Embracing Death and the Afterlife: Sculptures of Enma and His Entourage at Rokuharamitsuji

By © 2018 Ye-Gee Kwon

Submitted to the graduate degree program in Art History and the Graduate Faculty of the University of Kansas in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Chair: Sherry D. Fowler
Amy E. McNair
Maya Stiller
Maki Kaneko
Kyoim Yun

Date Defended: 5 October 2018

The dissertation committee for Ye-Gee Kwon certifies that this is the approved version of the following dissertation:

		Embra	cing De	ath and th	e Aft	erlife:	
Sculpt	ures of	Enma a	and His	Entourag	e at R	Cokuhara	amitsuji

Chair: Sherry D. Fowler

Date Approved: 5 October 2018

Abstract

This dissertation investigates a sculptural group of Enma and his entourage that was once enshrined in an Enma hall located within the Kyoto temple Rokuharamitsuji precinct, and hopes to highlight the role that significant yet understudied sculptures played in the development of the cult of Enma and the Ten Kings in premodern Japan. Rokuharamitsuji is of great importance to study the cult of Enma and the Ten Kings not only for its rare early sculptures of Enma and his two assistants created in the thirteenth century when the cult began to flourish in Japan, but also for the later addition of a seventeenth-century Datsueba sculpture, which reveals the evolution of the cult through its incorporation of Japanese popular belief. This study examines how the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group presented images of hell within a designated space and conveyed messages of salvation to their beholders, responding to the environs of the salvation-oriented temple. It demonstrates that historical, geographical, and cultural attributes of the temple's surrounding area, namely Rokuhara (a field of skulls), strengthened the belief in Enma and the Ten Kings and contextualized the cult in combination with another belief in Datsueba.

Acknowledgments

This work would not have been possible without the endless support and guidance that I received from many people. I would first like to extend my sincere gratitude to my adviser, Sherry Fowler, for her unfailing encouragement and for the tremendous support that she provided throughout my doctoral studies. Her invaluable guidance also helped me in all my research and in the writing of this dissertation. In addition to my advisor, I would like to thank my dissertation committee members, Amy McNair, Maki Kaneko, Maya Stiller, and Kyoim Yun, who offered constructive comments and encouragement.

My gratitude is also extended to the faculty and staff in the Art History Department at the University of Kansas. In particular, Marsha Haufler provided insightful suggestions for my dissertation proposal. Karen Brichoux, Lisa Cloar, Lauren Chaney, and the late Maud Humphrey kindly assisted me with the logistics of the Ph.D. program.

I am also very grateful to all the colleagues and friends I met in Lawrence. I especially thank Andi Back, Yen-yi Chan, Janet Chen, Jennifer Friess, Jiyeon Kim, Annie Kroshus, Sopheap Ky, Sangnam Lee, Samantha Lyons, Sooa Im McCormick, Laura Minton, Eunyoung Park, Ellen Raimond, Rachel Voorhies, Myeonghee Son, Weitian Yan, and Pinyan Zhu. They nurtured my academic and personal life in Lawrence, providing me with love and support. My heartfelt appreciation goes to my friends and former bosses, Kris Ercums and Mark Olson, who gave me valuable input and endless support.

Finally, I am indebted to my loving family and friends in Korea. Most of all, my deep gratitude goes to my parents, to whom this dissertation is dedicated. They have inspired and encouraged me to move forward with my dreams. Mom and Dad, thank you so much for your unconditional love!

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Chapter One	
Building a Legacy of Ten Kings	12
Chapter Two	
Embracing Death and Afterlife in Rokuhara	41
Chapter Three	
Activating the Rokuharamitsuji Sculptural Program of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku	76
Chapter Four	
The Power of Datsueba at Rokuharamitsuji	115
Epilogue	151
Bibliography	156

Introduction

In East Asian Buddhism fate is determined after death by Enma 閻魔¹ (Skt. Yama; Ch. Yanluo; Kr. Yeomla), commonly known as the ruler of hell, and nine other kings. Collectively, they are known as the Ten Kings of Hell.² In the dark region beyond death, the deceased travels through a succession of ten courts, each presided over by one of the kings. The cult of the Ten Kings was introduced to Japan from China in the tenth century. By the thirteenth century, the Ten Kings cult had become so firmly associated with the imaginations of hell that the cult turned into one of the most popular beliefs in Japan. From the thirteenth century on many images of Enma and the other kings were created in Japan in both painted and sculpted form. Numerous sculptures of Enma and his associates were installed in halls explicitly designated as Enmadō 閻魔堂 (Hall of Enma) or Jūōdō 十王堂 (Hall of Ten Kings) inside temple precincts or in proximity to temples in order to be worshiped as the emblems of the underworld in a defined space.

Such popularity and familiarity of Enma and Ten Kings imageries attest how deeply their worship was integrated into the spiritual lives of the Japanese populace. Nevertheless, I find that their sculptures have received rather little scholarly attention in the field of East Asian art history. Those produced after the fourteenth century, in particular, have been ignored by scholars presumably because they became ubiquitous. As an attempt to fill this void, the present study will reclaim the significant roles of Enma and his entourage sculptures in the history of the Ten Kings cult and within the wider context of East Asian Buddhist art by using the sculptures of

-

¹ Enma is also written as Enra 閻羅 or Enmadaiō 閻魔大王.

 $^{^2}$ Most English sources commonly but inaccurately call Enma and the nine kings the Kings of Hell. In fact, the Chinese names of Enma 閻魔 and Ten Kings $+\Xi$ do not literally refer to hell 地獄, which denotes underground prisons, purgatory, the underworld, or the afterlife. Moreover, the exact whereabouts of Enma's court is ambiguous. In this dissertation, I will refer them as the Ten Kings of the underworld.

Enma and his associates once enshrined in an Enma hall located within the Kyoto temple Rokuharamitsuji 六波羅蜜寺 precinct as a case study. This dissertation specifically investigates how those sculptures were venerated in premodern Japan and how they contributed to enriching the long-lasting Buddhist tradition of focusing on death and the afterlife that catered to the temple and the area. I argue that the sculptural configuration of the Rokuharamitsuji group formed over the late thirteenth and early seventeenth centuries attests to the evolution and localization in Japan of the once foreign faith in Enma and Ten Kings.

Why Rokuharamitsuji?

Rokuharamitsuji was salvation-oriented from its beginning and became a highly significant temple in Japanese Buddhist art history. It was founded by Kūya 空也 (903–972), a major proponent of Pure Land Buddhism 浄土仏教 (jōdo bukkyō), one of the most widely practiced traditions of Buddhism in Japan. Pure Land Buddhism focuses on the attainment of salvation and the entry into the Pure Land of Amida Buddha after death. Kūya was famous for spreading this faith in Amida Buddha among the common people by repeatedly chanting the six-syllable prayer nenbutsu 念仏 (南無阿弥陀仏, na-mu-a-mi-da-butsu) to Amida Buddha while dancing and beating a gong as he roamed the streets of Kyoto. In the year 951, a terrible plague occurred in Kyoto, and Kūya requested imperial permission to found a temple in the district called Rokuhara 六波羅 (a field of skulls) in order to pray for the souls who died in the plague. Since the eighth century when the capital (Kyoto) was built on the western side of the Kamo River, Rokuhara on the east side has been known as "the land of the dead" due to its proximity to a graveyard called Toribeno 鳥辺野.

Rokuharamitsuji is of great importance in the study of the cult of Enma and the Ten Kings in Japan not only for its outstanding sculptures of Enma and his associates, but also for its set of paintings depicting the Ten Kings. The Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group, composed of a large Enma and his two smaller scale assistant officials, Shiroku 司禄 (Officer of Records) and Shimei 司命 (Officer of Life Spans), is a rare early example from the thirteenth century, the time when the cult of Enma and the Ten Kings began to flourish in Japan.³ In 2008, a set of ten purportedly thirteenth-century hanging scrolls showing each of the Ten Kings judging the dead and bearing a signature of the renowned Chinese Buddhist painter Lu Xinzhong 陸信忠 (late twelfth–early thirteenth century) was discovered in the temple storehouse.⁴ Few temples in Japan have sculptures of Enma and his associates as well as Chinese paintings of the Ten Kings.

The sculptural group at Rokuharamitsuji also reveals the development of the Enma and the Ten Kings cult through the incorporation of Japanese popular belief. In 1629, the Enma triad was expanded with the addition of a sculpture of Datsueba 奪衣婆, an old hag who snatches away the clothes of the dead, by the well-respected Buddhist sculptor Kōyū 康猶 (active 1602–31), who made the sculpture in memory of his deceased daughter. The later addition of Datsueba, who was popular in Japanese folklore, transformed the cultural landscape of Rokuharamitsuji by conflating the existing cult of Enma with the cult of Datsueba, who became a protector of women and children. Although all these sculptures are currently placed in the Treasure Hall of the temple, they were formerly enshrined in an Enma hall that was destroyed and rebuilt.

³ According to Asami Ryūsuke, the thirteenth-century Shimei sculpture seems to have been replaced by a new one when the Datsueba sculpture was added. See Asami Ryūsuke, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō" [Investigation report: Buddhist sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji], *MUSEUM* 620 (June 2009): 20.

⁴ I am grateful to Professor Sherry Fowler for sharing her photos of these paintings.

⁵ The bottom of the sculpture bears an inscription, which indicates its creator, date, and for whom it was made.

The present study will closely investigate Rokuharamitsuji and its Enma Hall sculptures, integrating art historical, historical, and Buddhological approaches, to illuminate how patrons and believers worshipped the sculptures from the thirteenth to seventeenth centuries and how the sculptures helped shape the cultural identity of the temple and the area. My methods will include iconographical analysis of the sculptures, study of the history of the objects, the temple, and the physical context, including the environs, and examination of patronage and ritual context through Buddhist scriptures, temple records, inscriptions, and gazetteers in order to provide a scholarly understanding of how the Enma cult evolved within Rokuharamitsuji and its surrounding sacred area of Rokuhara.

Previous Scholarship and Significance

Most previous studies on the images of Enma and the Ten Kings have focused on sets of hanging scrolls depicting the Ten Kings and an iconographical readings of those paintings.⁶ As

⁶ Many Japanese scholars also paid attention to the illustrated versions of the early-tenth-century sutra Foshuo yanluowang shouji sizhong yuxiu shengqi wangsheng jingtu jing 仏説閻羅王授記四衆預(逆)修生七往生浄土経 (The sutra spoken by the Buddha to the four orders on the prophecy given to King Yama concerning the sevens of life [rituals] to be practiced preparatory to rebirth in the Pure Land), namely Shiwang jing 十王經 (Jp. Jūō kyō) (Scripture on the Ten Kings). These scholars include Matsumoto Eiichi, Tonkō ga no kenkyū [Research on painting at Dunhuang] (Tokyo: Tōhō Bunka Gakuin, 1937), 368-416; Matsumoto Eiichi, "Tonkōbon Jūō zukan zakkō" [Various studies on the illustrated scrolls of the Ten Kings sutras from Dunhuang], Kokka 621 (1943): 229-30; Tokushi Yūshō and Ogawa Kan'ichi, "Jūō shōshichi kyōsan zukan no kōzō" [The structure of the illustrated scrolls of The sutra and hymns of the Ten Kings and the sevens of Life], in Chūō Ajia Bukkyō bijutsu [The art of Central Asian Buddhism] (Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 1962), 255-96; Miya Tsugio, "Jūō kyō e ni tsuite" [On the illustrations of the Sutra of Ten Kings], Jissen Joshidai bigaku bijutsushi gaku 5 (1990): 81-118; Miya Tsugio, "Jūō kyō e shūi" [Survey of illustrations of the Ten Kings sutra], Jissen Joshidai bigaku bijutsushi gaku 7 (1992): 1-63.

Some scholars see the set of Ten Kings paintings in the Seikadō Bunko Art Museum as having originated in fourteenth-century China. See Miyazaki Noriko, "Seikadō Bunko Bijutsukan zō 'Jūō zu,' 'Nishisha zu' ni tsuite" [On the Ten Kings paintings and two messengers paintings in the Seikadō Bunko Art Museum], in *Mihotoke no osugata Bukkyō no bijutsu* [The looks of Buddhas: Buddhist art] (Tokyo: Seikadō Bunko Bijutsukan, 1999), 22-30. However, in her Ph.D. dissertation, Cheeyun Lilian Kwon argues that the Seikadō paintings were commissioned by the Goryeo court in the twelfth or early thirteenth century and were based on Northern Song models. See Cheeyun Lilian Kwon, "The *Ten Kings* at the Seikadō Library" (PhD diss., Princeton University, 1999); Cheeyun Lilian Kwon, "A Repositioning of a Medieval Painting Monument: The Ten Kings at the Seikadō Library," *Oriental Art* 46:5 (2000): 64-72; Cheeyun Lilian Kwon, "Northern Song Landscape Styles in the Seikadō *Ten Kings of Hell* Paintings," in *Bridges to Heaven: Essays on East Asian Art in Honor of Professor Wen C. Fong* II, ed. Jerome Silbergeld, Dora C. Y. Ching, Judith G. Smith, and Alfreda Murck (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011), 617-630.

one of the earliest publications on this topic, in 1921, Tanaka Toyozō wrote an article on the thirteenth-century and fourteenth-century Chinese Ten Kings paintings by the Ningbo painter Lu Xinzhong that functioned as the primary image source for the Japanese versions of the Ten Kings. Other scholars continued to scrutinize such Ten Kings hanging scrolls produced by artists in the city of Ningbo in China. For instance, Lothar Ledderose as an English-speaking scholar working in Europe conducted pioneering research on the system of the Ningbo workshops that had produced Ten Kings paintings.

A few scholarly works focused on Japanese versions of the Ten Kings paintings. Some scholars discussed the development of Japanese paintings of the Ten Kings, providing canonical references for the study of Ten Kings imagery. Kajitani Ryōji presented a short reference for the history of Ten Kings imagery in Japan, and more thorough, general treatments are found in Nakano Genzō's *Rokudōe no kenkyū* [Research on pictures of the Six Paths of Reincarnation] and Nakano Teruo's "Enma Jūō zō" [Images of Enma and the Ten Kings]. In her English language master's thesis, Watanabe Masako provided a substantial treatment of the overall subject of Ten Kings imagery both in China and Japan.

⁷ Tanaka Toyozō, "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu" [Ten Kings paintings by Lu Xinzhong], *Kokka* 371 (1921).

⁸ See Suzuki Kei, "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu" [Ten Kings paintings by Lu Xinzhong], Kanazawa Bunko kenkyū 136 (1967): 1-5; Kajitani Ryōji, "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu" [Ten Kings paintings by Lu Xinzhong], Kokka 1020 (1979): 22-38; Ebine Toshio, "Kin Shoshi hitsu jūō zu" [Ten Kings paintings by Jin Chushi], Kokka 1097 (1986): 20-22. The Ten Kings scrolls by Ningbo painters have been published in many exhibition catalogues. Among them, the fairly recent catalogue is Seichi Nipō [Sacred Ningbo] published in 2009 by Nara National Museum. See Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, Seichi Nipō: Nippon Bukkyō sen sanbyakunen no genryū [Sacred Ningbo: Gateway to 1300 years of Japanese Buddhism] (Nara: Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2009): 82-93.

⁹ Lothar Ledderose, *Ten Thousand Things: Module and Mass Production in Chinese Art* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), 163-85. Other sources on the Ningbo workshops include Ebinee Toshio, "Ninpō butsuga no kokyō" [Homeland of the Ningbo Buddhist paintings], *Kokka* 1097 (1986): 60-65; Ide Seinosuku, "Nihon no Sō Gen butsuga" [Song and Yuan Buddhist painting in Japan], *Nihon no bijutsu* 418 (2001): entire issue; Yukio Lippit, "Ningbo Buddhist Painting: A Reassessment," *Orientations* (June 2009): 54-62.

¹⁰ Kajitani Ryōji, "Nihon ni okeru jūō zu no seiritsu to tenkai" [The formation and development of pictures of the Ten Kings in Japan], *Bukkyō geijutsu* 97 (July 1974): 84-95; Nakano Genzō, *Rokudōe no kenkyū* [Research on pictures of the Six Paths of Reincarnation] (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1989); Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō" [Images of Enma and the Ten Kings], *Nihon no bijutsu* 313 (June 1992): 51-78.

¹¹ Watanabe Masako, "An Iconographic Study of 'Ten Kings' Paintings" (MA Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1984).

Other scholars wrote intensive studies on particular sets of Japanese Ten Kings paintings. In 1940, Tani Shin'ichi offered his basic research on the Jōfukuji 浄福寺 set of the Ten Kings hanging scrolls painted by Tosa Mitsunobu 土佐光信 (1434–1525) in the late fifteenth century, while nearly two decades later in 1958, Umezu Jirō proposed an interpretation of the relationship between the Jōfukuji set and another set at Nison'in 二尊院, painted about one hundred and fifty years earlier. In 2003, Quitman E. Phillips, in his clearly written and informative article "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," analyzed these two sets, suggesting an alternative interpretation for them. In her essay "Traveling across the Sea," Watanabe Masako further developed her earlier analysis of the Nison'in set discussed in her master's thesis. In her master's the her master's thesis. In her master's thesis. In her master's thesis. In her master's the her master

In comparison to studies on Ten Kings paintings, however, those on sculpture have been rather sporadic. In 1972, Washizuka Hiromitsu wrote an article on the Ten Kings sculptures at En'nōji 円応寺 in Kamakura, in which he focused on stylistic issues. 15 Tanaka Yoshiyasu's essay on the early examples of Enma and the Ten Kings sculptures from 1992 serves as a helpful yet basic survey. 16 Similarly, in his book *Rokudōe no kenkyū*, Nakano Genzō briefly touched on the sculptures of Enma and the Ten Kings in an introductory manner. 17 Moreover, several exhibition catalogues presenting the theme of Enma, Ten Kings, hell, or the underworld

¹² Tani Shin'ichi, "Tosa Mitsunobu kō" [Research on Tosa Mitsunobu], pt. 2, *Bijutsu kenkyū* 103 (July 1940): 11-25; Umezu Jirō, "Niso no Jūō zu: Yukimitsu to Mitsunobu no gaseki" [Two sets of pictures of the Ten Kings: the painting traces of Yukimitsu and Mitsunobu], *Bukkyō geijutsu* 36 (October 1958): 32-35.

Umezu's theory on these two sets and their relationship had been broadly accepted by the Japanese art historical community for over three decades until Nakano Genzō suggested a radical reinterpretation in 1989. See Nakano Genzō, *Rokudōe no kenkyū*, 336.

¹³ Quitman E. Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite: The Jōfukuji Paintings of the Ten Kings," *Ars Orientalis* 33 (2003): 120-145.

¹⁴ Watanabe Masako, "Traveling Across the Sea: Japanese Rakan and the Ten Kings of Hell," in *The Arts of Japan: An International Symposium*, ed. Miyeko Murase and Judith G. Smith (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2000), 31-58.

¹⁵ Washizuka Hiromitsu, "En'nōji no Enma jūō zō ni tsuite" [About Ten Kings sculptures at En'nōji], *Bukkyō geijutsu* 89 (December 1972): 55-65.

¹⁶ Tanaka Yoshiyasu, "Meifu no zuzō no gorei" [Old precedents of the sculptures of underworld], *Nihon no bijutsu* 313 (June 1992): 84-96.

¹⁷ Nakano Genzō, Rokudōe no kenkyū, 140-42.

understanding of the Ten Kings cult. 18 Studies such as those by Caroline Hirasawa and Wakabayashi Haruko that feature paintings do mention sculptures of Enma and the Ten Kings in the course of developing their related topics. 19 In her articles from 2004 and 2005, Abe Mika offers a scholarly discourse on the Enma hall at Daigoji 醍醐寺 that no longer exists through the examination of a document entitled *Enma-ō dō emei* 焰魔王堂絵銘 (Painting Inscriptions of the Enma Hall), which she discovered and transcribed. 20 Building upon Abe's findings and adding ritual components, Miriam Chusid's article has delved into the veneration of King Enma in medieval Japan by focusing on the same Enma hall at Daigoji. 21 However, to determine the larger historical and cultural context of this cult it is important to examine sculptures because they had a more stable presence at their sites than paintings, which were usually stored away and only brought out for specific rituals.

The published works on Rokuharamitsuji have heretofore emphasized its history, its famous founder Kūya, and a few of its other sculptures. For example, scholars have closely

¹⁸ Kawasaki-shi Shimin Myūjiamu, Enma tōjō [Advent of Enma] (Kawasaki-shi: Kawasaki-shi Shimin Myūjiamu, 1989); Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, Tokubetsuten: Jigoku: Oni to Enma no sekai [Special exhibition on Hell: The world of orge and Enma] (Himeji: Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, 1990); Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko, Tematen: Jigoku to jūō ju [Themed exhibition: Hell and Ten Kings paintings] (Yokohama: Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko, 1991); Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, Meikai no sabaki: Enma-sama to jigoku no sekai: Tōkai ni nokoru rokudō shinkō no zōkei [Judgement of the underworld: The world of Enma and hell: Tōkai regoion's arts of the belief in the six paths of reincarnation] (Yokkaichi: Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, 2001).

¹⁹ Caroline Hirasawa, "Hellbent on Heaven: Female Damnation and Salvation in Tateyama Mandalas" (PhD diss., Stanford University, 2005); Caroline Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution: A Primer on Japanese Hell Imagery and Imagination," *Monumenta Nipponica* 63:1 (Spring 2008): 1-50; Caroline Hirasawa, *Hellbent for Heaven in Tateyama Mandara: Painting and Religious Practice at a Japanese Mountain* (Leiden: Brill, 2013); Wakabayashi Haruko, "Officials of the Afterworld: Ono no Takamura and the Ten Kings of Hell in the *Chikurinji engi* Illustrated Scrolls," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 36, no. 2 (2009): 319-49.
²⁰ Abe Mika, "Daigoji Enmadō shiryō sandai" [Three historical materials on Daigoji Enma hall], *Rekishi Minzoku Hakubutsukan kenkyū hōkoku* 109 (2004): 205-23; Abe Mika, "Dajigoku to sosei tan: Daigoji Enmaōdō emei o yomu" [The tale of falling into hell and coming back to life: Reading the Daigoji Enma hall emei], *Setsuwa bungaku kenkyū* 40 (2005): 77-92.

²¹ Miriam Chusid, "Constructing the Afterlife, Re-envisioning Salvation: Enma Halls and Enma Veneration in Medieval Japan," *Archives of Asian Art* 69:1 (Spring 2019): Forthcoming. I would like to thank Professor Fowler for introducing Miriam to me and thank Miriam for kindly sharing her article, which has not come out yet.

examined the temple's tenth-century standing sculpture of the Eleven-Headed Kannon (Skt. Avalokiteśvara); the thirteenth-century sculpture of Kūya chanting; and another thirteenth-century sculpture of a seated Jizō (Skt. Kṣitigarbha), the one made by the renowned sculptor Unkei 運慶 (1151–1223).²² Moreover, in the few publications where the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma and his entourage were introduced, they were only briefly mentioned. It was not until 2009 that an in-depth report on these sculptures was written by Asami Ryūsuke.²³ In 2008, the Tokyo National Museum held an exhibition on the art of Rokuharamitsuji. On this occasion, the displayed Rokuharamitsuji sculptures, including Enma and his associates, were photographed and x-rayed; their shapes, structures, conditions, and inscriptions were also thoroughly examined at the museum. Asami's report addresses the results of this examination. This dissertation relies on the results of that investigation, which provide fundamental and valuable information on the sculptures of Enma and his entourage that was previously unknown.

The present study will employ an interdisciplinary approach by combining an iconographical analysis of the objects with a close reading of textual sources with respect to the temple's history, surrounding area, and ritual practices, while building on earlier scholarship on temple history and related sculpture sets. In particular, I will model my research on Abe Mika's articles and am indebted to Miriam Chusid's article. Abe and Chusid provide in-depth studies on an Enma hall at Daigoji and its arrangement of the sculptures inside a single hall that no longer exists. The present study, however, differs from their works because it focuses on the changes in

²² On the Eleven-Headed Kannon sculpture, see Kobayashi Gō, "Rokuharamitsuji no Jūichimen Kannon zō ni tsuite" [On the Eleven-Headed Kannon image at Rokuharamitsuji], *Kokka* 800 (1958): 396-401. On the Kūya image, see Tanaka Yūko, "Yugyō zō no keifu: Kyoto, Rokuharamitsuji Kūya zō o meguru sōzōryoku" [Lineage of wanderer images: Concerning the imagination of the Kūya image at the Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto], *Mikkyō zuzō* 18 (1999): 110-122. On the seated Jizō sculpture, see Miyake Hisao, "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsuzō to Unkei kenritsu no Jizō jūrinin" [The image of the Jizō bodhisattva at Rokuharamitsuji and the Jizō jūrinin established by Unkei], *Bijutsushi ronshū* 10 (November 2010): 1-15; Uemura Takuya, "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsu zazō ni tsuite: sono zōkei to zōnai nōnyūhin o megutte" [On the seated Jizō image at Rokuharamitsuji: Regarding its development and the sacred objects inside the sculpture], *Bukkyō daigaku shūkyō bunka myūjiamu kenkyū kiyō* 9 (2013): 23-70.
²³ Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 18-21 and 82-96.

the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural program within its Enma hall and its relationship to the temple's unusual surrounding area that is related to death. By doing so, this dissertation will offer a more comprehensive view of the Buddhist narratives concerning death and the afterlife in premodern Japan. In addition, this dissertation will contribute to the existing body of work on the cult of Enma and the Ten Kings by illuminating Rokuharamitsuji's significant but understudied sculptures of Enma and his associates.

Organization of the Dissertation

The first chapter of this dissertation opens with an overview of the origin, history, and nature of the Ten Kings belief in Japan by investigating textual sources and their visual interpretations. In particular, I identify the Ten Kings of the underworld, their courts, and their roles as envisioned by the Japanese populace, based on various works of literature and scripture, including the early tenth-century *Shiwang jing* 十王經 (The Scripture on the Ten Kings) and the twelfth-century *Jizō jūō kyō* 地蔵十王経 (The Sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings). ²⁴ This chapter explicates the way that the descriptions of the Ten Kings in such textual sources detailed the understanding of the underworld bureaucracy. Chapter One also traces the long-lasting and rich tradition of the Ten Kings' visual representations. This endeavor serves as a necessary first step in the study of the development of the Ten Kings cult and ultimately provides a context for the study of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma and his entourage.

Chapter Two situates the sculptural group of Enma and his entourage at Rokuharamitsuji within the history of the Rokuharamitsuji and its surrounding area, namely Rokuhara. I will not only explain Kūya's role in the founding of this temple next to a graveyard, but will also

²⁴ This sutra was invented in Japan, and its full title is *Bussetsu Jizō bosatsu hosshin innen jūō kyō* 仏説地蔵菩薩発心因縁十王経 (The scripture spoken by the Buddha on the causes of Bodhisattva Jizō giving rise to the thought of enlightenment and the Ten Kings).

reconstruct a history of the temple from the thirteenth century to the seventeenth century through temple records, gazetteers, other historical records, literature, and relevant legends. This chapter will also consider potential patrons and worshippers of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures under discussion, in terms of the history and nature of the temple and its surrounding area. Thus, I argue that the temple attracted patrons and clientele that ranged from aristocrats with political and economic power to *hinin* 非人 (outcasts) in extreme poverty. Such an all-embracing nature of Rokuharamitsuji was enhanced by the presence of sculptures of two compassionate deities, Jizō and Kannon, related to Enma.

Chapter Three focuses on the current Rokuharamitsuji sculptural program of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku by discussing its iconographical, textual, and ritual contexts in order to find out what these sculptures meant to their worshippers. I begin by reviewing and comparing these sculptures with other contemporaneous Enma or Ten Kings sculptural groups to illustrate the significance of the Rokuharamitsuji examples in terms of their stylistic and configurational features. I propose two possible original configurations of sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji, either a triad or a full set of the Ten Kings, before the addition of the seventeenth-century Datsueba image. By the late thirteenth century, these two arrangements had successfully taken root in Japan as predominant iconographical representations of sculpted Ten Kings. Moreover, I analyze the architectural layout of the former Enma halls in the temple complex to consider how worshippers originally accessed the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group. The recently discovered hanging scrolls of the Ten Kings are also examined. Relying on the scripture of the Ten Kings, I argue that there was a likely possibility that Ten Kings paintings were employed in tandem with the sculptures. Furthermore, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures might have been activated on their own terms as stationed at the Enma hall or as part of the festival for the deceased when taken out of the hall.

Chapter Four delves into the changes in the Enma sculptural group at Rokuharamitusji in the seventeenth century in response to the surge of interest in Datsueba. In 1629, Kōyū, the prominent Kyoto sculptor, added the Datsueba sculpture to the group. This chapter particularly examines the significance and popularity of Datsueba as the incorporation of popular belief into the existing cult of Enma at the temple. To this end, I trace the existing textual and visual milieu surrounding Datsueba. I then discuss the sculptor Kōyū as well as his patronage, and address the reception of Datsueba sculptures by female devotees in order to investigate the evolution of Enma and the Ten Kings worship at Rokuharamitsuji.

This dissertation highlights the significance of Enma and the Ten Kings sculptures from the thirteenth century, the time when the Ten Kings cult began to flourish in Japan, until the seventeenth century when multiple layers of Ten Kings belief coexisted, by centering on the sculptural program of Enma and his entourage at the Kyoto temple Rokuharamitsuji located in the area aligned with liminality between this world and the next. The present study hopes to establish a more inclusive framework of the Ten Kings cult in a Japanese context that only a few scholars have discussed in the English language. Thus, this study will advance our understanding of the Buddhist concept of death and the afterlife involving Enma and the Ten Kings.

Chapter One

Building a Legacy of Ten Kings

In Buddhism, the fate of the deceased depends on the judgment of Ten Kings 十王 $(j\bar{u}\bar{o})$. The deceased travels through the ten courts presided over by those Ten Kings in the dark region beyond death, either 冥界 (meikai) or 冥府 (meifu), and, according to his or her merits, is assigned to one of the six paths of existence, which include heaven, humans, asura 阿修羅 (a world of never-ending battle), animals, hungry ghosts, and hell. On every seventh day during the first forty-nine days after death, the dead person undergoes a trial administered by a judge, namely each king, and his officials. This judgment continues on to the one-hundredth day, during the first month after the first full year, and during the third year after death. The memorial services directed toward each king on these scheduled dates by the mourning family alleviate the punishments and sufferings of the dead until their reincarnation. 2

When and how would these general perceptions of Ten Kings and their roles have been constructed in a Japanese context? In this chapter, I will analyze Chinese and Japanese textual sources, including scripture and literature, which introduced the concept of Ten Kings to the Japanese populace as early as the eleventh century, and focus on how the Ten Kings were visually depicted. Through a close investigation of Enma, particularly, I argue that Enma came to represent the Ten Kings of the underworld. In doing so, this chapter provides a broader context necessary for understanding and placing the thirteenth- and seventeenth-century sculptures of Enma and his entourage at Rokuharamitsuji in Kyoto in the development of Ten Kings cult. Furthermore, I demonstrate that by the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries when the

¹ Stephen F. Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings and the Making of Purgatory in Medieval Chinese Buddhism* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i, 1994), 1.

² Kwon, "The Ten Kings at the Seikadō Library," 4.

Rokuharamitsuji sculptures were created, the Japanese populace had already familiarized themselves with the Ten Kings. By this time, the significance of Ten Kings, particularly Enma, pertaining to one's death and rebirth had taken root in Japan and had become assimilated into the Japanese context.

<u>Identities of the Ten Kings</u>

The cult of Ten Kings presumably emerged in China around the mid-seventh century.³ However, it was in the ninth and tenth centuries that the conception and bureaucratic system of the Ten Kings were fully formed. Naming each king of the ten courts, the early tenth-century text entitled Foshuo Yanluowang shouji sizhong yuxiu shengqi wangsheng jingtu jing 仏説閻羅王授記四衆預(逆)修生七往生浄土経 (The Sutra Spoken by the Buddha on the Prophecy of King Yama to the Four Orders concerning the Seven [Rituals] to Be Practiced Prior to Rebirth in the Pure Land),⁴ or Shiwang jing 十王經 (Scripture on the Ten Kings) abbreviatedly, functioned as one of the earliest scriptural foundations of this Ten Kings belief. There were various early tenth-century recensions of Shiwang jing discovered at Dunhuang, which included those without poems of praise 讃 (zan) or illustrations and illustrated versions with poems.⁵ Illustrated Shiwang jing recensions generally portray each king's court peopled with a few assistants, sinners wearing restraints, and the virtuous dead.

³ Possibly the earliest reference to the Ten Kings can be found in the treatise entitled *Shiwang zhengye lun* 十王正業 論 (An essay on true karma of the Ten Kings) written by a Chinese monk named Fayun 法雲, who lived around 660 in Chang'an. This treatise was briefly mentioned in a Buddhist catalogue *Datang neidian lu* 大唐内典録 (Record of Buddhist Sources of the Great Tang Dynasty) compiled by the Tang monk Daoxuan 道宣 (596–667) in 664.

⁴ It is also commonly known as *Yuxiu shiwang shengqi jing* 預修十王生七経 (The sutra on the preparatory cultivation of the sevens of life of the Ten Kings).

⁵ On these texts, see Motoi Makiko, "'Yoshu jūō kyō' no shohon [Various books of the Ten Kings sutra]," *Kyoto Daigaku kokubungaku ronsō* 11 (2004): 1-22 and Ogawa Kan'ichi, *Bukkyō bunkasahi kenkyū* (Kyoto: Nagata Bunshōdō, 1973), 81-154. Recensions excluding poems or illustration are considered the oldest, while illustrated versions are thought to have developed later.

These ideas of the Ten Kings and their judgments of the deceased also flourished in Japan through textual sources that were transmitted to Japan from China or created in Japan. The Japanese pilgrim and Tendai monk Jōjin 成尋 (1011–1081), who traveled in China between 1072 and 1081, wrote Santendai godaisanki 参天台五台山記 (Record of Visiting the Five Mountains of Tiantai), and, according to the record, he sent many sutras to Japan while living in China.⁶ He also mentioned obtaining a copy of *Shiwang jing* in the first year of his sojourn.⁷ Another scriptural source on the Ten Kings is Bussetsu Jizō bosatsu hosshin innen jūō kyō 仏説 地蔵菩薩発心因緣十王経 (The Scripture Spoken by the Buddha on the Causes of Bodhisattva Jizō Giving Rise to the Thought of Enlightenment and the Ten Kings), known in short as Jizō jūō kyō 地蔵十王経 (The Sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings). Probably written by anonymous Japanese authors sometime between 1000 and 1300 and modeled on the Chinese scripture Shiwang jing, Jizō jūō kyō not only summarizes the deceased's journey through the ten courts of the Ten Kings but also details his or her potential sufferings in the underworld. Based on such scriptures and other literary works, I herein attempt to identify each king of the underworld as envisioned by the Japanese populace from the eleventh century when the concepts of Ten Kings were introduced to them to the seventeenth century when the set of Enma entourage sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji was completed.

On the first seventh day after death, deceased beings who climb the steep and rocky mountain of death reach the court of King Shinkō 秦広王 (Ch. Qinguang Wang) and are interrogated by this first king to find out if they have committed the crime of killing. According

-

⁶ Motoi, "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju: Gyakushu, tsuizen butsuji ni okeru shōdō o chūshin ni" [The Ten Kings sutras and their reception: centered on the recitations occurring during advance rites and merit transferral rites for the dead], pt. 1, *Kokugo kokubun* 67 (June 1998): 25.

⁷ Motoi, "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju," pt. 1 (June 1998): 25.

⁸ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 58-59.

to Jūō santan sho 十王讚歎鈔 (The Praise of the Ten Kings) purportedly compiled by Nichiren 日蓮 (1222–1282) in the thirteenth century, King Shinkō furiously told the sinners that they came to his court because they forgot about the existence of the afterlife and lived only with wrongful and evil minds. The name of the first king may be interpreted as "The Great [or Extensive] King of Qin" or "The King Who Extends Qin," and here Qin 秦 refers to an ancient Chinese state during the Western Zhou 西周 dynasty (1046–771 BCE) as well as the first imperial dynasty (221–206 BCE). The Praise of the Ten Kings of Qin" and here Qin 秦 refers to an ancient Chinese state during the Western Zhou 西周 dynasty (1046–771 BCE) as well as the first imperial dynasty (221–206 BCE).

Then on the second seventh (fourteenth) day, in groups the dead cross the Sanzu River 三途の川 (J. Sanzu no kawa), often called Nakatsu 奈河津. This river functions as a symbol that separates the human continent from the regions of the underworld. Illustrated versions of *Shiwang jing* describe the deceased's encounter with the river and King Shokō 初江王 (Ch. Chujiang Wang), the second king, in detail (figs. I.1-3). As they step through the flooding waves of the river, the half-naked sinners are chased by ox-headed or horse-headed guards who hold pitchforks in their hands. King Shokō's court sits at the first inlet where the Sanzu River bends. The name of King Shokō, which literally means King of the First River, might have

⁹ Shōren, *Jūō santan sho shinyaku* [New translation of the praise of the Ten Kings], trans. Seiko Otsuka (Tokyo: Shishiku Sekaisha Shuppanbu, 1926), 5.

¹⁰ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 173. For figs. I.1-2, see Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, pls. 5a-5b. For fig. I.3, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Bukkyō setsuwa no bijutsu* [Art of the Buddhist setsuwa stories] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 1990), 169.

¹¹ The P 2003 version in the Pelliot Collection at the Bibliothèque Nationale shows King Shokō before the Sanzu River, while other editions place the river before the king.

¹² Ishida Mizumaro, Minshū kyōten: Miroku jōshōgyō, Miroku geshōgyō, Yakushikyō, Jizōkyō, Kōō kanzeongyō, Urabongyō, Bumo onjūgyō [Scriptures of people: Ascent and rebirth of Maitreya Sutra, advent of Maitreya Sutra, Medicine Master Sutra, Ksitigarbha Sutra, High King Avalokiteśvara Sutra, Ullambana Sutra, and the Sutra on the Profound Kindness of Parents], Bukkyō kyōtensen 12 (Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1986), 204. In the description of King Shokō's court, an old hag Datsueba 奪衣婆 appears. She will be discussed in the fourth chapter of this dissertation.

been derived from the Sanzu River. 13 $J\bar{u}\bar{o}$ santan sho states that King Shokō is compassionate towards the sinner "as parents think of their sick child." 14

The third king, King Sōtei 宋帝王 (Ch. Songdi Wang), whose name literally means "The Imperial King of Song," greets dead people on the third seventh (twenty-first) day, asking them if they have committed the crime of adultery. Similar to the name of the first king, that of the third king contains the character 宋 that indicates not only the state of Song (11th century—286 BCE) established during the Zhou dynasty (1046—256 BCE) but also the Liu Song 劉宋 dynasty that ruled southern China from 420 to 479. Nonetheless, the names of neither the first nor the third king appear in earlier sources other than *Shiwang jing* and *Jizō jūō kyō*. While King Sōtei punishes the sinner, he saves anyone who was devoted to his or her parents and did good deeds from falling into hell. 17

The deceased faces the fourth king, King Gokan $\Xi \equiv (Ch. Wuguan Wang)$, "King of the Five Offices," on the fourth seventh (twenty-eighth) day. Both illustrated *Shiwang jing* and $Jiz\bar{o}\ j\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}$ put an emphasis on the role of King Gokan by embellishing the scene at his court. The fourth court includes the scale of karma, in addition to a king sitting behind a desk, his attendants, and sinners, which repeatedly appear in other courts (figs. I.4-5). As one of the implements insuring impartial judgment, this scale of karma measures the severity of a crime. Particularly, according to $Jiz\bar{o}\ j\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}$, the scale is used to record the weight of the seven crimes violated by one's body and mouth. $Jiz\bar{o}\ j\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}$ also specifies the types of punishment the dead

¹³ Kominami Ichirō, "Jūō kyō no keisei to Zui Tō no minshū shinkō [Formation of the Ten Kings sutra and the faith among people during the Sui and Tang dynasties]," *Tōhō gakuhō: Kyoto* 74 (2002): 199.

¹⁴ Otsuka, trans., Jūō santan sho shinyaku, 10.

¹⁵ Ishida, Minshū kyōten, 208.

¹⁶ Teiser, The Scripture on the Ten Kings, 174.

¹⁷ Otsuka, trans., Jūō santan sho shinyaku, 13.

¹⁸ For the images, see Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, pls. 7a-7b.

¹⁹ Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 210.

would receive based on the weight of their bad acts. While a grave offense weighing over one kin \digamma (0.6 kg) equals the punishment of falling into hell, a medium offense reaching the scale of one $ry\bar{o}$ 両 (0.0375 kg) results in being reborn in the body of a hungry ghost. A light offense reaching the scale of one fun 分 (0.375 g) results in rebirth as an animal. The Boys of Good and Evil 善惡童子 (Ch. San'e tongzi) assist in this process of weighing karma and writing down good and bad actions that will eventually be reported to Enma.

Besides *Shiwangjing* and *Jizō jūō kyō*, early apocryphal Chinese Buddhist scriptures mention King Gokan as a member of the underworld bureaucracy. For example, the *Sutra of Consecration* 灌頂經 (Ch. *Guanding jing*, J. *Kanjō kyō*), written and compiled by the Chinese monk, Huiqian 慧虔 (active 5th c.) in 457, highlights the significance of King Gokan, who ranks just below Enma and collects all the details on evil deeds reported by lower-ranked officials. Moreover, the *Sutra of Trapuṣa and Ballika* 提調波利經 (Ch. *Diwei boli jing*, J. *Daii hari kyō*) written during the fifth century explains "Gokan" as the five separate offices that exist in the world of desire, the five human sense-organs, yin and yang, spirit, and hell. In a similar vein, the *Sutra of the Samādhi and Pure Salvation* 淨度三昧經 (Ch. *Jingdu sanmei jing*, J. *Jōdo sanmai kyō*), probably composed during the fifth century, specifies five different offices supervising the lay Buddhist precepts: "the Office of Butchering oversees the taking of life; the Office of Water punishes theft; the Office of Metal deals with fornication; the Office of Earth administers cases of lying; and the Office of Heaven adjudicates crimes of drunkenness." The

²⁰ Ishida, Minshū kvōten, 210.

²¹ Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 210.

²² Teiser, The Scripture on the Ten Kings, 174. See Guanding jing, in Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 大正新脩大蔵経 1331, 21:535c.

²³ Kominami, "Jūō kyō no keisei," 199.

²⁴ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 174-5. See T2121, 53:259b.

appearance of the karma scale in his court and detailed explanation of his roles as found in several sources assure the importance of King Gokan in understanding the underworld bureaucracy.

On the fifth seventh (thirty-fifth) day, the deceased encounters King Enma 閻魔王 (Ch. Yanluo Wang). Among the Ten Kings, Enma, the fifth king, has represented the rest of the group as the most prominent and worshipped figure in Japan. Rokuharamitsuji in this study also enshrines a sculpture of Enma. I will return to him later in this chapter and discuss his development in more detail.

On the sixth seventh (forty-second) day the departed proceeds to the court of King Hensei 変成王 (Ch. Biancheng Wang) or "King of Transformations." His name may be traced back to a hell described in the fifth-century Chinese tales collected by Wang Yuan (424-479) as 受变形成 (J. *juhen keisei*) or "city where people receive transformed shapes" after their death. Hensei might also mean that the dead are reborn in various forms after receiving a judgment. In the court of King Hensei, one's destiny of being reborn in heaven or hell is determined in an instant, as recorded in $Jiz\bar{o}~j\bar{u}\bar{o}~ky\bar{o}$. The illustrated *Shiwang jing* of the Pelliot Collection at the Bibliothèque Nationale shows that two donors, whose piety is recorded in the long scroll, ascend on clouds to paradise, in contrast to the evil person who is shown inside the walls of the prison (fig. 1.6). 18

The seventh king that the deceased faces on the seventh seventh (forty-ninth) day is King Taizan 泰山王 (Ch. Taishan Wang). King Taizan originated from Taishan Fujun 泰山府君 (J. Taizan Fukun), who presided over Mount Tai in Shandong province of China, summoning the

²⁵ Teiser, The Scripture on the Ten Kings, 176.

²⁶ Kominami, "Jūō kyō no keisei," 211.

²⁷ Ishida, Minshū kyōten, 260.

²⁸ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, pl. 9.

spirits of the dead and administering the lengthening and shortening of human lifespans.²⁹ As a magistrate of the realm of the dead located under Mount Tai (in modern Shandong province), Taizan Fukun was routinely associated with Enma.³⁰ Later he came to be immersed in the bureaucracy of the underworld, taking up a post as the seventh king. In order to bribe King Taizan, people even placed money in the mouths of the dead at burial, according to the *Compendium Sutra of the Six Perfections 六度集経 (Ch. Liudu ji jing; J. Rokudo jikkyō)* translated into Chinese in the third century.³¹ Jizō jūō kyō again emphasizes the significance of holding a memorial service to save the deceased brought to the court of King Taizan.³²

King Byōdō 平等王 (Ch. Pingdeng Wang), whose name means "Equal" or "Impartial," administers the passage on the one hundredth day. His name is likely to have originated from a nickname of King Enma, that is, "the impartial one." Other identities of King Byōdō include a manifestation of the Jizō Bodhisattva and one of the twelve underworld judges, respectively based on Tang dynasty Tantric texts³⁴ and Manichaean texts from the same period. In other contexts, the Impartial King Byōdō appears as an independent figure in his own right. For

²⁹ For more information on Taizan Fukun, see Sawada Mizuho, *Shūtei: Jigokuhen: Chūgogku no meikaisetsu* [A revised study of the transformation of hell: Chinese views of underworld] (Tokyo: Hirakawa Shuppansha, 1991), 37-48, 249-289; and Sakai Tadao, "Taizan shinkō no kenkyū [Study on the faith in Taizan]," *Saichō* 7: 2 (1937): 70-118.

³⁰ Osabe Kazuo, "Tōdai mikkyō ni okeru Enraō to Taizan Fukun [King Enma and Taizan Fukun in Tang dynasty esoteric Buddhism]," in *Dōkyō kenkyū* 4, ed. Yoshitoyo Yoshioka et al. (Toride-shi: Henkyōsha, 1971), 1-28.

³¹ This compendium was translated by Kang Senghui 康僧会 (active around 247-280), a Buddhist monk and translator. See Kominami, "*Jūō kyō* no keisei," 213-214.

³² The deceased in the court of King Taizan says that "with the properties that I left, hold a memorial service, make merits, and save me." Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 262.

³³ Nakamura Hajime, *Bukkyō go daijiten* [Dictionary of Buddhist terminology] 3 (Tokyo: Tokyo Shoseki Kabushikigaisha, 1975), 1146d-1147a.

³⁴ One of these Tantric texts is *Baiqiansong daji jing dizang pusa qingwen fashen zhan* 百千頌大集経地蔵菩薩請問法身讚 (Hundreds and Thousands Eulogies of Mahāsaṃnipāta Sūtra and Eulogies of Jizō Bodhisattva Questioning about Dharma Body), purportedly translated by Amoghavajra 不空金剛 (705-774), the eminent Indian Buddhist monk and the sixth patriarch of esoteric Buddhism in China. See T413, 13:792b.

³⁵ Such examples include *Monijiao xiabu zan* 摩尼教下部讚 (Manichaean Hymns of the Lower Section) and *Bosi jiao can jing* 波斯教残経 (The Teaching of Persian Scripture). See respectively T2140, 54:1273c and T2141b, 54: 1285c.

example, the *Account of Stimuli and Responses Related to Buddhāvataṃsaka-sūtra* 大方廣佛華 嚴經感傳 (Ch. *Dafangguang fo huayan jing ganying zhuan*) compiled shortly after 783 by Hu Youzhen 胡幽貞 contains the story of a devout Buddhist named Guo Shenliang, who was brought to King Byōdō by his envoys after death, questioned by the king, and sent to hell.³⁶ In this case King Byōdō is portrayed as a deity who judges whether or not the deceased goes to hell. Moreover, *Jizō jūō kyō* describes King Byōdō as the one who has a heart full of mercy despite his angry appearance, guides those who make an offering, and charges greedy people with a crime; the scripture further assures the reader that the deceased may go to heaven if their descendants do virtuous deeds.³⁷

The deceased passes through the court of the ninth king one year after death. The ninth king is called King Toshi 都市王 (Ch. Dushi Wang), literally "King of the Capital" or "King of the Market of the Capital." His name might have been modeled on older names for underground officials, such as Duguan Wang 都官王 or Duyang Wang 都陽王.³⁸ Moreover, a verse from the poem by the eighth-century Chan monk Wang Fanzhi 王梵志 mentions the name of King Toshi, stating that if you have money but do not know how to use it, you will enter the court of King Toshi without possessing anything.³⁹ The judgment of the sinners continues in this court; however, their destination among the six paths of rebirth has not been decided yet. The paths are accessible only from the tenth court. According to *Jizō jūō kyō*, it is first mentioned in the court of King Toshi that if people write Buddhist scriptures or make sculptures, they can be saved.⁴⁰

 $^{^{36}}$ Then, a monk appeared in hell and taught Guo Shenliang a Buddhist hymn. As Guo recited the hymn, he escaped from the underworld and returned to life. See Kominami, " $J\bar{u}\bar{o}~ky\bar{o}$ no keisei," 216.

³⁷ Ishida, *Minshū kvōten*, 265.

³⁸ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 177

³⁹ Kominami, "Jūō kyō no keisei," 219-220.

⁴⁰ Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 266.

Lastly the dead meets King Godō Tenrin 五道転輪王 (Ch. Wudao Zhuanlun Wang), "King of Reincarnation in Five Paths," three years after death. In this last court, King Godō Tenrin assigns the deceased to his or her next mode of life. In this court, it is emphasized that self-indulgence, evil thought, and ignorance are sins, which go around like a wheel.⁴¹ Godō 五道 refers to the five paths of rebirth in Buddhism: the path of hell, the path of hungry ghosts, the path of animals, the path of humans, and the path of heavenly beings. These five paths are equivalents of the five paths of the rokudō 六道 (the six paths of rebirth) excluding the path of fighting gods (asura). 42 Most versions of illustrated manuscripts of Shiwang jing present five (and sometimes six) paths of rebirth in the tenth court, using simplified figures of asura, gods, humans, animals, hungry ghosts, and sufferers and demons in hell (figs. I. 7-9).⁴³ In these texts, King Godō Tenrin appears as a martial figure, wearing a padded military suit and a general's cap. This representation reflects Godō Tenrin's other title, Godō Shōgun 五道将軍 (Ch. Wudao Jiangjun), General of the Five Paths, mentioned in eighth-century Tantric texts. 44 Another appellation of King Godō Tenrin is Godō Daijin 五道大神 (Ch. Wudao Dashen), Great Spirit of the Five Paths, who oversees the five paths as Enma's assistant. According to Kominami, the imperial Chinese Buddhist tomb inventory from the mid-sixth and mid-seventh centuries excavated in the Turfan region included a mortuary petition documenting that a Buddhist monk contacted Godō Daijin about the arrival of the deceased.⁴⁵

1

⁴¹ Ishida, *Minshū kvōten*, 270.

⁴² This distinction between the five and six paths seems to have been based on the difference in ideology among factions of the Buddhist order. This issue is discussed in Oda Yoshihisa, "Godō daijin kō [Article on Godō daijin]," *Tōhō shūkyō* 48 (October 1976): 14-29. For more information on the five and six paths, see David Neil Schmid, "Revisioning the Buddhist Cosmos: Shifting Paths of Rebirth in Medieval Chinese Buddhism," *Cahiers d'Extrême-Asie* 17 (2008): 293-325.

⁴³ For figs. I.7-8, see Schmid, "Revisioning the Buddhist Cosmos," 309 and 320 respectively. For fig. I.9, see Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, pl. 13b.

⁴⁴ Such texts include the scripture titled *Yanluo wang gong xingfa cidi* 焰羅王供行法次第 (Method of Making Offerings to King Yama in Successive Order) purportedly translated by Amoghavajra (705-774).

⁴⁵ Kominami, "Jūō kyō no keisei," 220-225.

These Ten Kings of the underworld are fearsome judges who punish and torture the sinners. However, they also exercise compassion toward those who generate merits and make offerings to the kings. The following passage from *Shiwang jing* indicates that,

The [historical] Buddha [Shaka] announced to [the kings]: "The Law is broad and forgiving. I allow you to be lenient with the compassionate and filial sons and daughters of all sinners. When they cultivate merit and perform sacrifices to raise the dead, repaying the kindness shown in giving birth to them and supporting them, or when during the seven sevens they cultivate feasts and commission statues in order to repay their parents' kindness, then you should allow them to attain rebirth in the heavens."⁴⁶

As noted above, the living transfer merit to the dead by holding feasts, performing rituals, and commissioning Buddhist images in order to cause the positive judgment of each presiding king, thus saving the dead. The Ten Kings show mercy to the dead whose family offers memorial services.

Who is Enma?

Now let us return to Enma, the most important figure among Ten Kings. Enma carries many names that differ based on different conceptions and translations. The Vedas, a collection of hymns and other religious texts composed in India between about 1500 and 1000 BCE, calls him Yama or Yama Rāja, a twin god of his sister goddess Yami, and describes him as the ancestor of humanity, the first to die, and king of a land of the departed.⁴⁷ Incorporated into the

⁴⁶ All translations are by author unless otherwise noted. I have cited Stephen Teiser's translation of a manuscript of *Shiwang jing* found at Dunhuang, now in the Pelliot Collection in the Bibliothèque Nationale. See Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 209-210.

⁴⁷ For more literature on Yama, see R. N. Dandekar, "Yama in the Veda," *Select Writings* I (1979): 118-140; Alex Wayman, "Studies in Yama and Māra," *Indo-Iranian Journal* 3 (1959): 44-73 and Bulcsu Siklós, "The Evolution of the Buddhist Yama," in *The Buddhist Forum*, vol. IV, ed. Tadeusz Skorupski (London: The School of Oriental and African Studies, 1996), 173-180.

Buddhist pantheon, he becomes a heavenly being 夜摩天 (Ch. Yemo tian, J. Yamaten). In esoteric Buddhism he is called Enmaten 焔摩天 (Ch. Yanluo tian). Eventually he acquires an identity as a judge or king of the dead, and his name is often written as Enma 閻魔, 焔摩, 炎摩, or Enra 閻羅.

The Japanese populace appears to have understood Enma as the ruler and judge of hell as early as the Nara period (710–794). *Nihon ryōiki* 日本霊異記 (*Record of Miraculous Events in Japan*, 787–824), one of the oldest Japanese literary sources, contains stories in which protagonists fall into the underworld for various reasons, meet King Enma to be judged according to their acts, and return to life. In these stories Enma is described as residing in a shining palace, and his palace appears as the entrance to hell. Enma's image as the lord and arbitrator of hell continues in the Heian period (794–1185). The tenth-century popular Buddhist text, *Ōjōyōshū* 往生要集 (*Essentials of Birth in the Pure Land*), compiled by Genshin 源信 (942–1017), includes a judgment scene in which Enma adjudicates the sinner brought to him by hell jailers. Although in *Ōjōyōshū* Enma appears only briefly, he seems to symbolize hell.

Another popular literary source called *Konjaku monogatari shū* 今昔物語集 (Tales of Times Now Past) of the twelfth century also mentions Enma as a judge in its descriptions of hell. The above-mentioned texts relate Enma to hell, but lack any visual reference to Enma himself.

⁴⁸ Shuhua Mao, "Enma shinkō ni kansuru Nicchu hikaku kenkyū [Japanese and Chinese comparative studies on the Enma faith]," *Hikaku minzoku kenkyū* 15 (June 1996): 28.

⁴⁹ One of the tales in the *Nihon ryōki* says, "At the end of the road in front are layers of towers. They shine and emit bright light." See Wakabayashi Haruko, "Hell Illustrated: A Visual Image of *Ikai* that came from *Ikoku*," in *Practicing the Afterlife: Perspectives from Japan*, eds., Susanne Formanek and William R. LaFleur (Vienna: Der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2004), 298.

⁵⁰ T2682, 84:33c.

 $^{^{51}}$ $\bar{O}j\bar{o}y\bar{o}sh\bar{u}$ expounds on the horror and cruelty of hell in detail as a way to emphasize the reward of being reborn in the Pure Land of Amida Buddha.

⁵² Mao, "Enma shinkō ni kansuru," 31.

As Japanese pilgrims and monks studying under esoteric Buddhist masters in China exported a large amount of esoteric Buddhist material to Japan in the early ninth century, Enma gained another identity as a heavenly being called Enmaten 閻魔(焰摩)天, one of the twelve guardian deities, particularly protecting the direction of South. This esoteric Buddhist image of Enma seems to have arrived on Japanese soil through the Mandalas of the Two Worlds brought back from China by Kūkai 空海 (774–835) in 806.⁵³ Although these original mandalas do not survive, Enmaten appears in the ninth-century *Takao mandara* 高雄曼茶羅, thought to be a second-generation copy, located at Jingoji 神護寺 in Kyoto.⁵⁴ Enmaten also emerged in sets of twelve hanging scrolls of heavenly beings 十二天 (J. Jūniten), and his independent images were created and worshipped in paintings and sculptures to pray not only for protection from disease and disaster, but also for longevity and easy childbirth.⁵⁵ In these images, Enmaten wears devastyle clothing like a graceful deity, holds a pole with a human head on the top, and sometimes rides on a water buffalo (figs. I.10-12).⁵⁶

This heavenly Enma gradually transformed into an afterlife judge as the cult of Ten Kings began to flourish in Japan. *Besson zakki* 別尊雜記, a compendium of Buddhist iconography compiled from 1171 to 1175 by the painter-monk Shinkaku 心覚 (1117–1180), shows a mandala dedicated to Enmaten (fig. I.13).⁵⁷ While Enma in the center wears a diaphanous bodhisattva garment, those who accompany him, Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, and

⁵³ Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution," 12.

⁵⁴ Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution," 12.

⁵⁵ Nakano Genzō, *Rokudōe no kenkyū* [Study on the Six Paths paintings] (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1989), 133.

⁵⁶ For more discussion on visual representations of Enmaten, see Nakano Genzō, *Rokudōe no kenkyū*, 131-138; and Nakano Genzō, "Enma ten kara Enma ō e [From Enmaten to King Enma]," *Bukkyo geijutsu* 150 (1983): 109-114. For figs. I.10 and I.11, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Josei to bukkyō* (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2003), 118 and 117 respectively. For fig. I.12, see Sawa Ryūken and Hamada Takashi, *Mikkyō bijutsu taikan* [Survey of esoteric Buddhist art] 4: *Ten, hōgu, soshi* (Tokyo: Asahi Shinbunsha, 1983-1984), 48.

⁵⁷ For the image, see Nakano Genzō, *Rokudōe no kenkyū* (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1989), 135.

two record-keepers, Shiroku 司録 (Ch. Silu) and Shimei 司命 (Ch. Siming), are all dressed in Chinese garb. Shiroku and Shimei attend Enma as the major underworld officials. Incorporated into the cult of the Ten Kings, Taizan Fukun, originally the god of Mount Taishan associated with the afterlife in China, turns into the seventh king, Taizan, while Godō Daijin becomes the tenth king Godō Tenrin. All these figures often work as functionaries of Enma. Later thirteenth-century Enmaten mandalas depict more attendants in addition to Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shiroku, and Shimei, placing Enma still in the center (fig. I.14). However, in these later depictions, Enma wears Chinese attire and the stern expression of the King Enma rather than the diaphanous garb and gentle expression of the heavenly Enmaten.

King Enma is regarded as the highest ranking of the Ten Kings. The illustrated *Shiwang jing* identifies Enma as a "Son of Heaven" 天子 (Ch. *tianzi*, J. *tenshi*), a designation often used to refer to an emperor, and shows him wearing the cap with jade pieces suspended from silk strings appropriate to the rank of emperor (figs. I.15-16). The *Shiwang jing* further states, "The Buddha announced to the entire great multitude that in a world to come, Yama Raja [Enma], Son of Heaven, would attain the role of Buddha." While the Chinese scripture considers Enma as imperative as the Buddha, its Japanese version, $Jiz\bar{o}\ j\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}$, often calls him the "King of the Law" 法王 (Ch. *fawang*, J. $h\bar{o}\bar{o}$), which seems to stress Enma's role as an impartial judge.

Furthermore, King Enma's palace is equipped with implements that insure unprejudiced administration and prove his superiority over other kings, according to *Jizō jūō kyō*. As a case in

-

⁵⁸ In particular, Taizan Fukun appears as one of the attendants of Enma in the *Taizōkai mandara* 胎蔵界曼荼羅. The fourteenth-century hanging scroll of Enma's court enshrined at Chōsenji 長泉寺, Osaka, illustrates King Enma accompanied by Taizan Fukun and Godō Daijin (fig. I.17). In front of them are Enma's officials, Shiroku and Shimei, along with sinners and hell jailers. For the image, see Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan, *Sakai no butsuzō butsuga* (Sakai: Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan, 1985), no. 54.

⁵⁹ For the image, see Sawa and Hamada, *Mikkyō bijutsu taikan* 4, 57.

⁶⁰ For the images, see Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, pls. 8a-8b.

⁶¹ Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 199.

point, *dandadō* 壇茶幢 banners are located to the left and right of the iron gate in his palace. On the top of each banner pole is a head: on the left pole is the head of Taizan Fukun, and on the right pole is the head of Kokuantennyo 黑闇天女.⁶² Both heads carefully look at the human world. The fierce looking Taizan Fukun records a person's every evil deed, both small and large, whereas the benign Kokuantennyo writes down even the smallest and insignificant good deed. All virtues and sins of the dead that both heads see are reported to King Enma. Moreover, all living beings have witnesses named Dōshōjin 同生神 (together-born or birth companion deities) constantly recording everything they do and reporting their findings to the king.⁶³ These witnesses are also called Kushōjin 俱生神.

Although Jūō santan sho, another text on the Ten Kings, placed dandadō at the court of the second King Shokō and Dōshōjin at the court of the third King Sōtei, these two implements appear to have become associated more closely with the court of King Enma. For example, one painting from the thirteenth-century set of fifteen rokudōe 六道絵 hanging picture scrolls at Shōjuraigōji 聖衆来迎寺, Shiga Prefecture, depicts Enma in his court equipped with such implements (fig. I.29).⁶⁴ On each side of the lower half of the painting is a dandadō pole. On the left is the pole with a head of a red-faced Taizan Fukun, while on the right is the pole with the head of Kokuantennyo. Below each pole, a Kushōjin (or Dōshōjin) figure is seated. On the left, a red- and stern-faced deity seems to be writing down the bad deeds of the deceased, whereas a kind-looking deity is noting the good deeds. Such a description of the two deities is presumably

 $^{^{62}}$ Visualized depictions of $dandad\bar{o}$ suggest that there are two types of $dandad\bar{o}$: each of two poles surmounted with one angry head or one benign head separately and a staff surmounted with both heads.

⁶³ On the development of them, see Nagao Kayoko, "Kushōjin no tenkai [Development of Kushōjin]," *Bukkyō bunka* 10 (2000): 43-70.

⁶⁴ For the image, see Izumi Takeo, Kasuya Makoto, and Yamamoto Satomi, eds., *Kokuhō Rokudōe* [National treasure Rokudōe] (Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2007), 143. Miriam Chusid scrutinizes the Shōjuraigōji scroll of Enma in her dissertation. See Chusid, "Picturing the Afterlife: The Shōjuraigōji Six Paths Scrolls and Salvation in Medieval Japan" (PhD diss., Princeton University, 2016), 96-133.

based on *Jizō jūō kyō*, which states that "the deity on the left writes bad deeds and looks like a Rasetsu 羅刹 (man-eating demon) … the deity on the right writes good deeds and looks like [the female deity] Kichijō[ten] 吉祥[天]."⁶⁵ The inclusion of *dandadō* and Dōshōjin in Enma's court assures his unprejudiced administration and proves his superiority over other kings.

Another tool aiding King Enma's judgment is the karma mirror called *jōhari no kagami* 淨頗梨鏡 (pristine crystal mirror) or *gō no kagami* 業鏡 (mirror of karma). This mirror projects all the good and evil acts of the deceased in their previous lives. By revealing any evil behavior that sinners might have easily concealed in life, the *dandadō* poles, Dōshōjin, and the mirror allow King Enma to make a clear and distinct judgment.

Visual Representations of Ten Kings

In China, Ten Kings seem to have begun to be visualized as early as the ninth century and have prevalently appeared in various art forms in the ninth and tenth centuries. Although one of the earliest references to a pictorial rendering of the underworld occurred in the sixth century, it did not include Ten Kings. Even the eighth-century artist Wu Daozi 吳道子 (active ca. 710–760), who was celebrated for painting hell scenes so terrifying that they made fishmongers and butchers stop killing animals and change their professions, is not considered to have painted Ten Kings. A Tang-dynasty text titled *Shenfushan si lingji ji* 神福山寺靈蹟記 (*A Record of the Numinous Traces at Shenfushan Temple*) carved in stone in 907 at Shenfushan temple mentioned a mural of the Ten Kings and Jizō bodhisattva as one of the notable images that existed in 907 at

⁶⁵ Izumi, Kasuya, and Yamamoto, eds., Kokuhō rokudōe, 331.

⁶⁶ Stephen F. Teiser, "Having Once Died and Returned to Life: Representations of Hell in Medieval China," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 48, no. 2 (December 1988): 437-439.

⁶⁷ Jingxuan Zhu, *Tangchao minghua lu* 唐朝名畫錄 [Record of famous painters of the Tang dynasty], 16. See also Alexander Soper, "T'ang Ch'ao Ming Hua Lu," revised translation, *Artibus Asiae* 21, no. 3/4 (1958): 210.

the temple. Considering that most buildings and images at the temple were destroyed during the Huichang $\stackrel{\triangle}{=}$ era (841–846) and subsequently rebuilt, the mural of Ten Kings and Jizō appears to have been painted sometime between 846 and 907.⁶⁸ This earliest example, however, is now lost.

Another early datable yet extant representation of Ten Kings accompanying Jizō can be found in Niche 85 located on the western cliff at Zizhong 資中 District in Sichuan Province.

According to the inscription, "during the [] year of Guanghua 光化 (898–901) [] []

Yundeng 雲登 and other donors of Zhongsheng 忠勝 village repaired and installed the Ten Kings images right in this cloister and hosted a vegetarian feast to repay kindness." Many more tenth-century carved stone images of the Ten Kings wearing the attire of Chinese bureaucrats and attending Jizō can be found on the south wall of the Duobao ku 多寶窟 grottoes in Guangyuan, Sichuan; in Niche 253 of Beishan 北山 in Dazu, Sichuan (fig. I.18)70; and in Niche 60 of the Yuanjue dong 圓覺洞 cave in Anyue, Sichuan (fig. I.19).71 While the Ten Kings in Guangyuan and Dazu are depicted as miniature figures flanking the bodhisattva, those in Anyue appear comparable to the bodhisattva in size. Moreover, in Anyue more details are added to other figures, including the Ten Kings' attendants who are dressed in Chinese costume.

Serving as the main hub of Buddhist art, the Mogao caves of Dunhuang provided early pictorial vestiges of Ten Kings. In addition to illustrated copies of the *Shiwang jing*, the oldest version of which was dated to 908, wall paintings and hanging scrolls depicting Ten Kings were found in the grottoes. Particularly, most of the Ten Kings paintings in situ at Dunhuang made

⁶⁸ Teiser, The Scriptures on the Ten Kings, 40.

 ⁶⁹ Zhiru Ng, *The Making of a Savior Bodhisattva: Dizang in Medieval China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007), 151. For the text inscription, see Mingyi Ding, "Sichuan shiku zashi," *Wenwu* 8 (1988): 53.
 ⁷⁰ For the image, see Ng, *The Making of a Savior Bodhisattva*, 153.

⁷¹ For the image, see Angela Falco Howard, *Summit of Treasures: Buddhist Cave Art of Dazu, China* (Trumbull: Weatherhill, Inc., 2001), 158.

during the tenth, eleventh, and twelfth centuries are placed on the ceiling of a passageway between the antechamber and the main chamber of a cave. This architectural scheme appears to have evoked "the deceased's passage to the intermediate state between death and the next birth, during which judgment is administered."⁷²

Dunhuang Mogao grottoes also contained vertical paintings portraying the kings as subordinate to a central image of Jizō bodhisattva. Twelve surviving examples from the ninth and tenth centuries now held in major museums, such as the British Museum and the Musée Guimet, vary in composition and style. Some of these hanging scrolls indiscriminately portray the kings with minor variations in costume and expression (fig. I.20),⁷³ whereas others endow each king with his own court and assistants (fig. I.21).⁷⁴ The eight illustrated handscrolls of *Shiwang jing* discovered at Dunhuang invest each king with even more autonomy by presenting them one after the other.⁷⁵ Each king is shown in his own separate scene, equipped with the belongings of a Chinese magistrate, including a desk, brush, ink, and documents, and accompanied by demonic prison guards, officials, messengers, the dead, and sometimes the living who present offerings.

According to literary sources, several artists in the Five Dynasties period (907–960) painted the Ten Kings. However, none of these works survive today. Zhang Tu 張圖 (fl. 907–922) reportedly painted a number of murals in the temples of Luoyang and some of the first recorded examples of Jizō and Ten Kings. Liu Daochun 劉道醇 (fl. 1059), the eleventh-century art critic, reminisced as follows: "Once at the home of Wu Zongyuan I viewed a scroll that Tu had painted of the Ten Kings and Dizang [J. Jizō]. Their faces were full of benevolence and

⁷² Ng, The Making of a Savior Bodhisattva, 157.

⁷³ For the image, see Teiser, *The Scriptures on the Ten Kings*, 36.

⁷⁴ For the image, see Teiser, *The Scriptures on the Ten Kings*, 38.

⁷⁵ Ledderose, "The Bureaucracy of Hell," 178-179.

compassion, so he has kept it as a treasure until now. To this day it is still kept as a treasure. It may be listed as an 'inspired work.' It can be ranked as a spiritual piece."⁷⁶ Another tenth-century painter Wang Qiaoshi 王喬士 (fl. 907–960) is known to have rendered over a hundred versions of images of Jizō and the Ten Kings.⁷⁷ The images created immediately after these tenth-century materials are not extant, although the Japanese monk Jōjin reports that he saw sculptures of the Ten Kings surrounding Jizō during his travel to China in 1072.⁷⁸

As the cult of Ten Kings started to flourish in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, each king was given more importance and sovereignty, which led to the depictions of Ten Kings in individual hanging scrolls. Each hanging scroll portrays the kings in their immediate courts embellished with outdoor courtly settings, exaggerated torture scenes, and multiplied functionaries who assist the kings. In particular, the elaborate settings, consisting of a large armchair covered with a patterned cloth, a painted screen behind the chair, and a decorated balustrade, imbue each king with authority. These sets of paintings depicting Ten Kings were first made during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries in workshops in the town of Ningbo 寧波 located on the southeastern rim of Hangzhou Bay in present-day Zhejiang Province. Ningbo had served as an important commercial port for trade between China and other countries, including Korea and Japan, since one of three Offices of Maritime Trade was established within the city during the Song dynasty (960–1279). So

⁷⁶ Liu Daochun, *Wudai minghua buyi* 五代名畫補遺 [Record of the Five Dynasties collection of famous paintings] 3v, 437b, in *Wenyuange siku quanshu* 文淵閣四庫全書 [Complete books in the Four Treasures (Wenyuan Pavilion Edition)], vol. 812 (Taipei: Taiwan Shangwu Yinshuguan, 1983-1986).

⁷⁷ Guo Ruoxu 郭若虛 (fl. 1010–1080), *Tuhua jianwen zhi* 圖畫見聞誌 [An overview of painting], in *Huashi congshu* 畫史叢書 [Collected Texts on the History of Painting], vol. 4 (Shanghai: Shanghai Renmin Meishu Chubanshe, 1963).

⁷⁸ Jōjin, *San Tendai Godai san ki*, in *Dainihon bukkyō zensho* (Tokyo: Suzuki Gakujutsu Zaidan, 1970–1973), vol. 72: 232c, 252c.

⁷⁹ Ledderose, "The Bureaucracy of Hell," 180.

⁸⁰ Lippit, "Ningbo Buddhist Painting: A Reassessment," 54.

By the thirteenth century, Ningbo had turned into a center for professional ateliers specializing in painting Daoist and Buddhist images. Among the surviving corpus of the sets of Ten Kings hanging scrolls, many carry signatures of the artists, Jin Chushi 金處士 (active late 12th century) and Lu Xinzhong 陸信忠 (late 12th—early 13th century), who managed a large family workshop in Ningbo. The signatures of Lu Xinzhong in the set at Eigenji 永源寺 in Shiga Prefecture, Japan, state the full address of his atelier for commercial purpose, which includes "Qingyuan fu 慶元府," an old name for Ningbo that was used between 1195 and 1277.81 Similarly, inscriptions on Jin Chushi's paintings in the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, and the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, include Mingzhou 明州, another old appellation for Ningbo before it was changed to Qingyuan fu in 1195, which provides a clue for dating Jin's works.

Sets of Ten Kings paintings attributed to Jin Chushi and Lu Xinzhong were transported in great quantities to Japan probably through Japanese merchants as well as Buddhist pilgrims during the Kamakura (12th–14th century) and Muromachi (14th–16th century) periods (figs. I.22-23). 82 More than ten sets attributed to Lu Xinzhong can be found in the Japanese collections of Kōtō'in 高桐院, Kyoto; Zendōji 善導寺, Fukuoka; Daitokuji 大徳寺, Kyoto; Kanagawa Prefectural Museum, Yokohama; Nara National Museum, Nara; Eigenji 永源寺, Shiga Prefecture; Jōdoji 浄土寺, Hiroshima Prefecture; Jōkyōji 浄教寺, Wakayama Prefecture; Hōnenji 法然寺, Kagawa Prefecture; Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko 神奈川県立金沢文

⁸¹ Ledderose, "The Bureaucracy of Hell," 167.

⁸² For fig. I.22, see Nara National Museum Collection Database, accessed August 8, 2018, https://www.narahaku.go.jp/collection/1013-5.html. For fig. I.23, see Metropolitan Museum of Art Collection Database, accessed August 8, 2018,

https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/44509?sortBy=Relevance&who=JIN+CHUSHI%24Jin+Chushi&ft=*&offset=0&rpp=20&pos=4.

子 (Kanagawa Prefectural Kanazawa Bunko Museum), Yokohama; Masaki Art Museum, Osaka; and Seiganji 誓願寺, Kyoto. 83 These sets show similar compositions yet contain slight discrepancies in figures, motifs, and quality. General compositional frameworks must have been established by the use of stencils, 84 which resulted in mass production of these Ningbo scrolls. The Ten Kings paintings discovered in 2008 in the storehouse of Rokuharamitsuji also bear the signature of Lu Xinzhong: "Painted by Lu Xinzhong" (陸信忠筆, Ch. Lu Xinzhong bi). 85 These paintings will be discussed more in detail in the third chapter of this dissertation.

Based on these Ningbo scrolls of Ten Kings imported from China over the Song and Yuan (1271–1368) dynasties, Japanese produced their own version of Ten Kings paintings. Numerous examples created during the Kamakura and Muromachi periods spread over Japan (figs. I.24-26). For example, the Ten Kings set housed in Seiganji 誓願寺, Fukuoka, which is thought to be the oldest Japanese version of separate hanging scrolls of Ten Kings, closely resembles works by Lu Xinzhong, while the sets in Hōfukuji 宝福寺, Okayama Prefecture, Sōfukuji 崇福寺, Aichi Prefecture, and Manjuji 万寿寺, Saga Prefecture are modeled on those by Jin Chushi. Furthermore, Nison'in 二尊院 and Jōfukuji 浄福寺 in Kyoto own almost identical sets of Ten Kings paintings. These two versions not only adopted motifs from both Lu Xinzhong and Jin Chushi but also added Japanese interpretations.

⁸³ More examples of works by Lu Xinzhong are housed in the collections of Museum für Asiatische Kunst in Berlin, Germany. For more information on Lu, see Kajitani, "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu," 22-38.

⁸⁴ Ledderose, "The Bureaucracy of Hell," 170.

⁸⁵ "Kyoto Rokuharamitsujide jūōzu ippan kōkai" [Ten Kings paintings open to the public at Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto], *Yomiuri shinbun*, June 17, 2008.

⁸⁶ For fig. I.24, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō: Nihon bukkyō 1300 nen no genryū* [Sacred Ningbo: Gateway to 1300 years of Japanese Buddhism] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2009), 93; for fig. I.25, see Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Meikai no sabaki: Enma sama to jigoku no sekai* (Yokkaichi: Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, 2001), 13; and fig. I.26, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma Jūō zō," 6.

⁸⁷ For more discussion on the Seiganji set, see Kajitani, "Nihon ni okeru Jūō zu no seiritsu to tenkai," 87-91.

⁸⁸ Nakano Teruo, "Enma Jūō zō," 52-55.

⁸⁹ Although debatable, Nison'in set is attributed to Tosa Yukimitsu 土佐行光 (active 1352–89), while Jōfukuji set is rather firmly identified with Tosa Mitsunobu 土佐光信 (1434–1525). For more information on Nison'in set, see

In most of the above-mentioned Japanese scrolls of the Ten Kings, each king is depicted with his other manifestation. In other words, "each king came to be considered a manifestation of a *honji butsu* 本地仏 (original-ground buddha), a higher order being—but not always a Buddha—who in this case embodied the promise of salvation." For instance, Jizō is portrayed floating above Enma, as other buddhas or bodhisattvas are suspended above the other nine kings. Such *honji butsu* relates to and evolves from the *honji suijaku* 本地垂迹 (original ground and manifested trace) system that had come to indicate equivalencies between Buddhist deities and local, native deities called *kami* in Japan since the twelfth century. 91

Controversies remain over the precise origin and background of depicting Ten Kings with their correspondences of Buddhist deities. For example, compared to Japanese paintings of the Ten Kings, most Ningbo scrolls do not incorporate *honji butsu* above the kings except the Kanazawa Bunko set and Jōkyōji set bearing the signatures of Lu Xinzhong. It is probable that Japanese sponsors might have specifically requested those two sets to be painted in that way, or that the paintings might have been altered or painted in Japan. ⁹² More solid evidence for the Chinese antecedent is found in the monumental stone carvings at Baodingshan 實頂山, Dazu (fig. I.27). ⁹³ This sculptural tableau, dating to between 1174 and 1252, shows, from top to bottom register, the ten buddhas and bodhisattvas inside circles, the Ten Kings with two court

Kajitani, "Nihon ni okeru Jūō zu no seiritsu to tenkai," 91-93 and Watanabe, "Traveling Across the Sea," 46-52. For more discussion on the Jōfukuji set as well as the relationship between Nison'in set and Jōfukuji set, see Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 129-142.

⁹⁰ Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 123.

⁹¹ Hirasawa in her article "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution" gives a useful overview of the development of the idea portraying Ten Kings with their other manifestations. See Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution," 23-27. For a fuller discussion of the *honji suijaku* system in terms of *kami*, see Mark Teeuwen and Fabio Rambelli, eds., *Buddhas and Kami in Japan: Honji Suijaku as a Combinatory Paradigm* (London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003), 1-53.

⁹² Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution," 25.

⁹³ For more information on these stone carvings, see Arami Hiroshi, "Daisoku Hōchōsan sekkutsu *Jigokuhen gan* seiritsu no haikei nit suite" [On the background of the creation of *The Niche of Transformation Tableau of Hell* at the Baodingshan cave in Dazu], *Etoki kenkyū* 16 (2002): 16-52. For the image, see Howard, *Summit of Treasures*, 48-49, 51.

officials, and various hell scenes. In the center of the rows of the Ten Kings and the ten buddhas and bodhisattvas sits Jizō bodhisattva. This example challenged the well-established Japanese conception that the *honji butsu* above each king in Japanese Ten Kings scrolls is exclusively Japanese. However, the Baodingshan combinations between the Ten Kings and the Buddhist deities "do not correspond to any known groupings in Japanese texts or images of the kings."

Although it is still undetermined whether the *honji butsu* connections in Japanese Ten Kings imageries directly originated in Chinese models, the relationship of each king to a Buddhist counterpart has been continuously emphasized in Japan. The thirteenth-century Japanese apocryphal sutra *Jizō jūō kyō*, which worked as the fundamental source for understanding Ten Kings, associated all the kings with Buddhist divinities whom Japanese populace at the time were familiar. Table 1 below shows the Japanese names of the Ten Kings and the names of their *honji butsu* counterparts.

Ten Kings Honji Butsu 1 Shinkō 秦広 Fudō Myōō 不動明王 2 Shokō 初江 Shaka Nyorai 釈迦如来 3 Sōtei 宗帝 Monju Bosatsu 文殊菩薩 4 Gokan 五官 Fugen Bosatsu 普賢菩薩 5 Enma 閻魔 Jizō Bosatsu 地蔵菩薩 6 Hensei 変成 Miroku Bosatsu 弥勒菩薩 7 Taizan 太山 Yakushi Nyorai 薬師菩薩 8 Byōdō 平等 Kannon Bosatsu 観音菩薩 9 Toshi 都市 *Ashuku Nyorai 阿閦如来 10 Godō Tenrin 五道転輪 Amida Nyorai 阿弥陀如來

Table 1. Ten Kings and *Honji Butsu*⁹⁵

Another Japanese Buddhist text entitled *Shiju hyaku innenshū* 私聚百因縁集 (Personal Collection of Numerous Stories on Causes and Conditions) compiled by the Japanese monk

_

⁹⁴ Hirasawa, "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution," 24.

⁹⁵ The correspondences of Ten Kings to Buddhist deities in this table are based on *Jizō jūō kyō*. See Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 183-277.

^{*}Shiju hyaku innenshū has Seishi Bosatsu 勢至菩薩 instead of Ashuku Nyorai.

Jūshin 住信 (1210—?) in 1257 and disseminated by itinerant preachers of Pure Land faith also articulates a pattern of buddha and bodhisattva correspondences similar to that of *Jizō jūō kyō*. 96 In addition to these textual sources, the images associated with Ten Kings indicate the significance of Ten Kings' relation to their Buddhist deities. Countless sets of individual hanging scrolls of the Ten Kings produced in Japan illustrate their Buddhist counterparts. Moreover, other types of paintings correlated to Ten Kings, such as *Jūō jigoku zu* 十王地獄図 (paintings of the Ten Kings and hell), incorporate the *honji butsu* of Ten Kings (fig. 1.28). 97 The Ten Kings hall at Jimokuji 甚目寺 in Aichi Prefecture enshrines a rare example of the Ten Kings sculptures presumably from the Nanboku-chō period (1336—1392) that have small images of the *honji butsu* of Ten Kings in the middle of their hats. 98 In this manner, Buddhist manifestations of the Ten Kings had become widely adopted by the Japanese populace. Accordingly, the popularity of Ten Kings seems to have also increased.

In Japan, apart from images of the Ten Kings per se, several pictures of Enma alone or combined with Jizō or hell scenes have survived, demonstrating the greater significance of Enma. ⁹⁹ As a case in point, in the thirteenth-century set of fifteen *rokudōe* hanging scrolls at Shōjuraigōji, Shiga Prefecture, one painting depicts Enma in his court (fig. I.29). ¹⁰⁰ The red-faced Enma with an open mouth, wearing Chinese garb, sits at a desk inside the lavish-looking

⁹⁶ Buddhist counterparts corresponding to the Ten Kings in *Shiju hyaku innenshū* follow those in *Jizō jūō kyō* with the exception of King Toshi. Different schools of Buddhism suggest other less common patterns. Shimizu Kunihiko, "Jizō jūō kyō kō" [Thoughts on the sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings], *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 51, no. 1 (2002): 191-192.

⁹⁷ For the image, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran: jigoku zōshi kara Tateyama mandara made* [Excursion to hell: from hell scroll to Tateyama mandala] (Toyama Prefecture: Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, 2001), 39.

⁹⁸ For the images, see Mitsui Kinen Bijutsukan, Ryūkoku Daigaku Ryūkoku Myūjiamu, and NHK Puromōshon, eds., *Jigokue wandārando: tokubetsuten* [Special exhibition on the wonderland of Buddhist hell scenes] (Tokyo: NHK Puromōshon, 2017), 55 and 56

⁹⁹ In addition to illustrated Ten Kings sutras, individual icons of Jizō attended by the kings, and hanging scroll sets of Ten Kings, there are a variety of pictures incorporating the Ten Kings with images of the Ten Worlds, six paths, or hell scenes.

¹⁰⁰ This painting is examined in detail in Izumi, Makoto, and Yamamoto, eds., *Kokuhō Rokudōe*, 329-334.

building. The lower half of the painting displays Enma's record-keepers and assistants as well as demons torturing the dead. *Enmaō zu* 閻魔王図 (Paintings of King Enma) at Chōsenji 長泉寺, Osaka, purportedly created during the late Kamakura period, similarly shows a red-faced Enma attended by his functionaries in his court (fig. I.17). In other paintings, Enma appears in a part of the scene, although not acting as the protagonist. For instance, Enma pays homage to Jizō who appears in his court, as seen in *Jizō bosatsu reigenki e* 地蔵菩薩霊験記絵 (The Illustrated Miraculous Interventions of Jizō Bodhisattva) from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries at Freer Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C. (fig. I.30). ¹⁰¹ Moreover, paintings, including *Yūzū nenbutsu engi e* 融通念仏縁起絵 (Paintings of the Origins and History of Yūzū Nenbutsu Faith) and *Yata Jizō engi e* 矢田地蔵縁起絵 (Paintings of the Origins and History of Jizō Image at Yatadera), narrate protagonists' visit to hell and encounter with Enma (figs. I.31-32). ¹⁰²

The sculptures of Ten Kings, which have been created since the Kamakura period, may be divided into three configuration types, regardless of their size (see Table 2). In particular, the sculptures in Type I and Type II that prevalently appeared in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries suggest the styles of sculptural configuration that had begun to evolve in Japan.

Table 2. Configuration Types of the Ten Kings Sculptures

Type I	Enma
Type II	Enma with attendant figures
Type III	Ten Kings
	Ten Kings with attendant figures

36

¹⁰¹ For the image, see Umezu Jirō, ed., *Shinshū Nihon emakimono zenshū* [New edition of the collection of Japanese handscrolls], vol. 29 (Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1980), plate 4.

¹⁰² For fig. I.31, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma Jūō zō," 72. For fig. I.32, see Machida Shiritsu Kokusai Hanga Bijutsukan, *Sukui no hotoke: Kannon to Jizō no bijutsu* [Buddha to the rescue: art of Kannon and Jizō] (Tokyo: Machida Shiritsu Kokusai Hanga Bijutsukan, 2010), 146.

Type I is a single sculpture of Enma. It seems that Enma halls enshrining a single sculpture of Enma were established in different parts of Japan. For example, as the Edo period gazetteer Settsu meisho zue 摂津名所図会 (Illustrations of Famous Places in Settsu Province, 1796–1798) shows, the Gappōgatsuji Enmadō 合邦辻閻魔堂, in Osaka, had a single image of Enma inside its hall (fig. I.33). 103

Type II includes images of Enma as the central image with a few other less significant figures, such as Shiroku, Shimei, Kushōjin, Taizan Fukun, Godō Tenrin, and/or Datsueba 奪衣婆 (old hag who strips clothes). 104 Shiroku and Shimei both represent Enma's assistants and play roles as record-keepers who keep track of the wrongdoings of the dead and Enma's judgment of the deceased. Generally, Shiroku holds a brush and a long board, while Shimei opens a scroll and reads it. As a pair of gods, Kushōjin affix themselves to a person's right and left shoulders at the time of a person's birth and then record the person's good and bad deeds throughout the person's life, and when the person dies, they report their findings to Enma. 105 The sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji in this study also belong to Type II if their original configuration formed a triad. The configuration of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Three.

Type III consists of sets of Ten Kings or Ten Kings with other attendants, including Shiroku, Shimei, Kushōjin, Datsueba, or Kisotsu 鬼卒 (hell jailer). In particular, some Type III sets of the Ten Kings have the Enma image as the largest one, whereas other sets of Ten Kings

¹⁰³ For the image, see Akisato Ritō, *Settsu meisho zue* 摂津名所図会 [Illustrations of famous places in Settsu province], vol. 2 (Osaka: Morimototasuke, 1796–1798). "Kotenseki Sogo Database: Japanese & Chinese Classics," Waseda University Library, accessed April 5, 2017,

http://archive.wul.waseda.ac.jp/kosho/bunko30/bunko30_e0222/bunko30_e0222_0002/bunko30_e0222_0002.html. ¹⁰⁴ Datsueba sits at the edge of the Sanzu River in the underworld and strips the sinners of their clothes. She will be discussed in the fourth chapter of this dissertation.

¹⁰⁵ Kuno Takeshi, ed., *Edo butsuzō zuten* [Illustrated dictionary of Edo Buddhist sculptures] (Tokyo: Tokyodō Shuppan, 1994), 153.

En'nōji 円応寺, a sub-temple of the Zen monastery Kenchōji 建長寺, in Kamakura (fig. I.34). 106
The Enma hall built in 1250 at En'nōji enshrines a large, carved Enma as the dominant, central image flanked by sculptures of other nine kings, Shiroku and Shimei (or two Kushōjin),
Datsueba, a hell jailer, and *dandadō*. 107 In contrast to the En'nōji sculptures that include the Enma image as the biggest one, there are sets in which Ten Kings are treated equally. Despite Enma's prominence, they are all of the same size. For instance, Jōnenji 常念寺, in Kyoto, has Ten Kings sculptures of the same size, in addition to two Kushōjin and Datsueba (fig. I.35). 108
Based on the inscriptions on Godō Tenrin and one Kushōjin, we know that these thirteen sculptures were created by Chinkei 珍慶 from 1474 to 1476 during the Muromachi period. 109

Since the sculptures of Ten Kings have been enshrined in many temples throughout

Japan, the temples and their sculptures listed above are only a few examples. Nevertheless, these examples give us an idea of the different configuration types of sculptural Ten Kings. In Types I and II, the Enma sculpture alone represents the Ten Kings. While most of the Kamakura-period sculptures of the Ten Kings belong to Type II, Type III seems to have become popular during the Muromachi period. By the seventeenth century, however, Type II began to appear more frequently. Moreover, throughout the Edo period, sculptures of Ten Kings continuously appear in the configurations of Type I and Type III. Such a tendency echoes that Enma has come to be considered as the representative of the Ten Kings of the underworld. The sculptures at

¹⁰⁶ For the images, see *Jigoku to gokuraku ga wakaru hon: 'ano yo' to Nihonjin no dōtokukan* (Tokyo: Futabasha, 2012), 76-77, 81.

¹⁰⁷ Among those sculptures at En'nōji, the sculptures of Enma, King Shokō, Shiroku and Shimei (or two Kushōjin), and Hell's Jailer were made during the Kamakura period. The seated statue of Enma is the largest of all the sculptures, facing the viewer, wearing a cap with the Chinese character *wang*, or king, and holding a scepter. The seated statue of Shokō, one of the Ten Kings, has an inscription inside it with the date 1251 and the name of the sculptor Kōyū 幸有. See Nakano Teruo, "Enma Jūō zō," 85, and Noma Seiroku, *The Arts of Japan: Ancient and Medieval* (Tokyo: Kodansha International LTD., 1965), 219.

¹⁰⁸ For the image, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma Jūō zō," 94.

¹⁰⁹ Saitō Ryūichi, ed., *Dōkyō no bijutsu* [Art of Taoism] (Osaka: Yomiuri Shinbun Osaka Honsha, 2009), 336.

Rokuharamitsuji belonged to the Type II group, which seems to have been the most common type created during the Kamakura period.

Conclusion

This chapter has examined Chinese and Japanese textual sources, including scriptures and literary sources, on Ten Kings, and their diverse visual interpretations both in painted and sculptural forms. Utilizing such textual and visual sources, I have tried to trace the origin, identify the nature, and reconstruct a broad history of Ten Kings beliefs in Japan. This attempt is the first step to understanding the development of the Ten Kings cult, which is necessary for the study of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma and his entourage.

The early tenth-century Chinese sutra Shiwang jing, its Japanese version Jizō jūō kyō, and other Japanese literary writings explained the characters of the Ten Kings ruling the underworld and exerting their influence on the deceased. Among the Ten Kings, Enma, who came to be regarded as the foremost king of the afterworld by the Japanese populace, transformed from a heavenly being to a judge or king of the dead. Ten Kings had been prevalently represented in various art forms in the ninth and tenth centuries in China, and by the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, each king had been given more importance and sovereignty, which led to the depiction of Ten Kings in individual hanging scrolls both in China and Japan. Most Japanese scrolls of the Ten Kings incorporated the honji butsu manifestations of the kings. Although it is still undetermined whether honji butsu connections originated directly in China, around the thirteenth century, the Japanese populace appears to have been familiar with the counterparts, which were mentioned in the thirteenth-century Japanese apocryphal sutra Jizō jūō kyō. Furthermore, in Japanese sculpture, starting in the Kamakura period, Ten Kings appeared in the form of a single Enma; Enma with a few attendant figures; and sets of Ten Kings. As a triad, the Rokuharamitsuji

sculptures of Enma and his entourage seem to be typical of the Kamakura period. Thus, by the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries when the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group was created, the once foreign beliefs in the Ten Kings had been successfully incorporated into the Japanese context.

Chapter Two

Embracing Death and Afterlife in Rokuhara

The concept of Ten Kings, who determined the fate of the deceased in their immediate courts, was introduced to the Japanese populace as early as the eleventh century¹ and burgeoned in Japan by the thirteenth century through a variety of Chinese and Japanese textual sources and visual interpretations. While the Rokuharamitsuji Enma and two assistant officials from the thirteenth or fourteenth century exemplify the popularization of the Ten Kings cult in Japan, the later addition of Datsueba to the triad in 1629 reveals the evolution of the Enma and Ten Kings cult through the incorporation of Japanese popular beliefs in Datsueba.

This chapter situates this sculptural group of Enma and his associates at Rokuharamitsuji within the history of the temple and its surrounding area, namely Rokuhara 六波羅, which is on the east side of modern Kyoto. I explain the role of its founder Kūya 空也 (903–972) in the founding of the temple next to a graveyard, reconstruct a history of the temple from the tenth to seventeenth centuries, and discuss possible patrons and worshippers through temple records, gazetteers, other historical records, literature, and relevant legends. By doing so, I argue that Rokuharamitsuji and its Enma entourage sculptures were placed in an ideal area named Rokuhara that was aligned with the concept of death and afterlife and encouraged the worship of Ten Kings among believers and sponsors from diverse social classes. Moreover, the faith in Jizō and Kannon bodhisattvas promoted at the temple from the twelfth to seventeenth centuries was

_

¹ This date was surmised from the fact that the Japanese pilgrim and Tendai monk Jōjin 成尋 (1011–1081) was known to have obtained the early tenth century text entitled *Shiwang jing* 十王經 (*Scripture on the Ten Kings*), the earliest scriptural foundation of the Ten Kings belief, during his travels to China. However, even before the introduction of this sutra, Japanese learned of Enma through Japanese literary texts such as *Nihon ryōiki* 日本霊異記 (Record of miraculous events in Japan) from 787–824. For more information, see Chapter One of this dissertation.

believed to bolster the chances to receive a favorable judgement from Ten Kings and attain salvation from the sufferings they might encounter in the underworld, which resulted in a wide spectrum of potential devotees and patrons of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma and his entourage.

The Founding of Rokuharamitsuji

Rokuharamitsuji was salvation-oriented from its beginning and became a highly significant temple in Japanese Buddhist art history on account of its founder Kūya, a major proponent of Pure Land Buddhism, one of the most widely practiced traditions of Buddhism in Japan. Pure Land Buddhism focuses on attaining salvation and entry into the Pure Land of Amida Buddha after death. Kūya was famous for spreading this faith in Amida Buddha among the common people by chanting "Namu Amida butsu," the *nenbutsu* (repetition of the name of Amida Buddha) prayer to Amida Buddha, while dancing and beating a gong as he roamed the streets of Kyoto. Rokuharamitsuji enshrines a sculpture of Kūya wearing a gong and holding a mallet in his right hand and a staff topped with a deer antler in his left hand (fig. II.1).² From his mouth six figures of Buddha come out, each one symbolizing one character from the chant "namu-a-mi-da-butsu." This visual representation of Kūya made by Kōshō 康勝 (active late 12th–early 13th c.), a son of the renowned Kamakura-period sculptor Unkei 運慶 (ca. 1150–1223), seems to have established a strong presence of Kūya, who sought salvation of people, at Rokuharamitsuji.³

While the origin of Rokuharamitsuji begins with Kūya, its founding year differs depending on historical records. In 951 when a terrible plague occurred in Kyoto, Kūya is said to

_

² For the image, see Kawasaki Junshō and Taki Shūzō, Rokuharamitsuji (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 2007), 24.

³ Rokuharamitsuji first belonged to the Tendai school in 977, and in 1595, the temple became a branch temple of the Shingon temple Chishakuin 智積院 in Kyoto.

have carved a sculpture of Eleven-headed Kannon and pulled it around the city in a cart to stop the plague and pray for the souls who had died of the plague. Kūya then requested imperial permission from Emperor Murakami 村上天皇 (r. 946–967) to found a temple, which later became Rokuharamitsuji, and enshrined the Eleven-headed Kannon sculpture as the main image at the temple, as indicated in the Kyoto guidebook *Kyōuchi mairi* 京内まいり (Visiting Kyoto) published by Tsuji Kanjūrō 辻勘重郎 in 1708 and another Kyoto guidebook Miyako meishoguruma 都名所車 (Famous Places in Kyoto on Wheels) written by Ikeda Tōri 池田東籬 (1788–1857) in 1830.4 According to Rokuharamitsuji engi 六波羅蜜寺縁起 (Origins and History of Rokuharamitsuji) written in 1122, which records the temple's founding story, however, Kūya founded the temple between 961 and 964 (応和 Ōwa era) and first named it Saikōji 西光寺.5 The name Saikōji is associated with the solicitation campaign that Kūya performed all his life while reciting the Amida prayer. Despite the discrepancy over its founding date, the origin of Rokuharamitsuji can be traced back to Kūya who strove to spread the Pure Land teachings and proselytize *nenbutsu* practice as a means for the Japanese populace to obtain salvation.

The twelfth-century Fusō ryakki 扶桑略記 (A Brief History of Japan) recorded that in 963 Kūya held a ceremony upon completing the transcription of six hundred volumes of the Daihannyagyō 大般若経 (Great Perfection of Wisdom Sutra) in gold ink at a hall that Kūya built

⁴ Kyōuchi mairi in Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Shinshū Kyoto sōsho [New edition of Kyoto series], vol. 5 (Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967-76), 437; Miyako meishoguruma (1830) in Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Shinshū Kyōto sōsho [New edition of Kyoto series], vol. 5 (Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1976), 497.

⁵ The original text of *Rokuharamitsuji engi* can be found at Kunaichō Shoryōbu, ed., *Fushimi no Miyake Kujōke kyūzō: shoji engishū* [Collection of the history of various temples in old possessions of the Fushiminomiya family and the Kujō family], *Zushoryō sōkan* (Tokyo: Kunaichō Shoryōbu, 1970), 53-58.

⁶ Itō Yuishin, *Jōdo no shōja: Kūya* [Sage of the Pure Land: Kūya] (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2005), 74.

temporarily on the east bank of the Kamo River, inviting six hundred monks.⁷ This hall has been regarded as the origin of Rokuharamitsuji. Some features of this *Daihannyagyō* ceremony⁹ continued at Rokuharamitsuji. In other words, Rokuharamitsuji carried on the tradition of engaging people from different social classes that Kūya initiated through the *Daihannyagyō* ceremony. According to Nihon kiryaku 日本紀略 (Summary of Japanese Chronologies), the imperial court grant coins for the *Daihannyagyō* ceremony, and many court nobles, including Fujiwara no Saneyori 藤原実頼 (900–970), the Senior Minister, joined the ceremony to make a connection with Buddha. 10 Besides court nobles, however, commoners were both physically and symbolically involved in the ceremony. For example, Kūya read ganmon 願文 (Buddhist prayers) written by the highly educated bureaucrat Miyoshi no Michimune 三善道統 (?-?) on behalf of people who attended the ceremony: "We ... pray for the peace of the Emperor's reign and his body, for the equal salvation of various lords, all the officials, priests, laymen, and people of all ranks, and for the salvation of all creatures across the distinction of life and death." 11 This ganmon clearly indicates the intention of including all of the populace regardless of their class. Moreover, for the midday meal prepared for the memorial service, about one hundred beggars and monks gathered. 12 Thus, Kūya's ceremony was even open to beggars, the lowest class of Japanese society.

-

⁷ Fusō ryakki in Katsumi Kuroita and Kokushi Taikei Henshūkai, ed., Kokushi taikei [A survey of national history], vol. 12 (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 1965), 241.

⁸ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū [Research on Rokuharamitsuji] (Kyoto: Sōgeisha, 1975), 27-28.

⁹ The process of this *Daihannyakyō* ceremony is detailed in the prayer written by Miyoshi Michimune 三善道統 that is included in the *Honchō monzui* 本朝文粋, the mid Heian-period collection of Chinese prose and poetry. ¹⁰ Itō, *Jōdo no shōja*, 42.

¹¹ The original text can be found at Ōsone Shōsuke, Kinpura Tadashi, and Gōto Akio, ed., *Honchō monzui* vol. 13 [Literary essence of our court], Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikei 27 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1992), 359-360. ¹² Itō, *Jōdo no shōja*, 42.

Moreover, during the day *gigaku* 伎楽 dance and music performances were dedicated, while dragon and phoenix (or water-bird) 竜頭鷁首 (ryōtōgekishu) boats were rowed in the Kamo River as an offering. 13 At night a ceremony of 10,000 lamps 万灯会 (Mandōe) was held, a bodhisattva ordination 菩薩戒 (bosatsukai) was conducted, and a prayer to Amida was recited.¹⁴ Mandōe is an offering of 10,000 lamps or lanterns to a buddha or bodhisattva as a prayer not only for the eradication of sin and defilement but also for the deceased. When the main hall of Rokuharamitsuji was dismantled and repaired from 1965 to 1968, several shallow earthenware bowls with residue of burned oil were discovered underneath the inner sanctum of the main hall. Those bowls dating to the end of the Heian period prove the *Mandōe* was practiced at that time. This practice still occurs at Rokuharamitsuji every year for three days from the eighth to the tenth day of August. As Kūya's Daihannyakyō ceremony aimed to save people of all ranks, Mandōe performed during such a ceremony must have sought the salvation of both nobles and commoners. The lamps lighted by commoners might have been regarded more precious than those by nobles, as, in Asheshiwang shouji jing 阿闍世王授決經 (The Sutra on the Prediction of King Ajātashatru) translated into Chinese by Faju 法炬 (fl. ca. 290-306) in the fourth century, it is recorded that, while 10,000 lamps offered by King Ajātashatru were extinguished by the wind, the fire of a lamp lighted by a poor old woman kept burning. ¹⁶ The continuation of *Mandōe* at Rokuharamitsuji, therefore, attests to the temple's all-embracing nature emphasized by Kūya.

_

¹³ As a religious masked drama-dance, *gigaku* was performed for the Japanese royal court at Buddhist ceremonies from the seventh to the tenth century. During the Heian period, aristocrats enjoyed the pastime watching musical and dance performances by entertainers aboard *ryōtōgekishu* boats on the ponds of their mansions. For more information on *ryōtōgekishu* boats, see Kyungwon Choe, "Marginalized yet Devoted: Buddhist Paintings Commissioned by Nuns of the Early Joseon Palace Cloisters" (PhD diss., University of Kansas, 2011), 192-198.

¹⁴ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 28.

¹⁵ Kon Tōkō, Kobayashi Gō, and Gorai Shigeru, *Kūya no tera: Rokuharamitsuji* [Kūya's temple: Rokuharamitsuji] (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1969), 167.

¹⁶ T 509:777, SAT Daizōkyō Text Database, accessed March 1, 2018, http://21dzk.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/SAT/ddb-sat2.php?mode=detail&useid=0509.

Kūya also made an effort to relieve the suffering of the dead, and his intention was honored at Rokuharamitsuji. According to Kūyarui 空也誄, a eulogy for Kūya written by Minamoto Tamenori 源為憲 (?–1011) in the 970s, when Kūya saw abandoned skeletal remains, he burned them and chanted the *nenbutsu*. ¹⁷ *Kūyarui* offers another episode involving Kūya's disciple, Fujiwara no Morouji 藤原師氏 (913–970), who was a chief councilor of the third senior court rank and the chief supervisor of Mutsu and Dewa provinces. When Morouji died in the seventh month of 970, he was buried on a hill in Higashiyama. 18 Kūyarui narrates that,

Having buried [Morouji] on the hill in Higashiyama, Kūya took a piece of paper, dipped a brush in ink, wrote a letter, and sent it to the palace of Enraō [Enma]. The letter stated, "A certain chief councilor of Japan in Senbushū¹⁹ is a patron of Kūya. There is a limit to life and death, and [Morouji] has gone to the other world before me. [Enraō], know the circumstances of Maō [a demonic being who keeps people from following Buddhism] and have mercy [upon Morouji]." [Kūya] let the Deputy discipliner Yokei approach [Morouji's] coffin and read this letter. As the letter was burned, the mourners looked sorrowful with changed complexions.²⁰

This hagiographic episode indicates that Kūya intended to save the deceased by asking Enma, the ruler of the underworld. Succeeding Kūya, Rokuharamitsuji has remained heavily involved in funeral processions and burials over the centuries.

Kūya's legacy continued at Saikōji, that is, Rokuharamitsuji, through a Tendai monk named Chūshin 中信 (active 10th c.). After Kūya passed away in 972 at Saikōji, the temple was

¹⁸ Itō, Jōdo no shōia, 44.

¹⁷ Kon, Kobayashi, and Gorai, Kūya no tera, 152.

¹⁹ As written in $K\bar{u}varui$, it refers to an island south of Mount Sumeru where people of this world live in Buddhist cosmology. See Clark Chilson, "Eulogizing Kūya as More than a Nenbutsu Practitioner: A Study and Translation of the Kūyarui," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 34, no. 2 (2007): 322. ²⁰ Itō, *Jōdo no shōja*, 44.

not systematically managed. The six hundred volumes of the *Daihannyagyō* in gold ink, which Kūya had transcribed, were moved to a sub-temple of the nearby Kiyomizudera 清水寺, and a few documents were lost.²¹ In 976 a huge earthquake hit Japan and destroyed some temples, including Tōji 東寺, Saiji 西寺, Gokurakuji 極楽寺, and Engakuji 円覚寺.²² Even at Kiyomizudera, which is located very close to Saikōji more than fifty people were crushed to death.²³ Saikōji must have been affected by the earthquake as well. In 977 Chūshin revived Saikōji as a Tendai branch temple, built new buildings, and changed its name to Rokuharamitsuji. The word rokuharamitsu 六波羅蜜, which the name is based upon, refers to the six virtues or perfections a Buddha to be practices to attain supreme enlightenment, namely generosity, proper conduct, patience, diligence, contemplation, and wisdom. The change of name from Saikōji to Rokuharamitsuji expanded the promise of extensive activities beyond the devotion to Amida Buddha.²⁴ Incorporating the forms of belief in seeking rebirth in the Pure Land, every day for four days in every third month of each year, Chūshin held a Kugee 供花会 (a ceremony to offer flowers to the Buddha) by conducting *Hokke hakkō* 法華八講 (Eight Lectures on the *Lotus Sutra*) during the day and praying devoutly to Amida Buddha at night.²⁵ Chūshin not only reorganized the temple, but also systemized Kūya's faith in salvation in Amida Buddha's Pure Land.

Rokuharamitsuji in Rokuhara

-

²¹ Rokuharamitsuji, *Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten: shomin no kokoro ni ikita Kūya no tera* [Exhibition on Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto: Kūya's temple that lived in the heart of people] (Tokyo: Otsuka Kōgeisha, 1973), 27.

²² Itō, *Jōdo no shōja*, 48.

²³ Itō, Jōdo no shōja, 48.

²⁴ Itō, Jōdo no shōja, 76.

²⁵ Gōto, ed., *Honchō monzui* vol. 10, 292.

Rokuharamitsuji and its sculptures of Enma and his entourage were situated in a location both physically and conceptually related to death and the afterlife. This area called Rokuhara 六波羅 extended from Matsubaradōri 松原通 to Shichijōōjidōri 七条大路通 on the eastern side of the Kamo River. At present, however, the name indicates the school district Rokuhara 六原学区 (Rokuhara gakku) in Higashiyama ward (fig. II.2).²⁶ When Emperor Kanmu 桓武天皇 (r. 781–806) relocated the capital from Nara to Heian, present-day Kyoto, in 794, the layout of the capital was planned as a square grid in accordance with the principles of Chinese geomancy. The capital, Heiankyō 平安京 (794–1867), was entirely built on the western side of the Kamo River in an orderly and geometric manner (fig. II.3).²⁷ While the purity and symbolic power of the emperor resided on western side of the Kamo River, the eastern side, namely the Rokuhara area, was considered impure and polluted due to its association with death.

Rokuhara was the entrance to a graveyard called Toribeno 鳥部野/鳥辺野 sited around the foot of the Amidagamine Peak 阿弥陀ヶ峰 of Higashiyama Mountain, and because of its proximity to the graveyard, Rokuhara was known as the land of the dead, where corpses and skulls were cast away and abandoned. Moreover, even the very name of the area originated from the association with death. Formerly, the area was called "dokurohara" 髑髏原, which referred to a field of skulls, since commoners in Kyoto generally left corpses there without burying them. ²⁸ Before Toribeno was developed, discarded bones and bodies were found by the banks of the Kamo River. *Shoku Nihon kōki* 続日本後紀 (Later Chronicle of Japan, Continued), the Japanese

²⁶ For the image, see supplementary map from Kiyomizuderashi Hensan Iinkai, ed., *Kiyomizudera shi: kaisō sen nihyakunen kinen* [History of Kiyomizudera: The 1200th anniversary of the foundation] (Kyoto: Otowasan Kiyomizudera, Seisaku Hatsubai Hōzōkan, 1995-2000).

²⁷ For the image, see Matthew Stavros, *Kyoto: An Urban History of Japan's Premodern Capital* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2014), 64.

²⁸ Kaizuka Shigeki, et al. *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi* [Historical records, history of Kyoto], vol. 10 *Higashiyama ku* (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1979-1994), 20.

history text officially commissioned and completed in 869, stated that the imperial court ordered the burning of about 5,500 skeletons scattered near the banks of the Kamo River.²⁹ Moreover, during the Heian period, people in the capital regarded the Kamo riverbank as a place to dispose of corpses not only in times of wars but also in ordinary times.³⁰

Around the tenth century, Toribeno became known as a famous burial ground or graveyard along with Adashino 化野 in the west and Rendaino 蓮台野 in the north of the city. The eleventh-century historical text *Nihon kiryaku* recorded that Imperial Prince Tsuneyo 恒世 親王 (805–826), a son of Emperor Junna 淳和天皇 (r. 823–833), and Imperial Princess Toshiko 俊子内親王 (?–826), a daughter of Emperor Saga 嵯峨天皇 (r. 809–823), were buried in Toribeno. Toribeno also had imperial mausoleums for Fujiwara no Takushi 藤原沢子 (?–839), a consort of Emperor Ninmyō 仁明天皇 (r. 833–850), and Fujiwara no Teishi 藤原定子 (977–1001), empress of Emperor Ichijō 一条天皇 (r. 986–1011). Other imperial families and nobles cremated in Toribeno include Fujiwara no Onshi 藤原穏子 (885–954), the second empress of Emperor Daigo 醍醐天皇 (r. 897–930); Fujiwara no Senshi 藤原詮子 (962–1002), a consort of Emperor Enyū 円融天皇 (r. 969–984); Fujiwara no Michinaga 藤原道長 (966–1028), one of the most powerful regents in the Heian period; and Fujiwara no Kenshi 藤原賢子 (1057–1084), empress of Emperor Shirakawa 白河天皇 (r. 1073–1087).

²⁹ Yamada Kunikazu, *Kyoto toshishi no kenkyū* [Research on the city history of Kyoto] (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2009), 223.

³⁰ Kaizuka, Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi, 20.

³¹ Kaizuka, Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi, 21.

³² Sections on the tenth day of the fifth month and tenth day of the sixth month of Tenchō 3 (826) in *Nihon kiryaku*, Kokushi taikei, vol. 5 (Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1897), 452-453.

³³ Yamada, *Kyoto toshishi no kenkyū*, 220.

³⁴ Kaizuka, *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi*, 21.

Nevertheless, Toribeno was by no means restricted to such imperial families or nobles. $Konjaku \ monogatari \ sh\bar{u}$ tells a related story as follows: A person with an illness, who had no place to go, arrived at Toribeno and died there. The Japanese scholar, Yamada Kunikazu, affirms that Toribeno was formed not by the government but happened naturally and although there were sections designated for certain clans, including the Fujiwara, and imperial mausoleums in the graveyard, Toribeno had no restrictions on who could be buried there. The such as t

Toribeno was located very close to Rokuhara, as depicted in the sixteenth-century *sankei mandara* 参詣曼荼羅 (shrine and temple pilgrimage mandala) of Yasaka Hōkanjitō 八坂法観寺 塔 (figs. II.4-5).³⁷ Right above the Rokuhara area, Toribeno is shown with several wooden grave markers and stone pagodas. Even to the left of the cartouche of Rokuhara can be found a stone stupa and three wooden grave markers, which suggests that Rokuhara and Toribeno shared a rather loose boundary. Situated in the Rokuhara area in proximity to the graveyard Toribeno, Rokuharmitsuji functioned as a religious service facility. As stated in the prayer from Kūya's *Daihannyakyō* ceremony at Saikōji (the future Rokuharamitsuji), in 963, a memorial service was performed even for the "bones of past and present in the wilderness" 荒原古今之骨 and the "spirits of ancestors and descendants in the mountain in the east" 東岱先後之魂.³⁸ Here, wilderness 荒原 and mountain in the east 東岱 referred to the burial grounds of Rokuhara and Toribeno.³⁹ Moreover, in 1000 a Buddhist service for Fujiwara no Teishi was conducted at Rokuharamitsuji before her body was buried on the grounds of Toribeno.⁴⁰ Thus,

³⁵ Konjaku monogatari shū, vol. 31 (Tokyo: Kondō Keizō, 1882), 45-46.

³⁶ Yamada, Kyoto toshishi no kenkyū, 252.

³⁷ For figs. II.4-5, see Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Shaji sankei mandara* [Pilgrimage mandalas of temples and shrins] (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1987), pls. 32 and 152 respectively.

³⁸ Ōsone, Kinpura, and Gōto, ed., *Honchō monzui*, 360.

³⁹ Yamada, *Kyoto toshishi no kenkyū*, 258.

⁴⁰ Kaizuka, *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi*, 21.

Rokuharamitsuji and its sculptures of Enma and his entourage were placed in an ideal neighborhood that was literally grounded in death and the afterlife.

Furthermore, the site chosen for Rokuharamitsuji and its sculptures was conceptually connected to death and the afterlife. Rokuharamitsuji is adjacent to the intersection known as Rokudō no tsuji 六道の辻 (Crossroad of the Six Paths). Rokudō no tsuji is perceived as a liminal space between this world and the next and has been said to be the entrance to the underworld where Enma resides. This connection of Rokudō no tsuji with Enma's underworld derived from a legendary story of Ono no Takamura 小野篁 (802–852), who was a scholar, poet, and courtier of the ninth century. Ono no Takamura⁴¹ is said to have worked for the Emperor Saga as a statesman during the day and at night served Enma as one of his officials (*meikan* 冥官).⁴² According to legend, when Takamura's father-in-law, Ono no Yoshisuke (Yoshimi) 小野良相 died of a disease, he was taken to Enma in the underworld and was sentenced to be punished. Then, Takamura intervened as Enma's official and asked Enma to forgive Yoshisuke. Having heard Takamura's request, Enma said "It is rather difficult, but I will let him go since you are

_

⁴¹ The biographies and legends of Ono no Takamura are narrated in setsuwa literature collections, such as Konjaku monogatari shū 今昔物語集 (12th century), Takamura monogatari 篁物語 [Tales of Takamura] (unknown), Gōdanshō 江談抄 [The Oe conversations] (ca. 1110), Kojidan 古事談 [Collection of old stories] (ca. 1212–1215), Ujishūi monogatari 宇治拾遺物語 [A collection of tales from Uji] (early thirteenth century), and Jikkinshō 十訓抄 [Miscellany of ten maxims] (ca. 1252), among others. His legend had been further elaborated by the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. For instance, the mid-and-late-fourteenth-century chronicle Teiō hennenki 帝王編年記 [Annals of the emperors] explains that "he is said to have had two lives, and to have been an incarnation of Monju." Similarly, in another fifteenth-century setsuwa collection entitled Sangoku denki 三国伝記 [Stories of Three Kingdoms], Takamura's body serves the Imperial Court, while his spirit travels to the underworld. For the cited passage in Teiō hennenki, see Kuroita and Kokushi Taikei Henshūkai, eds., Kokushi taikei, vol. 12, 2000. For Sangoku denki, see Bussho Kankōkai, ed., Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho [The collected works of Japanese Buddhism], vol. 148 (Tokyo: Meicho Furyūkai, 1983), 183-506.

⁴² Some stories specify Takamura's rank at the Court of Enma. *Gōdanshō* includes a story of Takamura saving his friend Fujiwara no Takafuji, who had died a sudden death, and in this story, Takamura is identified as the second official. In the case of *Sangoku denki*, however, Takakura is described as an incarnation of the third official. *Takamurayama Chikurinji engi* 篁山竹林寺縁起 scroll dated to the Muromachi period (1392–1573) introduces Takamura as "the third official, Sōtei-ō," namely the third King Sōtei among Ten Kings of the afterworld. For more information, see Wakabayashi, "Officials of the Afterworld," 338-341.

asking."⁴³ Upon saving Yoshisuke, Takamura told Yoshisuke not to reveal his identity to anyone. However, after returning to life, Yoshisuke told his daughter about meeting Takamura in the underworld. Having learned that his father-in-law had broken his promise, Takamura kicked the ground at Rokudō no tsuji and disappeared into the underworld (fig. II.6).⁴⁴ Accordingly, Rokudō no tsuji was believed to be a border between this world and the afterworld.

Aside from Ono no Takamura, there are stories of Enma himself revealing his presence at Rokudō no tsuji. In the Japanese classical comic theater *kyōgen* 狂言 plays, such as *Asahina* 朝 比奈 and *Yao* 八尾, Enma waits eagerly for sinners at Rokudō no tsuji. 45 For example, in the play *Asahina*, the famous warrior Asahina Saburō Yoshihide 朝比奈三郎義秀 goes to Rokudō no tsuji to meet Enma, who is catching sinners and chasing them to hell. Using his magical power, Asahina challenges Enma and asks Enma to take him to the Western paradise rather than to hell. Enma is defeated and ends up guiding Asahina to paradise. In the play *Yao*, a sinner meets Enma at Rokudō no tsuji and is about to fall into hell. However, he shows Enma a letter from Yao Jizō of Jōkōji 常光寺 in Kawachi Province 河内国 (present-day Osaka Prefecture) and then is sent to the Western paradise. As described in those *kyōgen* plays, Rokudō no tsuji is a path leading to Enma's underworld, and Enma often appeares at Rokudō no tsuji, waiting for sinners. Rokuharamitsuji was built right next to this intersection where the palace of Enma was believed to be and where Enma showed himself.

Nearby the intersection of Rokudō no tsuji are two other temples, Saifukuji 西福寺 and Rokudō Chinnōji 六道珍皇寺, also embedded in the concept of death and the afterlife. Stone

⁴³ Yoshiko Kurata Dykstra, trans., *The Konjaku Tales Japanese Section II from A Medieval Japanese Collection* (Osaka: Intercultural Research Institute, Kansai Gaidai University Publication, 1998–2003), 231.

⁴⁴ For more information, see Wakabayashi, "Officials of the Afterworld," 321-323. For the image, see Wakabayashi, "Officials of the Afterworld," 324.

⁴⁵ Kuno Akira, "Rokudō no tsuji," Nihon kenkyū 3 (September 1990): 124.

markers that read "Rokudō no tsuji" are found in front of these temples (figs. II.7-8). Situated one block north of Rokuharamitsuji, Saifukuji belongs to the Pure Land school of Buddhism and houses a seated sculpture of Amida Buddha. He temple is said to have arisen from a hall enshrining a Jizō sculpture made of clay by Kūkai 空海 (774–835), also known posthumously as Kōbō Daishi 弘法大師. He Emperor Saga's wife, Empress Danrin 擅林皇后 (786–850), who became a devout believer in Kūkai, often visited the temple and prayed to the Jizō to cure the disease of her son, later Emperor Ninmyō 仁明天皇 (r. 833–850); consequently, the Saifukuji Jizō came to be called Kosodate Jizō 子育て地蔵 (child-raising Jizō). Saifukuji also holds several paintings, such as *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* 熊野観心十界曼荼羅49 (Visualization mandala of the heart and ten worlds of Kumano) from the Muromachi period, *Kusōzu* 九相図50 (Picture of the nine stages of a decaying body) from the Edo period (1615–1867), and *Jūōzu* 十

Another temple Rokudō Chinnōji, commonly known as Rokudōsan 六道さん or Otagidera 愛宕寺, offers different versions of its founding story,⁵¹ but is widely believed to have

_

⁴⁶ Akisato Ritō, *Shūi miyako meisho zue* 拾遺都名所圖繪 [Supplementary illustrations of famous places in Kyoto], vol. 2 (Kyoto: Yoshinoyatamehachi, 1787), 165.

⁴⁷ Kanō Shin, *Rokudō no tsuji: Atari no shiseki to densetsu o tazunete* [The crossroad of the Six Paths: Visiting historic remains and legends of the neighborhood] (Kyoto: Muromachi Shōbo, 1988), 27.

⁴⁸ Kanō, *Rokudō no tsuji*, 26-27.

⁴⁹ Since the sixteenth century, *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* has functioned as a portable visual means for *Kumano bikuni* 熊野比丘尼, or Kumano nuns, to explain the concepts of heaven, earth, and hell in Buddhist cosmology by depicting the ten worlds of enlightened and non-enlightened existence. For more detail on such paintings, see Kaminishi Ikumi, *Explaining Pictures: Buddhist Propaganda and Etoki Storytelling in Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2006), 137-164.

⁵⁰ This type of painting depicting a corpse in the process of decay and decomposition is based on a Buddhist doctrine that urges contemplation on the nine stages of a decaying corpse. The earliest literary reference to *kusōzu* can be found in the historical records of the Daigoji Enma hall, which were dated to 1223. Takei Akio, "Daigoji Enmadō to sono shuhen: Senyōmonin, Kusōzu hekiga, Sōtatsu" [In and around Enmadō of Daigoji: Senyōmonin, mural painting of Kusōzu, and Sōtatsu], *Bukkyō geijutsu* 32 (January 1981): 58. The female corpse in the Saifukuji version is thought to represent Empress Danrin. For more information on *kusōzu*, see Kanda Fusae, "Behind the Sensationalism: Images of a Decaying Corpse in Japanese Buddhist Art," *The Art Bulletin* 87.1 (March 2005): 24-49

⁵¹ Oka Manami, Kyoto kisai monogatari [Tales of the geniuses of Kyoto] (Tokyo: PHP Kenkyūjo, 2013), 163-164.

been founded by Ono no Takamura. In the back garden of the main hall is a well through which Takamura is said to have gone to the underworld, and what is more, in recent years another well that Takamura is supposed to have used to return from the underworld has been discovered on the old temple grounds. The sixteenth- or seventeenth-century *sankei mandara* of Rokudō Chinnōji, which depicts the temple during the days of welcoming the spirits of the dead in the annual summer Festival for the Dead (*urabon* 盂蘭盆 or *obon* お盆), also shows one of those wells used by Takamura in its right upper corner (fig. II.9). 53

Rokudō Chinnōji also enshrines a seventeenth-century sculpture of Takamura along with a sculpture of a seated Enma dated to the Muromachi period (1392–1573) in its Enma hall or Takamura hall. Wearing a cap with hanging tails and a ceremonial court dress, which were used by Japanese civil officers, Takamura holds a *shaku* 笏, flat wooden scepter carried during imperial ceremonies, in his right hand and has an ornamental sword at his waist. He is accompanied by a jailer demon and an ogre-like officer of hell. ⁵⁴ This triad appears in the upper left corner of the Rokudō Chinnōji's sixteenth- or seventeenth-century *sankei mandara*, and next to this group is another triad consisting of a standing Enma and two assistants. Again, right above the main entrance of the temple, we can see sculpture-like seated figures of Enma flanked by his two officials. It is not clear, however, whether or not these figures correspond to the actual sculptures in the temple since the existing Enma sculpture at Rokudō Chinnōji has portrait sculptures of the monk Daihon 大本禅師 (1277–1345) and the monk Butsukan 仏観 (?-?) on

⁵² Before the discovery of this well, the well inside the abolished Fukushōji 福生寺 precinct, whose ruins are currently located in Saga Yakushiji 嵯峨葉師寺, Kyoto, used to be known as the passageway through which Ono no Takamura returned from the other world. For more details on Fukushōji, see Oka, *Kyoto kisai monogatari*, 170-171.
53 For the image, see Nagano Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Ano yo, yōkai: Shinshū ikai mangekyō* [The afterlife and monsters: A kaleidoscope of strange worlds in Shinshū] (Nagano: Nagano Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, 2003), 27.
54 For images, see Kanō, *Rokudō no tsuji*, 8-9.

either side. Nevertheless, the Enma sculpture might have been taken out of the Enma hall and placed outside for people to view on an occasion like the *obon* festival.

Another device that infuses Rokudō Chinnōji with the idea of death and the afterlife is a mukaegane 迎え鐘, which literally means a welcoming bell. The sound of this temple bell hung in a belfry located next to the Enma or Takamura hall is thought to reach into the other world and welcome departed souls home. Since the fourteenth century, the temple has allowed laypeople to ring the bell before the obon festival. This bell is also related to Ono no Takamura. According to Konjaku monogatari shū, after establishing Rokudō Chinnōji (then Otagidera), Takamura entrusted the task of creating a bell to a metal caster, who said, "I intended to make a bell that would ring by itself every two hours and twelve times a day without a person to strike it, and in order to complete it, bury it under the earth for three years and dig it up the day after those three years." Yet, being afraid of making the bell ring spontaneously, the head of the temple dug it up from the ground before three years passed, transforming the bell into a normal one. Although not ringing by itself, the bell is still believed to resound to the afterworld and summon spirits back to this world once someone strikes it by pulling its cord.

Moreover, within and around the precinct of Rokudō Chinnōji, that is, near the intersection of Rokudō no tsuji, were many *funbodō* 墳墓堂 (mausoleum halls) for the deceased. Those *funbo* halls worked as institutions where mourners were allowed to hold memorial services for the deceased for some time after his or her death and place a cinerary urn and an

⁵⁵ In Buddhism, the sound of a bell is thought to exert salvific power. According to the insciptions cast into some fourteenth-century Japanese bells, their sounds can be heard in hell, alleviating the sufferings of the dead. For more discussion on such bells, see Sherry Fowler, *Accounts and Images of Six Kannon in Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2016), 242-243.

⁵⁶ Oka, Kyoto kisai monogatari, 165.

⁵⁷ Kanō, Rokudō no tsuji, 18.

image of Buddhist deity, praying for divine protection. In 1110, Taira no Masamori 平正盛 (fl. 12th c.), a military leader who paved the way for the rise of the Taira clan, built an Amida hall 阿弥陀堂 (present-day Jōkōin 常光院), also called Rokuharadō 六波羅堂 or Masamoridō 正盛堂, in the Rokuhara area and two years later extended the hall on land borrowed from Rokudō Chinnōji. This hall seems to have been established as Masamori's personal mausoleum.

Thus, the sculptural group of Enma and his entourage enshrined at Rokuharamitsuji in the Rokuhara area is physically and conceptually linked to death and the afterlife. As Rokuhara on the eastern side of the Kamo River was adjacent to the graveyard Toribeno, this neighborhood has been regarded as the land of the dead, where one could easily encounter abandoned corpses and skulls, wooden grave tables, stone pagodas, and *funbo* halls from at least the eleventh century. Furthermore, Rokuharamitsuji is located near the intersection of Rokudō no tsuji theoretically perceived to be right above the palace of Enma, a place that Ono no Takamura, the ninth-century courtier, is believed to have frequented to serve as Enma's official.

Rokuharamitsuji For Everyone

While Rokuharamitsuji and its sculptures of Enma and his associates were situated in the Rokuhara area physically and conceptually aligned with death and the afterlife, they appear to have been accessed and supported by people from different classes, including aristocrats,

_

⁵⁸ Takahashi Masaaki, *Heike to Rokuhara bakufu* [Taira family and Rokuhara shogunate] (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 2013), 124.

⁵⁹ Takahashi Shin ichirō, Chūsei no toshi to bushi [Medieval city and samurai] (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 1996), 70. The establishment and extension of this hall was documented in Tango no kami Masamoridō kuyō ganmon 丹後守正盛堂供養願文 (Prayer for the dedication of the hall of Masamori, the governor of Tango Province) included in Gōto tokudō genganmon shū 江都督納言願文集 (The Collected Prayers of Ōe, Acting Governor General and Counselor, presumably edited by Ōe no Koreyori 大江維順 (?-?) in the mid-twelfth century). See Tokyo Teikoku Daigoku Bungakubu Shiryō Hensangakari, Dai Nihon shiryō [Histrorical sources of great Japan], vol. 3, pt. 11 (Tokyo: Tokyo Teikoku Daigaku, 1901), 112.

military leaders, and commoners. The tenth- and eleventh-century diary entitled *Shōyūki* 小右記 by Fujiwara no Sanesuke 藤原実資 (957–1046) records aristocrats' visits to Rokuharamitsuji.⁶¹ For instance, in 1029 Fujiwara no Yorimichi 藤原頼通 (992–1074) and a group of other nobles went to see the cherry blossoms in Higashiyama, and on the way to Higashiyama they visited Rokuharamitsuji; other entries in the diary indicate that Sanesuke corresponded with the head monk of the temple.⁶² In a similar vein, according to *Ryōjin hishō* 梁塵秘抄 (*Dance of the Dust on the Rafters*), the late twelfth-century anthology of *imayō* (literally modern style) compiled by Emperor Go Shirakawa 後白河天皇 (r. 1155–1158), Rokuharamitsuji was understood to be one of the spots to visit on a pilgrimage route to Kiyomizudera 清水寺.⁶³ Another aristocrat named Miyoshi Tameyasu 三善為康 (1049–1139), who wrote *Shūi ōjōden* 拾遺往生伝 (*Gleanings of Biographies of Those Reborn in the Pure Land*) and *Goshūi ōjōden* 後拾遺往生伝 (*Later Gleanings of Biographies of Those Reborn in the Pure Land*), retreated to the temple when he became eighty and prepared for his death.⁶⁴

In the twelfth century, military leaders from the Taira clan of samurai, who dominated Japanese politics at the time, established their headquarters in Rokuhara. Taira no Tadamori 平 忠盛 (1096–1153), a son of the above-mentioned Taira no Masamori, built his house between the years 1145 and 1151 and named it Ikedono 池殿, which his fifth son Yorimori 賴盛 (1131–1186) inherited later. Moreover, Tadamori's fourth son, Norimori 教盛 (1128–1185) had his residence Kadowakiden 門脇殿, and Tadamori's first son, Kiyomori 清盛 (1118–1181)

⁶¹ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 29.

⁶² Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 29.

⁶³ Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 101.

⁶⁴ Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten, 28.

⁶⁵ For more information on the Taira clan's residency in Rokuhara, see Takahashi, *Heike to Rokuhara bakufu*, 123-148.

constructed his mansion named Senden 泉殿 there as well. The Taira clan's residency in Rokuhara suggests that the Taira military leaders, who also maintained a close relationship with the imperial court, might have exerted their authority over Rokuhara and Rokuharamitsuji situated in Rokuhara.⁶⁶

Kiyomori, in particular, gained influential political power after being appointed as the first chief minister of the government from a samurai family. His residency in Rokuhara "augmented his influence by bringing to Kyoto a large contingent of his own army." He further tied himself to the imperial family by arranging a marriage between the Emperor Takakura and his daughter Tokuko 徳子 (1155–1214). In 1178, a constant sutra chanting for the safe childbirth of Tokuto commenced at Rokuharamitsuji. Rokuharamitsuji also has a thirteenth-century portrait sculpture of someone wearing a monk's robe; it is believed to depict Kiyomori, who became a monk in 1168 (fig. II.10).

After the collapse of the Taira clan in 1185, the Kamakura shogunate (feudal military government) took over the Rokuhara area. Moving political power to Kamakura, Minamoto no Yoritomo 源頼朝 (1147–1199), the first shogun (military shogun) of the Kamakura shogunate, built his new residence on the ruins of Ikedono, Taira no Yorimori's house in Rokuhara, and stayed there whenever he visited Kyoto. He also placed the office of the military governor, *shugo* 守護, in Rokuhara to oversee the affairs of the imperial court on behalf of the shogunate in Kamakura. This office was replaced by the Rokuhara *tandai* 六波羅探題 (local commissioner in Rokuhara) in 1221 after the Jōkyū Rebellion 承久の乱, the failed attempt by retired Emperor Go

⁶⁶ Emperor Go Shirakawa made an imperial visit to Kiyomori's Senden, and Emperor Takakura 高倉天皇 (r. 1168—1180) to Yorimori's Ikedono.

⁶⁷ Stavros, Kyoto: An Urban History of Japan's Premodern Capital, 84.

⁶⁸ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 33.

⁶⁹ For more discussion on the identity of this image, see Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 15.

⁷⁰ For the image, see Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 28.

Toba 後鳥羽天皇 (r. 1183–1198) to seize power from the Kamakura military government. Rokuhara *tandai* or shogunate deputies in the Rokuhara area acted as supervisors of political, military, and legal matters, for instance, appeasing disputes that broke out among religious institutions in the capital, until 1333 when the Kamakura shogunate came to an end. In the vicinity of the *tandai* office in Rokuhara stood residences of samurai and accommodations for their retainers and followers. By this time, Rokuhara administered shogunal affairs in the western provinces, turning it into a political district.

When the Rokuhara *tandai* was obliterated by the Ashikaga 足利 shogunate in 1333, Rokuharamitsuji survived. However, the fire of 1350 destroyed many buildings in the temple precinct. Between 1363 and 1366, a monk named Kanmi 観実 had solicited contributions to

71 Kimura Eiichi, "Kamakura jidai no jisha funsō to Rokuhara tandai" [Disputes among temples and shrines of the

Kamakura period and the local Rokuhara commissioner], *Shigaku zasshi* 117, no. 7 (July 2008): 1276. ⁷² Kaizuka, *Shirvō Kyōto no rekishi*, 270.

59

⁷³ Stavros, Kyoto: An Urban History of Japan's Premodern Capital, 87.

⁷⁴ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 33.

⁷⁵ Rokuharamitsuji, *Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten*, 30.

reconstruct the main hall, and several samurai participated in donating a horse and a silver sword. When the Ashikaga shogunate (1336–1573) moved its headquarters back to the eastern side of the Kamo River, the presence of samurai in Rokuhara area seems to have decreased. While the Ōnin civil war (1467–1477) and ensuing warfare severely devastated the area and Rokuharamitsuji in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, political leaders, such as Toyotomi Hideyoshi 豊臣秀吉 (1536–1598) and Tokugawa Ieyasu 徳川家康 (1543–1616), supported the revival of temples, including Rokuharamitsuji, with funding and by bestowing land on the temples. In fact, in 1589 Toyotomi Hideyoshi gave Rokuharamitsuji the rest of the materials left over from building the Hōkōji 方広寺 Daibutsu hall 大仏堂 to use to repair the halls at Rokuharamitsuji.

In 1966 during the dismantling and repairing of the main hall, about 8000 unglazed small clay stupas called *deitō* 泥塔 were discovered in the lower cornerstone of the inner sanctum pillar (fig. II.11).⁷⁹ These pagodas are about eight centimeters high, and most of them are in the shape of *gorintō* 五輪塔 or a five-ringed pagoda. Some of them have red pigment on them, and others have Sanskrit seed syllables written on them in ink. An analysis of these pagodas indicates that the clay used was plentiful in the Higashiyama area where Rokuharamitsuji is located.⁸⁰ The soil property, style, and firing method of the pagodas date them to the late Heian period or early Kamakura period.⁸¹ During the Heian and Kamakura periods, 84,000,⁸² 20,000, 10,000, or 8,400

⁷⁶ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 37.

⁷⁷ Kaizuka, *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi*, 45.

⁷⁸ Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 103.

⁷⁹ For the image, see Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 76-77.

⁸⁰ Kyoto-shi Maizō Bunzakai Kenkūjo, "Rokuharamitsuji keidai, Rokuhara seichōato" [Rokuharamitsuji precincts and the remains of Rokuhara government], *Kyoto-shi maizō bunzakai kenkūjo hakkutsu chōsa hōkoku* 2013–9 (2014): 41.

⁸¹ Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten, 19.

⁸² The dedication of 84,000 stupas, particularly, became a standard practice in the late twelfth century in Japan, which imitated the offering of the Indian King Aśoka in the third century B.C.E. For more information on the practice of donating 84,000 stupas, see Sherry Fowler, *Murōji: Rearranging Art and History at a Japanese Buddhist Temple* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005), 30.

groups of small clay stupas were made and dedicated by emperors, nobles, and high-ranking officials to pray for good health, longevity, or the birth of a son. 83 *Sankaiki* 山槐記, the diary of Nakayama Tadachika 中山忠親 (1131–1195), who was a court noble and writer, recorded that, upon hearing of Taira no Tokuto's pregnancy, the Taira family made stupas at Rokuharamitsuji, praying for the birth of a male heir and for a safe delivery. 84

Aside from aristocrats and samurai, Rokuharamitsuji also catered to commoners in Kyoto. It is possible that the pagodas found at Rokuharamitsuji were donated by commoners. *Konjaku monogatari* recounts the story of a poor woman who lived in Kyoto and was converted to Buddhism by joining a Jizō confraternity 地蔵講 (*Jizōkō*) at Rokuharamitsuji. ⁸⁵ As the story goes, she commissioned a sculpture of Jizō and gave her clothes to the sculptor as payment. Before the eye-opening of the image, however, she died and went to hell. There, she met the Jizō sculpture she had sponsored, who advised her to listen to the officers of hell regarding the methods of making amends for her sins, and if she did so, she would come back to life. One of her sins was lust, and a way to atone for lustful sin was to make a *deitō*, a clay stupa, and perform a memorial service. As this episode reveals, the production of such small mud stupas seems to have resulted from common people's longing to expiate their sins. Moreover, commoners gathered in large groups might have donated one or two clay stupas each which could amount to as many as 1,000, 2,000, or even 10,000 of them. ⁸⁶ It is also likely that the clay stupas excavated at Rokuharamitsuji were produced not for specific high-ranking petitioners,

⁸³ Rokuharamitsuji, *Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten*, 19. The practice of donating large numbers of wooden or clay stupas was considered a pious act for other reasons, including removal of harm and merit for the dead lost in battle. Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Murōji momitō no kenkyū* [Studies on momitō at Murōji] (Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppansha, 1976), 85.

⁸⁴ Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 76.

⁸⁵ See Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 32 and Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 95.

⁸⁶ Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten, 69-70.

such as emperors, nobles, and officials, but as a means of solicitation for the salvation of both nobles and commoners, which the temple performed similarly through *Mandōe* (a ceremony of offering 10,000 lamps).⁸⁷ Thus, Rokuharamitsuji was a temple that commoners frequented and there encountered the sculptural group of Enma and his entourage.

In addition to commoners, a group of outcasts or hinin 非人 might also have accessed Rokuharamitsuji and its sculptures of Enma and his entourage. Hinin, literally meaning "nonhuman," consisted of convicted criminals, the disabled, the blind, lepers, the abandoned, beggars, street performers, ascetics, and certain types of artisans.⁸⁸ Matsubara Street where Rokuaramitsuji is located merges onto Kiyomizuzaka 清水坂 or Kiyomizu Slope that leads to Kiyomizudera temple. Many hinin lived around the area of Kiyomizu Slope. An entry made in 1031 in Fujiwara Sanesuke's diary *Shōyūki* describes salt being given to those living at the foot of Kiyomizuzaka. 89 Moreover, Sankaiki, the diary of Nakayama Tadachika, has an entry dated 1158 with a passage that states: "Today when I went to pay respects to my ancestors, the hinin of the Kiyomizuzaka came begging for rice."90 While these hinin living in the neighboring area of Rokuharamitsuji were engaged in managing the vicinity around the Toribeno graveyard and in cleaning and protecting temples and shrines, they were allowed the privilege of receiving alms or food during rituals or memorial services at the temples. 91 For example, when Fujiwara no Michinaga 藤原道長 (966–1027) died in the twelfth month of 1027, rice, fish, and other kinds of food were given to the sick and the poor, namely *hinin*, at Rokuharamitsuji. 92 In 1304 when

⁸⁷ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 32.

⁸⁸ Gerald Groemer, "The Creation of the Edo Outcast Order," *Journal of Japanese Studies* 27, no. 2 (Summer 2001): 265

⁸⁹ Kaizuka, Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi, 33.

⁹⁰ Nakahara Keiji, "The Medieval Origins of the Eta-Hinin," *Journal of Japanese Studies* 5, no. 2 (Summer 1979): 389.

⁹¹ Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo, *Kyoto no burakushi: zenkindai* [Community history of Kyoto: early modern period], vol. 1 (Kyoto: Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo and Hatsubaijo Aunsha, 1984–1995), 38.

⁹² Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo, *Kyoto no burakushi*, 56.

Emperor Go Fukafusa 後深草天皇 (r. 1246–1260) held a grand Buddhist ceremony called *shichisōhōe* 七僧法会, he gave alms and food to 2,027 *hinin* in Kyoto, which included 1,000 *hinin* residing at Kiyomizuzaka. As depicted in the sixteenth-century *sankei mandara* of Yasaka Hōkanjitō, some *hinin* produced and sold arrows and bowstrings (fig. II.5). Various edicts and regulations changed the names, duties, and functions of *hinin*; however, at least until the Meiji period (1868–1912) the lodgings of the discriminated *hinin* remained in the neighboring area of Rokuhara. The presence of *hinin* outcasts in the neighborhood of Rokuharamitsuji adds another layer of diversity to the possible visitors to the temple.

Located in the Rokuhara area physically and conceptually linked to death and afterlife, Rokuharamitsuji held Buddhist lectures and ceremonies that attracted Japanese people from diverse social classes. As briefly mentioned above, the monk Chūshin, who revived Rokuharamitsuji in the tenth century, held a *Kugee* or *Kechien kugee* 結縁供花会 (a ceremony to form a karmic bond with and offer flowers to the Buddha) every day for four days in every third month of each year. According to the poetry preface that Yoshishige Yasutane 慶滋保胤 (933–1002), a literati and Confucian scholar, composed to praise the Buddha after the lectures on Lotus Sutra at one *Kechien kugee*, ⁹⁶ a crowd of lay Buddhists referred to as "good men and good women" (善男善女) of all classes from the western and eastern halves of the capital Kyoto

0

⁹³ Kiyomizuderashi Hensan Iinkai, ed., *Kiyomizudera shi 1: kaisō sen nihyakunen kinen* [History of Kiyomizudera: In commemoration of 200th anniversary of the temple's founding] (Kyoto: Otowasan Kiyomizudera and Seisaku hatsubai Hōzōkan, 1995–2000), 246.

⁹⁴ They normally made and sold arrows and bowstrings, but they functioned as a military force for the Gion Shrine in emergencies. See Kaizuka, *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi*, 33 and Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Shaji sankei mandara*, 152. For the image, see Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 3.

⁹⁵ Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo, *Kyoto no burakushi*, 235-254.

⁹⁶ At Buddhist ceremonies, such as *Kechien kugee* and *Kangakue* 勧学会 (Assembly for the Advancement of Learning), literati nobles, including Yoshishige Yasutane, composed poems relating to a phrase from the Buddhist scripture. At the Kechien kugee of Rokuharamitsuji, Yoshishige wrote a poem based on the phrase of "一称南無仏" (once exclaim, hail to the Buddha) from the *Lotus Sutra*.

gathered in the temple to hear sermons.⁹⁷ For the four days of the *Kechien kugee*, high priests from different schools of Buddhism in the southern and northern halves of Kyoto preached in order to guide all men on the first day, save all women on the second day, instruct all children on the third day, and educate all monks on the fourth day.⁹⁸ In 1507, when the main hall of Rokuharamitsuji was being repaired, the temple's sculptures including the *hibutsu* 秘仏 (hidden image) Eleven-headed Kannon sculpture were exhibited in public view. In her diary, *Nobutane kyōki* 宣胤卿記 (Diary of Nobutane), the courtier Nakamikado Nobutane 中御門宣胤 (1442–1525) recorded that during the period of public exhibition of those sculptures, a daily lecture was given, prompting a large crowd of people to visit the temple.⁹⁹ The all-embracing nature of such lectures and ceremonies at Rokuharamitsuji was enhanced as the temple became a sacred space of Jizō bodhisattya and Kannon bodhisattya.

Rokuharamitsuji As a Sacred Space of Jizō and Kannon

In Kyoto, imperial families, aristocrats, military leaders, commoners, and *hinin* outcasts were able to frequent Rokuharamitsuji due to the temple's location in Rokuhara which was associated with the notion of death and rebirth as well as the welcoming nature that its founder Kūya proclaimed and perpetuated. Moreover, as a sacred space of Jizō bodhisattva and Kannon bodhisattva, Rokuharamitsuji appealed to the Japanese populace from those different social classes. The legends and other stories regarding the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Jizō and Kannon that I will elaborate upon below suggest the patrons and clientele of the Rokuharamitsuji spanned from aristocrats with political and economic power to commoners in extreme poverty. Presumably, this wide spectrum of patrons and clientele encountered and worshipped the

⁹⁷ See Ōsone, Kinpura, and Gōto, ed., *Honchō monzui* vol. 10, 292-293, for the original text of the preface.

⁹⁸ Ōsone, Kinpura, and Gōto, ed., *Honchō monzui* vol. 10, 292.

⁹⁹ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 38.

Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma and his entourage. The presence of Jizō and Kannon, the compassionate deities related to Enma, in the same temple compound also might have maximized their belief in the benefits for rebirth.

Jizō at Rokuharamitsuji was so famous that some historical references, such as *Hyakurenshō* 百鍊抄 (13th century) and *Taiheiki* 太平記 (14th century), named Rokuharamitsuji as a Jizō hall. 100 The temple enshrines two images of Jizō. One of them, dated to the eleventh century, is a standing figure unusual in that he holds a wig or hair extension in his left hand (fig. II.12). 101 He is called the Katsurakake or Wig-holding Jizō 鬘掛地蔵. 102 This renowned image has many different origin tales. One story explains that a servant of Taira no Takayoshi 藤原隆能 (active mid-12th c.) dug up the image from the mud of a rice paddy in Mutsu Province (present-day Fukushima, Miyagi, Iwate, and Aomori Prefectures); another story says that the sculptor Hakkō Hōgen 白河法眼 carved the sculpture for Fujiwara no Hidehira 藤原秀衡 (?—1187), the third ruler of the northern outpost of Hiraizumi in Mutsu, and a third has it that Jizō himself flew down to consecrate the sculpture in the dream of the sculptor. 103

Konjaku monogatari tells a different version of the Wig-holding Jizō's origin. A man named Minamoto no Kunitaka 源国拳, the former governor of the Tajima Province (present-day northern Hyōgo Prefecture), died and arrived at Enma's court.¹⁰⁴ There, among many sinners, he saw Jizō, who manifested as a small monk, and begged the deity to save his life. Jizō, however,

¹⁰⁰ Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten, 29.

¹⁰¹ For the image, see Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 64.

¹⁰² This nickname seems to have been added much later. None of the early sources, such as *Konjaku monogatari*, *Hōbutsushū* 實物集 (Collection of treasures), or *Jizō bosatsu reigenki ekotoba* 地蔵菩薩霊験記絵詞 (Illustrated miracles of Jizō Bodhisattva), mention such an attribute. It also may have originally held not a hank of hair but something else, probably a sutra scroll.

¹⁰³ Hank Glassman, *The Face of Jizō: Image and Cult in Medieval Japanese Buddhism* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2012), 131.

¹⁰⁴ See Dykstra, trans., *The Konjaku Tales*, 26-27.

refused, saying Kunitaka had committed the sins with women and had never worshipped him. Kunitaka in despair promised Jizō that if he were returned to life, he would use all his money to worship the three jewels of Buddhism and to become his devotee. The deity then took pity on him and sent him back to the world of living. Afterward, Kunitaka became a monk and requested that the great Buddhist sculptor Jōchō 定朝 (?–1057) carve a wooden image of Jizō, later referred to as the "wig-holding" Jizō. Kunitaka also copied one section of the *Lotus Sutra* on multicolored paper and held services at Rokuharamitsuji. Monks and lay people, both men and women, who attended these services, believed in the miracles of the deity.

Another origin story of the Wig-holding Jizō image at Rokuharamitsuji can be found in the late twelfth-century Hōbutsushū 實物集 (Collection of Treasures) written by Taira no Yasuyori 平康頼 (active 12th century). 105 The story goes that a poor woman living in eastern Kyoto (Higashiyama district) frequently visited the Rokuharamitsuji Jizō. When her mother died, she had no money to bury the body or to hold a funeral. In the evening, an itinerant monk found her, learning of her situation, carried her mother's body away on his back, and took it into the mountains. After burying the body and performing funeral rites, the monk disappeared. On the following day, the daughter went to Rokuharamitsuji to thank the deity for making this happen. There she saw the sculpture of Jizō, whose feet were covered with dirt and mud and realized that it had been the Rokuharamitsuji Jizō himself who had walked into the mountains and buried her mother. In this story, no wig appears. However, the 1711gazetteer entitled Sanshū meisekishi 山州名跡志 recorded that the Rokuharamitsuji Jizō holds a wig in his left hand, which turned out to be the hair of the deceased mother. Inspired by this legend, female worshippers offered their

10

¹⁰⁵ See Glassman, The Face of Jizō, 132-133; Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 31; Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten, 28.

hair to the Jizō when they called on the deity. ¹⁰⁶ This Jizō is particularly famous for his ability to prevent husbands from wandering off. If the wife cuts a bit of her husband's hair, mixes it with some of her own, and offers it to the sculpture, the deity's efficacy can be realized. ¹⁰⁷ Believers also offered Jizō the hair of the deceased, praying that the deity would take care of the deceased in the next world. ¹⁰⁸

A similar story involving a poor man as protagonist can be found in the *Jizō bosatsu* reigenki ekotoba 地蔵菩薩霊験記絵詞 (Illustrated Miracles of Jizō Bodhisattva) dated before 1453. 109 This poverty-stricken man from Yamashiro near the capital borrowed some rice from a man named Toba and owed him a debt. The poor man, who had put up his own daughter as collateral on the loan, was worried about not being able to repay on time, and spent the night in the Rokuharamitsuji Jizō hall where the Wig-holding Jizō stood, praying for guidance. On the morning of the twenty-fourth of the month, Jizō's feast day, he left the hall and went to Toba. There he found out that his debt had already been paid by a monk of about thirty years old wearing black robes. This monk was, of course, Jizō himself.

Rokuharamitsuji also houses a document and a painting that reveal a wondrous tale of the Wig-holding Jizō. The letter of temple solicitation written in 1363 by the monk Kanmi for a reconstruction project explained not only the establishment of the temple but also the origin legend of Jizō. The story begins with a governor in Mutsu (or Ōshū) Province who commissioned a sculpture of Jizō in the capital and brought it with him to his assigned province. He entrusted the sculpture to a temple, but when a monk of the temple died, the sculpture was buried on the grounds. The governor dug up the image and came back to the capital with it. One

¹⁰⁶ Sarah J. Horton, *Living Buddhist Statues in Early Medieval and Modern Japan* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 133.

¹⁰⁷ Horton, *Living Buddhist Statues*, 133.

¹⁰⁸ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū, 31-32.

¹⁰⁹ Glassman, The Face of Jizō, 132.

¹¹⁰ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 36-37.

day the Jizō appeared in a dream of the governor and said that he wanted to be relocated to "Kūya's Kannon hall" at Rokuharamitsuji. The next day the governor moved the sculpture to Rokuharamitsuji. A fragment of the *Jizō bosatsu reigenki emaki* 地蔵菩薩霊験記絵巻 or *Saikōji Jizō emaki* 西光寺地蔵絵巻 (14th–15th century) at Rokuharamitsuji inscribes and depicts this miraculous story (figs. II.13-14).¹¹¹ The left section of the fragment shows Jizō standing on a lotus throne and holding a jewel in his left hand and a staff in his right hand with a male figure, probably the governor, kneeling beside the deity and offering him sandals. We see them again on right side of the fragment where Jizō is off the lotus throne, wearing sandals, walking by himself, and followed by the governor.

While these miraculous tales of Katsurakake Jizō attracted many devotees to Rokuharamitsuji, the temple enshrines another sculpture of Jizō (fig. II.15)¹¹² from the twelfth or thirteenth century, which also contributed to shaping the temple as a sacred space of Jizō. Unlike Katsurakake Jizō, this Jizō is seated holding a wish-granting jewel, a chief attribute of this bodhisattva, in his left hand. In his right hand, he probably would have held a *shakujō* 錫杖 (monk's staff), another significant attribute of the deity. According to the early eighteenth century guidebook, *Sanshū meisekishi*, this seated Jizō sculpture was created by Unkei and his son Tankei 港慶 (1173–1256), two of the most famous Buddhist sculptors of the Kamakura period. Moreover, the Jizō was flanked by the portrait sculptures of Unkei (mid-13th century) and Tankei (13th–14th century) in Jūrinin 十輪院 inside the temple. This building no longer exists, and the Jizō image is currently displayed in the Treasure Hall 宝物館 along with other

¹¹¹ For fig. II.13, see Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 64. For fig. II.14, see Rokuharamitsuji, *Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten*, 14.

¹¹² For the image, see Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 5.

sculptures. Regarding its origin, creator, and location, however, a consensus has not been reached among Japanese scholars.¹¹³

The seated Jizō sculpture was considered sacred and efficacious to the worshippers of the deity. It has been found through X-ray that inside the sculpture were presumably twelfth- or thirteenth-century deposits, such as *inbutsu* 印仏 (stamped Buddhist images) of Jizō and a wooden pole in the shape of *gorintō* or a five-ringed pagoda, which was made to increase its efficacy and strengthen *kechien* 結縁 (karmic bond with a Buddhist deity). This seated Jizō is also called Yumemi Jizō 夢見地蔵 (Jizō seen in a dream). A legend has it that Unkei and Tankei had a dream in which Jizō was suffering in hell on behalf of all creatures. 114 When they told each other about their own dreams, they found that their dreams did not differ on any point. Then they carved the sculpture, praying three times after every stroke of the blade. This Jizō image, believed to have taken the place of the condemned in hell, added another layer to the sacredness of Rokuharamitsuji, thus inspiring more devotees to worship the deity.

The cult of Jizō at Rokuharamitsuji seems to have played a significant role in the development and dissemination of the Enma cult in the area since the savior Jizō had a close relationship to Enma. The ninth-century *Nihon ryōiki* includes the story of a man named Fujiwara no Hirotari 藤原広足 who journeys to the underworld and is told by King Enma that he

.

¹¹³ See Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 10-14; Miyake, "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsuzō to Unkei konryū no Jizō Jūrinin," 1-16; and Uemura, "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsu zazō ni tsuite," 23-70. Considering Unkei never used the ichiboku-zukuri technique, through which the seated Jizō sculpture at Rokuharamitsuji was made, I believe it could have been the work of another sculptor.

ten, 61. Rokuharamitsuji also holds a woodblock of *Yumemi Jizō ryakuengi* 夢見地蔵略縁起 (Abbreviated origins and history of Yumemi Jizō) which similarly records that both Unkei and Tankei dreamt of Jizō and after waking up each sculpted half of the deity's body. See Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, pl. 10. The gazetteer entitled *Sanshū meisekishi* of 1711 tells a slightly different story. In this story, only Unkei had a dream of Jizō who manifested as a monk and ordered Unkei to make an image of Jizō since the monk himself was the deity. See Sakauchi Naoyori, *Sanshū meisekishi*, vol. 3 (Kyoto: Koyama Ihei, 1711), 40-41.

is "called the bodhisattva Jizō in your [Hirotari's] country."¹¹⁵ *Jizō Jūō kyō* (The Sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings, 13th century), one of the major textual sources through which the Enma and Ten Kings belief flourished in Japan, "insists that Jizō and Enma are, in fact, one—both advocate and judge."¹¹⁶ The presence of two Jizō images in addition to the sculptures of Enma and his entourage at Rokuharamitsuji must have reminded visitors and worshippers that while Enma was terrifying and intimidating, Jizō, as another manifestation of the magistrate Enma, was kind and the best advocate for the sinner.

Rokuharamitsuji also functioned as a sacred space of Kannon bodhisattva, bringing in more pilgrims to the temple (fig. II.16).¹¹⁷ Like Jizō bodhisattva, Kannon bodhisattva is known to exert his supernatural abilities to save sentient beings even in the underworld that Enma presides over, as described in the *Kāraṇḍavyūha Sutra* or *Description of the Casket* [of Avalokiteśvara's Qualities] 佛説大乘莊嚴寶王經 (Ch. *Foshuo dasheng zhuangyan baowang jing*, Jp. *Busetsu daijō shōgon hōōgyō*). This sutra, likely composed in Kashmir sometime around the fourth or fifth century and translated into Chinese around 1000, expounds the virtues and powers of Kannon.¹¹⁸ In one of the miraculous stories in the sutra, Kannon, after preaching the dharma of nirvana in the Avici Hell, cooled the woeful lake of fire there and turned it into a refreshing lotus pond, thus saving its suffering denizens. Hearing this miracle, Enma (Yama), Lord of Hell, praised the virtues of the bodhisattva.¹¹⁹ Therefore, Kannon bodhisattva, who

¹¹⁵ Nihon ryōiki 3:9, Takagi Ichinosuke et al., ed., Nihon koten bungaku taikei [Collection of classical Japanese literature], vol. 70 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1957–1967), 338-342, trans. in Kyoko Motomochi Nakamura, trans., Miraculous Stories from the Japanese Buddhist Tradition: The Nihon Ryōiki of the Monk Kyōkai (Surrey: Curzon Press, 1973), 233-234.

¹¹⁶ Glassman, *The Face of Jizō*, 18.

¹¹⁷ For the image, see Kon Jōkō, *Kūya no tera: Rokuharamitsuji* [Kūya's temple: Rokuharamitsuji] (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1969), 89.

¹¹⁸ Alexander Studholme, The Origins of Om Manipadme Hum: A Study of the Karandavyuha Sutra (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012), 14 and Chün-fang Yü, "Ambiguity of Avalokiteśvara and the Scriptural Sources for the Cult of Kuan-yin in China," *Chunghwa Buddhist Journal* 10 (1997): 428.

¹¹⁹ Yü, *Kuan-yin* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), 72. See T 1050:48, SAT Daizōkyō Text Database, accessed March 10, 2018, http://21dzk.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/SAT/satdb2015.php.

possesses such great salvific power, has been worshipped at Rokuharamitsuji and thought to have been acknowledged by Enma.

As mentioned earlier in this dissertation, the central image of the main hall at Rokuharamitsuji is the Eleven-headed Kannon sculpture that is said to have been carved by Kūya in 951. 120 The sculpture is concealed inside the main hall as a secret image and is only open to the public once every twelve years. There is uncertainty over the origin of this Kannon image. Nonetheless, Kūya appears to have venerated Kannon, who not only has the divine power to save beings from the six realms of suffering, but also provides many this-worldly benefits. In order to "undertake spiritual practices that would lead to rebirth in the Pure Land," Kūya is believed to have visited many well-known Kannon-related sacred mountains, including Hakusan 白山, Kinpusen 金峰山, and Kumano Nachi 熊野那智, during his extensive travels. 121 Legend has it that Kūya's personal predilection for Kannon bodhisattva turned Rokuharamitsuji into a sacred space of Kannon.

The Kannon sculpture at Rokuharamitsuji is not merely a wooden image depicting Kannon but considered a *reizō* 霊像, or holy icon of the deity, just as the two Jizō sculptures in the temple were regarded as living images of Jizō. Beginning in the latter half of the Heian period, both lay devotees and Buddhist ascetics fervently worshipped living Kannon icons. In the capital, Kyoto, a Seven Kannon pilgrimage 七観音詣 (Shichi Kannon mōde) was formed, and its circuit included Kōdō 革堂 (Gyōganji 行願寺), Seiwa'in 清和院, Nakayamadera 中山

¹²⁰ Some gazetteers, such as *Dekisai kyō miyage* 出来齋京土産 (Dekisai's souvenirs of Kyoto, 1677, by H. Isoda), attribute the sculpture to the celebrated sculptor Tankei. See in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho* 11, 538.

¹²¹ Mark MacWillams, "Living Icons: 'Reizō' Myths of the Saikoku Kannon Pilgrimage," *Monumenta Nipponica* 59, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 42.

¹²² MacWillams, "Living Icons," 36.

¹²³ Sherry Fowler dicusses the worship and the images of this grouping of seven Kannon in detail in her book, *Accounts and Images of Six Kannon in Japan*, 197-215.

寺, Kiyomizudera, Rokuharamitsuji, Rokkakudō 六角堂, and Chōrakuji 長楽寺. In the late twelfth century and continuing into the sixteenth century, Kyoto nobles undertook this pilgrimage and visited each of those seven temples that enshrined an important Kannon image. 124 In *Meigetsuki* 明月記, the diary of the courtier Fujiwara no Sadaie 藤原定家 (1162–1241), an entry written in 1225 recorded a court ladies' outing to those seven Kannon temples. 125

Moreover, Rokuharamitsuji was included in the circuit of the Saigoku sanjūsansho Kannon junrei 西国三十三所観音巡礼 (Saigoku thirty-three-temple Kannon pilgrimage) one of the most famous pilgrimage routes in Japan. In the twelfth century slightly before or after the formation of the seven Kannon pilgrimage in the capital, the Saigoku pilgrimage began to take shape. *Ryōjin hishō* includes the following song about the pilgrimage route:

Which way to Kiyomizudera?

Go down Kyogoku south to Gōjō street, find Ishibashi at the east end of the bridge, pass Yotsumune, Rokuharadō [Rokuharamitsuji], and Otagidera, pass the great Buddha, then Fukai, and after them Yasakaji.

Climb the hill to Kiyomizu and look below.

There are Sakandayu's Niōdō, Gion Shrine at the end of the Yasaka pagoda, and, to the south, the water basins.

After the ritual washing, we go to the temple for reverent worship.

Then look down at this curious waterfall with its delightful streams. 126

¹²⁴ Tanaka Kaori, "Sengokuki ni okeru 'shichi Kannon mōde,' 'shichinin mōde' ne tsuite" [About the Seven Kannon pilgrimage and the seven people pilgrimage in the Warring States period], *Tezukayama Daigaku Daigakuin Jinbunkagaku Kenkyūka kiyō* 11 (February 2009): 13.

¹²⁵ Kiyomizuderashi Hensan Iinkai, Kiyomizudera shi 1, 254.

¹²⁶ Yung-Hee Kim, *Songs to Make the Dust Dance: The Ryōjin hishō of Twelfth-Century Japan* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), 98-99.

This song lists famous sites and objects on the way to the Kiyomizudera, one of the temples on the Saigoku pilgrimage route. Although Rokuharamitsuji was not mentioned here as a pilgrimage station, it was a notable place that pilgrims could not miss on their way to Kiyomizudera. In 1335 the imperial court ordered a sutra chanting to Kannon at thirty-three temples for easy delivery of Empress Junshi 珣子 (1311–1337), a wife of the Emperor Godaigo 後醍醐天皇 (r. 1318–1339). There is a discrepancy between the temple names in the imperial order and those in the Saigoku pilgrimage route; however, Rokuharamitsuji was mentioned in the imperial order of 1335. 128

By the fifteenth century, the Saikoku pilgrimage had developed into its present form, and Rokuharamitsuji became the seventeenth temple on the circuit. A large number of devotees from all social classes started to go on the Saigoku Kannon pilgrimage. *Ten'in goroku* 天隱語錄, an account written by the Gozan 五山 monk named Ten'in Ryūtaku 天隱竜沢 (1422–1500) in 1486, describes it in this way:

The pilgrims overflow the villages and fill the hamlets; all of them have a piece of cloth attached to their backs on which is written, 'from such-and-such a village and a province, on the thirty-three *junrei*.' They say that the pilgrimage began during the time of Emperor Kanzan 花山 [r. 984–986], but this year, in the eighth year of Meiō 明応 [1499], it has become more and more popular.¹²⁹

Ten'in goroku further notes that many pilgrims came from the Kantō area and that even the order of the pilgrimage starting at Seigantoji 青岸渡寺 on Nachisan 那智山 and ending at Kegonji 華

¹²⁸ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 38.

 $^{^{127}}$ Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, $Rokuharamitsuji\ no\ kenkyū,$ 37.

¹²⁹ Translated in MacWilliams, 43-44. See Hayami Tasuku, "Kannon shinkō to minzoku" [Kannon faith and folk traditions], in *Kōza Nihon no minzoku shūkyō*, vol. 2, eds. Gorai Shigeru et al. (Tokyo: Kōbundō, 1980), 269.

厳寺 on Tanigumisan 谷汲山 was fixed to accommodate them. ¹³⁰ In the following years, during the Edo period, the number of pilgrims on the Saigoku pilgrimage route increased. ¹³¹ Naturally, more and more people from different social classes and from different regions came to be attracted to Rokuharamitsuji, the sacred space of Kannon.

Conclusion

This chapter has provided the historical, cultural, and social settings of the neighborhood where the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma and his entourage were enshrined. From its very beginning Rokuharamitsuji was salvation-oriented. For its founder Kūya, who strived to lead all creatures to Amida's paradise, the Rokuhara area was an ideal site on which to build the temple. Close to the Toribeno graveyard, Rokuhara was considered the land of the dead. Furthermore, within the Rokuhara area, adjacent to Rokudō no tsuji (Crossroad of the Six Paths), Rokuharamitsuji was located in a liminal space between this world and the next, which has been said to be the entrance to the underworld where Enma resided. As dwellers of the Rokuhara area changed from the eleventh to seventeenth centuries and as Rokuharamitsuji was promoted as a sacred space of both Jizō and Kannon bodhisattvas, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma and his associates were accessed and worshipped by patrons from a variety of social classes. The faith in Jizō and Kannon bodhisattvas promoted at Rokuharamitsuji further enhanced the allembracing and salvation-oriented nature of the temple, following in the footsteps of its founder Kūya and boosting the idea of their devotees' chances of receiving a favorable judgment from

¹³⁰ Pilgrims from the Kantō area could first visit the Ise shrines, head to the Kannon temples in the Kii peninsula, move to Nara, Kyoto, Osaka, and then proceed to the remaining temples in the north. From there they could return to their home provinces, using the Nakasendō or Tōkaidō routes. See Hayami, *Kannon shinkō* [Kannon faith] (Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 1970), 315.

¹³¹ For more information, see Maeda Takashi, "Edo jidai no junrei no ugoki: Saikoku junrei" [Trend of the Edo period pilgrimage: Saikoku pilgrimage], in *Kōza Nihon no junrei*, vol. 1, ed. Shinno Toshikazu (Tokyo: Yūzankaku, 1996), 83-103.

Ten Kings. The following chapters delve into the thirteenth-century sculptural program of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku and the changes in the triad in the seventeenth century in response to foci of the worshippers, patrons, and monks of the temple.

Chapter Three

Activating the Rokuharamitsuji Sculptural Program of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku

The salvation-oriented and all-embracing Rokuharamitsuji, located in Rokuhara, a liminal space between this world and the next, substantiated the supremacy of Enma and Ten Kings by enshrining him and his entourage in its formerly extant Enma hall. The present chapter will examine the Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall's sculptural program of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei (figs. III.1-3)¹ by discussing its iconographical, textual, and ritual contexts, comparing them with other contemporaneous Enma sculptural groups, and analyzing the history of the former Enma halls in the temple complex before the Datsueba sculpture was added in the seventeenth century. I suggest two possible original configurations of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures: either a triad or a set with more figures of the nine other kings. This chapter further explores the relationship of the Ten Kings paintings discovered in 2008 in the temple precinct to the sculptural group of Enma and his entourage. By establishing the possibility that the Rokuharamitsuji paintings would have been hung at both sides of the Enma sculptures in the temple's Enma hall, I will propose and substantiate three scenarios for how these sculptures may have been activated and what they may have meant to their worshippers during the memorial services for the dead and the living, in everyday lives, and during the annual summer Festival for the Dead (obon).

Contemporaneous Sculptures of Enma and His Entourage

Among the numerous sculptures of Enma and his entourage spread all over Japan, only a few examples produced during the Kamakura period are extant (see Table 3). Surveys of the

-

¹ For the images, see Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō* [Buddhist sculptures of Rokuharamitsuji] (Tokyo: Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2008), 14-15.

extant Kamakura-period sculptures of Enma and his associates in the following discussion serve as valuable sources for illuminating parallels and variations between the Ten Kings images' manifestations and groupings as well as for revealing concurrent beliefs in the course of the development of Ten Kings faith in Japan.

Table 3. Extant Sculptures of Enma and His Entourage of the Kamakura Period

Sculptures of Enma and His Entourage of the Kamakura Period							
CURRENT	SCULPTURES	DATE	HEIGHT	NOTE			
LOCATION							
Enma Hall	Head of King	1250	190.3 cm	Other sculptures include a			
(Main Hall)	Enma			Datsueba (Muromachi			
En'nōji,	King Shokō	1251	103.0 cm	period, 1514) and eight			
Kamakura	Two Kushōjin	Late 13th	100.7 cm	other kings (Edo period). ²			
	(or Shimei and	century	99.5 cm				
	Shiroku)						
	Hell jailer	Late 13th	79.5 cm				
		century-					
		early 14th					
	D 1. 1=	century	00.2	4			
	Dandadō	Early 14th	98.3 cm				
		century					
Main Hall	King Enma	13th	118.5 cm	They were originally			
Byakugōji, Nara		century		enshrined in its Enma hall.			
	Taizan Fukun	1295	129.7 cm				
	(King Taizan)	1205	122.0	4			
	Shimei	ca. 1295	132.0 cm				
	Shiroku		132.0 cm				
Nara National	King Enma	13th	54.3 cm	They were originally			
Museum	(or Taizan	century		enshrined at Kongōsenji			
	Fukun)			(Yatadera), Nara.			
	Shimei	14th	141.8 cm				
		century		Kongōsenji also holds a			
				sculpture of Datsueba dated			
				to 1591.			
Storage	King Enma	13th	123.0 cm	They were believed to have			
Tōdaiji, Nara	Taizan Fukun	century	124.1 cm	been enshrined in			
	(King Taizan)			Nenbutsudō Hall.			
Enma Hall	King Enma	13th	160.9 cm				
Hōshakuji, Kyoto	Taizan Fukun	century	122.4 cm	1			
		-					

² Among the rest of the kings, one sculpture bears an inscription indicating its creation date of 1691, while four sculptures were produced in 1711, according to the inscriptions written inside them.

	(King Taizan) Godō Tenrin Shiroku Shimei		143.6 cm 114.5 cm 110.5 cm	They initially belonged to the Enma hall of Nishi Kannonji.
Treasure Hall Rokuharamitsuji, Kyoto	King Enma Shiroku	Late 13th century— early 14th century	88.5 cm 55.4 cm	They were originally enshrined in its Enma hall.
	Shimei	17th century	54.8 cm	
Main Hall Jōshinji, Shiga	King Enma (or Kushōjin)	Late 13th century–	107.9 cm	
-	Kushōjin	early 14th century	106.1 cm	
Hirabori Enmei Jizōdō, Niigata	King Enma (or One of the Ten Kings)	Late 13th century	107.5 cm	
	Shimei (or Kushōjin)		85.2 cm	

Although not listed in Table 3 above, the earliest documented sculptures of Enma and his entourage belonged to the Enma halls at Anrakujuin 安楽寿院 in the Fushimi area of Kyoto and at Daigoji 醍醐寺, a Shingon school temple in Kyoto. The halls and sculptures inside do not exist any more. The Enma hall was constructed in 1140 by the order of retired sovereign Toba 鳥 羽法皇 (1103–1156) within the Anrakujuin temple complex where his gravesite was located, along with an Amida hall and a pagoda. On the other hand, the Enma hall at Daigoji was commissioned by Senyōmonin 宣陽門院 (1181–1252), the sixth daughter of the retired emperor Go Shirakawa 後台河天皇 (1127–1192). The imperial princess Senyōmonin, also known as

³ The Amida hall was completed in 1137, the pagoda in 1139, and the Enma hall in 1140. These three structures were situated in close proximity. As Yamamoto Satomi argues, they may have been constructed simultaneously as the components of his gravesite. See Yamamoto Satomi, "Toba Enmatendō no ba to zōkai" [Place and structure of the Enmaten of Toba], in *Zuzō kaishakugaku: kenryoku to tasha* [Study of iconographical interpretation: Authority and others], ed. Kasuya Makoto (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2013), 104-105.

⁴ Documentary evidence of the Daigoji Enma hall can be found in the following sources: *Daigoji shin'yōroku* 醍醐 寺新要録, a sixteenth-century summary record of Daigoji history complied by the monk Gien 義演 (1558–1626); *Enmaōdō emei* 焰魔王堂絵銘 (Inscription of the paintings in the Enma hall) excerpted in 1223 by the eminent

Princess Kinshi 覲子内親王, ordered Jōgen 成賢 (1162–1231), the twenty-fourth head priest of Daigoji, to build the hall. When construction on the Enma hall began is not known; however, the records reveal that it was completed and first consecrated in 1223. Later, the hall was destroyed by fire and rebuilt several times.⁵

Both the Anrakujuin and Daigoji Enma halls contained a sculpture of Enma as a *honzon* or the principal image of the halls. The Anrakujuin Enma hall had paintings of Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shimei, and Shiroku on its door. Modelled after this configuration at Anrakujuin, the Enma sculpture at the Daigoji Enma hall was flanked by other sculptures of Taizan Fukun and Godō Daijin accompanied by Shimei and Shiroku (fig. III.4). Those five sculptures were created by the famous Kamakura sculptors, Kaikei 快慶 (active 12th c.) and Tankei 湛慶 (1173–1256), and behind the five sculptures were Enma's empress 焰魔后, Enma's consort 焰魔妃, Dakini 拏吉尼, Binayaka 毘那夜迦, Shamonda 遮文拏, and Jōjusen 成就仙. This arrangement of sculptures resembles painted esoteric devotional images of Enma portrayed in Enmaten mandalas (fig. I.14). Sculptures in the Daigoji Enma hall seem to have served as a three-dimensional version of the Enmaten mandala, although the configurations of the figures differ

monk Jōgen 成賢 (1162–1231) from earlier sources; *Enmaōdō kanjinchō* 琰魔王堂勧進帳 (Fundraising prospectus for the Enma hall) written in 1340; and *Mandara kuki* 曼荼羅供記 that recorded the rituals performed to a mandala at the Daigoji Enma hall in 1386.

⁵ Chronology of the Daigoji Enma Hall

¹²²³ Consecrated

Burned down (Enma alone was destroyed; other figures remained intact.)

¹³⁴⁰ Rebuilt

¹³⁸⁶ Re-consecrated

¹⁴⁷⁰ Destroyed again by fire

Between 1558 and 1560, the few sculptures that survived the previous fire were lost to fire. For more detailed information on these dates, see Takei, "Daigoji Enmadō to sono shūhen," 58-61.

⁶ Daigoji Bunzakai Kenkyūjo, ed., *Daigoji shin'yōroku* [New important records of Daigoji], vol. 2 (Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 1991), 856.

⁷ For the image, see Abe, "Daigoji Enmadō shiryō sandai," 221.

^{8 &}quot;The Record of Offerings in 1223" (貞応二年), "The Fundraising Prospectus in 1340 (曆応三年), and "The Record of Offerings in 1386" (至徳三年) that are included in *Daigoji shin'yōroku* indicates that the main figures were carved by Kaikei and Tankei. See Takei, "Daigoji Enmadō to sono shūhen," 58.

⁹ Abe, "Daigoji Enmadō shiryō sandai," 210.

slightly. Moreover, the Daigoji Enma hall was decorated with mural paintings including scenes of eighteen hells and forty-three illustrations of stories about people falling into hell, reviving, and being reborn.¹⁰

The original Enma halls, sculptures, and mural paintings at Anrakujuin and Daigoji are forever lost, but the halls with Enma as the main image indicate that Enma had already established himself as the most significant judge of the underworld by the thirteenth century. As recorded in his "Written Pledge with Handprints of the Emperor" 法皇御手印御起請文 (Hōō gotein gokishōmon) of 1140, Toba built the Enma hall at his mausoleum Anrakujuin to petition Enma for a long life while he was alive and for salvation after death. In a similar vein, the imperial princess Senyōmonin, a devout Buddhist believer and a devoted follower of the monk Jōgen, created the Enma hall at Daigoji as one of the "spaces for her life of faith." The Daigoji Enma hall functioned as a space where devotees prayed for rebirth in paradise and offered mortuary rituals for the time when they would be receiving judgment from Enma. Furthermore, the Enma sculpture surrounded by other figures, corresponding to the arrangement in Enmaten mandalas, worked as the main image of the esoteric practice called Enmaten ku 焰魔天供 which

-

¹³ Abe, "Dajigoku to sosei tan," 83.

¹⁰ For more information on the mural paintings, see Abe, "Daigoji Enmadō shiryō sandai," 205-223; Abe, "Dajigoku to sosei tan," 77-92; and Chusid, "Constructing the Afterlife, Re-envisioning Salvation," 13-20.

¹¹ The passage from Toba's "Written Pledge with Handprints of Emperor" states: "The *honji* [i.e. original ground] of the great Enma-ten is the embodiment of all Buddhas who exhibit deep compassion. It is thought that his suijaku [i.e. manifested form] is as the ruler of the underworld who passes judgment on one's deeds as reflected in the pure mirror, which shows the sins and merits of one's past life and also those of the next. He protects the records of the names of the newly reborn and grants one hundred years of life ... [Commissioning] wooden sculptures, painted images, and the copying of texts all accumulated merit. My offerings of treasures and of the Dharma are limitless ... Fear and awe compel me to commission a monumental [Enma] image and enshrine it in a magnificent hall." English Translation by Miriam Chusid in Chusid, "Constructing the Afterlife, Re-envisioning Salvation," 7-8. For original text, Takakusu Junjirō, ed., *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō zuzō* (Tokyo: Daizō Shuppan, 1933), 5:545b-c, https://dzkimgs.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/SATi/images.php?vol=05.

Together with an Amida hall and a pagoda within the temple precinct, the Anrakujuin Enma hall particularly provided monks with a space to hold memorial services for Toba's rebirth in the Pure Land after his death. See Chusid, "Constructing the Afterlife, Re-envisioning Salvation," 8-9.

¹² Takei, "Daigoji Enmadō to sono shūhen," 61-62. A branch temple named Amidain 阿弥陀院 was built in 1219 by Jōgen by order of Senyōmonin as another space in which to realize her faith in Buddhism.

enabled devotees to pray for their worldly wishes, such as good health, longevity, and easy delivery.¹⁴ In the late fourteenth century, the Enma hall opened its doors not only to priests, courtiers, and samurai, but also to commoners.¹⁵

En'nōji, built in 1250 in the city of Kamakura, also has a hall dedicated entirely to Enma. However, unlike the Anrakujuin and Daigoji Enma halls, the Enma hall at En'nōji occupies the center of the temple complex and is a sub-temple of the Zen monastery Kenchōji. According to *Arai Enmadō En'nōji shuzō kanjinjō* 新居閻魔堂円応寺修造勧進状 (Letter of Temple Solicitation for the Repair of Arai Enmadō En'nōji) written in 1500, Ashikaga Takauji 足利尊氏 (1305–1358) moved En'nōji, originally built in Yuigo Mikoshiiwa 由比郷見越岩 (the east side of the Kamakura Great Buddha), to the southeast of the Great Torii of Tsurugaoka Hachimangū 鶴岡八幡宮, and the temple came to be called Arai Enmadō En'nōji. ¹⁶ In 1703, however, the temple was damaged due to an earthquake and tsunami, and the following year it was moved to its current location. ¹⁷

The En'nōji Enma hall appears to have reenacted the judgment of the dead by enshrining a large carved King Enma, nine other near life-size kings, and Enma's attendants. Among those sculptures, the sculptures of King Enma (figs. III.5-6), ¹⁸ King Shokō (fig. III.7), ¹⁹ two Kushōjin 俱生神 ("birth companion deity") (or Shimei and Shiroku) (figs. III.8-9), ²⁰ kisotsu 鬼卒 or

 20 For the images, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, $\textit{Butsuz\bar{o} sh\bar{u}ri 100-nen}, 32-33.$

¹⁴ Abe, "Dajigoku to sosei tan," 83.

¹⁵ Daigoji Bunzakai Kenkyūjo, ed., *Daigoji shin'yōroku*, 856-60.

¹⁶ Washizuka, "En'nōji no Enma jūō zō ni tsuite," 55.

¹⁷ Nagai Shin'ichi, ed., *Kamakura to tōgoku no koji* [Old temples in Kamakura and Kantō provinces], *Nihon koji bijutsu zenshū*, vol. 17 (Tokyo: Shūeisha, 1981), 130.

¹⁸ For the images, see Matsumoto Eiichi, *Kamakura no bijutsu* [Art of Kamakura] (Tokyo: Asahi Shinbunsha, 1958), cover and pl. 52.

¹⁹ For the image, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Butsuzō shūri 100-nen: tokubetsuten* [Special exhibition on the hundredth year of the restoration of Buddhist sculptures] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2010), 33.

gokusotsu 獄卒 (hell jailer) (fig. III.10),²¹ and a *dandadō* (fig. III.11)²² are considered to have been made during the Kamakura period.²³ They were carved out of multiple blocks of wood, painted, and inlaid with crystals for eyes. As the dominant, central image, the seated Enma with a red face and an open mouth is the largest (height 187.5 cm) of all the sculptures, wearing a crown with the Chinese character *wang* 王, or king, and holding a scepter in his right hand. His jaw touches his chest as he scowls in anger at the deceased before him. According to the gazetteer entitled *Shinpen Kamakurashi* 新編鎌倉志 (Newly Edited Guide to Kamakura) published in 1685, a piece of paper found inside the Enma sculpture during the restoration conducted in 1673 states that Enma was created in 1250 and restored in 1520 by the Buddhist sculptor Kōen 弘円 (1442–?), who held the title of Hōgen 法眼 (Eye of the dharma) and was from Shimotsuke 下野.²⁴ However, when it was repaired after the Great Kantō Earthquake of 1923, such a paper was not located.²⁵ As Japanese scholars have argued, the Enma sculpture is

-

²¹ For the image, see Matsumoto Eiichi, *Kamakura no bijutsu*, pl. 57.

²² For the image, see Matsumoto Eiichi, *Kamakura no bijutsu*, pl. 56.

²³ Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 85.

²⁴ Mizuno Keizaburo, ed., *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei: Kamakura jidai: zōzō meiki hen: kaisetsu* [Compilation of fundamental data on Japanese sculpture: Kamakura period: Records of images with inscriptions: Commentary], vol. 7 (Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2009), 7.

Kōen, who belonged to a Kamakura workshop of Buddhist sculptors, also sculpted a Datsueba image in the En'nōji Enma hall in 1514, as indicated by the inscription written inside the Datsueba (fig. III.12). Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, ed., *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku: Shoseki, kaiga, chōkoku, kōgei hen* [Comprehensive catalogue of the cultural properties in the city of Kamakura: Book, painting, sculpture, and crafts] (Kyoto: Dōhōsha, 1986), 445. For the image of Datsueba at En'nōji, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 87.

²⁵ According to Konchi nikki 金地目記 (Journal Written in Konchiin 金地院), in the third month of 1698 the sculptures of Ten Kings at En'nōji were once moved and entrusted to Chōjuin 長寿院 in Asakusa, Tokyo to raise funds for restoring En'nōji with the approval from the shogunate; due to the fire that broke out in Asakusa in the ninth month of the same year, five images among the En'nōji Ten Kings sculptures were destroyed. It is not absolutely clear exactly which images were burned; however, considering that Shinpen Kamakurashi was published after the fire in Asakusa, the Enma sculpture of En'nōji is presumed to have been restored after the fire. Mizuno, Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei, vol. 7, 7-8.

considered to have consisted of a head originally made in the thirteenth century²⁶ with a body that was replaced in the seventeenth or eighteenth century.²⁷

The En'nōji Enma hall holds other Kamakura-period examples that are comparable to the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures. An inscription written inside the seated sculpture of King Shokō (fig. III. 7), one of the Ten Kings, reveals its creation date of 1251, the name of the sculptor Kōyū 幸有 (dates unknown), and the monk petitioner named Zenkan 善観 (dates unknown) who invoked Amida Buddha and prayed for himself and others to acquire merit and for his deceased parents to attain Buddhahood.²⁸ The sculpture contains not only other inscriptions of prayers and Sanskrit seed syllables, but also inscription boards recording the repairs in 1638 and 1683.²⁹ Wearing a Chinese-style garment, King Shokō looks angry as he gazes to the right. The hems and sleeves of the garment, which spread out naturally like waves, give movement and volume to the sculpture. This Shokō image displays both the naturalistic Kei school 慶派 style and the decorative Song style.³⁰ A pair of Kushōjin (or Shimei and Shiroku), one with its mouth open (fig. III.8) and the other with its mouth closed (fig. III.9), seem to have been created in the Kamakura period like Enma and Shokō in that their waistband is raised up to chest height, their protruding bellies are emphasized, and their thick simple clothing is carefully carved.³¹ Similar to Kushōjin, a hell jailer (fig. III.10) shows his detailed chest and belly and looks rather unnatural; however, he appears somewhat different from Kushōjin, which indicates that the hell

²⁶ The head of the Enma sculpture was sculpted using the identical technique applied in the King Shokō image, which was dated to 1251. Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku*, 442.

²⁷ Itō Tomoko was a leading scholar who presented this argument in her article, "En'nōji Enma jūōzōni kansuru: Shiryō" [About Enma and Ten Kings sculptures of En'nōji: Historical records], *Kamakura* 42 (1983): 15-20.

²⁸ Noma, *The Arts of Japan*, 219 and Kōko Gakkai, ed., *Zōzō meiki* [Creating Buddhist sculptures and inscriptions] (Tokyo: Kōko Gakkai, 1936), 197-198.

²⁹ For more details, see Mizuno, *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei* 7, 6 and 13; Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku*, 447.

³⁰ Kamakura Kokuhōkan, ed., *Kamakura no seika: Kamakura Kokuhō kaikan hachijushūnen kinen, tokubetsuten* [The flowering of Kamakura: 80th anniversary special exhibition of Kamakura museum] (Kamakura: Kamakura Kokuhōkan, 2008), 94.

³¹ Washizuka, "En'nōji no Enma jūō zō ni tsuite," 60.

jailer can be dated to between the second half and the end of the Kamakura period.³² Similarly, a *dandadō* (fig. III.11) presents a compactly built structure which is characteristic of late Kamakura fourteenth-century sculptures.³³ At the En'nōji Enma hall, these formerly colorful and bulky sculptures, along with other sculptures of Ten Kings,³⁴ likely created a great sense of fear of the ruthless justice and punishments decided by the court.

As another comparison with the sculptures of Enma and his assistants at Rokuharamitsuji, the next group of sculptures to consider belongs to Byakugōji 白豪寺 in Nara. This sculptural group once enshrined in the temple's Enma hall consists of four wooden sculptures of Enma, Taizan Fukun, Shiroku, and Shimei from the thirteenth century (figs. III.13-16).³⁵ These sculptures were carved from multiple blocks of wood, painted, and inlaid with crystals for eyes. Enma and Taizan Fukun are seated cross-legged on *raiban tatami* 礼盤量 (raised platforms in the shape of *tatami* mats). With a menacing expression on his red face and with his mouth open, the Enma sculpture wears a simple Chinese official's robe and a large bag-like hat with a rod through it, and holds in his right hand a scepter, which also makes an iconographical connection to a Chinese official or judge. With his mouth closed, Taizan Fukun also looks intimidating and wears Chinese garb with a sash tied in a ribbon knot and a slightly more decorative hat. Both Shiroku and Shimei sit with one leg folded on a stool covered with tiger skins, wearing unadorned hats and official uniforms decorated with lotus arabesque patterns. Although they are empty-handed at present, their hand gestures suggest that Shimei

³² Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku*, 448.

³³ Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku*, 448.

³⁴ They were mostly made in the eighteenth century. See Mizuno, *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō* shūsei, vol. 7, 7 and 9; Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku*, 442-445; Washizuka, "En'nōji no Enma jūō zō ni tsuite," 62.

³⁵ For figs. III.13, 15, 16, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, ed., *Nara Saidaiji ten: Kōshō Bosatsu Eison nanahyakunen onki kinen: Shingon Risshū ichimon no hihō kōkai* [Exhibition on Saidaiji, Nara: The 700th anniversary of Kōshō Bosatsu Eison's death: Treasures of Shingon Risshū school opened to the public] (Tokyo: Nihon Keizai Shinbunsha, 1991), 152-153. For fig. III.14, see Ōta Hirotarō, ed., *Yamato koji taikan* [Great overview of the temples of Yamato] 4: Shinyakushiji, Byakugōji, Enjōji (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1977-1978), 128.

held an open scroll with a list of wrongdoings and that Shiroku held a brush in his right hand and a wooden plank in his left hand to jot down the sentence being passed on the condemned before him.

Sculptures of Taizan Fukun, Shiroku, and Shimei, excluding Enma, have interior inscriptions, which reveal who commissioned, produced, and repaired the sculptures. The inscriptions on the back of Taizan Fukun explain that it was created by Daibusshi Hōgen Kōen 大仏師法眼康円 with help from Sagami Hokkyō 相模法橋 in 1295. Necording to this inscription, Kōen (1207-?) was considered a Daibusshi (Chief Buddhist Sculptor), the most senior and accomplished sculptor, and was granted the special rank of Hōgen (Eye of the dharma), which is equal to the monastic rank below the Preeminent Monk (Sōjō). As the son of Kōshō 康證 (康勝), Unkei's fourth son, Kōen was one of the most active sculptors of the Kei school in the Kamakura period, ultimately becoming the successor of his uncle Tankei. With Tankei, he participated in the restoration of the main image of the Thousand-armed Kannon at Sanjūsangendō, and earned the title of Hōgen. This leading sculptor is said to have produced the attendant sculptures of Shimei and Shiroku as well. The Enma sculpture was not made by Kōen, but seems to have been created around 1295 when the other three sculptures were produced.

-

³6 The inscription is written as follows: 「大仏師法眼幸録康円/相模法橋」See Ōta, *Yamato koji taikan*, 69; Nishikawa Shinji, "Kōen kenkyū josetsu" [Introduction to the research on Kōen], *Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan kiyō* 3 (1967): 121. *Hokkyō* refers to 'bridge or transmitter or the dharma' and corresponds to the eminent priest (*shōnin*). Therefore, 相模法橋 might mean someone who has a title of *hokkyō* and is from the Sagami area.

³⁷ For more information on the titles and ranks of Kamakura sculptors, see John M. Rosenfield, *Portraits of Chōgen: The Transformation of Buddhist Art in Early Medieval Japan* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 134-5.

³⁸ Ōta, *Yamato koji taikan*, 70; Nedachi Kensuke, *Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai: Unkei to keiha Shichijō busshi o chūshin ni* [Japanese medieval Buddhist sculptors and society: Focusing on Unkei and Shichijō sculptors in the Kei school] (Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2006), 272 and 320.

³⁹ Kōshō was the sculptor of Kūkai's portrait sculpture at Tōji, and his son, Kōen, also worked at Tōji as the chief Buddhist sculptor. See Nedachi, *Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai*, 272.

Tōdaiji 東大寺 in Nara enshrines thirteenth-century sculptures of Enma and Taizan Fukun that resemble those in Byakugōji (figs. III.17-18).⁴⁰ Their robes and hats are similar to those worn by Chinese magistrates. While Enma holds a flat scepter like a Chinese official, Taizan Fukun has a brush in his right hand and a dandadō staff topped with two heads in his left hand. Although the Byakugōji Taizan Fukun (fig. III.14) is now empty-handed, he makes the same hand gestures as the Tōdaiji Taizan Fukun, which suggests he may also at one time have held a brush and a staff. The Enma and Taizan Fukun of Tōdaiji were purportedly located in the hall called Nenbutsudō 念仏堂 that the prelate Chōgen 重源 (1121–1206) built in order to practice Pure Land Buddhism.⁴¹ The principle deity of the Nenbutsu hall is a large, seated Jizō bodhisattva made in 1237 by Kōsei 康清 (dates unknown), a Buddhist sculptor of the Kei school.⁴² Considering their similar style and fine joined-block construction, this Taizan Fukun seems to have been created as a set with a Jizō sculpture while the Enma is thought to have been made later than those two in the second half of the thirteenth century. 43 Unlike the attire of Jizō and Taizan Fukun, Enma's robe is decorated with dragon patterns done in the regional painting technique called *moriage* 盛上げ, which uses shell-white or powdered gold on the surface to achieve a relief-like effect.⁴⁴ In the case of Tōdaiji, the Enma serves as a subordinate figure to Jizō rather than as the most prominent.

Kongōsenji 金剛山寺 (Yatadera 矢田寺) known as a sacred space of Jizō in Nara once had a hall enshrining sculptures of Ten Kings and their associates. At present, two sculptures

⁴⁰ For the images, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Nara butsuzōkan meihin zuroku* [Catalogue of the masterpieces from the Nara Buddhist sculpture hall] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2010), 62.

⁴¹ Mino Yutaka, ed., *The Great Eastern Temple: Treasures of Japanese Buddhist Art from Tōdaiji* (Chicago: Art Institute of Chicago in association with Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1986), 30.

⁴² Nara Rokudaji Taikan Kankōkai, ed., *Nara rokudaji taikan* [Great overview of the six great temples in Nara], vol. 11 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1968-1973), 27.

⁴³ Mizuno, *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei*, 93-94.

⁴⁴ Mizuno, Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei 5, 94.

identified as Enma and Shimei⁴⁵ are extant (figs. III.19-20).⁴⁶ Of these two sculptures, the Enma image, rather small (height: 54.3 cm) and from the thirteenth century, is unusual in that he sits with his both feet on the floor. Moreover, he holds a flat scepter with both hands, dissimilar to other images of Enma; however, both the hands and the scepter are later additions.⁴⁷ Considering that his angry facial expression is not as severe when compared to other sculptures of Enma, it is possible that this sculpture depicts Taizan Fukun rather than Enma.⁴⁸ The Shimei sculpture, holding a brush in his right hand, seems to have been made later than the Enma sculpture, in the fourteenth century, as its unnatural style resembles the *dvarapalas* 守門神 (door guardian, Jp. *shumonjin*) sculpture made between 1322 and 1323 at the Ōyamazumi Shrine 大山祇神社 in Ehime prefecture; and the inscription inside the sculpture indicates it was repaired in 1582.⁴⁹ This image has the rare feature of silver plate used for the whites of the eyes and pupils inlaid with gilt-bronze plates.⁵⁰

Another group of thirteenth-century sculptures, now located at Hōshakuji 宝積寺 in Kyoto, emphasizes the importance of Enma (fig. III.21)⁵¹ who is accompanied by four attendants. All five sculptures initially belonged to the Enma hall at the entrance of Nishi Kannonji 西観音寺 to the north of Hōshakuji, but because Nishi Kannonji burned down in 1872, the sculptures had to be relocated to Hōshakuji. ⁵² The attendant figures include Taizan Fukun

⁴⁵ Formerly, the Shimei image was identified as Shiroku; however, referring to the Enmaten mandara 焰魔天曼荼羅, it was reattributed as Shimei. For more information, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Nara butsuzōkan meihin zuroku*, 63 and Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan and Bukkyō Bijutsu Kyōkai, ed., *Yatadera no butsuzō: tokubetsu chinretsu* [Special exhibition: Buddhist sculptures of Yatadera] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2000), 10-11, 34, and 36.

⁴⁶ For the images, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan and Bukkyō Bijutsu Kyōkai, *Yatadera no butsuzō*, 34 and 36.

⁴⁷ Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan and Bukkyō Bijutsu Kyōkai, *Yatadera no butsuzō*, 34.

⁴⁸ Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan and Bukkyō Bijutsu Kyōkai, *Yatadera no butsuzō*, 34

⁴⁹ Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, Nara butsuzōkan meihin zuroku, 63.

⁵⁰ Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 92.

⁵¹ For the image, see Tanabe Saburōsuke, *Shūgōshin*, *kōsō* [Combinary gods and high priests], *Nihon no bustuzō hakkya*, vol. 5 (Tokyo: Gyōsei, 1991), 108.

⁵² Tanabe, *Shūgōshin*, *kōsō*, 108.

(fig. III.22),⁵³ Godō Daijin (also known as King Godō Tenrin) (fig. III.23),⁵⁴ Shiroku (fig. III.24),⁵⁵ and Shimei (fig. III.25).⁵⁶ Sometimes Taizan Fukun is identified as Shimei, Godō Daijin as Shiroku, Shimei as Ankoku Dōji, and Shiroku as Kushōjin.⁵⁷ However, as the sculptures correspond to the figures in the thirteenth-century Enmaten mandalas (fig. I.14), such designation is incorrect.⁵⁸ Moreover, the sculptural organization of Hōshakuji is repeated in the painting of King Enma from the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century at Chōsenji, Osaka (fig. I.17), which depicts Enma, accompanied by Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shiroku, and Shimei, intimidating sinners in his court. As discussed in Chapter One, Taizan Fukun administering the realms of the dead found under Mount Tai and Godō Daijin overseeing the five paths of rebirth are equivalent to the seventh king Taizan and the tenth king Godō Tenrin of the underworld, respectively. These two were treated as special aides to Enma, the lord of the underworld.⁵⁹

Seated on *raiban tatami*, the Hōshakuji Enma, Taizan Fukun, and Godō Tenrin all have beards, look fierce, and wear the coats of Chinese officials. They also wear hats in different styles and hold different objects in their hands. For example, Enma has a flat scepter, Taizan Fukun holds a brush and a book, and Godō Tenrin has a brush and a handscroll.⁶⁰ Shimei and Shiroku are dressed in simple high-necked garments worn over pantaloons, and they are seated

⁵³ For the image, see Tanabe, *Shūgōshin*, *kōsō*, 109.

⁵⁴ For the image, see Tanabe, *Shūgōshin*, *kōsō*, 109.

⁵⁵ For the image, see Nishikawa Kyōtarō and Emily J. Sano, *The Great Age of Japanese Buddhist Sculpture: AD 600-1300* (Fort Worth: Kimbell Art Museum; New York: Japan Society, 1982), 117.

⁵⁶ For the image, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 89.

⁵⁷ See Nishikawa and Sano, *The Great Age of Japanese Buddhist Sculpture*, 116.

⁵⁸ Tanabe, *Shūgōshin*, *kōsō*, 108.

⁵⁹ They were mentioned in the early tenth-century sutra *Shiwang jing*. See the following excerpt from Teiser, *The Scripture on the Ten Kings*, 198-199.

[&]quot;As he approached parinirvāṇa, the Buddha lifted himself up and emitted a ray that universally illuminated the great multitude as well as a myriad of Bodhisattvas and Mahāsattvas; heavenly dragons and spirit kings; ... Yama [Enma], Son of Heaven; the Magistrate of Mount T'ai [Taizan Fukun]; the Officer of Life Spans [Shimei] and Officer of Records [Shiroku]; the Great Spirit of the Five Paths [Godō Daijin]; and the officials of the underground prisons."

⁶⁰ In Enmaten mandalas, Taizan Fukun holds a staff topped with a human head instead of a handscroll.

with one leg folded on a stool covered by an animal skin. Shiroku holds a brush in his right hand, and his left hand holds a long wooden plank. His companion, Shimei, sits holding a handscroll in both hands. Constructed of several pieces of hollowed wood according to the joined-block technique, this group of sculptures are major works from the thirteenth century, showing exaggerated facial expressions and natural and sturdy physiques.

Lastly, Kamakura-period sculptures of Enma and his associates can be found at the Hirabori Enmei Jizō hall 平堀延命地蔵堂 in Niigata and at Jōshinji 浄信寺, also known as Kinomoto Jizōin 木之本地蔵院, in Shiga. The Hirabori Enmei Jizō hall enshrines two sculptures; one is believed to be Enma (or one of the ten kings) and the other is Shimei (or Kushōjin), which are dated to the late thirteenth century (figs. III.26-27). The two flank a seated sculpture of Jizō (1355), the main deity of the hall. The purported Enma sculpture wears a crown and has his mouth open, while the purported Shimei sculpture wears a cap and has a firmly closed mouth. The former is depicted sitting on a chair, whereas the latter sits with his right knee up. The use of single-block carving technique and the similar stylistic features, such as massively carved eyes, eyebrows, and noses, indicate that the two sculptures were made as a set. At Jōshinji, a standing sculpture of Jizō (1242) is flanked by two standing sculptures: one of Enma (or Kushōjin) holding a sword in his right hand and a handscroll in his left and the other of Kushōjin, both from the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries (figs. III.28-29).

⁶¹ For the images, see Niigata Kenritsu Kindai Bijutsukan, *Niigata no butsuzō ten: Chūetsu daishinsai fukkō kinen tokubetsuten* [Commemorative special exhibition of the Chūetsu earthquake reconstruction: Exhibition on the Buddhist images in Niigata] (Niigata: Niigata no Butsuzōten Jikkō linkai, 2006), 98-99.

⁶² The former sculpture at Hirabori Enmei Jizō hall wears shoes with the Chinese character "王", meaning a king, on their toes, which establish it as one of the Ten Kings. Among the Ten Kings, Enma is commonly depicted with his mouth open, showing his upper teeth and tongue, and holding a flat scepter. The hands of the former sculpture are rendered as if they are holding something, most likely a scepter. Thus, the former sculpture appears to be Enma. On the other hand, the latter sculpture is presumed to be Shimei since its hands appear as if they are holding an unfolded handscroll, an item most Shimei images are described as having.

⁶³ For the images, see Mizuno Keizaburō, ed., *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei: Kamakura jidai: zōzō meiki hen: kaisetsu* [Compilation of fundamental data on Japanese sculpture: Kamakura period: Records of images with inscriptions: Commentary], vol. 5 (Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2003), 178.

former is depicted as angry with furrowed brows and an open mouth, while the latter is depicted as an old man, clenching his teeth. However, as they are both similar in size, standing straight, wearing similar robes and hats, they are sometimes thought to be two Kushōjin figures.⁶⁴ In any case, this pair serves as a rare example of Enma and his entourage, along with another pair in the Hirabori Enmei Jizō hall.

Examining the surviving sculptures of Enma and his entourage from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries (Kamakura period), we can see a certain level of consistency in their rendering in sculptural form. In particular, most of the Enma sculptures have a wrathful facial expression with bulging eyes, furrowed brows, and an open mouth. These distinctive features seem to have reinforced his presence as the most frightening king and ultimate judge of the underworld. Moreover, many sculptures of Enma and other kings are seated cross-legged, either on the floor or on raised platforms in the shape of *tatami* mats, unlike their Chinese counterparts who are seated on chairs behind their desks. Such changes might have resulted from the impact of Japanese portrait paintings in which the sitters are often depicted seated on raised platforms in the shape of *tatami* mats.⁶⁵

The above survey of the Kamakura-period sculptures of Enma and his associates also reveals the evolution of the Ten Kings sculptures in terms of their configuration in Japan. The sculptural organizations of Enma, Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shiroku, or Shimei in Byakugōji, Hōshakuji, and Tōdaiji presumably refer back to the arrangement of earliest yet no longer extant sculptures at Daigoji, which is based on the grouping of deities in mandalas dedicated to Enmaten. This array of sculptures may have been related to such esoteric Buddhist rituals as i

64 Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 93.

⁶⁵ During the Kamakura (12th–14th century) and Muromachi (14th–16th century) periods, numerous portrait paintings of emperors, courtiers, samurai, feudal lords, and intellectuals were produced, and this genre of portrait painting remarkably developed. Murashige Yasushi, "Tennō to kuge no shōzō" [Portraits of emperors and courtiers], *Nihon no bijutsu* 387 (August 1998): 53.

Enmaten ku 閻魔天供 and Meidō ku 冥道供, as well as the onmyōdō 陰陽道 (The Way of Yin and Yang) ritual Taizan Fukun sai 泰山府君祭, which were offered to Enma (Enmaten and King Enma), Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shiroku, and Shimei in order to heal illness, prolong life, avert misfortune, or secure the safe delivery of a child. Such a configuration, however, did not appear during the Muromachi and Edo periods. Rather, the En'nōji layout of placing Enma at the center and the other nine kings and attendants on both sides of Enma as well as the current Rokuharamitsuji configuration of Enma accompanied by Shiroku and Shimei appeared repeatedly throughout subsequent periods.

Enma Triad at the Rokuharamitsuji

The present Rokuharamitsuji sculptural configuration of Enma and his entourage consists of a large Enma (height: 88.5 cm) (fig. III.1), his two smaller scale assistant officials, Shiroku (height: 55.4 cm) (fig. III.2) and Shimei (height: 54.8 cm) (fig. III.3), and the old hag Datsueba of similar size (height: 36.5 cm) (fig. IV.38). While the Enma and Shiroku sculptures are said to have been made between the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries, the Shimei figure seems to have been added in the seventeenth century. Enma is dressed in a simple, round-necked coat of the type worn by a Chinese official with large, long, and round sleeves that fall over his

-

⁶⁶ Enma (Enmaten and eventually King Enma), Taizan Fukun, Godō Daijin, Shiroku, and Shimei were thought of as the magistrates of the underworld, who controlled the fate of all human beings both before and after death. *Enmaten ku, Meidō ku*, and *Taizan Fukun sai* rituals invoking these figures became popular among court nobility in the eleventh and twelfth centuries. Esoteric Buddhist rituals like *Enmaten ku* and *Meidō ku* were mentioned in *Asabashō* (阿娑縛抄, a thirteenth-century compendium of Tendai rituals) and *Kakuzenshō* (覚禅鈔, a twelfth- or thirteenth-century iconographic compilation of the Shingon tradition). According to *Konjaku Monogatari shū* from the late Heian period (794–1185), the *Taizan Fukun sai* ritual was performed by the legendary Onmyōdō practitioner Abe no Seimei (安倍晴明, 921–1005). For a fuller treatment of the *Taizan Fukun sai* ritual, see Masuo Shin'ichirō, "Taizan Fukun sai to 'Meidō junishin' no keisei" [Development of the Taizan Fukun sai and the twelve deities of the underworld], in *Shigo no sekai: Indo, Chūgoku, Nihon no meikai shinkō* [The world after death: underworld belief in India, China, and Japan], ed. Tanaka Sumio (Tokyo: Tōyō Shorin, 2000), 228-252; Masuo, "Chinese Religion and the Formation of Onmyōdō," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 40, no. 1 (2013): 35-36; Saitō Hideki, *Onmyōdō no kamigami* [Deities of Onmyōdō] (Kyoto: Bukkyō Daigaku Tsūshin Kyōikubu: seisaku hatsubai Shinbunkaku Shuppan, 2007), 62-64, 73, 88; Shigeta Shin'ichi, "A Portrait of Abe no Seimei," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 40, no. 1 (2013): 93-93.

trousers. The collar of his robe overlaps in front behind his beard as he tucks in his chin. Enma has an imposing physique with rigidly raised shoulders. He wears a straight waistband, which is only shown in the back. On both sides are the folded pleats of the sleeves. His right hand holds a flat scepter, which was added later, while his left rests on his left thigh.⁶⁷ He also wears boots and a crown with projections at each side. Enma shows a face contorted in fury, which is emphasized by deeply furrowed eyebrows, glaring bulging eyes and a mouth opened in a yell. This sculpture was originally painted with black lacquer and polychrome, which has flaked off, exposing the wooden surface. His face was colored in red. On the left sleeve are found remains of *moriage* (shell-white) patterns. According to the inscription board found inside the sculpture, it was repaired in 1631.⁶⁸

The Rokuharamitsuji Enma shares similarities with the other Enma sculptures from the Kamakura period at En'nōji (fig. III.6), Byakugōji (fig. III.13), Tōdaiji (fig. III.17), and Hōshakuji (fig. III.21) discussed above. Those similarities include a red face, a furious facial expression, beads on the base of the crown, and large sleeves placed forward and shaped like bags. Moreover, like other figures of Enma, the one at Rokuharamitsuji is composed of several pieces of wood, following the conventional method of joined-block construction. His eyes are also crystal inserts. Specifically, the Enma sculpture at Rokuharamitsuji, most resembles the one at Hōshakuji in that both have an open space under their armpits. Regardless of those resemblances, compared to other Enma examples, the Rokuharamitsuji image is smaller in size, and has a wider square face and more stiffly raised high shoulders. Furthermore, his garment is more simplified, with more formalized patterns on the garment.⁶⁹ Such similarities and

⁶⁷ Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 19.

⁶⁸ Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 19. The tatami mat that Enma sits on might have been added when the figure was restored.

⁶⁹ Sugimoto Sonoko and Kawasaki Ryūshō, *Koji junrei, Kyoto* [Pilgrimage to old temples in Kyoto] 25, *Rokuharamitsuji* (Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1978), 133.

differences suggest that the figure of Enma at Rokuharamitsuji was created in the late Kamakura period.⁷⁰

As one of Enma's assistants, Shiroku (fig. III.2) accompanies Enma at Rokuharamitsuji. He is garbed as a clerk in a simple round-necked upper garment with long sleeves, which is worn over pantaloons. Folds in the clothing add texture to the sculpture. A belt decorated with small round medallions is wrapped around his waist, but is shown only in the back. He also wears long boots and a cap with the projection divided into two and rolled over. His cap is further decorated with a strap knotted in front of the projection, crossed at the back, and connected to the base of the cap. He has a sturdy body, a firmly closed mouth, and curly locks of beard hair, which are shown three-dimensionally. The shapes of his robe, boots, and cap show great resemblance to those of other Shiroku figures, such as those at Byakugōji (fig. III.15) and Hōshakuji (fig. III.24). Like those figures, the Rokuharamitsuji Shiroku was made in the joined-woodblock technique, using many separate wood blocks, carefully assembled. Moreover, inlaid crystals were used for the eyes.

Because of the exaggerated facial expressions of anger and the embellished modeling of garments shared by both, it is thought that the Shiroku image at Rokuharamitsuji was sculpted around the same time when Enma figure was made, that is, between the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries.⁷¹ While other thirteenth-century Shiroku sculptures at Hōshakuji and Byakugōji turn their heads to the left to see the wooden writing tablets held in their left hands,

-

Nec Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 19; Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," 96; Rokuharamitsuji, et al, *Shomin no kokoro ni ikita: Kūya no tera, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten* [Exhibition on Rokuharamitsuji, the temple of Kūya who lived in the hearts of ordinary people, in Kyoto] (Tokyo: Asahi Shinbun, 1973), 27; Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, ed., *Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō* [Buddhist sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji] (Tokyo: Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2008), 14; and Sugimoto and Kawasaki, 133.
⁷¹ Sugimoto and Kawasaki, 133. Here, Shiroku is referred to as Shimei, and vice versa. However, as indicated in the *Sutra on the Bodhisattva Jizō's Aspiration for Enlightenment and the Ten Kings* compiled between 1000 and 1300, Shimei is recorded as a god in charge of life and Shiroku as a god in charge of records. Therefore, it is accurate to say that the one holding a scroll, on which judgment is written, is Shimei, while the figure holding a brush and writing with it is Shiroku.

the Rokuharamitsuji Shiroku looks straight ahead. Considering that a Shiroku figure at Kongōsenji (fig. III.20) from the fourteenth century is similarly looking forward with a stern appearance, it is believed that the Rokuharamitsuji image might have been made in the fourteenth century too. Holding a brush in his right hand and a handscroll in his left, Shiroku sits with his right leg tucked up on the pedestal, which is painted to look as if a tiger skin were draped over it. His left wrist, the handscroll, the brush, and the pedestal are all later additions.⁷²

Shiroku's companion, Shimei (fig. III.3), also assists Enma at Rokuharamitsuji. Like Shiroku, Shimei wears a simple round-necked upper garment with long sleeves over pantaloons, along with boots and a cap. However, Shimei forms an interesting contrast to Shiroku in several aspects. In the case of Shimei, a waistband is tightened over his bulging belly. Compared to Shiroku who has a rather solid body, Shimei's body is generally round. Moreover, Shimei wears boots that are longer and less decorative than those of Shiroku. Shimei's hat looks similar to Shiroku's, but the former has rod-like projections at each side. He raises his left hand to shoulder level and his right hand to belly level, bending the elbows. Both hands with their palms facing upwards are shaped as if holding each side of the now-missing handscroll. These hand gestures are reminiscent of the Shimei image unfurling a scroll at Hōshakuji (fig. III.25). Shimei has a stern and angry face like Shiroku; nonetheless, Shimei with a long beard keeps his mouth open unlike Shiroku who is depicted with his mouth firmly closed. Shimei is seated with his left leg folded on a pedestal that is decorated with leopard-skin patterns.⁷³

⁷² Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 20.

⁷³ In the thirteenth-century Enmaten mandalas located in the Kyoto National Museum (fig. III.31) and Onjōji in Shiga Prefecture (fig. I.14), Shiroku and Shimei flank Taizan Fukun, and each of them sits on a stool spread with the skin of a leopard and a tiger respectively. Moreover, Shiroku and Shimei are depicted seated on such stools in the painting of King Enma from the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century at Chōsenji in Osaka (fig. I.17). The Rokuharamitsuji Shiroku and Shimei, however, rest on tiger-patterned and leopard-patterned pedestals respectively. For fig. III.33, see Sawa and Hamada, *Mikkyō bijutsu taikan*, vol. 4, 57.

Based on the lack of strength in the flesh of his face and body, this Shimei figure at Rokuharamitsuji seems to have been made later than the Shiroku figure.⁷⁴ It seems to have been sculpted either in 1629 when the Datsueba image was created by the Kyoto sculptor Kōyū 康猶 (?–1632) or in 1631 when the Enma sculpture was repaired.⁷⁵ Since Shiroku and Shimei are a customary pair of officials present at King Enma's court, I believe that the current Shimei figure replaced the original one that was made alsong with the Enma and Shiroku images from the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries.

<u>Propositions of the Original Sculptural Configuration</u>

The previously discussed survey of the Kamakura-period sculptures of Enma and his associates in Chapter One and in this chapter show the development of the configuration of Ten Kings sculptures in Japan. It evolved from an arrangement corresponding to that seen in esoteric Enmaten mandalas to arrangements that either placed Enma at the center and other nine kings and attendants on both sides of Enma or formed a triad of Enma accompanied by Shiroku and Shimei. By the late thirteenth century, the latter two layouts had successfully taken root in Japan as predominant iconographical representations of the sculpted Ten Kings. This leads us deduce that the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural program originally formed either a triad consisting of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei or a group of ten kings and Enma's two associates.

The formation of an Enma triad representing the Ten Kings and the underworld bureaucracy was also utilized even in a miniature, portable shrine called *zushi* 厨子. For example, in the case of the *zushi* (fig. III.30) now located in Shōmyōji 正明寺 in Sakai City and

⁷⁴ Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō*, 15.

⁷⁵ Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 20.

purportedly produced in 1356, a tiny sculpture of Enma (height: 4.0 cm)⁷⁶ is inside, while the inner sides of its doors display painted images of Shimei and Shiroku.⁷⁷ The inner rear wall of the *zushi* bears an inscription proclaiming its origin in 1356 in vermilion lacquer; according to the inscription, the Enma sculpture was made by the high priest Jishin 茲心 from the pine tree in the garden just outside Enma's office and given by the monk Izumi 泉惠 in Miidera 三井寺 to Zenshō Shōnin 禪照上人.⁷⁸ This *zushi*, when it was opened, showed a triad of Enma and his principle assistants. Such an Enma triad configuration continued to appear occasionally during the Muromachi period and frequently during the Edo period.⁷⁹ Thus, if one accepts that the Enma triad at Rokuharamitsuji is its original formation, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei may serve as an important precedent for the sculptural configuration of Ten Kings that became predominant in Japan after the thirteenth century.

Alternatively, the original configuration of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures may have followed the arrangement of En'nōji, which placed Enma at the center and other figures, such as the other nine kings and their attendants, on his both sides. This formation was the alternate arrangement of the sculpted Ten Kings that has continued to be predominant in Japan since the thirteenth century. In the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, particularly, many sculptures of Ten Kings and their associates in this configuration were produced by Buddhist sculptors from well-established workshops, including Nanto Fujiyama bussho 南都富士山仏所 and Shukuin bussho 宿院仏所 in the Nara area. ⁸⁰ The sculpture program of Enma and his two assistants might have

⁷⁶ Although small, this Enma sculpture exhibits common features with other visual representations of the king. He is depicted as ferocious with an open mouth and seated with his legs crossed. He wears a hat marked with the Chinese character " \pm " and appears to have held a flat scepter, which is missing at present, in his right hand.

⁷⁷ For the image, see Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan, *Sakai no butsuzō butsuga*, 31.

⁷⁸ Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan, *Sakai no butsuzō butsuga*, 101.

⁷⁹ Wakabayashi "Officials of the Afterworld," 343.

⁸⁰ For instance, Jōnenji 常念寺, in Kyoto, has sculptures of Ten Kings, two Kushōjin, and Datsueba (fig. I.35), which were created by Chinkei 珍慶, the sculptor of Nanto Fujiyama bussho, from 1474 to 1476. For the inscriptions documenting its creation date and sculptor, see Nedachi Kensuke, "Muromachi no chōkoku: chūsei

坊目誌 (Journal of a Kyoto monk) written in 1916 by Usui Kosaburō 稚井小三郎 (1865–1928) notes that the Enma hall at Rokuharamitsuji enshrined nine other kings along with Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku. 81 Although sculptures of those nine other kings are nowhere to be found, the entries in *Kyoto bōmokuji* support the proposition that the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures originally formed a configuration featuring a centered Enma with the nine other kings and their attendants flanking him. Accordingly, such direct reference to the existence of sculptures at the Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall leads to a more logical supposition for the original configuration as a set with the nine other kings.

Enma Hall at the Rokuharamitsuji

Regardless of its original layout, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group was enshrined in an Enma hall on Matsubara Street, which was repeatedly destroyed and rebuilt. The earliest documentation of the Enma hall is found in the fifteenth volume of the thirteenth-century history book entitled *Hyakurenshō* 百鍊抄 in which extracts from entries of court diaries and other records were compiled. The entry on the twelfth day, third month of 1243 (Kangen 寬元 1) notes:

戌時六波羅炎魔堂燒亡

-

chōkoku kara kinsei chōkoku e" [Sculptures of Muromachi: From medieval sculpture to early modern sculpture], Nihon no Bijutsu 494 (2007): 65. Moreover, in 1559, the Shukuin Buddhist sculptors Genji 源次 and his son Genzaburō 源三郎 together made sculptures of Ten Kings, Shimei, Shiroku, and Datsueba at Taimadera 當麻寺 in Nara. For the images and inscriptions on them, see Naraken Kyōiku Iinkai, Nara-ken chūsei chōkoku chōsa hōkoku: Shukuin busshi: Sengoku jidai no Nara busshi [Shukuin Buddhist sculptors: Buddhist scuptors of the Warring States era in Nara, report on the investigation of medieval period sculpture in Nara Prefecture] (Nara: Naraken Kyōiku Iinkai, 1998), 64-66. For more information on Shukuin sculptors, see Fowler, Accounts and Images of Six Kannon in Japan, 102-105.

⁸¹ Usui Kosaburō, *Kyoto bōmokuji* [Journal of a Kyoto monk], Section: Shimogyō, 21. School District, in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho*, vol. 21, 50.

The Enma hall in Rokuhara [Rokuharamitsuji] burned down during the hours of the dog, which indicates dusk between 7 pm and 9 pm. After the 1243 fire, a new Enma hall must have been built to enshrine the sculptures of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei. Nevertheless, it is still not clear whether the sculptures of Enma and Shiroku currently enshrined in the temple's Treasure hall were created after the fire.

Several sources in the Edo period (1615–1868) record the continuation of an Enma hall. As a case in point, according to the gazetteer entitled *Yamashiro meishō shi* 山城名勝志 (Annals of Yamashiro's Picturesque Sites, 1705), the Enma hall existed outside the temple gate. Records on Rokuharamitsuji), written in 1730, records that the Enma hall was oriented to the north.

Miyako meisho zue 都名所図会 (Illustrations of Famous Places in Kyoto), a guide book first published in 1780 to explain and illustrate scenic spots and the precincts of shrines and temples in Kyoto in response to the popularization of travel, also depicts the Enma hall located in

⁸² Ōshima Takeyoshi 大島武好 (1633–1704), *Yamashiro meishō shi* [Annals of Yamashiro's picturesque sites] 15, in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyoto*, vol. 14, 236.

⁸³ Shusetsusai 守拙斎 (1688–1716), *Kyōuchi mairi* [Visiting Kyoto], in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho*, vol. 5, 437.

⁸⁴ *Yamashiro meiseki junkōshi* [Guidebook for touring famous historic places in Yamashiro] 2, in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho*, vol. 22, 294.

⁸⁵ Ikeda Tōri 池田東籬 (1788-1857), *Miyako meishoguruma* [Famous places in Kyoto on wheels], in Noma and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho*, vol. 5, 497.

⁸⁶ Gangoji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo, *Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū*, 63.

the vicinity of Rokuharamitsuji's front gate (figs. III.32-33).⁸⁷ Although almost half of the building is hidden in the clouds, a cartouche indicates its location. The existence of a Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall is once more confirmed in the map called *Kyōmachi miezu saiken taisei* 京町御絵図細見大成 (Completed Pictorial Map of Closely Inspected Kyoto) published first in 1831 and reprinted in 1868.⁸⁸ In this map, the Enma hall across from Rokuharamitsuji is designated as a Ten Kings hall, Jūōdō 十王堂 (fig. III.34).⁸⁹ Since Enma represents the Ten Kings of the underworld, an Enma hall is often referred to as a Ten Kings hall. As stated in the entries in *Kyoto bōmokuji*, the Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall (Enmadō), which was also called Ten Kings hall, was originally placed in the Toribeno graveyard and later became a part of Rokuharamitsuji.⁹⁰ The Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall ended up being destroyed in 1871, and afterward the sculptures were moved to inside the main hall.⁹¹

In Japan, small Enma halls were built on roadsides in villages or in temple precincts for people to visit daily. The Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall, which seemed small as well, sat on Matsubara Street, which was lined with many temples, including Saifukuji 西福寺. The *Historical Records on Rokuharamitsuji* (1730) mentioned above lists all the buildings in and near the temple precinct with their locations and the measurements of each building's floor space. According to this document, the floor space of the Enma hall measures six *tsubo* 坪 (about 19.8 sq m). In comparison, the floor space of the main hall rebuilt in 1363 measures 108 *tsubo* (about 356.4 sq m), eighteen times larger than the Enma hall. The size of the Enma hall can be

⁸⁷ Miyako meisho zue edited by Akisato Ritō 秋里籬島 (active 1780–1814) and illustrated by Takehara Shunchōsai 竹原春朝斎 (?–1801) was published by Yoshinoya Tamehachi 吉野屋為八 in Kyoto first in 1780 and reprinted in 1786. It consists of six volumes. For fig. 34, see Kokusai Nihon Bunka Kenkyū Center, Miyako meisho zue Database, accessed August 10, 2018, http://www.nichibun.ac.jp/meisyozue/kyoto/page7/km_01_077.html.

⁸⁸ This map was reprinted by a map store Takehara Kōbee 竹原好兵衛.

⁸⁹ For the image, see the map entitled *Kyōmachi miezu saiken taisei* (first published in 1831 and reprinted in 1868).

⁹⁰ Usui, Kyoto bōmokuji, in Shinshū Kyoto sōsho, 50.

⁹¹ Usui, Kyoto bōmokuji, in Shinshū Kyoto sōsho, 50.

estimated in *Karaku meishō zue* 花洛名勝図会 (An Illustrated Guide to Places of Scenic Beauty in Kyoto) compiled in 1864 as it includes a picture depicting a precinct of Rokuharamitsuji, which is spread over two pages (fig. III.35).⁹² The largest building on the left page is the main hall, while a building under the cartouche that reads Enma hall can be found in the right corner of the right page. Although only a part of the Enma hall is shown and if the drawing is accurate, we can see how small the Enma hall was compared to the main hall.

The existence of the Enma hall and the sculptures of Enma and his entourage at Rokuharamitsuji was preordained, given the neighborhood of the salvation-oriented temple. As discussed in Chapter Two, Rokuharamitsuji founded by the major Pure Land Buddhism proponent Kūya was situated in Rokuhara, the area physically and conceptually accorded with death and afterlife. The proximity to the Toribeno graveyard and Rokudō no tsuji (Crossroad of the Six Paths) turned Rokuhara into a liminal space between the underworld and the living world. Located in such neighborhood, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures of Enma and his associates in the Enma hall may have been thought to facilitate travel between the two worlds.

Paintings of the Ten Kings at Rokuharamitsuji

In addition to the sculptures of Enma and his entourage, Rokuharamitsuji holds paintings of Ten Kings. These paintings were discovered in the temple storehouse along with more than 2,000 Buddhist objects and ancient documents in April 2008 when the storehouse was rebuilt.⁹³ In June of the same year, the paintings were first open to the general public at the temple, and then, in 2016, they were included in the exhibition *Rakuyō Sanjūsan Sho* 洛陽三十三所 (Thirtythree sacred places in Kyoto), which was held at the Kyoto Bunka Hakubutsukan. However,

⁹² For the image, see Kokusai Nihon Bunka Kenkyū Center, Karaku meishō zue Database, accessed August 11, 2018, http://www.nichibun.ac.jp/meisyozue/karaku/page7/km_04_05_019f.html.

100

^{93 &}quot;Kyoto, Rokuharamitsuji de Jūōzu ippan kōkai," *Yomiuri shinbun* (June 17, 2008), 39.

except for small images in an exhibition pamphlet, they have not been published.⁹⁴ Furthermore, it is unclear how they came into the collection of Rokuharamitsuji.

Despite their rather obscure origins, the examination of these Ten Kings paintings is an opportunity to speculate on their probable uses in tandem with the sculptural program at Rokuharamitsuji situated in the liminal space between the underworld and the living world. A set of ten separate hanging scrolls—one for each king—is purportedly attributed to the Southern Song artist Lu Xinzhong 陸信忠 (fl. early to mid-thirteenth century), who ran a family painting workshop in Ningbo 寧波, China. Three scrolls portraying the first king, King Shinkō 秦広王 (Ch. *Qinguang Wang*), the second king, King Shokō 初江王 (Ch. *Chujiang Wang*), and the tenth king, King Godō Tenrin 五道転輸王 (Ch. *Wudao Zhuanlun Wang*) bear the signature of Lu Xinzhong (fl.ca. 1195–1276): "Painted by Lu Xinzhong" 陸信忠筆 (Ch. *Lu Xinzhong bi*). Lu Xinzhong is recorded as a Buddhist painter during the Yuan dynasty (1271–1368) in the *Kundaikan sōchōki* 君台観左右帳記 (A Manner Book for the Assembly Hall) in the fifteenth-and sixteenth-century catalogues (secret documents) of the Ashikaga shogunal collection with display instructions, written by Nōami 能阿弥 (1397–1471) and his grandson Sōami 相阿弥 (d. 1525).95

Each hanging scroll has a cartouche in either the upper left or upper right corner, which carries an inscription, like the following:

一七秦廣大王

On the first-seventh day: the Great King Shinkō

⁹⁴ Kyoto Bunka Hakubutsukan, *Rakuyō Sanjūsan Sho: Engi to Sonzō* [Thirty-three sacred places in Kyoto: History and image] (Kyoto: Kyoto Bunka Hakubutsukan, 2016).

⁹⁵ The original is lost, but there are over 150 manuscripts and publications of *Kundaikan sōchōki* divided into two groups of Nōami version (1476) and Sōami version (1511). See Sōami, *Kundaikan sōchōki*, vol. 1 (Tokyo: Yūrindō, 1884).

This inscription denotes that, seven days after their death, deceased people confront the first king, Shinkō, in his court, where they are detained, tortured, and judged according to their conduct during their life.

Every painting of the Rokuharamitsuji set emphasizes the justice and harshness of each king by dividing its composition into two parts. The upper half of the painting presents a king as a judge. As the main figure of each scroll, a king, wearing headgear with the Chinese character "king" \pm (J. δ ; Ch. wang) and a voluminous garment, sits in a large armchair covered with a patterned fabric. In front of him, there is a desk, on which lies an open scroll and writing tools, and, behind him are a painted screen and a decorated balustrade. He is also accompanied by at least two attendants who assist him in reaching a verdict in the trials. In such paintings, kings are depicted as judges. The lower half of the painting, by contrast, highlights the cruel side of each king with scenes of torture and punishment. For example, in the hanging scroll of the sixth king named Hensei is a mountain densely filled with vertical blades (fig. III.36). Scary looking hell jailers with blue and green skin push a wheel of fire towards the sinners and turn the handle of the mortar, in which a sinner is stuck upside down. Blood spills over the bodies of these criminals. Other scrolls in the set show similar composition.

It appears that the Rokuharamitsuji images were not necessarily painted by Lu Xinzhong but by several other painters, including Lu Zhongyuan 陸仲淵 (active 13th–14th century), in Lu Xinzhong's atelier, exhibiting the formal and iconographic conventions often found in other Ten Kings paintings. As briefly mentioned above, Lu Xinzhong managed a workshop in Ningbo, an important port city for trade with Korea and Japan, in present-day Zhejiang province, and his family workshop produced a large corpus of paintings of popular Buddhist subjects. In particular, more than ten sets of the Ten Kings paintings purportedly by Lu Xinzhong and his atelier are now known: Kōtōin 高桐院, Nara; Zendōji 善導寺, Fukuoka; Daitokuji 大徳寺,

Kyoto; Kanagawa Prefectural Museum, Yokohama; Nara National Museum, Nara; Eigenji 永源寺, Shiga Prefecture; Jōdoji 浄土寺, Hiroshima Prefecture; Hōnenji 法然寺, Kagawa Prefecture; Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko 神奈川県立金沢文庫 (Kanagawa Prefectural Kanazawa-Bunko Museum), Yokohama; Masaki Art Museum, Osaka; and Museum für Ostasiatische Kunst, Berlin. These sets can be divided largely into three groups based on the composition and iconographies of paintings: (1) Kōtōin, Museum für Ostasiatische Kunst, Nara National Museum, and Zendōji; (2) Daitokuji and Kanagawa Prefectural Museum; and (3) Eigenji, Hōnenji, Jōdoji, Kanazawa Bunko, and Masaki Museum. The Rokuharamitsuji set best fits in the third group.

None of Lu Xinzhong's scrolls in the three groups illustrate hell scenes as fully as the Rokuharamitsuji scrolls. Nevertheless, the upper halves of some paintings in the Rokuharamitsuji set bear a resemblance to those in the third group. For instance, the composition of the painting of the first king, King Shinkō, in the Rokuharamitsuji set (fig. III.37) is somewhat similar to that of the Eigenji painting (fig. III.38).98 Both paintings show the first king holding a brush, two attendants standing at the king's right side, a hell jailer opening up the mouth of a sinner with tongs, and another jailer heating an iron ball in flames to put it into the sinner's mouth. The Rokuharamitsuji scroll, however, has more elements, such as the clouds surrounding the screen and two more attendants on each side of the king. Moreover, its lower half is more embellished with hell jailers and sinners in torture, although it is missing the balustrade.

⁹⁶ For more information on Lu, see Kajitani, "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu," 22-38.

⁹⁷ Nakano Teruo in "Enma jūō zō" and Lothar Ledderose in his book *Ten Thousand Things* discuss Lu Xinzhong's paintings of Ten Kings, conforming to this grouping. These groups of Ten Kings paintings were produced by the workshop, transferring motifs, figures, and groups with stencils. The differences in quality and details among these groups resulted from the economic status of their patrons. For further study, see Ledderose, *Ten Thousand Things*, 168-176.

⁹⁸ For fig. III.38, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō*, 89.

a similar vein, the upper halves of the Rokuharamitsuji paintings of the fifth king, King Enma, and tenth king, King Godō Tenrin, closely resemble those of the corresponding scrolls in the Eigenji set, exhibiting only slight disparities (figs. III.39-42).⁹⁹

Other scrolls in the Rokuharamitsuji set do not perfectly match those from the sets in the third group; however, the repeated uses of some motifs are apparent. As a case in point, a figural group of a woman in a cangue, a baby following her, and a hell jailer pulling the cangue appears in the painting of the fourth king, King Gokan, in the Rokuharamitsuji set (fig. III.43), while such a group emerges in paintings of the sixth king, King Hensei, from the sets in the third group, including the Eigenji set and the Kanazawa Bunko sets (figs. III.44-45). As another case in point, a painting of the third king, King Sōtei, in the Rokuharamitsuji set (fig. III.46) and that of the second king, King Shokō, in the Eigenji set (fig. III.47) show a figural group consisting of a hell jailer grasping the hair of a sinner whose hands and toes are tied fast and another hell jailer holding a stick with which he beats the soles of the sinner's feet.

While some scrolls from the Rokuharamitsuji set share similarities in composition and motifs with those from the sets designated as the third group among the Ten Kings paintings produced by Lu Xinzhong and his workshop, three hanging scrolls of the fifth king, King Enma (fig. III.39), the seventh king, King Taizan (fig. III.48), and the tenth king, King Godō Tenrin (fig. III.41), are almost identical to those from another Chinese set in the Nara National Museum (figs. III.49-51), which are dated to the fourteenth century. Only three scrolls are extant in the Nara set, and two of them also carry the signature of the Yuan painter Lu Zhongyuan (active

-

⁹⁹ Fig. III.39 matches fig. III.40. For fig. III.40, see Nakano Teruo, "Enma jūō zō," pl. 2. Fig. III.41 matches fig. III.42. For fig. III.42, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō*, 91.

¹⁰⁰ For fig. III.44, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō*, 90. For fig. III.45, see Ledderose, *Ten Thousand Things*, 174.

¹⁰¹ For fig. III.47, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, Seichi Ninpō, 89.

¹⁰² For fig. III.49, see Nara National Museum Collection Database, accessed August 10, 2018, https://www.narahaku.go.jp/collection/1006-1.html. For fig. III.50, see Nara National Museum Collection Database, accessed August 10, 2018, https://www.narahaku.go.jp/collection/1006-2.html. For fig. III.51, see Nara National Museum Collection Database, accessed August 10, 2018, https://www.narahaku.go.jp/collection/1006-3.html.

13th—14th century): "Painted by Lu Zhongyuan" 陸仲淵筆 (Ch. *Lu Zhongyuan bi*). Like Lu Xinzhong, he was mentioned in the *Kundaikan sōchōki*, but only two hanging scrolls of arhats at Nōmanin 能満院 in Nara and Jōshōkōji 常照皇寺 in Kyoto are known extant works by Lu Zhongyuan. Not much is known about Lu Zhongyuan, the painter of the Nara scrolls; nonetheless, Lu Zhonyuan is likely to be somehow related to Lu Xinzhong and his workshop, considering that they have the same surname. Lu Zhongyuan's scrolls in the Nara National Museum share the same compositional frameworks as the Rokuharamitsuji paintings that contain the upper sphere of the Ten Kings' judgment and the lower sphere of pain and fear. In particular, the lower spheres of the paintings in both sets delineate various images of those deceased who have been found guilty being tortured and punished in hell. For example, there are sinners smeared with blood in trees with sharply cut leaves and on a knife mountain and those thrown into the boiling caldron.

In spite of minor differences in details, scrolls depicting the fifth, seventh, and tenth kings in the Rokuharamitsuji set strikingly resemble those done by Lu Zhongyuan at the Nara National Museum, which leads us to deduce that the former was made around the same time as or slightly later than the latter in the fourteen century. 104 Moreover, as discussed earlier, the Rokuharamitsuji set of paintings is related to ready-made studio works of Lu Xinzhong. The paintings of the first, second, and tenth kings bear the name of Lu Xinzhong. Some Rokuharamitsuji scrolls follow the style of the well-known thirteenth-century Ten Kings paintings produced by the workshop of Lu Xinzhong in terms of composition and motifs. Given

¹⁰³ Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō*, 301.

¹⁰⁴ A comparison of details in the Rokuharamitsuji and Nara scrolls reveals slight disparities. Differences are apparent in the shapes of the clouds, the painted landscapes on the screens, and the textile patterns on the clothes, the furniture draperies, and the frames of the painted screens. Moreover, assistant figures differ slightly in their postures, hand gestures, facial features, and hand-held attributes. For example, in the paintings of the fifth king from the Rokuharamitsuji and Nara sets, an official in a pink robe stands next to Enma. The figure looking at his superior in the Nara set puts his hands together, whereas the one looking away from the king in the Rokuharamitsuji version holds a square box covered by a cloth.

such relevance to Lu Xinzhong's atelier and Lu Zhongyuan's association with Lu Xinzhong, the Rokuharamitsuji set is likely one of the many models that Lu Xinzhong's workshop offered to its customers. Although it is unclear when and how this set came into the collection of Rokuharamitsuji, I will discuss how these branded paintings depicted in a theatrical and grotesque manner might have been used along with the sculptures of Enma and his associates in the following section.

Activation of the Enma Triad at the Rokuharamitsuji

Since the Kamakura period, two types of rituals pertaining to the Ten Kings, postmortem 追善 (tsuizen) and pre-mortem 逆修 (gyakushu), have been widely practiced. Tsuizen is a memorial service for the dead held by the deceased's family, whereas gyakushu is a service held for and/or by a living person. The early-tenth-century sutra, Foshuo yanluowang shouji sizhong yuxiu shengqi wangsheng jingtu jing 仏説閻羅王授記四衆預(逆)修生七往生浄土経 (The Sutra Spoken by the Buddha to the Four Orders on the Prophecy Given to King Yama Concerning the Sevens of Life [Rituals] to Be Practiced Preparatory to Rebirth in the Pure Land), namely Shiwang jing 十王經 (Scripture on the Ten Kings), provides the scriptural foundation for actual Ten Kings practices in the following passages:

If there is a good son or good daughter, bhiksu or bhiksuni, upasaka, or upasika who cultivates in preparation the seven feasts of life, twice each month offering support to the Three Jewels, then whosoever provides for the Ten Kings will have their names revised and reports will be given; memorials will be sent up to the Six Ministries, the Boys of Good and Evil will send memorials to all the officials of heaven's ministries and earth's

. .

¹⁰⁵ Wakabayashi, "Officials of the Afterworld," 340. The continued importance of both *tsuizen* and *gyakushu* in Ten Kings rites in medieval Japan is discussed in Motoi Makiko's textual studies, "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju," pt. 1 (June 1998): 22-33 and "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju," pt. 2 (July 1998): 17-35.

prefects, and it will be noted in the register of names. On the day one arrives, one will expediently attain assigned rebirth in a place of happiness. One will not have to dwell in intermediate darkness for forty-nine days, and one will not have to wait for sons and daughters to attempt posthumous salvation. As one's life span passes before the ten kings, if there is one feast missing, then one is detained before one king, remaining there continuously to undergo suffering, unable to emerge into birth, detained for the length of one year. For this reason, you are admonished to pray for the reward of rebirth in the Pure Land. 106

The [historical] Buddha [Shaka] announced to [the kings]: The Law is broad and forgiving. I allow you to be lenient with the compassionate and filial sons and daughters of all sinners. When they cultivate merit and perform sacrifices to raise the dead, repaying the kindness shown in giving birth to them and supporting them, or when during the seven sevens¹⁰⁷ they cultivate feasts and commission statues in order to repay their parents' kindness, then you should allow them to attain rebirth in the heavens.¹⁰⁸

The second passage, particularly, states that *tsuizen* rituals for the dead are practiced on the first day of each of the seven weeks after one's death. Beginning in the Kamakura period, additional ceremonies for the last three kings among the ten were performed on the one-hundredth day and on the first- and third-year anniversaries. ¹⁰⁹ Based on this schedule, the Ten Kings, along with their *honji butsu* buddhas and bodhisattvas, came to be summoned at each service on each day, and paintings and sculptures of the Ten Kings were offered to the temple. ¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁶ Teiser, The Scripture on the Ten Kings, 203-204.

^{107 &}quot;The seven sevens," which is called Shichishichisai 七七斎 in Japanese, refers to the seven feasts that surviving family members conducted for the wellbeing of the deceased.

¹⁰⁸ Teiser, The Scripture on the Ten Kings, 209-10.

¹⁰⁹ Karen M. Gerhart, *The Material Culture of Death in Medieval Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009). 25.

¹¹⁰ Wakabayashi, "Officials of the Afterworld." 340.

As *Shiwang jing* further explains, upon the arrival of the soul of the deceased in the underworld, envoys riding black horses are dispatched to his old home to verify whether or not his descendants are performing *tsuizen* rituals addressed to the ten kings. The offerings of paintings, sculptures, incense, and sutra recitations made to the appropriate king and counterpart buddha or bodhisattva were believed to ensure a merciful judgement for the dead in a series of trials before the Ten Kings.¹¹¹

The first passage above from *Shiwang jing* explicates *gyakushu* rituals for living people. 112 Although the sutra specifically mentions ritual offerings to be performed semimonthly on a regular basis in advance to the Ten Kings, numerous early medieval Japanese texts testify that *gyakushu* rituals were performed over forty-nine days, corresponding to the *tsuizen* rites held for seven seventh days. 113 For example, the *Eiga monogatari* 栄花物語 (The Tale of Flowering Fortunes) describes that in 1023 the courtier Fujiwara no Michinaga 藤原道長 (966–1028) made "sacred images and [forty-nine] copies of sutras [Lotus Sutra and Amida Sutra] in preparation for forty-nine days of services on his own behalf." 114 In *gyakushu* rituals, offerings made in advance to the Ten Kings are believed to encourage the favorable judgments from the kings after one's death. 115 The practice of such pre-mortem mortuary rituals has been considered more effective

By the fourteenth century, three additional *tsuizen* memorial services began to be conducted in the seventh year, thirteenth year, and thirty-third year after one's death, calling upon three more deities: the Buddha Dainichi Nyorai and the bodhisattvas Seishi and Kokūzō.

¹¹¹ Gerhart, The Material Culture of Death, 25.

¹¹² The very title of the *Shiwang jing* sutra also includes "sevens of life" 生七 that refer to the seven feasts of life 生七斎 (Shōshichisai) cultivated preemptively in preparation for the living's own afterlife.

¹¹³ Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 127.

¹¹⁴ William H. McCullough and Helen Craig McCullough, trans., *A Tale of Flowering Fortunes: Annals of Japanese Aristocratic Life in the Heian Period* 2 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1980), 593.

¹¹⁵ Gerhart, *The Material Culture of Death*, 155.

Gyakushu was not confined to a Ten Kings rite but extended to other rites regarding memorial portraits or stone monuments called *itabi* (板碑). For more information, see Phillips, *Practices of Painting in Japan*, 1475–1500 (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 2000), 151, and Kawakatsu Masatarō, "Gyakushu shinkō no shiteki kenkyū" [Historical research into the religious practice of pre-death funeral services], *Ōtemae Joshi Daigaku ronshū* 6 (November 1972): 147-165.

than that of *tsuizen* rituals since "only one seventh of the merit gained from *tsuizen* actually went to the deceased and the rest to the living performer of the rites."¹¹⁶

The Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma and his entourage might have served as the focal point of such mortuary rituals, both *tsuizen* and *gyakushu*, in tandem with the rediscovered Ten Kings paintings. ¹¹⁷ It is further possible that Ten Kings hanging scrolls were hung on both sides of the Enma triad in the small Enma hall, the space which Enma presided over, on specific days of observance when the soul of the departed or the living was to travel through the courts of the Ten Kings. Considering that the floor space of the Rokuharamitsuji Enma hall measured six *tsubo* (about 19.8 sq m), the hall seems to have been small but big enough to hang the ten paintings. Some Ten Kings hanging scrolls from the Ningbo sets discussed above show that the five kings turn to the left and five to the right. ¹¹⁸ This compositional scheme suggests that these Ten Kings paintings may have been hung at the sides of a central image, either a painting or a sculpture, in two rows of five. ¹¹⁹ The central image may be painted or sculpted images of Jizō bodhisattva, Enma, or Ten Kings who are related to the notion of death, or a portrait of the deceased. ¹²⁰ In the case of the Rokuharamitsuji set of Ten Kings hanging scrolls, four kings face to their right and five to their left, with the exception of

¹¹⁶ Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 127.

¹¹⁷ The arrangement of hanging scrolls or mural paintings of Ten Kings and their sculptures in a temple hall can be observed in China and in Korea. As a case in point, the Kṣitigarbha Hall (Ch. Dizangdian) at Zhenguosi Temple 镇国寺 in Shanxi Province holds clay sculptures of Kṣitigarbha and Ten Kings against the mural paintings of Ten Kings, all of which are presumed to have been produced during the Ming Dynasty (1368–1644). Moreover, in Korea, most temples of the Joseon Dynasty (1392–1897) are equipped with a Ten Kings Hall (Kr. Siwangjeon) or a Hall of Judgement of the Dead 冥府殿 (Kr. Myeongbujeon) that enshrines sculptures of Kṣitigarbha and Ten Kings along with hanging scrolls of Ten Kings. For more information on the arrangement of Ten Kings sculptures and paintings in Joseon temples, see Kim Jung-hee, "Joseon sidaeui myeongbu sinanggwa myeongbujeon dosang yeongu" [A study on the faith in judgment of the dead and on the iconography of the hall of judgment of the dead during the Joseon dynasty], *Misulsahakbo* 4 (August 1991): 48-66.

¹¹⁸ One of such examples is the set of Ten Kings paintings by Lu Xinzhong at the Nara National Museum. For the images, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Seichi Ninpō*, 85-87.

¹¹⁹ For a fuller discussion of this point, see Ledderose, *Ten Thousand Things*, 180 and Phillips "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 141-142.

¹²⁰ Some sets of the Ten Kings paintings include a painting of Jizō bodhisattva in addition to the ten images of the kings. In these cases, the painting of Jizō appears to have been placed in the center.

the second king who faces forward, presumably looking at the viewer. Even with this exception, there is a strong possibility that the Rokuharamitsuji paintings would have been hung at both sides of the Enma sculptures in the temple's Enma hall.

The fourteenth-century diary, Moromoriki 師守記 (Chronicle of Moromori), written by the courtier Nakahara Moromori 中原師守 (active 14th century), describes the possible uses of Ten Kings paintings during tsuizen and gyakushu rituals. Moromori's diary records details about the post-mortem mortuary practices performed for his father, Senior Secretary Nakahara Morosuke (?-1345), and his mother, Nakahara Kenshin (?-1345). 121 Morosuke died on the sixth day of the second month of 1345. Three days later (ninth day of the second month), his corpse was moved to the Nakahara residence, and, on the same day, Ryōchi 了智, a Buddhist-image maker, visited the Nakahara residence and created paintings of the *nichibutsu* 目仏 (daily Buddha) and seven Buddha images. As Karen Gerhart surmises, nichibutsu may be a hanging scroll depicting either Ten Kings or Ten or Thirteen Buddhas (and Bodhisattvas). 122 The entry for the second month, twelfth day mentions the first Daily Buddha Offering Ceremony 日仏供養 (nichibutsu kuyō) performed in the Fourth Chamber of the Nakahara residence and its daily continuation throughout the forty-nine-day mourning period. During the Daily Buddha Offering Ceremonies conducted at one-week intervals, the seven Buddha paintings commissioned on the ninth day of the second month would be hung; on each of the seventh days, incense and sutra incantations would be offered to the appropriate Buddha image corresponding to the king for that day. 123 In the case of the pre-mortem rituals, similar offerings were made to the Ten Kings before

¹²¹ Throughout I have consulted Gerhart's translation of *Shiryō sanshū: Moromoriki*, 11 vols. (Tokyo: Gunsho Ruijū Kanseikai, 1968).

¹²² Gerhart, The Material Culture of Death, 22-24.

¹²³ Gerhart, The Material Culture of Death, 25.

one's death.¹²⁴ Such *tsuizen* and *gyakushu* offerings of the paintings of the Ten Kings or correlated Buddhas promise the Buddhas' salvation and the kings' lenient judgment of the deceased and the living.

When unrolled at the Enma hall where Ten Kings sculptures were stationed, the Ten Kings paintings were presumably meant to encourage viewers to improve their moral awareness and modify their behaviors through hell imageries and to remind worshippers of the need for holding rituals for and making offerings to Ten Kings that would guarantee a favorable judgment and a peaceful rebirth. The painting of the tenth king Godō Tenrin 五道転輸王, particularly, hints at the possibility of being freed from hell by making offerings to Ten Kings. It depicts two married couples offering sutras to Godō Tenrin in its upper half and two sinners walking out of the gate of hell in its lower half (fig. III.41). Although specific mortuary rituals are not depicted, the couples' offering of sutras to the king alludes to the empowerment of essential ritual acts. 125 The addition of such paintings to a sculptural set must have further enhanced the efficacy of a ritual space.

Unlike those Ten Kings paintings that are usually stored away, the three-dimensional representations of Enma and his associates, stationed in the Enma hall at all times on Matsubara Street, must have functioned as a sharp reminder of the underworld of Enma and Ten Kings to anyone passing the street. Aside from the Ten Kings paintings, the sculptures alone gave people the sensation of an actual encounter with the lord of the underworld and his minions. By stepping into the Enma hall, viewers of the sculpture of Enma entered his court as if they had died. The

¹²⁴ Gerhart, *The Material Culture of Death*, 155.

by the adaptation of the implements and actions of ritual in specific generic conventions of liturgical paintings. See Phillip E. Bloom, "Ghosts in the Mists: The Visual and the Visualized in Chinese Buddhist Art, ca. 1178," *The Art Bulletin* 98.3 (2016): 297-320. In this article, taking *Five Hundred Arhats*, a set of one hundred hanging scrolls produced between 1178 and 1188, as a case study, he argues that the study of liturgical artworks should not be limited to viewing them solely from the perspective of the liturgist and the liturgical manual.

sculptures of Enma and his entourage themselves were intended to represent the Ten Kings governing the underworld that the dead encountered after death.

Furthermore, sculptures of Enma and his assistants at Rokuharamitsuji might have been taken out of the small Enma hall during the annual summer Festival for the Dead (urabon 盂蘭 盆 or obon お盆), to serve as the objects of worship or the subjects of sermons with regard to the concepts of hell, death, and rebirth. The relocation of sculptures during special events was not unusual. For instance, the Chinnōji sankei mandara 珍皇寺参詣曼荼羅 (Chinnōji Pilgrimage Mandala) (fig. II.9)¹²⁶ dated to the sixteenth or the seventeenth century depicts the precinct of Rokudō Chinnōji 六道珍皇寺, which is located in the vicinity of the Rokuharamitsuji during the days of welcoming the spirits of the dead in the *obon* festival from the eighth day to thirteenth day of the seventh month. 127 Right above the main entrance of the temple, we can see figures of Enma and his two officials seated on a low wooden bench (fig. III.52). Inside the two open huts set up in the upper left section of the painting are a standing image of Enma flanked by two standing assistants and a standing image of Ono no Takamura accompanied by the standing figures of a hell jailer and an officer (fig. III.53). Relatively small persons put their hands together in reverence in front of these figures, which leads us to deduce that those figures are sculptures. Moreover, these sculptural figures served as the focus of preaching with regard to the ideas of hell, death, and rebirth. In front of the standing Enma triad is a man holding a fan and wearing a bamboo hat and a mask. This man seems to be explaining and preaching about the Enma triad, pointing at them with a fan. Because the actual existence of Enma's two attendants in the Rokudō Chinnōji has not been confirmed, the triad of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei placed

¹²⁶ For the image, see Nagano Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Ano yo, yōkai*, 27.

¹²⁷ Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, Shaji sankei mandara, 154.

above the main gate on the painting is evidence of the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei.

Conclusion

The Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group, currently composed of a large Enma and his two smaller scale assistant officials, Shimei and Shiroku, is a rare early example from the late thirteenth to early fourteenth century, the time when the cult of Enma and Ten Kings began to flourish in Japan. A comparison with other contemporary sculptures illuminates parallels and variations between the Ten Kings images' manifestation and grouping. On the one hand, the Rokuharamitsuji group is presumed to have originally formed a triad, which served as a critical precedent for the predominant iconographical representations of the sculpted Ten Kings that had successfully taken root in Japan beginning in the late thirteenth century. On the other hand, the current Rokuharamitsuji sculptures might have been made as a set with additional images of nine other kings. Such configuration was the alternate arrangement of the sculpted Ten Kings, which had predominated since the late thirteenth century. The monk Usui Kosaburō's journal, Kyoto bōmokuji, written in 1916, in particular, makes out a good case for this theory. The Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group, originally either a triad or a set, was once enshrined at the temple's Enma hall situated on the bustling Matsubara Street in Rokuhara, an ideal area in that it was aligned with the concept of death and the afterlife, thus allowing the faithful to have easy access to the Enma sculptures.

In 2008, a set of ten fourteenth-century hanging scrolls showing each of the Ten Kings judging the dead and bearing the signature of the renowned Chinese Buddhist painter Lu Xinzhong was discovered in the temple storehouse. Despite the overly optimistic attribution to Lu Xinzhong, the Rokuharamitsuji paintings appear to have been produced by the branded Lu

workshops probably in the fourteenth century. In combination with these Ten Kings paintings, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group was further activated during *tsuizen* and *gyakushu* rituals. Otherwise, the sculptures in the Enma hall, whenever encountered by the faithful, might have reminded them of the underworld of Enma and Ten Kings. On special occasions like the *obon* festival, they were taken out of the Enma hall and served as the objects of worship or the subjects of sermons to help reinforce the ideas of hell, death, and rebirth.

Chapter Four

The Power of Datsueba at Rokuharamitsuji

The Enma sculptural group located in the Enma hall at Rokuharamitsuji experienced a transformation in the seventeenth century. In 1629, a sculptor named Kōyū 康猶 (?–1632) sculpted the image of Datsueba 奪衣婆 (the old woman who snatches away clothing) and added it to the pre-established sculptures of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku from the late thirteenth to early fourteenth centuries in order to honor his deceased daughter. Despite her obscure origins, Datsueba began to appear in Japanese textual references, such as Buddhist scriptures and religious stories, in the eleventh century. Conforming to such textual references, Datsueba was depicted as a demonic hag not only in a number of paintings related to hell, Ten Kings, and the underworld bureaucracy, but also in many sculpted forms after the thirteenth century. By tracing the textual and visual history of Datsueba, I demonstrate that the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba was sculpted based upon the iconographic model of the demonic old hag with withered breasts that had been standardized and imprinted on the mind of Japanese populace by the seventeenth century.

Most importantly, in this chapter I discuss the sculptor Kōyū as the patron of his own work and consider the devotees' interpretation and reception of the popular deity Datsueba. By doing so, I argue that Kōyū may have chosen to sculpt Datsueba, the frightening old hag, and dedicate it to Rokuharamitsuji not only because of the temple's designation as a salvation-oriented domain but also because Datsueba's judicial and salvific nature particularly appealed to female devotees and could be incorporated into the existing cult of Enma and Ten Kings at the temple.

Who is Datsueba?

In Japan, the earliest written accounts of Datsueba can be found in setsuwa 説話 (collections of narratives).¹ The eleventh-century Dai Nihon koku hokekyō genki 大日本国法華経験記 (Collection of miraculous tales of the Lotus Sutra in Japan; often abbreviated as Hokke genki 法華験記) written by Chingen 鎮源, a monk from Mount Hiei, tells the story of a priest named Renshū 蓮秀 who encounters an old female demon 嫗鬼 (onaki) after his death.² This demon lives on the bank of a large river under a large tree where countless clothes are hung on its branches. She tells the priest: "Know this! This [place] is the Sanzu River 三途河 (Three Ford River) and I am an old lady of the Sanzu River. Take off your clothes, and I will let you cross."³ Realizing the priest's devotion to the Lotus Sutra and Kannon, the demon puts her hands together respectfully and the priest returns to life. This story in Hokke genki is the first appearance of Datsueba as a demon hag of the Sanzu River in Japanese literary sources. Other setsuwa

-

¹ In the late tenth-century diary, *Kagerō nikki* 蜻蛉目記 written by the mother (c. 935-995) of Fujiwara no Michitsuna 藤原道綱 (955–1020), Datsueba sang a song about the Mitsusegawa 三瀬川, a river between this world and the underworld, which was also known as Sanzu River. The early eleventh-century imperial poem anthology, *Shūi Wakashū* 拾遺和歌集, records a poem written by the daughter of Sugawara Michimasa 菅原道雅 after seeing a hell painting. She describes the painting as depicting the deceased crossing Mitsusegawa, taking off their garments, and hanging them on a tree. It is not clear whether the hell painting described in this poem includes an image of Datsueba. See Kawamura Kunimitsu, *Jigoku meguri* [Hell tour] (Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 2000), 150. For the English translation of *Kagerō nikki*, see Sonja Arntzen, *The Kagerō Diary: A Woman's Autobiographical Text from Tenth-Century Japan* (Ann Arbor: Center for Japaneses Stücke, The University of Michigan, 1997).

² See "Renshū hōshi" 蓮秀法師, *Hokke genki* 2:70, in Inoue Mitsusada and Ōsone Shōsuke, eds., *Ōjōden Hokke genki*, *Nihon shisō taikei*, vol. 7 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1974), 138-139 and 542.

³汝今当知 jokontōchi

是三途河 zesanzugawa

我是三途河嫗也 wareko sanzugawa onaya

汝脱衣服与我可渡 jodatsuifuku yogakawata

Excerpt from Ishiba Hiroshi, *Jigokue to bungaku: Etoki no sekai* [Hell painting and literature: The world of picture-explaining] (Tokyo: Kyōiku Shuppan Sentā, 1992), 87.

anthologies such as *Konjaku monogatari shū* from the twelfth century and *Kannon riekishū* 観音 利益集 (Collection of the benefits of Kannon) include derivations of this tale.⁴

Aside from setsuwa collections, Buddhist scriptures and writings played a vital role in popularizing Datsueba. Among those Buddhist texts is $Jiz\bar{o}\ J\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}\$ 地蔵十玉経 (The Sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings), probably written by anonymous Japanese authors sometime between the eleventh and twelfth centuries, purportedly based on the tenth-century Chinese scripture $Shiwang\ jing\ + \Xi$ 経 discovered at the Dunhuang caves. No reference to Datsueba can be found in $Shiwang\ jing$, however. The Japanese text $Jiz\bar{o}\ J\bar{u}\bar{o}\ ky\bar{o}$ from the twelfth century introduces Datsueba in the section describing the court of the second king, King Shokō 初江王, as follows:

At the bend in the river, where the office of [King Shokō] sits near the bank of the upper reaches of the stream, is where the buried undertake to cross the great river before them. This is where the buried discern that they are crossing over to the dead. It is called the Ford on Hell River [Nakatsu] 奈河津, and there are three ways to cross. The first is a mountain torrent; the second is an abyss in the river; and the third is a bridge that crosses over. In front of [King Shokō's] office is a large tree named Eryōju 衣領樹. Under the tree, two demons live. One of them is Datsueba, the other Keneō 懸衣翁. The hag demon breaks the fingers of both hands [of the dead] in reproof of the theft that [he or she] committed [when alive]. The old male demon, in hatred of adultery, makes the sinner bend down his head and legs and makes him carry the woman he cheated with on his back. A demon

⁴ For the story in *Konjaku monogatari shū*, see *Konjaku monogatari shū* 16:36, *Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikei*, vol. 3 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1993), 562-565. The date of *Kannon riekishū* has not been identified.

⁵ The virtuous pass over a bridge, less pure individuals wade through a shallow mountain stream, and sinners plunge into a watery abyss.

with a cow's head pokes those two with an iron club and chases them into the river rapids. All the dead are gathered under the tree. The hag demon strips away their clothes, and the male demon hangs the clothes on the tree branches. [By doing so, both demons] expose the gravity of [the sinners'] crimes and transfer them to the court of the next king.⁶

As in the formerly discussed *setsuwa* tales, Datsueba is described as a demon hag living under a large tree who takes the clothes off the dead. *Jizō Jūō kyō* names the hag Datsueba, the clotheshanging tree Eryōju, and the river Nakatsu. Most importantly, the scripture not only associates Datsueba with Ten Kings by situating her in the court of King Shokō, but also entrusts her with the duty of measuring the weight of the sins committed by the deceased through their clothes, thus allowing Datsueba to take part in the judgment made by King Shokō. Later thirteenth- or fourteenth-century Buddhist texts, such as *Jūō santan shō* 十王讃歎鈔,*Shiju hyaku innen shū* 私聚百因縁集,*Futsu shōdō shū* 普通唱導集,and *Jōdo kenmon shū* 浄土見聞集,also recognize Datsueba's involvement in judging the deceased, even though some of them call Datsueba by different names.⁷

Moreover, ideas regarding Datsueba seem to have been disseminated among the Japanese populace through *otogizōshi* 御伽草子, the fictional narratives written during the Muromachi period (fourteenth–sixteenth centuries) and early Edo period (sixteenth–seventeenth centuries).

-

⁶ The original text can be found in Ishida, *Minshū kyōten*, 204.

⁷ Jūō santan shō with descriptions of greater detail than those in Jizō Jūō kyō is said to have been written by the monk Nichiren 日蓮 (1222–1282) in 1254. It refers to Datsueba as Keneu 懸衣嫗 or the old hag of the Sanzu River 三途河の嫗. Shiju hyaku innen shū, a collection of Buddhist setsuwa written by Gukan Jūshin 愚勧住信 in 1257, explains Keneō as Datsueba's husband and adds that, if the deceased does not have clothes, Datsueba strips off his or her skin. Edited by the monk Yoshiki 良季 between 1297 and 1302, a Buddhist instruction book entitled Futsu shōdō shū repeats the contents of Jizō Jūō kyō. Lastly, Jōdo kenmon shū, a Buddhist writing by Kōgen 光玄 in the fourteenth century, refers to Datsueba as Datsueki 脱衣鬼. See Ishiba, Jigokue to bungaku, 87-88.

They were explicitly written to entertain and morally edify people. In those *otogizōshi* stories, Datsueba meets people on their way to hell. Hirono yomigaeri no sōshi 平野よみがへりの草紙 (The Book of the Rebirth of Hirano) written by an unknown author sometime between 1439 and 1513, for instance, is the account of the nun Keishin's journey in 1439 from Chōhōji 長宝寺 in the Hirano district of Osaka to the court of King Enma. This tale describes Datsueba as an elderly woman who has the appearance of a demon, waits at the edge of the river, strips evildoers of their burial robes, and hangs the garments in the branches of a *biranju* 毘蘭樹 tree to measure the gravity of their sins.

In a similar vein, the *otogizōshi* named *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* 富士の人穴草子 (The Tale of the Fuji Cave) tells of the Kamakura-period warrior Nitta no Shirō Tadatsune's tour of hell inside a mysterious cave on the side of Mount Fuji. ¹² After seeing the Children's Riverbed Hell, Nitta encounters an old woman, namely Datsueba, by the Sanzu River. The 1603 version of *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* describes this scene:

Looking toward the west, Nitta saw the Sanzu River, ten-thousand *yojanas* deep and wide. An old woman was stripping passing sinners of twenty-five robes in accord with their twenty-five types of sin. Those without robes were stripped of

-

⁸ For a definition of *otogizōshi*, see Chieko Irie Mulhern, "Otogizōshi: Short Stories of the Muromachi Period," *Monumenta Nipponica* 29, no. 2 (Summer 1974): 181-184.

⁹ Hara Chisato, "Chūsei ni okeru Datsueba no juyō to ninshiki ni tsuite" [About the reception and perception of Datsueba in the medieval period], *Etoki kenkyū* 23 (2011): 90-92.

¹⁰ Hirono yomigaeri no sōshi is also known by the title of *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*. According to R. Keller Kimbrough, this story was used by Chōhōji temple for preaching in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. See R. Keller Kimbrough, "Preaching the Animal Realm in Late Medieval Japan," *Asian Folklore Studies* 65 (2006): 188 and note 18, 198.

¹¹ This tree refers to the *eryōju* tree in *Jizō Jūō kyō*. The story goes like this: "The robes of the most sinful were the heaviest, causing even stout branches to bend to the earth. "Look at the weight of your crime!' the old woman would shout, after which she would enumerate the evildoer's transgressions and interrogate the person in a manner that was most frightening to behold." Translation by Keller Kimbrough. See Kimbrough, "Translation: The Tale of the Fuji Cave," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 33, no. 2 (2006): 9, note 28.

¹² There are six hand-copied *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* manuscripts that predate the 1627 woodblock-printed edition, and two of the earliest extant texts are dated to the first years of the seventeenth century (1603 and 1607).

their skin, which the old woman hung on the limbs of a *biranju* tree and made into celestial feather gowns.¹³

The 1627 edition of *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* details the appearance of Datsueba, emphasizing her frightening demonic features. She is ten *shaku* (3.03 meters) tall; her eyes are like wheels; and she has 80 upper teeth and 120 lower teeth. The narrator of *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* in both the 1603 and 1627 editions adds that the old woman is a manifestation of Dainichi Buddha (Skt. Mahāvairocana). This addition might have resulted from the concept of *honji butsu* 本地仏 (original-ground Buddha). *Jizō Jūō kyō* associates all the kings with "*honji butsu*, a higher order being—but not always a Buddha—who embodies the promise of salvation." The sutra does not connect Datsueba to any original-ground Buddha. Nevertheless, the association of Datsueba with Dainichi Buddha and of Ten Kings with buddhas, bodhisattvas, or Myōō 明王 (Wisdom King), with whom people were already familiar, seems to have increased the popularity of not only Ten Kings but also of Datsueba.

What does Datsueba look like?

As discussed above, textual sources described Datsueba as an old hag demon who strips the dead of their garments or skin, but how was she depicted? How did the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba come to have such appearance? Datsueba has been given the appearance of an old female demon whose ribs are exposed and whose withered breasts droop in a slovenly manner. The illustrated versions of the *Shiwang jing* scripture currently preserved at Tōji Kanchiin 東寺

¹³ For a translation of the entire text (1603), see Kimbrough, "Translation: The Tale of the Fuji Cave," 4-21.

¹⁴ Hara, "Chūsei ni okeru Datsueba no juyō to ninshiki ni tsuite," 91 and Ishiba, *Minshū kyōten*, 92.

¹⁵ Kimbrough, "Translation: The Tale of the Fuji Cave," 9.

¹⁶ Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 123.

観智院 and at Kōyasan Hōjuin 高野山 宝寿院 include an image of the monstrous figure.¹⁷ Both the Kōyasan and the Tōji versions depict a demonic figure standing on top of and in-between the branches of the *eryōju* tree (figs. IV.1-2).¹⁸ The figures look like ogres, but they could be the prototype of Datsueba. Furthermore, as mentioned earlier, the texts of *Shiwang jing* do not include an old woman or Datsueba. On the other hand, the Japanese sutra *Jizō Jūō kyō* explicates Datsueba as a hag demon under the clothes-hanging tree by the Sanzu River. The images of Datsueba described in *Jizō Jūō kyō* and other Japanese texts, including widely disseminated *setsuwa*, had evolved into ogre-like hags dressed in a slovenly manner, through the following visual representations of Datsueba.

Early visual representations of Datsueba¹⁹ can be seen in the thirteenth- and fourteenth-century paintings of the six paths of rebirth (*rokudō*), including *Jikkaizu* 十界図 at Eikandō Zenrinji 永観堂禅林寺 in Kyoto, *Rokudōe* 六道絵 at Gokurakuji 極楽寺 in Kobe, *Rokudō Jūōzu* 六道十王図 at Mizuo Mirokudō 水尾弥勒堂 in Ibaraki, and *Jūō Jigokuzu* 十王地獄図 at the Idemitsu Museum of Arts in Tokyo.²⁰ The thirteenth-century *Zenrinji jikkaizu* (picture of ten worlds) consists of two hanging scrolls. The right scroll centers around Amida Buddha and

¹⁷ There are different editions of *Shiwang jing*: recensions without illustrations or hyms and illustrated versions containing elements not fully explained by the texts. For more information on *Shiwang jing*, see Motoi, "'Yoshu jūō kyō' no shohon," 1-22, and Tsukamoto Zenryū, *Tsukamoto Zenryū chosaku shū* [Writings of Tsukamoto Zenryū], vol. 7 (Tokyo: Daitō Shuppansha, 1975), 315-399.

¹⁸ For fig. IV.1, see Hara, "Chūsei ni okeru Datsueba no juyō to ninshiki ni tsuite," 91; for fig. IV.2, Tokushi and Ogawa, "Jūō shōshichikyō sanzukan no kōzō," 250.

¹⁹ The twelfth-century *Jigokuzōshi* (scroll of hell) in the Nara National Museum contains scenes of hell, where individuals fall into depending on the sins they committed during their lifetime (figs. IV.3-4). Particularly, the hell of measures for those who cheated their customers and the hell of the iron mortar for robbers have hag figures as a demon-jailer. The hags in both scenes have big mouths with fangs, and a third eye on their foreheads, and expose shriveled breasts. They are not Datsueba that we know now, but their demonic features might have been incorporated into shaping the image of Datsueba in Japan. For *Jigoku zōshi* images, see Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Birei: Inseiki no kaiga: tokubetsuten* [Exquisite: Paintings of the 11th-13th centuries] (Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2007), 130-131.

²⁰ These four paintings and Rokudōe at Shōjuraigōji 聖衆来迎寺 in Shiga Prefecture are considered representative examples of depicting the six paths of rebirth from the Kamakura period. See Sugamura Tōru, "Kamakura jidai rokudōe no tokushoku to sono haikei ni tsuite" [About characteristics and background of Rokudōe during the Kamakura period], *Geijutsu kenkyū* 16 (2003): 1-16.

depicts the worlds of animals, *asura*, humans, and heavenly beings. The upper section of the left scroll is occupied by Jizō and Ten Kings, while its lower section describes the paths of hell and hungry ghosts. Although these scrolls are called the picture of ten worlds (*jikkaizu*), only six paths of rebirth are illustrated. In the lower right corner of the left scroll, a woman baring her chest and extending her right hand is seated in front of the *eryōju* tree (fig. IV.5).²¹ She faces two naked deceased women. One of them appears to be begging and the other looks like she is sobbing. Behind these two women, a fully dressed couple crosses the Sanzu or Nakatsu River that runs under a nearby bridge. Though the face of the woman with the bare chest is not clearly visible, the *eryōju* tree, Nakatsu River, and bridge nevertheless suggest that this female figure is Datsueba.

Composed of three hanging scrolls, the thirteenth-century Rokudōe at Gokurakuji portrays Ten Kings in the upper sections and six paths in the lower sections. Datsueba is shown in the middle of the first (or right) scroll that illustrates the human realm involving the four kinds of sufferings and the process of a decaying corpse (figs. IV.6-7).²² Datsueba dressed in a red robe stands under the *eryōju* tree from which some clothes are hanging. A naked female figure stands facing Datsueba with her hands put together. The Sanzu River runs in front of Datsueba, and a formally dressed male crosses the bridge over the river. This configuration similar to *Zenrinji Jikkaizu* confirms the red-robed figure as Datsueba, even though her chest is not exposed. She has a fierce facial expression with a large open mouth, bulging eyes, and disheveled hair.

Another early visual source for Datsueba is the fourteenth-century *Rokudō jūō* painting at Mizuo Mirokudō, of which one of the three hanging scrolls is missing. Like the Gokurakuji Rokudōe, the Mizuo Mirokudō scrolls position Ten Kings in the upper parts and the six paths of

²¹ For the image, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 31.

²² For the images, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 35.

rebirth in the lower parts. Datsueba is depicted in the far-right middle section of the first scroll (figs. IV.8-9).²³ This configuration of Datsueba, a naked female, the *eryōju* tree, river, and bridge is repeated here. Datsueba sits under the *eryōju* tree with clothes hanging from it and faces a naked female figure. Nearby is the bridge over the Sanzu River. Compared to the two examples mentioned previously, however, Datsueba in the Mizuo Mirokudō *Rokudō jūōzu* is portrayed on a large scale and in great detail. She sits with her legs crossed at the ankles and bares her upper body with its ribs and withered breasts. Her unkempt white hair, big nose and ears, bulging eyes, and wrinkles identify this figure as a demon hag. This appearance is reminiscent of the female demon jailers in the twelfth-century handscroll entitled *Jigoku zōshi* 地獄草紙 (hell scrolls) (figs. IV.3-4). In this depiction, Datsueba holds clothes in her hands, and the deceased woman in front offers her own clothes to Datsueba, which action emphasizes Datsueba's role.

 $J\bar{u}\bar{o}$ jigokuzu (picture of Ten Kings and hell) at the Idemitsu Museum of Arts also includes a Datsueba image. Dated to the fourteenth century, $J\bar{u}\bar{o}$ jigokuzu is composed of two hanging scrolls, each showing five kings in the upper portions and hell scenes below. Datsueba is located in the lower left corner of the left scroll (figs. I.28, IV.10). She sits under the $ery\bar{o}ju$ tree with its hanging clothes surrounded by the Nakatsu River. Next to the river is the bridge, over which Jizō, a naked male, and a female wearing only a red skirt cross. Seated with her right knee raised, Datsueba is depicted as an old hag with long white hair, a big mouth, and bulging eyes. As seen in the Mizuo Mirokudō $Rokud\bar{o}$ $j\bar{u}\bar{o}zu$, a naked woman offers Datsueba her clothes. Added to the former configuration of Datsueba, in this one, to Datsueba's left is a staff topped with two heads, one human and one demonic. This staff called $dandad\bar{o}$ or $jint\bar{o}j\bar{o}$ f

²³ For the images, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 36.

²⁴ For the images, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 39.

functions as Enma's assistant.²⁵ Situating a *dandadō* associated with Enma close to Datsueba implies that Datsueba belongs to the domain of Enma.

In addition to *rokudōe*, some Japanese hanging scroll sets depicting the immediate courts of the Ten Kings contain images of Datsueba. Japanese versions put Datsueba in the court of different kings, such as King Shinkō 秦広王 or King Shokō 初江王. These examples include the Nison'in 二尊院 and Jōfukuji 浄福寺 sets in Kyoto, the former attributed to Tosa Yukimitsu 土 佐行光 of the early fourteenth century and the latter made in 1489 by Tosa Mitsunobu 土佐光信 (d. 1521) (figs. IV.11-12).²⁶ The scrolls of the first king, King Shinkō, from the Nison'in and Jōfukuji sets share similarity in composition, such as the depiction of Datsueba standing under the *eryōju* tree and in front of the bridge over the Sanzu River. Both paintings emphasize Datsueba's monstrous qualities with her bulky, masculine body, sagging breasts, horns on her head, big ears, bulging eyes, a large open mouth, and sharp and protruding fangs. In her right hand she holds a club, which resembles the one used by demon-jailers in hell, while in her left hand she holds a robe she has snatched away from the naked male sinner sitting next to her. In the case of the fifteenth-century set at Chōjuji 長寿寺 in Shiga Prefecture, Datsueba is depicted in the scroll of the second king, King Shokō, as introduced in the Japanese Buddhist scripture $Jiz\bar{o} J\bar{u}\bar{o} ky\bar{o}$ (fig. IV.13).²⁷ On the riverbank, Datsueba with a scary face sits in front of the eryōju tree and greets a clad woman crossing the bridge.

-

²⁵ Enma's esoteric form as Enmaten 焰摩天 is often shown holding *dandadō* banner pole with one head (fig. I.14). The two heads of *dandadō* see the activities of human beings on behalf of Enma and report their misdeeds and good deeds to him during their trial after their deaths. According to *Jizō jūō kyō* scripture, Enma's palace has four iron gates, each flanked by *dandadō* pole surmounted by beings shaped like human heads. The late thirteenth-century hanging scroll among the set of fifteen *Rokudōe* at Shōjuraigōji visually describes Enma's court (fig. I.29). For more detailed description of this painting, see Izumi, Kasuya, and Yamamoto, eds., *Kokuhō rokudōe*, 329-334. For the image, see Izumi, Kasuya, and Yamamoto, *Kokuhō rokudōe*, 143.

²⁶ Quitman E. Phillips discusses these two versions in detail in his article. See Phillips, "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite," 120-145. For the images, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 50.

²⁷ For the image, see Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 44.

Datsueba also emerges in other painted forms. As a case in point, the sixteenth-century handscroll entitled *Yata Jizō maitsuki nikkie* 矢田地藏毎月日記絵 (Monthly picture diary of Yata Jizō) at Yatadera 矢田寺 in Nara depicts a shaggy Datsueba under the *eryōju* tree (fig. IV.14).²⁸ This handscroll illustrates the benefits one would obtain from visiting and worshipping the Yatadera Jizō each month. In the painting, Jizō takes a person through the various places each month and relieves the suffering encountered at each place, thus leading him to the Pure Land. In a scene labeled "The fifteenth of the third month, . . . escaping [saved from] the suffering of the Sanzu River," we find Datsueba seated with both knees up extending her right hand to receive clothes from a naked woman. She is also accompanied by a demon hell jailer, who escalates the suffering of sinners. On the other hand, fully dressed male and female figures cross the bridge and are saved by Jizō. This scene highlights Jizō's ability to rescue his believers from the agony caused by Datsueba and the Sanzu River.

This composition of the scary hag Datsueba striping away the clothes from the deceased and a merciful Jizō helping a clad noble couple cross the bridge continued to be seen in *Kumano kanshin jikkai mandara* 熊野観心十界曼荼羅 (Visualization mandala of the heart and ten worlds of Kumano),²⁹ which were mostly created from the sixteenth century to the eighteenth century. Kumano mandalas visually explain the ten worlds of rebirth between hell and paradise (fig. IV.15).³⁰ In these mandalas, Datsueba is located at the foot of the bridge by the Sanzu River,

-

²⁸ For the image, see Umezu Jirō, ed., *Jizō Bosatsu reigenkie; Yata Jizō engie; Seikōji engie* [Illustrated miraculous tale of Jizō Bodhisattva, illustrated origin and history of Yata Jizō, illustrated origin and history of Seikōji], *Shinshū Nihon emakimono zenshū* 29 (Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1980), 112-113.

²⁹ Hideo Kuroda and Ikumi Kaminishi have conducted an insightful analysis of *Kumano kanshin jikkai mandara*. See Kuroda Hideo, "The *Kumano Kanshin Jikkai Mandara* and the Lives of the People in Early Modern Japan," in *Practicing the Afterlife: Perspectives from Japan*, eds. Susanne Formanek and William R. LaFleur (Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2004), 101-120 and Ikumi Kaminishi, *Explaining Pictures*, 137-164.

³⁰ The ten worlds are composed of the six realms of heaven, humans, asura, animals, hungry ghosts, and hell, and the four sacred worlds of buddhas, bodhisattvas, sravakas, and pratyekabuddhas. For the image, see Shibuya Kuritsu Shōtō Bijutsukan, *Chūsei shomin shinkō no kaiga: Sankei mandara jigokue otogizōshi* [Paintings of Commoners'

while Jizō and a noble pair are on the bridge (figs. IV.16-18).³¹ Seated with her left knee raised under the *eryōju* tree, Datsueba has long white hair and wears a loose robe, exposing her breasts. She also holds a club in her right hand and clothes in her left hand, scaring sinners who are just about to have their clothes taken away.

Rumano mandalas as a portable visual means for disseminating Buddhist teachings and soliciting funds. Kumano nuns traveled around the country, carrying the mandalas with them, and performed *etoki* 絵解 (picture explaining) in public, as depicted on the seventeenth-century screen, *Festival at Sumiyoshi Shrine*, belonging to the Freer Gallery, Washington, DC. In this screen, a nun wearing a simple gray kimono points to a large hanging scroll, deciphering and preaching to the audience (fig. IV.19).³² The image of Datsueba sitting between two trees with hanging clothes to the right of the *kokoro* 心 (heart) character also works as a crucial indicator in the identification of the painting that the nun is pointing to as a Kumano mandala (fig. IV.20).³³ In most Kumano mandalas, Datsueba images are found where the nun's hand is located. Nevertheless, the painter of the Freer screen intentionally placed Datsueba in an unusual spot to make her visible, which implies the importance of Datsueba in understanding the ten worlds of reincarnation between hell and paradise.

faith during the medieval era: Shrine and temple mandalas, hell paintings, and paintings of folk tales] (Tokyo: Shibuya Kuritsu Shōtō Bijutsukan, 1993), 57.

³¹ For the images, see Shibuya Kuritsu Shōtō Bijutsukan, *Chūsei shomin shinkō no kaiga*, 57; Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, *Jigoku yūran*, 64-65.

³² Although simplified, we can recognize the painting as a Kumano mandala due to some iconographic motifs, such as a huge arched mountain with several figures walking on it, the character *kokoro* 心, Enma, *asura*, and Blood-pool hell. For the image, see Kaminishi, *Explaining Picture*, plate 9.

³³ For the image, see Barbara Ruch, "Woman to Woman: Kumano bikuni Proselytizers in Medieval and Early Modern Japan," in *Engendering Faith: Women and Buddhism in Premodern Japan*, ed. Barbara Ruch (Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 2002), 569.

From the Kamakura period on, sculptures of Datsueba, as an old hag demon, continued to be created out of stone and wood. Stone sculptures of Datsueba can be found all over Japan as three-dimensional independent images, as a part of three-dimensional group images, and as relief images on stupas and pillars. One of the oldest Datsueba images in stone is known to appear on the stone relief sculpture of Jizō and Ten Kings dating to the late Kamakura period at Shinyakushiji 新薬師寺 in Nara (fig. IV.21).34 Here, Jizō is carved as the main figure in the middle, while the Ten Kings surround Jizō. Engraved on the top of Jizō's head is a series of figures: from left to right, a horse, an ogre holding a rod, a seated Datsueba, a hell's jailer holding a staff topped with a head, a standing Keneō, and a lion (fig. IV.22).³⁵ This Datsueba is sitting with her left knee up and has sagging breasts. Another early relief image of Datsueba (dated to 1518) is carved on a stone pillar with six Jizō in Ōsaku, Nakan town in Kumamoto Prefecture (fig. IV.23).³⁶ In the upper part of the pillar are six engraved Jizō figures and on the stand in the middle are Ten Kings, Datsueba, and Keneō. With her left knee up, Datsueba is seated and holds clothes in her right hand. In addition, other relief images of Datsueba appear on stone kuyōtō 供養塔, pagodas built for memorial services of the deceased, from the seventeenth century onward.³⁷

In the case of three-dimensional stone sculptures, Datsueba stands alone, together with Enma, or along with Ten Kings and other associates. These freestanding stone sculptures of Datsueba are not only enshrined within temple precincts, but also found on roadsides, on mountains, and near cemeteries. The sculpture on Fujitake Mountain in Ueda City of Nagano

³⁴ Marui Sumi, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite" [About forms of Datsueba], *Rekishi kōkogaku* 40 (July 1997): 41.

³⁵ Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 42. 36 Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 40.

³⁷ The Datsueba image is accompanied by Ten Kings, Keneō, a scale, and a *dandadō*. See the table in Marui "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 36-37.

Prefecture is an example of an early independent stone Datsueba (fig. IV.24).³⁸ Unlike conventional Datsueba images, this Datsueba is seated with her legs crossed, but still presents a scary expression and bare breasts. On the back of the sculpture, the creation date of 1466 and the name of the sculptor, Shinkai 真海, are incised. Legend tells us that when village people, suffering from a severe drought for about six years, climbed up Fujitake Mountain to pray for rain, it rained immediately.³⁹ It has been said that village people in Ueda made this sculpture to repay the favor and called it 'Great Uba old lady' 大姥さま (Ōubasama).⁴⁰ Individual Datsueba sculptures in stone are dispersed throughout many regions of Japan.⁴¹

As in the Rokuharamitsuji group, three-dimensional stone sculptures of Datsueba sometimes stand alongside Enma, or are included in the group of other related figures, such as Jizō, Ten Kings, Shiroku, Shimei, and additional associates. For instance, the Jōdō school temple Kuhōnji 九品寺 in Kamakura has Datsueba accompanied by Enma. The Kuhōnji Datsueba, dated to 1655, is seated with one knee up and bare breasts (fig. IV.25). 42 This pairing of Datsueba and Enma sculptures implies that Datsueba's stature is equal to that of Enma in the Buddhist concept of the afterlife. In a more complex arrangement, a Datsueba image in the city of Ōtsuki of Yamanashi Prefecture is grouped with Ten Kings, Shiroku, and Shimei, which dates to the late Edo period (fig. IV.26). 43 The Ten Kings work as principle images of the group, while Datsueba is added as a supplementary figure to their entourage.

2

³⁸ For the image, see Ueda shi Maruchimedia jōhō senta, "Nagano sekizō ōuba zazō," *Ueda shi bunkaizai mappu*, accessed May 13, 2015, http://museum.umic.jp/map/document/dot41.html.

³⁹ Ueda shi Maruchimedia jōhō senta, "Nagano sekizō ōuba zazō."

⁴⁰ Ueda shi Maruchimedia jōhō senta, "Nagano sekizō ōuba zazō" and Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 43.

⁴¹ Kobayashi Gōzō did a survey on the Datsueba stone sculptures located in Kōriyama, Fukushima Prefecture, and categorized them into four groups. See Kobayashi Gōzō, "Kōriyama chihō no Datsueba oyobi Enmazō" [Sculptures of Datsueba and Enma in the Kōriyama region], *Nihon no sekibutsu* 5, no. 4 (1990): 25-36.

⁴² Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 36. For the image, see Miura Katsuo, ed., *Kamakura no sekibutsu hōtō* [Stone Buddhas and pagodas of Kamakura], *Kamakura Kokuhōka zuroku*, vol. 23 (Kamakura City: Kamakura-shi Kyōiku Iinkai and Kamakura Kokuhōka, 1980), 36.

⁴³ Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 37. For the image, see Marui, "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite," 41.

Most of the early wooden images of Datsueba belong to a group of sculptures composed of Jizō, Enma, Ten Kings, or other associates. One of the earliest extant Datsueba examples can be found at the Ten Kings hall of the Tendai school temple Jōnenji 常念寺 in Kyoto (fig. IV.27).44 This Datsueba is enshrined with other sculptures of Ten Kings and two Kushōjin of similar size, around thirty-five centimeters high. Based on the inscriptions on King Godō Tenrin and one of the Kushōjin, we know that these thirteen sculptures were created by Chinkei 珍慶, who belonged to the Nanto Fujiyama bussho 南都富士山仏所 of Nara, from 1474 to 1476 during the Muromachi period.45 The Jōnenji Datsueba is seated with her right knee raised, her right hand on the right knee, and her left hand curled into a fist. She is simply clothed, yet exposing her sagging breasts and has her mouth open, as typical of Datsueba's images. Unlike other examples in which she exhibits a fierce expression, however, she seems to be laughing rather than frowning. Moreover, the Jōnenji Datsueba holds on her lap a small figure of a baby who is looking at her. I will explain this baby's association with Datsueba later.

Another early example of a Datsueba can be found the sculpture at En'nōji 円応寺, a subtemple of the Zen monastery Kenchōji 建長寺, in Kamakura (fig. IV.28).⁴⁶ As discussed in Chapter Three, the Enma hall built in 1250 at En'nōji enshrines a large, carved Enma as the dominant, central image and other flanking sculptures of the nine kings, Shiroku and Shimei (or two Kushōjin), Datsueba, a hell jailer, and a *dandadō*.⁴⁷ The colored, multi-block Datsueba is 100 centimeters high, and according to its inscription, it was sculpted in 1514 by Kōen 弘円

⁴⁴ For the image, see Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, *Tokubetsuten Jigoku*, 83.

⁴⁵ Inscriptions can be found in Saitō, ed., *Dōkyō no bijutsu*, 336. The Fujiyama bussho is one of the branch workshops of the Nara bussho that centered around Kōfukuji, and sculptors of the Fujiyama workshop were in charge of making images for small- and medium-sized temples in and around Nara. Kensuke, "Muromachi no chōkoku," 65.

⁴⁶ For the image, see Nedachi, "Muromachi no chōkoku," 68.

⁴⁷ Other sculptures are discussed in Chapter Three of this dissertation.

(1442–1529).⁴⁸ The En'nōji Datsueba is different from typical Datsueba images in that she is fully dressed. She wears a robe on top of which is a long overgarment and she is seated with her left knee slightly raised. Her left hand is resting on her left knee with the palm upward, whereas her right hand looks as if it is grasping something. Both hands are posed as if they were holding a long stick such as a *keisaku* 警策 (a wooden stick used during meditation).⁴⁹ Her long hair is fastened with a thin headband. Although she is wrinkled and shows a furious expression with a wide-open mouth, the En'nōji Datsueba has a rather neat appearance.

Another early sculpture of Datsueba in wood can be found at the Shingon school temple Kongōsanji 金剛山寺 (or Yatadera) in Nara (fig. IV.29). ⁵⁰ Kongōsanji originally had an Enma hall or Ten Kings (Jūō) hall enshrining the sculptures of Ten Kings and associates; however, at present only three images remain. Those images include the thirteenth-century Enma or Taizan Fukun, a fourteenth-century Shimei, and a Datsueba dated to 1591. ⁵¹ Made of joined wood blocks, the Datsueba image (height: 62 cm) is painted and has inserted crystal eyes. The inscription inside the Datsueba sculpture tells us that a sculptor named Minbukyō 民部卿 created this image in 1591 and donated it to the Enma or Jūō hall. ⁵² The Kongōsanji Datsueba is clothed, but her breasts are exposed. She is sitting with her right knee raised, resting her right hand on top of her right knee and extending her left hand with palm upward. She might have held something in her left hand. Datsueba's open mouth, teeth, and wrinkles make her look old and scary. Compared to the previous images of Datsueba, the Kongōsanji Datsueba has shorter hair.

⁴⁸ Kōen was one of the sculptors active in the Kamakura area in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. For more information on Kōen, see Miyama Susumu, "Busshi Kōen kō" [Article on the Buddhist sculptor Kōen], *Atomi Gakuen Joshi Daigaku kiyō* 1 (March 1968): 89-99.

⁴⁹ Washizuka, "En'nōji no Enma Jūōzō ni tsuite," 62.

⁵⁰ For the image, see Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, *Tokubetsuten Jigoku*, 84.

⁵¹ Enma or Taizan Fukun and Shimei sculptures are examined in Chapter Three of this dissertation.

⁵² It has not been confirmed who Minbukyō was, but a famous Kyoto-based sculptor, Kōshō 康正 (1534–1621), who will be discussed later, bore the name of Minbukyō.

As shown above, during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, a consensus on the depiction of Datsueba had not yet been achieved. In some cases, Datsueba is depicted as standing rather than seated; in some cases, her breasts are bared, while in other cases, she is fully dressed. In the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, however, the old hag Datsueba began to be rendered in a seated posture with exposed ribs or withered, drooping breasts.⁵³ By the seventeenth century, when the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba was sculpted, images of Datsueba appear to have been standardized. She began to be commonly depicted as an elderly demon hag sitting with an open mouth, bulging eyes, one knee up, and a bare chest exposing her ribs and sagging breasts. Which leg is raised is not consistent. Moreover, some images show Datsueba as half-naked, only wearing a skirt, whereas others present her wearing a loose robe and showing a bare chest. Hairstyles vary, and sometimes she holds a cloth in her hand. In 1690 the Japanese iconographic manual entitled Butsuzō zui 仏像図彙 (Illustrated Compendium of Buddhist Images) was published in three volumes.⁵⁴ The Datsueba image included in the *Butsuzō zui* manual depicts her seated with her right leg up under the *eryōju* tree (fig. IV.30).⁵⁵ She wears a baggy robe that bares her chest and holds a cloth that she must have taken away from the deceased. With wrinkles and long eyebrows, she looks old, and her mouth is wide open. An entry next to the picture explains that her height is sixteen shaku (4.8 meters) and her eyes look like wheels. As Butsuzō zui came to serve as the most widely distributed source for Buddhist images, this description might have been an iconographic model for later visual representations of Datsueba. Accordingly, the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba was sculpted based on this standardized iconographic model of the old hag.

⁵³ The Datsueba sculpture at En'nōji is exceptional since she wears layers of robes.

⁵⁴ Its illustrations were done by a painter, Tosa Hidenobu 土佐秀信. See *Shoshū Butsuzō zui*, compiled by Gishin (n.p., 1690). This manual continued to be expanded and was republished in five volumes in 1783 and every few decades afterwards up to the early twentieth century. For more information on later enlarged versions, see Fowler, *Accounts and Images of Six Kannon in Japan*, n. 70, 333.

⁵⁵ For the image, see Kuno Takeshi, ed., *Edo butsuzō zuten*, 154.

Datsueba at Rokuharamitsuji

The wooden sculpture of Datsueba at Rokuharamitsuji is represented as a hag demon (fig. IV.31).⁵⁶ Datsueba (height: 36 cm) is seated with her left leg raised, her left hand on her left knee, and her right fist on her right thigh. Her left hand makes a loose fist, which suggests that she might have once held something like a cloth. Her upper body is naked, revealing her ribs and sagging breasts as well as her backbone. She wears only a skirt that covers her thighs. Her nude upper body with its withered breasts hanging down should particularly remind us of the female demons depicted in the *Jigoku zōshi* handscroll (figs. IV.3-4). The Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba's hair is meticulously sculpted: curly hair in the front and falling in nine bunches in the back. Her painted eyes are big, and her mouth is open so widely that her tongue and teeth are visible. Made using the multi-block wood technique, the sculpture has traces of red pigment on the face, body, and skirt.

Inscriptions tell us more information about the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba. On the bottom of the sculpture is the following inscription written in red lacquer from right to left:

山城国 Yamashiro no kuni

六波羅蜜寺 Rokuharamitsuji

優婆 Uba

寬永六己巳年 Kanei roku kishitoshi

照月寿光信女 Terutsuki jukō shinnyo

七月七日 Nanagatsu nanaoka

寿光信女為頓 Jukō shinnyo itomi

⁵⁶ Kawasaki and Taki, *Rokuharamitsuji*, 52.

証菩提也 Shōbodaiya

法眼康猶 Hōgen Kōyū

新添之⁵⁷ Shinsoeno

[English Translation]

Yamashiro Province

Rokuharamitsuji

Uba (Datsueba)

In the sixth year of the Kanei era (1629)

Female lay devotee named Teruzuki Jukō

On the seventh day of the seventh month

Wholeheartedly for Jukō

Validating her salvation in the next world

Högen (second highest honorary Buddhist title for a sculptor) Köyü

Newly added it

According to this inscription, the sculpture was made by Kōyū 康猶 (?–1632) in 1629 to pray for his deceased daughter's entry to Nirvana. Kōyū's daughter died in the same year and was given the title Teruzuki Jukō 照月寿光, as a posthumous Buddhist name for a female believer. Besides this inscription, another inscription in ink found on the bottom of the pedestal tells us that the sculpture was restored in 1791.⁵⁸

⁵⁷ Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 21.

願主法心 ganshu hōshin

再興細工福島?前守 saikō saiku fukushima? zengami

133

⁵⁸ Excerpt from Asami, "Chōsa hōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō," 21.

寬政三歳 辛亥 七月 Kansei mitose shingai nanagatsu

Köyū the Sculptor

Kōyū, the maker of the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba, was the eldest son of Kōshō 康正 (1534–1621), who headed the Shichijō bussho 七条仏所 (Seventh Avenue workshop) in Kyoto. The Shichijō bussho, which was founded by Kakujo 覚助 (?–1077), the son of Jōchō 定朝 (?–1057), in the Shichijō Takakura 七条高倉 area, remained active until the nineteenth century. The Shichijō bussho functioned as one of the most renowned Buddhist image-making workshops in Kyoto, serving elite patrons. It was also referred to as the Kei 慶 school since major Kamakuraperiod sculptors, including Kōkei 康慶 (fl. late 12th c.), Unkei 運慶 (?–1223), and Tankei 湛慶 (1173–1256), worked in the Shichijō bussho and headed the atelier. However, by the end of the fourteenth century, several members of the Shichijō bussho had formed separate branch workshops, including the Shichijō nishi bussho 七条西仏所, the Shichijō naka bussho 七条中仏所, and the Shichijō higashi bussho 七条東仏所. 59 Despite this division, in a broad sense they are considered to be part of the same school.

Even though the activities of the Shichijō bussho had become fairly stagnant by the sixteenth century, Kōshō, Kōyū's father, reinvigorated the workshop searching for a new style based on Kamakura-period precedents, as shown in the Yakushi triad in the Kondō of Tōji 東寺 and the Shaka triad in Myōhōin 妙法院.⁶⁰ According to *Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu narabini*

[[]English Translation]: In the third year of the Kansei era (1791), the seventh month of the Shingai year / Petitioner Hōshin / Restored by a craftsman by the name of Fukushima? zengami.

⁵⁹ The Shichijō nishi bussho 七条西仏所 was established by Unkei's grandson Kōyo 康誉 (?-?); the Shichijō naka bussho 七条中仏所 was established by Unkei's third son Kōben 康弁 (?-?); and the Shichijō higashi bussho 七条東 仏所 was established by Kōshun 康俊 (?-?), son of Unkei's sixth son Unjo 運助 (?-?). In the beginning, the Nishi bussho was considered the legitimate lineage of the Shichijō bussho but in the latter half of the fifteenth century, the Naka bussho became more influential. For more information on the sculptures made by these workshops during the Muromachi period, see Nedachi, "Muromachi no chōkoku," 46-61.

⁶⁰ Nedachi, Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai, 369.

matsuryū 本朝大仏師正統系図幷末流 (Orthodox Genealogy including Lower Branches of Great Buddhist Sculptors in Japan) from Konkōji 金光寺, Kōshō served as the twenty-first head of the Shichijō workshop, creating and repairing sculptures in many temples, such as Myōhōin, Tōji, Shitennōji, Shōkokuji, and Sanjūsangendō.⁶¹ He also assumed the position of the master sculptor 大仏師 (daibusshi) of Tōji, which was considered one of the most prominent sculptor titles in Japan. Being a Daibusshi of Tōji meant not only having an occupation as a chief sculptor, but also earning a status accompanied by privileges and assets.⁶²

Succeeding his father, Kōyū was the twenty-second master sculptor of the Shichijō bussho, and in 1602 he was appointed Tōji Daibusshi. 63 Like Kōshō, Kōyū participated in various significant temple projects. Among them, the restoration of the Yakushi triad in the Golden Hall at Tōji stands out. This Yakushi triad consisting of Yakushi Buddha (Skt. Bhaiṣajyaguru), Nikkō bodhisattva (Skt. Suryaprabha), and Gakkō bodhisattva (Skt. Candraprabha) was originally made in 796, but in 1486 it was destroyed by fire. Then, in 1602 Kōshō, along with Kōyū and other Shichijō bussho sculptors, initiated the Yakushi triad restoration project, which lasted for nine years. Even though Kōyū succeeded to the title of Tōji Daibusshi a month after the restoration began, Kōshō continued to oversee the project as an actual chief sculptor at Tōji. 64 Nevertheless, Kōyū joined the restoration project and worked as one of the main sculptors. The inscription on the wooden plaque found inside the head of the Yakushi image indicates that the Toyotomi 豊臣 family sponsored the Yakushi triad, as an

⁶¹ The edition of *Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu narabini matsuryū* written after 1634 was first published in Tanaka Kisasu, "*Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu no kōkanni tsuite*" [About the publication of the Orthodox Genealogy of Great Buddhist Sculptors in Japan], *Bijutsu kenkyū* 11 (November 1932): 34-43.

⁶² Nedachi, Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai, 280.

⁶³ Nedachi, Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai, 269.

⁶⁴ Considering that Kōshō's name appeared in the inscriptions on other Tōji sculptures made after 1602, the succession of Tōji daibusshi title might have only been formal. See Nedachi, *Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai*, 269 and 348.

offering to bring them prosperity.⁶⁵ Moreover, the sculptors include Shichijō Daibusshi Kōshō, who was awarded Hōin 法印 (Seal of the Law), the highest honorary Buddhist title; Kōri 康理, Kōshō's brother; Kōyū, Kōshō's son; and Kōei 康英, Kōshō's other son.⁶⁶

Surrounded by a mandorla adorned with seven smaller Yakushi, the main Yakushi Buddha is seated on a high platform, and underneath the platform are small sculptures of the Twelve Divine Generals, which are considered to be appropriate attendants of Yakushi. Among these twelve general sculptures, four figures, including Kubira (Skt. Kumbhira), Meikira (Skt. Mihira), Haira (Skt. Pajra), and Shōtora (Skt. Catura), have inscriptions that contain Kōyū's name notated as follows: Sakyō Hōkyō Kōyū 左京法橋康猶 (Kōyū from the east side of Kyoto with the title Hōkyō (Bridge of the Law) (figs. IV.32-35).⁶⁷ In particular, the inscription written on the back of Kubira's body reveals that Kōyū was eighteen years old when he made the sculpture in 1603.⁶⁸ As mentioned earlier, by his late teens, Kōyū had already become a master sculptor of Tōji, and gained the third highest honorary Buddhist title, Hōkyō. According to the same inscription, while Kōshō made the sculptures of Yakushi, Nikkō, and Gakkō, Kōyū created some of the twelve generals and joined in on making the seven smaller Yakushi figures for the mandorla. This demonstrates that Kōyū played a significant role in restoring the Yakushi triad sculptures at Toji, which have been regarded as some of the most important sculpture commissions in Kyoto in the seventeenth century, and that at an early age he earned recognition as a skilled sculptor.

⁶⁵ Jūyō Bunzakai Hensan Iinkai, ed., *Shin shitei jūyō bunzakai: kaisetsuban* [Newly designated important cultural property: commentary], vol. 3 (Tokyo: Mainichi Shinbunsha, 1980-1984), 28-29.

⁶⁶ Jūyō Bunzakai Hensan Iinkai, Shin shitei jūyō bunzakai: kaisetsuban, 28-29.

⁶⁷ Tōji Hōmotsukan, *Shūri kansei kinnen Tōji no Jūni Shinshōzō: moderingu no myō* [Commemoration of completing the restoration of the sculptures of the twelve devine generals] (Tokyo: Tōji Hōmotsukan, 2002), 41, 47, 57, and 61. For the images, see Tōji Hōmotsukan, *Tōji no Jūni Shinshōzō*, 14, 20, 30, and 34.

⁶⁸ Tōji Hōmotsukan, *Shūri kansei kinnen Tōji no Jūni Shinshōzō*, 61.

In addition to the Tōji Yakushi triad, Kōyū created and restored sculptures at several other temples in Kyoto, such as Shōkokuji 相国寺, Kiyomizudera 清水寺, and Chionin 知恩 院.⁶⁹ Moreover, Kōyū was commissioned by the Tokugawa shogun to make sculptures and mortuary tablets for shogunate-sponsored temples, including Zōjōji 增上寺 and Kaneiji 寛永寺 in Edo (Tokyo), and for the Shinto shrine Nikkō Tōshōgū 日光東照宮 dedicated to Tokugawa Ieyasu 徳川家康 (1543–1616).70 In 1598, Ieyasu designated Zōjōji, a small, preexisting Jōdo school temple in Edo, as the mortuary temple for his clan, while Ieyasu's grandson, Iemitsu 家光 (1604–1651), founded Kaneiji, another family temple, in Edo in 1625. Ieyasu intended to turn Zōjōji into the main Jōdō school temple in eastern Japan, one that would rival the Jōdo head temple Chionin of Kyoto.⁷¹ In a similar tactic, Iemitsu planned to make Kaneiji the new headquarters of Tendai Buddhism in eastern Japan, challenging the authority of the Tendai complex on Mount Hiei, northeast of Kyoto. 72 Both Zōjōji and Kaneiji not only enshrined the souls of deceased Tokugawa ancestors, but also functioned as "personal and national symbols of Tokugawa hegemony."⁷³ When Kaneiji was established, Kōyū sculpted the main deity for its Goma (fire ritual) hall, several figures in the Yakushi hall, Five Buddhas in the five-storied pagoda, and the Shaka Buddha, Monju bodhisattva (Skt. Mañjuśrī), and Fugen bodhisattva (Skt. Samantabhadra) in Hōkke hall.⁷⁴ By then, Kōyū had earned the second highest Buddhist title,

⁶⁹ Tanaka, "*Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu no kōkanni tsuite*," 38 and Hase Yōichi, "Daibusshi keizu to shichijō busshi" [Shichijō Buddhist sculptors and a genealogy of master sculptors of Buddhist images], *Kansai Daigaku Bungaku Ronshū* 63, no. 4 (February 2014): 32.

⁷⁰ Hase, "Daibusshi keizu to shichijō busshi," 32.

⁷¹ Patricia Jane Graham, *Faith and Power in Japanese Buddhist Art, 1600-2005* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i, 2007), 35.

⁷² Graham, Faith and Power in Japanese Buddhist Art, 36.

⁷³ Graham, Faith and Power in Japanese Buddhist Art, 35.

⁷⁴ Tōeizan shodō konryūki 東叡山諸堂建立記, Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho, vol. 120 (Tokyo: Meicho Fukyūkai, 1978-1983), 426-428.

Hōgen 法眼 (Eye of the Law).⁷⁵ Additionally, at Zōjōji, Kōyū made mortuary tablets for the second shogun, Tokugawa Hidetada 徳川秀忠 (1579–1632), and for Sugenin 崇源院 (1573–1626), a wife of Hidetada, for the Taitokuin mausoleum in Edo.⁷⁶

Kōyū also joined the construction project of Nikkō Tōshōgū, another sacred space that strengthened the Tokugawa hegemony. As a mausoleum and shrine for Tokugawa Ieyasu, Nikkō Tōshōgū was originally constructed in 1617 and was dismantled and rebuilt in 1636 under the third shogun, Iemitsu. A Tendai Buddhist priest and religious adviser to the Tokugawa, Tenkai 天海 (1536-1643)⁷⁷ played a vital role in the Nikkō Tōshōgū construction project, according to Nikkōzan omiya gobutsuzō goshūfuku goyōki narabini Dai bukkōshoku iesujime ryakukei 日光山 御宮御仏像御修復御用記 并大仏工職家筋目略系 (Description of the Restoration Order of Buddhist Sculpture in Mount Nikkō Shrines and the Abbreviated Family Lineage of Buddhist Sculptors) written in 1750 and Goyō oboegaki 御用覚書 (order memorandum) from the seventeenth century. These texts record that sculptures of the three deities, Tōshō Gongen 東照 権現, Sannō Gongen 山王権現, and Matarashin 摩多羅神, and several other images in the Honji (Original Form) hall of Nikkō Tōshōgū were originally made based on Tenkai's text Himitsu gosōden 秘密御相伝 (Inherited Secrets). Considering that Goyō oboegaki and Honchō

7

⁷⁹ Miyama, "Kinsei shichijō bussho no bakufu goyō o megutte," 24.

⁷⁵ Tōeizan shodō konryūki, Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho, 426-428.

⁷⁶ Miyama Susumu, "Kinsei shichijō bussho no bakufu goyō o megutte: Niide not shiryō o chūshin ni" [An examination of the official orders of Shichijō Buddhist sculptors by the bakufu: Focusing on new materials], *Kamakura* 80 (1996): 28-29.

⁷⁷ Born in Mutsu Takada (Fukushima Prefecture), Tenkai studied Tendai Buddhism on Mount Hie in the northeast of Kyoto. In 1613 Tenkai was appointed as head of the entire complex of shrines and temples at Mount Nikkō by Tokugawa Ieyasu. From then on, Tenkai served Ieyasu, Hidetada, and Iemitsu as their religious counselor. As his religious power increased, Tenkai began to get involved in government affairs. Besides the construction and reconstruction of Nikkō Tōshōgū, Tenkai took part in creating the *Tōshōsha engi* (Origin of the [Nikkō] Tōshō Shrine), a document devised by Iemitsu to propagate the religious tale of Ieyasu's life and his deification. For more information on *Tōshōsha engi*, see Karen M. Gerhart, "The Tōshō Daigongen engi as Political Propaganda," in *The Eyes of Power: Art and Early Tokugawa Authority* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999), 107-140.

⁷⁸ *Goyō oboegaki* is a tentative name of the text written by Shichijō bussho sculptors about their employment by the shogunate. See Miyama, "Kinsei shichijō bussho no bakufu goyō o megutte," 24.

daibusshi seitō keizu listed Kōyū as the first sculptor associated with Nikkō Tōshōgū, it must have been Kōyū who received *Himitsu gosōden* from Tenkai to produce the Tōshōgū sculptures.⁸⁰ Creating sculptures contained inside family shrines and temples, Kōyū had an important role as the primary sculptor hired and sponsored by the Tokugawa shogunate.

Furthermore, Kōyū is known to have repaired a portrait sculpture of the patriarch of the Ji 時 school of Buddhism at Shichijōdōjō Konkōji 七条道場金光寺 in Kyoto. Konkōji's *kakochō* 過去帳 (necrology) written in the nineteenth century has an entry as follows:

寛永六己巳七月 Kanei roku kishitoshi nanagatsu

照月寿光信女 Teruzuki jukō shinnyo

仏師廿二代康猶之娘也 Busshi nijūnidai Kōyū no musumeya

遊行二祖上人御木像 Yugyō niso shōnin gomokuzō

修造主者大仏師法眼 Shūzōshusha daibusshi hōgen

康猶娘為寿光寄付之81 Kōyū musumetame Jukō kifuno

[English Translation]

In the seventh month of the sixth year of Kanei era (1629)

A female lay devotee named Teruzuki Jukō,

Daughter of the twenty-second Daibusshi Kōyū.

Wooden sculpture of the second patriarch Yugyō shōnin [Shinkyō]

Repaired by Daibusshi Hōgen [Kōyū]

Kōyū donated it in honor of his daughter Jukō.

80 Miyama, "Kinsei shichijō bussho no bakufu goyō o megutte," 24.

81 Mōri Hisashi, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi" [Buddhist sculptors of the Shichijō school at Konkōji], *Bukkyo geijutsu* 59 (December 1965): 58.

Kōyū repaired the portrait sculpture of Shinkyō 真教 (1237–1319), the second Ji school patriarch named Yugyō Shōnin 遊行上人 (wandering holy man), in honor of his own daughter Teruzuki Jukō, who died in 1629. Teruzuki Jukō is the same daughter to whom Kōyū dedicated the Datsueba sculpture at Rokuharamitsuji.

Kōyū donated the sculpture of Shinkyō to Konkōji for his deceased daughter since the temple originally located in Shichijō Higashinotōin 七条東洞院 of Kyoto had a very close relationship with the Shichijō bussho to which he belonged. Konkōji was one of the headquarters of the Ji school, a branch of Pure Land Buddhism that developed in Kyoto around the itinerant priest Ippen 一遍 (1234–1289). The temple enshrined seven portrait sculptures of the Ji school Yugyō Shōnin patriarchs, among which five were made by Shichijō bussho sculptors. The five sculptures include Ippen, Icchin 一鎮 (1177–1355), Sonmei 尊明 (1350–1417), Son'ei 尊惠 (1363–1429), and Kiyū 暉幽 (1403–1466). These images are representative works done by the Shichijō workshop.

Konkōji also had several documents confirming a bond between Konkōji itself and the Shichijō workshop sculptors. As a case in point, Konkōji held a fifteenth-century letter written by the sixteenth Yugyō Shōnin Nanyo 南要 (1385–1470).⁸⁴ This letter, addressed to the

⁸² As Konkōji was consolidated to Chōrakuji 長楽寺 in 1907, those sculptures along with related documents are currently housed in Chōrakuji. The seven portrait sculptures were designated Important Cultural Property in 1980, and, while repairs were conducted from 1983 to 1987, objects and inscriptions were found inside each sculpture, which determined the subjects of the figures.

⁸³ For more information on sculptors for each image, see Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, *Chōrakuji no meihō* [Famous treasures from Chōrakuji] (Kyoto: Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2000), 52-54.

⁸⁴ On the back of the letter is written 'yugyō nijūichi dai shōnin gosho 遊行廿一代上人御書,' which attributes the letter to the twenty-first Ji school Yugyō shōnin Chiren 知蓮 (1452–1513). However, Konkōji has a letter written by Chiren, in which the handwriting is different from the letter in discussion. For more information, see Asanuma Takeshi, "Shichijō bussho ni yoru Jishū soshi zō seisaku no shoki no yōsō ni tsuite: Kōshōji den Itchin shōnin zazō to Chōrakuji Shinkyō shōnin izō o megutte" [About the early phase of the production of Ji school patriarch sculptures by the Shichijō Buddhist workshop: Regarding the seated sculpture of priest Itchin at Kōshōji and the seated sculpture of priest Shinkyō at Chōrakuj], *Gakusō Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan* 23 (2001): 101.

eighteenth Yugyō Shōnin Nyozō 如象 (1417–94), concerns the Shichijō bussho. Here, Nanyo advised Nyozō that in the future he should entrust the creation of sculptures to both the Shichijō nishi bussho and the Shichijō naka bussho since the completion of Ippen's portrait sculpture by the Shichijō nishi bussho alone was late.85

Another document is the previously mentioned *Kakochō* at Konkōji, which lists the names of the living for posthumous peace and the names of the dead for rebirth in paradise.⁸⁶ While the Konkōji death register contains names of people from diverse social classes, such as emperors, high priests, shoguns, and lay believers, the names of Shichijō sculptors and their families, in particular, appear frequently. 87 Not only his daughter but also Kōyū himself were listed in the death register of Konkōji. Similar to that described in *Kakochō*, Konkōji enshrined a large wooden mortuary tablet (height: 89.5 cm) for the Shichijō sculptors. On the back of the tablet, the names of sculptors from the founder Jōchō to the twenty-fifth master Kōjō 康乗 (1644–89) are carved. This tablet must have been made to mourn for the souls of deceased Shichijō workshop sculptors.

Lastly, Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu narabini matsuryū, dated to 1750 from Konkōji, demonstrates the temple's interest in and its special relationship with the Shichijō workshop sculptors. Unlike other versions, the Konkōji version records only up to the twenty-seventh sculptor and briefly lists the titles or achievements of each sculptor. 88 The Konkōji-related notes are written in precise detail. For example, written next to Kōben's name is his donation of family land to Konkōji. 89 Moreover, an entry about Kōshō states that the Shichijō workshop sculptors

⁸⁵ Nanyō shōnin (yugyō jūroku dai taa) shojō 南要上人 (遊行十六代他阿) 書状. For the full text, see Murai Yasuhiko and Ōyama Kyōhei, ed., Chōrakuji zō Shichijōdōjō Konkōji bunsho no kenkyū [Studies on the documents of the Shichijō school of Konkōji held at Chōrakuji] (Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 2012), 68-69.

⁸⁶ For more discussion on *Kakochō*, see Mōri, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi," 57.
⁸⁷ Mōri, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi," 57-60.

⁸⁸ Mōri, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi," 62-63.

⁸⁹ Original text can be found in Mōri, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi," 62.

had lived in Konkōji until Kōshō moved to Karasuma 鳥丸 Street in 1585,⁹⁰ which reveals that the Shichijō bussho was affiliated with the temple not only professionally but also personally.

Kōyū, the head sculptor of the Shichijō workshop and at Tōji, also maintained a personal, intimate relationship with Konkōji, as evidenced by his daughter's name being listed on the temple's death register and the repair of a portrait sculpture of the Ji school patriarch at Konkōji for his daughter. Why then, would Kōyū have chosen to sculpt a Datsueba image and to dedicate that sculpture to Rokuharamitsuji rather than Konkōji?

Popular Datsueba

Admittedly there are no records that detail the personal relationship between Kōyū and Rokuharamitsuji. However, as discussed in Chapter Two, Rokuharamitsuji was salvation-oriented from its very beginning, was located in the Rokuhara area entrenched in the concept of death and the afterlife, and served as a sacred space of Jizō bodhisattva, the protector of women and children, holding the two sculptures, that of Katsurakake Jizō and that of Yumemi Jizō, and appealing to a wide spectrum of devotees. Moreover, Rokuharamitsuji had already enshrined the Kamakura-period sculptures of Enma and his assistants who control one's fate after death and even before death. Kōyū must have been aware of such advantages and efficacies of the temple with regard to ensuring a light punishment in the underworld or a favorable judgement leading to a peaceful afterlife.

Kōyū might have decided to make and donate the sculpture of Datsueba to Rokuharamitsuji because Datsueba had gained popularity as a close associate of Enma, the ruler of the underworld, and as a salvific symbol. Even before Kōyū dedicated his Datsueba sculpture to Rokuharamitsuji, Datsueba appears to have been understood as a major component of the

⁹⁰ Original text can be found in Mōri, "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi," 62.

underworld by people in Kyoto. The fourteenth-century handscroll entitled Yugyō shōnin engie 遊行上人縁起絵 (Illustrated Biography of Ippen)⁹¹ includes a scene in which Ippen 一遍 (1234–1289), the founder of the Ji school of Buddhism, and his followers, cross the Shijō Bridge on their way to the Shakadō 釈迦堂 (currently known as Somedonoin 染殿院) at Shijō, Kyōgoku in Kyoto.⁹² In the 1594 copy kept at Kōmyōji 光明寺 in Yamagata Prefecture, a monk wearing a bamboo hat and a gray robe is soliciting and preaching to bystanders at the foot of the Shijō Bridge with puppets (fig. IV.36).⁹³ The monk shows small figures of the Parinirvana of the Buddha, humans, and hell jailers on the top of a large table covered with a cloth with painted images symbolizing death. Two groups of images are depicted: one with Jizō and two hungry ghosts and the other with a human and Datsueba sitting under the eryōju tree. This scene demonstrates that the townspeople of Kyoto had easily accessible and public opportunities to learn that Datsueba was a major figure in Enma's underworld.

By the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, Datsueba appears to have become as popular as Enma and to have been considered equally as important as Enma as a symbol of death and judgment. Datsueba was worshipped individually or together with Enma in designated halls, as represented in *Shaji sankei mandara* 社寺参詣曼荼羅 (Pilgrimage Mandalas of Shrines and Temples). As visual aids to explain and advertise sacred sites, *sankei mandara*, mostly produced during the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, describe the landscapes of shrines and

⁹¹ Yugyō shōnin engie is based on a text edited by a priest named Sōshun. Its first four scrolls describe the life of Ippen, while the remaining six scrolls depict the life of Ta'a, the second patriarch of the Ji school. Although the original set is lost, more than ten groups of scrolls are dispersed in several temples and private collections. Tanaka Ichimatsu and Kadokawa Shoten, ed., Yugyō shōnin engie [Illustrated biography of Ippen], Nihon emakimono zenshū, vol. 23 (Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1958-1969), 1-4.

⁹² According to the inscription accompanying this scene, Ippen and his followers entered the city of Kyoto on the 16th of the intercalary 4th month in 1284. They stayed at the Shakadō and observed the *nenbutsu* service, which attracted the attention of the citizens. See *Yugyō shōnin engie*, *Nihon emakimono zenshū*, 63-64.

⁹³ For the image, see Ryūkoku Daigaku Ryūkoku Myujiamu, *Etokitte naani: katari tsugareru bukkyō kaiga* [What is *etoki*?: Buddhist paintings handed down] (Tokyo: Mainichi Shinbunsha, 2012), 11.

temples, which include images of pilgrims worshipping at the site as well as of historical and miraculous events related to the site. As a case in point, a *sankei mandara* from Zenkōji 善光寺 made between 1596 and 1600 includes images of two halls, each enshrining a sculpture of Datsueba, which a pilgrim to Zenkōji meets upon entering the temple precinct through its gate (fig. IV.37-38). 94 In each hall Datsueba has sagging breasts and holds a white cloth in one hand and a stick in the other. Next to the halls are trees where white cloths are hung. They resemble the *eryōju* tree, under which Datsueba is often seated. The inclusion of *eryōju* trees, which do not exist in reality, seems to have been intended to remind viewers of the role of Datsueba. 95

By the seventeenth century, *kanjin hijiri* 勧進聖 (itinerant ascetics doing fundraising campaigns), who were recurrently seen on the streets, played a significant role in popularizing Datsueba. The six-panel screen dating approximately to 1607 in the Nagoya City Museum presents two *kanjin hijiri* with a Datsueba sculpture. This screen not only depicts the construction of a castle by the Kaga Maeda 加賀前田 family in Sunpu (present-day Shizuoka City), but also includes street scenes with shops and entertainment performances. ⁹⁶ Next to an audience watching a lion dance are two priests wearing gray robes (fig. IV.39). ⁹⁷ Strapped around his neck of the monk on the right is a *zushi* (portable shrine) that has a small sculpture of Datsueba exposing her chest and holding a white cloth. He opens his mouth slightly, looking at two men kneeling in front of him, as if preaching the story of Datsueba to them. He is followed

⁹⁴ For the images, see Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Shaji sankei mandara*, pl. 25.

⁹⁵ Terasawa Shingo argues that the inclusion of Datsueba along with Sai no kawara and the blood bowl pool hell was intended to emphasize hell and salvation at Zenkōji. See Terasawa Shingo, "Zenkōji sankei mandara ni suite" [About the Zenkōji pilgrimage mandala], *Plilokaria* 28 (March 2011): 100-101.

⁹⁶ Kuge Masafumi, "Datsueba o motsu hijiri" [A monk holding Datsueba], in *Hyōhaku no geinōsha*, ed. Sonoda Gakuen Joshi Daigaku and Rekishi Minzoku Gakkai (Tokyo: Iwatashoin, 2006), 101.

⁹⁷ For the image, see Okamoto Ryōichi and Wakisaka Atsushi, eds., *Kuge buke* [Courtiers and warriors], *Kinsei fūzoku zufu*, vol. 11 (Tokyo: Shōgakkan, 1984), 52.

by another priest who carries a sack on his back and a big ladle across his shoulder probably to receive alms.

A similar image of *kanjin hijiri* can be found in the seventh volume of the book entitled *Jinrin kinmō zui* 人倫訓蒙図彙 (Illustrated encyclopedia of humanity) published in 1690 (fig. IV.40). 98 *Jinrin kinmō zui* illustrates a traveling priest introduced as Ouba no kanjin 御優婆勧進 (Fundraising for the old hag) carrying a pole that has a *zushi* with a Datsueba sculpture in front and a *zushi* with a Jizō sculpture in the back. The Datsueba in the *zushi* is seated with her right leg up, a bare chest, and a cloth in her right hand. According to the explanation under the illustration,

By the Sanzu River is a horrifying old woman [Datsueba] who snatches away the clothes of men and women heading towards the underworld. If connected to this person [itinerant monk] while living in this world, she [Datsueba] will look away and let you through.⁹⁹

The explanation further records that Ouba no kanjin gathered female believers. As this entry and the 1607 screen reveal, Datsueba as the old hag in Enma's underworld had become such a familiar deity that the Japanese populace, male or female, could easily encounter her even outside temple precincts through *kanjin hijiri*. Later around the An'ei era (1772–1781) the Datsueba cult became strengthened to the extent that there were efforts to suppress it in 1849.

Kōyū also might have chosen to sculpt a popular image of Datsueba for his deceased daughter as Datsueba was thought to be a great advocate for salvation. He indicated in the inscription written underneath the Datsueba sculpture at Rokuharamitsuji that the sculpture

Asakura Haruhiko, ed., *Jinrin kinmō zui* [Illustrated encyclopedia of humanity] (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1990), 267.
 Asakura, *Jinrin kinmō zui*, 267.

¹⁰⁰ Asakura, *Jinrin kinmō zui*, 267.

¹⁰¹ Yanagita Kunio, "Shōzuka no baba" [Old woman of the Sanzu River], in *Imo no Chikara*, *Yanagita Kunio zenshū*, vol. 11 (Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1998), 397.

would "validate her salvation in the next world" 証菩提也. This mirrors Kōyū's understanding of Datsueba as the deity who could bring his deceased daughter salvation. The belief that Datsueba is indicative of salvation was promoted in pilgrimage mandalas. In the Zenkōji sankei mandara mentioned above, two sculptures of Datsueba are positioned at the middle gate that leads to the main hall where the famous hidden image of the Amida triad is enshrined within the Zenkōji compound. This positioning of Datsueba images suggests that her presence signaled the entry to the Amida Buddha's sacred space where pilgrims went to seek eventual salvation. 102

Similarly, in different versions of the *sankei mandara* of the Ise Shrines probably created in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, pilgrims to Ise encountered Datsueba after crossing the Miya River, escaping the polluted everyday world and entering the pure land. In the version kept at Jingū Chōkokan, the museum of the Ise Shrines in Mie Prefecture, an oversized sculpture of Datsueba is seated with her right knee up inside a rather large building (fig. IV.41). In the sloppily dressed Datsueba holds a bundle of white clothes in her left hand. In front of the building, a male pilgrim prays to a Datsueba sculpture, pressing his hands together. In the case of the *Ise sankei mandara* in the Kimiko and John Powers private collection, a Datsueba sculpture is enshrined alongside a sculpture of Enma in the same building, as a passing *yamabushi* 山伏 (mountain ascetic hermit) looks in the direction of the sculptures (fig. IV.42). In the sculptures of Datsueba and Enma, both treated equally, offer pilgrims a fierce greeting and

¹⁰² Saka Chihiro discusses this salvific aspect of Datsueba symboized in the Zenkōji sankei mandara in her article, "Bridging the Realms of Underworld and Pure Land: An Examination of Datsueba's Roles in the Zenkōji Pilgrimage Mandala," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 44, no. 2 (2017): 191-223.

¹⁰³ Peter Knecht, "Ise sankei mandara and the Image of the Pure Land," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 33, no. 2 (2006): 236. For a fuller interpretation of the Ise mandara, see Talia J. Andrei, "Ise Sankei Mandara and the Art of Fundraising in Medieval Japan," *The Art Bulletin* 100.1 (2018): 79-82.

¹⁰⁴ For the image, see Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Shaji sankei mandara*, pl. 42 and Andrei, "Ise Sankei Mandara and the Art of Fundraising in Medieval Japan," fig. 9.

¹⁰⁵ For the image, see Osaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, *Shaji sankei mandara*, pl. 45 and Andrei, "Ise Sankei Mandara and the Art of Fundraising in Medieval Japan," fig. 10.

introduce them to a Buddhist world after death, eventually leading them to the blissful pure land of Ise. 106

Furthermore, the belief in Datsueba developed in relation to women and children, and thus presumably motivated Kōyū, who had lost a daughter, to dedicate a sculpture of Datsueba to Rokuharamitsuji. Datsueba's life-giving ability can be observed in the early sixteenth-century otogizōshi titled *Tengu no dairi* 天狗の内裏 (Tengu's Palace). In the tale, Datsueba "presides over births and lends the newborn an item called the placenta cloth," and then takes it back after death. This dichotomous aspect of Datsueba relates to her guaranteeing safe childbirth and to controlling birth and death. 108

Datsueba's image as the old hag of the Sanzu River was also conflated with the image of the mountain goddess Ubagami 姥神 (old woman deity) or Uba 姥 (優婆) (old hag), who is believed to protect women and their children as well as the border between the living and the dead. Often worshipped through stone images of an old woman, Uba has a frightening face and bare chest, and sits with one leg up, similar to Datsueba's typical apprearance. Besides their physical appearance, Datsueba and Uba share the abilities to secure women's abundant lactation as well as children's health. An unusual sculpture of Datsueba holding a small baby

¹⁰⁶ Knecht, "Ise sankei mandara and the Image of the Pure Land," 237.

¹⁰⁷ Hank Glassman, "At the Crossroads of Birth and Death: The Blood Pool Hell and Postmortem Fetal Extraction," in *Death and the Afterlife in Japanese Buddhism*, eds. Jacqueline I. Stone and Mariko Namba Walter (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008), 184-185.

¹⁰⁸ Glassman, "At the Crossroads of Birth and Death," 185 and Kawamura, *Jigoku meguri*, 166-167.

¹⁰⁹ Hara, "Chūsei ni okeru Datsueba no juyō to ninshiki ni tsuite," 84.

Mount Tateyama in Toyama prefecture has been worshipped for geographic features that are thought to resemble the Buddhist paradise and hell. The cult that developed around Mount Tateyama promised rebirth in Amida's Pure Land to those who traveled the mountain path to the summit. The Tateyama cult also promoted Uba (also referred to as Ubason 姥尊 or Onbasama おんぱ様), the double of Datsueba, as the principal female deity guarding the mountain path and protecting women. On Tateyama, many sculptures of Ubason are found to be worshipped inside Ubadō halls. For more information on Ubason revered within the Tateyama cult, see Hirasawa, *Hell-bent for Heaven in Tateyama*, 137-181.

¹¹⁰ For examples of stone images of Ubagami, see Tanaka Hideo, *Tōgoku satoyama no ishigami sekibutsu keifu* [Lineage of stone kami and stone buddha in the rural area of Kanto provinces] (Tokyo: Seiga Shobō, 2014), 43-70.
111 Bernard Faure, *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity, and Gender* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003), 315-316. Datsueba and Ubagami are also connected to the aged Ono no Komachi 小野小町 (fl. ca. 850), a

on her lap at Jōnenji may indicate this amalgamation of Datsueba and Uba (fig. IV.27). By the seventeenth century, Uba seems to have been prevalently perceived as a double image of Datsueba, the menacing hag of Sanzu River, and vice versa. Kōyū's Datsueba sculpture was also recognized as Uba, as indicated by the characters "優婆" (Uba) in the inscription, which were used to name the image. Additionally, the aforementioned illustration of an itinerant monk carrying a sculpture of Datsueba in the seventeenth-century book *Jinrin kinmō zui* attests to the interchangeability of Datsueba and Uba, since the illustration is entitled "Ouba no kanjin" 御優婆勧進 meaning fundraising for the old hag.

The worship of such female deities as Datsueba and Uba appears to have been fueled by the long-standing Buddhist prejudices that women were intrinsically sinful and by the concerns about how to save them. In Buddhism, female bodies were perceived to embody defilement as they were associated with the sin of blood pollution from childbirth and menstruation. During the late fourteenth or early fifteenth century, several recensions of the *Blood Bowl Sutra* 佛說大藏正教血盆經 (Ch. *Foshuo dazang zhengjiao xuepenjing*, J. *Bussetsu daizō shōkyō ketsubon kyō*), a twelfth-century apocryphal Chinese scripture, were transmitted to Japan, which intensified the notions of women's pollution. The sutra explicates the impurity of women that makes them fall into Blood Pool Hell in retribution for the sin of polluting the earth with blood and their salvation from the hell by copying and possessing the sutra. Visual mechanisms of the Blood Pool Hell and other hells directed at women began to appear in sixteenth- and

female Japanese *waka* poet, whose sculptures are worshipped by women praying for successful breastfeeding or childrearing. These sculptures are located in Seiganji 誓願寺 in Akita Prefecture and Zuishinin 隨心院 in Kyoto. See Matsuzaki Kenzō, *Jizō to Enma Datsueba: gensei raise o mimamoru hotoke* [Jizō, Enma, and Datsueba: Buddhas guarding this life and afterlife] (Tokyo: Keiyusha, 2012), 78-84.

¹¹² Caroline Hirasawa provides examples from a wide assortment of texts and images related to the condemnation of women in her book. See Hirasawa, *Hell-bent for Heaven in Tateyama*, 108-112.

¹¹³ The sutra centers around the protagonist Mokuren 目連, a monk and a disciple of Sakyamuni Buddha, who saves his mother from the Blood Pool Hell. For the full English translation and discussion of the *Blood Bowl Sutra*, see Alan Cole, *Mothers and Sons in Chinese Buddhism* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998), 199-206.

seventeeth-century paintings such as *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* (fig. IV.15) and *Tateyama mandara* (fig. IV.43).¹¹⁴ The *etoki* 絵解 (picture explaining) practice (fig. IV.19) developed empathy between female devotees and polluted women in the imageries and encouraged them to seek salvation.

By the seventeenth century, the concept of women's innate defilement thoroughly permeated Japanese society. It thus is natural to surmise that Kōyū, the leading Buddhist sculptor in Kyoto and the Buddhist believer himself, was familiar with women's karmic destiny to go to hell. To prevent the soul of his deceased daughter from falling in hell due to a perception that her body was innately sinful, he chose to sculpt an image of Datsueba, the popularized female deity who takes part in the Ten Kings' judicial process and protects women and their children. Kōyū's dedication of this sculpture to the salvation-oriented Rokuharamitsuji also accorded with his intention to save his daughter.

Conclusion

From the moment they were enshrined in the Enma hall in the thirteenth century, the sculptural group of Enma, Shimei, and Shiroku at Rokuharamitsuji played an important role in contributing to the idea of the temple and the Rokuhara area being a sacred space to guide devotees through the liminal experience between life and death. In 1629, the sculpture of an old hag demon Datsueba was added to the original group. In Japan, since the tenth century, Datsueba had been described in a variety of textual sources, including *setsuwa* collections, Buddhist

The paintings of the *Tateyama mandara* have been used to propagate the salvific powers of Mount Tateyama. In addition to the assembled scenes of hells for women, these paintings feature the ritual called *Nunohashi kanjōe* 布橋 灌頂会 (Cloth Bridge sacrament) in which women were encouraged to participate in order to gain salvation. During this ritual, women participants cross a bridge overlaid with strips of white cloth between an Enma Hall and an Uba Hall to reenact death and rebirth. For further information on this rite, see Irit Averbuch, "Discourses of the Reappearing: The Reenactment of the 'Cloth-Bridge Consecration Rite'," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 38 (January 2011): 1-54. For fig. IV.51, see Kawasaki-shi Shimin Myūjiamu, *Enma tōjō*, 24-25.

scriptures and fictional narratives, and in diverse visual materials, such as paintings, prints, and sculptures. By the seventeenth century, visual representations of Datsueba began to be standardized, depicting her as an elderly, demonic figure exposing her sagging breasts. Thus, Kōyū chose to sculpt the Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba using this popularized form.

The Rokuharamitsuji Datsueba sculpture was dedicated to the temple for his deceased daughter by Kōyū, one of the most renowned Buddhist sculptors of that time in Kyoto. Several documents and sculptures demonstrate that Kōyū was in charge of many significant Buddhist sculpture commissions in Kyoto in the seventeenth century and thus was a prominent figure in society in the capital. By the time he dedicated the Datsueba image to Rokuharamitsuji, the temple, with its Enma triad sculptures and Ten Kings paintings presumably belonging to it, must have already been functioning as an authoritative institution that propagated the concept of death and the afterlife embedded in Rokuhara, the land of the dead. By then, Datsueba was regarded as a familiar and popular collaborator of Enma, as an important protagonist of the underworld, and as an aid to salvation. Furthermore, Datsueba became a protector of women and children, attracting more female worshippers and turning the temple and the surrounding area into a site concerned with fertility and renewal. Enshrined along with Enma, Shiroku, and Shimei, or a full set of the Ten Kings, that formerly existed in the Enma hall at Rokuharamitsuji, the half-naked Datsueba enabled the female devotees (and the male advocates) who believed in women's inherent sins to overcome karmic destiny.

Epilogue

Personal concerns over death and afterlife are driving forces in Buddhist thought and practice; therefore, a variety of mechanisms for preparing for a good death and a paradisal afterlife were developed within the Buddhist belief system. One of the most popular and effective systems thus far has been the bureaucratic administration of the underworld (or dark region beyond death) by the Ten Kings led by King Enma, the foremost king among them. The dead are believed to be brought for judgment to the courts administered by the Ten Kings and their assistants before proceeding to the next life. A series of judgments by the Ten Kings determines the path into which the deceased would be reborn according to their accumulated actions. If one is found guilty of bad deeds, he or she will be sent to one of the evil paths. The worst-case scenario would be rebirth in the hells where sinners are tortured by hell jailers in perpetuity.

Since its transmission into Japan in the eleventh century, the cult of Enma and Ten Kings developed in accordance with the needs of the Japanese populace, producing a wide range of imageries. Specifically, sculpted images of Enma, Ten Kings, and their attendants can be easily observed throughout the whole country. Despite their abundance and availability, however, sculptures of Enma, Ten Kings, and their assistants have thus far been subject to relatively little attention in the field of art history. Moreover, while the vast majority of Japanese scholarly literature has assessed the textual and visual development of the Ten Kings cult in Japan, there seems to be only a few scholars who have discussed a comprehensive history of the cult in a Japanese context in the English language. Keeping in mind this scholarly void, the present study has established a more inclusive context of the Ten Kings cult that developed in Japan by primarily focusing on the sculptural group of Enma and his entourage at the Rokuharamitsuji

temple in Kyoto. I have revealed that the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures created in the late thirteenth to early fourteenth century and modified in the early seventeenth century attest to the evolution, localization, and popularization in Japan of the once foreign faith in Enma and Ten Kings.

First, as a starting point in building a long-lasting legacy of Ten Kings in Japan, I surveyed and analyzed an assortment of Chinese and Japanese textual sources on Enma and Ten Kings as well as their visual representations both in painted and sculptural forms. Some of the principle written references to Ten Kings include the tenth-century Chinese apocryphal scripture Shiwang jing (The Sutra on the Ten Kings); its Japanese counterpart Jizō jūō kyō (The Sutra on Jizō and the Ten Kings) from the eleventh or twelfth century; and another Japanese Buddhist text entitled $J\bar{u}\bar{o}$ santan sho (The Praise of the Ten Kings) from the thirteenth century. Based on the survey, I identified each king of the Ten Kings in order to understand the way they were interpreted in a Japanese context, and I elaborated on Enma, arguing that Enma whose court was equipped with different tools used to judge the dead came to represent the other nine kings. The investigation into visual representations of the Ten Kings further proved that, by the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, the Ten Kings cult had become localized in Japan. For instance, the Japanese hanging scrolls of Ten Kings, which depicted each king in his own court, associated all the kings with Buddhist divinities (honji butsu 本地仏) with whom the Japanese populace at the time were familiar. As another case in point, the Enma triad configuration, if original, at Rokuharamitsuji was one of the main configuration styles of Ten Kings sculptures that had developed in Japan.

What, then, is special about Rokuharamitsuji primarily highlighted in this dissertation? Rokuharamitsuji, formerly named Saikōji, has been salvation-oriented, all-embracing, and aligned with the concept of death and the afterlife from its founding by Kūya (903–972), a major proponent of Pure Land Buddhism in the tenth century. Kūya strove to propagate the faith in

Amida Buddha and save everyone equally, which are goals that Rokuharamitsuji continued to follow. Rokuharamitsuji's physical and conceptual relation to death and the afterlife is intensified by its location in the area Rokuhara (a field of skulls) near a charnel ground called Toribeno. Its proximity to the intersection known as Rokudō no tsuji (Crossroad of the Six Paths) and other temples of similar nature also marks the temple as a threshold to the other world. Tracing the history of Rokuharamitsuji and its surrounding area Rokuhara affirms that the temple and the sculptures of Enma and his entourage were accessible and appealing to the patrons and clientele, who spanned from aristocrats with political and economic power to *hinin* (outcasts) in extreme poverty. The all-embracing nature of the temple was enhanced as the temple became a sacred space of Jizō bodhisattva and Kannon bodhisattva. The presence of the sculptures of these compassionate deities related to Enma in the same temple compound was believed to multiply devotees' chances to escape from suffering and maximize benefits for rebirth.

The current sculptural program at Rokuharamitsuji consists of a large Enma, his two smaller scale main assistant officials, Shimei and Shiroku, and the old hag Datsueba of similar size. Based on a thorough comparison with other sculptures of Ten Kings and their associates from the Kamakura period, the Enma and Shiroku sculptures are said to have been made between the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries, whereas the Shimei figure seems to have been added in the seventeenth century either when the Datsueba image was sculpted or when the former two were repaired. This sculptural group was enshrined in an Enma hall located on Matsubara Street that was repeatedly destroyed and rebuilt until the nineteenth century, as gleaned through the analysis of entries in gazetteers, histories, temple documents, and maps of Kyoto. By the late thirteenth century, two styles of configurations that evolved from the arrangement corresponding to that in esoteric Enmaten mandalas had firmly taken root in Japan as the predominant iconographical representations of sculpted Ten Kings: the arrangement that

places Enma at the center and the other nine kings and attendants on both sides of Enma or the triad arrangement which shows Enma accompanied by Shiroku and Shimei. Thus, I proposed two possible original layouts of sculptures at Rokuharamitsuji before the addition of the seventeenth-century Datsueba image. However, as discussed, the entries in Usui Kosaburō's *Kyoto bōmokuji* (Journal of a Kyoto monk) written in 1916 give more weight to the full set of Ten Kings.

In addition to the sculptures of Enma and his entourage, Rokuharamitsuji is known to hold a set of Ten Kings hanging scrolls discovered in the temple storehouse in 2008 and attributed to the Southern Song artist Lu Xinzhong (fl. early to mid-thirteenth century). Nevertheless, I argued that these paintings were not necessarily painted by Lu Xinzhong but instead, by several other painters, including Lu Zhongyuan (active 13th–14th century), in Lu Xinzhong's atelier and dated to the fourteenth century. This argument was supported by comparisons with other extant paintings produced by Lu Xinzhong, his atelier, and Lu Zhongyuan. Admittedly, there is still no satisfying explanation as to when and how this set of paintings came into the collection of Rokuharamitsuji, yet the paintings were likely used there to enhance the ritual program of the Ten Kings sculptures.

The Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group of Enma and his entourage appears to have been activated in three ways. First, in tandem with the Chinese Ten Kings paintings, the sculptures were the focal point of two mortuary rituals, post-mortem (*tsuizen*) for the dead and pre-mortem (*gyakushu*) for the living. Secondly, stationed in the Enma hall on Matsubara Street, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptural group reminded anyone passing the street of the underworld of Enma and Ten Kings. Thirdly, the Rokuharamitsuji sculptures served as the objects of worshipping or the subjects of sermons with regard to the ideas of hell, death, and rebirth, when they were taken out of the Enma hall on the special occasion of the *obon* festival.

The faith in Ten Kings at the salvation-oriented Rokuharamitsuji enhanced and evolved when it was conflated with another popular belief in Datsueba. Datsueba is believed to rob the clothes of dead people by the Sanzu River, which they are supposed to cross after death. In 1629, the image of Datsueba was added to the existing sculptural group of Enma and his entourage from the late thirteenth to early fourteenth centuries by the renowned Kyoto-based Buddhist sculptor Kōyū (?–1632) for his deceased daughter. In Japan, Datsueba was popularized through a wide assortment of textual references and imageries related to Ten Kings, hell, and paradise. By the seventeenth century, she was promoted not only as an indispensable component of the landscape of the underworld, but also as a salvific deity that appealed to female devotees, who were considered innately sinful, and as a resource for fertility concerns. Datsueba's various characteristics intensified the salvation-oriented and all-embracing reputation of the temple.

Every year in early August, Rokuharamitsuji, along with Saifukuji and Rokudō Chinnōji in the vicinity, prepares a variety of observances for the *obon* festival held to welcome back the spirits of deceased family members. At this time, Rokuharamitsuji is flooded with worshippers who wish to participate in the reenacted ceremony of 10,000 lamps (*Mandōe*), which is believed to have been held long ago by Kūya at the temple. To the Japanese populace, Rokuharamitsuji is still a salvation-oriented and welcoming temple. I hope the present study will offer a glimpse into the belief systems regarding death and the afterlife within the Buddhist context and the related visual and ritual culture of Japanese Buddhism that has been enriched through the sculptures of Enma and his entourage.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

- Akisato Ritō 秋里籬島 (active 1780–1814). *Settsu meisho zue* 摂津名所図会 vol. 2. Osaka: Morimototasuke, 1796–1798. Waseda University Library Database of Japanese and Chinese Classics: http://www.wul.waseda.ac.jp/kotenseki/index.html.
- ——. Shūi miyako meisho zue 拾遺都名所圖繪 vol. 2. Kyoto: Yoshinoyatamehachi, 1787. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds. Vol. 14 of Shinshū Kyoto sōsho. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967-76.
- Chingen 鎮源 (active 11th century). *Hokke genki* 法華験記. In Inoue Mitsusada and Ōsone Shōsuke, eds. *Ōjōden Hokke genki*, Vol. 7 of *Nihon shisō taikei*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1974.
- Fusō ryakki 扶桑略記. Katsumi Kuroita and Kokushi Taikei Henshūkai, ed. Vol. 12 of Kokushi taikei. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 1965.
- Ikeda Tōri 池田東籬 (1788–1857). *Miyako meishoguruma* 都名所車. Kyoto: Sanjōdōritominokōjihigashieiru, 1830. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds. Vol. 5 of *Shinshū Kyoto sōsho*. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967-76.
- Jōjin 成尋 (1011–1081). Santendai godaisanki 参天台五台山記. In Suzuki gakujutsu zaidan, ed. Vol. 72 of Dai Nihon bukkyō zensho. Tokyo: Suzuki Gakujutsu Zaidan, 1970–1973.
- Kōkogakukai 考古学会, ed. Zōzōmeiki 造像銘記. Tokyo: Kōkogakukai, 1936.
- Konjaku monogatarishū 今昔物語集. In Vol. 3 of Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikei. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1993.
- Liu Daochun 劉道醇 (fl. 1059). Wudai minghua buyi 五代名畫補遺. In Vol. 812 of Wenyuange siku quanshu. Taibei: Taiwan Shangwu Yinshuguan, 1983-1986.
- Miyoshi no Michimune 三善道統 (?-?). *Ganmon* 願文. *Honchō monzui* 本朝文粋, vol. 13. In Ōsone Shōsuke, Kinpura Tadashi, and Gōto Akio, eds. Vol. 27 of *Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikei*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1992.
- Nihon kiryaku 日本紀略. In Vol. 5 of Kokushi taikei. Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1897.
- Ōshima Takeyoshi 大島武好 (1633–1704). *Yamashiro meishō shi* 山城名勝志, vol. 15. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Vol. 14 of *Shinshū Kyoto sōsho*. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967–76.

- Rokuharamitsuji engi 六波羅蜜寺縁起. In Kunaichō Shoryōbu, ed. Fushimi no Miyake Kujōke kyūzō: shoji engishū, Zushoryō sōkan. Tokyo: Kunaichō Shoryōbu, 1970.
- Sakauchi Naoyori 阪内真頼 (17th–18th c.). Sanshū meisekishi 山州名跡志, vol. 3. Kyoto: Koyama Ihei, 1711. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Vol. 15 of Shinshū Kyoto sōsho. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967–76.
- Shusetsusai 守拙斎 (1688–1716). *Kyōuchi mairi* 京内まいり. Kyoto: Tsuji Kanjūrō, 1708. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Vol. 5 of *Shinshū Kyoto sōsho*. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967–76.
- Tōeizan shodō konryūki 東叡山諸堂建立記. In Bussho Kankōkai, ed. Vol. 120 of Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho. Tokyo: Meicho Fukyūkai, 1978-1983.
- Usui Kosaburō 碓井小三郎. Kyoto bōmokuji 京都坊目誌. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds., Vol. 21 of Shinshū Kyoto sōsho. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967–76.
- Yamashiro meiseki junkōshi 山城名跡巡行志 vol. 2. In Noma Kōshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds. Vol. 22 of Shinshū Kyoto sōsho. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1967-76.

Secondary Sources

- Abe Mika. "Daigoji Enmadō shiryō sandai." *Rekishi Minzoku Hakubutsukan kenkyū hōkoku* 109 (2004): 205-223.
- ——. "Dajigoku to sosei tan: Daigoji Enmaōdō emei o yomu." *Setsuwa bungaku kenkyū* 40 (2005): 77-92.
- Andrei, Talia J. "Ise Sankei Mandara and the Art of Fundraising in Medieval Japan." *The Art Bulletin* 100.1 (2018): 68-96.
- Arami Hiroshi. "Daisoku Hōchōsan sekkutsu *Jigokuhen gan* seiritsu no haikei nit suite." *Etoki kenkyū* 16 (2002): 16-52.
- Arntzen, Sonja. *The Kagerō Diary: A Woman's Autobiographical Text from Tenth-Century Japan*. Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, The University of Michigan, 1997.
- Asakura Haruhiko, ed. *Jinrin kinmō zui*. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1990.
- Asami Ryūsuke. "Chōsahōkoku: Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō." *MUSEUM* 620 (June 2009): 2-97.
- Asanuma Takeshi. "Shichijō bussho ni yoru Jishū soshi zō seisaku no shoki no yōsō ni tsuite: Kōshōji den Icchin shōnin zazō to Chōrakuji Shinkyō shōnin izō o megutte." *Gakusō Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan* 23 (2001): 99-112.

- Averbuch, Irit. "Discourses of the Reappearing: The Reenactment of the 'Cloth-Bridge Consecreation Rite'." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 38 (January 2011): 1-54.
- Bloom, Phillip E. "Ghosts in the Mists: The Visual and the Visualized in Chinese Buddhist Art, ca. 1178." *The Art Bulletin* 98.3 (2016): 297-320.
- Bussho Kankōkai, ed. Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho. Tokyo: Meicho Furyūkai, 1983.
- Chilson, Clark. "Eulogizing Kūya as More than a Nenbutsu Practitioner: A Study and Translation of the Kūyarui." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 34, no. 2 (2007): 305-27.
- Choe, Kyungwon. "Marginalized yet Devoted: Buddhist Paintings Commissioned by Nuns of the Early Joseon Palace Cloisters." PhD diss., University of Kansas, 2011.
- Chusid, Miriam. "Picturing the Afterlife: The Shōjuraigōji Six Paths Scrolls and Salvation in Medieval Japan." PhD diss., Princeton University, 2016.
- ——. "Constructing the Afterlife, Re-envisioning Salvation: Enma Halls and Enma Veneration in Medieval Japan." *Archives of Asian Art* 69:1 (Spring 2019): Forthcoming.
- Cole, Alan. Mothers and Sons in Chinese Buddhism. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998.
- Daigoji Bunzakai Kenkyūjo, ed. Daigoji shin'yōroku vol. 2. Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 1991.
- Dandekar, R. N. "Yama in the Veda." Select Writings I (1979): 118-140.
- Dykstra, Yoshiko Kurata, trans. *The Konjaku Tales Japanese Section II from A Medieval Japanese Collection*. Osaka: Intercultural Research Institute, Kansai Gaidai University Publication, 1998-2003.
- Ebine Toshio. "Kin Shoshi hitsu jūō zu." Kokka 1097 (1986): 20-22.
- ——. "Ninpō butsuga no kokyō." *Kokka* 1097 (1986): 60-65.
- Faure, Bernard. *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity, and Gender*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Fowler, Sherry D. *Murōji: Rearranging Art and History at a Japanese Buddhist Temple.* Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005.
- ——. Accounts and Images of Six Kannon in Japan. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2016.
- Gangōji Bukkyō Minzoku Shiryō Kenkyūjo. Rokuharamitsuji no kenkyū. Kyoto: Sōgeisha, 1975.
- . *Murōji momitō no kenkyū*. Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppansha, 1976.

- Gerhart, Karen M. *The Eyes of Power: Art and Early Tokugawa Authority*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.
- ——. The Material Culture of Death in Medieval Japan. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009.
- Glassman, Hank. "At the Crossroads of Birth and Death: The Blood Pool Hell and Postmortem Fetal Extraction." In *Death and the Afterlife in Japanese Buddhism*, eds. Jacqueline I. Stone and Mariko Namba Walter, 175-206. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008.
- . The Face of Jizō: Image and Cult in Medieval Japanese Buddhism. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2012.
- Groemer, Gerald. "The Creation of the Edo Outcast Order." *Journal of Japanese Studies* 27, no. 2 (Summer 2001): 263-293.
- Graham, Patricia Jane. Faith and Power in Japanese Buddhist Art, 1600-2005. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i, 2007.
- Hara Chisato. "Chūsei ni okeru Datsueba no juyō to ninshiki ni tsuite." *Etoki kenkyū* 23 (2011): 83-101.
- Hase Yōichi. "Daibusshi keizu to shichijō busshi." *Kansai Daigaku Bungaku Ronshū* 63, no. 4 (February 2014): 1-49.
- Hayami Tasuku. Kannon shinkō. Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 1970.
- "Kannon shinkō to minzoku." In *Kōza Nihon no minzoku shūkyō vol. 2*, edited by Gorai Shigeru et al. Tokyo: Kōbundō, 1980.
- Hirasawa, Caroline. "Hellbent on Heaven: Female Damnation and Salvation in Tateyama Mandalas." PhD diss., Stanford University, 2005.
- ——. "The Inflatable, Collapsible Kingdom of Retribution: A Primer on Japanese Hell Imagery and Imagination." *Monumenta Nipponica* 63, no. 1 (2008): 1-50.
- ——. Hell-bent for Heaven in Tateyama Mandara: Painting and Religious Practice at a Japanese Mountain. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Horton, Sarah J. *Living Buddhist Statues in Early Medieval and Modern Japan*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Howard, Angela Falco. Summit of Treasures: Buddhist Cave Art of Dazu, China. Trumbull: Weatherhill, Inc., 2001.
- Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, *Tokubetsuten: Jigoku: Oni to Enma no sekai*. Himeji: Hyōgo Kenritsu Rekishi Hakubutsukan, 1990.

- Ide Seinosuku. "Nihon no Sō Gen butsuga." Nihon no bijutsu 418 (2001).
- Ishiba Hiroshi. Jigokue to bungaku: Etoki no sekai. Tokyo: Kyōiku Shuppan Sentā, 1992.
- Ishida Mizumaro. *Minshū kyōten: Miroku jōshōgyō, Miroku geshōgyō, Yakushikyō, Jizōkyō, Kōō kanzeongyō, Urabongyō, Bumo onjūgyō*, Bukkyō kyōtensen 12. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1986.
- Itō Tomoko. "En'nōji Enma jūōzōni kansuru: Shiryō." Kamakura 42 (1983): 15-20.
- Itō Yuishin. Jōdo no shōja: Kūya. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2005.
- Izumi Takeo, Kasuya Makoto, and Yamamoto Satomi, eds. *Kokuhō rokudōe*. Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2007.
- Jūyō Bunzakai Hensan Iinkai, ed. *Shin shitei jūyō bunzakai: kaisetsuban*, vol. 3. Tokyo: Mainichi Shinbunsha, 1980-1984.
- Kaizuka Shigeki, et al. *Shiryō Kyōto no rekishi*. Vol. 10, *Higashiyama ku*. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1979.
- Kajitani Ryōji. "Nihon ni okeru jūō zu no seiritsu to tenkai." *Bukkyō geijutsu* 97 (July 1974): 84-95.
- ——. "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu." *Kokka* 1020 (1979): 22-38.
- Kamakura Kokuhōkan, ed. *Kamakura no seika: Kamakura Kokuhō kaikan hachijjushūnen kinen, tokubetsuten*. Kamakura: Kamakura Kokuhōkan, 2008.
- Kamakurashi Kyōiku Iinkai, ed. *Kamakurashi bunzakai sōgō mokuroku: Shoseki, kaiga, chōkoku, kōgei hen.* Kyoto: Dōhōsha, 1986.
- Kaminishi, Ikumi. *Explaining Pictures: Buddhist Propaganda and Etoki Storytelling in Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2006.
- Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko. *Tematen: Jigoku to jūō ju*. Yokohama: Kanagawa Kenritsu Kanazawa Bunko, 1991.
- Kanda, Fusae. "Behind the Sensationalism: Images of a Decaying Corpse in Japanese Buddhist Art." *The Art Bulletin*, 87.1 (March 2005): 24-49.
- Kanō Shin. *Rokudō no tsuji: Atari no shiseki to densetsu o tazunete*. Kyoto: Muromachi Shōbo, 1988.
- Kawakatsu Masatarō. "Gyakushu shinkō no shiteki kenkyū." *Ōtemae Joshi Daigaku ronshū* 6 (November 1972): 147-165.

- Kawamura Kunimitsu. *Jigoku meguri*. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 2000.
- Kawasaki Junshō and Taki Shūzō. Rokuharamitsuji. Kyoto: Tankōsha, 2007.
- Kawasaki-shi Shimin Myūjiamu. *Enma tōjō*. Kawasaki-shi: Kawasaki-shi Shimin Myūjiamu, 1989.
- Kim, Jung-Hee. "Joseon sidaeui myeongbu sinanggwa myeongbujeon dosang yeongu." *Misulsahakbo* 4 (August 1991): 33-74.
- Kim, Yung-Hee. *Songs to Make the Dust Dance: The Ryōjin hishō of Twelfth-Century Japan*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994.
- Kimbrough, R. Keller. "Preaching the Animal Realm in Late Medieval Japan." *Asian Folklore Studies* 65 (2006): 179-204.
- Kimura Eiichi. "Kamakura jidai no jisha funsō to Rokuhara tandai." *Shigaku zasshi* 117, no. 7 (July 20, 2008): 1276-1300.
- Kiyomizuderashi Hensan Iinkai, ed. *Kiyomizudera shi 1: kaisō sen nihyakunen kinen*. Kyoto: Otowasan Kiyomizudera, Seisaku hatsubai Hōzōkan, 1995-2000.
- Knecht, Peter. "Ise sankei mandara and the Image of the Pure Land." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 33, no. 2 (2006): 223-248.
- Kobayashi Gō. "Rokuharamitsuji no Jūichimen Kannon zō ni tsuite." *Kokka* 800 (1958): 396-401.
- Kobayashi Gōzō. "Kōriyama chihō no Datsueba oyobi Enmazō." *Nihon no sekibutsu* 5, no. 4 (1990): 25-36.
- Kominami Ichirō. "'Jūō kyō' no keisei to Zui Tō no minshū shinkō." *Tōhō gakuhō: Kyoto* 74 (2002), 183-256.
- Kon Jōkō. *Kūya no tera: Rokuharamitsuji*. Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1969.
- Kon Tōkō, Kobayashi Gō, and Gorai Shigeru. *Kūya no tera: Rokuharamitsuji*. Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1969.
- Kuge Masafumi. "Datsueba o motsu hijiri." In *Hyōhaku no geinōsha*, edited by Sonoda Gakuen Joshi Daigaku and Rekishi Minzoku Gakkai, 99-106. Tokyo: Iwatashoin, 2006.
- Kuno Akira. "Rokudō no tsuji." Nihon kenkyū 3 (September 3, 1990): 105-31.
- Kuno Takeshi, ed. *Edo butsuzō zuten*. Tokyo: Tokyodō Shuppan, 1994.

- Kuroda, Hideo. "The *Kumano Kanshin Jikkai Mandara* and the Lives of the People in Early Modern Japan." In *Practicing the Afterlife: Perspectives from Japan*, edited by Susanne Formanek and William R. LaFleur, 101-120. Vienna: Verlag Der Österreichischen Akademie Der Wissenschaften, 2004.
- Kuroita Katsumi and Kokushi Taikei Henshūkai, eds. *Kokushi taikei*. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 1965.
- Kyoto-shi Maizō Bunzakai Kenkūjo. "Rokuharamitsuji keidai, Rokuhara seichōato." *Kyoto-shi maizō bunzakai kenkūjo hakkutsu chōsa hōkoku* 2013–9 (2014): 1-60.
- Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo. *Kyoto no burakushi: zenkindai*, vol. 1. Kyoto: Kyoto Burakushi Kenkyūjo and Hatsubaijo Aunsha, 1984–1995.
- Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan. *Chōrakuji no meihō*. Kyoto: Kyoto Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2000.
- Kyoko Motomochi Nakamura, trans. *Miraculous Stories from the Japanese Buddhist Tradition: The* Nihon Ryōiki *of the Monk Kyōkai*. Surrey: Curzon Press, 1973.
- "Kyoto Rokuharamitsujide jūōzu ippan kōkai." Yomiuri shinbun, June 17, 2008.
- Kwon, Cheeyun Lilian. "The Ten Kings at the Seikadō Library." PhD diss., Princeton University, 1999.
- ——. "A Repositioning of a Medieval Painting Monument: The Ten Kings at the Seikadō Library." *Oriental Art* 46:5 (2000): 64-72.
- ——. "Northern Song Landscape Styles in the Seikadō *Ten Kings of Hell* Paintings." In *Bridges to Heaven: Essays on East Asian Art in Honor of Professor Wen C. Fong* II, edited by Jerome Silbergeld, Dora C. Y. Ching, Judith G. Smith, and Alfreda Murck, 617-630. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011.
- Ledderose, Lothar. *Ten Thousand Things: Module and Mass Production in Chinese Art.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000.
- Lippit, Yukio. "Ningbo Buddhist Painting: A Reassessment." Orientations (June 2009): 54-62.
- MacWillams, Mark. "Living Icons: 'Reizō' Myths of the Saikoku Kannon Pilgrimage." *Monumenta Nipponica* 59, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 35-82.
- Machida Shiritsu Kokusai Hanga Bijutsukan. *Sukui no hotoke: Kannon to Jizō no bijutsu*. Tokyo: Machida Shiritsu Kokusai Hanga Bijutsukan, 2010.
- Maeda Takashi. "Edo jidai no junrei no ugoki: Saikoku junrei." In *Kōza Nihon no junrei vol. 1*, edited by Shinno Toshikazu, 81-103. Tokyo: Yūzankaku, 1996.

- Mao Shuhua. "Enma shinkō ni kansuru Nitchu hikaku kenkyū." *Hikaku minzoku kenkyū* 15 (June 1996): 5-46.
- Marui Sumi. "Datsueba no keitai ni tsuite." Rekishi kōkogaku 40 (July 1997): 30-45.
- Masuo Shin'ichirō. "Taizan Fukun sai to 'Meidō junishin' no keisei." In *Shigo no sekai: Indo, Chūgoku, Nihon no meikai shinkō*, edited by Tanaka Sumio, 228-252. Tokyo: Tōyō Shorin, 2000.
- ------. "Chinese Religion and the Formation of Onmyōdō." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 40, no. 1 (2013): 19-43.
- Matsumoto Eiichi. Tonkō ga no kenkyū. Tokyo: Tōhō Bunka Gakuin, 1937.
- ——. "Tonkōbon Jūō zukan zakkō." *Kokka* 621 (1943): 227-232.
- . Kamakura no bijutsu. Tokyo: Asahi Press, 1958.
- Matsuzaki Kenzō. *Jizō to Enma Datsueba: gensei raise o mimamoru hotoke*. Tokyo: Keiyusha, 2012.
- McCullough, William H. and Helen Craig McCullough, trans. *A Tale of Flowering Fortunes: Annals of Japanese Aristocratic Life in the Heian Period* 2. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1980.
- Mino Yutaka, ed. *The Great Eastern Temple: Treasures of Japanese Buddhist Art from Tōdaiji*. Chicago: Art Institute of Chicago in association with Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1986.
- Mitsui Kinen Bijutsukan, Ryūkoku Daigaku Ryūkoku Myūjiamu, and NHK Puromōshon, eds. *Jigokue wandārando: tokubetsuten.* Tokyo: NHK Puromōshon, 2017.
- Miura Katsuo, ed. *Kamakura no sekibutsu hōtō*. Kamakura Kokuhōka zuroku 23 (Kamakura City: Kamakura-shi Kyōiku Iinkai and Kamakura Kokuhōka, 1980.
- Miya Tsugio. "Jūō kyō e ni tsuite." Jissen Joshidai bigaku bijutsushi gaku 5 (1990): 81-118.
- ——. "Jūō kyō e shūi." *Jissen Joshidai bigaku bijutsushi gaku* 7 (1992): 1-63.
- Miyake Hisao. "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsuzō to Unkei konryū no Jizō Jūrinin." *Bijutsushi ronshū* 10 (February 2010): 1-16.
- Miyama Susumu. "Busshi Kōen kō." *Atomi Gakuen Joshi Daigaku kiyō* 1 (March 1968): 89-99.
- . "Kinsei shichijō bussho no bakufu goyō o megutte: Niide not shiryō o chūshin ni." *Kamakura* 80 (January 1996): 1-44.

- Miyazaki Noriko. "Seikadō Bunko Bijutsukan zō 'Jūō zu,' 'Nishisha zu' ni tsuite." In *Mihotoke no osugata Bukkyō no bijutsu*, edited by Seikadō Bunko Bijutsukan, 22-30. Tokyo: Seikadō Bunko Bijutsukan, 1999.
- Mizuno Keizaburo, ed. *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei: Kamakura jidai: zōzō meiki hen: kaisetsu* 5. Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2003.
- ———, ed. *Nihon chōkokushi kiso shiryō shūsei: Kamakura jidai: zōzō meiki hen: kaisetsu* 7. Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Bijutsu Shuppan, 2009.
- Mōri Hisashi. "Shichijōdōjō Konkōji to busshitachi." *Bukkyo geijutsu* 59 (December 1965): 52-66.
- Motoi Makiko. "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju: Gyakushu, tsuizen butsuji ni okeru shōdō o chūshin ni," part. 1, *Kokugo kokubun* 67 (June 1998): 22-33.
- ——. "Jūō kyō to sono kyōju: Gyakushu, tsuizen butsuji ni okeru shōdō o chūshin ni," part. 2, *Kokugo kokubun* 67 (July 1998): 17-35.
- ———. "Yoshu jūō kyō' no shohon." Kyoto Daigaku kokubungaku ronsō 11 (2004): 1-22.
- Mulhern, Chieko Irie. "Otogizōshi: Short Stories of the Muromachi Period." *Monumenta Nipponica* 29, no. 2 (Summer 1974): 181-198.
- Murai Yasuhiko and Ōyama Kyōhei, eds. *Chōrakuji zō Shichijōdōjō Konkōji bunsho no kenkyū*. Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 2012.
- Murashige Yasushi. "Tennō to kuge no shōzō." Nihon no bijutsu 387 (August 1998).
- Nagai Shin'ichi, ed. *Kamakura to tōgoku no koji. Nihon koji bijutsu zenshū* 17. Tokyo: Shūeisha, 1981.
- ——. Rokudōe no kenkyū. Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1989.
- Nagano Shiritsu Hakubutsukan. *Ano yo, yōkai: Shinshū ikai mangekyō*. Nagano: Nagano Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, 2003.
- Nagao Kayoko. "Kushōjin no tenkai." Bukkyō bunka 10 (2000): 43-70.
- Nakahara Keiji. "The Medieval Origins of the Eta-Hinin." *Journal of Japanese Studies* 5, no. 2 (Summer 1979): 385-403.
- Nakamura Hajime. *Bukkyō go daijiten* 3. Tokyo: Tokyo shoseki kabushiki kaisha, 1975.
- Nakano Genzō. "Enma ten kara Enma ō e." Bukkyo geijutsu 150 (1983): 102-120.
- Nakano Teruo. "Enma jūō zō." Nihon no bijutsu 313 (June 1992): 51-78.

- Naraken Kyōiku Iinkai. Nara-ken chūsei chōkoku chōsa hōkoku: Shukuin busshi: Sengoku jidai no Nara busshi. Nara: Naraken Kyōiku Iinkai, 1998.
- Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan. *Bukkyo setsuwa no bijutsu*. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 1990.
- ———, ed. Nara Saidaiji ten: Kōshō Bosatsu Eison nanahyakunen onki kinen: Shingon Risshū ichimon no hihō kōkai. Tokyo: Nihon Keizai Shinbunsha, 1991.
- ——. Josei to bukkyō. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2003.
- ——. Birei: Inseiki no kaiga: tokubetsuten. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2007.
- . Seichi Nipō: Nippon Bukkyō sen sanbyakunen no genryū. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2009.
- . Butsuzō shūri 100-nen: tokubetsuten. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2010.
- ———. *Nara butsuzōkan meihin zuroku*. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2010.
- Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan and Bukkyō Bijutsu Kyōkai, eds. *Yatadera no butsuzō: tokubetsu chinretsu*. Nara: Nara Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2000.
- Nara Rokudaji Taikan Kankōkai, ed. *Nara rokudaji taikan* 11. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1968-1973.
- Nedachi Kensuke. *Nihon chūsei no busshi to shakai: Unkei to Keiha Shichijō busshi o chūshin ni*. Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2006.
- "Muromachi no chōkoku: chūsei chōkoku kara kinsei chōkoku e." *Nihon no Bijutsu* 494 (2007).
- Ng, Zhiru. *The Making of a Savior Bodhisattva: Dizang in Medieval China*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007.
- Niigata Kenritsu Kindai Bijutsukan. *Niigata no butsuzōten*. Niigata: Niigata no Butsuzōten Jikkō linkai, 2006.
- Nishikawa Kyōtarō and Emily J. Sano. *The Great Age of Japanese Buddhist Sculpture: AD 600-1300*. Fort Worth: Kimbell Art Museum; New York: Japan Society, 1982.
- Noma Köshin and Shinshū Kyoto Sōsho Kankōkai, eds. *Shinshū Kyōto sōsho*. Vols. 5, 11, 22. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten, 1976.
- Noma Seiroku. *The Arts of Japan: Ancient and Medieval*. Tokyo: Kodansha International LTD., 1965.
- Oda Yoshihisa. "Godō daishin kō." *Tōhō shūkyō* 48 (October 1976): 14-29.

- Ogawa Kan'ichi. Bukkyō bunkasahi kenkyū. Kyoto: Nagata Bunshōdō, 1973.
- Oka Manami. Kyoto kisai monogatari. Tokyo: PHP Kenkyūjo, 2013.
- Okamoto Ryōichi and Wakisaka Atsushi, eds. *Kuge buke*. Kinsei fūzoku zufu 11. Tokyo: Shōgakkan, 1984.
- Osabe Kazuo. "Tōdai mikkyō ni okeru Enraō to Taizan Fukun." In *Dōkyō kenkyū* 4, edited by Yoshitoyo Yoshioka et al., 1-28. Toride-shi: Henkyōsha, 1971.
- Ōsaka Shiritsu Hakubutsukan. Shaji sankei mandara. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1987.
- Ōta Hirotarō, ed. *Yamato koji taikan* 4. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1977-1978.
- Phillips, Quitman E. *Practices of Painting in Japan*, 1475–1500. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 2000.
- ——. "Narrating the Salvation of the Elite: The Jōfukuji Paintings of the Ten Kings." *Ars Orientalis* 33 (2003): 120-145.
- Rokuharamitsuji. *Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten: shomin no kokoro ni ikita Kūya no tera*. Tokyo: Ootsuka Kōgeisha, 1973.
- ———, et al. *Shomin no kokoro ni ikita: Kūya no tera, Kyoto Rokuharamitsuji ten*. Tokyo: Asahi Shinbun, 1973.
- Rosenfield, John M. Portraits of Chōgen: The Transformation of Buddhist Art in Early Medieval Japan. Leiden: Brill, 2011.
- Ruch, Barbara. "Woman to Woman: Kumano bikuni Proselytizers in Medieval and Early Modern Japan." In *Engendering Faith: Women and Buddhism in Premodern Japan*, edited by Barbra Ruch, 537-580 (Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 2002.
- Ryūkoku Daigaku Ryūkoku Myujiamu. *Etokitte nani?: katari tsugareru bukkyō kaiga*. Tokyo: Mainichi Shinbunsha, 2012.
- Saitō Hideki. *Onmyōdō no kamigami*. Kyoto: Bukkyō Daigaku Tsūshin Kyōikubu: seisaku hatsubai Shinbunkaku Shuppan, 2007.
- Saitō Ryūichi, ed. Dōkyō no bijutsu. Osaka: Yomiuri Shinbun Osaka Honsha, 2009.
- Saka, Chihiro. "Bridging the Realms of Underworld and Pure Land an Exminaiton of Datsueba's Roles in the Zenkōji Pilgrimage Mandala." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 44, no. 2 (2017): 191-223.
- Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan. Sakai no butsuzō butsuga. Sakai: Sakai-shi Hakubutsukan, 1985.

- Sakai Tadao. "Taizan shinkō no kenkyū." Saichō 7: 2 (1937): 70-118.
- Sawa Ryūken and Hamada Takashi. *Mikkyō bijutsu taikan* 4: *Ten, hōgu, soshi*. Tokyo: Asahi Shinbunsha, 1983-1984.
- Sawada Mizuho. Shūtei: Jigokuhen. Tokyo: Hirakawa Shuppansha, 1991.
- Schmid, David Neil. "Revisioning the Buddhist Cosmos: Shifting Paths of Rebirth in Medieval Chinese Buddhism." *Cahiers d'Extrême-Asie* 17 (2008): 293-325.
- Shibuya Kuritsu Shōtō Bijutsukan. *Chūsei shomin shinkō no kaiga: Sankei mandara Jigokue Otogizōshi*. Tokyo: Shibuya Kuritsu Shōtō Bijutsukan, 1993.
- Shigeta Shin'ichi. "A Portrait of Abe no Seimei." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 40, no. 1 (2013): 77-97.
- Shimizu Kunihiko. "Jizō jūō kyō kō." *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 51, no. 1 (2002): 189-194.
- Siklós, Bulcsu. "The Evolution of the Buddhist Yama." In *The Buddhist Forum, volume IV*, edited by Tadeusz Skorupski, 173-180. London: The School of Oriental and African Studies, 1996.
- Soper, Alexander. "T'ang Ch'ao Ming Hua Lu: Celebrated Painters of the T'ang Dynasty by Chu Ching-hsüan of T'ang," revised translation. *Artibus Asiae* 21, no. 3/4 (1958): 204-230.
- Stavros, Matthew. *Kyoto: An Urban History of Japan's Premodern Capital*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2014.
- Sugamura Tōru. "Kamakura jidai rokudōe no tokushoku to sono haikei ni tsuite." *Geijutsu kenkyū* 16 (2003): 1-16.
- Sugimoto Sonoko and Kawasaki Ryūshō. *Koji Junrei, Kyoto* 25. *Rokuharamitsuji*. Kyoto: Tankōsha, 1978.
- Suzuki Kei. "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu." Kanazawa Bunko kenkyū 136 (1967): 1-5.
- Takahashi Masaaki. Heike to Rokuhara bakufu. Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 2013.
- Takei Akio. "Daigoji Enmadō to sono shuhen: Sen'yōmon-in, kusōzu hekiga, sotatsu." *Bukkyō geijutsu* 134 (1981): 57-68.
- Tanabe Saburōsuke. *Shūgōshin, kōsō*. Nihon no bustuzō hakkya 5. Tokyo: Gyōsei, 1991.
- Tanaka Hideo. *Tōgoku satoyama no ishigami sekibutsu keifu*. Tokyo: Seiga Shobō, 2014.

- Tanaka Kaori. "Sengokuki ni okeru 'shichi Kannon mōde,' 'shichinin mōde' ni tsuite." *Tezukayama Daigaku Daigakuin Jinbunkagaku Kenkyūka kiyō* 11 (February 2009): 13-31.
- Tanaka Kisasu. "Honchō daibusshi seitō keizu no kōkanni tsuite." Bijutsu kenkyū 11 (November 1932): 34-43.
- Tanaka Toyozō. "Riku Shinchū hitsu jūō zu." Kokka 371 (1921).
- Tanaka Yoshiyasu. "Meifu no zuzō no gorei." Nihon no bijutsu 313 (June 1992): 84-96.
- Tanaka Yūko. "Yugyō zō no keifu: Kyoto, Rokuharamitsuji Kūya zō o meguru sōzōryoku." Mikkyō zuzō 18 (1999): 110-122.
- Tani Shin'ichi. "Tosa Mitsunobu kō," pt. 2. Bijutsu kenkyū 103 (July 1940): 11-25.
- Teeuwen, Mark and Fabio Rambelli, eds. *Buddhas and Kami in Japan: Honji Suijaku as a Combinatory Paradigm*. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.
- Teiser, Stephen F. "Having Once Died and Returned to Life: Representations of Hell in Medieval China." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 48, no. 2 (December 1988): 433-464.
- ———. The Scripture on the Ten Kings and The Making of Purgatory in Medieval Chinese Buddhism. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i, 1994.
- Terasawa Shingo. "Zenkōji sankei mandara ni suite." Plilokaria 28 (March 2011): 79-123.
- Tōji Hōmotsukan. *Shūri kansei kinnen Tōji no Jūni Shinshōzō: moderingu no myō*. Tokyo: Tōji Hōmotsukan, 2002.
- Tokushi Yūshō and Kan'ichi Ogawa. "Jūō shōshichi kyō sanzuken no kōzō." In *Chūō ajia bukkyō to bijutsu*, edited by Seiiki bunka kenkyūkai, 257-296. Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 1963.
- Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, ed. *Rokuharamitsuji no butsuzō*. Tokyo: Tokyo Kokuritsu Hakubutsukan, 2008.
- Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan. *Jigoku yūran: jigoku zōshi kara Tateyama mandara made*. Toyama Prefecture: Toyama-ken Tateyama Hakubutsukan, 2001.
- Tsukamoto Zenryū. Tsukamoto Zenryū chosaku shū vol. 7. Tokyo: Daitō Shuppansha, 1975,
- Uemura Takuya. "Rokuharamitsuji Jizō bosatsu zazō ni tsuite: sono zōkei to zōnainōnyūhin o megutte." *Bukkyō Daigaku Shūkyō Bunka Myūjiamu kenkyū kiyō* 9 (March 30, 2013): 23-70.
- Umezu Jirō. "Niso no Jūō zu: Yukimitsu to Mitsunobu no gaseki." *Bukkyō geijutsu* 36 (October 1958): 32-35.

- ———, ed. *Shinshū Nihon emakimono zenshū* 29. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1980.
- Wakabayashi, Haruko. "Hell Illustrated: A Visual Image of *Ikai* that came from *Ikoku*." In *Practicing the Afterlife: Perspectives from Japan*, edited by Susanne Formanek and William R. LaFleur. Vienna: Der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2004.
- ——. "Officials of the Afterworld: Ono no Takamura and the Ten Kings of Hell in the *Chikurinji engi* Illustrated Scrolls." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 36, no. 2 (2009): 319-349.
- Washizuka Hiromitsu. "En'nōji no Enma jūō zō ni tsuite." *Bukkyō geijutsu* 89 (December 1972): 55-65.
- Watanabe, Masako. "An Iconographic Study of 'Ten Kings' Paintings." MA Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1984.
- ——. "Traveling across the Sea: Japanese Rakan and the Ten Kings of Hell." In *The Arts of Japan: An International Symposium*, edited by Miyeko Murase and Judith G. Smith, 31-58. New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2000.
- Wayman, Alex. "Studies in Yama and Māra." Indo-Iranian Journal 3 (1959): 44-73.
- Yamada Kunikazu. Kyoto toshishi no kenkyū. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2009.
- Yamamoto Satomi. "Toba Enmatendō no ba to zōkai." In *Zuzō kaishakugaku: kenryoku to tasha*, edited by Kasuya Makoto. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2013.
- Yanagita Kunio. "Shōzuka no baba." In *Imo no Chikara*, *Yanagita Kunio zenshū*, vol. 11. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1998.
- Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan. *Meikai no sabaki: Enma-sama to jigoku no sekai: Tōkai ni nokoru rokudō shinkō no zōkei*. Yokkaichi: Yokkaichi Shiritsu Hakubutsukan, 2001.
- Yü, Chün-fang. Kuan-yin. New York: Columbia University Press, 2001.

Digital Resources

- Kokusai Nihon Bunka Kenkyū Center, Miyako meisho zue Database: http://www.nichibun.ac.jp/meisyozue/kyoto
- Nara National Museum Collection Database: https://www.narahaku.go.jp/collection
- The Metropolitan Museum of Art Collection Database: https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection

The SAT Daizōkyō Database: http://21dzk.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/SAT/index.html

Ueda shi Maruchimedia jōhō senta, "Nagano sekizō ōuba zazō," Ueda shi bunkaizai mappu. http://museum.umic.jp/map/document/dot41.html.

Waseda University Library. "Kotenseki Sogo Database: Japanese & Chinese Classics." http://archive.wul.waseda.ac.jp/kosho/bunko30/bunko30_e0222/bunko30_e0222_0002/bunko30_e0222_0002.html.