue that the Constitution does not provide a sufficient basis for American Indian law, and that the government should return to the treaty-making process as the mechanism managing relations between sovereign Indian nations and the federal government.

Although the work is comprehensive and persuasive, there are a few areas that could be explored further in the book. Although Deloria and Wilkins mention briefly that federal Indian law is inconsistent with international law, they do not elaborate on specific ways in which this is the case. Since the experiences of Indigenous peoples are increasingly being viewed in relation to each other, a concise investigation comparing the experiences and status of American Indian peoples with other Indigenous populations throughout the world would have made the study even stronger, and their conclusions even more convincing. Also, although Deloria and Wilkins extensively and effectively discuss the ramifications of federal actions on Indian religious practices, addressing other areas of reservation life that are affected by federal constitutional law such as gaming and land and water rights would have added to the applicability of the study. In the final analysis, however, this well-written, extensively researched work does cover its intended subject matter effectively and in detail. Rather than emphasizing criticisms of the book for what the authors chose not to cover, it is more important to underscore that this work will remain significant in Indian legal history and that it stands up quite well in relation to Deloria's other works on Indian legal issues.

University of Utah

Steven L. Danver

The Dawes Commission and the Allotment of the Five Civilized Tribes, 1893-1914, Kent Carter. (Orem, UT: Ancestry.com, 1999. ix, 284 p.: ill.; 28 cm; ISBN 091648985X, \$29.95)

The United States government's attempt to assimilate the Cherokee, Creek, Choctaw, Chickasaw, and Seminole Nations into the dominant society by means

of allotment is generally regarded as an abysmal failure and one of the many tragedies associated with Indian-white relations. Kent Carter accepts this premise, but he offers a more detailed, scholarly explanation as to why and how the Dawes Commission ultimately failed. He does so by delving into the bureaucratic processes associated with allotment more deeply than any previous scholar.

Carter's study of "bureaucratic imperialism" is couched within his overarching thesis that "the policy of assimilation through allotment could not be made to work by any missionary body regardless of how pure it remained" (168). His thirteen chapters tracing the Dawes Commission from its inception to its dissolution are extensively documented and well supported by predominately primary materials and voluminous official documents. But Carter's focus is not so much concerned with the tragedy of assimilation and allotment as it is with explaining how bureaucratic processes of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries functioned and "how the allotment policy was implemented with a better understanding of the complex issues involved and how the records were created and used" (ix).

Carter concludes that the oft-overlooked bureaucrats associated with the Commission performed their tasks to the best of their abilities. Carter does not discount the scandals and controversies associated with the Commission's twenty-one year history. But given Congress' determination to achieve assimilation through allotment as quickly and cheaply as possible, Carter effectively demonstrates how those responsible for implementing allotment maintained their focus despite the immense amount of both internal and external pressures.

Carter's book, however, is not for everyone. He does not offer, for example, a moral assessment of the Dawes Commission as one would find in works like Angie Debo's *And Still the Waters Run: The Betrayal of the Five Civilized Tribes*. But for those who want a scholarly explanation of how the Dawes Commission functioned and how and why Commission members made decisions, Carter's book is the text of choice. Because of its detail and focus on bureaucratic processes, Carter's book will only appeal to a relatively small audience, but for those who have a desire to better understand bureaucracy and federal Indian policy, Carter's book is an excellent source.

Carter used over 1,200 footnotes in 228 pages to explain the intricacies of the Dawes Commission bureaucracy. His inclusion of contemporary photographs and copies of key documents enhanced the book's overall presentation. Unfortunately, however, Carter did not provide a single map of Indian Territory or of Oklahoma to give the reader a sense of the locations he referenced. Additionally, some parts of the book, especially chapter six, were a bit tedious. His appendices were useful although an occasional organizational chart would have aided the reader's understanding of how the Department of the Interior theoretically functioned. Despite these minor shortcomings, however, Carter's book is a useful addition to the scholarship on federal Indian policy and should be used as a model for future studies of American bureaucracies.

LaDonna Harris: A Comanche Life, LaDonna Harris, edited by H. Henrietta Stockel. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000. xxv, 147 p., [10] p. of plates: maps, ports.; 21 cm; ISBN 080322396X, \$25.00)

This book chronicles the achievements of a woman during the 1950s and 1960s, a period in American history when being a strong, visible woman was as unpopular as being Indian. H. Henrietta Stockel briefly sets the tone of the book at the beginning of each chapter and occasionally throughout the book, but it is LaDonna Harris's voice that rings clear in the narrative as a Comanche woman.

Stockel makes it clear in the preface that the book is not about a twentieth-century Comanche lifestyle, but "LaDonna's life story as she lived it and as it affected those she loved" (xvi). The result of the collaboration between Harris and Stockel is a book by women about a woman coming into her own. Although Stockel interviews Harris, her ex-husband, and their two daughters to round out the imagery, Harris takes control of the style and content to assure little misunderstanding of her Comanche life.

Harris provides a brief history of the Comanche and how her family chose to claim their allotments to remain on the Comanche homeland near the mountains. She expresses the frustrations of assimilation and the colonial mentality that Native Americans faced when making cultural progress and through co-existence with whites. Harris describes an independent childhood with the matriarchal influence of a strong Comanche grandmother.

Her marriage to U.S. Senator Fred Harris draws her into the political world. Due to Harris's matriarchal influence, she finds herself in a synergistic relationship at her husband's side rather than in the background as was customary for women in the mainstream lifestyle. She is propelled into a social and political life of projects and committees and overcomes what she originally perceives herself to be, "a stoic Comanche" woman, to become a strong committee member and leader. She outlines a "grass roots" approach to leadership that transcends all cultures to make a difference for Native Americans and other minority cultures (i.e., with African Americans on the Oklahoma mayor's committee on integration).

Harris closes with lessons of letting go and moving forward, from her divorce to how to stop acting like a candidate's wife and start acting like a candidate when she ran for office on a third party ticket. She is drawn back to the Comanche life style and expresses the desire to work one-on-one with her people as a medicine woman rather than lead the public life she had pursued.

Harris and Stockel conclude the autobiography in keeping with the goal to present Harris' affect on her family, the nation, and the Comanche people. The result is an approach very similar to the autobiography of Wilma Mankiller (see Wilma Mankiller and Michael Wallis, *Mankiller: A Chief and Her People*, 1993).

An uplifting and informative chronicle of events enhanced by a collection of photographs, *LaDonna Harris: A Comanche Life* will appeal to those interested in women's studies, Indian studies, leadership, and government relations.

The Zuni Enigma: A Native American People's Possible Japanese Connection, Nancy Yaw Davis. (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2000. xxx, 318 p.: ill., maps; 25 cm; ISBN 0393047881, \$26.95)

As an enrolled member of the Zuni Nation and a person who has studied Japanese for three years with one year spent at the prestigious Sophia University in Japan, the theory that inspired Nancy Yaw Davis' book intrigued this reviewer. Her thesis that in the 1300s a group of Japanese explorers landed in North America, found their way to the Zuni Nation, settled and forever altered the Zuni language, religion, culture and genetic code is both appealing and repelling. This book appeals to this reviewer as a desire to learn Japanese may have been predetermined by the genetic imprint of ancient ancestors. However, Davis was simply another self-serving anthropologist with a desire to prove through research that the Zuni people are incapable of original thought and the ability to dictate the parameters of their identity without the help of outside influences. Her thesis has not been well accepted by the Zuni or by academics because she uses secondary sources that provide an outside level of objectivity representing "investigative reporting" more than true scholarship.

In reading the book, one concludes that Davis is an enlightened anthropologist who seeks to expand the mindset of humanity by presenting evidence that all human beings possess a common past through our migrating, merging and integrating ancestry. She presented her thesis with the knowledge that the Zuni Nation may find it repugnant and offered an indirect apology to the Zuni in her acknowledgements. She dedicated the book to the Zuni Tribe, their descendants, and their Asian relatives. A noted Zuni anthropologist, Edmund Ladd, was allowed to present a Zuni perspective in the foreword. While she never expressly requested their permission to publish her book, she welcomed the input and discussion of her thesis by the Zuni Tribal Council. Davis openly admitted that her thesis has met with much resistance in academic circles.

On the positive side, the book itself is beautifully designed and illustrated. The text includes 72 illustrations, 17 maps and 9 tables, which aid the reader in understanding foreign concepts and academic jargon. The book possesses one of the most thorough listings of previously published works on Zuni. An index is included so that readers can quickly locate subjects of interest. Extensive endnotes accompany each chapter. While this book may be of most interest to those who are interested in anthropology, anyone with interest can read this book and comprehend its contents.

Davis has organized the book in a way that is easily followed in support of her thesis. The first two chapters provide an overview of Zuni history and culture. Chapters three, four and five defend the plausibility of her thesis by examining trade routes, oceanic currents, and ship building in the thirteenth century. Chapters six, seven, eight and nine outline the similarities between the Japanese

and the Zuni in genetics, language, cultural models, cosmology, religion and artistic expression.

In researching this book, Davis did not conduct any primary research. Instead she relied solely on secondary sources. It is this reliance on secondary sources that compromises the book. While Davis did not wish to exploit the Zuni people by conducting primary research of her own, she failed to acknowledge that many of the secondary sources she used are exploitive because they violated the rights of the Zuni people by publishing sacred images and knowledge. Furthermore, many of her secondary sources were written by individuals such as Cushing, Stevenson, Bunzel and Benedict, who were seeking to understand Zuni thought and actions through a rubric based on Western knowledge. Therefore, these works are at best compromised representations of the Zuni people.

The compromised integrity of her sources also impacts her comparison of the Zunian and Japanese languages. She used dictionaries written by non-native Zunian speakers rather than consulting with native Zuni speakers who have established their own method of writing the language which is arguably the truest representation of how words should be spelled. By consulting with native Zuni speakers and native Japanese speakers, her theory may have been dispelled. In spite of these observations, the book is recommended to anyone who wants to learn about similarities between the Japanese and the Zuni peoples.

University of Kansas

Monica Tsethlikai

What is Indigenous Knowledge? Voices from the Academy. Ladislaus M. Semali and Joe L. Kincheloe, editors. (New York: Falmer Press, 1999. xvi, 381 p.; 23 cm., notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 0815334524, \$29.95 paper)

The past forty years have seen a plethora of postcolonial challenges to the Western academic canon. The majority of these books have been indictments of the cultural character of formal Western knowledge systems (i.e., science) and have tended to idealize non-Western knowledge systems without offering substantive descriptions, analyses, or cogent arguments for the relevance of such ways of knowing in a global context. In *What is Indigenous Knowledge?* editors Ladislaus Semali and Joe Kincheloe seek to provide answers to the critical question in the title while explicating the benefits of a true synthesis of Indigenous and Western ways of knowing in a mainstream pedagogical setting.

The overall tone of this book is tactfully idealistic, providing a dialogue to facilitate ongoing efforts to create a “transformative science” that entails “an approach to knowledge production that synthesizes ways of knowing expressed by the metonymies of hand, brain, and heart” (45). Accordingly, the contributors to this volume engage in a substantive and critical comparison of Indig-

enous and Western knowledge systems, noting that knowledge is primarily *culturally-based*. The editors set the pace with a concise historical critique of the cultural biases inherent in Western knowledge, suggesting that *scientific* claims of universality can be more limiting than enlightening. Other essays provide detailed descriptions of knowledge systems that differ profoundly from the Western “norm.” R. Sambuli Mosha, for example, offers an intriguing case study of the holistic nature of education among the Chagga people of Tanzania. Mosha notes that, rather than confining education to a strictly “intellectual” category (a reflection of Western dualism), the Chagga view education as something that must incorporate all aspects—spiritual, ethical, physical, etc.—of human life.

One of the most important aspects of this book is its emphasis on the significance of *context* in the cultural production and understanding of knowledge. Clemente Abrokwa, for instance, provides a comparative study of music education in several indigenous African societies. He illustrates that in these cases a full understanding of the meanings encoded in such music forms requires an intimacy with the cultural and historical context in which they are produced. Other authors present comparative critiques of the tension between Indigenous, *context specific* ways of knowing and Western assertions of *context-independent* knowledge. June M. George makes this point in discussing the difficulties of integrating indigenous knowledge into mainstream school curricula, noting more problems than solutions. Likewise, Marcel Viergever makes the compelling point that Western efforts to “preserve” Indigenous knowledge often does more harm than good, as the act of archiving this “data” only serves to separate such knowledge from its cultural context.

This book is less successful in suggesting ways in which Western and Indigenous knowledge can coexist in a complementary way, especially in a pedagogical setting. Ann Parish’s analysis of the manner in which farmers of Egypt’s El Bahkta Oasis balanced potentially environmentally destructive agricultural techniques introduced through Western agents by reviving Indigenous post-harvesting techniques exemplifies a situation where Western and Indigenous epistemological systems struck a comfortable medium almost by accident. The book would have been much enhanced by articles such as this. Moreover, the excessive criticism of the cultural underpinnings of Western knowledge obscures the ethnocentricities inherent in *all* cultures. Nonetheless, the provocative dialogue in this book promises to appeal to a wide audience including anthropologists, linguists, and proponents of Fourth World Politics. It warrants recognition as an important contribution to efforts to decolonize the academic canon.

The Animals Came Dancing: Native American Sacred Ecology and Animal Kinship, Howard L. Harrod. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2000. xxv, 170 p.: maps; 24cm. ISBN 0816520275, \$17.95 paper)

In *The Animals Came Dancing*, Harrod proposes the need for a shift in the Euro-Americans' view of their place, in regards to the physical and metaphysical worlds. Harrod asserts that by studying the Northern Plains hunting people who lived between 1750 and 1850, the people of Euro-American descent should shift their belief from one of dominance (a view that dates back to the Christian Theory of Creationism where man was given dominion over the animals), to view life as a web of interdependency. Harrod asserts that a shift in thinking will allow the preservation of North American plant and animal life, in both their domestic and "wild" states, for the twenty-first century. Harrod believes that Euro-Americans, for the most part, do not acknowledge the millions of animals that are killed daily to feed and clothe them. He suggests that the growing distance between agriculture and the general public causes individuals to take for granted that food will always be available. The current Euro-Americans are so entrenched in this belief of superiority that they have little use for those who do not serve them as expected. Euro-Americans believe that those who do not serve are not to be tolerated, but eliminated or discarded to suit their insatiable needs.

The book is divided into six chapters. Chapter one explains the geography, the climate, and the tribes that Harrod is going to use to present the need for change. Harrod also acknowledges the sources that he used to compile a view of the beliefs and life style of the Northern Plains hunters. Most came from the "memories of Native American people that were recorded by anthropologists, fur traders, missionaries and other non-Indian observers" (7). Harrod acknowledges that even though the records are "flawed by the interests and perspectives of the observers, they are still invaluable sources for invoking a sense of everyday life" (7). Chapter two describes the different creation beliefs of the Northern Plains Tribes, how their belief that man exists at the same level as animals and plants, each being interdependent upon one another. The creation of the world required the cooperation of plants, animals, spiritual entities and man. Chapter three explores the kinship relations that the tribes have with plant, animal, and spiritual beings. These relationships have to be treated with respect or the kinship ties could be broken, leaving the people to suffer.

Chapter four tells of the rituals for maintaining a positive relationship to the spiritual, animal and plant environments. Chapter five describes the renewal of life through ceremonies (primarily the Sun Dance), in which the Plains Nations sought to renew their environment, especially the Buffalo, which was a main source of food, clothing, shelter and tools. In Chapter six, Harrod pulls the information together to support his view that current Euro-Americans need to shift their belief system to one that is aware of the web of interdependency of all life and the need to protect and cultivate our relationship to the earth. In this

way we all conserve the natural world for the twenty-first century.

Harrod gives good reasons to support a shift in the present Euro-American mind set. However, some of the sources that Harrod used for his descriptions of the tribes. By his account, many of these are highly suspect. Soldiers and missionaries are going to be hard pressed to be non-biased in their interpretation. Their ethnocentric interpretation may account for some of the descriptions of sexuality that were included in the book. The relevancy of their inclusion was suspect as they appeared to be included to attract readers, rather than help the reader realize Harrod's goal for a shift in the present Euro-American belief system to preserve plants and animals in their domesticated and wild state for the twenty-first century.

University of Kansas

Marta Henshaw

The Trickster Shift: Humor and Irony in Contemporary Native Art, Allan J. Ryan. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1999. xv, 303 p.: ill.; 29 cm. ISBN 0295978163, \$60 cloth)

Over the past 30 years, this reviewer had occasion to be in art galleries throughout the United States and in Europe. During these visits, viewers made outraged assumptions as one person commented that "Indians should stick to traditional painting like C.M. Russell did." First, Charlie Russell was not an American Indian; however, his nineteenth-century paintings of Plains cultures have come to represent "Indian lifestyles." Second, the person making the aforementioned comment, was, at the time, viewing a modern version of Lakota ledger art, painted by a Lakota. Lakota ledger art is a very traditional art form for Lakotas.

Such is the kind of irony found in *The Trickster Shift*. Or, as Allan J. Ryan put it, the general public "sees Native art as mystical and legend bound" and refuses to see it as "the active spirit of the traditional Native trickster" (3). A portion of the artwork in this book represents a variety of social and political issues Indigenous peoples face. There are powerful pieces, such as Gerald McMaster's "Shaman," in which a medicine man explains the theory of transformation to cowboys, thus debunking the dumb-antagonist-Indian, Hollywood stereotyping of Indigenous peoples.

Other impressive examples abound. Jim Logan confronts the damage done by the advertising industry that equated beauty with thin, blonde women in "Venus Myth." As part of the painting, Logan wrote, "So powerful is beauty that my sister wishes she was white and my sons won't look at their own..." (81). Lawrence Paul Yuxweluptun uses striking colors and surrealist versions of traditional images to drive home the impact of the destruction of the environ-

ment in "Hole in the Sky" and "Throwing Their Culture Away." Ron Noganosh relies on a three-dimensional approach in "Will the Turtle Be Unbroken?" Noganosh describes the sculpture as, "That's one hell of a bleak statement on the world. The Ojibway legend of creation is that the world is built on the back of a turtle. That's a turtle shell there [which rests on a model of the Starship Enterprise in the sculpture]. The Earth is moving through space...on the back of a turtle. These are rainforests burning [on the globe of the world that sits on the turtle shell], there's oil slicks on it, half the God-damned world is turning into a desert!" (269).

Other works of art contained in this book help to dispel one of the myths about Indigenous peoples: that we don't have a sense of humor. Bill Powless' "Tourists" and Jim Logan's "It's a Kodak Moment," turn the tables and put the camera in Indigenous hands, and in Logan's drawing the Native is photographing whites as they dance. Shelley Niro does an Indigenous satire of the classic Marilyn Monroe in her "500 Year Itch." Ryan includes interviews with the artists, speaking about their work, their lives, and their inspirations. He also critiques the works from a scholar's point of view. Overall, the book offers a potent mixture of Native voices and worldviews.

Ryan lectures frequently on anthropology, art history, and First Nations Studies, and has also worked as a graphic designer, singer/songwriter, and television satirist. He holds a Ph. D. in Anthropology from the University of British Columbia. Ryan organized a workshop on Native American cartooning in Tempe, Arizona, in 1998, and is currently researching the work of Native American cartoonists.

University of Kansas

Sierra Adare

Possessions: Indigenous Art/Colonial Culture, Nicholas Thomas. (New York: Thames and Hudson, 1999. 304 p.: ill.; 24 cm. ISBN 0500280975, \$24.95 paper)

In *Possessions*, Nicholas Thomas offers an exciting and engaging account of the multiple, uneven, and often insecure exchanges wedding Indigenous and colonial art in Australia and New Zealand. He presents a critical, cross-cultural art history informed by and extending the works of James Clifford, Ruth B. Phillips, Deborah Poole, and W. Jackson Rushing III. His study displays depth and breadth: discussions of figures like Colin McCahon, Eugene von Guérard, Margaret Preston, Gordon Bennett, Chane Cotton, and Judy Watson illustrate adept interpretations of landscape painting, the shifting uses and understanding of Indigenous cultures, the incorporation of Indigenous motifs, the celebration of traditional art forms, the crystallization of anti-colonial projects, and the contributions of recent immigrants. Throughout, he produces a clearly written, well

researched, and lavishly illustrated text, noteworthy for its sophistication and approachability.

Through close readings of two instances of settler colonialism, he complicates ongoing discussions of colonialism, cultural politics, and social identity. His interest in the ambivalent and unequal interactions between Indigenes and settlers turns attention away from more conventional concerns with Europe, exploitation, and abstract ideologies and directs it toward the culturally grounded force fields shaping the efforts of Europeans, Aborigines, Maori, and later immigrants to make claims, stage self, and imagine community in and through Indigenous art. The care and nuance with which he interprets this border zone promotes a dual vision. On the one hand, it promotes a rich understanding of settler-consciousness—the justification of dispossession and the creation of nationality through renderings of place and pioneers, the contradictory desires to exhibit, embrace, and exterminate Indigenous peoples, the guilt, longings, privileges and pleasures associated with (dis)possession; on the other hand, it illuminates the spaces and strategies available to Indigenous peoples—the seduction of stereotypes and the elaboration of anti-colonial imaginaries. Looking both ways, Thomas exposes not only the appropriations, inventions, and insecurities of settlers or the refusals, adaptations, and survivals of Indigenes, but he also highlights the genealogies, transactions, and transgressions knitting together these peoples.

Possessions is a bold book, deserving a broad audience. Indeed, it demands attention outside of art history and beyond Pacific studies. It should be read particularly by academics and activists in the Americas interested in better understanding the dynamics of settler colonialism. And although sophisticated, the questions posed and analyses offered should have great value in advanced undergraduate and graduate courses.

Drake University

C. Richard King

Igniting The Sparkle: An Indigenous Science Education Model, Gregory A. Cajete. (Skyland, NC: Kivaki Press, Inc. 1999. 233 p. Illustrations, appendices, bibliography, ISBN 1882308662, \$24.95 paper)

As a First Nations Studies instructor at the University of Northern British Columbia, I am always looking for ways to increase and improve environment and science curriculum so more Aboriginal students take these courses and succeed in them. The author Gregory Cajete has produced an impressive collection of journal articles, book chapters, and books on topics ranging from Indigenous land-use, education, science, sustainability, and spirituality. Dr. Cajete's (1999) latest book is the continuation of work first established by his thesis, *Science A*

Native American Perspective: A Culturally Based Science Education Curriculum (1986) and his book *Look to the Mountain: An Ecology of Indigenous Education* (1994). In this latest work Cajete (1999:27) once again taps into *Traditional Native American Systems of Education*, "characterized by observation, participation, assimilation and experiential learning rather than by the low-contexted formal instruction characteristic of Euro-American schooling."

For practitioners, students and parents, *Igniting The Sparkle* represents tentative steps into a re/form-ing classroom, with a rejuvenating creative energy. The problem with reviewing this book is that it is in a league all its own. There is a small but excellent body of literature about Aboriginal science education, and this book adds greatly to it. This curriculum should not be confused with cross-cultural science education, but it is suggestive. This book is an important contribution to Indigenous education and it may represent a paradigm shift in the teaching and learning of science. *Igniting The Sparkle* represents a break from the continued colonization, exclusion and assimilation of Native people by the body politic/intellect.

Cajete (1999:26) notes, a "culturally-based approach to science education for Native Americans is a new development in a long and tenuous history of Native American education and reflects an evolution of thought related to self-determination, community education and a renaissance of Native American identity." Many people and questions have been marginalized and alienated by scientific inquiry. The development of Western thought, technology and economies that spawned the industrial revolution and enabled colonization to speed forward, have dimmed the creative fires of other ways of talking about and relating to the world.

In appendix B there are seven syllabi, curriculum that demonstrate a postmodern reflexivity, a strengthening of voice and ideology that relies on the context of traditional Indigenous cultural values to advance a model that can comprehend the significance of diverse values and beliefs in science education. Through this curriculum, science education is reinvigorated despite its overly materialist failures. Culture is conjoined with science through an educational model that responds to and embraces Aboriginal cultural values. The messages in this book are in keeping with the ongoing decolonization of North American Aboriginal traditions.

Cajete challenges the very essence of culture-free science and in doing so he asks, does objective, unbiased science exist? He asserts that scientific inquiry is a creative process like any other creative process such as painting or dance. Inroads to make science relevant to Indigenous students and teachers is possible by bringing culture and spirituality back into science, through its analysis as a creative act. In the construction of Western science, religion and politics were banished; the potency of this act catapulted scientific inquiry well beyond the realm of daily life, out of the shadows of oppressive gods and goddesses, to a rarified intellectual pursuit of man to know the unknown. Eventually, man and nature were also expelled from science. The periods of growth that followed

these separations have long passed and we are ready for rich debate concerning the existence, importance and state of culture and spirituality in scientific inquiry.

While there may not be consensus, most scientists would concede that science was never a discipline free from culture and religion, and some even argue that science curriculum is failing students outside of the mainstream hegemonic white liberal middle class suburbs of North America. We are becoming painfully aware that science, which fails to reflect the local/situated, or the cultural, loses something of the diversity that makes knowledge resilient and robust. Without appropriate consideration of culture and spirituality, science holds no meaning. There are very few books and even fewer scholars addressing the topic of Native American science education; however, Gregory Cajete has made a significant contribution with *Igniting The Sparkle*. When a book such as this one comes along we need to be careful to hold it against a realistic standard.

There are some significant problems with the book. First, the copy editing leaves much to be desired. There are grammatical errors and the text is wrought with mistakes. These are small, but so numerous that it diverts the book's message and purpose. Second, Cajete cites Peat (1994) on page 46 and in the footnote section, but Peat is cited as (1996) in the comprehensive bibliography. The footnote section is a collection of notes for all the chapters in each part of the book; it is difficult to use and the information could have been either contained in the text or, for easier reference, placed as endnotes immediately following each chapter. The bibliography has omitted numerous references. Lastly, there are inconsistencies in the text, indicative of hyperbole that should have been edited out. For example, Cajete argues "holistic learning and education has been an integral part of traditional Native American education and socialization until relatively recent times" (53). Cajete goes on to argue that "specialized training, such as that involved in becoming a medicine man or shaman, a priest or participant in an important tribal society, usually involved the tutor-student relationship. The relationship between the parties might last many years and occurred in either specific and highly formalized situations or very informal generalized situations" (57). The truth is that both forms of instruction and learning occurred in Aboriginal communities in the past and present, and show up in both traditional education and public/private western education. Not to be overly simplistic, but Indigenous education produced both generalists and specialists, and this is true of Western education as well.

Igniting The Sparkle balances practical teaching experience and scholarly theoretical attention to advance Native American science curriculum, and I am encouraged by the book. It demonstrates praxis in the area of Aboriginal student science education, not only as a desired principle, but also as a very real possibility. The book should be of considerable interest to teachers and learners at all educational levels.

Revitalizing Indigenous Languages, Jon Reyhner, Gina Cantoni, Robert N. St. Clair and Evangeline Parsons Yazzie, editors. (Flagstaff: Northern Arizona University Center for Excellence in Education, 1999. 140 pp., ISBN 0967055407, \$10.00)

This multi-authored book is an important resource for scholars and the general public concerned with the future of minority languages in the world. *Revitalizing Indigenous Languages* was published as the proceedings from the Stabilizing Indigenous Languages Symposia and contains a selection of papers presented at the Fifth Annual symposium that took place in 1998.

The volume starts with a poem by Richard Littlebear, which, expresses both pessimism and optimism, the general feelings found in the book. In the introduction, Jon Reyhner suggests a series of actions directed towards the revitalization of endangered languages based on the works presented at the previous symposia, including the papers in this book. Reyhner proposes different activities for each of the eight stages of language loss outlined by Fishman (1991).

The other 15 papers included in this volume are organized in four categories: "Obstacles and Opportunities for Language Revitalization," "Language Revitalization Efforts and Approaches," "The Role of Writing in Language Revitalization," and "Using Technology in Language Revitalization." Although literacy, mostly through school, is one of the main strategies suggested for language revitalization, there are evidences presented which show that reversing language shift efforts developed solely within the school context do not succeed (23). As mentioned before that pessimism and optimism are reflected throughout the volume. Among the pessimistic comments are those concerning the reduced numbers of native speakers who still use the language, the lack of trained teachers, and insufficient materials for reversal language shift purposes. On the other hand, renewed efforts are also presented: printed materials, videotapes, internet resources, computer programs for language learning, and the use of the native language in the media are some of the materials that are currently being developed as part of the efforts directed toward the preservation of Indigenous languages.

Rather than a theoretical discussion on language shift and revitalization, the book offers a rich series of organized efforts directed toward the preservation of Indigenous languages undergoing shift. Probably the strongest aspect of this book is that it not only presents a variety of methods with revitalizing purposes, but there also is a diversity of advocates of reversal language shift represented by the contributors to the book. The papers included are written by both insiders and outsiders of the communities whose languages are undergoing shift, and this aspect shows the reader the complexity of initiating a program directed to the revitalization of endangered Indigenous languages.

A New Order of Things: Property, Power, and the Transformation of the Creek Indians, 1733-1816, Claudio Saunt. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999. xiv, 298 p.: ill, maps, index. ISBN 052166943X, \$17.95 paper).

In twelve chapters organized into four sections, Claudio Saunt chronicles the impact of the expanding European-American presence on the economic and political system of the Creeks. The author focuses on the rift that developed within Creek society between full-blood Creeks and mestizos (Creek mixed-bloods). According to Saunt, this rift occurred as mestizos accumulated property and created a new political order based on centralized authority and coercion. This violated Creek concepts of a community-shared subsistence and a government built on consensus, and eventually caused intra-societal conflict.

Saunt does an excellent job of documenting the mestizo acceptance of the European-American economic system, and how this caused mestizos to alter the Creek political reality in an effort to protect their accumulated wealth. Specifically, his focuses on Alexander McGillivray's self-aggrandizing role in this process, the shifting position of African Americans in Creek territory, and the alteration in gender roles among mestizos demonstrate solid research and an excellent grasp of the mestizo point of view. Unfortunately, Saunt too often uses the minority mestizo perspective as representing that of the whole Creek nation. As a result, he does not provide a truly Indigenous, Creek understanding of historical events.

Saunt's inability to provide the "traditional" Creeks' position in these events derives from his rejection of the ethnohistoric method. Specifically, Saunt claims that "[t]he language of anthropology" promotes a synchronic analysis of Creek history, and therefore, his historical assessment of the Creeks must be limited to the decades in question without reference to previous existing conditions (83-84). As a result, he confines his sources to written accounts by Spaniards, Britains, Anglo-Americans, and mestizos. In taking this approach, he cannot reconstruct the majority Creek interpretation of the historical circumstances in question. In the end, the narrative focuses on Indian-white relations, and more specifically, it discusses mestizo-Creek relations in terms of a European-American worldview. For example, Saunt discusses "power" in the European-American, political sense of the term rather than with the traditional Creek concept that includes both physical and metaphysical aspects. Thus, he omits the traditional Creeks' side of the story.

Despite its limitations, Claudio Saunt's monograph significantly expands our current understanding of the intricate intra- and inter-group relationships that developed in the Deep South of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Specifically, he adds to Creek related historiography by extensively using Spanish as well as traditional British, American, and Creek mestizo sources to examine the Creek mestizo perspective of and influence upon the events of this time period. Because it is well documented and succinctly argued, scholars will find this book useful and enlightening, and the general public will enjoy its fluid

and uncomplicated narrative. This study will prove to be a valuable addition to the field in the manner of David Corkran's *The Creek Frontier* (1962) and Kathleen E. Holland Braund's *Deerskins and Duffels* (1993).

University of Kansas
Haskell Indian Nations University

Dixie Ray Haggard

Searching for the Bright Path: The Mississippi Choctaws From Prehistory to Removal, James Taylor Carson. (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1999. xvi, 183 p.: ill., map; 24 cm. ISBN 0803215037, \$45.00 cloth)

In this theoretically insightful monograph, James Taylor Carson follows the Choctaw people from the prehistoric Mississippian past until the removal crisis of the 1820s. The Choctaws, he contends, faced a series of decisions in the centuries following European contact that forced them to choose how best to adhere to their Choctaw culture and follow "the straight bright path." As much as Choctaws debated the proper path, they acted within a shared cultural system that was characterized by a chiefly political organization, a gendered division of labor, matrilineal kinship networks, and a cosmological sense of the sacred order. On the eve of forced removal, the Choctaws may have "governed themselves, fed themselves, and thought of themselves and their place in the world" in new ways, but they continued to adhere to a Choctaw moral code that determined what was "proper and true" (7).

Like previous scholars of southeastern Indian societies, Carson inevitably confronts the issue of factionalism. Unlike most scholars, Carson does not attach racial categories to these divisions. Carson eschews the traditional dichotomy between traditional full-bloods and acculturated half-breeds and opts instead to use the terms "primordialists" and "cosmopolitans." The first group supported innovation that was consistent with older customs, while the other group was "much more influenced by Anglo-American patterns of action and behavior" (88). Interaction with Euro-American society shaped this factionalism, but Carson effectively shows how the eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century divisions began as Mississippian-era kinship networks and long-standing moieties.

By focusing on the shared desire to follow the bright path, Carson stresses, "neither group abandoned the Mississippian values that course through their culture" (88). Although cosmopolitans wanted to incorporate constitutional government, nationalism, and Christianity into their worldview, Carson rejects the idea that cosmopolitans wanted to become Americans. Instead, they pursued various innovations in an attempt to protect their independence and satisfy their Great Father *Aba*. Even the acceptance of Protestant Christianity had Choctaw roots. As Choctaw Robert Folsom explained, he decided to "embrace the Gospel, and walk in the straight and bright path" (106). Similarly, Choctaws

welcomed mission schools while simultaneously rejecting the missionaries' insistence that boys become farmers. They accepted the commercial opportunities that accompanied the schools but they would not tolerate assaults on their gender norms.

Carson's careful use of Anthony Giddens' structuration theory results in a narrative that accounts for dramatic individual choices as well as the invisible structural changes of the long duration. The result is an engaging ethnohistorical study that explains how, after generations of difficult decisions and a multitude of surface changes, the Choctaws "remained at heart Choctaw" (132).

California State University—Los Angeles

Andrew Frank

Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples, Linda Tuhiwai Smith. (London: Zed Books Ltd, 1999. ix, 208 p.; ill.; 23 cm. ISBN 1856496244, \$25.00 paper)

Indigenous researchers may find Smith's work, which could be a possible articulation of their experiences, to be of interest. As a result of this work, non-Indigenous researchers may discover how their work can impact the Indigenous people they choose to study. Smith begins the first half of her book by recounting the history of Western research and its perception by Indigenous peoples and also through the eyes of an Indigenous researcher. Once Smith has detailed mainstream approaches to research using Indigenous participants, she conveys her experiences as an Indigenous researcher who conducts research with her own people and community. The contrast she draws between the "insider" versus "outsider" perspectives concerning research of Indigenous peoples, offers a rare and intriguing dialogue on the research act.

Smith juxtaposes Western research intentions with Indigenous ones. She explains the significance of the goals of self-determination, decolonization and social justice as being primary to Indigenous research. Other Indigenous researchers share these motivations creating a common thread within Indigenous research methodology. Smith conversely depicts the research paradigm of the Western scholar as one built upon imperialist notions which continue the domination of Indigenous peoples within their homelands. Seen from an Indigenous insider's view, the Western scholar is a participant in supporting hegemonic structures of mainstream institutions.

Smith's case study of Maori-initiated research in New Zealand adds significant new information. Smith includes information on the primary focus, methodology and underlying philosophy of Maori research in which she and her husband engage. She gives the reader a rare insight into the ways Indigenous research methodology can and must differ from those derived from Western

methods and motivations.

Smith also allows the reader to learn about Kaupapa Maori, a research methodology centered in Maori philosophy, culture and the autonomy of Maori participants. One of the primary goals of this research methodology is that any research conducted must be of some positive benefit to the Maori themselves in order to proceed. This unique approach reorients research from that of the researcher's agenda to the needs of the Indigenous participants. Kaupapa Maori research deconstructs the research process using Maori epistemology.

Smith's twenty-five research projects demonstrate the common themes Indigenous peoples will recognize within their research efforts and how they conduct research within their own locales. The reader will pick up an indication of the nature of Indigenous research versus Western research when reading these descriptions as they question the motivations of these research projects versus those of the Western researcher. That Indigenous research projects are clearly action-based and self-determined towards autonomy is revealing and at times unlike the research of the non-Indigenous researcher. Those who wish to explore a previously neglected aspect of Indigenous research will benefit by reading this monograph.

Saskatchewan Indian Federated College

Cathy Wheaton

The Rapid City Indian School, 1898-1933, Scott Riney. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1999. x, 278 p.: ill., maps; 23 cm. ISBN 0806131624, \$29.95 cloth)

Scott Riney's recent addition to the boarding school literature has much to recommend it. Organizing his study thematically (as opposed to chronologically), Riney examines various elements of the Rapid City Indian School (RCIS): the recruitment of students; the provision of Indian children; curricula; the school's seasonal operation; discipline, punishment, and violence; employees; and the RCIS's function as a federal resource center for off-reservation tribal members. Drawing on the scholarship of David Wallace Adams, Brenda Child, and K. Tsianina Lomawaima, Riney concludes that – for Indian students during the life of the school – there were “many roads to Rapid,” as children attended for numerous reasons: coercion by reservation agents and police, family poverty and the inability of parents to adequately provide for their families, perceived opportunity, etc. In a particularly enlightening analysis that seeks to recall the agency of parents in influencing the circumstances of their children's education, the author demonstrates the manner in which interschool competition for Indian students allowed families to negotiate better conditions for their heavily-recruited children.

Drawing on extensive archival research, the text's richness of detail undoubtedly renders it an important contribution to the extant scholarship. Nevertheless, several minor problems remain. First, in providing such a broad overview of the RCIS as an institution, the text lacks an engaging narrative progression, which will unfortunately limit its readership and likely prevent it from becoming a popular addition to college syllabi. The study lacks, for instance, the intimacy of Child's *Boarding School Seasons*, which was published at the same time, as well as the methodological originality of Lomawaima's *They Called It Prairie Light*. Greater use of oral histories would have enlivened the text.

Second, in introducing his subject, Riney, echoing Clausewitz, observes, "in a ... sense" the school "was a way [for the government] to continue a conflict by other means" (4). "[T]he government began," he writes, "a concerted effort to settle the 'Indian problem' once and for all by destroying American Indian tribes and tribal cultures. The focal point of conflict, as always, was land" (4-5). While this suggests a promising contextualization for the analysis of the RCIS that follows, the remainder of the text largely neglects this critical framework. The chapters following the introduction fail to develop the imperialistic intentions articulated earlier. By the end of the book, what initially promised to be a critical formulation of the role of boarding schools – and the RCIS in particular – in the consolidation of American Empire devolves into a largely provincial examination of a single institution.

The Rapid City Indian School is not without its shortcomings. Nonetheless, in his effort to provide a fuller picture of the school's influence in the lives of Indian people – most recruited from reservations in the northern Great Plains – Scott Riney has written a thoroughly researched and comprehensive overview of the operation of the RCIS and the role it played for decades in shaping the lives of its students and staff.

University of Minnesota

Scott Laderman

Indians in the Making: Ethnic Relations and Indian Identities around Puget Sound, Alexandra Harmon. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1998. xii, 393 p.; 24 cm., illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 0520226852, \$19.95 paper)

As "identity" has become a central and contested concept in legal, cultural and political spheres, particularly for Indigenous peoples, Harmon's award-winning book about the shifting terrain of Indian identities in the Puget Sound area is a welcome addition both to the history of Northwest Coast peoples and American Indian studies in general.

Harmon, a former attorney, begins her account with a brief discussion of a 1980 legal dispute involving the reservation boundary of the Suquamish Tribe and whether or not there was historical continuity between the modern incarna-

tion of the tribe and the original one who signed an 1865 treaty. Despite its legal resolution by matter of precedent, this case raised significant questions about the historical continuity between the modern tribe and the original one. It is from this point that Harmon begins, contending that “a history of Indians like the Suquamish could and should be a chronicle of change over time in Indianness itself” (3).

Her thorough, detailed analysis, lucidly written with comprehensive notes, serves as both a solid introduction to the history of indigenous peoples in Western Washington as well as a nuanced examination of the shifting and often contradictory “demarcations” of the term “Indian” through time in response to various political, economic and demographic factors. From the first contacts between Northwest Indigenous peoples and Europeans (“King George men”) to late twentieth-century encounters over treaty fishing rights, Harmon examines the complex and mutable legal and intercultural negotiations between groups of people living in Western Washington and how these negotiations affected “people’s self-concepts and self-presentations” (11). More specifically, she discusses attempts by colonial officials, governments and courts, and others, to delineate discrete boundaries between Indians and non-Indians as well as between groups of Indians themselves. Her careful probing of historical evidence demonstrates the porousness of these boundaries and challenges conventional thinking about categories like “Indian” and “tribe” as a priori and static.

One of those rare books that is suitable for experts and lay readers alike, *Indians in the Making* contests the notion of “an ahistorical concept of identity” derived from “an unshakable core of tradition” (248). Harmon is successful in her attempt to “combat the pernicious and all-too-prevalent assumption that change erodes Indian identity,” an issue whose importance extends beyond the context of Western Washington (249). Although her topic is broad in scope, Harmon is able to weave an intricate narrative of change around Puget Sound over the last 150 years, demonstrating the centrality of questions of “Indianness” in the history of the area.